### A DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS OF THE ENGLISH AND FRENCH TRANSLATIONS OF THE <u>1001 NIGHTS</u>

by

**Monique Cardinal** 

A Thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of Master of Arts

> Program of Comparative Literature McGill University Montreal, Quebec September 1991

(c) Monique Cardinal, 1991



National Library of Canada Bibliothèque nationale du Canada

Canadian Theses Service

Service des thèses canadiennes

Ottawa, Canada K1A ON4

> The author has granted an irrevocable nonexclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

> The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-315-74617-3



Abstract

A descriptive analysis of the <u>1001 Nights' translations is situated at the crossroads</u> of modern developments in translation theory, in the redefinition of medieval textuality and poetics, and in the critique of the interpretive tradition of Orientalism. We based our analysis of the English and French translations of the Nights (Galland, Lane, Payne, Burton, Mardrus, Khawam) on the target-text approach elaborated by the Tel-Aviv and Leuven theoreticians, and on the typology of deformations of modern translating practices established by A. Berman. A translation bears the marks of a network of constraints and strategies of the target culture: translational norms, readership, discursive practices, personal motivation, etc. Our task was to decide which factors constitued the shaping forces of the Nights' translations. The core of the research redefined the 1001 Nights as a medieval work of mixed orality, and illustrated how recurrence (phonetic, lexical, and syntactic) created the rhythm of the text. Recurrence is the universal and constant trait of an oral poetics, and constituted the major translation problem which confronted the translators because of their bond to highly literate-literature cultures.

i

Résumé

Une analyse descriptive des traductions des 1001 nuits se place au carrefour des développements modernes en traductologie, de la redéfinition de la textualité et de la poétique médiévales, et de la critique du discours orientaliste. Notre analyse des traductions anglaises et françaises des 1001 nuits (Galland, Lane, Payne, Burton, Mardrus, Khawam) est fondée sur deux modèles: la théorie du polysystème appliquée à la traduction par les écoles de Tel-Aviv et de Louvain, et la typologie des déformations de la pratique traduisante moderne établie par A. Berman. Une traduction s'insère dans un réseau de contraintes et de stratégies de la société réceptrice: normes de traduction, public, pratiques discursives, motivation personnelle, etc. Une partie du travail consistait à établir comment ces facteurs ont fait système dans les traductions des 1001 nuits. L'autre partie s'est consacrée a décrire la textualité médiévale des 1001 nuits comme oralité mixte, fortement structurée au niveau rhythmique par la récurrence (phonétique, lexicale et syntaxique). La récurrence est la caractéristique universelle et constante d'une poétique orale et constitue le problème de traduction majeur auquel les traducteurs se sont affrontés étant donné leur appartenance à des cultures marquées par l'expérience moderne de la littérature.

ii

### Acknowledgements

I am very grateful to my husband, Mustafa Aroud, for his unconditional support. Without his encouragement and faith in me, I could not have completed this work.

I would also like to thank Professor Marc Angenot for being a good guide and structuring my intuitions.

I extend my thanks to Professor Issa J. Boullata, whose course on Modern Arabic Thought was a revelation.

Finally, this comparative study of the <u>1001 Nights</u> was made possible by the women at Interlibrary Loans of McGill University who assiduously tracked down the very rare editions of the <u>Nights</u> in Arabic and in translation. I thank them all for making the texts available.

### Table of Contents

Abstract	i
Résumé	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Introduction	1

### Chapter One

Part I:	What a	descriptive	analysis	can be	<b>;</b> .	•••••		 10
Part II	: What a	a descriptive	analysis	s shoul	d <u>not</u>	be or a	do	 25

## Chapter Two

Historical and Contextual Background of the 1001 Nights	.42
Language and critical reception of the 1001 Nights	.49
Textuality of the 1001 Nights	
Importance of Mahdi's Arabic edition	

## Chapter Three

The Oral of Mode of Narration of the <u>1001 Nights</u>	
Medieval text as performance	66
Vocal Signals of the medieval text	73
1. Authorial intervention	
2. Musical declamation and gestual commentary	76
3. Recurrence and rhythmic components of the 1001 Nights	81
Phonetic recurrence	
Lexical recurrence	97
Syntactic recurrence	.101

# Chapter Four

C

Descriptive Analysis	107
1. Galland: Occidentalising the Orient	
Excerpts from Galland's translation	
2. Mardrus: Orientalising the Orient	
Excerpts from Mardrus' translation	

3. Paratext of the English translations of the 1001 Nights15	57
4. Oral Poetics: Micro/macro structure of the translations10	68
Macro-structure of the translations10	68
Micro-textual level of the translations17	70
Conclusion	
Conclusion	54
Appendix 1	88
Appendix 2	91
Appendix 3	94
Appendix 4	95
Appendix 5	96
Bibliography19	97

Nous pouvons voir par toutes ces traductions que chaque période a apporté son cachet particulier et ses conceptions, tant littéraires que scientifiques, de l'art de traduire. Au début du XIXe siècle on ne cherche que l'agrément de la lecture et la satisfaction de la curiosité, on continue en somme Galland; dans la seconde moitié du siècle apparaît, surtout chez les Anglais, le sourci de mettre en relief le côté ethnographique des <u>Nuits</u>. Enfin, dans ces dernières années, le texte arabe dans son ensemble a été abordé par des philologues arabisants. Il serait intéressant de faire une histoire des traductions en liaison avec l'évolution des idées littéraires et des études orientalistes.

Nikita Elisséeff (1949: 84)

#### Introduction

Since the 18th century, the <u>1001 Nights</u> has grown to become a classic of that timeless and limitless body of "Universal Literature" (1):

Monument le plus populaire de la littérature arabe, le livre des <u>Mille et Une</u> <u>Nuits</u> (Alf layla wa-layla) a été, depuis le XVIIIe siècle, traduit ou adapté dans presque toutes les langues du monde, devenant ainsi partie intégrante du patrimoine universel. (Bencheikh 1968: 29)

The many pages devoted by Western scholars, writers and translators to these popular narratives, first introduced from the Arab world by Antoine Galland in 1704, bear witness to their lasting influence on literary communities in the West. The <u>Nights</u> has functioned as a central force in nourishing the literary imagination and production of hundreds of Western writers. Studies by Abdullah, Ali, Amshoosh, Barchilon, Conant, Caracciolo, Martino, Piroué, <u>et al</u> (see bibliography) have documented the birth and growth of the "oriental tale" ("le conte oriental"), the offspring of the <u>1001 Nights</u> in England and France. No other European language, except for German (2), can rival the English and French translations of the <u>Nights</u> which make up our corpus: Antoine Galland 1704-1717, Edward W. Lane 1838-1841, John Payne 1882-1889, Richard F. Burton 1885-1888, Joseph C. Mardrus 1899-1904, and René Khawam 1965-1967 and 1986-1987. These

<sup>1.</sup> The "universalisation" of the <u>Nights</u>, i.e. the production of readily accessible, readable translations, results in the "dehistorisation" and "decorporealisation" ("décorporéisation", A. Berman 1986: 67, 69) of the narratives. Berman's criticism of the "traditional" theory and practice of translating which annexes and naturalises the source text will be discussed in Chapter 1.

