The Representation of Muslim Women in American Print Media:

A Case Study of *The New York Times*

September 11, 2000 –September 11, 2002

By Heather McCafferty

Institute of Islamic Studies
McGill University, Montreal
August, 2005

A thesis submitted to McGill University in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of M.A. in Islamic Studies

Your file Votre référence
ISBN: 978-0-494-24894-2
Our file Notre référence
ISBN: 978-0-494-24894-2

Abstract

Author: Heather Ann McCafferty

Title: The Representation of Muslim Women in American Print Media: A Case Study of *The New York Times* September 11, 2000 – September 11, 2002

Department: Institute of Islamic Studies

Degree: Master of Arts

This thesis is an examination of representations of Muslim women in the American print media. I focus on one particular publication, *The New York Times* within a time frame surrounding the events of September 11, 2001. Articles were selected from this publication that fell within the time period of September 11, 2000 to September 11, 2002. In selecting articles, I chose those based on their inclusion of any discussion that clearly identified those discussed as Muslim women, through the use of the words "Muslim" or "Islamic" in their descriptions. The case study was carried out by reading through each daily edition of *The New York Times* in order to identify any articles that fell within my criteria. I also used an online database containing abstracts of the publication to verify that no article of relevance was overlooked. I then devised 5 categories within which to analyze the representations of Muslim women that were found within these articles, "Veil", "Biographical", "Women's Issues", "Politics" and "Muslims in the West". The main goal of this thesis is to determine how Muslim women are represented within this particular publication and to analyze whether the events of September 11, 2001 had any effect on how Muslim women were portrayed in *The New York Times* articles.

Acknowledgements

I wish to thank all of my friends and family for their generous support throughout my studies and through the completion of this thesis. I thank my family for their continued support of my educational goals and for always being there. I wish to thank Professor Michelle Hartman for all of her support and encouragement as my advisor and professor. Professor Hartman's courses inspired me in so many ways and as an advisor she was always available to offer advice, support, encouragement and a great deal of patience. I thank my wonderful friend Sara Mogilski for all of her support and her friendship the past two years. Thank you for always being there to listen. I thank Salwa Ferahian for all of her kindness, support and constant words of encouragement since my arrival at the Institute three years ago. I thank Jacob, Erin, Walter, Sheema, Amer and Mark for their friendship and for making those first two years on Aylmer Street so memorable. Thank you to my co-workers at McLennan circulation where I spend most of my day everyday, for keeping me in high spirits. Finally I wish to thank all of my professors at the Institute of Islamic Studies for a rewarding three years and I thank the Institute for their financial support during my studies.

résumé

auteur: Heather Ann McCafferty

titre: La représentation des femmes musulmanes dans des médias américains d'impression : Une étude de cas le *New York Times* 11 Septembre, 2000 – 11 Septembre, 2002

département: Institut d'études islamiques

degré: Maîtrise en arts

Cette thèse est un examen des représentations des femmes musulmanes dans les médias américains d'impression. Je me concentre sur une publication particulière, le *New York Times* dans une tranche de temps entourant les événements 11 septembre, 2001. Des articles ont été choisis parmi cette publication qui a fait partie de la période de temps 11 septembre, 2000 – 11 septembre, 2002. En choisissant des articles, j'ai choisi ceux basés sur leur inclusion de n'importe quelle discussion qui a clairement identifié ceux discutés en tant que femmes musulmanes, par l'utilisation des mots "musulmans" ou "islamique" dans leurs descriptions. L'étude de cas a été effectuée en lisant par chacun l'édition quotidienne du *New York Times* afin d'identifier tous les articles qui ont fait partie de mes critères. J'ai également employé une base de données en ligne contenant des résumés de la publication pour vérifier qu'aucun article d'importance n'a été négligé. J'ai alors conçu 5 catégories dans lesquelles pour analyser les représentations des femmes musulmanes qui ont été trouvées dans ces articles, issues d'"voile", "biographiques", des "de femmes", de l'"politique" et des "musulmans dans l'ouest". Le but principal de cette thèse est de déterminer comment des femmes musulmanes sont représentées dans cette publication particulière et pour analyser si les événements 11 septembre, 2001 ont eu n'importe quel

effet sur la façon dont des femmes musulmanes ont été dépeintes dans les articles de *New York Times*.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1 - Introduction/ Muslims in the American Media

Introduction

Since the late 1970s, a few major events have brought increased media coverage of Islam and Muslims in the American press. The Iranian hostage incident in 1979, the OPEC-related rise in oil prices, the Gulf War and the events of September 11, 2001 each made an impact on the American media representations of Islam and Muslims. In this thesis I am concerned with the media's interpretations of the most recent of these events, the attacks that occurred in the United States on September 11, 2001. This particular incident had a significant effect in the U.S. as it occurred so suddenly and took so many lives as a result. In media coverage of this event and its aftermath, specific references were made to Islam and Muslims even before the perpetrators were identified and the coverage only intensified when the authorities announced that their suspects were Arab Muslims. The immediate reaction of the press following the attack that focused the blame on Islam even before any official statement had been released points to some pre-existing sentiment of suspicion among the public that made it so easy for such accusations to be accepted as fact. Here I refer to existing stereotypes of Islam and Muslims that were already widely used in the American media, in television, cinema and the daily press. This is one of the elements that will be examined throughout this thesis.

With this increased media coverage of Muslims, Muslim women soon became a major focus of media attention. This came as the result of the American occupation of Afghanistan following the attacks and the media's fixation on the liberation of that nation's women. Afghan women became potent symbols in the media of militant Islam and the press overwhelmed the public with endless images of the burka-clad Afghan

woman. The result was that the occupation appeared increasingly in the press to be more of a women's liberation campaign then a military retaliation for the September 11th attacks as was its true intention.

In analyzing the media representations that resulted from the events of September 11, 2001, it is these images of Muslim women that I was particularly interested in because such an emphasis was placed on the American military liberating the women from the oppressive conditions that had been placed on their lives for so many years. I decided to conduct an analysis of these media representations and to examine additional representations of Muslim women in the press surrounding this time period to assess just how Muslim women are presented to the public through the press on a day to day basis. I was interested in analyzing how this event affected the representations of Muslim women through conducting a comparative analysis of newspaper articles from a year prior to and a year following the attacks, September 11, 2000 and September 11, 2002. The primary intent of this thesis as a result is to provide an analysis of the representations of Muslim women found in the media during this period and to examine whether the events of September 11th had any correlation to the number of articles carrying representations of Muslim women. I will then look at the descriptions used in the articles discussing Muslim women over the two year period to determine whether there were any changes in the modes of representation following the attacks.

My intent in this thesis is to analyze the impact of September 11, 2001 on the media representations of Muslim women that are found in American print media. In order to do this I have based my analysis on a case study of one particular publication, *The New York Times*. By selecting this event as the basis for my analysis I developed my case

study within a time frame of one year prior to the event and one year following. Choosing a two year time frame surrounding September 11, 2001 allows for an analysis of changes that may have occurred in the representations of Islam and Muslims as a result of these events. In this case study "representation" will be defined as any descriptive elements that are used in the description of Muslim women.

Examination of the way that language is used as a descriptor in the representation of Muslim women is a key element to understand within the broader context of media constructions of their subject because the selection of specific words can carry a great deal of weight in public opinion on a particular subject. William B. Hart II and Fran Hassencahl discuss this in their study *Culture as Persuasion: Metaphor as Weapon* explaining that metaphors can be used in literature to dehumanize a subject and to garner support for actions against the subject[1]. Hart II and Hassencahl elaborate on this concept in relation to media representations of Muslims and Arabs surrounding the war in Iraq. They explain that in articles "definitions of the enemy as a stranger, an alien, or a subhuman are repeated themes"[2], while "the most prominent metaphors used to portray the enemy were enemy-as-animal" and "enemy-as-aggressor"[3]. In this sense it is important to understand the metaphor of the words used in the representations as they can aid in the distortion of the public's perception of the subject. This is not to say that I anticipated a similar use of metaphors in the representations of Muslim women during this same period that Hart II and Hassencahl conducted their study within, rather I am

---

[1] William B. Hart II and Fran Hassencahl, "Culture as Persuasion: Metaphor as Weapon" in Lee Artz and Yahya R. Kamalipour., eds. *Bring 'Em On – Media and Politics in the Iraq War*, Lanham & Toronto: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2005, p.85
[2] Hart II and Hassencahl , p.86
[3] Hart II and Hassencahl, p.89

expressing the necessity to address the possible effect on public opinion of the metaphors that are used in relation to Muslim women in the articles that I examined.

It is also important to note the media's focus on the role of religion in the discussions of the incidents that occurred on this day. In media coverage, Islam became the scapegoat for the actions of a few individuals, identified as Muslim, who happened to hold radical ideas of what Islam meant to them. This is not the first time that a few individuals have claimed to be acting in the name of their religion nor is it limited to incidents involving Muslims. Violence has been carried out in the name of religion by Christians, Jews and individuals of other religious affiliations. Radical thinkers can exist in any religious community yet the American media seems to discuss religion as an influence on violence only when covering events that they attribute to Islam or Muslims.

As Edward Said discusses in *Covering Islam,* Islam is often represented in direct contrast with what are understand to be "Western" ideas and the media emphasizes a portrayal of Muslims as the "other" in relation to non-Muslims. Said explains that, "no one has equated the Jonestown massacre or the destructive horror of the Oklahoma bombing or the devastation of Indochina with Christianity, or with Western or American culture at large; that sort of equation has been reserved for 'Islam'"[4]. This issue has been examined in other works as well. Jack Shaheen analyzed several news reports in his work *Arab and Muslim Stereotyping in American Popular Culture,* consulting a number a major publications including *The New York Times,* the *Washington Post* and the *Los Angeles Times* following the first World Trade Center bombing in 1993. He explains that, "ignored in reports was this: individuals who commit acts of terrorism, whatever their

[4] Edward Said, *Covering Islam: How the Media and the Experts Determine How We See the Rest of the World*, Vintage Books: New York, 1997, p.9

origin, are a tiny minority whose deeds are politically rather than religiously motivated"[5]. Shaheen's argument is important to take into account because far too often in the media there is this overemphasis on the role of religion and no examination of political or even personal motivation for violence that occurs throughout the world today.

A number of scholars who have analyzed representations of Islam and Muslims in the American media have examined major daily news publications in the United States such as *The New York Times,* the *Washington Post* or the *Los Angeles Times* in their works[6]. They have shown how these publications provide examples that demonstrate how the reporting of political events in the Middle East is intertwined with statements that cast a negative image of Muslims who live where these major events occur. The ongoing Israeli-Palestinian conflict is one particular example that receives constant media attention in the United States. In coverage of this conflict, the emphasis is often more focused on depicting the conflict as religious rather than political or even cultural. Even though many Palestinians are Christian, the American media often depicts all Palestinians as Muslims. Karim H. Karim describes this in his discussion of how Islam is often linked with terrorism and violence in the media. In reference to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict he explains that, "The image of terrorism has become so completely enmeshed with Islam in the dominant Northern discourses that even Christian Middle Easterners involved in

---

[5]Jack Shaheen, *Arab and Muslim Stereotyping in American Popular Culture*. Center for Muslim-Christian Understanding: History and International Affairs: Washington, 1997, p.31

[6] See Karim H. Karim, *Islamic Peril – Media and Global Violence*. Montreal: Black Rose Books, 2000; Edmund Ghareeb, ed. *Split Vision: The Portrayal of Arabs in the American Media*. American-Arab Affairs Council: Washington, D.C., 1983; Ghazi-Walid Falah, "The Visual Representation of Muslim/Arab Women in Daily Newspapers in the United States" in *Geographies of Muslim Women: Gender, Religion, and Space*. New York: The Guilford Press, 2005; Therese Saliba, "Military Presences and Absences: Arab Women and the Persian Gulf War" in Susan Jeffords and Lauren Rabinovitz eds., *Seeing Through the Media – The Persian Gulf War*. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1994. These are only a few of a number of examples discussing the representations of Islam and Muslims in major daily news publications.

violent confrontations are presented as being Muslim. Although a significant proportion of the members of the PLO have been Christian, including George Habbash, the head of the Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine (one of the most active terrorist organizations in the 1970s), the dominant image of the PLO was that its members were solely Muslim"[7]. Journalists directly draw connections for the reader between terrorism and Islam by using the words "Islam" or "Muslim" and "fundamentalism" or "terrorism" within the same sentence. In reference to articles discussing the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, stories on this subject can be found in the news media on a daily basis, reinforcing these connections frequently. Similarly, if specific representations of Muslim women if used frequently in news articles it will then be difficult for the public to identify Muslim women with anything but the representations that are found in the media. If these representations are based on stereotypes or misinformation on the part of the journalist then these recurring images only reinforce these misrepresentations among the general public.

After September 11, 2001, there was an increase in media discussion of Islam and Muslims. In conducting the preliminary research for my case study I found a significant increase in articles in the one year following September 11, 2001. Prior to September 11, 2001, 37 articles discussed Muslim women in *The New York Times*, in the following year I found 92 articles. While I focus specifically on an American publication, increased coverage of Islam and Muslims was not limited to the American media alone.

According to Elizabeth Poole in her study of Islam in the British press, post-September 11th, the subject of Islam "previously at the margins of coverage in the British news media and a distant object in the consciousness of the majority of British people", it

[7] Karim H. Karim, *Islamic Peril – Media and Global Violence*. Montreal: Black Rose Books, 2000. p. 80

now had "an uncomfortable familiarity"[8]. Poole's study examines what representations of Islam and Muslims were found in the British media following the attacks and the affect that these representations may have on the public whether they be positive or negative representations. Poole argues that while "Islam is suddenly 'recognizable'" it is "the form in which Islam is known that is of concern here. That people are suddenly more interested in Islam could be a positive development, but if the knowledge that is produced only reinforces an Orientalist perspective then this will be an opportunity lost"[9]. Poole's study of the British media is important because it investigates representations of Islam and Muslims that may be considered slightly more objective than those found in the United States where the attacks took place. For a publication to report on such tragic events and to be located in close proximity to the location where they occurred there is less likely to be as much objectivity on the part of the reporters as the emotional ties to the incident are closer at hand.

Definition of Media/Print Media in Relation to this Study

The American public receives its daily news from sources that are most often affiliated with the few major media conglomerates[10]. As a result, the information being disseminated to the public is unlikely to provide varying viewpoints and interpretations of the events covered. Said highlights this obstacle in *Covering Islam* when he says, "The widest distribution and therefore the strongest impact is made by a handful of organizations: two or three wire services, three television networks, CNN, half a dozen

---

[8] Elizabeth Poole, *Reporting Islam: Media Representations of British Muslims*. I.B. Tauris Publishers: London, 2002, p.3

[9] Poole, p.3

[10] Edmund Ghareeb, *Split Vision – The Portrayal of Arabs in the American Media*. American-Arab Affairs Council: Washington, D.C., 1983, p.10-11

daily newspapers, two (or perhaps three) weekly news magazines"[11]. This means that if one of these news agencies is distributing inaccurate information then all of the smaller agencies connected to this larger one will likely be presenting the same misinformation to the public. This is why it is particularly necessary to analyze the information presented by these major news agencies.

For the purpose of this particular study, "the media" is limited to broadcast and print media, organizations that act as a source of information for the general public. Within this broader discussion of broadcast and print media I will focus specifically on print media, and even more specifically on one daily news publication printed in the United States, *The New York Times*. My goal in examining this particular publication is to identify the representations that this publication uses in its discussion of Islam and Muslims with a focus on the representations of Muslim women through the close analysis of articles from the two year time frame that I outlined in my introduction.

I developed my definition of news media from Gaye Tuchman's work *Making News: A Study of the Construction of Reality*. Tuchman describes news as, "a window on the world. Through its frame, Americans learn of themselves and others, of their own institutions, leaders, and lifestyles, and those of other nations and their peoples...the news aims to tell us what we want to know, need to know, and should know"[12]. Tuchman further states that, "news organizations both circulate and shape knowledge"[13]. This definition conveys the impact that the American media has on the public and the position of authority that it holds. In acknowledging that the media may hold such a position it is

---

[11] Said, p.54
[1212] Gaye Tuchman, *Making News: A Study of the Construction of Reality*. The Free Press: New York, 1978, p.1
[13] Tuchman, p.2

then even more crucial to understand what representations the news media is producing of Islam and Muslims.

Teun Van Dijk describes how media organizations ultimately control the subject of every report, explaining that the press "through its specific discursive and cognitive strategies of selection, emphasis, focusing, exaggeration, relevance assignment, description, style, or rhetoric it has a powerful role in the final definition of the situation"[14]. He examines the importance of the various elements that make up a news article. In describing the impact of the headline alone, Van Dijk explains, "they are usually read first and the information expressed in the headline is strategically used by the reader during the process of understanding in order to construct the overall meaning, or the main topics, or the rest of the text before the text itself is even read"[15]. Following Van Dijk's argument it is therefore important to understand that the vocabulary is usually selected for a specific reason, to provide a particular image for the reader. For example, Van Dijk explains that if the word "riot" or "protest" is used in the headline, then "readers would have to make an extra effort to derive an alternative main topic from the text"[16]. The use of specific words in the headline can set the tone for the entire article as readers will then interpret the remainder of the text through the meaning that they derive from these words. Additionally, he argues that not only do the words used in the headline "express the definition of the situation, but they also signal the social or political opinions of the newspaper about the events"[17]. In my case study I will develop Van Dijk's theory further in relation to the language used in the representations of Muslim women in *The*

[14] Teun A. Van Dijk, *Racism and the Press*, Routledge: London, 1991, p.42
[15] Van Dijk, p.50
[16] Van Dijk, p.51
[17] Van Dijk, p.53

New York Times. I will look at what words are used in the headlines, any photo captions and the main body of the article and how these representations are related to the overall subject of the article.

Focus of Case Study

Within this larger set of articles about Islam I chose to focus on the representations of Muslim women. In my case study of *The New York Times* I wanted to identify what representations of Islam and Muslims were depicted in this particular publication. More specifically, I wanted to understand how Muslim women are portrayed in relation to descriptions of Islam and Muslims in general within my specified time frame surrounding September 11, 2001. I expected that there would be a dramatic increase in articles chronicling the plight of changes for Afghanistan's women, especially due to the fact that some changes did occur during the American led war in Afghanistan. I also wanted to analyze how the familiar Western stereotypes of the Muslim woman would emerge within the articles if they appeared at all.

***The New York Times* as a Case Study**

I selected *The New York Times* as the publication with which to conduct my case study as it represents the mainstream of American print media and it covers a large readership area, nationally and internationally. In this sense, *The New York Times* can be considered a national paper. Todd Schaefer refers to earlier analysis of David Paletz when he describes the publication as one of the "premier newspapers in the United States, read by the nation's elite and outside of their immediate communities"[18]. He explains that

[18] Todd M. Schaefer, "Framing the US Embassy Bombings and September 11 Attacks in African and US Newspapers" in Pippa Norris, Montague Kern and Marion Just eds., *Framing Terrorism: The News Media, the Government and the Public*. Routledge: New York, 2003. p.94 referring to David L. Paletz, *The Media in American Politics*. Longman: New York, 2002

while *The New York Times* is not the largest paper in the United States in terms of circulation, the publications "elite status and audience" make it "more influential than the pure numbers of readers dictates"[19]. Additionally, because the publication is based in New York City where the September 11, 2001 attacks had the greatest impact; it is relevant to examine what sort of response the publication had towards American Muslim communities.

A number of scholars who examine the representations of Islam in the American media refer to *The New York Times* as an important source to analyze because it is regarded with such prestige. According to Said, publications such as *The New York Times,* "will have credibility by virtue of its source, its institutional prestige, its frequency (daily, hourly, etc.), and its air of expertise and experience"[20]. For example, in *Covering Islam*, Said refers to the position of *The New York Times* as having the ability to, "reach more people, make a deeper impression, get more of a certain kind of news across than do other, smaller, less-wealthy news –distributing agencies"[21]. Said also describes the publication in his work as, "an extraordinarily strong institution functioning as a power almost coeval with the nation itself" and that "nowhere are standards of professionalism so high"[22].

Edmund Ghareeb describes *The New York Times* as one of the major news outlets that "wield national influence"[23]. Further, according to Harold Piety, "*The New York Times* is by far the most important of the major dailies in its general influence, and the

---

[19] Schaefer, p.94
[20] Said, p.55
[21] Said, p.54
[22] Said, p.89
[23] Edmund Ghareeb, *Imbalance in the American Media* in Edmund Ghareeb, ed., *Split Vision: The Portrayal of Arabs in the American Media.* American-Arab Affairs Council: Washington, 1983, p.11

Times takes pride in the fact that newspaper editors across the land regard it as vital"[24]. Additionally, he argues that, "The *Times* is the only truly national newspaper in the United States, and it is generally available in most American cities of 100, 000 or more persons on a daily basis"[25]. Karim H. Karim explains that *The New York Times* is also a source of authority for news agencies outside of the United States as some in Canada for example base their article content "on reports by correspondents of American sources"[26]. Karim lists *The New York Times* among the American sources that Canadian news agencies often refer to for coverage.

Jack Shaheen looks at specific representations of Islam and Muslims referring to *The New York Times* in his work *Arab and Muslim Stereotyping in American Popular Culture*[27] while Edmund Ghareeb examines both the content of articles and those responsible for producing it through interviews with several *New York Times* writers in his work *Split Vision*[28]. *The New York Times* is not just a publication it is also a major company that controls 18 other newspapers throughout the United States, 8 network television stations, 2 New York radio stations and over 40 news related websites[29]. As a result it is important to understand the content of articles that is generated in this

---

[24] Harold R. Piety, *Bias on American Editorial Pages* in Ghareeb, *Split Vision*, p.126
[25] Piety, p.126
[26] Karim H. Karim, *Islamic Peril: Media and Global Violence*. Black Rose Books: Montreal, 2000, p.14
[27] Jack Shaheen, *Arab and Muslim Stereotyping in American Popular Culture*. Center for Muslim-Christian Understanding: History and International Affairs: Washington, D.C., 1997, see Chapter 3 for example on *Print and Broadcast News* pages 29-64
[28] Edmund Ghareeb, ed. *Split Vision: The Portrayal of Arabs in the American Media*. American-Arab Affairs Council: Washington, D.C., 1983
[29] This information can be found and all of the affiliate publications etc. are listed on the company's website found at the following address: http://www.nytco.com/company.html Incomplete information about *The New York Times* is available in other sources. Most discussions of ownership pointed out instead that the paper is widely read, more liberal than others and compared it to other American publications. One discussion pointed out that *The New York Times* is under Jewish ownership (Steve Bell, *American Journalism: Practices, Constraints, and Middle East Reportage* in Michael C. Hudson and Ronald G. Wolfe, *The American Media and the Arabs*. Centre for Contemporary Arab Studies: Washington, D.C., 1980). I was more interested in understanding the magnitude of the company that *The New York Times* is operated under.

particular publication as it also holds influence over a large number of media outlets throughout the United States and that the content found within *The New York Times* is influenced by the publication's role in this larger organization.

