

Nicole Biamonte

Between 1809 and 1820 Beethoven composed settings for 179 folk-song melodies, the majority of them Irish, Scottish, and Welsh.¹ While there have been documentary and bibliographical studies concerning this repertoire,² analytical studies are far fewer. The most comprehensive analyses of the settings to date are found in Petra Weber-Bockholdt's *Beethovens Bearbeitungen britischer Lieder* and to a lesser degree in Barry Cooper's *Beethoven's Folksong Settings*,³ which is primarily historical in focus but includes a consideration of the formal structures of the settings, motivic development within them, and—most germane to this study—Beethoven's treatment of “irregular” melodies. In this essay I examine the surprisingly small number of Beethoven's modal folk-song

1. Beethoven set 150 songs from Britain and twenty-nine from the Continent: op.108 (Scottish), WoO 152–54 (Irish), WoO 155 (Welsh), WoO 156 (Scottish, one English), WoO 157 (mostly British, two Italian), WoO 158a (Continental), WoO 158b (British), WoO 158c (British, one French), and eleven uncatalogued settings.

2. Felix Lederer, *Beethovens Bearbeitungen schottischer und anderer Volkslieder* (Bonn: L. Neuendorff, 1934); Cecil B. Hopkinson and C. B. Oldman, *Thomson's Collections of National Song, with Special Reference to the Contributions of Haydn and Beethoven* (Edinburgh: R. & R. Clark, 1940); Alan Tyson, *The Authentic English Editions of Beethoven* (London: Faber and Faber, 1963); Willy Hess, “Handschriftensammelbände zu Beethovens Volksliederbearbeitungen” in *Beiträge zur Beethoven-Bibliographie*, ed. Kurt Dorfinüller (Munich: G. Henle, 1979), pp.88–103; Marianne Bröcker, “Die Bearbeitungen schottischer und irischer Volkslieder von Ludwig van Beethoven,” in *Jahrbuch für musikalische Volks- und Völkerkunde* 10 (1982), 63–89.

3. Petra Weber-Bockholdt, *Beethovens Bearbeitungen britischer Lieder* (Munich: Fink, 1994); Barry Cooper, *Beethoven's Folksong Settings: Chronology, Sources, Style* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994).

settings and categorize them by harmonization type, superimposing a theoretical framework on the continuum between tonality and modality.

The analytical neglect of these arrangements stems from the view, less widely held today than in the past but nonetheless still prevalent,⁴ that they were compositional hackwork based on materials from musical traditions with which Beethoven was largely unfamiliar, containing little, if any, of his artistry. This valuation is reflected by their position in the *New Grove Dictionary* works list, in which the folk-song settings are placed at the extreme end, following “Miscellaneous Works” and even “Works of Doubtful Authenticity.”⁵ As Cooper has shown, however, Beethoven himself came to regard these commissions as serious works.⁶ I will show that his solutions to the compositional problems presented by the melodies can shed light on his harmonic thinking and his creative process in general.

Almost all of Beethoven's folk-song settings result from his work for George Thomson (1757–1851), an amateur editor and publisher in Edinburgh who had already commissioned similar arrangements from Ignaz Pleyel and Leopold Koze-luch, whose work was unsatisfactory, and then from Joseph Haydn, whose health had deteriorated too far to continue. In July 1806, Thomson first suggested setting folk songs to Beethoven,⁷ who agreed in November of that year,⁸ but specific terms were not settled until late 1809. The first group of completed arrangements was returned to Thomson in July 1810. Over the course of the following decade, Beethoven composed 179 settings and sent all but two of them to Thomson (two settings of Austrian melodies were offered only to Simrock in Bonn).⁹ Thomson finally discontinued Beethoven's folk-song commissions in 1820 when it proved that, despite the composer's eventual grudging efforts to make them more easily playable, they were not commercially successful. While Thomson lamented his lost investment,¹⁰ he continued to commission settings from Carl Maria von Weber,

4. For example, in the first edition of his biography *Beethoven*, Maynard Solomon described the settings as “of little value,” an assessment he amended in the second edition to “of somewhat mixed value.” Compare Solomon, *Beethoven* 1st edn. (1977), p.297 with the 2nd edn. (1998), p.388.

5. Douglas Johnson and Scott Burnham, “Beethoven,” *Works*, *Grove Music Online*, ed. L. Macy, www.grovemusic.com.

6. Cooper, *Beethoven's Folksong Settings*, pp.198–201.

7. Brandenburg, no.253 (1 July 1806), I, 286 (summary; original unknown).

8. Brandenburg, no.259 (1 Nov. 1806), I, 290–92.

9. For more details, see Cooper, *Beethoven's Folksong Settings*, esp. chap.2, “Compositional Chronology,” pp.11–38.

10. “All my gold ducats, about 700 of them, have been thrown away, besides the expense of engraving, printing, and paper!” (letter from Thomson to William Smyth on 29 August 1821, quoted in Cooper, *Beethoven's Folksong Settings*, p.43).

Johann Nepomuk Hummel, the English composer Henry R. Bishop, and the Scottish composer G. F. Graham.

Thomson's goal was to publish selected traditional songs of the British Isles in simple arrangements suitable for amateur performance. To this end, with the ostensible aim of preserving the songs, Thomson bowdlerized or replaced texts deemed overly vulgar, insufficiently picturesque, or otherwise deficient. It is worth noting that in many cases even the original texts and melodies available to Thomson had been recently written by English composers affecting an ersatz Scottish folk style; nonetheless, many of these were later adopted in Scotland as genuine.¹¹ It is also worth noting that many of the folk songs existed in multiple versions of the melody, title, and text, which makes identification of a single original problematic at best. Thomson acknowledged this difficulty in the preface to the first volume of *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs* (1804), containing arrangements by Pleyel and Kozeluch, and described his criteria for selecting the melodies, which privileged contemporary taste over authenticity:

The first object was to procure the Airs in their best form. What their precise *original* form may have been, cannot now be ascertained. Although we go back to the earliest printed Collection, it is far from certain that the Airs are there presented to us as they came from the Composers; for they had been preserved, we know not how long, by oral tradition, and thus were liable to changes before they were collected. Nor is it at all certain that the earliest Collectors had industry to seek, opportunity to find, and musical taste to select and hand down the Airs in their most approved form. It is certain, however, that, in the progress of the Airs to modern times, they have in some parts been delicately moulded by judicious Singers, into a more simple and pleasing form than that given to them by the early Publishers. . . . In selecting the Airs, the Editor not only consulted every Collection, old and new, comparing the same Airs in each, but availed himself of the communications of such intelligent friends as he knew to have been conversant with their native music; and he invariably chose that set or copy of every Air, whether printed or manuscript, which seemed the most simple and beautiful, freed, he trusts, from vulgar errors on the one hand, and redundant graces on the other.¹²

11. For more on this topic, see Hugh Trevor-Roper, "The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland" in *The Invention of Tradition*, ed. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1983), pp. 15–41; and David Johnson, *Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century* (London: Oxford UP, 1972), esp. "National Songs," pp. 130–49.

12. From the preface to *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs for the Voice*, ed. George Thomson, vol. I (Edinburgh: G. Thomson, 1803), p. 1.

For many songs Beethoven was not sent the intended text, which often was not yet written, and the English language of which he would not have understood without assistance—let alone the Scottish dialect. He repeatedly demanded the texts from Thomson, however, arguing that he could not compose proper arrangements without them,¹³ and as Cooper points out, he described his settings as compositions,¹⁴ which suggests that he took the commissions seriously. Responding to one of Thomson's many requests that he simplify his accompaniments, Beethoven placed the settings implicitly on a level with his other works when he testily declared: "I am not accustomed to retouching my compositions; I have never done so, certain of the truth that any partial change alters the character of the composition. I am sorry that you are the loser, but you cannot blame me, since it was up to you to make me better acquainted with the taste of your country and the little facility of your performers."¹⁵

For each melody Beethoven was given a tempo marking and sometimes the title or general affect of the song. He supplied piano accompaniments with introductions, postludes, and internal ritornellos; optional parts for other voices, violin and cello; adaptations of the violin parts for flute; and in a few instances, vocal cadenzas. In many settings Beethoven consciously invoked a folk idiom through foreground primitivist devices such as drone-bass pedal points, independent $\frac{6}{4}$ chords that create a sense of harmonic naiveté, and appoggiaturas and other unprepared dissonances. On the other hand, there are many instances of secondary deceptive cadences, chromatic chords, and complex melodic and rhythmic figurations that are more typical of his canonical works.

What effect was Beethoven seeking to evoke in his settings of the folk-song melodies? By his own admission, he considered the settings to be both art music and music for the people: "I shall strive to make the compositions as easy and agreeable as I can, as far as this accords with the elevation and originality of style which by your own admission characterizes my works so advantageously, and from

13. See Brandenburg, no.409 (23 Nov. 1809), II, 91; no.457 (17 July 1810), II, 141; no.515 (20 July 1811), II, 206; and no.556 (29 Feb. 1812), II, 248.