<sup>2.</sup> The major German translators are Gustav Weil 1837-1867, Max Henning 1896-1897 and Enno Littmann 1921-1928 (Littmann 1960: 359-360).

translations span almost three centuries and thus are indeed one of the few examples of translated literature which lends itself to a historical study of translational norms.

In the Middle Ages and the Renaissance, mainly works of Arabic philosophy, theology, science and medicine were translated into Hebrew, Latin and later European languages (Lewis 1980: 41). Apart from the Qur'ān, the <u>1001 Nights</u> was the first work of Arabic literature to be translated into a European language:

The vogue of literary translation began with the famous French version of the <u>Thousand and One Nights</u> by Antoine Galland, completed in 1704 [sic], and followed by a whole series of others, including translations by such eminent scholars as Sir William Jones and such gifted writers as the German poet, Friedrich Rückert. (Lewis 1980: 43)

In our times, almost three centuries later, the Nights still remains the single piece of Arabic literature to be the most translated, edited and re-edited in the West, and thus widely known by Western readers. Though modern Arab writers are translated more and more, a survey carried out by N. Tomiche shows that the <u>1001 Nights</u> still holds the record for the number of translations edited and distributed in the Western Hemisphere. Out of a total of 401 translations in German, English, Spanish, French, Italian and Portuguese for a period of twenty years (1948-1968), 275 were of the <u>1001 Nights</u> (3) while the remaining works were divided between classical (52) and modern (74) literature (Tomiche 1978: 2) It is evident that even today, the <u>1001 Nights</u> continues to play a formative role in shaping Western vues of Arab culture and Arabic literature, though this representation is now almost six centuries out of date.

Translators of the <u>1001 Nights</u> have been accused of producing notoriously

<sup>3.</sup> N. Tomiche borrows these figures from the <u>Index Translationum</u>, an international listing of translations published by UNESCO. On page 3 of her introduction, Tomiche provides a table of her findings.

"bad", unfaithful translations. In reaction to this "sad state of affairs", recent work on the <u>1001 Nights</u>, all of which is the achievement of Arab scholars and translators, has been undertaken in the spirit of "putting things right". By producing a descriptive analysis of the <u>Nights</u>, we intend to sidestep this dualistic classification of the translations, good/bad, faithful/unfaithful still operative in contemporary evaluations of translations. (4) We will show how choices made by the translators, despite their profession of faithfulness to the original, were motivated by their respective literary and cultural traditions. (5) Since <u>all</u> translations are faithful, that is some sort of equivalence is presupposed between source and target texts, a descriptive study must determine to <u>what</u> they are actually faithful:

...it follows that the question to be asked in the actual study of translations (especially in the comparative analysis of TT [target text] and ST [source text]) is not <u>whether</u> the two texts are equivalent (from a certain aspect), but <u>what type</u> and <u>degree</u> of translation equivalence they reveal. (Toury 1981: 21)

We will therefore answer the basic questions as to why and how a particular translation of the <u>Nights</u> is functional within a given time and space, and what are the underlying norms that governed the translators in their work.

All translations, the <u>1001 Nights</u> being no exception, are products of the target-language and culture of or adopted by (as in the case of Mardrus and Khawam) their respective translators; they bear the traces of a "network of

<sup>4.</sup> As we shall see, dualistic terminology and concepts, redefined by theoreticians in the past decade, still have a fundamental role to play in translation theory.

<sup>5.</sup> Since the Arab translators, Joseph C. Mardrus (1899-1904) and René Khawam (1965, 1986, second version), were translating for French audiences, they were constrained, if they wished their translations to be <u>acceptable</u> (G. Toury), to adapt the <u>Nights</u> to the literary tastes and traditions of their Western readers, despite their initial (and laudable) intentions of rendering an even more "faithful" version of the <u>Nights</u> than their European predecessors.

constraints" (Toury 1981: 14), linguistic, literary, social and individual, of the recipient culture:

DTS [Descriptive Translation Studies] starts from the notion that any research into translation, whether it is confined to the product itself or intends to proceed to the reconstruction of the process which yielded it (and on from there), should start from the hypothesis that <u>translations are facts of one system only</u>: the target system. It is clear that, from the standpoint of the source text and source system, translations have hardlly any significance at all, even if everybody in the source culture "knows" of their factual existence (which is rarely the case anyway). Not only have they left the source system behind, but they are in no position to affect its linguistic and textual rules and norms, its textual history, or the source text as such. On the other hand, they may well influence the recipient culture and language... (Toury 1985: 19)

Even though we rely greatly on the theoretical framework and tools provided by G. Toury's target-text approach to the descriptive analysis of literary translations, we cannot agree with the second part of this often repeated statement. (6), that there exists no dialogue between translations and their source texts and cultures, that translations cannot alter the status and initial form (the immutability and fixity) of their source texts. Toury's axiom applies to literature as we experience it in modern times, i.e. as a written work, produced by an individual author, stable in form (protected by copyright laws), and destined for individual reading. His statement therefore cannot possibly apply to a work such as the <u>1001 Nights</u>, which in its initial stages, was orally transmitted and re-enacted for a collective hearing, and which, even in its written versions, continued (and still continues) to exist in a plethora of forms, subject to the greatest manipulation. The much criticised and dubious quality of the translations and corresponding Arabic source texts edited in the 19th century, have induced modern

<sup>6.</sup> Previously stated by the author in similar terms in 1980: 28, and reproduced in 1986: 1120.