The information contained in the pages of *The New York Times* as discussed in the examples above, is understood by the public to be a fair and accurate depiction of reality yet it is important to realize in analyzing the content of the articles within this publication that as with any news agency, they are governed by both corporate interests and the personal opinions held by the writers assigned to the stories. This creates an obstacle in the dissemination of objective information as news content is then filtered through specific agendas. The organizations running publications such as *The New York Times*, as with any publication (or television news broadcasts), have certain corporate agendas that they are following to appeal to a certain audience (or in some cases to appease a certain audience). This is not to say that journalism cannot be objective, rather I would argue that larger news agencies such as *The New York Times* are more prone to being influenced by a corporate agenda. As I will demonstrate in my case study, there are a number of examples in articles where the writer discusses the necessity to look beyond misrepresentations of Muslims that are so prevalent in the media. By acknowledging the existence of this problem, these writers provide an essential perspective on the issue.

Before I began my research I intuitively suspected that I would find an increase in articles discussing Muslims in general and more specifically, Muslim women in the post-September 11, 2001 period, whether they portrayed Islam as positive or negative. The events of September 11, 2001 fueled curiosity and discussion about Islam in the United

States[30]. As well, the American led war in Afghanistan resulted in increased opportunities for some women living there. The attacks of September 11, 2001 and the US led war in Afghanistan had an impact on the representation of Muslim women in the media and by selecting a time frame that included one year prior and one year following September 11, 2001, I believed that I could assess how the representation of Muslim women changed if it in fact did as a result of these events and perhaps find a clear understanding of what these changes were.

As I will discuss within the two chapters of my case study, the events of September 11, 2001 did indeed affect the coverage of Islam in *The New York Times.* In particular there is a major increase in the number of articles about Muslims in the United States. In *The New York Times* I found that post-September 11th, 2001 even while there were negative generalizations being generated about Islam and Muslims in the American press, there was also curiosity about the Muslim communities living within the United States. As a result, amidst the negative portrayal of Islam in the press there was also an attempt to answer questions and understand this growing American community. The *New York Times* published a number of articles to address questions like: What do Muslims believe? What can we learn about American Muslims? How do they feel about the attacks? What is going on in their communities? Approximately fifty of these articles were included in my case study, articles which present representations of the "Muslim Woman" through either literary or visual images.

---

[30] See Pippa Norris, Montague Kern and Marion Just, *Framing Terrorism* in *Framing Terrorism: The News Media, the Government and the Public.* Routledge: New York, 2003, p.3-5. See also Said in *Covering Islam*

Methodology

My method for research in this case study included scanning each daily edition of *The New York Times* on microfilm in an initial search for any articles that discussed Islam or Muslims. I also conducted a key word search in an online database of the publication to ensure that I did not miss any articles that would be relevant. From these articles, I then carefully read through them to determine which could be considered for further analysis because they discuss Muslim women. I selected those that clearly indicated that the women discussed in the article were Muslim, through the use of the words "Muslim" or "Islamic".

In examining representations of Muslim women in *The New York Times*, I will discuss elements of each news article including visual images, captions, headlines and the main bodies of the articles. Each of these elements can have a lasting impact on the reader depending on how the information is presented within the articles. Photos are taken into consideration for the analysis of each article as Ghazi-Walid Falah argues that "readers may forget much of the content of an article shortly after reading it, but pictures can be recalled sometimes for years"[31]. The caption "is another area where the value judgment of a newspaper's editor can be easily transmitted. The words selected for captions are not simply descriptions of pictures, but instead are specific interpretations of visual representations"[32]. Similarly to the role of the headline as discussed earlier in reference to Van Dijk's analysis, the caption can invoke a specific interpretation of events based on the vocabulary used to express the incident that the caption is referring to. In my

[31] Ghazi-Walid Falah, "The Visual Representation of Muslim/Arab Women in Daily Newspapers in the United States" in *Geographies of Muslim Women: Gender, Religion, and Space*. New York: The Guilford Press, 2005, p. 302

[32] Falah p. 302 discussing J. Tomlinson, *Cultural Imperialism: A Critical Introduction*.

case study I will look at these elements of the article to analyze what representations are being conveyed to the reader aside from those found in the main body of text, as these elements are usually the first to capture the attention of the reader.

Islam and the Media – Existing Works

The past two decades have resulted in an increasing amount of scholarly work on Islam and Muslims in the media. In this section, I will discuss some of the existing works as a foundation for my own analysis. According to Edmund Ghareeb, the authority of the American media can "mold and channel public opinion according to their own biases and misconceptions"[33]. This stems as a result from a combination of both the free expression of individual journalists, who are not always knowledgeable about the subject of their articles, as well as the influence of the news editors and the views of the media corporation as a larger entity as I have discussed earlier in this section.

Ghareeb analyzes the portrayal of Arabs in the American media in his work explaining that, "The Middle East is the most obvious area in which imbalance has been prevalent. It is an area which the American public understands little, yet there is no shortage of opinions"[34]. Therefore, accuracy in the coverage presented is crucial. Ghareeb argues that, "part of the problem is ignorance – most Americans have had only the most fleeting and superficial exposure to Middle East history and culture in their educational experience"[35]. Many in the U.S. public have no prior knowledge of Islam and Muslims that would enable them to understand news coverage of these subjects critically and what is presented in the media is the only exposure to Islam that many in the public will have. This is problematic according to Ghareeb as "too often this brief glimpse is distorted and

[33] Ghareeb, p.3
[34] Ghareeb, p.4
[35] Ghareeb, p.5

confirms inaccurate stereotypes of the Arabs"[36]. These stereotypes include the portrayal of Arab countries as "backward" and the people as either "desert-dwelling Bedouins or millionaires"[37]. In the following section I will look more closely at this use of stereotypes in representations of Islam and Muslims in the media.

The Use of Stereotypes

> Popular culture and the mass media in the United States have generated and sustained stereotypes if a monolithic evil Arab; these stereotypes constructed all Muslims as Arabs and all Arabs as terrorists. Using representations and language in news, movies, cartoons, and magazine stories, the media and popular culture have participated in the construction of an evil Arab stereotype that encompasses a wide variety of people, beliefs, religions and assumptions[38]

The research for my thesis confirmed that particular stereotypes are prevalent in representations of Islam and Muslims in *The New York Times* before and after September 11, 2001. In analyzing the representations of Muslims in this publication it is necessary to examine the stereotypes that many of these representations are drawn from. A number of scholarly works discuss the affects of stereotyping in the media, a few of which I will elaborate on in this section. Jack Shaheen examines the cause and the affects of stereotyping on representations of Arabs and Muslims in the media in several of his works. He describes some of the factors that result in the stereotyping of Arabs and Muslims in his important pamphlet, *Arab and Muslim Stereotyping in American Popular Culture*, explaining that, "No single factor leads to stereotyping. Undeniably ignorance, the handmaiden of bigotry, continues to be a contributing factor. Most journalists and image makers do not have the religious, cultural or language background to understand

---

[36] Ghareeb, p.5
[37] Ghareeb, p.22
[38] Debra Merskin, "The Construction of Arabs as Enemies: Post-9/11 Discourse of George W. Bush" in Lee Artz and Yahya R. Kamalipour., eds. *Bring 'Em On – Media and Politics in the Iraq War*, Lanham & Toronto: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2005, p. 121

Islam"[39]. According to this argument, the stereotypes of Islam and Muslims that may be found in the media are primarily a result of misinformation in the individual journalist and in the publication's knowledge on the topic. Without adequate background on the subject there is a risk of presenting the information based on assumptions or based on misinformation attained from other sources and individuals who are not fully educated on the subject. Shaheen also discusses this problem in his work *The TV Arab* where he discusses a number of the misrepresentations that are found in the media and he offers a broader discussion to dispel the misinformation that he finds[40].

It is necessary to discuss the existence of stereotypes in the news media as this is the source that many in the general public rely on for an informed view about local and world events. By assuming that the information they disseminate is at all times an accurate representation fails to allow for a necessary critical analysis of what is presented to the public through the media. This use of stereotyping is important to examine in order to provide objectivity when presented with any subject and in this particular case study I wanted to analyze the common stereotypes that are frequently used in relation to Muslim women. The media, whether printed material, television, film or the internet, are sources that the public relies on for a number of topics that many people would not have access to otherwise, they often rely on these sources to provide them with information and insight about world events on a daily basis. As a result, inaccurate information that draws on misrepresentations will often not be recognized if this is the sole source of information being relied on. Said describes this problem in his work *Covering Islam* when he argues that, "For most Americans (the same is generally true for Europeans) the branch of the

---

[39] Jack Shaheen, *Arab and Muslim Stereotyping in American Popular Culture*. Center for Muslim-Christian Understanding: History and International Affairs: Washington, 1997, p.53

[40] Jack Shaheen, *The TV Arab*. Bowling Green State University Press: Bowling Green, 1984

cultural apparatus that has been delivering Islam to them for the most part includes the television and radio networks, the daily newspapers, and the mass-circulation news magazines"[41]. If this statement is accurate, then it is important to ensure that the information that these sources provide regarding Islam is a fair representation of the religion and its people.

It is important to understand the representations presented in the media as they provide information for an audience that often knows little of the subject presented. In his examination of the portrayal of Arabs in the mass media, Ghareeb discovered that "many Americans picture Arabs as backward, scheming, fanatic terrorists who are dirty, dishonest, oversexed and corrupt"[42]. It is necessary to analyze these depictions that are found in the media as there are so many misrepresentations being generated by the American media about Islam and Muslims. There is often a failure in the media to examine the diversity of Islam and Muslims and instead they are frequently portrayed as one homogeneous group. So often the media focuses on providing one image of Islam that not all factors of any specific situation often described as related to Islam are examined correctly if at all. It is necessary to analyze the possible role of other factors such as cultural values and traditions, politics and economics on any events discussed in the media rather than focusing primarily on the affect of religion as is often the focus of articles representing Islam and Muslims.

Said explains that lacking from some of the discourse on Muslims is the fact that they come from a "remarkably varied history, geography, social structure, and culture of the forty Islamic nations and the approximately 800,000,000 Muslims who live in Asia,

---

[41] Said, p.47
[42] Ghareeb, p.7

Africa, Europe, and North America (including many millions in the Soviet Union and China)"[43]. According to John Esposito, one of the major problems with the portrayal of Islam in the media is that "coverage of Islam and the Muslim world concludes there is a monolithic Islam out there somewhere, believing, feeling, thinking and acting as one"[44] Additionally, Said explains that some writers know, "neither the languages nor the societies" that they purport to be experts on[45]. Karim H. Karim also argues that in discussing Islam or Muslims in the media, there is a "failure to acknowledge their diversity"[46].

In addition to assumptions that Islam is one "monolithic" religion, there is also a tendency in the media to depict all Muslims as Arabs and all Arabs as Muslims. The media, according to Ghareeb "has continued to foster stereotypes by lumping Muslims and Arabs together"[47]. He explains that this generalization is inaccurate as "The Arabs do not number more than 12 percent of the world's Muslims"[48]. This is apparent in many of the articles discussing Arabs. For example in discussions of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, as I mentioned earlier in this chapter, there is an assumption by many journalists that all Palestinians are Muslims and that this is essentially a conflict between Jews and Muslims. Not only does this fail to recognize the political motivation behind the conflict, it also fails to acknowledge the multiple religious identities of the Palestinian people.

Similarly, as Poole discusses in *Reporting Islam*, when the media continues to make reference to "Muslim and Islamic terrorists'" it leads the readers to believe that "the

---

[43] Said, p.85
[44] John Esposito in Jack Shaheen, *Arab and Muslim Stereotyping in American Popular Culture*. Center for Muslim-Christian Understanding: History and International Affairs: Washington, 1997, p.3
[45] Said, p.85
[46] Karim, p.7
[47] Ghareeb, *A Renewed Look at American Coverage of the Arabs: Toward a Better Understanding* in Ghareeb, *Split Vision, p.160*
[48] Ghareeb, p.161

associated negative behaviour is seen to evolve out of something inherent in the religion, rendering any Muslim a potential terrorist"[49]. Jack Shaheen explains that often these representations result from ignorance. "Although Islam is one of the three great monolithic religions, most Americans know little about its teachings, its holy days, or its commonalities with Christianity and Judaism"[50].

Van Dijk's study of headlines in five British newspapers between 1981 and 1986 revealed that headlines of articles discussing minority groups "are firmly connected to the concept of 'race'"[51] and he explains that "since most readers have few other sources of information about ethnic affairs, we must conclude that the media have an important role in conveying this kind of knowledge"[52]. Such misconceptions and lack of knowledge about Muslims is conveyed to the public and as a result, these representations will continue to be reinforced. This is why it is necessary to analyze what the existing representations of Islam and Muslims in the media are, in order to understand what misinformation is being generated. More awareness needs to be raised regarding the inaccuracies disseminated by the media in order for the public to recognize the necessity of a more critical analysis of news media content.

Gender is another factor that affects how a particular subject is represented in the media. By this I refer to the generalizations that are so frequently used in media representations of Muslim women. While particular stereotypes are repeatedly used to identify Muslims across gender lines to emphasize certain traits in relation to an overall religious and cultural identity, Muslim women are confronted with additional modes of

---

[49] Poole, p.4
[50] Shaheen, p.6
[51] Van Dijk, p.55
[52] Van Dijk, p.237

representation that misrepresent not only their culture and religion, their position as a woman is distorted as well. Iris Marion Young discussed the burden that gender plays in representing women from various backgrounds.

> The idea of group representation, this objection claims, assumes that a group of women, or African Americans, or Maori, or Muslims, or Deaf people has some set of common attributes of interests which can be represented. But this is usually false. Differences of race and class cut across gender, differences of gender and ethnicity cut across religion, and so on. Members of a gender or racial group have life histories that make them very different people, with very different interests and different ideological commitments. The unifying process required by group representation tries to freeze fluid relations into a unified identity, which can re-create oppressive exclusions[53]

As a result of such attempts for group representation, there is often a failure to recognize all of the factors that affect the individuals within this larger group and instead they are represented in relation to only one aspect of their identity even though their experience as a Muslim woman for example may be completely different from each of the other Muslim women's experiences depending on a number of additional factors.

Chandra Talpade Mohanty also emphasized the necessity for understanding the multitude of factors that can affect each woman's life rather than affixing assumptions to a group of women with one shared factor. In *Feminism Without Borders* she describes the solidarity approach in applying feminist analysis to issues involving minority or "third world" women. Mohanty explains, "this solidarity perspective requires understanding the historical and experiential connections between women from different national, racial and cultural communities"[54]. In order to do this Mohanty suggests examining "social and economic process and histories of various communities of women in particular

---

[53] Iris Marion Young, *Inclusion and Democracy*. Oxford University Press: Oxford & New York, 2000. p. 122

[54] Chandra Talpade Mohanty, *Feminism Without Borders – Decolonizing Theory, Practicing Solidarity*. Duke University Press: Durham & London, 2003. p. 242

substantive areas...points of contact as well as disjunctures"[55]. In my examination of the representations presented of Muslim women in the American press, it is an understanding of these factors that are absent from the representations and instead Muslim women are constantly depicted as one monolithic group despite their various backgrounds and experiences.

Lila Abu-Lughod also addressed this issue in her study, *Remaking Women – Feminism and Modernity in the Middle East.* She explained, "postcolonial world women have become potent symbols of identity and visions of society and the nation"[56]. Abu-Lughod's critique assesses the influence of what she describes as "East/West Politics"[57] on the construction of particular representations of Muslim and Arab women. She explains, "In colonial or semi-colonial contexts, the distinction between modernity and tradition (with its correlate, backwardness) had a particularly active life because it was paired with that between the West and the non-West"[58]. This comparison between modern and traditional, West and non-West is repeatedly found in representations of Muslim women in the press. In the analysis I conducted of articles for my case study I repeatedly found instances of such comparisons with the representations of Muslim women constructed out of these generalizations.

By conducting a case study of one particular publication my intent is to identify the existing representations of Muslim women and to discuss what these representations suggest through the specific language that is used. The two major stereotypes that are common representations of the Muslim woman are first, the submissive and oppressed

---

[55] Mohanty, p.242-243
[56] Lila Abu-Lughod, *Remaking Women – Feminism and Modernity in the Middle East.* Princeton University Press: Princeton, 1998. p.3
[57] Abu-Lughod, p.13
[58] Abu-Lughod, p.13-14

and second, the exotic and mysterious[59]. These are also the two representations that I encountered repeatedly in my case study of *The New York Times.* Asma Gull Hasan discusses the prevailing stereotypes of Muslim women in West in her work *American Muslims – The New Generation.* She discusses the stereotypes that many Americans have towards Muslim women; especially those who choose to wear the veil. She explains that these Muslim women are often viewed as "inherently foreign, uneducated and oppressed" or in some instances Westerners will associate "an exotic mystique with *hijab,* acknowledging women who wear *hijab* as alien and different"[60]. Marnia Lazreg also discusses the major stereotypes of Muslim women found in both the media and in academic discourse. She explains that for Muslim women, "two extreme interpretations of women have ensued. Women are seen either as embodiments of Islam, or as helpless victims forced to live in its tenets"[61]. It is crucial to understand how these representations are generated in the media at this time and by analyzing how this is done in *The New York Times* I hope to provide some insight into possible larger trends that can be found in other publications.

Muslim Women in the Media

In this section I will examine scholarly works that discuss representations of Muslim women in the media that influenced my analysis of the articles included in my case study of *The New York Times.* Among the works in this field that I refer to are those of Ghazi-Walid Falah, Marnia Lazreg, Elizabeth Poole and Jack Shaheen. Ghazi-Walid

---

[59] See Ghazi-Walid Falah, "The Visual Representation of Muslim/Arab Women in Daily Newspapers in the United States" in Ghazi-Walid Falah and Caroline Nagel, eds., *Geographies of Muslim Women.* Guilford Press: New York, 2005, p.300-301

[60] Asma Gull Hasan, *American Muslims – The New Generation.* Continuum: New York, 2002. p.127

[61] Marnia Lazreg, *The Eloquence of Silence- Algerian Women in Question.* Routledge: New York, 1994, p.14

Falah's study entitled "The Visual Representation of Muslim/Arab Women in Daily Newspapers in the United States" is a particularly useful starting point because it examines the common representations of Muslim women in the American media and the impact of these representations on the American public. In this study Falah argues that, "the use of particular images of women reflects the operational practices of editors, who assign 'news value' to photographs based on ideological meanings associated with certain images, thereby reinforcing these meanings"[62]. According to this argument, media representations are not only the result of ignorance about a specific subject, but they are also deliberately selected to convey a specific message. It is necessary to understand this when analyzing the representations of Muslim women that are found in news articles as it means that some of the content will likely play a role in reinforcing specific messages that a particular representation may convey. In my case study my intent is not to determine whether any specific representation of Muslim women found within the articles is a result of either lack of knowledge on the part of the journalist or influenced by the larger corporation that governs them. While my intention is to discuss existing representations of Muslim women and to examine what depictions can be found within a two year time frame of *The New York Times* it is also necessary to understand the factors that can influence these representations

My research reveals that many articles use either the visual representation of a veiled Muslim woman or specific words in reference to the veil as part of the article's headline, when these images had no connection to the content of the article. I will discuss this in more detail in chapter 2 and 3, where I argue that this finding in particular shows that often writers were trying to add "news value" to their articles through these unrelated

[62] Falah, p.301

images. Falah found that "pictures of Muslim women rarely relate directly to the subject matter in the text, suggesting that the images serve some other purpose than elucidating Muslim women's experiences to a Western audience"[63]. Further, Falah also argues that "pictures of Muslim and Arab women were selected for print with the aim of supplementing and augmenting the persuasive power of the written text"[64] and that these images "have served to reinforce images of Muslim society as the cultural, political, and moral 'other' of the West"[65].

This representation of the Muslim woman as "the other" has been discussed in a vast array of scholarly works[66]. Marnia Lazreg for example, describes this in relation to her study of the representation of Algerian women in her work, *The Eloquence of Silence.* In this study Lazreg explains that,

> Women in Algeria are subsumed under the less-than-neutral labels of 'Muslim women', 'Arab women' or 'Middle-Eastern women', giving them an identity that may not be theirs. Whether the so-called Muslim women are devout or their societies are theocracies, are questions that the labels gloss over[67]

In representing women through these labels it places limitations on them. My analysis of representations of Muslim women in *The New York Times* articles demonstrates that in identifying women as Muslim the authors of the articles make certain assumptions about their personal abilities and how Islam affects their situations. These assumptions fail to recognize the other factors influencing the women's situations and representations of

---

[63] Falah, p.305
[64] Falah, p.301
[65] Falah, p.301
[66] Some of the works I consulted on this subject include: Marnia Lazreg, *The Eloquence of Silence; Algerian Women in Question.* New York: Routledge, 1994. Linda Steet, *Veils and Daggers – A Century of National Geographic's Representation of the Arab World.* Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2000. Faegheh Shirazi, *The Veil Unveiled – The Hijab in Modern Culture.* Gainesville: University of Florida Press, 2001. Mohja Kahf, *Western Representations of the Muslim Woman – From Termagant to Odalisque.* Austin: University of Texas Press, 1999.
[67] Marnia Lazreg, *The Eloquence of Silence; Algerian Women in Question.* New York: Routledge, 1994, p.7

Muslim women are then bound to a narrow definition of what being a Muslim woman means.

According to Falah, the two dominant images of Muslim women in the American press are "women as passive victims" and "women as active political agents"[68]. When shown as passive victims "the underlying message (typically conveyed in the caption) is that their victimization is being alleviated by Western intervention and "liberation"[69]. This image usually applies to articles discussing women in Afghanistan and in Iraq yet, Falah explains that while the "passive victim" image is also used regarding Palestinian women, the "captions and text (often using the passive voice to describe the killings of family members) tend to suggest that their own people are to blame for their victimization"[70]. Whereas in articles depicting women as "active political agents", Falah explains, "photographs are intended to be jarring and to shatter stereotypes about secluded, subordinate Muslim women", yet such images "do not speak to Muslim women's political consciousness and agency as much as they point to an alleged irrationality of Muslim societies and to Muslims' presumed penchant for violence"[71]. My case study reinforced these findings. As I will discuss in the following two chapters in my analysis of the articles, often these depictions of Muslim women reinforce other more general representations of Islam and Muslims. For example, in articles that use the victim representation of Muslim women, the writer attributes their situation to an oppressive quality within Islam or to violence on the part of Muslim men. In this sense the

[68] Falah, p.305
[69] Falah, p.305
[70] Falah, p.305
[71] Falah, p.305-306

representations of Muslim women that are found in many of my case study articles reinforce other stereotypes of Islam and Muslims in a more indirect manner.