14. Cooper, *Beethoven's Folksong Settings*, p.198.

15. "Je ne suis pas accoutumé de retoucher mes compositions; Je ne l'ai jamais fait, pénétré de la vérité que tout changement partielle altere le Caractere de la composition. Il me fait de la peine que Vous y perdes mais Vous ne sauriez m'en imputer la faute, puisque c'étant a Vous de me faire mieux connoître le gout de Votre pays & le peu de facilité de vos executeurs" (Brandenburg, no.623 [19 Feb. 1813], II, 321). Nearly all of their correspondence is in French, which was the closest they had to a common language.

which I shall never lower myself.”¹⁶ Unfortunately, the resulting works had too much art in them for Thomson’s public; he complained that Beethoven “composes for posterity . . . he has been too learned and eccentric for my purpose.”¹⁷ Cooper has asserted that the reason behind the perceived difficulties with Beethoven’s settings is that he was composing in an experimental vein and was willing “to risk something primitive or awkward, rather than lapse into harmony that was too predictable and conventional.”¹⁸ Dahlhaus’s observation on the role of folk music in the development of nineteenth-century harmony is apposite to a consideration of Beethoven’s folk-song harmonizations:

Folk music was integrated into the context of nineteenth-century harmonic writing, but because it was originally monodic (or performed in heterophonic variants) it resisted assimilation into the well-worn formulas of major-minor tonality; for that very reason it challenged composers to invent unusual harmonies, to make experiments that in turn affected harmony in music unconnected with folk music, and so influenced the mainstream of developments. The experimentation had the advantage, moreover, of having a goal, of being undertaken in response to a specific, well-defined problem.¹⁹

In this way, a construct that was originally melody-driven was incorporated into a harmony-driven system of tonality, transforming it while becoming transformed in the process. As noted above, some of the older folk-song melodies had already been modified to conform better to major-minor tonality, and Thomson encouraged Beethoven to make similar emendations wherever necessary: “If you find in any of the airs a passage which appears disagreeable to you, and which you could ameliorate by a slight change, you are at liberty to do so.”²⁰ Apart from trivial adjustments of rhythm, however, Beethoven let the melodies stand unchanged—with one exception.

16. “Je m’efforcerai de rendre les compositions faciles et agréables autant que je pourrai, et autant que cela peut s’accorder avec cette Elévation et cette originalité du Style, qui selon votre propre aveu caractérisent mes ouvrages asses avantageusement, et dont je ne m’abaisserai jamais” (Brandenburg, no.259 [1 Nov. 1806], I, 290).

17. Letter from Thomson to William Smyth on 29 August 1821, quoted in Cooper, *Beethoven’s Folksong Settings*, p.43.

18. Cooper, *Beethoven’s Folksong Settings*, p.149.

19. Carl Dahlhaus, *Between Romanticism and Modernism*, trans. Mary Whittall (Berkeley and Los Angeles: U California P, 1980), p.97.

20. “Si vous trouvez dans quel que ce soit des airs un passage qui vous paroît désagréable, et que vous pourriez améliorer par un léger changement; vous êtes en liberté de la faire” (Brandenburg, no.605 [21 Dec. 1812], II, 300).

His only known alteration was to a single pitch in the melody of *Lochnagar* (WoO 156/9), a purportedly Scottish folk song actually written by the English composer Maurice Greene (1696–1755).²¹ Example 1 shows the final A section of the AABA' form. The melody on the top staff was published by Thomson in an 1804 setting by Pleyel; Beethoven's 1818 setting is shown below it.²² (Note: this and all following examples are reductions of Beethoven's vocal and instrumental parts.)

Beethoven changed the second note in m. 19 from B \flat to B \sharp , which he placed in the bass on the downbeat of that measure, transforming the first half of m. 19 from stable tonic harmony to a strongly directional applied dominant, V/iv, and effectively classicizing the diatonic folk syntax. In like manner, Beethoven set scale degrees $\hat{5}$ – $\hat{8}$ leading into m. 17 not with the obvious V–i but with V⁷/VI–VI. This reharmonization is somewhat surprising, since the preceding three phrases all open with the same ascending-fourth gesture supported with dominant and tonic, but it serves to integrate harmonically the B section, which begins in the relative major (B \flat) prepared by the submediant (E \flat).

Beethoven's classicization of a diatonic folk melody illustrates another perceived problem with the settings: they straddle two musical traditions without properly belonging to either. Reconciling the monodic folk tradition with the

Tho' ca-ta-racts foam 'stead of smooth flow-ing foun-tains, I sigh for the va-ley of dark Loch-na-gar!

17

g: V4/VI 3 VI i6 4 V7 i V6/iv 5 iv V6 - 5 4 - 3 i

Example 1: Melody of *Loch-nagar* and Beethoven's setting (WoO 156/9), mm. 17–20.

21. Described by Cooper in *Beethoven's Folksong Settings*, pp. 59, 129.

22. Tune: *Sweet Annie frae the Sea Beach Came*. Thomson replaced the original text with Byron's *Lochnagar*.

harmonic Classical one was not necessarily an easy task. Indeed, when Kozeluch received Thomson's first group of melodies to be set, he sent them straight back, confident that they must have been full of copyist's errors.²³ Beethoven himself complained:

There are some songs which do not succeed without some trouble, although one does not hear this when playing or looking at them, for example [*Sunset*]; one very quickly finds harmonies to harmonize such songs, but [when considering] the simplicity, the character and the nature of the tune, to succeed is not always so easy for me as you perhaps believe; one finds an infinite number of harmonies, but only one is consistent with the genre and the character of the melody.²⁴

Sunset, Beethoven's example of a troublesome melody to harmonize, is Aeolian. The British tradition of modal folk tunes—most commonly, Aeolian, Dorian, and Mixolydian—is well documented,²⁵ yet of all the folk-song melodies Beethoven set, only twenty are modal, and of those, three are Continental rather than British. The rest of the melodies, like nearly all of Beethoven's harmonizations, are unambiguously major or minor. This tonal bias may well have been a consequence of Thomson's aesthetic criteria, as explained in the preface to *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs* quoted earlier.

Of the modal melodies, fifteen are versions of Aeolian, three are Mixolydian, and two are variants of major or minor for which there exists no ready classification. Table 1 presents the heptatonic and hexatonic modes as alterations of tonal scales and keys, which is how they came to be viewed in the nineteenth century.

23. James C. Hadden, *George Thomson, the Friend of Burns* (London: J. C. Nimmo, 1898), p. 298.

24. "[I]l y a des chansons, qui ne reussent pas sans quelque peine, quoiqu'on ce n'entend pas en jouant et aussi en voyant par Exemple comme No. 2, on trouve bien vite des harmonies pour harmoniser des telles Chansons, mais la simplicité, le Caractère la Nature du chant, pour y reussir, ce n'est pas toujours si facile comme vous peut-être croyes de moi, on trouve un Nombre infinie des Harmonies, mais seulement une est Conforme au genre et au Caractère de la Melodie" (Brandenburg, no. 1244 [21 Feb. 1818], IV, 174).

25. See Herman Reichenbach, "The Tonality of English and Gaelic Folksong," *ML* 19 (1938), 268–79; Bertrand H. Bronson, "Folksong and the Modes," *MQ* 32 (1946), 37–49; Cecil J. Sharp, *English Folk Song: Some Conclusions*, rev. Maud Karpeles (Belmont, Ca.: Wadsworth, 1965); and Harold S. Powers and James Cowdery, "Mode, §IV, 2: Modal Scales and Melody Types in Anglo-American Folksong," *Grove Music Online*. Norman Cazden rejects Sharp's modal hexatonic category as simply ornamented pentatonic. See Cazden, "A Simplified Mode Classification for Traditional Anglo-American Song Tunes," *Yearbook of the International Folk Music Council* 3 (1971), 60–61 and 64–65.

Table 1: Modes in a Tonal Context

HEPTATONIC MODES			HEXATONIC MODES ¹	
mode	equivalent scale	key signature	mode	equivalent scale
minor	natural minor with $\sharp\hat{7}$		minor/Aeolian	natural minor with no $\hat{7}$
Phrygian	natural minor with $\flat\hat{2}$	(+1 \flat or -1 \sharp)	Phrygian/Aeolian	natural minor with no $\hat{2}$
Aeolian	natural minor		Aeolian/Dorian	natural minor with no $\hat{6}$
Dorian	natural minor with $\sharp\hat{6}$	(-1 \flat or +1 \sharp)	Dorian/Mixolydian	natural minor with $\sharp\hat{6}$, no $\hat{3}$ or major with $\flat\hat{7}$, no $\hat{3}$
Mixolydian	major with $\flat\hat{7}$	(+1 \sharp or -1 \sharp)	Mixolydian/Ionian	major with no $\hat{7}$
Ionian	major		Ionian/Lydian	major with no $\hat{4}$
Lydian	major with $\sharp\hat{4}$	(-1 \flat or +1 \sharp)		

1. This system is a simplification of one presented in Bronson, "Folksong and the Modes," based in turn on Annie Gilchrist, "Note on the Modal System of Gaelic Tunes," *Journal of the Folk Song Society* 4 (1910–13), 150–53.

The hexatonic modes can be viewed as gapped seven-note scales that have two potential identities because the "missing" scale degrees are undefined. Such dual classifications have also been used for melodies that use two forms of a scale degree.

The two modes listed on the first line, minor and minor/Aeolian, have a different scale structure than the others, which are all rotations of the major scale. None of the modes in the table has a diatonic leading tone except for Ionian, which is equivalent to major, and Lydian, which is rare in this repertoire (as is Phrygian). Thus, against the background of major-minor tonality, triads such as v and $\flat VII$ that feature the subtonic rather than the leading tone can function as expressions of modal harmony. Indeed, these are the only two harmonies that distinguish Aeolian from minor and Mixolydian from major. Other characteristically modal harmonies are the major subdominant in Dorian and the flat supertonic (when not serving as a dominant preparation) in Phrygian.