Arab scholars and translators to reconsider their position regarding the Nights. Previously, little attention was paid to the Nights because of its marginal position (i.e. non-canonical) as popular narratives in the Arabic literary canon. In reaction to the manipulation and deformations undergone by the Nights at the hands of Western scholars and translators, Arab editors and intellectuals have reappropriated this group of texts in an attempt, one could assume, to salvage what has been lost. As A. Berman has stated regarding modern retranslations of "classical" works, most of them are carried out with the intention of rediscovering the textuality and poetics of the original obscured by an adaptive and ethnocentric practice of translation (7):

Le mouvement proprement moderne de la re-traduction commence lorsqu'il s'agit de réouvrir l'accès aux oeuvres qui constituent notre sol religieux, philosophique, littéraire et poétique; aux oeuvres qui ont décisivement modelé notre mode de sentir et d'exister... La retraduction moderne est une mémoire rapatriante. (Berman 1986: 130)

Joseph C. Mardrus, an Egyptian doctor, produced a translation of the Nights which, among other things, attempted to give the most Arabicised version by transposing into French many of the sayings (locutions, idioms, etc.), and even the wording of the Arabic text. He also expanded the oral formula pronounced by Shahrāzād at the beginning of the nightly episodes and attempted in many instances to reproduce the rhythm and rhyme of the text in order to highlight the remnants of a of an oral mode of narration still found in the written text. (8) For

<sup>7.</sup> We await with impatience the new translation of the <u>1001 Nights</u> to be published by Jamel Eddine Bencheikh, a prominent Algerian literary scholar and André Miquel, a well-known French arabist. One could assume that their project is motivated by this "movement of re-translation/patriation" identified by A. Berman.

<sup>8.</sup> These initial statements of Mardrus' system of translating will be described in greater detail in Chapter 4.

similar reasons, René Khawam, a Syrian translator and professor, in 1965 and again in 1986, produced his translation of the <u>Nights</u> with the intention of reviving their oral character:

Ces créations sont animées d'un rythme spécial; elles dénotent une vivacité bien différente du caractère langoureux que l'on a coutume de présenter au public comme particulier aux <u>Mille et Une Nuits</u> et en général à la littérature arabe. Nous avons donc tenu à nous conformer à ce rythme populaire, donnant toute sa valeur au style original du récit... (Khawam 1965, vol.1: 26)

Khawam's ambition to preserve the oral nature of the text-- whether he succeeded in doing so will be discussed in Chapter 4-- led him to hunt down the oldest sources of the Nights, relying on unedited manuscripts, only consulting the 19th-century Arabic editions (corrected, censored and expanded versions of the oldest nucleus of the manuscripts) to complete and clarify unclear passages. His work ultimately resulted in the reformulation of the Arabic source text(s). Likewise, Muhsin Mahdi, an Iraqi scholar, completed the re-edition of the Arabic 1001 Nights, basing his text on the same group of manuscripts used by Khawam, identified as Syrian in origin and reputed to be the oldest group (14th-century) as opposed to the more recent Egyptian branch. His work is of great importance because he reproduced the text (a compilation of Antoine Galland's manuscript, the oldest known manuscript to date, and of three similar manuscripts of the Syrian branch) (9), "errors and all", in order to preserve the oral provenance of the narratives unlike the 19th-century editors of the Nights:

<sup>9.</sup> Mahdi's intention was to recreate the hypothetical prototext of the Nights, which theoretically would be the source text-- the Ur-text-- for the other existing manuscripts. Despite this debatable search for "origins", for the original text of the original (and unique) author, Mahdi did indicate in his edition the variants taken from the other Syrian manuscripts of the Nights, and consequently recreated the "mouvance" of the narratives, typical of medieval works. (Zumthor)

Mahdi's general criticism of the nineteenth-century printed texts is that they are "contrived" (mulaffaqah). By this he means that the later redactors obscured the traces of the oral recitation in their source-manuscripts and instead gave the stories a more formal literary quality. According to Mahdi, these later redactors worked this transformation in two ways. First, they replaced colloquial wording with classicizing fushā. Second, where the earlier mauscript-sources (such as G[alland]) had displayed frequent repetition of both descriptive details and entire incidents in a given story (a reflection of the leisurely and discursive storytelling-style frequently used in oral recitation), the later [19th-century] editors of the Egyptian texts condensed the stories considerably: they abridged exchanges of dialogue and numerous descriptive details and avoided the iteration of entire episodes which appeared in repetitive form in earlier manuscripts. (Pinault 1987: 129-130)

Mahdi's criticism of the 19th-century editors of the Nights could be applied verbatim to the treatment of the stories by the translators: effacement of the rhythm and diction typical of oral narration, elimination of the repetition of words, sentences and narrative segments, and one should add the censorship of explicit sexual scenes by Galland, Lane and the Egyptian sheikh, guardian of the morals of his Arabic readership, who prepared the Arabic edition (Būlāq) of 1835. The 19th-century Arabic editions (Būlāq, Calcutta II and Habicht) and the translations of the Nights have both played a similar role in dispossessing the Arabic and European reader of the oral poetics of the Nights--- the translations to an even greater degree, given the cultural and linguistic distance from Arabic popular narration heightened by an ethnocentric practice of translating.

This digression on the problematics surrounding the source texts of the <u>1001 Nights</u> has introduced us to the debate surrounding the <u>Nights</u>: an oral versus written mode of narration, popular (non-canonical) versus canonical, mobility

versus fixity, etc. The plurality of the source texts (10) and the adaptive nature of the translations of the <u>Nights</u> draws the critic away from an interlinear comparison between source and target texts, this being the "traditional" or "classical" approach to a descriptive analysis of translations. Not only will we study the <u>Nights</u> on a micro-textual level, but we will also assess both source and target texts on the macro- and contextual levels since all three levels do interrelate. (11)

In the chapter that follows, we establish the basis for a descriptive theory of translations by referring first to the target-text approach elaborated by the Tel-Aviv group-- G. Toury, <u>et al.</u>-- and the theoreticians at Leuven-- J. Lambert, Th. Hermans, <u>et al.</u> Secondly, we recapitulate the foundational debates in translation theory such as H. Meschonnic's critique of E. Nida's and later J. Ladmiral's so-called "pragmatic" approaches to translating. Thirdly, we incorporate into our descriptive analysis of the source and target texts of the <u>Nights</u>, A. Berman's analytics of a critical theory of translation. Finally we proceed with a succinct critique of past studies of the <u>Nights</u>' translations in order to demonstrate what a descriptive analysis should <u>not</u> be or do. Our intention is not to draw up a comprehensive inventory of contemporary translation theories. Rather, we have adopted a selective approach which focuses on the major differences, oppositions and also similarities of modern reflections on translations and translating of the past thirty years.