In representing Muslim women, the media also tends to focus on difference, which reinforces the perception of Muslim women as "the other". Falah argues that "Arab and Muslim women are rarely portrayed as having 'normal' lives by U.S. standards – that is as simply going to work or to school, having fun or enjoying their lives and families"[72]. According to Shaheen much of this is based on the Western woman's perspective of the status of Muslim women. He argues that, "in Western eyes there are problematic aspects to the status of Muslim women, just as there are problematic aspects to the status of Western women from a Muslim perspective"[73]. He explains that the media fails to depict Muslim women in roles that extend beyond the usual stereotype of being confined to their homes. According to Shaheen, "although Muslim women are successful physicians, teachers and journalists, as well as homemakers, stories seldom present them as excelling in those roles"[74]. In analyzing the articles for my case study, I found that representations that did describe Muslim women in these roles did so by emphasizing that their situation is somehow unique and that the women had to overcome the influence of their religion in order to achieve success. In examining the articles for my case study, I found that that any representations that do not rely on the use of stereotypes often describe the Muslim women in that particular story as exceptional, as though the stereotypes are the norm. In doing this, the writer's draw on the representation of the Muslim woman as 'the other', placing them in a restrictive role based on the notion of difference in comparison with what some may conceive as 'Western'.

---

[72] Falah, p.306
[73] Shaheen, p.41
[74] Shaheen, p.41

Elizabeth Poole examines representations of Muslim women in the media in relation to their relevance in the discourse on Orientalism. She explains that, "the discourse of Orientalism has been transcoded and transferred to the internal Other. Its central elements were used to exoticize and render the internal Other as inherently different if not ultimately 'foreign'"[75]. The representations of Muslim women that I found in my analysis of *The New York Times* can be described as examples of how media is reinforcing this idea of "the internal Other". For example, my study reveals that for Muslim women who are involved with 'Western' organizations (notably the UN) or do not choose to wear the veil, the emphasis on their position as the "Other" is still present, yet slightly diminished. Instead, emphasis is placed on how they are westernized, modern and educated. In the articles discussed in my case study, this is often described as the result of assimilation into Western society or due to intervention from Western countries. Ghazi-Walid Falah argues that, "Whether veiled or exposed, passive or wielding weapons, Muslim women are the ultimate 'Other', and they serve as the main repositories of the West's sense of fear, fascination, and superiority vis-a vis the Muslim world"[76].

The arguments discussed above provide discussion of existing representations of Muslim women that I consulted in order to understand how Muslim women have been presented in the media both historically and within other media publications currently. These works provided insight as to patterns of representation that Muslim women are frequently subjected to in the Western media. In conducting my case study of *The New York Times* between September 11, 2000 and September 11, 2002 I wanted to determine how the articles in this particular publication represented Muslim women and whether the

---

[75] Poole, p.251
[76] Falah, p.318

stereotypes that seem so frequent in other publications played a role in articles found in this one. More importantly, I will examine whether any changes occurred in the representation as a result of the events of September 11, 2001. I will expand on in the following two chapters as I provide specific examples for further discussion. I will use these as a framework for understanding representations of Muslim women in *The New York Times*. The goal of my thesis is not to prove that these representations still exist, which they clearly do, rather it is to understand what representations are presented in discussions of Muslim women and to analyze them in relation to these other stereotypes and representations. As I found though in my analysis, many of the representations discussed in this chapter are in fact reinforced in examples in my own case study which is why this discussion is necessary.

In the following two chapters I present my case study, which is divided into two time periods. Chapter Two focuses on articles published between September 11, 2000 and September 10, 2001. Chapter Three contains articles from September 11, 2001 to September 11, 2002. Within these two chapters I will discuss specific articles from this time frame and analyze the representations of Muslim women presented within each article. I will continue to refer to the framework outlined in this chapter as a basis for understanding the specific representations found within each article.

Framework for Analysis

The two year period of my case study is from September 11, 2000 through September 11, 2002, centering on the events of September 11, 2001 that left many Americans and much of the world in shock. The incidents that occurred on this day not only affected the media coverage of Islam and Muslims, they also resulted in changes to

the civil rights of Muslims living in the United States. As M. Cherif Bassiouni describes in his article "Don't Tread on Me: Is the War on Terror Really a War on Rights?", "the nation has never before seen a more systematic erosion of civil rights than after 9/11"[77]. He goes on to explain, "After September 11, 2001, the administration embarked on a series of measures that started with a wave of arrests of aliens whose status was irregular. But the administration's campaign only focused on people of Arab origin and others who were Muslim"[78]. The impact of September 11, 2001 continues to grow as it resulted in two American-led wars in Afghanistan and in Iraq. Joe L. Kincheloe discusses this in *The Miseducation of the West* explaining, "After 9/11 and the wars in Afghanistan and Iraq the ways images of Islam have been embedded in the Western and especially the American consciousness become extremely important to everyday life"[79]. In analyzing the representations of Muslim women in *The New York Times* within the two year time frame surrounding these events my intention is to analyze whether these events had any impact on the these depictions as there seems to have been a significant impact on both the media and the government towards Muslims.

The following two chapters contain my case study of *The New York Times* with an analysis of a number of articles and their representations of Muslim women. Chapter 2 covers the time period of September 11, 2000 to September 10, 2001 while Chapter 3 deals with September 11, 2001 through September 11, 2002. As I mentioned briefly earlier in the introduction and as I will discuss in greater detail at the beginning of

---

[77] M. Cherif Bassiouni, "Don't Tread on Me: Is the War on Terror Really a War on Rights?" in Elaine C. Hagopian, ed. *Civil Rights in Peril: The Targeting of Arabs and Muslims*. Chicago: Haymarket Books, 2004, p.1 (cited as reprinted with permission from original publication in the *Chicago Tribune*, August 24, 2003)

[78] Bassiouni in Hagopian, ed., p.2

[79] Joe L. Kincheloe, "Introduction" in Joe L. Kincheloe and Shirley R. Steinberg, eds. *The Miseducation of the West – How Schools and the Media Distort Our Understanding of the Islamic World*. Westport and London: Praeger, 2004, p. 1

Chapter 2, each of the selected articles will be analyzed within one of five smaller subcategories; "Veil", "Biographical", "Women's Issues", "Politics" or "Muslims in the West". In this case study I will provide examples from each article that I discuss of representations of Muslim women and I will then analyze these representations in order to understand what is being disseminated through these articles in reference to Muslim women.

Chapter 2

In this chapter, I will present the first half of my case study examining the representation of the "Muslim Woman" in the American press using *The New York Times* as a primary source. This case study covers the duration of two years, from September 1, 2000 to September 30, 2002 and it is based on my analysis of articles about Muslim women that I found in *The New York Times* within this time frame. For this study, articles about the "Muslim Woman" are defined as any articles with written or visual images of Muslim women found in all sections of *The New York Times* over this two year period. As I found a large quantity of articles that pertained to my case study, all of the articles, including those that are not discussed in these two chapters can be found in detail in Appendix A. Ideally, I would like to have discussed all of these articles, as each one of them provides a valuable example of the representation of Muslim women in *The New York Times*. However, because of length restrictions the appendix contains a list of all articles so that I can share all of my findings, while limiting my in-depth analysis to selections from these findings.

Categories for Analysis

Within the two larger categories determined by time, I will analyze the articles within the framework of five subcategories in order to understand the content of the articles as it relates to the larger issue that is discussed. By dividing the articles into smaller categories I was able to analyze how the writers represented Muslim women in reference to a series these larger issues. I determined that the five major themes relevant to the articles that I found in the full two years of my case study are: Veil, Biographical, Women's Issues, Politics and Muslims in the West. I organized the articles according to

these categories based primarily on the subject and the main issues that are dealt with in each article. In order to do this, I read through each article thoroughly to determine what these main issues are and after examining all of the articles I developed five categories based on commonalities between the issues presented. For example, I created the category "Biographical" because a number of the articles focused on one individual and their story whereas in the category "Politics", the main subject of the article is a current political event. I labeled another category "Women's Issues" to encompass articles that focused primarily on women and certain issues that affect them. Many of the articles discussed the experiences of Muslims living in the Diaspora leading me to place these articles in a separate category that I have labeled, "Muslims in the West". In the final category of "Veil", I placed articles that refer to the veil both in their headlines and within the text of the article indicating that this may be the subject of focus. As I will explain further in the analysis of the articles, some articles could fit within multiple categories. As a result I chose the category that I felt was most closely related to the article content. The exception is the category of "Veil" which I will discuss in further detail below.

Veil

The first category I have called "Veil". As I mentioned above, this category includes articles that refer to the veil within their headlines. In some cases, the actual content of the article is unrelated the veil, yet the writer includes this reference as the primary focal point of the article in the headline. The category Veil differs from the other categories, in that the others focus on content whereas in the Veil category I analyze the significance of the headline in relation to the content. I argue that this exception is

justified because there are a significant number of articles that use this common method of representing Muslim women in articles whose content is unrelated to the subject of Muslim women. By referring to the veil in the headline, the reader is led to believe that this is in fact the focal point of the article when it is not.

Biographical

The articles in the category "Biographical" focus on one individual and describe one specific aspect of this woman's life. Articles in this category usually identify the subjects as Muslim women within the first few sentences indicating that this is an influential factor in the women's lives. By presenting this information early in the article, any discussion of the woman's life that follows is understood in relation to her identity as a Muslim. It is important to note however that within the articles, while the actual topic of discussion appears at first glance to be something broader, such as an artist's involvement in an exhibition or a woman's leadership in a United Nations organization, the writers tend to focus on the effects of the woman being a Muslim, in relation to her work in a particular field. This is important to recognize as it is placing significance solely on the role of Islam in the experiences of these women's lives rather than focusing on the individual woman's personal achievements.

Women's Issues

The category "Women's Issues" includes articles that deal with topics clearly understood to relate to women including marital status, familial roles and obligations and concepts of physical beauty. For example, these articles discuss education, illiteracy, laws and traditional customs that have a particular effect on women. Many of the articles included in this category focus on difference - - how the Muslim woman's position in

relation to these topics makes her different than non-Muslim women. More interesting is the comparison that many of the writers make between Muslim women and Western women. While the Muslim women are described as uneducated, oppressed, lacking opportunity and, in some articles, not having a sense of beauty and style, Western women are depicted in the same articles as rescuing these backwards women and bringing them both opportunities and style.

Politics

In the category "Politics", the issues discussed involve current events in the Middle East, Iran, Afghanistan and Turkey along with a few articles that focus on events in countries whose Muslim population is identified within the text. Often these articles do not provide any specific discussion of Muslim women, yet I have included them because they do contain brief mentions, usually in the form of a description of women wearing the veil, intended to provide a specific representation for the reader. By including descriptions of Muslim women in these articles, the authors politicize the women as their inclusion within the article leads readers to believe that there is a connection between them and the political issue discussed. In some of the articles, the authors make a direct reference to the veil as a sign of fundamentalism whether they clearly state that there is a connection or by including the description of a veiled Muslim woman in a sentence discussing Islamic fundamentalism. In this sense, not only is the content of these articles political, the representation of the Muslim woman found within the article is also in itself politicized. The articles found in the "Politics" category were placed here rather than in the "Veil" category for instance because the overall focus of the article involves a current political event as indicated by the headline and the majority of the article text.

Muslims in the West

The final category included in my case study is "Muslims in the West". This category includes articles that discuss issues affecting Muslims living in the West, as well as articles describing Muslim customs. Some of these articles examine everyday experiences such as attending university and the celebration of holidays. Many of the articles discuss the impact of September 11, 2001 on the lives of Muslims living in the United States. Some of the articles attempt to present another perspective on the everyday activities of life in the United States while others clearly emphasize difference in terms of what makes the Muslim woman different from non-Muslim American women. It is within this category of "Muslims in the West" that the largest increase in the quantity of articles took place after September 11, 2001.

I chose these analytical categories for analysis rather than other forms of categorization – geographical organization or organization by author for example, because these categories allow for a deeper insight into how the Muslim woman is constructed in relation to broader issues. By placing the articles under these categories I was able to examine for example how various *New York Times* writers discussed similar issues while also examining them in relation to the diversity of locations discussed in the articles that I found. These categories allowed me to focus on the larger issue rather than one of the factors attributed to the issue.

The case study that follows will proceed according to the chronological order of the two major categories that I have outlined above. In this chapter I cover September 11, 2000 to September 10, 2001 and in chapter 3, September 11, 2001 to September 11, 2002. Within these two major categories I will then proceed to analyze the articles under

the five subcategories of Veil, Biographical, Women's Issues, Politics and Muslims in the West. In each of the sections I will provide specific analysis of the articles and the representations of Muslim women that can be found within them. I will also draw conclusions as to how to understand the representations that are presented in the context of the larger issues that are discussed.

September 2000 to September 10, 2001

In the initial time frame of my case study, the first twelve months, thirty-seven articles contain representations of Muslim women identified by the inclusion of the words "Muslim" or "Islamic" in the description of the women discussed in the articles. In these articles, four make direct reference to the "veil" in their headlines. Seven articles are biographical and another seven deal with women's issues. Within the articles on women's issues, the authors link the issue specifically to Muslim women. Eight articles discuss politics and finally, the largest number of articles I compiled for this time period, are those discussing the situation of Muslim communities in the United States and in Europe. Eleven articles fall within this category. Many of the articles could fit within multiple categories yet I selected the category to which I felt the article content was most relevant.

Veil

The four examples that I will discuss from the articles in the category of Veil bear the titles, "Romance of the Chador", "Behind the Veil", "Saudi Mall-Crawlers Shop till their Veils Drop" and "Saudis Offer Veiled Welcome to Tourists of a Certain Age". These articles have in common that they use language that suggests specific images of the "Muslim Woman" to the reader. The images I refer to are those that represent Muslim

women as "the other" through maintaining specific generalizations of seclusion, submissiveness and exoticism in the imagery and the way that such imagery is used to connect these generalizations with the wearing of the veil. I selected these four particular articles as examples for this category because the writers were clearly trying to emphasize the imagery of the veil through the headline and the text itself. Interestingly, in all four of these examples, although the veil image is incorporated into the headline, rather than overtly referring to the physical wearing of the veil, as is described through additional imagery in the text, the headlines use the veil image as a metaphor for seclusion ("Behind the Veil"), for something mysterious, implied as negative ("Saudis Offer a Veiled Welcome to Tourists of a Certain Age"), the exotic ("Romance of the Chador") and as the "other" emphasizing appearance in a tone of sarcasm ("Saudi Mall-Crawlers Shop till their Veils Drop").

In the first article, "Romance of the Chador: The video artist Shirin Neshat's elaborately staged films express the real-life dramas of women living under Islam"[80], Deborah Solomon looks at the content and motivation behind the films of Iranian-American Shirin Neshat. The language used within the title, aside from the use of the word "chador", provides its own specific image of Muslim women. The choice of the words "real-life drama" and "living under Islam" are important as their meanings can be understood negatively when placed in the same sentence. By this I mean that "real-life drama" often implies hardships and/or challenges, while the words "living under Islam" creates the sense the women are controlled by Islam. As a result of this title's particular wording the readers are prompted to relate the difficult situations of the women discussed in the article to their religion, Islam.

[80] Solomon, p.SM41, Mar 25, 2001

The main subject of the article is the work of the filmmaker Shirin Neshat and her stories about women in a country "presumed" to be Iran. Although her films are purely fictional, Solomon explains how they have the "look and feel" of documentary cinema and asserts in several instances that the restrictive atmosphere surrounding the female characters is a reflection of reality. Several passages in Solomon's article reveal this. For example, she refers to Neshat's videos as "star vehicles for the chador (literally 'tent')", describing the chador as "the traditional veil of Iran, a square of black fabric that falls from head to toe and looks conveniently dramatic on film". Another example implies that there is a connection between veiling and the lack of freedom. In reference to Neshat's work, Solomon explains that "it's hard not to view her work in political terms – it is always reminding you that Iran is a repressive place where a woman must cloak her body".

In another passage, Solomon refers to another major stereotypical Western image of Muslim women, the exotic Muslim woman living within the harem. She describes images such as these as resembling a "stag party" as can be described through "painters ranging from Rembrandt to Matisse" as "opulent, Orientalist fantasies of sultans and desert landscapes and overcrowded female harems". In contrast to this image, Solomon describes Neshat's work as "the harem gone beserk", stating that in Neshat's films, the women "instead of idly lying around, are always leaving. They escape in rowboats, through soothing daydreams of romance or, when all else fails, through madness". This statement implies multiple images. First, that the typical perception of the Muslim woman is that she resides in a harem where the days are passed idly in seclusion and as is inferred by the use of the word "escape", they are secluded against their will. In contrast,

the later statement implies that those who leave this setting do so as a form of rebellion seeking either love or death. By drawing such a comparison, Solomon reinforces the stereotypes by implying that anything that differs from this harem stereotype is a result of the women being drawn outside by her inner desires.

In the second article, "Behind the Veil"[81], Diane Johnson reviews Elaine Sciolino's book *Persian Mirrors: The Elusive Face of Iran*. Sciolino herself is also a writer for *The New York Times* and indeed my case study includes several articles by her. For this reason, the article reviewing her work is of particular interest. The review however includes more of Johnson's impressions of Iran and her version of the status of Muslim women then an actual review of Sciolino's work. For example, the article opens with a story about an experience Johnson had in an American airport,

> In the Atlanta airport a few months ago I was startled to see a man and his two wives encamped on the carpeted floor surrounded by their six little sons, the women entirely shrouded in black chadors, their faces veiled, only their eyes showing. This is a sight one often sees in England but seldom here, a rare reminder of the existence of a culturally and geographically distant people whose lives are intertwined with our own more than we realize.

The example given is particularly interesting as it is not related to the content of the article, the review of *Persian Mirrors*. Johnson paints a specific picture of these "distant people" and leaves the reader with a particular image of the Muslim woman as she or he reads the remainder of the article. Moreover, Johnson makes the assumption that the two women she saw in the airport were both wives of the man they were sitting with. She seems confident in this assumption although she does not provide any justification for it. In another sentence Johnson states "Islam is not, to be sure, the only religion that shrouds women but it has clung with special anxiety to the idea that women must be covered". The use of the word "shroud" is an interesting choice as it can be understood either in the

[81] Johnson, p.BR12, October 22, 2000

sense that the religion itself is "shrouding the women" or in the physical sense referring to the idea that "a woman must be covered". The use of the words "shroud" and "covered" also imply two major images, the first being completely closed off physically while the second connotation makes reference to one being enveloped by a cloth of death. The use of vocabulary comparing the veil to objects of physical restriction and in this particular example, to a death shroud, is evident in a number of the articles that I will discuss in this category.

In another article, "Saudis Offer Veiled Welcome to Tourists of a Certain Age"[82], Neil MacFarquhar discusses the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia's interest to catering to retired tourists age 65 and over. MacFarquhar's choice of the words "veiled welcome" creates a dual image for the reader. The first image is that of the veiled woman, an image which he reinforces in another statement "women are expected to walk around tented from head-to-toe in black". The other image that the words invoke is that this invitation of tourism has some hidden purpose or that it is not completely sincere. MacFarquhar's article is filled with sarcastic attempts at humour invoking negative images in an attempt to exaggerate the more conservative aspects that he perceives to be attributed to Saudi Arabia. MacFarquhar describes the Kingdom, "With its bleak deserts and its moral code that makes Pilgrims seem louche" and tells his readers "There is just something – be it that drinking a beer is illegal or that that convicted murderers get their heads lopped off on downtown squares – that does not beckon most outsiders".

Even MacFarquhar's attempt at a less opinionated statement regarding tourism opportunities in Saudi Arabia is more of a criticism as to why anyone would consider such a vacation experience as he directs a comment to anyone who may be interested,

[82] MacFarquhar, p.A1, July 09, 2001

"Aside from the ban on alcohol and the dress code for women, the county offers a variety of outlandish – not to say bizarre – traditions…". In this particular article the implied image of the Muslim woman in Saudi Arabia is that she is essentially an a roving figure living inside a black tent, referring to his choice of the description of women as "tented from head-to-toe in black". In describing the Kingdom, MacFarquhar adds an equally insulting statement to summarize his opinion of Saudi culture. He uses the adjectives "outlandish" and "bizarre" to the traditions that he is familiar with, although from reading this article it is unclear what specific "traditions" are being referred to in this statement. As the article is more concerned with emphasizing MacFarquhar's understanding of Saudi legal practice, the traditions that would draw tourists to visit the Kingdom fail to be elaborated on. Furthermore, in reading the text of the article and reflecting on the headline, it is clear that MacFarquhar intended to imply a dual meaning through the use of the word Veil in the headline to present both this image of a faceless population of black cloth in reference to women and as a hidden motive or insincerity in reference to the Saudi government in their desire to increase tourism.

In "Saudi Mall-Crawlers Shop Till Their Veils Drop",[83] Susan Sachs plays on the common North American expression "shop till you drop". By ironically invoking a Saudi version of this phrase, "shop till their veils drop". This juxtaposition of East and West is reinforced by the following image, "In a country that has no movie theaters or public concerts, where women are not welcome at events like horse racing and sword-dancing, the mall is one of few places where the sexes mix – and can hang out". There she provides her image of the disadvantages of Saudi women for the reader. Sachs also includes a physical image of Saudi girls as "wrapped in loose-fitting head-to-toe black

[83] Sachs, p.A4, Dec.05, 2000

cloaks to conform with the country's strict interpretation of Islamic modesty", yet she tells readers that "in the shiny malls, many let some hair show". This statement implies that Islam is the restrictive force encompassing Saudi society yet in the modern, Western style surroundings of the shopping mall, the Muslim woman is set free from these restrictions.

This preoccupation with the veil found in the four articles discussed above recurs in examples which I placed in other categories. I placed these specific articles in their own category however because of the inclusion of the word "veil" or variations of the word, such as "chador" within the title. The headlines of the articles are as important to analyze as the content of the article itself as it is usually by the headline that the reader selects which article to read and makes their initial judgment on the subject that is dealt with in the body of text that will follows.