Table 2 shows the modal melodies Beethoven arranged, categorized by his approach to harmonizing them. This table is an expansion of one presented in Cooper²⁶ that lists modal melodies, double-tonic melodies, and melodies that have irregular endings but are otherwise tonal, which have not been included here.²⁷

26. Cooper, *Beethoven's Folksong Settings*, p.155.

Table 2: Beethoven's Settings of Modal Folk-song Melodies

Title (Origin, Date)	Scale Type	Phrase Endings	Harmonization
TONIC/RELATIVE HARMONIZATION: $\flat\hat{7}, \hat{5}, \hat{3} \rightarrow \hat{5}, \hat{3}, \hat{1}$			
<i>The Monks of Bangor's March</i> ¹ (Welsh, 1809–10)	C Aeolian (minimal $\hat{6}$)	$\hat{2}-\hat{4}, \flat\hat{7}-\hat{5}, \hat{4}, \flat\hat{3}-\hat{1}$	C minor/ $E\flat$ major
<i>They Bid Me Slight My Dermot Dear</i> (Irish, 1809–10)	D Aeolian	$\hat{5}-\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}, \flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}$	D minor/F major
<i>The Morning Air Plays on My Face</i> (Irish, 1809–10)	G minor/Aeolian ($\flat\hat{7}/\flat\hat{7}$, no $\hat{6}$)	$\downarrow\flat\hat{7}-\hat{5}, \hat{3}, \downarrow\flat\hat{7}-\hat{5}, \hat{1}$	G minor/ $B\flat$ major
<i>Oh! Who, My Dear Dermot</i> (Irish, 1812–13)	B Aeolian (minimal $\hat{6}$)	$\downarrow\flat\hat{7}-\hat{5}, \hat{1}, \downarrow\hat{5}-\hat{3}, \hat{1}$	B minor/D major
<i>O Mary Ye's Be Clad in Silk</i> (Scottish, 1814–15)	A Aeolian/Dorian (no $\hat{6}$)	$\downarrow\hat{5}-\flat\hat{7}, \hat{3}, \downarrow\hat{5}-\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}$	A minor/C major
<i>O Soothe Me, My Lyre</i> (Irish, 1816)	G Aeolian	$\downarrow\flat\hat{7}-\downarrow\hat{5}, \hat{5}-\hat{1}, \hat{5}-\hat{3}, \hat{5}, \hat{1}$	G minor/ $B\flat$ major
<i>The Highland Watch</i> (Scottish, 1816–17)	G Aeolian/no upper $\hat{6}$	$\downarrow\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}, \downarrow\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}, \downarrow\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}$	G minor/ $B\flat$ major
SUBTONIC SEQUENCE			
<i>Sir Johnie Cope</i> (Scottish, 1817)	G Aeolian (minimal $\hat{6}$)	$\hat{5}-\hat{1}, \hat{2}, \flat\hat{7}-\hat{2}, \hat{1}, \flat\hat{7}, \hat{2}, \hat{2}, \hat{1}$	G minor/ $B\flat$ major
<i>Highlander's Lament</i> (Scottish, 1820)	E Aeolian/Dorian (no $\hat{6}$)	$\downarrow\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}, \downarrow\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}$	E minor/G major
MEDIANT SEQUENCE			
<i>Sunset</i> (Scottish, 1818)	A Aeolian (minimal $\hat{6}$)	$\hat{2}, \hat{1}, \hat{5}, \hat{1}$	A minor/C major
“WRONG-KEY” HARMONIZATION:			
SUBDOMINANT			
<i>The Old Strain</i> (Welsh, 1809–10)	D Mixolydian	$\hat{1}, \hat{2}, \hat{1}$	G major/B minor
<i>Judy, Lovely, Matchless Creature</i> (Irish, 1813)	F major with $\flat\hat{7}/\flat\hat{7}$, no $\hat{3}$	$\downarrow\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}, \downarrow\flat\hat{7}-\hat{5}, \hat{1}$	$B\flat$ major/F major
<i>Vo lesochke komarochkor</i> , ² (Russian, 1816)	G Mixolydian	$\hat{4}-\hat{8}-\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}$	C major
OTHER			
<i>Highland Harry</i> (Scottish, 1814–15)	E Aeolian	$\downarrow\flat\hat{7}-\downarrow\hat{2}, \hat{1}, \downarrow\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}$	D major
<i>Poszła baba po popiół</i> (Polish, 1816)	B Phrygian/Aeolian ($\flat\hat{2}/\flat\hat{2}$)	$\hat{1}, \hat{1}, \hat{6}-\hat{4}, \hat{1}$	G major/G Lydian
LIMITED-RANGE HARMONIZATION: $\hat{1} \hat{2} \hat{3} \hat{4} \hat{5}$			
<i>Lilla Carl: Väggsisa</i> (Swedish, 1816–17)	A minor/no $\hat{6}$, no $\hat{7}$	$\hat{1}, \hat{1}, \hat{2}, \hat{1}$	A minor/no $\hat{6}$, no $\hat{7}$
MODAL HARMONIZATION			
<i>Lament for Owen Roe O'Neill</i> (Irish, 1810)	G Aeolian/Dorian ($\flat\hat{6}/\hat{6}$)	$\downarrow\flat\hat{7}-\hat{5}, \hat{1}, \downarrow\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}$	G Dorian/F major
<i>The Return to Ulster</i> (Irish, 1810)	F minor/Aeolian ($\flat\hat{7}/\hat{7}$)	$\downarrow\flat\hat{7}, \hat{1}, \hat{5}, \hat{1}$	F Aeolian
<i>Save Me from the Grave and Wise</i> (Irish, 1812–13)	F Mixolydian/no $\hat{6}$	$\hat{4}-\hat{2}, \hat{4}-\hat{2}, \hat{4}-\hat{2}$	F Mixolydian
<i>Come Fill, Fill, My Good Fellow</i> (Irish, ³ 1817)	G Aeolian/Dorian (no $\hat{6}$)	$\hat{1}, \hat{1}, \hat{1}$	G Aeolian

1. This is a retranslation of the Welsh title *Ymdaith Mwnge* or *Ymdaith y Mwnge*, which was translated in the 1780s from the original English title, *General Monck's March*. Prys Morgan, “From a Death to a View: the Hunt for the Welsh Past in the Romantic Period,” in *The Invention of Tradition*, ed. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1983), p.78.

2. First published under the German title “Im Walde sind viele Mücklein geboren” in Beethoven, *Neues Volksliederheft: 23 tiroler, schweizer, schwedische, spanische, und andere Volksweisen*, ed. George Schünemann (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1941).

3. Originally published by Thomson as Scottish.

The songs are in chronological order within each category. The majority of the tunes consist of four symmetrical four-measure phrases, the most common schemes being AABA and ABCB. The single or paired numbers with downward arrows in the third column refer to scale degrees below the tonic.

Beethoven harmonized all of the Aeolian-based melodies in the tonic/relative category by alternating between a pair of relative keys; in each case the first key listed is the governing tonic. In the first subcategory, most of the melodies cadence on lowered $\hat{7}$ in conjunction with $\hat{5}$ or $\hat{3}$, which strongly suggests $\hat{5}$, $\hat{3}$, and $\hat{1}$ in the key of the relative major. Cecil Sharp noted that “a pathetic rise up to the minor seventh of the scale through the fifth” was characteristic of English folk airs,²⁸ and he also commented on the tendency of contemporary musicians to harmonize Aeolian melodies partly in the relative major.²⁹ In his *Origins of the Popular Style*, Peter van der Merwe describes the “equally pathetic” descent from the seventh to the fifth as standard in folk music³⁰ and identifies a ladder of thirds extending up to the seventh above the tonic and down to a third below as the underlying framework of this melody type.³¹

In the second tonic/relative subcategory, subtonic sequence, the two Scottish melodies feature a gesture characteristic of that folk tradition: a melodic motive sequenced down a whole step, which Norman Cazden has called “subtonic juncture.”³² Songs based on this pattern are sometimes referred to as double-tonic tunes, although this designation has also been used for the first tonic/relative type, which seems more appropriate since the term suggests oscillation between two keys rather than two chords. Beethoven recognized the harmonic implications of the melodic sequence in these songs, but in both cases treated the subtonic as V/III. *Sunset*, the melody that Beethoven found problematic, is in a subcategory by itself (mediant sequence) and is discussed below.

In the settings in the second category, “wrong-key” harmonizations, Beethoven

27. Every scale degree except $\hat{4}$ can be found as a final: $\hat{2}$ in *Save Me from the Grave and Wise* (WoO 154/8), *The Maid of Isla* (op.108/4), and *From Garyone* (WoO 152/22 and 154/7); $\hat{3}$ in *Dim, Dim Is My Eye* (op.108/6); $\hat{5}$ in *Paddy O'Rafferty* (WoO 153/14) and *Sympathy* (op.108/10); $\hat{6}$ in *O Soothe Me, My Lyre* (WoO 153/7); and $\hat{7}$ in *Bonny Laddie* (op.108/7).

28. Sharp, *English Folk Song: Some Conclusions*, p.84.

29. *Ibid.*, p.48.

30. Peter Van der Merwe, *Origins of the Popular Style: The Antecedents of Twentieth-Century Popular Music* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989), p.173.

31. *Ibid.*, pp.124–25.

32. Cazden, “A Simplified Mode Classification for Traditional Anglo-American Song Tunes,” pp.65–66.

minimized the modal implications of the melodies by reassigning the tonic.³³ Three are Mixolydian melodies set in the key of the subdominant; two of these—*The Old Strain* and *Vò lesochke komarochkov*—have clear subdominant biases that likely inspired their harmonizations. Two melodies with flexible scale degrees are in the “wrong-key” category: *Judy, Lovely, Matchless Creature*, with $\flat\hat{7}/\sharp\hat{7}$ (ex.2), and *Poszła baba po popiół* (ex.11), with $\flat\hat{2}/\sharp\hat{2}$. Both are recast so that the flexible scale degree is $\hat{4}$, but the occurrences of $\sharp\hat{4}$ function as leading tones to $\hat{5}$, rather than creating a Lydian inflection (which is also the case in the chorale sections of the *Heiliger Dankgesang* from op.132, although a Lydian interpretation of this work is more plausible because of the absence of the perfect fourth).