In response to our epigraph of N. Elisséeff's proposal for future scholarship concerning the <u>Nights</u>, a descriptive analysis of the <u>1001 Nights</u>' translations is situated at the crossroads of modern developments in translation theory, in the

<sup>10.</sup> All the translators used more than one source text for their translations.

<sup>11.</sup> The writings of José Lambert will be the primary guideline in defining the features of these different levels and the possible relations which exist between them for a descriptive study of translations.

critique of the interpretive tradition of Orientalism, and in the re-evaluation/valorisation of a poetics of oral narratives long obscured by conventions of written, bookish cultures. C'est l'affaire d'une excellente traduction qu'à travers elle nous puissions sentir la nudité de la langue originale comme le corps d'une danseuse à travers son vêtement.

> Hugo Von Hofmannsthal sur la traduction des <u>Mille et une nuits</u>, cité par Antoine Berman dans <u>Cinquièmes</u> <u>Assises de la traduction littéraire (Arles</u> <u>1988</u>), 113.

### Chapter One: Part I What a descriptive analysis can be

Given the subject of our research, the descriptive analysis of the English and French translations of the <u>1001 Nights</u>, the "restricted" or "narrow" definition of translation put forward by G. Toury in <u>The Encyclopedic Dictionary of Semiotics</u> is the most operative:

In a more restricted sense, which is by far the most current one, translating is reduced to <u>interlingual</u> processes only, that is, it refers to processes where the two respective systems (primary codes) are two ontologically equivalent, different natural languages. In the most restricted of its senses, the initial and resultant entities are both linguistic <u>utterances</u>, or <u>texts</u>, belonging, in addition to the general linguisitic systems, also in secondary modeling systems which are of the nature of <u>text-types</u>, or <u>textual traditions</u>. In this narrow sense, translating is therefore an intertextual activity involving cross-lingual procedures. (1986: 1116)

This definition refers to the activity, the process of translating, while a descriptive analysis takes as its object the result of this production, the translation as product. A descriptive analysis is the after-the-fact study of the translation process, of the norms, explicit or not, which governed the decisional process involved. Toury divides translational phenomenon into three basic divisions: translating, translation, and translatability (the potential for source and target equivalence), in an attempt to "overcome the remnants of the terminological problem" (1986: 1112) surrounding translatology/ translation studies. Descriptive Translation Studies (DTS) approaches translations on the empirical level, that is how they are and not what they can be, which would make up the theoretical branch of translatology, or how they should be, this prescriptive

mandate belonging to applied translation studies (Toury 1985: 35) :

Instead of providing guidelines for the next translation to be made and passing judgement of any number of existing ones, the descriptive method takes the translated text as it is and tries to determine the various factors that may account for its particular nature. (Hermans 1985: 12-13)

In order to "account for the nature" of a translation, an evaluation process is involved. The comparison between source and target texts is only part of this process which includes a number of relations: original to translation, author to translator (their intentions), reader (source culture) to reader (recipient culture), pragmatics and reception in source and target systems respectively, authors of the same system (interdiscursity), situation of original and translation in respect to other texts (intertextuality), the internal harmony and conflict of literary systems (i.e. canonical versus non-canonical, primary versus secondary, etc. (Lambert and Van Gorp 1985: 44) The descriptive method thus defined "attempts to go beyond the binary relation of source and target text" (ibid.: 46) because it recognises that the source text is never the sole model on which a translation is based. (Lambert 1989: 155) DTS explores a range of relations and is therefore not to be equated with an evaluation of translations leading to reductionist (1) statements such as:

...we can see Galland's virtues and limitations fairly clearly. One of course notices the seventeenth-century Frenchman's decorum, the restraint and poise of his tone, and comparing that with the grotesqueries o [sic] Payne-Burton or even the relatively simple style but still heavy movement of Lane...After consulting the Arabic texts, however, one realizes that simplicity, even spareness of diction to the point of crudeness, is quite appropriate here. Mardrus and Khawam aim at capturing this crudeness... (Knipp 1974: 54)

After comparing a few sentences of source and target texts, C. Knipp's

<sup>1. &</sup>quot;The comparison of T1 [source] and T2 [target], to the exclusion of other factors, has often been responsible for the reductionist approach we have been criticizing." (Lambert and Van Gorp 1985: 47)

conclusion to his descriptive analysis of the six translations of the <u>Nights</u> is reduced to: Galland=restraint and poise of tone, Lane=simple and heavy, Payne/Burton=grotesque, Mardrus/Khawam=crude. Galland's translation is good, "it is difficult to find a more happy, creative, and successful translation in the West" (Knipp, <u>ibid</u>.), and the remaining are <u>bad</u>. A descriptive analysis which only seeks to evaluate a translator's performance in dualistic terms usually leads to the conclusion that, in general, translations are inadequate and thus do not deserve to be called translations.

Many scholars have argued that the different manuscripts of the 1001 Nights could be recordings of oral performances. (2) The stories were thus intended to be communicated orally. However, after the translation process, they were incorporated into the realm of (Western) literature, presented in the material form of a book (chapter divisions, punctuation, capitalisation, etc.), and designed for individual reading. In addition to this shift in the Nights' original conditions of composition and presentation, the stories undergo a 1001 amputations and amplifications at the hands of the translators. Nonetheless, in spite of the numerous changes ("infidelities"), the <u>Mille et une nuits</u> and the <u>Arabian Nights'</u> <u>Entertainment</u> do not cease to be translations. A text which is announced as a translation, irrespective of the degree and type of equivalence obtained between itself and the source text, and despite the fact that it might even be an original work-- a ghost translation--, does not cease to function as a translation in the target culture:

There is also nothing perverse in the claim that the identity of a target text as a translation is determined first and foremost by considerations

<sup>2.</sup> See in particular P. Molan (1981) and D. Pinault (1986) who have found references to oral reciters in the Arabic <u>Nights</u>.

pertinent to the receptor system, with no necessary connection with the source text and its position in the source system, and with the actual process which yielded that target text, strange as it may seem to the uninitiated. (Toury 1984: 81)

If our object of study is first and foremost <u>translations</u>, attention devoted to the source text is a <u>means</u>, and not an end in itself, for identifying the translation problems and solutions encountered during the translating process, the main constraint in the <u>1001 Nights</u> being the tension between written and oral modes of narration:

Moreover, when they [students of translation] finally bring the corresponding originals to bear upon their work, these are used as means only, namely means for the reconstruction of the process of decision-making resorted to during the act of translating, the extraction of the translational norms on the basis of the existing translational relationships, and, ultimately, the general concept of translation underlying the corpus in question and responsible for those norms, relationships, decisions. (Toury 1984: 78)

The comparison between source and target texts is undertaken in order to establish on the micro-level the shifts undergone by the original on the macro-level (3), and ultimately in order to determine the <u>overall</u> equivalence obtained between source and target texts. The often cited example of the oral formula pronounced by Shahrāzād (more elaborate in the older manuscripts but extensively truncated in the 19th-century Arabic editions), our nocturnal storyteller, at the beginning and end of each nightly episode, is an important feature of the macro-structure of these narratives. Four of the six translators

<sup>3.</sup> J. Lambert and H. Van Gorp provide an updated scheme for Translation Description in the appendix to their 1985 article. The macro-level includes the division of the text into chapters, acts, scenes, etc., titles, types of narrative (dialogue, descriptive, etc.), internal narrative structure, authorial comment... The micro-level comprises selection of words, dominant grammatical patterns and formal literary structures (metre, rhyme, etc.), forms of speech, modality (passive or active), language levels (sociolect; archaic/popular/dialect etc.)... (52-53)

(Galland, Lane, Payne and Khawam) eliminated Shahrāzād's presence throughout the Nights, finding the oral formula repetitive, thus imposing their own divisions on the stories and consequently doing away with this dramatisation of the text-in-performance. (Zumthor 1987: 247) The reader finds himself/herself removed from the oral origins of the text, and the gulf increases on the micro-level where scenic repetitions, oral formulae, rhythmic patterning of the text, etc. are eliminated in order to create a non-repetitive, non-redundant, progressive and "fast-moving" type of prose tailored to Western standards. This hunting-down of repetition and redundancy not only reflects the literary norms of the recipient culture, but also reveals the norms applied in the translating process, namely the widely believed axiom that a translation should improve the original, clarify "obscure" passages and refine style. As we have tried to demonstrate by this one example (there being many more to be discussed later in Chapter 4) of eliminating Shahrāzād as storyteller, the descriptive method, which does not take translations to be idiosyncratic manifestations of translators' whims, situates them in the historical and textual contexts of the recipient culture:

Une traduction est à la fois une historicité spécifique, et un acte de langage spécifique. Un texte et ses traductions sont dans des histoires et des langues différentes et surtout des stratégies et des enjeux différents. (Meschonnic 1981a: 6)

DTS is a method which furthers the historical understanding of translational phenomena, and no field of knowledge can claim to be complete without this understanding of theory and its applications. Consequently, it is difficult to understand why certain translators are hostile and even scornful towards the descriptive branch of translation studies. The writings of J. Ladmiral typify this inimical attitude of practitioners towards theoreticians. He identifies himself as a handyman ("un bricoleur") of theorems ("théorèmes") whose goal is to construct a series of tools helpful to translators in their everyday work. He openly rejects the possibility of an all-encompassing theory of translation which would unify the theoretical, descriptive and applied branches. In a recent article (1987), Ladmiral continues to argue in favor of translation as <u>praxis</u> ("un discours qui est pratique", 18); translatology is a science of practice: "une praxéologie". In contrast to Toury's triadic division of translation studies, Ladmiral posits the following mock-typology (1987):

1. "la traductologie d'avant-hier or "traductologie prescriptive/ normative". Its authors are Benjamin, Meschonnic, Larbaud, José Ortega y Gasset, Steiner, Berman;

2. "la traductologie d'hier" or "traductologie descriptive." Of its authors, Vinay et Darbelnet, Guillemin-Flescher, Ballard, Mounin, Etkind, Catford and Wilss, Ladmiral writes: "ils procèdent d'une démarche à posteriori. Cette traduction descriptive se situe 'en aval' du travail du traducteur. Elle prend pour objet la traduction comme produit, comme résultat (ou comme effet) de l'activité traduisante." (22)

3. "la traductologie de demain" or "traductologie inductive/ scientifique", which is a "psychologie cognitive" whose object will be "ce qui se passe dans la tête des traducteurs" (22);

4. "la traductologie d'aujourd'hui" or "traductologie productive" whose ambition is to "bricoler' un ensemble de concepts et de principes qui soient de nature à anticiper et à faciliter la <u>pratique</u> traduisante ou 'traductrice'." (23) Its authors are Nida and Ladmiral.

Ladmiral's pseudo-chronology is visibly hierarchical, assigning more importance to the translating process and associating it with the notion of intellectual progress. He classifies the descriptive method as a "thing of the past"-- la traductologie d'hier--, thus not essential to future developments in translation studies: "ce ne sera plus maintenant dans cette seule direction que se fera l'essentiel des recherches sur la traduction." (22) In a similar though not identical (but cruder) typology (1986), Ladmiral situates "yesterday's" translatology at one extreme, but this time labelling its authors "sourciers", those in favor of preserving the maximum of the source text in a translation, while his camp, the "ciblistes" adapt the source text to target (cible) linguistic and literary norms. He bases this opposition on the dualism of the sign, signifier and signified, qualifying the sourciers'/littéralistes' preoccupation with the work of the signifier of the source text as "un mode de pensée archaique et magique". On the contrary, the ciblistes'/sémanticiens' (sémantiastes) emphasis on meaning, on the signified of the source text evokes, according to him, "la double idée de modernité et (...) de communication". (1986: 35) Ladmiral's typology of 1986, inherits Nida's division of translation into formal and dynamic equivalence, this opposition based on the centuries-long division of language into spirit and letter. Ladmiral's dualistic typology bears a family resemblance to other famous dualisms in translation theory: "traduction éloignante/traduction rapprochante" (Schleiermacher, Ortega y Gasset), "verres colorés/verres transparents" (Mounin), "traduction sémantique/traduction communicative" (Newmark), "traduction non déguisée/traduction déguisée". (Larose 1987: 229) Even in his most recent comments. Ladmiral still relies on this worn-out and ineffective dualism:

C'est pourquoi je reprendrai, en le complétant, un vieil adage (cibliste) de traducteurs: on ne traduit pas des mots-- mais on ne traduit pas non plus des choses-- on traduit des idées! (1986: 36)

Les ciblistes, tels que je les ai définis, sont ceux qui entendent être fidèles à l'<u>esprit</u> du texte-source, et non pas tant à sa lettre... (1986: 38)