Biography

The second category is "Biography" which includes five articles, two of which I will analyze in detail below. The first is "Woman with a New View of Culture"[84]. In this piece, Barbara Crossette describes the accomplishments of Thoraya Obaid, the woman at the head of the United Nations Population Fund. In the opening sentence of the article Obaid is identified as "a Muslim woman from conservative Saudi Arabia". In another section of the article, Crossette reasserts the "conservativeness" of Obaid's country of origin, describing it as "an Arab country where women's rights are still severely limited". She includes a comment from her interview with Obaid regarding women's issues implying that some women's issues are exclusive to Muslim countries. For example, Crossette states that Obaid "reminds Muslim leaders that many girls are indeed married

[84] Crossette, p.A8, June 20, 2001

very young", as though this is an issue limited to religion alone rather than an issue belonging to culture or tradition in many societies. Additionally, instead of discussing broader issues of concern that Obaid focuses on in her work with the UN Population fund, there seems to be a focus on how Obaid, as a "Muslim" in this position can use her power to deal with problems of the Muslim world. In this sense Obaid is placed in the position of the "Other" and emphasis is placed on how being a Muslim woman affects her actions. Crossette implies that this qualifies her to speak on behalf of all Muslim countries and all Muslim women thereby ignoring the traditions and customs of any particular country and within it the existence of regional differences that often play a greater role in the way a society is functioning than the assumed role that religion plays.

In an earlier article, "Working for Women's Sexual Rights"[85], in which Crossette interviewed Obaid's predecessor Dr. Nafis Sadik, this assumption that being a Muslim woman is an automatic qualification of expertise in all areas of the Muslim world is yet again implied. While knowledge of a shared religion is useful in understanding one aspect of individual Muslim countries, such assumptions reinforce this idea that the so called Muslim world is one entity. She tells readers that, according to Sadik, "her Muslim upbringing and her background in the developing world have enhanced her credibility in dealing with reluctant or suspicious governments and societies". This statement conveys an image to readers that Muslim societies and governments are uncooperative and untrustworthy and that Sadik, because she is a Muslim, must have the ability to deal with Muslim populations and individuals in power. Crossette is creating a bias in the sense that she selects excerpts from her interviews in order to assert to readers that such issues

[85] Crossette, p.A8, Oct 2, 2000

as described above are limited to Muslim populations and that all Muslims can be described this way.

Women's Issues

In the category "Women's Issues" I have selected three articles for further analysis. The first is "Honor Killings"[86], an article whose writer is not attributed. The article opens with the following paragraph,

> Two years ago in Jordan, a 17-year old girl became pregnant after being raped by a family friend. Instead of reporting the rapist, the girl's father and brother shot her eight times and left her for dead. Like many other women in Jordan who are threatened by their families, she was sent to jail for her own protection after receiving medical care.[87]

Although the article goes on to explain that honor killings occur throughout the world and are not limited to the Middle East, the author follows this information with the statement "But such killings are most common in Islamic nations" and that they "it is impossible to know the extent of these crimes because most take place in repressive countries where reporting is poor". Even though the author adds that "many men who commit honor killings cite the Koran, but most scholars say there is no justification in Islam for these crimes, they are a manifestation of the social pressures of traditional societies…", the emphasis on the killings frequency more so in "Islamic" and "repressive" countries is the initial information provided to the readers. Instead of further analysis of the possibility that honour killings result from pressures of society and tradition on those who commit the act, the author instead provides extensive discussion prior to this statement that Islam may play a role in leading individuals to commit these acts. While the author may merely be trying to analyze both sides of the argument, the choice of vocabulary emphasizes the

---

[86] author unknown, WK14, Nov 12, 2000
[87] author unknown, WK14, Nov 12, 2000

role of Islam as the motive for violence rather than discussing it as one of many possible factors.

In the second article entitled "Love Finds a Way in Iran: 'Temporary Marriage'"[88], Elaine Sciolino describes the practice of temporary marriage or *sigheh* as, "How to wrap premarital sex in an Islamic cloak". In another section of the article she describes one example of how temporary marriage has been portrayed in the Iranian media. Sciolino describes an article from a weekly tabloid about "a chador-wearing prostitute" infecting her clients with the AIDS virus. Sciolino places this example within the context of a larger discussion citing men who both support the practice of temporary marriage and others who address their concern for the fate of the women who engage in it. One man told another weekly paper, "If I temporarily marry a young woman for three years and then divorce her, would anyone be willing to marry her? It would be impossible that any man would want to have a family with this woman". As a result, while both sides of the argument regarding this practice of temporary marriage are presented by Sciolino, the reader is left with the impression that no matter what side of the argument women are on, their situation is one of rejection and powerlessness.

In another article entitled "Turkish Women Who See Death as a Way Out"[89], Douglas Frantz does not immediately identify the women in his article as Muslim women. Instead he first discusses the difficulties and the abuse faced by women in one particular Turkish village and in the conclusion of the article summarizes how their experiences as Muslim women compare to those of Muslim women in other countries.

---

[88] Sciolino, p.A3, Oct.4, 2000
[89] Frantz, p.A3, Nov.3, 2000

Concluding the article with such a statement seems to imply that Frantz intended to draw a connection between these experiences and Islam,

> Women in Turkey have more freedom than their counterparts in other Muslim countries, but in the southeast the culture remains more conservative and women are passive observers. Too often, experts say, they cannot control their lives, only their deaths.

The main body of the article includes a number of stories of women facing abuse in the village of Batman, Turkey and Frantz repeatedly describes a situation of powerlessness for the women living there. In describing one particular case of abuse, Frantz explains, "A 22-year-old woman threw herself from the roof of a seven-story apartment building across from her family's apartment after being beaten by her parents for wearing a tight skirt". The village women as a group are described as completely powerless by Frantz, "men rule with the authority of a feudal lord. The women raise the children and live in the shadows, usually behind a veil..." and he claims "every woman under 30 seems to be either pregnant or carrying an infant or both". Frantz leads readers to believe that life for women in this village is limited to seclusion in the home and he tells readers that "girls who go to school or have jobs face rigid rules and harsh punishment at home". The women of this article are reduced to helpless, uneducated victims of abuse whose only alternate option is severe punishment or suicide. This issues described in this article may have some connection to tradition and local custom yet Frantz ascribes the experiences of some of these women to their Islamic faith by including the words "Muslim country" in the conclusion of the article.

Politics

This section includes an analysis of six articles that are primarily political yet they also include specific representations of the Muslim woman. I found that the articles

dealing with a political issue tended to include unrelated descriptions of Muslim women wearing the veil. In these articles, the writers attempt to draw connections between the veiled women and political defiance in some of the examples and societal exclusion in others. While many of the examples that follow could have fit in the Veil section, I determined that they were more relevant for this section as the majority of the article's text is devoted to the political issue or event and the representation of the Muslim woman is included either as an example to describe the local environment or as a participant in reference to the political issue. For example, in "Defiant Chinese Muslims Keep Their Own Time"[90] Elisabeth Rosenthal limits the discussion of the female Muslim population in China's Kashgar to the following two images: "This far flung city of veiled women, spice markets and donkey carts" and "the crowded mosques and veiled women in Xinjiang did not reflect piety so much as protest". Here we learn that the Muslim women in this region are veiled and many of them wear the veil not because of their religious beliefs, but rather for political reasons. This image serves to emphasize the difference of women in this region from Chinese women in the rest of the country while asserting that the veil is a symbol of defiance in this region of China. The impact of this image is that the Muslim woman becomes a politicized symbol. Rosenthal fails to examine the more complex relationship between religion and politics in this region instead reducing it one existing as a reaction to the other.

In many of the articles there is a theme of repetition as the writers try to incorporate images of the veiled Muslim woman within the text. As I mentioned above, this image is not always relevant to the actual subject of the text yet it is included as an almost expected representation of the Muslim woman when the writers attempt to include

[90] Rosenthal, p.3, Nov.19, 2000

them in their discussion. Likewise, in some examples the writers describe Muslim men as "bearded" despite the irrelevance of this detail in relation to the article content. An example of this is Douglas Frantz's, "Persecution Charged in Ex-Soviet Republic"[91]. In describing one Muslim woman in Uzbekistan, Frantz emphasizes the fact that she wears a headscarf, "Beneath the silk head scarf, her eyes were filled with thought and prayer, grief and anger". In another sentence Frantz describes the implications of outward signs of belief when he explains "Women wearing head scarves and men with beards, signs of Muslim piety, were banned from state universities in 1997". Additionally, readers are provided the image that religious Muslim women work in the home, thus assuming that all women working outside of the home are therefore not as pious, as described in the following example, "Few devout Muslim women in Uzbekistan work outside their homes". I include this sentence because it makes a generalized assumption of a population using religion when in fact there may be economic, personal or culturally-influenced factors influencing the decision to work inside the home.

Similar generalizations can be found in an article discussing Iranian cinema, "In Iran, Expressions of a Country's Soul" [92], although in this particular article the author argues that the cinema industry in Iran demonstrates a more accurate depiction of Iranian culture for the Western audience. In order to argue this, Elaine Sciolino describes some images of Iran prevalent in the American press and popular culture mainly an atmosphere of anti-Americanism coupled with the usual visual images of veiled women. She gives the example of one dominant image of Iran "as a country of dour, repressed women swathed in black and bearded young men chanting 'Death to America!". According to

---

[91] Frantz, p.6, Oct.29, 2000
[92] Sciolino, p.AR1 & 24, Mar.11, 2001

Sciolino, the Iranian film industry is effective in transcending such images. Sciolino states that "more than any other medium, film has helped break down the dominant Western images of Iran" and it can in fact provide "the most direct glimpse into this complicated culture". While Sciolino seems to be challenging negative stereotypes about Iran, the argument for film as a means to understand Iranian culture is also problematic and difficult to analyze. Even though these films that Sciolino describes may not perpetuate existing Western stereotypes of Iran, they are in fact fictional creations. One cannot understand American culture solely through the American film industry, nor do the images presented necessarily provide the full reality of American life just as Iranian films may show certain aspects of the Iranian culture while failing to present a full picture of it. Sciolino does make an effort to convey that Westerners fail to understand Iranian culture when they continue to perpetuate the negative stereotypes and her argument seems to be a challenge to readers to look past the stereotypes and perhaps seek other sources of information through which to understand Iranian culture.

As I described previously, many of the articles attempt to draw a connection between a political issue and the Muslim woman's wearing of the veil. Some of the articles make clear statements ascribing fundamentalist tendencies to those women who wear the veil. An example of this can be found in the article "Despite Turkey's Secularism, Ramadan Exerts a Strong Force",[93] where Douglas Frantz states that "The government is on constant alert for signs of Islamic fundamentalism, and women are forbidden to wear headscarves in universities and public buildings". The implication of this choice of words is that the reader will assume that there is a direct correlation between headscarves and fundamentalism. As there is no further discussion of this

[93] Frantz, p.A15, Dec.26, 2000

statement and it is the single time that the veil is mentioned in the article, placing it within the same sentence as the word fundamentalism assumes that all Muslim women who wear the veil are fundamentalists. While many Muslim women do in fact wear the veil and the existence of female Muslim fundamentalists is a reality, the construction of the above sentence provides no clear connection between the two statements nor does it provide any discussion defining "Islamic fundamentalism" or any understanding as to why headscarves are forbidden in Turkey's universities and public buildings.

In another article, "With Trepidation, Saudi Arabia Meets the World"[94], Susan Sachs looks at the challenges faced by Saudi Arabia as it opens its doors to increased tourism and partnerships with foreign nations and companies. I selected this article for further discussion as it includes words that convey a sense of restriction and destruction. Sachs explains "For a society accustomed to its king and princes, where foreign publications are censored, where the study of Western philosophy is banned and where women may appear publicly only if swathed in black cloth, there are minefields ahead". The emphasis is on the rejection of the West and the Saudi women are described as being "swathed" a word that evokes the image of an all-encompassing, restricted and passive physical existence or it can also refer to the swaddling wrap of an infant in a tight piece of cloth to restrict movement. As well, Sachs chooses the word "minefields" to describe the challenges that lay ahead for tourism in Saudi Arabia. Using the word minefields as a metaphor for obstacles or challenges attributes a destructive capability to these challenges. Sachs obviously chose this word for a particular reason in order to convey a certain image. Later in the article, Sachs explains how the existence of a Western presence in itself provided Saudi women with opportunities. She describes a protest that

[94] Sachs, p.22, Dec.10, 2000

took place during the Gulf War, "when American and European soldiers, male and female, poured into Saudi Arabia for the Gulf War 10 years ago, a group of educated women in Riyadh, emboldened by the presence of Westerners, flouted the ban on women drivers". The image that this invokes for the reader is that the Muslim woman in Saudi Arabia is essentially restricted and powerless and the only way to change this is with Western influence. As another article by Sachs discussed in the Veil section shows, she tends to equate any presence that she considers Western, be it the shopping mall or the physical presence of Americans to any action by Saudi women that she considers to be a sign of protest such as driving or partially unveiling.

In the final article that I analyzed for this section, "The Miniskirt as a National Security Threat"[95] Jenny Lyn Bader describes the limits of fashion in some parts of the world, "From head scarves to chadors to Bermuda shorts, fashion is a tempting political scapegoat". Bader uses the head scarf as a contrast to what one would understand as the main subject of her article, the miniskirt, "On the opposite end of the political spectrum from the mini, the most widely persecuted piece of cloth these days is the Islamic headscarf. For some, covered hair can be as scandalous as naked legs". She compares the wearing of the head scarf in the Turkish parliament to "showing up in the United States Senate in Confederate flag earrings". In another sentence she states, "Regimes that scapegoat clothing give new meaning to the concept of fashion victim". This article is an interesting example as it moves from a discussion of the mini-skirt, an item of clothing thought controversial by some for its excessive display of skin, to a lengthier discussion on the more controversial practice of veiling. While the miniskirt appears to be the subject indicated by the headline, such a small portion of the actual text is devoted to this

[95] Bader, p.WK3, Sept.10, 2000

topic. Instead, Bader focuses on how the veil has now come to be viewed in many countries as the "national security threat" thereby politicizing the Muslim woman as a symbol of threat and defiance.

Muslims in the West

In this fifth and final section I discuss articles about Muslim communities in the Diaspora. Although many of these articles as well could easily fit into some of the previous categories discussed, I created this category because the overall theme of the social/community experience is the prominent issue. As with many of the articles in all five categories, the veil continues to be used as a descriptive word to describe the women within the articles, often as the single-word that conveys to readers that the subject is a Muslim woman. In some articles, image takes the place of language to identify the Muslim identity of the women found within. Two of the articles discussed here contain visual instead of literary images, "The Immigrant Journey Gets No Easier in Britain" by Sarah Lyall and Robert Hanley's, "Different Views, Similar Feelings". In "The Immigrant Journey Gets No Easier in Britain"[96], a photo of two women wearing headscarves is captioned with the words, "Young women walking past a car dealership that was burned during recent rioting between Asian and white residents in Bradford, England". The image of veiled women identifies the subjects of the photo as Muslim women and by placing the women at the scene of destruction the immediate message to readers is that there is a link between the subjects and the destruction, when in fact the connection is more complex. The photo uses Muslim women as a symbol of the riot which can either be understood as victimizing or politicizing Muslim women. While the riots discussed may be a result of tension between immigrants and non-immigrants in

[96] Lyall, p.A3, Jul 13, 2001

Britain, Lyall's depicts these as tension and focuses on the Muslim identity of the immigrants living in Bradford. The problem with this is that it reduces these tensions to being an issue of religion.

In the other article, "Different Views, Similar Feelings"[97], Robert Hanley includes two photos of women wearing headscarves with text describing political rallies in New York and New Jersey in support of Palestinian liberation. One of the photos shows young women involved in some form of protest who appear to be shouting as they hold up posters. In the text of the article, one woman explains to Hanley "As a Palestinian –American and a Moslem, I have to show my support for my family and my people". While this article is certainly political and it could fall in category four, I included it in this particular category because the initial subject of the article text is relations between the Jewish and Palestinian communities of the New York area. This topic emphasizes what Hanley describes as a politicization of immigrant communities. In this article Hanley focuses on the Palestinian-Muslim community and examines their identity as both Palestinians and as Americans. The representation that this article presents is that, although they are American, there tends to be a stronger allegiance of the Palestinian-American community (with the article focusing on Muslims in this particular community) to their ethnic or religious community locally and internationally, rather than to their identity as Americans. The problem with these examples is that they place a value judgment on a community in which some of its members may be more politically active than members of other immigrant communities. Hanley uses this participation as a way to describe difference and defiance and in reference to the Muslim Palestinian woman; she

[97] Hanley, p.B1, Oct.14, 2000

thus becomes a symbol of this political activity as conveyed through the photographs and interviews that Hanley includes in this article.

Other articles in this category deal with issues of acceptance, understanding and tolerance of Muslims by non-Muslims in North America and Europe. All of these articles describe the clothing individual Muslims and emphasize how this made them different from others. This is done either through the author's comparisons alone, between Western and 'Muslim' dress or by supporting their argument using excerpts from their interviews with Muslim women, in which they describe the connection between their clothing and their sense of identity. The article "British City Defines Diversity and Tolerance"[98] describes a Muslim community in Leicester, UK. In the article, Warren Hoge explains the reaction of students to questions about racial tolerance in their community. In discussing the question of tolerance, Hoge focuses on the students physical appearance emphasizing how these students may be perceived as different. For example, he describes the students as "A group of black and Asian high school students in head scarves and embroidered caps" and when questioned as to whether they had ever experienced racism, Hoge writes, "One student replied 'No never...they are used to us and our Asian clothes'". The assumption that this question implies is that because of their clothes the students do not fit into British society and he appeals to this sense of belonging in his line of questioning. Also, he clearly indicates difference when he describes the students as "black and Asian". As a result he is not only focusing on religious difference, he is also drawing on racial differences.

[98] Hoge, p.A1, Feb.08, 2001

Another article that draws a connection between religion, clothing and a sense of belonging is a "Chance to Live, and Then Describe, Her Own American Dream"[99] by Matthew Purdy. Purdy describes the Muslim woman that he is interviewing as, "as much Bengali as American" and he explains to readers that, "In her devout Muslim family, hanging out with friends – particularly at the mall – is forbidden. This was the first year she wore American teenage garb to school instead of Muslim dress". Purdy adds that the young woman confided "I've basically never chilled". The image that these particular statements convey is that a Muslim teenage girl is somehow lacking in the "normal" American teenage experience because she dresses differently from her classmates and may not participate in the same activities as them. Purdy also describes the young woman's academic achievements as though they are exceptional for someone facing so many restrictions.

In this article, readers are informed about what makes this Muslim teenage girl so different from other American teenagers, yet there is no description of what types of activities she and her friends do enjoy together. This would demonstrate that while she may not be hanging out at the mall there are other activities that she does share with other teenagers. Also, this article, like many others does not clarify that while the women discussed are Muslim, their situations are not necessarily similar to those of other Muslim women. Some restrictions on the Muslim women described in some of the articles may, for example, be more cultural than religious. The articles rarely explain the possible influence of culture rather than or in addition to religion. Not to understand this would be to generalize about all Muslims, who of course come from many different cultural traditions and experiences. This generalization could be limited if writers would at least

[99] Purdy, p.21, June 24, 2001)

take into consideration the individual Muslim communities or individuals that they are describing and perhaps instead of focusing on their religion as their primary identity, also explore local customs, tradition and history as an influence.

In another article, "On Campus and on Knees, Facing Mecca"[100], American Muslim Sarah Ibrahim tells Jodi Wilgoren about her first-year college dormitory experience. Wilgoren describes to readers that as "A committed Muslim who covers her hair around men outside her family, Ms. Ibrahim feared she might never be able to remove her head scarf and go to sleep". From this excerpt, readers can understand the difficulties associated with dormitory-style accommodation for some Muslim women. The articles educates readers how the living situation was adapted to accommodate this student's needs,

> But she soon returned to campus, the only freshman with a single room in the all-woman dormitory. Now a sophomore, Ms. Ibrahim often cooks Islamically approved food, or halal, in the suite she shares with eight other women, three of them Muslim. Men are banned from the restroom on her floor, and a suite-mate's boyfriend is careful to announce himself rather than barge in.

I included these two excerpts from the text to show how Wilgoren's article attempts to educate readers as well as to tell a story. This article takes on an issue facing some Muslim women as they embark on a university experience, shows some Muslim practices that may require different living arrangements, as well how universities can and do provide solutions for the students who require this. Despite the informative aspects of this article however, it still emphasizes difference confirmed by Wilgoren's description of Ibrahim as only a description of her headscarf, "There's a whole culture of being different," Ms. Ibrahim shrugged under her mauve and vanilla headscarf "You're

---

[100] Wilgoren, p.A1, Feb.13, 2001

considered somewhat cooler if you don't do what everyone else does". While this statement does focus on difference, the young woman's indication that it is actually "cooler" to be different ends up challenging the negativity associated with not fitting in. In this sense the things that Wilgoren describes as setting the woman apart from other teenagers in fact empowers this woman. The self-control necessary to be "different" in the Islamic sense from other teenagers as represented in this particular article provides a positive portrayal of Muslim women that is absent in many of the articles that I found for this case study. As I have mentioned in the analysis of previous articles, many of the writers associate the wearing of the veil or the participation of Muslim women in other Islamic practices as something that is forced upon the women. This is discussed again in the following article.

Although the article "A Scholarship and a Crisis"[101] is a compilation of four interviews with Palestinian students talking about their educational experience during the US scholarship program that they are part of, the responses included from the one female recipient do not reflect the same questions as those posed to the males interviewed. Rather, there is a lengthy discussion about this woman's wearing of the veil. Although this topic is unrelated to the article's subject, Lagerquist includes a lengthy response from this particular student on the issue.

> For personal reasons I wear a head scarf, and I have gotten very used to being perceived as backward and uneducated. In the U.S. I often get asked, 'What does it feel like to be oppressed?' It's a huge factor in developing myself to prove that not only Arab women but Muslim women can be leaders. It is also a perception in the Arab world that, religiously and culturally, it's not where women should be. The way to deal with it is to set an example in how you conduct yourself

This statement responds to encounters that Muslim women may experience as a result of the stereotypical image of the Muslim woman as oppressed while at the same time not

[101]Lagerquist, p.EL30-32, Aug 5, 2001

dispelling the stereotypes altogether. Rather, the explanation seems to describe the Muslim woman's existence as coping and dealing with obstacles to personal empowerment. At the same time this response offers harsh criticism of the Arab world and its position on women and power. The information provided lumps women from this entire region of the "Arab world" into one category - those struggling to overcome a position of powerlessness without examining the differing political possibilities and limitations for women in each of the countries that make up the "Arab world".