The third category contains a lone setting in which both melody and harmony are confined to scale degrees $\hat{1}$ through $\hat{5}$, save for a single brief instance of lowered $\hat{6}$ in the introduction. Five settings in the table are more typically hexatonic, comprising Aeolian or Mixolydian scales with no sixth degree: *The Morning Air Plays on My Face* (ex.3), *O Mary Ye’s Be Clad in Silk* (not shown), *Highlander’s Lament* (ex.9), *Save Me from the Grave and Wise* (ex.16), and *Come Fill, Fill, My Good Fellow* (ex.17). Because the sixth degree is not defined, the four minor-mode melodies are classified as “Aeolian/Dorian” in the table. There is no dual categorization for the hexatonic melody of *Save Me from the Grave and Wise*, which is Mixolydian with no sixth degree, because the two possibilities, Mixolydian and Mixolydian $\flat\hat{6}$, do not belong to the same scale type. Mixolydian is the fifth mode of major, while Mixolydian $\flat\hat{6}$ is the fifth mode of melodic minor. Since none of Beethoven’s harmonizations are hexatonic, these melodies have not been placed into a separate group. The final category lists four settings of Irish melodies that feature distinctive modal-marker harmonies, such as the subtonic and minor dominant.³⁴

Tonic/Relative Harmonizations

The opening phrases of the melodies in the tonic/relative category are the most consistently modally inflected, often cadencing prominently on lowered $\hat{7}$, which

33. The earliest example of a “wrong-key” harmonization in Beethoven’s music is the well-known *thème russe* from the first “Rasumovsky” String Quartet, op.59, no.1, composed in 1806, before he began work on the folk-song settings. The original folk melody is in D Aeolian with an emphasis on the lowered seventh degree; Beethoven recast it tonally by setting it in the relative key of F major.

34. Petra Weber-Bockholdt asserts that only two settings feature a marked use of the subtonic: *Lament for Owen Roe O’Neill* and *Save Me from the Grave and Wise* (Weber-Bockholdt, *Beethovens Bearbeitung britischer Lieder*, p.31); however, *Come Fill, Fill, My Good Fellow*, which she describes as a double-tonic melody (p.32), also fits this description.

9

Ju - dy, love - ly, match - less crea - ture, beau - ty shines thro' ev' - ry fea - ture,

Bb: I (#ii°2 I) F: V I V₄/₃

17

like you light, the pride of na - ture, thro' the morn - ing dew.

I Bb: #ii°2 I (ii) #ii°2 I V₄/₃ F: ii

25

Come, then, to your Pat - rick's dwell - ing, all a - round the buds are swell - ing,

I Eb: V7/V V₄/₃ I IV I6 F: vii°6 V₄/₃

33

ev' - ry lit - tle lin - net's tell - ing, 'tis the time to woo.

I Bb: #ii°2 I IV₆/₄ #ii°2 I V₄/₃ I (V6 I)

Example 2: Beethoven,
*Judy, Lovely, Matchless Crea-
 ture* (WoO 153/19, 1813),
 mm.9-40.

5

The morn-ing air plays on my face, and through the grey mist peer - ing,

g: i VI V i VI V III

Example 3: Beethoven, *The Morning Air Plays on My Face* (WoO 152/4), mm.5–8.

Beethoven as a rule harmonized by tonicizing the mediant.³⁵ At least two of the theoretical treatises that Beethoven owned, Kirnberger's *Die Kunst des Reinen Satzes* (1779) and Knecht's *Vollständige Orgelschule* (1798), give tables for modal chorale harmonizations in which the second cadence listed for the Aeolian mode—after the tonic—is on the mediant;³⁶ however, this is also extremely typical of tonal works in minor keys. The implied alternation of a pair of relative keys can be seen in ex.4, the opening phrase of *Oh! Who, My Dear Dermot*.³⁷

6

Oh! who, my dear Der - mot, has dar'd to de - ceive thee, And what's

b: V (V7) i V6 i VI (IV/III) V/III III (V7) i

Example 4: Beethoven, *Oh! Who, My Dear Dermot* (WoO 154/5, 1812–13), mm.6–10.

35. William Daune y remarked upon the tonic/relative key implications of these melodies: “Another prevailing course of modulation to be noticed in the Scottish [*sic*] melodies is, that of alternation of the major key, and its relative minor; the melody moving to and from these keys to the exclusion of every other, and this, too, not unfrequently, at regular distances” (William Daune y, *Ancient Scottish Melodies* [Edinburgh: Bannatyne Club, 1838], p.319).

36. Kirnberger, *The Art of Strict Musical Composition*, trans. David Beach and Jurgen Thym (New Haven: Yale UP, 1982), p.330; and Knecht, *Vollständige Orgelschule für Anfänger und Geübtere* (Leipzig: Breitkopf, 1795–98), III, pp.8–19 and 44–55.

37. Tune: *Crooghan a Venee*; new text by William Smyth.

In m.10, the melodic cadence $\flat\hat{7}-\hat{5}$ is treated as $\hat{5}-\hat{3}$ and harmonized straightforwardly by dominant and tonic in the key of the mediant, prepared by G major in m.9, which functions in retrospect as IV/III. A more emphatically modal progression might employ the minor dominant in m.10. A more tonal one might employ the major dominant on beat 2, but presumably Beethoven wanted to avoid a cross-relation between $A\flat$ in the melody and $A\sharp$ in a lower voice. Instead, he placed a dominant-seventh chord with no third at the end of the measure, setting up the tonic beginning of the next phrase. Beethoven's harmonic treatment of *The Morning Air Plays on My Face* (WoO 152/4) is similar, but the regressive cross-relation ($F\sharp$ to $F\flat$) is in the melody, and the move to the mediant is direct and unprepared by its dominant (see ex.3).

The first phrase of *They Bid Me Slight My Dermot Dear* (ex.5) ends on $\flat\hat{7}-\hat{5}-\flat\hat{7}$ above the tonic, which is less common in these songs than endings on $\flat\hat{7}-\hat{5}$ below. As in the preceding example, the subtonic functions as V/III, here elaborated by a neighboring $III\frac{6}{4}$ at the end of m.9; thus $\flat\hat{7}-\hat{5}-\flat\hat{7}$ is recast as $\hat{5}-\hat{3}-\hat{5}$ in the relative major. The dominant in m.10 is not resolved, however, and the mediant is not heard as tonic until the third phrase of the AABA form. The second A phrase begins like the first except that the harmony in m.12 is $i\frac{6}{4}$, which functions analogously to $III\frac{6}{4}$ in m.9, as a neighboring expansion of the dominant.

They bid me slight my Dermot dear, for he's of low degree, and

I my lady's maid am here, and of the quality.

d: V i V/III III $\frac{6}{4}$ V/III iv

V i $\frac{6}{4}$ V7 i

Example 5: Beethoven, *They Bid Me Slight My Dermot Dear* (WoO 152/18, 1809–10), mm.7–14.

Example 6 shows the beginning of *Sunset*,³⁸ Beethoven's own illustration of a troublesome melody to harmonize, possibly because the melodic gesture $\flat\hat{7}-\hat{5}$ and its accompanying tonicization of the mediant occur at the midpoint rather than the end of the phrase. The move to V/III and concurrent shift in the pedal point occur on beat 4 of m.13. Changing on the following downbeat would create a more normative harmonic rhythm, but would render the melody dissonant on both beats. The first phrase ends typically, on the subtonic functioning as V/III, but not dictated in this case by $\flat\hat{7}$ in the melody. Beethoven could equally well have harmonized scale degrees $\hat{4}$ and $\hat{2}$ in m.16 more tonally, with ii-V, IV-V, or V⁷, as he did at the analogous point in *The Monks of Bangor's March* (see ex.7). Because the second half of the phrase replicates the rhythm and contour of the first half beginning a third higher, *Sunset* is categorized as a mediant sequence.

All of Beethoven's tonic/relative harmonizations are constructed in similar manner: most occurrences of lowered $\hat{7}$ are set with the tonic or dominant of III. The settings in this category are liberally sprinkled with $\frac{6}{4}$ chords, which Beethoven used as a primitivist signifier. Many of these function traditionally, as elaborations of the dominant, as in ex.5, or as tonic chords over a dominant pedal, as in ex.6, but some are more independent, as in ex.8a, Beethoven's setting of *The Highland Watch*, composed in 1816–17.³⁹ Here, in the reverse of the typical $\hat{5}-\hat{6}-\hat{5}$ neighbor figure, root-position VI serves as an upper-neighbor chord to $i\frac{6}{4}$, which is treated as a stable harmony.

13

The sun up-on the Weird-law hill in Ett - rick's vale is sink - ing sweet,

a: i V/III III6
4 V7/III

Example 6: Beethoven, *Sunset*
(op.108/2, 1818), mm.13–16.

38. Tune: *Lord Balgonie's Favorite*; new text by Walter Scott.

39. New text by James Hogg.

When the hea - then trum - pet's clang Round be - lea - guer'd Ches-ter rang, -

c: i V i V/III III V/III i V7

Example 7: Beethoven, *The Monks of Bangor's March* (WoO 155/2), mm. 3–6.

Two years later, Beethoven revised this setting as the theme for no. 10 of the Folk-song Variations for Piano and Flute, op. 107, one of two sets of folk-song variations that Beethoven composed for Thomson (the other is op. 105). The first four measures of the theme are shown in ex. 8b. The melody and most of the dotted rhythms are unchanged, but the harmony has been classicized, now consisting largely of root-position tonic and dominant triads.