Ladmiral's polemics become quite virulent when he accuses the sourciers of violating the "naturalness" of the French (target) language by their literalist translations:

Alors que les ciblistes se veulent éminemment respectueux du plaisir des langues, du plaisir propre à la langue dans laquelle on parle (ou écrit), c'est-à-dire en l'occurrence qu'ils entendent respecter la langue-cible, je suis tenté de dire que la logique des sourciers, c'est la logique du viol! (1986: 39)

L'idée est qu'une bonne traduction devrait violer la langue-cible. (ibid., 39)

Mais alors, c'est que les ciblistes ont raison contre les sourciers. Plus précisément: le paradigme métaphorique d'un viol de la langue...maternelle (horresco referens!), qui est sous-jacent au discours sourcier, ne peut être qu'un adjuvant rhétorique. (ibid., 40)

Ladmiral identifies H. Meschonnic as one of the main proponents of the "viol sourcier". The uninitiated reader might be surprised by the repeated attacks against Meschonnic in Ladmiral's recent articles. However, he openly declared Meschonnic his arch-opponent when they both edited an issue of Langue française devoted to translation theory (51: 1981). In the introductory article, a dialogue between himself and Meschonnic, Ladmiral talks of a "tension à la fois dialogue et duel: entre Henri Meschonnic et moi-même pour commencer, c'est-à-dire entre une «poétique de la traduction» et «mes théorèmes»." (1981a: 7) From that moment on, Ladmiral has always mistaken Meschonnic's poetics of translation/poetic translations, for some sort of word for word, interlinear transposition (also known as "transcodage") between source and target languages:

...il [Meschonnic] lui apparaît primordial de se tenir au plus près de l'énoncé en langue-<u>source</u> et, plus précisément, du détail des <u>signifiants</u>, c'est-à-dire des unités de <u>langue</u> qui sont les constituants de cet énoncé, qu'il rend mot pour mot... (Ladmiral 1986: 38)

Meschonnic, on the contrary, has maintained for now close to two decades, that a poetics of translation is first and foremost a reflection on the <u>letter</u>, on the work of the signifier of the text, and not a fetishism of its lexical and syntactic units, "un verbalisme fétichiste, curieusement dénommé littéraliste, puisque son unité est, non la lettre, mais le mot." (1986: 78). Meschonnic proposes in the place of a "traduction linguistique", a "traduction poétique" which takes rhythm as the major signifier of discourse, of the text to be translated:

C'est en tant que rythmique du discours qu'il y a lieu de théoriser, et de pratiquer, non plus une linguistique de la traduction, mais une poétique de la traduction. (1981b: 38)

Comme la théorie du rythme et la théorie de la traduction, terrains-- et non régions-- d'une même stratégie et d'un même enjeu, ceux d'une critique de l'historicité dans le langage. (ibid.: 39)

The rhythm of a text is a subjective and historical use of language. A poetic translation perserves the rhythmic patterns of the source text which are in fact the semantic regulators of the text. Rhythm gives life and form to all texts; however, it becomes the most important signifier and organiser of discourse in an oral mode of production (which will be the central issue in Chapters 2 and 3). Meschonnic privileges rhythm and prosody in his translations of the Bible in order to rediscover for his reader the oral mode of these writings obscured by past translations, the majority of which relied on conventions of literate, bookish cultures:

Ce primat de la rythmique impose alors, précisément pour la Bible, de sortir des conventions de l'écrit, qui marquent toutes les traductions, y compris la réaction du calque, pour retrouver le mode de l'oralité qui est son mode de visée. (1981b: 38)

Meschonnic's goal to define the relation between rhythm and signifier is a historical project, an attempt to restore to the text its historicity: "une pensée du langage à la recherche de sa propre historicité." (1986: 76) At the same time, Meschonnic recognises that a translation is an encounter between two poetics ("une interaction de deux poétiques" 1973: 307) and two histories, source and target:

On traduit toujours à partir d'un certain <u>état</u> de sa langue et de sa littérature. Ainsi la poésie étrangère se traduit-elle à partir de notre poésie contemporaine. (Berman 1985: 134)

Thus, in his Biblical translations, Meschonnic deliberately borrows from modern poetic and novelistic practices which have done away with typographical conventions, i.e. punctuation, capitalisation, uniform character print and spacing, chapter divisions, etc. This modification of the graphic presentation of the translation enables Meschonnic to break away from a highly codified and restrictive written tradition in order to give a voice to the oral mode of narration of the Biblical source text. To deny or conceal this relation/tension between two competing traditions, source and target, is to annex the source text to target literary and cultural norms. The "traditional translation", as Meschonnic labels most translations of our Western tradition, is an annexation, an adaptation to target-text models and literary tastes, and thus is a suppression of the dialectic nature of translating: "L'annexion est l'effacement de ce rapport, l'illusion du naturel." (1973: 308) Meschonnic ascribes to the "traditional translation" an ahistorical treatment of the source text because, as practice, it disembodies the text from its material specificity, its diction, prosody and rhythm (4), seeking only to reproduce the meaning of the text: "Celui-ci [le dualisme], ayant séparé préalablement le langage entre de la forme et du sens, n'a programmé de traduire que le sens. Ce sont les traductions herméneutiques." (1986: 76) A. Berman, a recent supporter of Meschonnic's theoretical stances, follows up with a similar definition of the "hermeneutic translation": "des théories traditionnelles [de la traduction] qui posent l'acte de traduire comme une restitution embellissante (esthétisante) du sens." As repeatedly stated by Berman, the excavation of meaning, this being the sole purpose of a hermeneutic translation, is inevitably

<sup>4. &</sup>quot;Cette matérialité est prise comme une diction, prosodie et rythme dominant, inséparables de la signification du rapport entre valeur et signification qui fait un texte." (Meschonnic 1973: 451)

accompanied by an explication, rationalisation, clarification and thus manipulation of that meaning: "Pour le traducteur formé à cette école [traditionnelle], la traduction est une transmission de sens qui, en même temps, est tenue de rendre ce sens plus clair, de le nettoyer des obscurités inhérentes à l'étrangeté de la langue étrangère." (Berman 1985: 37) Freed from its specific materiality, from its historical form, the text enters into a realm of atemporality, of the abstract and universal:

Poser que le but de la traduction est la captation du sens, c'est détacher celui-ci de sa lettre, de son corps mortel, de sa gangue terrestre. C'est saisir l'universel et laisser le particulier (Berman 1985: 53)