The final article that I have included for analysis in this first section of my case provides specific images for readers to identify two separate images of the Muslim woman. One of the major issues of this article, "'New Danes', Differences Create a Divide"[102] by Roger Cohen is cultural tradition. The individuals discussed in the article must come to terms with their families' cultural expectations to uphold traditions of their parent's homeland. Cohen focuses a personal story of arranged marriage by a young Dane of Turkish immigrant parents to the daughter of a family friend who Cohen describes as, "a modest young woman in a traditional headscarf who knew nothing of life outside the village". Another woman is introduced later in the article, a woman who would become the second wife. Two distinct and contrasting images of Muslim women are presented in this article as the man describes his relationships to each of the women. The initial description of the first wife is of a veiled girl ignorant to life outside of her village placed suddenly moved to a distant, European country. Cohen adds the following statement from the husband reaffirming her non- belonging, "My wife was wearing a veil and that was a problem for me in Denmark. You have to adapt, give up something to get something, but she would not. I was going out with Danish friends, but it was awkward

[102] Cohen, p.A1, Dec.18, 2000

with Sorgul. I felt I could not show her in a veil". The first wife is described here as though she is an object for display as her husband is worrying about "showing" her to his friends. In contrast, his second wife, also a Muslim but one who does not wear the veil, is described in a completely different manner. A photo is included informing readers that the second wife does not veil, but this is not considered a subject worth exploring in the text.

In many of the articles I examined in all five categories and in both time frames, the physical description of the Muslim woman was only included when the woman was described as wearing the veil. In contrast in the articles that discussed the Muslim woman who did not veil, the author informed readers that the woman being discussed was Muslim but the physical description was replaced by a photo only and no further discussion on physical appearance is included. The subject only becomes important if one chooses to wear it. For example, Cohen describes the second wife as, "Born and raised in Aarhus, fluent in Danish, Fatma, 27 is very different from Sorgul, at home in the West, emancipated, sparkling, sophisticated". The image that readers are provided with in this article is that the Muslim woman who wears the veil in the West and who works in the home does not fit in, does not conform and as a result creates an obstacle for herself in becoming part of society. On the other hand, the Muslim woman who wears Western clothes, works outside of the home and chooses not to veil is more advanced than her veiled counterpart. This article refers directly to the stereotypes discussed by Hasan, Falah and Shaheen that subjugate the veiled Muslim woman to being uneducated and oppressed[103].

---

[103] See Ghazi-Walid Falah, "The Visual Representation of Muslim/Arab Women in Daily Newspapers in the United States" in Ghazi-Walid Falah and Caroline Nagel, eds., *Geographies of Muslim Women.*

While increased coverage of the Muslim community is a positive step forward as it indicates that this community is just one of many that make up the American (or, in some of the cases, British or Danish) general population, the content of the articles remains focused on how this community is different from the rest of the nation. Repeatedly the reader is informed on how physical appearance in the form of dress sets Muslims, and more specifically in my case study, Muslim women, apart from the rest of the population. The articles discussing women who wear the veil include 26 out of 37 articles in the first half of the case study and 67 out of 92 articles in the second half. These articles always include a full description of a veiled woman and often a photo to reinforce the image. In other articles that describe women as Muslim and provide photos showing that they do not wear the veil, no physical description is discussed in the text. Instead there are references to them being Westernized, educated, liberal and in some instances, moderately religious. Although readers are learning about different aspects of the Muslim community, there is no understanding that this community is made up of a number of different cultural groups, immigrants and non-immigrants and that it includes individuals who follow different branches of Islam. As a result, this attempt to convey a generalized image of the Muslim community is misleading as is this attempt to reinforce this image of the Muslim woman as the other[104]. In the following chapter I will analyze the articles found in *The New York Times* in the period of September 11, 2001 to September 11, 2002. I will do this in order to understand the representations of the Muslim woman in the context of the events of September 11, 2001 and the war in

---

Guilford Press: New York, 2005, Asma Gull Hasan, *American Muslims – The New Generation.* Continuum: New York, 2002 and Jack Shaheen, *The TV Arab.* Bowling Green State University Popular Press: Bowling Green, 1984

[104] See Mamia Lazreg, *The Eloquence of Silence –Algerian Women in Question.* Routledge: New York, 1994 for a discussion of the Muslim woman as the "Other" in chapter 1, "Decolonizing Feminism", p.6-19

Afghanistan that followed, in order to draw conclusions as to the affect of these events on the representation of the Muslim woman in *The New York Times* during this two year time frame.

Chapter 3

September 11, 2001 – September 11, 2002

In the previous chapter I analyzed articles from the first half of my case study time frame, September 11, 2000 to September 10, 2001. In this chapter I will examine articles with representations of Muslim women published on September 11, 2001 through to the following year on September 11, 2002. I use the same methodology in this chapter, analyzing the articles within the framework of my five subcategories of "Veil", "Biographical", "Women's Issues", "Politics" and "Muslims in the West". I do this in order to maintain a framework which will allow me to draw comparative conclusions from my findings within the two timeframes. The total number of articles that this half of the case study is comprised of is 92. Within this timeframe the number of articles discussing Muslim-American communities has increased significantly, 35 articles as opposed to 11 in the previous time period. Of these articles, 26 discuss the experiences of Muslim-American women following September 11, 2001 while the other 9 examine other issues in the lives as Muslim women[105].

During this period, *The New York Times* also published 16 articles about Afghan women and how the U.S.-led war in Afghanistan has brought new opportunities for these women. Many of the articles discuss the accomplishments of Muslim women. Similar to articles discussed in chapter 2, many of the writers describe these accomplishments as an exception and they often emphasize that in order to succeed they had to surpass obstacles related to their position as a Muslim woman. Also, as with the articles that I examined in the first half of the case study, there continues to be an emphasis on difference when

[105] Here I refer to the issues such as maintaining Islamic practices in non-Muslim settings, student life, celebration of holidays, conversion to the faith and religious rights

describing Muslim women. In this second half of the case study I will analyze the articles in order to determine what the representations of Muslim women are in the articles that I discuss and I will then draw conclusions as to whether there are any commonalities between my findings in both of the time frames of this case study while assessing what these findings indicate.

Veil

The 5 articles out of a total of 5 in this half of the case study that discuss the veil in their headlines all refer to the changes that occurred for Afghan women after the U.S. invasion. The first of these articles that I will discuss is "The Rifle and the Veil"[106] by Jan Goodwin and Jessica Neuwirth. In this article, the use of "veil" and "rifle" as two reference points for the subject of the headline creates a representation of Muslim women as victims of militancy. In doing this the writers try to impose a connection between Islam as a religion, with the veil as its symbol and violence as symbolized through the rifle. In analyzing this article it is clear that Goodwin and Neuwirth are trying to describe the victimization of Afghan women as a result of militant Islam in Afghanistan. For example, according to the following statement women bear the consequences of "radical" Islam, "When radical Muslim movements are on the rise, women are the canaries in the mines". They also argue that Afghan women faced "oppression" even before the Taliban came to power explaining, "The Taliban did not start the oppression of Afghan women, nor have they been its only practitioners". Goodwin and Neuwirth make this statement as a preface to a lengthy discussion on "Arab militants" who they argue issued religious rulings against women in Afghanistan since the formation of resistance from the late 1980's onwards against the Soviets. Goodwin and Neuwirth also refer to the limitations

[106] Goodwin and Neuwirth, p.A19, Oct.19, 2001.

faced by Afghan women under the Taliban as a "terrorist act" reinforcing a militant representation of Islam with women as the powerless victims. This example is found in the center of the article in large, bold print with the statement "restriction of Afghan women is a terrorist act" as the authors of this article emphasize a necessity to rescue Afghan women from the "terrorism" of their country.

Another article, "Behind the Burka: Women Subtly Fought the Taliban"[107] describes some of the ways that Afghan women attempted to overcome the restrictions placed upon them by the Taliban. The representations found in this example identify Muslim women as powerless, inhuman and virtually stripped of any identity. Muslim women in Afghanistan are represented as helpless while being referred to as "wayward cattle". According to Amy Walden there is a sense of hope among Afghan women "that they will be treated like human beings, not wayward cattle". This is only one of two references in Walden's article that describes Muslim women as inhuman. The second example is, "Herat is still full of women in burkas, the full-length shroud that covers even the face, rendering a woman more column than human". The word "shroud" is used to describe the burka in this example. Aside from being understood as a cover for shelter or protection, a shroud is also a burial garment.

The word selection in this article in itself creates this representation of these Muslim women as less then human and virtually dead. Walden also draws an association between the burka, economic status and educational background. Walden also describes women who choose to wear the burka as "poor" and "uneducated", "Many other women, usually poor or less-educated, said that they would continue to wear the burka, as they had done before the Taliban came to power". The assumption of this statement is that

[107] Waldman, p.B4, Nov.19, 2001

veiling can not be a choice, rather it is something done out of ignorance or force. In contrast, the following example explores the practice of veiling as one of choice yet it presents the notion that veiling is one of the symbols of a struggle between tradition, namely Islam, and modernity, alluded to as the West.

This article that uses the veil as a symbol of militancy is "Hair as a Battlefield for the Soul"[108] by Elaine Sciolino. Sciolino describes hair as an indication of freedom from the Taliban with the statement, "Celebrating their liberation from Taliban rule in Afghanistan last week, men shaved off their beards, while women unveiled their faces and revealed bits of hair". Unlike Walden, Sciolino does convey that the practice of veiling is usually one of choice when she says, "Choice -- to veil or not, to shave or not -- has been an issue in Islam for more than a century". In the following statement though, she describes this practice as part of a struggle between Islam and "modernity". According to Sciolino, "It helps to understand that the Muslim world today is waging two wars on overlapping battlefields: one between traditional interpretations of Islam and modernity, the other between the will of the state and the rights of the individual". This statement fails to represent the diversity that exists in the "Muslim world" where tradition and culture also play a role in political and social practices in the individual countries. Instead, Sciolino focuses on the role of Islam in this "war" between tradition and modernity and the role that hair plays in this "struggle". As a result, the representations of Muslim women found within this article are overshadowed by this comparison between a limited, restrictive atmosphere due to tradition and the possibility of freedom through modernity. In the next article, the writer describes the affect of this concept of freedom as

[108] Sciolino, p.WK5, Nov.18, 2001

an enabler to physically change the women of Afghanistan from veiled, which is equated with unattractiveness to unveiled and beautiful.

According to David Halbfinger in "After the Veil, a Makeover Rush"[109] the American led war in Afghanistan has not only enabled Afghan women to show their hair, it has also brought for them the desire for physical beauty. He argues that, "Afghan women have held onto their desire to look beautiful, but they face a woeful shortage of beauticians". By making such a statement, Halbfinger seems to suggest that Afghan women are not attractive because of the absence of beauty parlors. He describes women, including American women and some Afghan-Americans, who have traveled to assist in the creation of beauty schools in Afghanistan as "racing to the rescue" and these women tell Halbfinger, "Through the school, we could not only help women in Afghanistan to look and feel better but also to give them employment". This emphasis on physical appearance is the primary concern of these American women rather than arguably more pressing issues affecting Afghan's women such as the basic necessities for life after a war; food, shelter and health. Another woman explains that "Sixty percent of Afghan women are widows. They need ways to see that they are human". Such a statement implies to readers these material amenities are necessary for the women to be "human" and without these beauty schools the women would remain uneducated and inhuman.

Halbfinger also conveys to readers that the new opportunities for Afghan women have come as a result of a "rescue" by these Western women and readers are led to believe that prior to this "rescue" they were not as attractive and as the following statement implies, unclean and uneducated. One of the American women tells Halbfinger, "I was appalled by the lack of sanitation. They're using rusty scissors, they have one

[109] Halbfinger, p.9.1, Sept.01, 2002

cheap comb for the whole salon and they don't sanitize it". The same woman adds, "They're doing it, but they really need the education. They don't have any technique whatsoever". These "rescuers" seem surprised that a country recently at war would lack beauty supplies and because of this the Afghan women are represented as uneducated and in need of being rescued. As with the previous article, these particular representations stem from other common depictions of Muslim women as symbols of a traditional society who are almost destined to remain 'the other'. Any opportunity to break free of this 'otherness' would then be the result of freedoms brought about by the so-called 'modern' world.

While the previous article examines trivial concerns for Afghan Muslim women, another article "The Fear Beneath the Burka"[110] by Rina Amiri questions the logic of addressing such issues at this time. Amiri stresses that in the post-war environment of Afghanistan, where even the basic necessities are difficult to attain. The focus of Amiri's article is the powerful symbolism of the burka in the West and for the Afghan people. She describes the garment as "a reflection of the deeply religious and conservative values". Amiri adds that the burka "also stands for something disturbing: the fear and insecurity that still grips the country". In this particular article, rather than providing readers with the image that the women of Afghanistan are removing their burkas with enthusiasm and rushing to rebuild careers and education, Amiri in contrast tries to explain to readers why many women have yet to stop wearing the burka. She explains that "the majority of women are afraid to take off their burkas because they do not have confidence in the fragile peace and security in Afghanistan". Amiri tells readers that one woman explained to her "How am I supposed to think about going back to work or

[110] Amiri, p.A29, March 20, 2002)

sending my daughter to school if I am still afraid to go outside?". The text of the article is centered on a drawing of a woman in a burka emerging from under a larger burka. The message evoked by this image is that removing the burka is more complex than it appears and that there are a number of underlying issues that influence this decision for Afghan women.

The five articles discussed in this section provide examples of how the veil is used to suggest particular representations of Muslim women. All five of the articles examine the impact of the war in Afghanistan on the women living there, with four of the articles emphasizing what the authors believe to be American contributions to the improving situation of Afghan women. The American invasion is described as a liberating force for freeing Afghan women from the burka and for helping the women become more "human" by promoting beauty parlors. Only Amiri's article takes a critical approach in discussing the affect of the war on Afghan women while the other authors focus on how the women have been "rescued". The representations of Muslim women found in the other four examples are primarily depictions of oppressed and uneducated women. The articles by Goodwin and Neuwirth as well as the one by Sciolino in this section also present the veil as a symbol linked to militancy and as an indicator of oppression. These particular representations are clear through the headline of the article alone -- which is why they have been placed in the "Veil" section. The content of these articles is used to reinforce these representations, emphasizing the political role of the U.S. in any changes that may allow for new representations of the Muslim women of Afghanistan. Aside from Amiri's article, the articles that I have examined in this section represent Muslim women as the "other" through focusing on how their situation differs from that of American

women and emphasizing that these women have little control over their own lives as they are seemingly overwhelmed by their own lack of education and the oppressiveness of Islamic tradition. In these articles, American forces are described as liberators of the women and as educators to free them from their ignorance. In this sense, the articles only re-affirm this idea of "otherness" as it is only through Western intervention that these Muslim women are able to improve their situations. In contrast, Amiri provides a more objective examination of the situation of women in Afghanistan as she discusses the affects of war on their current situations, something that the remaining 4 articles fail to take into great consideration.

Biographical

Six out of the nine biographical articles that I found for this time period are discussed here in order to provide a clear picture of my findings in this section. In this particular category, the writers of the articles in many ways try to dispel certain common stereotypes of Muslim women by exhibiting their independence and personal empowerment. Yet in doing so, as I will discuss, there is a tendency to reinforce other stereotypes in order by portraying these women as somewhat exceptional among Muslim women. The writers also emphasize that in order for these women to attain their goals, there was often some obstacle related to their Islamic faith that they had to surpass in order to reach them.

The first example in this category, "Diverse Works Exhibited by Muslim Artists"[111] looks at an exhibit showcasing the talents of Muslim/Sufi artists in Long Island, New York. In this article Shandray Gabbay discusses the necessity for more accurate representations of Muslim women, as far to often the media is filled with

[111] Gabbay, p.LI14, Dec.23, 2001

depictions reinforcing stereotypes and also for elaborating on the diversity of Muslim women. She writes that one of the goals of the exhibit "was to erase common stereotypes of Muslims, including the idea that Islam advocates violence". In describing this exhibit Gabbay focuses on some of the themes that she discussed as being important to overcome in the representation of Muslims. For example, she describes the exhibit as including, "self-portraits of women, veiled and unveiled" and "themes of violence, suppression of women, spirituality and the culture clash of a dual Muslim and American identity".

In focusing on these particular themes to describe the content of the exhibit Gabbay is only reinforcing the "common stereotypes" that she claims the exhibit was intended to overcome. This is not to say that issues such as violence or suppression of women do not exist in the experience for some Muslim women, rather it is interesting that Gabbay chose them as examples for describing the exhibit rather than discussing works that deal with less politically charged issues. One artist included tells Gabbay that the exhibit helps to "show that we are different and similar in so many ways". In this example, these similarities are not emphasized, rather Gabbay focuses on specific representations that reinforce stereotypes, violence, oppression of women and a sense of difference between Muslim and non-Muslim American women, depicting this difference as a "culture clash". For example she discusses one example by a Pakistani artist that is part of a series "with themes of human suppression and suffering". In this sense while Gabbay is explaining that the exhibit is an attempt to overcome stereotypes, the examples discussed within in many ways reinforce the belief that these are problems within the Muslim communities, rather than discussing examples from the exhibit that highlight more positive representations unrelated to stereotypes.

In "Stitch by Stitch, a Daughter of Islam Takes on Taboos"[112], Hilarie Sheets interviews artist Ghada Amer to discuss her embroidery project entitled *Encyclopedia of Pleasure.* Similar to the article by Gabbay, Sheets explains that the purpose of this work was to focus on women's issues and not specifically Muslim women's issues. The artist explains to Sheets in the article, "I don't want viewers to see my work as the work of 'the other', that's the most insulting thing that could happen" and that the purpose of the work is to, "talk about the problems of women everywhere, not just in Muslim countries". In discussing the subjects of Amer's work, Sheets does in fact focus on her difference as a Muslim woman. She does this by discussing the controversy of sexuality in Islam that is described through the artist's work. While Sheets explains that Amer "investigates the place of women in the history of all cultures", she focuses on a discussion of how the place of women in Islam is discussed through the artist's work. In doing this, Sheets focuses on Muslim women as separate and as "the other" in relation to the situations of women in other cultures and she focuses on how being a Muslim woman resulted in particular reactions to the subject of sexuality. One of the subjects of Amer's work on sexuality is pornography. Sheets explains that because Amer's parents are quite religious, "they had to get used to their daughter's choice to be an artist, particularly one dealing with the taboo subject of sexuality". According to Sheets this is an exceptional subject for religious Muslim women artists to discuss, as is the decision to become an artist. The other example that Sheets provides to describe Amer's work is a description of "satin storage closets stitched with all the text from the Koran that refers to women, underscoring their small presence in the book". In this example Sheets describes an invisibility of women in Islam according to the Qur'an. These examples from the article

[112] Sheets, p.AR33, Nov.25, 2001

show how Sheet's reinforces this representation of the "other" in her discussion of this one Muslim artist. Although Amer explains that she does not want viewers to examine her work as a product of the "other", Sheets fails to present this discussion without emphasizing the artist's Muslim identity. Although the work is about all women, across cultural and religious boundaries, much of the article focuses on examples related to Muslim women. In the following article, the focus is specifically on Muslim women and the subject focuses on her own identity in order to dispel the links between Islam and violence

In "Daughter of Islam, Enemy of Terror"[113], Robin Finn interviews Aasma Khan, the co-creator of a group, Muslims Against Terrorism, founded to educate New Yorkers that Islam does not endorse terror. In the article, Khan is described by Finn, "her black hair spills to her shoulders from a widow's peak, her makeup is muted, her clothing simple...no veil, though modesty of dress is a must, and not just because it, like removing shoes indoors, is culturally ingrained". This description is used to explain that not all religious Muslims wear the veil, and that this sense of "modesty" is not only conveyed through the wearing of the veil. In this sense, Finn's article attempts to educate readers about the diversity practice and belief among religious Muslims in terms of veiling.

The discussion of veiling is also used to separate Khan from the Muslim women who do veil, describing her as though it is an indication that she is more modern, "a citified New Age Muslim" as Finn describes. Finn explains that Khan had been involved in an Islamic study group even before the attacks "whose focus is intellectual, not political". The underlying assumption contained in this statement is that Islamic study groups are generally political. One would usually assume that a "study group" serves an

[113] Finn, p.D2, Oct.25, 2001

intellectual purpose, yet in this article, the connection between Islam and politics is implied by the statement above. This article is also a positive example in many ways as it indicates that strength of spirituality cannot be judged by outward appearances and through the emphasis by Khan of how the examples of violence that the media connects with Islam, the actions of extremist individuals and groups, are in no way representative of Islam and Finn allows Khan to assert this repeatedly throughout the article. In this sense, as is the case with all of the articles in this category, there is a strong effort to dispel stereotypes in relation to Muslim women, yet in some of the articles statements are made by the writer result in either the notion that this example may be somewhat exceptional or in the attempt to challenge certain stereotypes others are then reinforced.

In the remaining three articles, stereotypes of Muslim women continue to be challenged although as with the previous three articles the authors reinforce other stereotypes at the same time. The following articles dispute the stereotype of the Muslim woman as submissive and instead invoke images of defiance. For example, Seth Mydans interviews a professional dancer in Pakistan in the article "A Pakistani Dancer and Her Life Underground"[114]. He describes her defiance in choosing a career as a professional dancer, which according to Mydans is taboo in Pakistan. He explains that, "Her dance was everything Muslim Pakistan now stands against". Although Mydans manages to dismiss the stereotype of the Muslim woman as weak and submissive, he ends up focusing on the representation of the Muslim woman as an exotic temptress. He explains that, "In a country where most women cover their heads and some hide inside full-body burkas, where sexual feelings are seen as a challenge to purity and uprightness, a dancing woman is a defiance and a threat". Mydans also depicts Muslim men as violent by

[114] Mydans, p.A4, May 11, 2002

including the statement of the dancer arguing that "Muslim men have got this hang-up about dancing women. They're afraid that once they see a woman they can't control themselves, that either she'll seduce them or they'll rape her". By including such a statement, Mydans is reinforcing inaccurate generalizations about Muslims in discussing a subject that is not necessarily of controversy on a religious level, rather this particular story is an example of social and cultural reactions to the careers of female dancers in Pakistan. Mydans includes the misrepresentation of Muslim men as not being in control of their actions towards women without any further discussion or explanation. The implication of the statement is that readers may interpret it as the reason why women veil, as though they need to in order to protect themselves from the desires of men. As a result while the article tries to confront the representation of the Muslim woman as oppressed, the writer instead reinforces other stereotypes depicting Muslim woman as exotic seductresses and as potential victims of lustful and violent Muslim men.