Example 8a: Beethoven, *The Highland Watch* (op. 108/22, 1816–17), mm. 1–4.

Old Sco-tia, wake thy moun-tain strain, in all its wil-dest splen - dours!

g: (V) $i6_4$ VI $i6_4$ VI $i6_4$ VI $i6_4$ VI III

Example 8b: Beethoven, Folk-song Variations, “The Highland Watch” (op. 107/10, 1818–19), mm. 1–4.

Old Sco-tia, wake thy moun-tain strain, in all its wil-dest splen - dours!

g: i (V) i V i VI III

Tonic/Relative vs. “Wrong-key” Harmonizations:

Highlander’s Lament (*WoO 157/9*) and Highland Harry (*WoO 156/6*)

Two settings from the same tune family, *Highlander’s Lament* and *Highland Harry*, are shown in exs.9 and 10.⁴⁰ Beethoven set *Highland Harry* in 1814–15; in 1820 Thomson sent him the melody of *Highlander’s Lament*, describing it as a more correct version.⁴¹ Both forms of the tune begin and end in E minor but alternately outline D major at phrase endings. Beethoven tried out both possibilities as tonic: *Highlander’s Lament*, in the tonic/relative category, is set in E minor with D major functioning as V/III, while *Highland Harry*, in the “wrong-key” category, is set in D major, with a dominant pedal throughout and the melody ending on $\hat{2}$.⁴² The first verse of *Highlander’s Lament* is shown in ex.9.⁴³

The melodic-motivic structure of *Highlander’s Lament* is ABCB, but Beethoven adopted the harmonic paradigm of the AABA songs, supporting the strong arrival on lowered $\hat{7}$ in m.11 with mediant harmony. This setting conforms to the tonic/relative harmonic scheme even when the melody seems to indicate otherwise. In mm.18–19, $\hat{1}-\hat{5}-\hat{1}$ in the melody imply the harmonies i–V–i in E minor, but Beethoven set them instead with I–V–I in C major, which functions at the middleground level as a dominant preparation in G major. Likewise, the scalar descending fifth in m.21 strongly suggests an arrival on the local dominant, D major, preceded by a measure of G major. Beethoven did just the reverse, harmonizing m.20 with D major and placing the scalar figure and its echo over the local tonic, G. Such small-scale departures from an expected harmonic progression are a conscious component of Beethoven’s folk style.

The melody of the earlier setting, *Highland Harry* (ex.10),⁴⁴ features a clearer instance of subtonic juncture in mm.8–11. The triadic motive sequenced down a whole step invites a tonic–subtonic harmonization; Beethoven’s arrangement,

40. For another discussion of these two settings, see Weber-Bockholdt, *Beethovens Bearbeitungen britischer Lieder*, pp.87–95.

41. Haydn had already arranged yet another version of this melody for Thomson as *The Old Highland Laddie* in 1801 (Hob.31a/248). This variant of the tune more clearly outlines D major, which is the key of Haydn’s setting.

42. Although the later setting is in the more plausible key, Thomson published only the earlier, *Highland Harry*, but not until 1839.

43. Text by Robert Burns. The introduction and postlude have been omitted.

44. The uppermost line is the voice part. The text, by Robert Burns, was written to fit the variant later set as *Highlander’s Lament*. Thomson left it to the singer to adjust the rhythms to the text in this version.

8

My Har-ry was a gal-lant gay, fu' state-ly strade he on the plain; But

13

now he's ban-ish'd far a-wa', I'll ne-ver see him back a-gain.

18

O, for him back a-gain, O, for him back a - gain, I wad gie a' Knock-

24

- has-pie's land for High-land Har - ry back a-gain!

e: V7 i VI VI6 4 G: I ii6 V I (V6 5 I)

I IV I e: ii°6 V V7 i (V7 i) VI

G: IV V7/VI VI V7/IV IV V6 I (V I) I

IV e: I bVII V V7 i

Example 9: Beethoven, *High-lander's Lament* (WoO 157/9, 1820), mm.8–26.

8
My Harry was a gal-lant gay, fu' state-ly strade he on the plain; But now he's ban-ish'd

D: V9 16 4 V9

13
far a-wa', I'll ne-ver see him back again. O, for him back a-gain, *sfz*

16 4 (vi^o/V) 16 4 V (ii6) (vi^o6/ii ii6)

18
sfz O, for him back a-gain, I *sfz* wad gie a' Knock has-pie's land for High-land Har-ry

16 4 (c^o7) 16 4 (ii6) ii6 V7 16 4 (vi^o7/V)

23
back again!

V V7 16 4 (vi^o7/V) (V) V 16 4 16 4

29
V 16 4 V 16 4 V 16 4 V (I) ii6 V7 1

Example 10: Beethoven,
Highland Harry (WoO 156/6,
1814–15), mm.8–37.

however, constitutes a more procrustean attempt to fit the Aeolian melody into the confines of a tonic-dominant structure. This setting comprises one of the most extensive uses of pedal point: the entire song, including the prelude (not shown) and excepting only the final six measures of the postlude, is set over a dominant pedal. Where the melody outlines D major, it is indeed harmonized with D major, but never as a stable tonic because of the pedal point. Where the melody outlines E minor, it is set with dominant harmony, most often in the form of an A⁹ chord, and this is how each verse ends: on scale degree $\hat{2}$ supported by the dominant. In an extreme case of delayed resolution, a root-position tonic is reached only in the brief postlude after the third verse (mm. 32ff.), through a conventional ii⁶–V⁷–I cadence that is the first departure from the dominant pedal. Cooper has identified this setting as the most likely basis of a comment in Beethoven's *Tagebuch* from late 1814: "The Scottish songs show how unconstrainedly the most unorganized melody can be treated through harmony."⁴⁵

The inclusion of D \sharp in relatively close proximity to D \natural (mm. 17–18 and 20–22) was likely a factor in Thomson's assessment of the diatonic melody of *Highlander's Lament* as the more authentic version. We can infer from the small-scale chromaticisms, ornamental passing and neighboring tones, and the lack of rests that the source for *Highland Harry* was an instrumental version; the tune itself is a traditional strathspey, a slow type of reel.⁴⁶ The effect of D \sharp in mm. 16–17 and 20–21 is to imply i–V and V–i respectively in E minor, yet the local function of these measures in Beethoven's harmonization is more ambiguous. Because the third above the bass is conspicuously absent, mm. 16–17 and 20 have been labeled as ii⁶ over dominant pedal, rather than V⁹. On the downbeat of m. 17 D \sharp is part of a lower-neighbor vii^o triad, whereas at the end of m. 20 it is a chromatic lower-neighbor note.

The relationship of the keys of these two settings is not as surprising as it might at first seem, since the melody of *Highlander's Lament* is E Aeolian/Dorian hexatonic, and E Dorian is the second mode of D major (and conversely, D major is the seventh mode of E Dorian). The ending of *Highland Harry* is not unique among the folk-song settings—Beethoven had already set at least two circular melodies ending on the second degree, *Save Me from the Grave and Wise* (1812–13, ex. 16)

45. "Die Schottischen Lieder zeigen als ungesungen die unordentlichste Melodie vermöge die Harmonie behandelt werden kann" (Maynard Solomon, "Beethoven's *Tagebuch* of 1812–1818," in BS III, 227).

46. Marianne Bröcker describes these ornaments as characteristic of bagpipe music (Bröcker, "Die Bearbeitungen schottischer und irischer Volkslieder von Ludwig van Beethoven," p. 78), although the strathspey originated as a dance played on the fiddle.

and *From Garyone* (earlier setting, 1811–12). Because of its length, slow tempo, and verse-chorus structure, however, *Highland Harry* is less convincing than these others as a circular tune.

Of the two settings, the simpler and more diatonic *Highlander's Lament* is the more stylistically apposite. A similar relationship exists between a handful of other duplicate settings by Beethoven, in which the earlier version features a more elaborate piano part and a higher degree of chromaticism. While the later settings, which are plainer and more idiomatic, seem to demonstrate Beethoven's compositional process of constant refinement, in actuality these simplifications are a concession to Thomson's insistently repeated requests for easier accompaniments.

“Wrong-key” Harmonization:

Poszta baba po popiół (WoO 158a/10)

In 1815 Thomson decided to publish a volume of continental folk songs, but managed to collect only three. At his request, Beethoven managed to find twenty-six others,⁴⁷ as well as a few British ones, in more cosmopolitan Vienna—although not without some difficulty. Beethoven wanted the settings to be published, with accompanying prose translations, in their original languages: Italian, Danish, Polish, Portuguese, Russian, Swedish, Spanish, Hungarian, French, and German.⁴⁸ Thomson was certain that this format would be unmarketable in Britain, and he attempted to commission new English texts for the songs, but never succeeded. Eventually he sold twenty-four of the settings to the London firm Paine & Hopkins, who did not publish them either. Many of these arrangements were not printed at all until 1941.⁴⁹

47. Brandenburg, no. 874 (1 Jan. 1816), III, p. 203.

48. French: *Non, non, Colette* (WoO 158c/2); Italian/Venetian: *La gondoletta* (WoO 157/12) and *Da brava, Catina* (WoO 158a/23); Spanish: *Una paloma blanca, Como la mariposa*, and *Tiranilla Española* (WoO 158a/19–21); Portuguese: *Yo no quiero embarcarme* and *Seus lindos olhos* (WoO 158a/11–12); Swedish: *Lilla Carl* (WoO 158a/17); Danish: *Ridder Stigs Runer* (WoO 158a/1); Hungarian: *Édes kinos emlékezet* (WoO 158a/22); Russian: *Vó lesochke komarochkov; Akh, rechenki, rechenki*; and *Kak poshli nashi podruzhki* (WoO 158a/13–15); and Polish: *Oj, oj, upilem* and *Poszta baba po popiół* (WoO 158a/9–10). The remaining Continental settings are a Sicilian song with a Latin text (*O Sanctissima*, WoO 157/4), several folk songs in German (four Austrian, five Tyrolean, one Ukrainian, and one putatively Swiss), and an uncatalogued French song (*Air Français*) with no text.