Meschonnic, and later Berman, adamantly oppose the new generation of traditional translators, the pragmatists: Nida, Ladmiral, Newmark, Delisle, García Yebra et al., who continue to promulgate the preservation of meaning over form (thus upholding the dualist vision of language as form/content, style/meaning), and the filtering of this meaning through procedures of clarification, rationalisation, explication, universalisation and naturalisation, in order to render it more accessible and comprehensible to the target-culture reader. In fact, they have redefined the concept of fidelity, a fidelity no longer pledged to the letter of the text but to the effect produced by the text on the reader. Their aim is to recreate the orginal effect the source text had on its initial readers so that the target audience may experience the text in a similar manner. Not only is this "original effect" impossible to determine, but it ultimately leads to the replacement (naturalisation) of elements of source text and culture by pseudo-equivalents in the target text and culture, i.e. dialects of the source text are replaced by dialects of the target culture, source proverbs are not translated but equivalents conveying the "same" meaning are found in the target culture: "Poco a poco hila la vieja el copo= Petit à petit l'oiseau fait son nid" (García Yebra 1982: 38), and the "body language" portrayed in the source text, judged either "too hot or too cold", is found a "safe" equivalent for the target audience: the famous example of Nida's replacement of the biblical kiss, a form of greeting, by the American "hearty-handshake", etc. The filtering of meaning and the effacement of the poetics of the original text results in a translation which does not read as one but reads as an original written in the target language:

Si on tente de mettre l'équivalent, non plus dans le sens mais dans l'effet, on entre dans un pseudo-pragmatisme intenable. Puisque, outre la réduction du sens à l'effet, qui est une erreur, nul ne peut savoir ce qu'était d'abord cet effet sur un destinataire d'origine. Et sur chaque destinataire. Ce behaviorisme autorise toutes les manipulations. C'est le <u>hearty hand-shake</u> <u>all around</u> de Nida, pour le baiser biblique sacré. La traduction devient adaptation. (Meschonnic 1986: 77)

Ces deux axiomes [de la traduction traditionnelle] sont corrélatifs: on doit traduire l'oeuvre étrangère de façon que l'on ne «sente» pas la traduction, on doit la traduire de façon à donner l'impression que c'est ce que l'auteur aurait écrit s'il avait écrit dans la langue traduisante. (Berman 1985: 53)

In correlation to Meschonnic's criticism of the "traditional translation",

Berman qualifies the translation-annexation as "ethnocentric" because it adapts

the source text to the recipient culture:

Ethnocentrique signifiera ici: qui ramène tout à sa propre culture, à ses normes et valeurs, et considère ce qui est situé en dehors de celle-ci-l'Etranger-- comme négatif ou tout juste bon à être annexé, adapté, pour accroître la richesse de cette culture. (Berman 1985: 48-49)

An ethnocentric translation is automatically a "hypertextual translation" because it is based on an already operative model of the recipient literary system: "Hypertextuel renvoie à tout texte s'engendrant par imitation, parodie, pastiche, adaptation, plagiat, ou toute autre espèce de transformation formelle, à partir d'un autre texte <u>déjà</u> existant." (Berman 1985: 49) The basic rule of a critical theory of translation ("une théorie critique") is: "La traduction ethnocentrique est nécessairement hypertextuelle, et la traduction hypertextuelle nécessairement ethnocentrique." (Berman, ibid.) The major objective of a critical theory of translation is to establish to what extent a translation is ethnocentric and hypertextual since "toute oeuvre est à un quelconque degré hypertexuel". (Berman 1985: 63) Berman has elaborated an <u>analytics</u>, "une analytique" of translation for describing the changes which occur between source and target texts. He has identified the thirteen most common deformations which occur in ethnocentric-hypertextual translations of literary prose: "la rationalisation, la clarification, l'allongement, l'ennoblissement et la vulgarisation, l'appauvrissement qualitatif, l'appauvrissement quantitatif, l'homogénéisation, la destruction des rythmes, la destruction des réseaux signifiants sous-jacents, la destruction des systématisations, la destruction ou l'exotisation des réseaux langagiers vernaculaires, la destruction des locutions et idiotismes, l'effacement des superpositions de langues." (Berman 1985: 68-69) We shall describe in more detail these 13 deformations when we compare source and target texts in Chapter 4. However, as a preliminary comment, almost all these deformations were found in the translations, and for each translator, two or three of the deformations consistently reoccurred throughout the stories thus enabling us to characterise each individual system of translation. Berman's analytics of translation proved indispensable for carrying out our descriptive analysis.

Berman refers to translational shifts which occur between source and target texts as deformations/destructions. A critical theory of translation therefore does not divorce an <u>analytics</u> from an <u>ethics</u>: "Ici, la traduction, pour accéder à son être propre, exige une <u>éthique</u> et une <u>analytique</u>." (1984: 16-17) Berman like Meschonnic distances himself from the DTS theoreticians (Toury, Lambert, Van Gorp, Hermans, etc.) because he incorporates an ethics into an analytics and historics of translation. An ethics is based on that "fondamental contract" which links the translation to the original and prohibits any "dépassement de la texture de l'original." (Berman 1985: 58) An ethics of translation attempts to open up a dialogue with the source text and culture by preserving its distinctiveness: "L'acte éthique consiste à reconnaître et à recevoir l'Autre en tant qu'Autre." (1985: 88). Berman talks about the essence of translation as being ethical because it is fundamentally animated by the "désir d'ouvrir l'Etranger en tant qu'Etranger à son propre espace de langue." (1985: 89) Thus the ethical translation is the positive alternative to its negative counterpart, the ethnocentric translation, just as a poetics of translation is opposed to the hypertextual treatment of the source text. (1985: 47) Historically, the ethnocentric translation is the tradition in the West, thus the majority of translations constitute a systematic negation of the foreignness (l'étrangeté) of the foreign (étranger) work (Berman 1984: 17) :

Au contraire, la visée appropriatrice et annexionniste qui caractérise l'Occident a presque toujours étouffé la vocation éthique de la traduction. La "logique du même" l'a presque toujours emporté. (1985: 89)

This ethnocentric practice of translating in the West holds true for the translations of the 1001 Nights. The Nights was treated with even greater licence than most texts because of the instability/plurality of the source texts, and also because it is a collection of popular narratives which most scholars (Western and Arab) have labelled as unrefined and vulgar, this value-judgement indirectly warranting "the ennoblement of suject-matter" and "the polishing of style" during the translation process. An ethics of translation does not limit the relation between source and target texts to an <u>encounter between two literary systems</u>, <u>between two distinct aesthetics</u>, but interprets this relation as symbolising either a state of dominance of one culture over the other, as in the case of ethnocentric translations, or a state of reciprocity, of cohabitation between two nations: "...les rapports de l'original à la traduction expriment les rapports de nation à nation."