In the final two articles, the authors depict their subjects as defiant and militant Muslim women. In "Portrait of an Angry Young Arab Woman"[115] Joel Greenberg describes one woman who took her own life and the lives of several others in a West Bank bombing as, "A devout Muslim college student from this village near Nablus". With this statement he emphasizes that the woman is a religious Muslim, as though this is an important detail in understanding the act that she carried out. In this article Greenberg both politicizes the Muslim woman and describes her militant potential by explaining, "She has been memorialized among Palestinians and in the Arab world as the first woman to carry out a suicide bombing in the current Palestinian uprising". In this sense he avoids the submissive stereotype while reinforcing another. Rather than understanding

[115] Greenberg, P.A10, March 1, 2002

the act as a political or personal reaction to the situation of the Palestinian people, Greenburg instead tries to assert that Islam is militant and political and that women do in fact play a role in the defiance. It is in drawing this connection that Greenberg moves from dispelling one stereotype to reinforcing others, namely the idea that the violent acts carried out by some Palestinians are influenced by Islam. Greenberg also includes a statement by the woman's sister that, taken out of context, fails to provide accurate information to readers and instead represents Islam as a violent religion. According to Greenburg, the woman's sister explained that "her views were supported by Muslim tradition" and that "The Prophet Muhammad had declared 'A woman can join the holy war without her husband's permission' ". While Greenburg may have been attempting to show the strength of Muslim women and their ability for defiance rather than submission, he ended up providing misrepresentations of Muslim women and Islam in general.

The final article that I include in this section is also about a female bomber. In this article, "Arab Woman's Path to Unlikely 'Martyrdom'"[116] by James Bennet, the woman is identified as a "Muslim but not particularly religious". By including this statement Bennet indicates that religion must hold some relevance in the woman's actions. Bennet also includes a statement from the woman's mother that represents Muslims as irrational and violent, "We're proud of it. I wish every man, every woman would do the same, be a bomber". These last two articles focus on the women's identities as Muslims rather than exploring additional factors that may have led them to carry out bombings such as political reasons or personal dissatisfaction with the events occurring around them. Instead religion is used in these articles to justify their acts, providing misinformation to readers and perpetuating the stereotypes that link Islam with violence. While the authors

[116] Bennet, p.A1, Jan.31, 2002

are intent on showing that Muslim women are not submissive and powerless, they instead succeed in including Muslim women in the stereotypes that are more often reserved for Muslim men, depicting them as angry and militant. In doing this, they eliminate the notion that defiance is gender specific in reference to Muslims yet this results in an assertion that a tendency towards violent defiance is a something almost inherent in Islamic culture.

The articles discussed in this section challenge the stereotypes of the Muslim woman as weak, submissive and oppressed yet they do this by reinforcing other stereotypes and misrepresentations commonly reserved for depictions of Muslims in the American media. These representations depict the Muslim woman as an exotic seductress, a politicized militant and as a defiant against tradition. All of the articles use these representations to emphasize the "otherness" of Muslim women and all focus on their identity as a Muslim in relation to the issues discussed in the articles. The writers of these "Biographical" articles genuinely appear to be challenging stereotypes in many of the examples they provide, especially in the interview excerpts with the individuals discussed. Despite this, there are a number of statements included that work against this challenge and end up almost confirming stereotypes that make a connection between Islam and violence. This is the case in all 6 of the articles. In contrast, the following articles discussed in the category of "Politics" do not attempt to dispute stereotypes of Muslim women or of Muslims in general. Rather, they draw connections between the particular political event discussed and the influence of Islam in the situation. In terms of representations of Muslim women, the discussion of them in the article is usually in the form of a physical description using the veil as a symbol of Muslim identity.

Politics

In this section I will discuss 7 of 20 articles I found that deal with political issues during the period of September 11, 2001 to September 11, 2002. The 20 articles in this section is out 92 articles overall in this half of the case study. I found that while Muslim women are not the subject of most of these articles, descriptions of them are included in order to emphasize the role of Islam in the issue discussed. Muslim women are often only described when they are veiled and the authors discuss the connection of their wearing the veil to issues of politics and violence.

In the first article that I will discuss, "Algerians Seek Something More than Survival"[117] Suzanne Daley writes that in Algiers, "Outside the old neighborhood, many women dress as they would in any European city. Most do not wear head scarves. It is rare to see young women hiding their faces". The purpose of this statement appears to be for indicating that modern, western influenced women do not veil and those who do, as Daley indicates are mainly from the old neighborhoods in Algiers. Women who wear the veil are referred to as "hiding" their faces. In this example, the main focus of the article is on the internal conflict between the Algerian government and opposition groups seeking control but Daley focuses on the symbolism of the veil without explaining to readers the connections that she is attempting to draw between politics and the veil.

In another example, "In Iran, an Angry Generation Longs for Jobs, More Freedom and Power"[118], Amy Waldman describes the physical appearance of a young woman in order to convey to readers a connection between unveiling and freedom. She describes her as, "a student of English translation who wears thick makeup and a smart trench coat,

---

[117] Daley, p.A3, Dec.14, 2001
[118] Waldman, p.A8, Dec.7, 2001

with her hair partly exposed". According to Waldman, the woman stated, "I want more freedom". Waldman explains that "a striking number of young people described religion as a tool of repression" as one woman tells her that "when she applies for acting jobs she is told to tone down her makeup, cover all her hair, wear a longer coat". The representations of Muslim women in this article depict them as defiant against a repressive religion and state. The woman that Waldman uses as an example of this growing defiance may be understood by American readers to be fairly "westernized" in that she studies English, does not completely veil and she wears makeup, as opposed to what is described as an acceptable appearance for Iranian Muslim women, little makeup and their hair completely covered.

Another article, "In U.S., Echoes of Rift of Muslim and Jews"[119], describes the tense situation for Muslim women in the U.S. after the September 11, 2001 attacks, "Muslim women in headscarves were advised to stay indoors, mosques and Muslim schools in Los Angeles were shut down...". Muslim women who wear the veil became victims of discrimination because they are in fact visible as Muslims. In this sense the representation of Muslim women as victims in many of the post-September 11 articles is a reflection of incidents that actually occurred. However, in these same articles it is important to analyze the entire representation of the Muslim woman that is presented as in some of the articles the women are described as bringing victimization upon themselves.

Laurie Goodstein also tries to draw political and religious connections between the Palestinian-Israeli conflict and the September 11 attacks, describing the reactions of the Muslim and Jewish communities in the U.S. "A terrorist attack in the United States

[119] Goodstein, p.A12, Sept.12, 2001

detonates particular repercussions here among both Muslims and Jews, whose kin in the Middle East are locked in a bitter battle that many people immediately assume has now arrived like an unwelcome immigrant on American shores". Not only does this statement make unfounded assumptions that the events of September 11, 2001 are somehow connected to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, it also places blame on religion as a perpetrator of violence. Additionally, this statement makes the assumption that the Israeli-Palestinian conflict is a religious conflict and it generalizes that all Palestinians are Muslim. Finally, while the title of this article indicates that it is about stressed relations between the Muslim and Jewish communities in the United States, the article focuses primarily on Muslims with the discussion of Muslim women being primarily one emphasizing their victimization caused by their identity as Muslims.

In another article, "By Barring Religious Garb, Singapore School Dress Code Alienates Muslims"[120], Seth Mydans discusses the banning of the veil in Singapore schools. Mydan quotes the country's prime minister as saying, "If religious clothing is allowed, our schools will become polarized along racial and religious lines, as children will tend to mix with those who look and dress similarly. Our efforts to build a nation will be severely set back". According to this statement this ban on "religious clothing" is necessary to eradicate the difference that without such a ban would set Muslims apart from non-Muslims. Mydans also quotes a professor in the article who tries to justify the necessity for the ban, "schoolgirls being raised to wear headscarves may discover another area of discrimination. Women with head scarves are often turned down when they apply for jobs". According to this statement, Muslim women who wear the veil bring discrimination upon themselves and in order to be accepted in society they must not wear

[120] Mydans, p.A6, March 2, 2002

it. In this sense, this article tries to justify the ban as existing in order to provide more opportunities to Muslim women that they would be denied if they wore the veil. By doing this the article emphasizes that these outward signs of religious devotion incite negativity and that there is a certain sense of fear towards Islam. The discussion provided in this article does little to question the validity of such discrimination. Instead there is more effort placed on justifying through the words of Singapore's policy makers, why this is necessary.

In the next article, "Turkey, Well Along Road to Secularism, Fears Detour to Islamism"[121] by Douglas Frantz, a photo that is included with the article and its caption are important to note in the overall analysis of the article. The photo shows a group of women wearing long coats and head scarves standing in front of a billboard of a blond woman wearing what appears to be only a bikini, posing seductively. The caption reads, "Veils vs. Thongs, Turkey seeks to balance its Muslim customs, reflected by these women at Istanbul's airport, and Western mores". This example attempts to show a struggle between Islam and the "West" while in the body of the article itself Frantz describes some of the signs of "Westernization" that can be found throughout Istanbul as a result of secularism. These examples try to convey an existing balance between religion and secularism. He tells readers that "In Istanbul, short skirts are as common as religious head scarves, and alcohol flows freely". One woman who he describes as "a stylish woman in her 30's" tells Frantz "Turkey is not Iran. I am from a neighborhood that values the woman no less than the man". The assumption made by this statement is that in Iran, an example of an Islamic state, the woman has less value than the man while in secular nations such as Turkey women are of equal value and the religious and secular

[121] Frantz, p.A8, Jan.8, 2002

women are able to live in equality. In the attempt to describe how the role of Islam varies among the Turkish population, as I would argue that it does among the population of any Muslim majority nation, Frantz associates what he describes as signs of secularism with the influence of Westernization and modernity. As well, Frantz attributes the secularism of the country to the position of women living there by including the statement by the one woman of how in Islamic states like Iran, women are of are inferior to men.

In "The Sullen Majority"[122], Tim Judah examines the younger generation of Iranians and what he describes as a growing defiance to the tradition. According to Judah, "Wherever there are computers, for example, teenage girls wearing *hejab* head covering are bobbing about, headphones clamped to their ears, as they download music from a world away". He describes this access as a way for young women to overcome their seclusion at home, "The computer has become particularly important in the lives of urban girls, often confined at home by traditional parents who, by the same token, have absolutely no clue what their daughters are doing online". Judah contrasts this form of defiance with what he describes as situations that may result from these attempts to break free of tradition. "As dawn breaks it is easy to find chador-clad and probably heroin-addicted working girls sleeping outdoors in certain parks". He explains, "Many of these girls are runaways. They have fled abusive or drug-addicted parents, or they are country girls who saw the big city on television or balked at the prospect of an early arranged marriage". The resulting representation of Muslim women in Iran is one of oppression and in order to overcome this, the women must turn to modern life in the cities where they may risk their own lives. The message is that the divide between tradition and so-

[122] Judah, NYT Magazine, p.44, Sept.1, 2002

called modernization is so great that there is little room for compromise between the two ways of life.

The final article that I discuss in this section is "Medical Schools Show First Signs of Healing from Taliban Abuse"[123] by Norimitsu Onishi. This article looks at post-Taliban changes for medical education in Afghanistan. During the later period of Taliban rule Onishi explains that limited numbers of women were permitted to attend a nursing school for women with specific restrictions. According to a doctor that Onishi describes as, "her face unveiled, showing red lipstick and makeup, and her eyes fixed on a male journalist", the restrictions included the following; "they were not allowed to leave the building or to talk to the men studying nursing, they could not wear lipstick or makeup" and "most significantly, they were not allowed to look at pictures of the human body". Now "the young women wore blue uniforms and white head covers, though high heels and traces of makeup could be seen". The representations of Muslim women in this article depict them as oppressed yet defiant against the restrictions that they faced during the Taliban. In contrast is the description of women in the post-Taliban era. Onishi focuses on the women's unveiled appearance as the "signs of healing from Taliban abuse" rather than discussing the other ways that the medical schools have been affected by the fall of the Taliban.

The examples discussed in the articles above describe political issues ranging from unemployment, secularism, the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and a nation's recovery from war in the one year following the events of September 11, 2001. Most of these articles attempt to draw a connection between the wearing of the veil and the political issues discussed. The veil is described as a hindrance to employment, as a sign of

[123] Onishi, p.A12, Jan.15, 2002

political defiance, as a challenge to Westernization or modernity and as a symbol of Islam used in the physical description of a Muslim population. Veiling is described as an act of political defiance in some countries and the insistence of women to wear the veil results in their choice to be seen as different according to some of the articles. Some articles also place the blame on Muslim women who wear the veil, when they face discrimination. In contrast, unveiling is discussed as an indication of Western influence and modernization.

Women's Issues

Out of 92 articles in this half of my case study, 17 articles relate to "Women's Issues". In this category I will examine 8 of the 17 articles that deal with women's issues during this time period. The majority of the articles in this category discuss women in Afghanistan but the first few that I will analyze deal with separate issues discrimination against Muslim women in the workplace, marriage laws, education and career choices. In the article "Islam and Its Adherents Ride the Publicity Wave"[124], Caryn James discusses an episode of the Oprah Winfrey show that finished with Winfrey exclaiming "Modern Muslim women!". James describes to readers, "Before an audience made up mostly of women, some wearing traditional Muslim headscarves and others in Western dress, Ms. Winfrey set about demystifying Islam and going past the knee-jerk pleas against discrimination that have been so much a part of the pop-cultural conversation". According to James, the discrimination against Muslim women is not an important issue and she seems to be placing the blame on Muslim women themselves for any negative reactions towards them.

---

[124] James, p.B8, Oct.6, 2001

The women of the audience are described as wearing either "traditional Muslim" clothes or "Western dress" emphasizing this sense of outward difference. James explains later in the article that this focus on difference was necessary for breaking down the walls between Muslim and non-Muslim women. She argues that Winfrey was, "better at breaking down the Us-Them barrier when she explored the more delicate subject of differences, drawing attention in a gentle way to the fact that Muslim women in head coverings look especially alien to many Americans". James adds that the interview between Winfrey and Queen Rania of Jordan, "did not add much. As Ms. Winfrey pointed out, she looks like any glamorous if traditional young woman in New York or Chicago" and she continues that, "the queen's assurance that Muslims do not hate Americans simply echoed the platitudes floating around too many talk shows".

It is interesting that James does not see any relevance in interviewing Muslim women who appear too Western and she dismisses the reality that Muslims "do not hate Americans". By stating this it appears that James cannot accept any depiction of Muslim women and Muslims in general that does not fit within a negative and limited existing stereotype and any depiction to the contrary is conveyed as something unusual. Instead, James describes another aspect of the show as, "more illuminating when a Muslim woman in a head scarf" was shown on the job as a reporter for the Chicago Tribune "wearing pants and make-up" and that "she was as aggressive as any other reporter". The representations in this article emphasize difference and display the expectations that some in the media have in reference to Muslim women. James seems intent to focus on the stereotypical representation of the Muslim woman as weak and submissive and finds it "illuminating" that she can also be an aggressive reporter.

In "Campus Crowd Shrugs at Marital-Equality Law"[125], Somini Sengupta describes the reactions of women at an Istanbul university campus to a new law granting women equal property rights in a divorce. According to Sengupta, "The chasms in the lives of Turkish women run deep – between the schooled and the unschooled, the cosmopolitans and the recent migrants from the countryside, the secularists and the Islamists". Sengupta makes a number of comparisons in this statement that limit the representation of religious Muslims to being uneducated individuals from the countryside whereas the secular population is described as educated and "cosmopolitan". Sengupta continues "women here repeatedly tangle with the clashing impulses brought by tradition and greater Westernization". As with in a number of other articles from this time period, the focus is on the struggle between Muslim values and traditions and those brought by "Westernization" (understood in many of the articles as modernization). In this article Sengupta describes these "clashing impulses" through a scene in the city's popular nighttime hangouts as a place where one could see a combination of "women with brightly painted lips, black leather boots as spiky as minarets, hip-hugging jeans. You can see covered women (and remember, to cover is a sign of modesty) making out with their boyfriends in the promenade". This article focuses on making distinctions between Muslim, traditional values and "Western", modern values but the clash between the two is emphasized in the description of outwardly sexual behavior of "covered women".

In the article "Where Muslim Traditions Meet Modernity"[126] Susan Sachs focuses on the representation of the Muslim woman as weak and oppressed. She states, "As modernity collides with religious tradition, women have begun to demand a

[125] Sengupta, p.A4, Nov.28, 2001
[126] Sachs, p.B1, Dec.17, 2001

reinterpretation of the civil codes that presume a woman, in her private life, is a capricious creature in need of a man's guiding hand". According to Sachs, the opportunity for Muslim women to gain any personal power or freedom is only possible with the influences of "modernity". She describes this modernizing of civil codes as a conquest for modernization, "For many Muslim women, the religious authority that subordinates them to the authority of male relatives represent a final frontier". Sachs later tells readers in explaining that "in the seventh century, Islam vastly improved the lot of women at that time"[127], "as codified over the years, however, Islam eventually institutionalized the inferiority of women. The prophet Muhammad is said to have urged his followers to treat women with respect, but respect has come to mean control". In making such statements it would have been useful for Sachs to provide specific examples rather than making such a broad generalization. She places the blame on Islam itself but fails to explain what others factors may have led to a change in the status of Muslim women in some countries. In this article, all Muslim women are grouped together as having suffered from this "institutionalized inferiority", a generalization that does not take into account the diversity of Muslim women living in varied circumstances throughout the world. In this article there is little consideration for the diversity of the Muslim world and within it, the diverse roles that women play that are often influenced by regional customs and traditions rather than religion alone as with any place in the world. Instead, these statements reinforce the stereotype of Islam as an oppressive religion towards women and of Muslim women as weak victims of oppression.

---

[127] ibid, p.B4

In the article "Instant Islam: Trying to Find a Global Faith in the Details"[128] Julie Salamon reviews a television program entitled "Muslims" on the television series *Frontline*. In her description of the program she looks at various representations of the Muslim woman. This first statement that I will describe challenges the common media representation that Muslim women need to be rescued and that those who wear the veil are forced to do so. She describes a Malaysian gynecologist, "her head covered by a decorated scarf when she's not wearing scrubs", who discusses "the tranquility she feels as a Muslim woman". The doctor tells viewers, "I don't need to be liberated. I was born a free person". The next example represents the Muslim woman as a helpless victim and indicates that Islam plays a role in the situation of the woman. The woman is described by Salamon as being "less sanguine about Islamic strictures" because her husband has "kept her trapped in a marriage, even though he has taken a second wife, had more children and punched his first wife for complaining that he's neglected her and her child". Salamon explains that "the strongest voices for Islamic reform (on this program at least) come from women – and no wonder"[129]. While Salamon provides a representation of the Muslim woman as a successful individual under her own control, the majority of the article examines how Muslim women are often victimized as a result of Islam.

The other articles discussing issues of relevance to women, all refer to Afghan women which is important to note as it provides a sense of the American media perception towards the American-led war in Afghanistan. In "Liberating the Women of Afghanistan"[130], readers are told that "America did not go to war in Afghanistan so that women there could once again feel the sun on their faces, but the reclaimed freedom of

---

[128] Salamon, p.E1, May 9, 2002
[129] ibid, p.E8
[130] p.A26, Nov.24, 2001

Afghan women is a collateral benefit that Americans can celebrate". This statement focuses on what is described as an American victory for Afghan women that came as a result of overthrowing the Taliban government. The women of Afghanistan can therefore attribute what this article describes as an improved situation to the actions of the American government and that this "reclaimed freedom" comes as a "benefit" for Americans.

In this article, the burka is described as, "a full-body tent that left women barely able to see" and according to the author, "many women in Kabul still wear burkas – because they always have or their families demand it". This description gives the illusion of a woman encased inside a shelter either as a result of tradition or through the force of her families. In contrast to this representation, the author describes the pre-Taliban success of Muslim women in Afghanistan, describing them as equally well educated as the country's males, "before the Taliban, half of the university students and government workers were women and 40 percent of doctors". In making this statement, the author does explain that these opportunities, "have been available mainly to the small urban middle class, and have always been limited by traditional customs and underdevelopment intensified by war". This places into perspective the affect that economics, local customs and war has on the opportunities for the population. This is important as many of the articles discussing Muslim women in Afghanistan focus on Islam as the influence that is limiting opportunities for the women rather than analyzing other factors that do in fact play a greater role.

All of the articles discussing Afghan women in this section describe the burka as a symbol for Afghan women, 3 out of 10 articles in total I have included here for further

discussion. In "Women in Authority: Walking a Fine Line in Showcasing Women and Dealing with Muslim Allies"[131], Alessandra Stanley tells readers that "enemy terrain is ruled by Islamic fundamentalists who have made the veil obligatory and banned women from public life". In this article Stanley uses several comparisons between Afghan women and American women who hold positions of power in politics and in other sectors. Stanley includes their concerns about what is missing from the Afghan women's lives as though these American women are the voice of authority on what is necessary for the Muslim women of Afghanistan. This is another example of how the American media at this time depicted American intervention as a way to "rescue" Afghan women and like many of the other examples it fails to recognize the other factors that have affected women's increased participation in public life. In another section of this article, Stanley quotes the leader of the Northern Alliance, Haron Amin as saying "the Taliban had given his country the wrong, regressive image. In the 60's and 70's in Kabul, my mother wore miniskirts". Stanley uses the miniskirt as a symbol of modernity and freedom in the pre-Taliban era, a symbol that can be understood as an extreme contrast to the practice of veiling. By including this example, Stanley seems to be emphasizing that the burka remains the country's symbol of "regression".

Two of the articles take a different perspective in analyzing the current situation of Afghan women. Similar to the article by Rina Amiri discussed above, "The Fear Beneath the Burka," the following two articles also look at the more pressing factors facing Afghan women in this post-war period. In "In Bonn, Three Champions for Afghan Women"[132], Steven Erlanger includes responses from Afghan women to their situation

[131] Stanley, p.B9, Oct.27, 2001
[132] Erlanger, p.B4, Nov.30, 2001

and the challenges that they face in the post-Taliban era. One woman tells Erlanger, that it is necessary that, "Western women respect the right of Afghan women to choice, including the choice of keeping their chadors and burkas". Instead of focusing on the fact that many women are still choosing to wear the burka, concern should instead be placed on seeing that proper aid is distributed to women in situations of economic need. According to this same woman, "the real problems of Afghan women are 'extreme poverty and the number of widows who have no means to sustain themselves'" and likely they would not " 'immediately strip off their veils and take full roles in public life' ". These examples look at the more pressing issues for women involved in the aftermath of war in Afghanistan rather than the concern of whether or not women choose to wear the burka. This is important to note as in the majority of articles in all of my categories within this case study that discuss Afghan women following the war, too much emphasis is placed on the symbolism of the burka and not enough attention is focused on the larger problems they are facing.

Similar to the previous article and to the other article by Amiri that I discussed in the "Veil" section, "Muslim Women as Symbols – and Pawns"[133] examines other issues facing Afghan Muslim women. This article is an important example as Amiri discusses different modes of interpretation that tend to exist when analyzing situations of not only Afghan Muslim women but Muslim women in general. Her article opens with the familiar description of a burka-clad Afghan woman that has become the common depiction in the American media. Amiri uses this representation as an introduction to her argument challenging depictions that often show the Muslim woman as a direct contrast to the Western woman. Amiri explains that for the West, "the timid smiles of Afghan

[133] Amiri, p.A19, Nov.27, 2001

women emerging from beneath their burkas" and that the image of "women shrouded in billowing clouds of blue had become hallmarks of the Taliban's extremism and repression".