49. The majority of the Continental settings were published in Beethoven, *Neues Volksliederheft: 23 tiroler, schweizer, schwedische, spanische, und andere Volksweisen*, ed. George Schünemann (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1941).

In a few Continental settings, Beethoven depicted a perceived national character through instrumental effects. The piano accompaniments of the Spanish *Una paloma blanca* and the Portuguese *Yo no quiero embarcarme* feature rolled chords that imitate a strummed guitar, while both of the Polish settings include raised $\hat{4}$ and a drone fifth—elements that, in conjunction with other national associations, sound characteristically Polish.⁵⁰

Poszła baba po popiół (ex. 11)⁵¹ is a typical oberek,⁵² a fast dance in triple meter, in a concise eight-measure AABA form. Narrow-range melodies are very common in Polish music;⁵³ in this case, every measure is confined to a minor third, and with the exception of mm. 14–15, either begins or ends on the pitch B. Because of the directionally inflected second degree (C \sharp /C \sharp), a convincing Phrygian-inflected accompaniment would be challenging to compose. Beethoven chose instead to set the melody in a Lydian-inflected G major with a directional fourth degree. He was undoubtedly conscious of the Polish associations of the sharpened fourth degree, since he incorporated it into his other Polish setting, *Oj, oj, upilem* (WoO 158a/9), a typical *krakowiak*⁵⁴ in fast duple meter, which is also in G major but not modally inflected (see ex. 12).⁵⁵ With the tonic reassigned, the melody of *Poszła baba po popiół* begins and ends on $\hat{3}$ and does not state the lower tonic at any point, although the upper tonic briefly appears twice (m. 14). Beethoven's postlude (not

50. As Dahlhaus observed: "Aesthetically it is perfectly legitimate to call bagpipe drones and sharpened fourths typically Polish when they occur in Chopin and typically Norwegian when they occur in Grieg . . . [they represent] something which is common to national music generally and yet is felt to be specifically national in the consciousness of the individual nations" (Dahlhaus, *Between Romanticism and Modernism*, p. 95). Zofia Lissa expresses astonishment at the authentically Polish effect of the Lydian fourth and the drone fifth in the bass. See Lissa, "Bearbeitungen polnischer volkslieder von Beethoven," *Beethoven-Kongressbericht Berlin 1970* (Berlin: Verlag Neue Musik, 1971), p. 449.

51. The introduction and postlude have been omitted. Barry Cooper's translation of the text is: The old woman wanted to fetch some ashes / The Devil came and drowned her; / No more old woman, no more ashes / All that was left of her were two smoked hams. (Beethoven *Volkslied-Bearbeitungen*, Deutsche Grammophon *Complete Beethoven Edition*, vol. 17 liner notes, p. 209.)

52. Lissa, "Bearbeitungen polnischer volkslieder von Beethoven," p. 450.

53. Jan Stęszewski, "Poland," §II, 4: "Traditional Music: General Characteristics," *Grove Music Online*.

54. Lissa, "Bearbeitungen polnischer volkslieder von Beethoven," p. 450.

55. The second half of the first stanza is shown in this example. A full translation by Barry Cooper is: Oh dear, I got drunk at the inn / And slept it off in the hallway, / And the dirty dogs / Have stolen my basket! / Oh, you dirty rats, / Give me back my basket! / Where am I supposed to put the barley / So that I can buy liquor again? (Beethoven *Volkslied-Bearbeitungen*, Deutsche Grammophon *Complete Beethoven Edition*, vol. 17, liner notes, p. 225.)

Example 11: Beethoven,
Poszła baba po popiół (WoO
 158a/10, 1816), mm.9–16.

The musical score for Example 11 consists of two systems. The first system covers measures 9-12, and the second system covers measures 13-16. The vocal line is in G major, and the piano accompaniment is in G major. The lyrics are in Polish.

System 1 (Measures 9-12):

Measures 9-12: Po-szła ba - ba po po-piół i dia - bel je u - to - pil.

Chord progression for measures 9-12: G: I (#iv°6 I) ii6 V7 I I (#iv°7 I) ii6₅ V7 I

System 2 (Measures 13-16):

Measures 13-16: Ni po - pio-lu, ni ba - by, ty-lko z ba-by dwa sza-by.

Chord progression for measures 13-16: I (IV) I (V7 I)

shown) echoes this structure by ascending to the upper tonic rather than descending to the lower one.

Whereas *Highland Harry* is set almost entirely over dominant pedal, *Poszła baba po popiół* is set almost entirely over tonic pedal. G is established as the tonic from m.3 (not shown) by the persistent fifth G–D, which evokes a fiddle drone,⁵⁶ and reinforced with conventional bass progressions in mm.10 and 12. The C# in the melody could have been supported with V/V, but are harmonized instead with less tonally directed structures, neighboring common-tone diminished chords over a tonic pedal. In m.10 the sudden clash of a leap to D in the bass against a leap to the

56. A characteristic texture in Polish folk music for the fiddle is a melody played on the upper two strings, A and E, combined with a drone played on the lower two strings, G and D. Bagpipe drones are also common, but are generally pitched on E \flat , B \flat , or F (Stęszewski, “Poland,” §II, 5: “Traditional Music: Instruments,” *Grove Music Online*). While Beethoven’s other Polish setting, *Oj, oj, upilem*, does not feature a repeating drone fifth, the bass line is built similarly around the fifth G–D.

17

a zyd-ki psia-ju - chy a zud-ki psia-ju - chy ko-bial-ke mi wie-ni. ko-bial-ke mi wie-ni.

G: I V I6 V4 3 I V I6 V4 3 I I6 IV V vi I6 4 I6 4 IV V I

Example 12: Beethoven, *Oj, oj, upilem* (WoO 158a/9), mm. 17–24.

unprepared seventh $C\sharp$ in the melody adds to the deliberately unpolished quality of the setting. The pattern of fluctuation between $C\sharp$ and $C\flat$ is continued in the B section (mm. 13–14): the melody in m. 14 is accompanied with $C\flat$, even though $C\sharp$ would have reinforced the Lydian effect. Thus, as in most of the other AABA settings, the middle section of *Poszła baba po popiół* is more tonally grounded than the modally inflected outer sections.

Limited-range Harmonization:

Lilla Carl (*Vaggvisa*, WoO 158a/17)

A handful of Beethoven's folk-song settings are distinctive characterizations without national associations: for example, the horn-calls in the hunting songs *Sion the Son of Evan* and *Waken Lords and Ladies Gay* (WoO 155/1 and 155/12) and the pizzicato string parts of *O Soothe Me My Lyre* (WoO 153/7). Another striking portrayal is *Lilla Carl* (ex. 13),⁵⁷ a Swedish lullaby or *vaggvisa*, for which Beethoven created a rocking left-hand part and added a long hypnotic coda with a built-in *rallentando* that depicts the rocking slowing to a stop.

57. Only the first verse is included in the musical example; the text underlay is as originally published. A full translation by Carl Michael Bellman is: Little Carl, sleep softly in peace, / You will have time enough to be awake, / Time enough to see our evil days / And taste their gall. / This world is an island of sorrow, / Scarcely have we drawn breath than we have to die / And remain behind as dust. Thus it is with our life's span, / And thus the years disappear, / We have only just drawn breath, deeply and gladly, / And we're lying on the bier. / Little Charles, you shall think on this, / When you see the little flowers / Which adorn the Spring. (Beethoven *Volkslied-Bearbeitungen*, Deutsche Grammophon *Complete Beethoven Edition*, vol. 17, liner notes, pp. 223–25.)

The image displays a musical score for 'Lilla Carl' by Beethoven, featuring piano and vocal parts. The score is divided into five systems, each with a system number (1, 6, 11, 17, 23) at the beginning. The piano part is in the left hand, and the vocal part is in the right hand. The lyrics are in Swedish. The score includes various musical notations such as dynamics (*p*, *pp*), articulation (*tr*), and performance instructions (*dim.*, *ritard.*). Harmonic analysis is provided below the piano part, indicating chords and their functions (e.g., (V7), i, i6/4).

System 1: Measures 1-5. Dynamics: *p*. Articulation: *tr*. Lyrics: Lil - la Carl, sov tids nog se vår. Harmonic analysis: a: i (V) (i) i.

System 2: Measures 6-10. Lyrics: sött i frid, on-da tid och du får tids nog - va - ka, Värld-en är en sor-ge - ö, hen - nes gal - la sma - ka. Harmonic analysis: (V7) i V7 i i V.

System 3: Measures 11-16. Lyrics: bäst man an-das, skall man dö och bli mull till - ba - ka. *dim.* Harmonic analysis: i V i V i (V7) i (V7) i (V7) i.

System 4: Measures 17-22. Harmonic analysis: (V7) i (V7) i (V7) i6/4 (V7) i6/4 (V7) i6/4 (V7) i6/4.

System 5: Measures 23-27. Dynamics: *pp*, *ritard.* Harmonic analysis: (V7) i (V7) i (V7) i (V7) i.

Example 13: Beethoven, *Lilla Carl* (WoO 158a/17, 1816–17).

Apart from a single brief instance of scale degree $\hat{6}$ in the prelude (m.3), the setting of *Lilla Carl* employs only $\hat{1}$ through $\hat{5}$. Minor hexatonic with no sixth degree is particularly characteristic of older Swedish folk songs,⁵⁸ and the scale of *Lilla Carl* can be considered a subset of this scale: a minor pentatonic scale—in the sense that it comprises only five notes—with no sixth or seventh degree. In contrast to the familiar gapped-third anhemitonic pentatonic scale (built around the intervallic pattern m3–M2–M2–m3–M2) this is a gapped-fourth pentatonic scale (M2–m2–M2–M2–P4).

This melodic framework is not entirely atypical of the genre: the A sections of *Småvisa*, a Swedish children's song, and the American lullaby *All the Pretty Horses*, are structurally and motivically very similar. Beethoven's adoption of the same limitation in his accompaniment, however, is quite striking. Complete dominant and subdominant triads are ruled out, but through repeated melodic movements of $\hat{4}$ – $\hat{3}$ and $\hat{2}$ – $\hat{1}$, a tempered sense of dominant–tonic motion is created, even without the leading tone. These movements are paralleled on a smaller scale by $\hat{1}$ – $\hat{5}$ – $\hat{1}$ and $\hat{5}$ – $\hat{1}$ – $\hat{5}$ in the left-hand rocking figure, which may derive from the opening ascending-fifth gesture, and on a larger scale by the tonic and dominant pedals created by the lowest notes of the same figure.

A more definitively modal setting is *Lament for Owen Roe O'Neill* (ex.14).⁵⁹ Thomson published this song without text or attribution, but the composer is now known to be the Irish harper Turlough Carolan (1670–1738).⁶⁰ The tune is G Aeolian/Dorian, with raised $\hat{6}$ for the first ten measures (mm.3–12), lowered $\hat{6}$ for the next three (mm.13–15), no $\hat{6}$ for the last three (mm.16–18), and an emphasis on lowered $\hat{7}$ throughout.⁶¹ Beethoven's accompaniment fluctuates between G Dorian and G minor, with shifts to F major in mm.8–10 and 14–17. The first harmonic movement is an emphatic arrival on the subtonic, F (m.4), approached

58. Margareta Jersild and Märta Ramston, "Sweden," §II, 3: "Traditional Music: Vocal Traditions," *Grove Music Online*.

59. The highest notes with upward stems are the melody. Notes with downward stems, such as those at the end of mm.2 and 4, are part of the accompaniment, not the melody.

60. Turlough Carolan, *The Complete Works of O'Carolan: Irish Harper & Composer* (2nd edn. Cork, Ireland: Ossian, 1989).

61. Weber-Bockholdt speculated as to whether F might not have equal authority as a final (Weber-Bockholdt, *Beethovens Bearbeitungen britischer Lieder*, p.31), but since the first three phrases begin on G, and the second and fourth phrases end there, G is clearly defined as the resting point. That the third phrase ends on F is unusual only because it is the subtonic rather than the mediant.

g: i bVII (V) #viø7 V6 i v (V)

i F: V7 V9 I6 4 V7 I6 4 V7 I6 4 V7 I6 4 g: iv V

i bVII iv V2 i6 F: I6 4 V I

IV6 4 I (vii°6) I g: V6 5 i F: ii V7 I g: (i)

Example 14: Beethoven, *Lament for Owen Roe O'Neill*
 (WoO 158b/7, 1810), mm.3–18.

via its leading tone, E_b , and functioning modally as a goal unto itself rather than tonally as V/III , as it does in many other settings. G minor is reaffirmed at the end of that measure through its leading tone, F^\sharp , which Beethoven interpolated into the original melody, classicizing it as he did with the melody of *Lochnagar* (ex.1). The first phrase concludes with another modal inflection, the minor dominant in

m.6, which is countered at the end of the measure by a major dominant leading into the tonic beginning of the next phrase. A more tonal harmonization of this measure might employ the major dominant squarely on beat 3, prepared by the subtonic in the first half of the measure.

The second phrase is deflected from the tonic even sooner, with V of F major (m.7) establishing a dominant pedal that carries throughout the phrase. The melodic cadence in m.10 is a conventional $\hat{3}-\hat{2}-\hat{1}$ descent in G, but Beethoven vehemently rejected its tonic implications, harmonizing it instead with V and I_4^6 in F, as in the preceding measure, and arriving unexpectedly on an apparent minor dominant (C minor in m.10). In retrospect, this chord functions as the home subdominant of a iv-V-i elided cadence, and the dominant pedal in F becomes a dominant preparation in G. The third phrase begins like the first, but closes with a $\hat{3}-\hat{2}-\hat{1}$ descent in F major (mm.14-17), which functions for the first time as a root-position tonic.

The two keys used in this setting are species of the same scale: F major is the seventh mode of G Dorian, and G Dorian is the second mode of F major. Thus the modal inflection created by $\flat\text{VII}$ as a harmonic goal (mm.4 and 12) is paralleled on a larger structural level by the use of $\flat\text{VII}$ as a subsidiary key area (mm.7-10 and 14-16). The cadential figures in mm.17-18 sum up the harmonic relations in this work: V-i first in G minor, then in F major, and then a modal melodic $\flat\hat{7}-\hat{1}$ cadence in a monophonic texture that avoids any form of dominant and creates an archaic affect. Beethoven's postlude (not shown) echoes this gesture, but closes with a conventional $\text{i}_4^6-\text{V}^7-\text{i}$ cadence in G minor.

The Return to Ulster (*WoO 152/1*)

The minor dominant also creates a modal inflection in another lament by Carolan, *The Return to Ulster* (ex.15),⁶² which was set in the same year as *Lament for Owen Roe O'Neill*. The melody of *The Return to Ulster* has a flexible seventh degree and thus fluctuates between F harmonic minor and F Aeolian. Beethoven's accompaniment begins with a single reiterated C, the function of which is not immediately apparent. This repeated pitch is transferred down an octave twice (m.4), becoming a pedal point that continues, occasionally relocated but otherwise uninterrupted, throughout the rest of the song.

62. Tune: *Young Terence MacDonough*; new text by Walter Scott. The original version of the tune, which is slightly different, is available in *The Complete Works of O'Carolan* and is also given in Bröcker, "Die Bearbeitungen schottischer und irischer Volkslieder von Ludwig van Beethoven," p.82.

f: i v6 VI7 It.+6 i6₄ V i6₄ v
 6
 Once a gain, but how chang'd, since my wan - d'rings be-
 (VI2) (V) (i6₄) i6₄
 10
 - gan I have heard the deep voice of the La - gan and
 V i6₄ v V7 i6₄ (V6/V) (V6/V)₅
 14
 Bann, And the pines of Clan - bra - sil re - sound to the
 v (i6) i6 v6₄
 18
 roar That wea - ries the ech - oes of fair Tul - la-
 i (V) i

Example 15: Beethoven, *The
 Return to Ulster* (WoO 152/1,
 1810), mm.1–38.

22

- more. A - las! my poor bo - som, and why shouldst thou

Ab: (viiø7) I IV6₄ I IV6₄

26

burn! With the scenes of my youth can its rap - ture re-

I ii I6 viiø4₃ f: iv6

30

- turn? Can I live the dear life of de-

V V4_{3/2}

33

- lu - sion a - gain, that flow'd when these ech - oes first

i6 v6₄ V6₄ i (V) i (V)

37

mix'd with my strain?

i

The initial sighing gesture from F minor to C minor at the end of m.1 is most readily interpreted as iv–i. It is not until the arrival of the pitch D \flat —first as part of a submediant seventh chord (m.2), and then as the bass of a tonality-defining Italian sixth (m.3)—that the dominant function of C, hence the key, becomes clear. The descending lament tetrachord is completed and the dominant confirmed in m.4. When the first two measures are restated with left and right hands exchanged (mm.5–6), the minor dominant heard in the opening measure returns. Beethoven employed V and v in approximately equal measure in this setting, but subverted many of the major dominants: for example, V in m.10 has no third, V⁷ and V⁹ in mm.12 and 32 are countered by much stronger arrivals on minor dominants in mm.14 and 34, and the implied major dominants in mm.20 and 36–37 are set over tonic pedal.

The first alteration to the dominant pedal initiated in m.4 is the addition of a second note, introduced in m.13 as the leading tone of V (B \sharp). Following its resolution in m.14, the second bass note resurfaces as B \flat below the original dominant pedal and descends to the tonic, a fifth-span that complements the initial descending tetrachord in mm.1–4 and completes a stepwise octave descent. Since it is not yet clear that F is the tonic in m.1, the strong arrival in m.19 constitutes the first root-position tonic in the work.

The melody is through-composed, but like most of Beethoven's AABA and ABCB settings, the third phrase (mm.23–30) is in the relative major. Oddly, this phrase is the only one in the song without an emphatic arrival on E \flat in the melody, although it does feature a dramatic ascending-octave leap on E \flat (m.27) that echoes an earlier, similar leap on F (m.16). There are three instances of E \flat as a melodic goal: at the end of the phrase in m.14 and at phrase midpoints in mm.18 and 34. In each case it is treated as the lowered seventh degree in F Aeolian and harmonized with the minor dominant. Beethoven seems to have deliberately chosen to emphasize the modality of this melody, since he could easily have set it in a more tonal fashion by supporting $\flat\hat{7}$ with the relative major, as he did in the tonic/relative harmonizations.