Amiri's discussion highlights that this articulation of women's rights is not a Western-based way of thinking even though Westerners do see themselves as proponents of the cause for women everywhere, by these "Western" standards and ways of thinking. This is evident in articles that make the comparison between freedom and dressing in "Western" attire or by getting makeovers in beauty parlors whereas women who wear the veil are subject to being labeled as uneducated, backward and oppressed. In discussing the how the Western notion of feminism has affected Muslim women, Amiri explains that, "This enmeshing of gender and geopolitics has robbed Muslim women of their ability to develop a discourse on their rights independent of a cultural debate between the Western and Muslim worlds". By assuming that women's rights for women everywhere should be understood in the same way is not possible as it does not take into account the variety of factors that influence a woman's situation in any given place throughout the world. Rather it only serves to analyze a situation based on the one's own familiarity with it as influenced by personal experiences and values. Further, as Amiri explains, the Western world has contributed to the views of Muslim women as part of part of "a battle between East and West" "by centering on the place of women in its depiction of Islam as repressive and backwards". This is apparent in 6 of the articles that I have discussed in this section as the author's continually make statements about Islamic values being in a struggle with westernization and modernity. Amiri also challenges the representation of Islam as an oppressive religion towards women. This is another misrepresentation that is

repeatedly found in the articles of this case study. Instead, Amiri tells readers that "we must move beyond the premise that Islam is anti-woman".

Muslims in the West

The number of articles discussing Muslims in the West greatly increased in the months following the September 11, 2001 attacks as *The New York Times* provided articles both to examine the reaction of Muslim-Americans towards the attacks and to analyze their experiences as Muslims in this post-September 11 environment. *The New York Times* also attempted to educate readers on Islamic practices through the inclusion of individual experiences and the discussion of issues affecting some Muslim women living in the West.

I have chosen 8 of the 33 articles that I found discussing Muslims in the West during this time period for analysis. In the first example, "Stereotyping Rankles Silent, Secular Majority of American Muslims"[134] by Laurie Goodstein focuses on the reactions of Muslims who consider themselves to be, "cultural Muslims" rather than religious Muslims. The emphasis is made in this article that there has been too much focus on the more religious Muslims living in the U.S. without recognizing that many American Muslims do not practice religious beliefs and many Muslim women as a result do not wear the veil. Goodstein argues that, "cultural Muslims say they have been overlooked in the portrayal of Muslims after the Sept.11 attacks, with devout Muslims regarded as the norm." The assumption in this argument is that in order to be a religious Muslim one must wear the veil or show other outward signs of Islamic practice. Goodstein explains that the media focuses on "women in headscarves and bearded men on their knees facing

[134] Goodstein, p.A20, Dec.23, 2001

Mecca" when discussing Muslim Americans. In this article, Goodstein interviews several "secular" Muslims, and is told by one that she, "like many other Muslim women, does not wear a head scarf". While the representations of Muslim women included in this article reflect reality in that there are practicing and non-practicing Muslim women in the U.S. and that some wear the veil while many others do not, Goodstein makes assumptions that provide misinformation for readers. The main example of this that I have discussed above is the assumption that in order to be a believing, non-secular Muslim woman one must wear the veil. While there is debate about the necessity of wearing the veil as a symbol of Muslim piety, there are in fact many religious Muslim women in the U.S. who do not choose to wear it.

Several of the articles provide the experiences of the difficulties that some Muslim women faced following the September 11 attacks because they were easily identifiable as Muslims as they choose to wear the veil. One woman explains to the author Timothy Egan in "Tough but Hopeful Weeks for the Muslims of Laramie"[135] that she felt she was "as Wyoming as you can get, I moved here when I was 1 ½ years old". The woman explains in this article that she was harassed a week after the September 11 attacks and she was an easily identifiable target as a Muslim because she was, "the only student at the University of Wyoming to wear the traditional headscarf, the hijab".

Many of these articles discuss the fear that many Muslim women who wear the veil had after the attacks to leave there homes and many that did experienced harassment or discrimination of some form. This fear is expressed in Robert Worth's article, "For the Country's Arab-Americans, a Time of Disquiet"[136]. In the period immediately following

---

[135] Egan, p.B1, Oct.18, 2001
[136] Worth, p.WE8, Sept.30, 2001

the attacks, Worth explains that "in Westchester, most Muslim women were afraid to go out while wearing traditional Muslim headdress". Some women described the "insults and a climate of fear" that they did experience when they left their homes. The fear of Muslim-American women is repeated in several articles, fear as those who wear headscarves are identifiable Muslims. This atmosphere of fear surrounding the attacks created restrictions and resulted in the victimization of some Muslim women in the U.S. As John Rather explains in another article, "Uneasy Times for Muslims on the Island",[137] one woman "had taken to wearing a baseball cap over her traditional Muslim scarf because it now brings unwanted attention". Much of this negative attention resulted from the existing misrepresentations of Muslims in the American media that even prior to the attacks led many Americans to both misunderstand and fear Muslims. While these representations often depicted Islam as being the cause of the victimization of Muslim women, as shown in these examples, these misrepresentations caused non-Muslim Americans to subject Muslim women to violence and restrictions enforced by fear in the months following the attacks.

In the article, "Fear in the Open City"[138] by Anika Rahman, the author tells her personal story of how she felt being a Muslim American woman following the attacks. She tells readers "I am so used to thinking about myself as a New Yorker that it took me a few days to begin to see myself as a stranger might, a Muslim woman, an outsider, an enemy of the city. Before last week I had thought of myself as a lawyer, a feminist, a wife, a sister, a friend, a woman on the street". The events of September 11 led to an increased emphasis on difference in the American media representation of Muslims

[137] Rather, p.LI8, Sept.23, 2001
[138] Rahman, p.A27, Sept.19, 2001

which in turn affected the American public's perception of Muslim Americans as "outsiders". Other articles from this time period included statements from Muslim American women describing the difficulty that they are experiencing because of these perceptions of them as outsiders.

The article "Sadness and Fear as a Group Feels Doubly at Risk"[139] by John Fountain is one example that depicts the difficulties that Muslim American women (and Muslim American men) have experienced following the attacks in reconciling their identities as both Muslims and Americans. The fact that this is an issue at all reflects the experiences that Muslim Americans have had as Americans. The misrepresentations of Muslims in the media in not something that has only occurred as a reaction to the September 11 attacks, as I have shown throughout this case study they are a perpetuation of misrepresentations that have existed for decades in the American media.

In Fountain's article, he describes the one woman that he interviews by focusing on her visible appearance as a Muslim woman while explaining to readers that this is an American woman. "Beneath the silk white scarf and coffee brown skin, it is American blood that flows through Hannah El-Amin's veins". In the following statement from the same article Fountain discusses further their experiences as Muslim American women. Fountain explains that, "In a classroom, more than a half dozen African-American young women wearing their hijab, the scarves and traditional Muslim dress, spoke of the dichotomy of being faithful Muslims and proud Americans". Similarly, in the article "The 2 Worlds of Muslim American Teenagers"[140] by Susan Sachs, one Muslim woman stresses her American identity. She explains to Sachs that, "We have a burden on us.

---

[139] John W. Fountain, p.B9, Oct.5, 2001
[140] Sachs, p.B1, Oct.7, 2001

We're Muslims, and we feel like other Muslims around the world do. And we're Americans".

Several articles examine the experience of young Muslim women in American schools. These articles often look at issues that may affect their experiences in the schools as Muslim women and they also examine how Islamic practices influence these same experiences. While these articles can be viewed as informative in many ways as they describe the experiences of Muslim women, they focus on representing difference, how young Muslim American women are different from the average non-Muslim American woman. For example, in the article "Where Islam Meets 'Brave New World'"[141], author Tara Bahrampour points out differences between Muslim teenage girls and other American teens. The difference is described in the article and it is reinforced by the captions on the article photos. The captions include the following descriptions, "There may be sneakers under the robes, but no pictures of pop stars or boyfriends in lockers" and "The girls may receive Regents diplomas at Al Noor, but not all will get the opportunity to go to college". It is the second of these two captions that is important to mention as by including this Bahrampour is focusing on the opportunities that some Muslim women may not have without providing any further discussion to this statement. By using this statement as a caption for the photo Bahrampour emphasizes that Muslim women do not have the same opportunities as non-Muslim women for college education. This is an interesting example as it could be said with any graduating class of non-Muslim girls that "not all will get the opportunity to go to college".

---

[141] Bahrampour, p.EL22-23, Nov.11, 2001

A different representation of difference is provided in the article "Muslims Nurture Sense of Self on Campus"[142] by Laurie Goodstein. She interviews Muslim women at Wellesley College who choose to wear the veil and she questions them as to their self-identity as both a Muslim and as an American in this post-September 11 environment. Goodstein explains "The head scarves are only the most visible sign of a gradual religious reawakening among the younger generation of Muslim college students across the country", including some who according to Goodstein "have proudly donned the head scarves that their mothers refused to wear". The women explain to Goodstein that their scarves are a symbol of freedom rather than one of oppression as is so commonly portrayed in the American media. One woman tells Goodstein, "Wearing a scarf just makes me feel more liberated. It sort of elevates you from the status of being seen as just a sexual object". Another representation is also included in this article as Goodstein includes a statement from a woman who identifies herself as Muslim rather than Muslim American. She explains to Goodstein, "I am Muslim first, not even American Muslim, because so much of the American culture is directly in conflict with my values as a Muslim". By including this statement it may be misunderstood by readers that this is a common feeling among Muslim Americans because it argues that there is little compatibility between American culture and Muslim values, which although this may be one woman's opinion, it is not shared by most Muslim Americans. All that this statement does is reinforce this sense of difference and the perception of Muslim Americans as "outsiders".

Throughout this case study I have attempted to analyze the various representations that are presented of Muslim women in the American media. My findings

[142] Goodstein, p.B1, Nov.3, 2001

show that many of the stereotypes continue to be reinforced and following the attacks of September 11, 2001, these representations have led to repercussions as the American public has formulated their opinions of Muslims on these misrepresentations. Some members of the American public have reacted to Muslim women through discrimination or even harassment as though these women somehow played a role in attacks that were allegedly carried out by some angry men who happened to Muslims. In the final section, I will draw my conclusions of the findings of this case study in order to understand what these representations convey, how they have been used and what we can understand from the overall findings. Finally, it will be important to discuss changes that occurred in the representations of Muslim women between the pre-September 11, 2001 period and the post-September 11 period.

Chapter 4 – Conclusion

The goal of conducting my case study of *The New York Times* in this thesis was to examine how it represented Muslim women within a two year time frame surrounding the attacks of September 11, 2001. In my analysis of these representations, I consulted a number of sources that discuss this issue in order to gain a better understanding of existing representations. I then developed my own argument from the discourse that I examined and I continued to use it as a point of reference in the analysis of the articles I selected. Previous scholarship on the subject was necessary to understand when conducting my own case study, as many of the stereotypes often associated with Muslim women in the media continue to be reinforced. In conducting my case study of *The New York Times* I determined that while there were attempts to dispel a number of these

stereotypes, often in doing this other stereotypes were reinforced. For example, in some of the articles, the writers' attempts to depict Muslim women as not being oppressed or submissive resulted in an emphasis on how they often had to overcome some obstacle associated with their religion in order to be successful. In this sense their success was then an exception rather than a normalcy. Similarly, in some of the articles the attempt to show Muslim women as empowered resulted in depictions of them as defiant and in some cases militant.

My findings reveal that many of the stereotypes discussed in previous works by a number of scholars[143], continue to be reinforced in articles that were published within the two year time frame of my case study. The representations of Muslim women in *The New York Times* can be identified in three categories -- as powerless and oppressed, as mysterious and exotic and as politicized and defiant. Moreover, most of the articles focus on the symbolism of the veil and they discuss this symbol in relation to one of the three main representations that I determine above. In many of the articles the description of a veiled Muslim woman is included -- not because it is necessarily related to the subject directly, rather this symbol is used to draw other associations for the reader in reference to Islam. For example, some of the articles use a description of a veiled woman within a statement discussing fundamentalism or political defiance.

Some articles use the description of the veil to reinforce this notion of Muslim women as "the other". As Yasmin Jiwani discusses in her article "Gendering Terror", "the association of Muslim women with the veil persists in Western popular imagination. Moreover, it feeds and fuels yet another prevailing feature in the discourse surrounding

[143] Primarily Ghazi-Walid Falah, Mohja Kahf and Marnia Lazreg

Orientalized women – that of their oppressed and tradition-bound existence"[144]. The description of the veil itself in discussions of Muslim women provides its own specific representation that is based on a "Western" notion of the veil symbolizing oppression and an existence limited by tradition. It is clear from many of the articles that I include in my case study that this is the representation that the authors are trying to present. In contrast, the articles which do not discuss the veil when describing Muslim women instead depict the successes of the women as exceptional, as though they were only able to attain their goals because of their "Westernization". While in articles that discussed Muslim women who wear the veil described this detail as the only element of the women's physical description, when discussing Muslim women who do not veil the readers are only aware of this fact because of the photo of the women that the authors include. In describing women within the actual text, readers are often told of their "Western" style clothes or that they are wearing makeup. In analyzing these articles it appears that the veil only becomes an issue when one chooses to wear it.

Many of the articles that describe the changes for Afghan Muslim women following the U.S. led war in Afghanistan emphasize that any opportunities that the women now have are a result of being "rescued" by Western intervention in their country. These articles describe the signs of freedom for these women solely as their ability to show their hair or to wear makeup, rather than looking at the other implications that have resulted for Afghan women as a result of the war, namely the increased poverty and the growing number of widows who have greater concerns than removing their

---

[144] Yasmin Jiwani, "Gendering Terror: Representations of the Orientalized Body in Quebec's Post-September 11 English-Language Press", *Critique: Critical Middle Eastern Studies*, v. 13 (3): 265-291 (Fall 2004)

burkas or applying to the universities. Many of these articles fail to discuss additional factors affecting the opportunities of women in Afghanistan.

Finally, in the majority of the articles that I analyzed for my case study, the dominant representation of the Muslim woman was the depiction of her as "the Other". Most of the authors focused on how Muslim women were different from "Western" women and what opportunities they did not have that "Western" women have. In doing this the authors of these articles based their assumptions on stereotypes such as those discussed in chapters 1and 2 of my thesis. These assumptions were also based on religion as the cause of this perceived difference and few articles took into account additional factors that play a role in the lives of the women discussed such as culture, politics, economic factors and personal choice. Instead most of the articles that acknowledged the subject as Muslim based their discussion of the woman's particular situation around the influence that Islam plays in the lives of these women.

By identifying what representations of Muslim women can be found in the media and analyzing what they convey to the public I seek more critical analysis of the information presented in the media. As many members of the general public rely on the news media as their source for learning about world events and various cultures, it is even more crucial to ensure that the representations disseminated by the media are not reinforcing stereotypes that provide misinformation. While the stereotyping of Muslim women continues to be evident in the media, it is important to draw attention to this problem and to encourage a critical assessment of the information being distributed to us on a daily basis.

Appendix A – Newspaper citations of Muslim women in *The New York Times*

Categories

Veil (V)
Biographical (B)
Women's Issues (WI)
Political (P)
Muslims in the West (MIW)

The New York Times

September 01, 2000 – September 10, 2001

Date	Page	Writer	Title
Sept.10, 2000	WK3	Jenny Lyn Bader	The Miniskirt as a National Security Threat **(P)**
Oct.2, 2000	A8	Barbara Crossette	Working For Women's Sexual Rights **(B)**
Oct.4, 2000	A3	Elaine Sciolino	Love Finds a Way in Iran: 'Temporary Marriage' **(WI)**
Oct.5, 2000	B1 & B8	Nichole M. Christian	New Hostility in Mideast Echoes in a Brooklyn Neighborhood **(MIW)**
Oct.9, 2000	C4	Susan Stellin	Compressed Data: A Web Site for Observant Muslim Investors **(B)**
Oct.14, 2000	B1 & B5	Robert Hanley	Different Views, Similar Feelings: Jews And Palestinians Alike Harbor Anger and Resentment **(MIW)**
Oct.16, 2000	B1 & B2	Barbara Crossette	Amid the Isolation, Finally a Friend: A Movement to Confront Hidden Abuse in Immigrant Families **(MIW)**
Oct.22, 2000	BR12	Diane Johnson	Behind the Veil: A Veteran Journalist Looks at Modern Iran and Examines Its Hope for the Future **(V)**
Oct.29, 2000	6	Douglas Frantz	Persecution Charged in Ex-Soviet Republic **(P)**
Nov.3, 2000	A3	Douglas Frantz	Turkish Women who See Death as a Way Out **(WI)**
Nov.12, 2000	WK14	author unknown	Honor Killings **(WI)**
Nov.19, 2000	3	Elisabeth Rosenthal	Defiant Chinese Muslims Keep Their Own Time **(P)**

Nov.26, 2000	10	Carlotta Gall	Bereft Women of Bosnia Find Solace in Graveyard **(P)**
Dec.5, 2000	A4	Susan Sachs	Saudi Mall-Crawlers Shop till Their Veils Drop **(V)**
Dec.10, 2000	22	Susan Sachs	With Trepidation, Saudi Arabia Meets The World **(P)**
Dec.10, 2000	BR8	Jonathan Mahler	Love in the Land of Mullahs: A Novel of Romance in Modern Iran **(WI)**
Dec.10, 2000	24	Marlise Simons	Dutch Group Calls Off an Opera After Muslims Pressure Cast **(MIW)**
Dec.18, 2000	A1 & A10	Roger Cohen	For 'New Danes,' Differences Create a Divide **(MIW)**
Dec.26, 2000	A15	Douglas Frantz	Despite Turkey's Secularism, Ramadan Exerts a Strong Force **(P)**
Feb.8, 2001	A1 & A12	Warren Hoge	British City Defines Diversity and Tolerance **(MIW)**
Feb.12, 2001	A4	Norimitsu Onishi	Maradi Journal: On the Scale of Beauty, Weight Weighs Heavily **(WI)**
Feb.13, 2001	A1 & A24	Jodi Wilgoren	On Campus and on Knees, Facing Mecca **(MIW)**
Feb.25, 2001	13	author unknown	School System in Michigan Plans to Serve Muslim Food **(MIW)**
Mar.11, 2001	AR1 & 24	Elaine Sciolino	In Iran, Expressions of a Country's Soul **(P)**
Mar.20, 2001	A3	Roger Cohen	Austrian School Drama: Crucifix Meets Ramadan **(MIW)**
Mar.25, 2001	SM40	Deborah Solomon	Romance of the Chador: The Video Artist Shirin Neshat's Elaborately Staged Films Express the Real-Life Dramas of Women Living Under Islam **(V)**
Apr.29, 2001	WE6	Lynne Ames	Out of a Nightmare, New Dreams are Born: A Scarsdale Couple Takes in an Iranian Teenager who was Blinded and Disfigured by Battery Acid **(B)**
May 14, 2001	A1 & A4	Neil MacFarquhar	In Egypt, Law of Man Creates a Caste of Shunned Children **(WI)**
June 20, 2001	A8	Barbara Crossette	Woman with a New View of Culture **(B)**
June 24, 2001	21	Matthew Purdy	A Chance to Live, and Then Describe,

			Her Own American Dream **(B)**
June 24, 2001	WH8	Marcia Sherman	When Fashion and Makeup do Wonders for the Spirit **(B)**
July 9, 2001	A1 & A4	Neil MacFarquhar	Saudis Offer Veiled Welcome to Tourists of a Certain Age **(V)**
Jul.13, 2001	A3	Sarah Lyall	The Immigrant Journey Gets No Easier in Britain **(MIW)**
Jul.29, 2001	6	Nazila Fathi	Ayatollah, Reviewing Islamic Law, Tugs At Ties Constricting Iran's Women **(WI)**
Aug.5, 2001	EL30	Peter Lagerquist	A Scholarship and a Crisis **(MIW)**
Aug.6, 2001	A4	Ian Fisher	Presevo Journal: In Wedding Season, Expatriate Albanians Return **(B)**
Sept.1, 2001	A2	Nazila Fathi	Court in Iran Detains Filmmaker on Charges of Political Crimes **(P)**

September 11, 2001-September 11, 2002

Date	Page	Writer	Title
Sept.12, 2001	A12	Laurie Goodstein	Relations: In U.S., Echoes of Rift of Muslims and Jews **(P)**
Sept.13, 2001	A24	Somini Sengupta	Relations: Arabs and Muslims Steer Through an Unsettling Scrutiny **(MIW)**
Sept.14, 2001	A14	Matthew Purdy	Our Towns: For Arab-Americans, Flag-Flying and Fear **(MIW)**
Sept.15, 2001	A20	Anemona Hartocollis /Charlie LeDuff	Relations: Parents Fear Their Children Will be the Target of Bigotry **(MIW)**
Sept.16, 2001	20	Barbara Crossette	In Montreal: A Sense of Foreboding in Canada's Diverse Muslim Haven **(MIW)**
Sept.18, 2001	B5	Evelyn Nieves/ Patricia Leigh Brown	Afghan-Americans: Group Struggling to Shed Association With Terrorism **(MIW)**
Sept.19, 2001	A27	Anika Rahman	Fear in the Open City **(MIW)**
Sept.23, 2001	LI8	John Rather	Uneasy Times for Muslims on Island **(MIW)**
Sept.30, 2001	WE1 & 8	Robert Worth	For Arab-Americans, a Time of Disquiet **(MIW)**