In his setting of *The Return to Ulster*, Beethoven evokes a folk idiom through the pedal point itself and the pervasive chords and sudden clashes it creates. A dissonance too startling to be folklike occurs in m.32, where the addition of three notes to the pedal forms an impressively discordant low-register cluster. Functionally, this is simply a compressed V² with an added minor ninth, resolving conventionally to i⁶. The dominant pedal that sounds throughout the initial phrase gives rise to the expectation of a clear harmonic movement to root-position V and then to root-position i, an expectation that is never satisfied; even in the postlude (not shown),

the repeated V–i movements occur over tonic pedal. Instead, through emphasis on the minor dominant and subversion of the major dominants—and many of the tonics—Beethoven created, around a bass line and harmonic structure composed largely of tonic and dominant, a modal harmonization that reinforces the modal melody.

Save Me from the Grave and Wise (WoO 154/8)

Come Fill, Fill, My Good Fellow (op.108/13)

These two Irish folk songs are neither from the same tune family nor in the same mode, but they have several features in common: both are modified strophic forms with hexatonic melodies that have no sixth degree and a lowered seventh. Beethoven's treatments are likewise very similar: both accompaniments consist chiefly of tonic and dominant, with the subtonic functioning as a dominant preparation.

Save Me from the Grave and Wise is a circular tune in which every phrase ends on $\hat{2}$, necessitating a final postlude that descends to the tonic. The first A section

11

Save me from the grave and wise, for vain - ly would I tax my spi - rit,

F: I V6/5 V

15

be the thing that I des-pise, and ri - val all their stu-pid me - rit

cresc. p

I bVII6 vii°6 (I) V

Example 16a: Beethoven,
*Save Me from the Grave and
Wise* (WoO 154/8, 1812–13),
mm. 11–18.

is shown in ex.16a.⁶³ The melodic framework is a triadic F major except for the penultimate measure of each phrase, which features a Mixolydian inflection in the form of a leap from G up to the lowered seventh degree, E \flat (m.17). Cooper has described this leap as “wild and wayward,”⁶⁴ and it is undeniably difficult to assimilate within conventional major-minor tonality. Beethoven set it with the only appropriate choice: the subtonic triad. The other two diatonic harmonies containing both notes of the leap are iv and vii $^{\circ}$ /IV, both of which are stylistically alien, and the half-diminished-seventh chord would be unable to resolve properly. Thus, Mixolydian scale degree $\flat\hat{7}$ in this melody is reinforced with the modal harmony \flat VII $^{\circ}$. The subtonic triad functions as a pre-dominant, leading smoothly into the dominant-function diminished vii $^{\circ}$ ⁶⁵ in m.18 through a raising of its root from E \flat to E \natural . Beethoven was careful to avoid parallel perfect intervals between \flat VII and I: the subtonic is in first inversion while the tonic is in root position, the leading-tone triad is interpolated between the two, and the tonic triad has no fifth.

Beethoven was apparently pleased with the effect of the subtonic triad, for he wrote in French at the end of the autograph score: “Behold how one must not be afraid of the expression of the strangest sounds in melody, because one will surely find a natural harmony for it.”⁶⁵ He used the last four measures of the phrase as the basis of the introduction (ex.16b) and marked every occurrence of \flat VII with a crescendo. On the other hand, perhaps he felt that only with repetition and emphasis could the listener’s ear become accustomed to this unusual feature.

The difficulties of harmonizing modal melodies with a lowered seventh degree are noted in a later Scottish source: “The way in which the seventh of the scale is often used . . . puts the modern harmonist to a stand . . . he either *alters* the melody, in spite of its characteristic peculiarities, to accommodate it to the usual routine of his harmony; or, which is certainly much more wise, he preserves the melody entire, and suits his harmony as he best can to the case”⁶⁶—as Beethoven did here.

63. Tune: *Nora Creina*; new text by William Smyth.

64. Cooper, *Beethoven's Folksong Settings*, p.158.

65. “Voilà comme on ne doit pas avoir peur pour l’expression les sons le plus etrangers dans melodie, puisque on trouvera surement un harmonie naturell pour cela” (Hans-Günther Klein, *Ludwig van Beethoven: Autographe und Abschriften* [Berlin: Merseburger, 1975], p.178). Beethoven made a similar, albeit more ambiguous, comment in German in his *Tagebuch* about a year later (see n.45). The observation above may have been intended for Thomson, as French was their language of communication.

66. William Daune, *Ancient Scottish Melodies*, p.336.

6

p

cresc. *p* *tr* *cresc.*

F: $bVII^6$ $vii^\circ 6$ I V I $bVII^6$

$vii^\circ 6$ I V V7

The image displays a musical score for the song "The Rose Tree". It is written for a piano, with a treble and bass staff joined by a brace. The key signature is one flat (B-flat), and the time signature is 4/4. The score is divided into two systems. The first system begins at measure 35 and ends at measure 40. The second system begins at measure 40 and ends at measure 45. The melody is primarily in the treble staff, featuring eighth and sixteenth notes, often beamed together. The bass staff provides a steady accompaniment with eighth notes. A trill (tr) is marked above the final note of the first system (measure 40) and the first note of the second system (measure 40). The lyrics "The Rose Tree" are written below the first system, and "The Rose Tree" is written below the second system.

The subtonic does not appear in the postlude (ex.16c), which is based on the open-ended final measure of the phrase. Several commentators have noted the strong resemblance of this motive to the main theme of the last movement of Beethoven's Seventh Symphony,⁶⁷ which was completed a few months before *Save Me from the Grave and Wise*. Beethoven created a musical double entendre that alludes to both the melody of the Seventh Symphony finale and the problematic leap in the folk-song melody, which now follows rather than precedes the open-ended measure, and has been shifted up a step from $\hat{2}-\flat\hat{7}$ to the more tonally orthodox $\hat{3}-\hat{8}$, providing closure to the phrase.

The subtonic also functions as a dominant preparation in *Come Fill, Fill, My Good Fellow*, another Irish melody set by Beethoven five years later, although Thomson originally published it as Scottish. The first A section is shown in ex.17.⁶⁸ This triadic melody provides another illustration of subtonic juncture, outlining the progression tonic-subtonic. Accordingly, Beethoven harmonized m.6 with $\flat VII$ —he really had no choice—but rather than moving directly from tonic to subtonic, he prepared it with its dominant, $V^7/\flat VII$ (m.5), thus avoiding parallel perfect intervals between the root-position triads i and $\flat VII$. As in *Save Me from the Grave and Wise*, the subtonic functions as a dominant preparation, more diatonically in this setting because of its minor mode. Although the penultimate note of the tune is the leading tone, the fundamental scale structure is G Aeolian/Dorian hexatonic, and the overall effect is modal. Because of the melodic sequence in *Come Fill, Fill, My Good Fellow*, $\flat VII$ serves as both a dominant preparation and a lower contrasting sonority, taking on simultaneous functions of dominant and subdominant.

Conclusion

The categories of harmonization I have applied to Beethoven's folk-song settings provide a theoretical framework for considering modal harmony in the context of major-minor tonality. When confronted with these modal melodies, Beethoven devised numerous different ways of accommodating them, including shifting between two relative keys, reassigning the tonic, and adopting the scalar limitations

67. George Grove credits his friend Charles Villiers Stanford with pointing out the likeness. George Grove, *Beethoven and His Nine Symphonies* (2nd edn. London, 1896), pp.261–62; also noted in Cooper, *Beethoven's Folksong Settings*, p.177; Weber-Bockholdt, *Beethovens Bearbeitungen britischer Lieder*, pp.257–58; Cooper, review of Weber-Bockholdt, *Beethovens Bearbeitungen britischer Lieder* in *ML* 76 (1995), 449; and Lewis Lockwood, *Beethoven: The Music and His Life* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2003), p.231.

68. Tune: *There's Three Gude Fellows Ayont Yon Glen*; new text by William Smyth.

The image shows a musical score for a folk-song setting by Beethoven. It consists of two systems of music. The first system has a vocal line and a piano accompaniment. The vocal line starts with a treble clef, a key signature of one flat (B-flat), and a time signature of 8/8. The lyrics are: "Come fill, fill, my good fel-low, fill high, high, my good fel-low, and". The piano accompaniment has a grand staff (treble and bass clefs). The second system also has a vocal line and piano accompaniment. The vocal line starts with a treble clef, a key signature of one flat, and a time signature of 8/8. The lyrics are: "let's be me-ry and mellow, and let us have one bot-tle more." The piano accompaniment has a grand staff. Below the piano parts, there are harmonic annotations: "g:" and "i" under the first system, and "V7/bVII bVII V7" under the second system. The third system has a vocal line and piano accompaniment. The vocal line starts with a treble clef, a key signature of one flat, and a time signature of 8/8. The lyrics are: "let's be me-ry and mellow, and let us have one bot-tle more." The piano accompaniment has a grand staff. Below the piano parts, there are harmonic annotations: "i" under the first system, "V7" under the second system, and "i" under the third system.

5
Come fill, fill, my good fel-low, fill high, high, my good fel-low, and

g: i V7/bVII bVII V7

7
let's be me-ry and mellow, and let us have one bot-tle more.

i V7 i

Example 17: Beethoven, *Come Fill, Fill, My Good Fellow* (op.108/13, 1817), mm.5–8.

or modal inflections of the given melody. The varying degrees of modality demonstrated by his harmonizations are largely dependent on the scalar qualities and emphases of the original melodies. Clearly, he did indeed seek out the harmonies most “consistent with the genre and the character of the melody.”⁶⁹ He combined these harmonically distinctive settings with primitivist signifiers such as pedal points and small-scale dissonances intended to create an authentically folklike feel. A close reading of this analytically neglected yet worthwhile repertoire and its history demonstrates that Beethoven valued the folk-song settings both aesthetically and compositionally; his creative solutions to the problems they presented remain of interest to us today.

69. “Conforme au genre et au Caractère de la Melodie” (Brandenburg, no.1244 [21 Feb. 1818], IV, 174).