Oct.1, 2001	B1 & B7	Jodi Wilgoren	The Pakistani-Americans: Isolated Family Finds Support and Reasons to Worry in Illinois **(MIW)**
Oct.5, 2001	B9	John W. Fountain	African-American Muslims: Sadness and Fear as a Group Feels Doubly at Risk **(MIW)**
Oct.6, 2001	B8	Caryn James	The Media: Islam and Its Adherents Ride the Publicity Wave **(WI)**
Oct.7, 2001	B1 & B9	Susan Sachs	The 2 World of Muslim American Teenagers **(MIW)**
Oct.18, 2001	B1 & B10	Timothy Egan	Tough but Hopeful Weeks For the Muslims of Laramie **(MIW)**
Oct.19, 2001	A19	Jan Goodwin/ Jessica Neuwirth	The Rifle and the Veil **(V)**
Oct.22, 2001	B10	Jodi Wilgoren	American Muslims: Islam Attracts Converts By the Thousand, Drawn Before and After Attacks **(MIW)**
Oct.24, 2001	A8	Alan Cowell	Tug of Faith Unsettles British Muslims **(MIW)**
Oct.25, 2001	D2	Robin Finn	A Daughter of Islam, and an Enemy of Terror **(B)**
Oct.27, 2001	B9	Alessandra Stanley	Women in Authority: Walking a Fine Line in Showcasing Women and Dealing With Muslim Allies **(WI)**
Oct.29, 2001	B1 & B6	Susan Sachs	A Family Both Arab and Arab-American, Divided by a War **(B)**
Nov.3, 2001	B1 & B8	Laurie Goodstein	Muslims Nurture Sense of Self on Campus **(MIW)**
Nov.4, 2001	B1 & B9	Jodi Wilgoren	Struggling to be Both Arab and American **(MIW)**
Nov.11, 2001	EL22	Tara Bahrampour	Where Islam Meets 'Brave New World' **(MIW)**
Nov.16, 2001	B1 & B10	Laurie Goodstein	Ramadan: Muslims See Acceptance and Scrutiny as Holy Month Nears **(MIW)**
Nov.16, 2001	D1 & D2	Daniel J. Wakin	Safekeeping Faith and Tradition: Bronx Mosque Provides a Place for Prayer, and More **(MIW)**
Nov.18, 2001	WK5	Elaine Sciolino	Hair as a Battlefield for the Soul **(V)**

Nov.19, 2001	A1 & B4	Amy Waldman	Behind the Burka: Women Subtly **(V)** Fought Taliban
Nov.19, 2001	B6	Danny Hakim	Islam: Ford Motor Workers Get on-the-Job Training in Religious Tolerance **(MIW)**
Nov.21, 2001	D1 & D2	Daniel J. Wakin	Thanksgiving in a time of Fasting: In Brooklyn, Healing Rhythms of Ramadan **(MIW)**
Nov.24, 2001	A26	author unknown	Liberating the Women of Afghanistan **(WI)**
Nov.25, 2001	AR33	Hilarie M.Sheets	Stitch by Stitch, a Daughter of Islam Takes on Taboos **(B)**
Nov.27, 2001	A19	Rina Amiri	Muslim Women as Symbols – and Pawns **(WI)**
Nov.28, 2001	A4	Somini Sengupta	Istanbul Journal: Campus Crowd Shrugs at Marital-Equality Law **(WI)**
Nov.30, 2001	B4	Steven Erlanger	Rights: In Bonn, Three Champions for Afghan Women **(WI)**
Dec.2, 2001	WK3	Barbara Crossette	Afghanistan's Women: Hope for the Future, Blunted by a Hard Past **(WI)**
Dec.2, 2001	WK7	Amy Waldman	Word for Word: Taboo Heaven **(P)**
Dec.7, 2001	A8	Amy Waldman	In Iran, an Angry Generation Longs for Jobs, More Freedom and Power **(P)**
Dec.9, 2001	LI1 & 10	Ramin Ganeshram	Steadfast in Their New Faith: Converts Rally to Islam after Sept.11 **(MIW)**
Dec.12, 2001	B2	David Rohde	At a Hospital: 'Grandchildren and Ladies' Become Casualties **(P)**
Dec.14, 2001	A3	Suzanne Daley	Algerians Seek Something More Than Survival **(P)**
Dec.15, 2001	A4	Somini Sengupta	Joblessness is Fraying Istanbul's Social Fabric **(P)**
Dec.15, 2001	A16	Jim Yardley	Differences Portray Microcosm of Islamic World **(MIW)**
Dec.17, 2001	B1	Susan Sachs	Where Muslim Traditions Meet Modernity **(WI)**
Dec.17, 2001	B8	Amy Waldman	Holiday: Fast Ends in Kabul, But a Hunger Grows For a New, Better Life **(WI)**

Dec.17, 2001	A1 & A13	Evelyn Nieves	A New Minority Makes Itself Known: Hispanic Muslims **(MIW)**
Dec.23, 2001	LI14	Shandray Gabbay	Diverse Works Exhibited by Muslim Artists **(B)**
Dec.23, 2001	A20	Laurie Goodstein	Stereotyping Rankles Silent, Secular Majority of American Muslims **(MIW)**
Jan.2, 2002	B1 & B2	Daniel J. Wakin	Ranks of Latinos Turning to Islam Are Increasing **(MIW)**
Jan.3, 2002	A18	Jo Thomas/ Ralph Blumenthal	Rural Muslims Draw New, Unwanted Attention **(MIW)**
Jan.5, 2002	A8	Blaine Harden	U.S. Looks at Whether Saudi Princess Enslaved Maid **(P)**
Jan.8, 2002	A8	Douglas Frantz	Turkey, Well Along Road to Secularism, Fears Detour to Islamism **(P)**
Jan.9, 2002	A10	Amy Waldman	A Nation Challenged: Education – Young Women, Back in School, Race to Catch Up **(WI)**
Jan.15, 2002	A12	Norimitsu Onishi	A Nation Challenged: Education- Medical Schools Show First Signs of Healing From Taliban Abuse **(P)**
Jan.20, 2002	NYT30 & 31	Andrew Marshall	The Widows' Battalion: For Indonesia, Separatism is a Much of a Problem as Radical Islam, and Women have Joined The Fight **(WI)**
Jan.27, 2002	NYT28-31	Richard Dowden	This Woman Has Been Sentenced to Death by Stoning **(P)**
Jan.31, 2002	A1 & A10	James Bennet	Arab Woman's Path to Unlikely 'Martyrdom' **(B)**
Feb.10, 2002	A14	John F. Burns	A Nation Challenged: Reviving Education For Women in Kabul, This Test is Welcome **(WI)**
Feb.10, 2002	A15	Sheryl Gay Stolberg	A Nation Challenged: Exiles, Torn Between Countries, Want to Help Rebuild Afghanistan **(MIW)**
Feb.11, 2002	A3	Elaine Sciolino	Rehabilitation Joins Retribution in Saudi Drug War **(P)**
Feb.15, 2002		Elaine Sciolino	Jidda Journal: Where the Prophet Trod, He Begs, Tread Lightly **(B)**
Feb.16, 2002	B8	Eric Goldscheider	Religion Journal: Colleges are Scrambling for Muslim Chaplains **(MIW)**

Mar.01, 2002	A10	Joel Greenberg	Portrait of an Angry Young Arab Woman **(B)**
Mar.2, 2002	A6	Seth Mydan	By Barring Religious Garb, Singapore School Dress Code Alienates Muslims **(P)**
Mar.8, 2002	A14	Chris Hedges	Muslims Return from Mecca with Joy, Yet Concern **(MIW)**
Mar.10, 2002	AR1 & 20 &21	Andrew Solomon	An Awakening After the Taliban **(WI)**
Mar.10, 2002	WK3	Erica Goode	Finding Answers in Secret Plots **(P)**
Mar.11, 2002	B5	Yilu Zhao	Steering Clear of Politics at Islamic Day Schools **(MIW)**
Mar.20, 2002	A29	Rina Amiri	The Fear Beneath the Burka **(V)**
Mar.21, 2002	A18	author unknown	Boys, and Girls, Return to School in ~~Kabul (WI)~~
Mar.21, 2002	B1 & B2	Susan Sachs	from Ancient Days, a Tasty New Year: Rites of a Persian Feast Recall Homelands Left Behind **(MIW)**
Apr.10, 2002	B3	Susan Sachs	Conflict Takes Toll on Jewish and Arab Families in the City **(P)**
Apr.16, 2002	A16	Tim Golden	Media: Crisis Deepens Impact of Arab TV News **(P)**
Apr.25, 2002	A16	Susan Sachs	A Nation Challenged: Relations – For ~~Many American Muslims, Complaints of~~ Quiet but Persistent Bias **(MIW)**
May 4, 2002	A4	David Rohde	Schooled in America, Seething In the West Bank **(P)**
May 9, 2002	E1 & E8	Julie Salamon	Instant Islam: Trying to Find A Global Faith in the Details **(WI)**
May 11, 2002	A4	Seth Mydans	A Pakistani Dancer and Her Life Underground **(B)**
May 17, 2002	A3	Seth Mydans	In Pakistan, Rape Victims are the ~~Criminals (WI)~~
May 22, 2002	A3	Neil MacFarquhar	In Bahrain, Women Run, Women Vote, Women Lose **(P)**
June 01, 2002	A10	Sarah Kershaw	The Distant Drums of War **(P)**
June 27, 2002	A16	Dana Canedy	Lifting the Veil for Photo ID Goes too Far, Driver Says – Muslim Woman

			Is Taking Florida to Court **(MIW)**
July 02, 2002	A11	Barbara Crossette	Study Warns of Stagnation in Arab Societies **(WI)**
July 17, 2002	A3	Ian Fisher	Account of Punjab Rape Tells of a Brutal Society **(WI)**
July 28, 2002	A3	Ian Fisher	Seeing No Justice, A Rape Victim Chooses Death **(WI)**
Aug.04, 2002	WK5	Nazila Fathi	Taboo Surfing: Click Here for Iran **(P)**
Aug.19, 2002	B1 & B5	Daniel Wakin	For New York Muslims, An Uneasy Anniversary **(MIW)**
Aug.20, 2002	A12	no author	Court Upholds Stoning for Nigerian Mother **(WI)**
Aug.28, 2002	A3	Nazila Fathi	To Regulate Prostitution, Iran Ponders Brothels **(WI)**
Sept.01, 2002	1 & 5	David M. Halbfinger	After the Veil, a Makeover Rush **(V)**
Sept.01, 2002	NYT42-47	Tim Judah	The Sullen Majority **(P)**
Sept.02, 2002	A1 & A6	Serge Schmemann	For Arab Informers, Death; For Executioners, Justice **(P)**
Sept.04, 2002	A1 & A8	John F. Burns	On the Radio, Afghans Call Their Nation to a New Day **(P)**
Sept.07, 2002	A3	Norimitsu Onishi	Mother's Sentence Unsettles a Nigerian Village **(WI)**

Bibliography

Primary Source

The New York Times, September 11, 2000-September 11, 2002

Secondary Sources

Abedi, Mehdi and Michael M.J. Fischer. *Debating Muslims: Cultural Dialogues in Postmodernity and Tradition*, Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1990.

Abraham, Nabeel and Sameer Y. Abraham., eds. *Arabs in the New World – Studies on Arab-American Communities*, Detroit: Wayne State University Center for Urban Studies, 1983.

Abraham, Nabeel and Sameer Y. Abraham., eds. *The Arab World and Arab-Americans – Understanding a Neglected Minority*, Detroit: Center for Urban Studies, Wayne State University, 1981.

Abrahamian, Ervand. "The U.S. Media, Samuel Huntington and September 11", *MERIP*, Summer 2002 (no.223, vol.32, no.2): 62-63

Abu-Laban, Baha; Regula B. Qureshi and Earle H. Waugh., eds. *The Muslim Community in North America*, Edmonton: The University of Alberta Press, 1983.

Abu-Laban, Sharon McIrvin; Regula Burckhardt Qureshi and Earle H. Waugh., eds. *Muslim Families in North America*, Edmonton: The University of Alberta Press, 1991.

Abu-Lughod, Lila., ed. *Remaking Women – Feminism and Modernity in the Middle East*, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998.

Adams, C. *Television Coverage of the Middle East*, Norwood, N.J.: Ablex Publishing, 1981.

Ahmed, Leila. *Women and Gender in Islam – Historical Roots of a Modern Debate*, New Haven & London: Yale University Press, 1992.

Ali, Tariq. *The Clash of Fundamentalisms – Crusades, Jihads and Modernity*, London & New York: Verso, 2002.

Allan, Stuart and Barbie Zelizer. eds. *Journalism After September 11*, London: Routledge, 2002.

Allan, Stuart. *News, Gender and Power*, London, New York: Routledge, 1998.

Alloula, Malek. *The Colonial Harem*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986.

Al-Marayati, Salam. "The Rising Tide of Hostile Stereotyping of Islam", *The Washington Report on Middle East Affairs*: June 1994: p.27

Altheide, D. *Creating Reality: How TV News Distorts Events*, Beverly Hills, CA: Sage, 1976.

Artz, Lee and Yahya R. Kamalipour., eds. *Bring 'Em On – Media and Politics in the Iraq War*, Lanham & Toronto: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2005.

Belkaoui, Janice. M. "Images of Arabs and Israelis in the Prestige Press: 1966-1974", *Journalism Quarterly*, v.55: 732-733, 799 (1978)

Benet, James; Kaplan Daniels, Arlene and Tuchman, Gaye., eds. *Hearth and Home – Images of Women in the Mass Media*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1978.

Benthall, Jonathan. *Disasters, Relief and the Media*, London: I. B. Tauris, 1993.

Bernheimer, Charles. ed., *Comparative Literature in the Age of Multiculturalism*, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1995.

Carey, James W. *Communication as Culture: Essays on the Media and Society*, Boston: Unwin Hyman, 1988.

Culler, Jonathan D. *Literary Theory: A Very Short Introduction*, Oxford/New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.

Daniel, Norman. *The Cultural Barrier: Problems in the Exchange of Ideas*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1975.

Darling, Jennifer. *The American Press and the Role of Islam in the Iranian Revolution: A Study of Editorial Perceptions in Five Daily Newspapers*, MA Thesis, Montreal: McGill University, 1982.

Egorova, Yulia and Tudor Parfitt., eds. *Jews, Muslims and Mass Media*, London/New York: Routledge, 2004.

Esposito, John L. *The Islamic Threat: Myth or Reality?*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1992.

Esposito, John L. and Yvonne Yazbeck Haddad., eds. *Muslims on the Americanization Path?*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1998.

Falah, Ghazi-Walid. "The Visual Representation of Muslim/Arab Women in Daily Newspapers in the United States" in *Geographies of Muslim Women: Gender, Religion, and Space*. New York: The Guilford Press, 2005.

Feldman, Allen. "On Cultural Anesthesia: From Desert Storm to Rodney King", *American Ethnologist*, 21(2): 404-418 (1994)

Fox, Roy F. *Images in Language, Media and Mind*, Urbana, Illinois: National Council of Teachers of English, 1994.

Gerbner, G. and G. Marvanx."The Many Worlds of the World's Press" in G. Gerbner and M. Siefert eds. *World Communication: A Handbook*, New York: Longman, 1984 (p.92-102)

Ghareeb, E. "The Middle East in the U.S. Media", *The Middle East Annual Issues and Events*, v.3:185-210 (1984)

Ghareeb, E. ed. *Split Vision, the Portrayal of Arabs in the American Media*, Washington, D.C.: American Arab Affairs Council, 1983.

Haddad, Yvonne Yazbeck ed. *The Muslims of America*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1991.

Haddad, Yvonne Yazbeck ed. *Muslims in the West – From Sojourners to Citizens*, New York: Oxford University Press, 2002.

Haddad, Yvonne Yazbeck and Jane I. Smith. eds. *Muslim Communities in North America*, Albany: State University of New York Press, 1994.

Haddad, Yvonne Yazbeck and Jane I. Smith. eds. *Muslim Minorities in the West- Visible and Invisible*, Walnut Creek: Altamira Press, 2002.

Hagopian, Elaine C. ed. *Civil Rights in Peril: The Targeting of Arabs and Muslims*. Chicago: Haymarket Books, 2004.

Hasan, Asma Gull. *American Muslims: The New Generation 2nd Edition*, New York/London: Continuum, 2002.

Haynes, J.E. "Keeping Cool About Kabul: *The Washington Post* and the *New York Times* Cover the Communist Seizure of Afghanistan", *World Affairs*, v.145:369-383 (1983)

Henderson, Mae. ed., *Borders, Boundaries and Frames: Essays in Cultural Criticism and Cultural Studies*, New York: Routledge, 1995.

Heumann, J. "U.S. Network Television: Melodrama and the Iranian Crisis", *Middle East Review*, v.13: 51-55 (1980)

Hudson, M.C. and R.G. Wolf., eds. *The American Media and the Arabs*, Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 1980.

Jiwani, Yasmin. "Gendering Terror: Representations of the Orientalized Body in Quebec's Post-September 11 English-Language Press", *Critique: Critical Middle Eastern Studies*, v.13 (3): 265-291 (Fall 2004)

Just, Marion, Montague Kern and Pippa Norris., eds. *Framing Terrorism – The News Media, the Government and the Public*, New York: Routledge, 2003.

Kahf, Mohja. *Representations of the Muslim Woman: From Termagant to Odalisque*, Austin: University of Texas Press, 1999.

Kamalipour, Yahya R. *The U.S. Media and the Middle East: Image and Perception*, Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1995.

Karim, Karim H. *Constructions of the Islamic Peril in English Language Canadian Print Media: Discourses of Power and Violence*, McGill University PhD Dissertation, Communication Studies Department, 1996.

Karim, Karim H. *Images of Arabs and Muslims: A Research Review*, Ottawa: Policy & Research, Multiculturalism Branch, Multiculturalism and Citizenship Canada, 1991.

Karim, Karim H. *The Islamic Peril: Media and Global Violence*, Montreal: Black Rose Books, 2000.

Karim, Karim H. ed., *The Media of Diaspora*, New York: Routledge, 2003.

Kincheloe, Joe L. and Shirley R. Steinberg., eds. *The Miseducation of the West – How Schools and the Media Distort Our Understanding of the Islamic World.* Westport and London: Praeger, 2004.

Lazreg, Marnia. *The Eloquence of Silence – Algerian Women in Question*, New York: Routledge, 1994.

Manoff, Robert Karl and Michael Schudson. eds., *Reading the News: a Pantheon Guide to Popular Culture*, New York: Pantheon Books, 1986.

Marvasti, Amir and Karyn D. McKinney. *Middle Eastern Lives in America*, New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2004.

McAlister, Melani. *Epic Encounters – Culture, Media, and U.S. Interests in the Middle East, 1945-2000*, Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001.

McChesney, Robert W. and John Nichols. eds., *Our Media, Not Theirs: The Democratic Struggle Against Corporate Media*, New York: Seven Stories, 2002.

Metcalf, Barbara Daly ed. *Making Muslim Space in North America and Europe*, Berkely: University of California Press, 1996.

Moghissi, Haideh. *Feminism and Islamic Fundamentalism – The Limits of Postmodern Analysis*, London & New York: Zed Books, 1999.

Moghissi, Haideh., ed. *Women and Islam – Critical Concepts in Sociology, Volume I: Images and Realities*, London & New York: Routledge, 2005.

Moghissi, Haideh., ed. *Women and Islam – Critical Concepts in Sociology, Volume 2: Social Conditions, Obstacles and Prospects*, London & New York: Routledge, 2005.

Mohammad-Arif, Aminah. *Salaam America – South Asian Muslims in New York*, London: Anthem Press, 2000.

Mohanty, Chandra Talpade. *Feminism Without Borders – Decolonizing Theory, Practicing Solidarity*, Durham & London: Duke University Press, 2003.

Morris, Nancy and Silvio Waisbord. *Media and Globalization – Why State Matters*, Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2001.

Mortimer, E. "Islam and the Western Journalist", *Middle East Journal*, v.35: 492-505 (1981)

Mousa, I.S. *The Arab Images in the U.S. Press*, New York: Peter Lang, 1984.

Newton, Judith Lowder. *Starting Over: Feminism and the Politics of Cultural Critique*, Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1994.

Paraschos, Manny and Bill Rutherford. "Network News Coverage of the Invasion of Lebanon by Israel in 1982", *Journalism Quarterly*, v.62: 457-464 (1985)

Parenti, Michael. *Inventing Reality: The Politics of Mass Media*, New York: St. Martin's Press, 1986.

Poole, Elizabeth. *Reporting Islam – Media Representations of British Muslims*, London: I.B. Tauris Publishers, 2002.

"Rewriting America", *Index on Censorship for Free Expression*, vol.32, no.3, July 2003,

Issue 208. (London, UK)

Said, Edward. *Covering Islam: How the Media and the Experts Determine How We See the Rest of the World*, New York: Pantheon Books, 1981.

Said, Edward. "The MESA Debate: The Scholars, the Media and the Middle East". *Journal of Palestine Studies*, v.16 (2): 85-104 (1987)

Saliba, Therese. "Military Presences and Absences: Arab Women and the Persian Gulf War" in Susan Jeffords and Lauren Rabinovitz eds., *Seeing Through the Media – The Persian Gulf War*. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1994.

Schudson, Michael. *Discovering the News: A Social History of American Newspapers*, New York: Basic Books, 1978.

Sell, Roger D. *Literature as Communication: The Foundations of Mediating Criticism*, Philadelphia: J. Benjamins, 2000.

Shaheen, Jack G. *Arab and Muslim Stereotyping in American Popular Culture*, Washington, D.C.: Center for Muslim-Christian Understanding: History and International Affairs, Georgetown University, 1997.

Shaheen, Jack G. "Media Coverage of the Middle East: Perception and Foreign Policy", *Annals*, v.482: 160-174 (1985)

Shaheen, Jack G. *Reel Bad Arabs: How Hollywood Vilifies a People*, New York: Olive Branch Press, 2001.

Shaheen, Jack G. *The TV Arab*, Bowling Green, OH: Bowling Green State University Popular Press, 1984.

Shirazi, Faegheh. *The Veil Unveiled – The Hijab in Modern Culture*. Gainesville: University of Florida Press, 2001.

Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. *A Critique of Postcolonial Reason – Towards a History of the Vanishing Present*, Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1999.

Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. *In Other Worlds – Essays in Cultural Politics*, New York & London: Methuen, 1987.

Sreberny-Mohammadi, Annabelle. ed., *Media in a Global Context*, New York: St. Martin's Press, 1997.

Steele, Meili. *Theorizing Textual Subjects: Agency and Oppression*, Cambridge/New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997.

Steet, Linda. *Veils and Daggers – A Century of National Geographic's Representation of the Arab World.* Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2000.

Suleiman, Michael W. "An Evaluation of Middle East Coverage in Seven American News Magazines, July-December, 1965", *Middle East Forum*, v.41: 9-30 (1965)

Suleiman, Michael W., ed. *Arabs in America – Building a New Future*, Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1999.

Terry, J. and G. Mendenhall. "1973 U.S. Press Coverage on the Middle East", *Journal of Palestine Studies*, v.4 (1): 120-133 (1974)

Tomlinson, John. *Cultural Imperialism – A Critical Introduction*, London: Pinter Publishers, 1991.

Tuchman, Gaye. *Making News.– A Study in the Construction of Reality*, New York: The Free Press: New York, 1978.

Van Dijk, Teun A. *Racism and the Press*, London/New York: Routledge, 1991.

Wagner, C.H. "Elite American Newspapers Opinion and the Middle East: Commitment Versus Isolation" in W.A. Beling, ed. *The East: Quest for American Policy*, Albany: State University of New York Press, 1973: 306-335

Wormser, Richard. *American Islam*, New York: Walker and Company, 1994.

Young, Iris Marion. *Inclusion and Democracy*, New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.