23

(Berman 1984: 92) An analytics of translation makes explicit the relation between a poetics and politics (Meschonnic 1978: 233) by not only establishing how a translation partakes in the dynamics of the target literary system, but also by situating the translation within a larger discursive context of the recipient culture. For example, the descriptive analysis of the 19th-century English and French translations of the <u>1001 Nights</u> should privilege the rapport between the translations and a popular Orientalist discourse so that the deformations that occur between source and target texts are interpreted for their ideological weight. In this larger discursive context, we are able to apply to our analysis both Berman's critique of the ethnocentricity of the Western practice of translation and E. Saïd's denunciation of the West's political and ideological manipulation of the Orient through the interpretive tradition of Orientalism. It will become apparent in the final stages of our presentation that the political and economic domination of East by West manifests itself as an "aesthetic domination" ("domination esthétisante", Meschonnic 1973: 315) in the translations.

24

### Chapter One: Part II What a descriptive analysis should not be or do

In this companion section, we shall illustrate how comparatists, without referring explicitly to a theory or school of translation in their descriptive analyses of the 1001 Nights, did actively make use of some basic axioms concerning translations and translating. The proverbial statement, "no theory is still theory", holds true, and it is this inadvertence to theoretical issues, to one's presuppositions, that prevents the reader-critic from breaking the chain of inherited generalities about a specific group of texts. H. Meschonnic voices a similar observation in response to the question, "Does practice imply a theory?", debated at the Second Annual Meeting of Literary Translation/Translating at Arles (France) in 1985:

Ce qui semble souvent difficile à admettre pour les traducteurs, c'est qu'ils font de la théorie sans le savoir. Y compris quand ils disent qu'ils n'en font pas. Si bien que le paradoxe de la traduction, surtout quand il s'agit de littérature, c'est que la traduction montre les idées du traducteur sur le langage, sur la littérature, précisément même quand il croit ne pas en avoir, quand il croit n'avoir de rapport qu'avec le texte. (36)

Just as translating is not a transparent activity, but rather a conjunction of two poetics and histories which demands on the part of the translator a conscious attempt at reconciliating often conflicting traditions, a translation is not to be viewed as the transparent transposition of source-text meaning into the recipient language. In the following pages, we shall reintroduce Meschonnic's criticism (1973) of this semantic approach to translating typified by E. Nida's writings and shall demonstrate that C. Knipp's descriptive analysis of the Nights' translations is an implicit application of Nida's methodology. Three descriptive analyses have been published on the <u>1001 Nights(1)</u>: C Knipp's cursory article (1974: 11pp.) on the six major English and French translators: Galland, Lane, Payne, Burton, Mardrus and Khawam (1965-67); C. Hagège's comparative analysis (1980) of Mardrus' and Galland's translations, and R. Hawari's evaluation (1980) of Galland's translation. What is common to these studies is that all three authors argue in favor of, though from different perspectives, the superiority of Galland's translation:

...Galland has lost his place of pre-eminence. He deserves to have it back. (Knipp 1974: 47)

Hagège selects examples from the frame story to demonstrate that Galland understands and therefore adequately translates idiomatic expressions in the Arabic text while Mardrus constantly misinterprets the same expressions and therefore mistranslates them. Mardrus' translation, in its many attempts to be literal, often does not "make sense". Consequently Galland is the better translator because he is able to reproduce with exactness the meaning of the text, despite the numerous abridgements he imposes on the text-- justified by classicist aesthetics according to Hagège. (2) Then again, Galland does not appear to be the competent arabist Hagège makes him out to be after one takes into consideration the many and often amusing cases Hawari supplies of Galland's gross misinterpretations of the Arabic which lead him to invent entire narrative segments. Nonetheless, Hawari, like Hagège, concludes that Galland's translation is to be praised because it

<sup>1.</sup> A fourth study of the French translators, Galland, Mardrus and Khawam, was published by A. Azar in 1987. Azar compares the translations amongst themselves rather than confronting source and target texts. His study is not a descriptive analysis by definition, however, we do comment on his findings in Chapter 4 during our own descriptive analysis of Khawam.

<sup>2. &</sup>quot;Au caractère de litanie de ce texte, Galland substitue dépouillement "classique" et brieveté, à la répétition il préfère la litote, moyennant une sévère réduction." (Hagège 1980: 125)

masterfully transforms the Arabic Nights into a "worthy" piece of literature:

He [Galland] has, in my view, rendered the generally primitive and unsophisticated Arabic original into a polished, smoothly flowing and highly stylized narrative, which is not at all what his original source is. In fact, the original sounds, more often than not, like a faint echo when compared with what it becomes in Galland's immeasurably artistic and highly cultivated narrative. (Hawari 1980: 155)

C. Knipp carries out his comparison of the six translations based on a meagre three sentences taken from the frame story (when King Shāhzamān finds his wife, the queen, in bed with a black slave/kitchen boy) in order to prove that Galland's translation and its English version published in 1708 (?)-- which is thus a translation of a translation-- is "artistically" superior to any other English and French translation since published. As is apparent, Hagège, Hawari and Knipp are selective in their sampling of source and target texts in order to "prove" their assumptions concerning the translations. Their approach is atomistic, and cannot possibly be considered to adequately describe each translator's treatment of the Nights. The reader has no sense of how these isolated examples relate to the text as a whole, to its poetics and narrative structure. Their implicit definition of an adequate translation is one which preserves above all the meaning of the source text. As stated above, no reference to any theory of translation is to be found in these articles, and any mention of translation does not transcend the most general and uncritical of comments.

Knipp's study, far from coming close to an adequate analysis of these translations, will act as a foil in our attempt to define what a descriptive analysis should <u>not</u> be or do. The following axioms can be extracted from Knipp's disparate comments on the translations:

#### AXIOM I: A translation improves the source text, and is thus its superior.

...I am compelled to say that I prefer Galland's French, and the Grub-street Englishing of Galland, to any other version and even to the original,
which, in its more authentic written forms-- after all, it is essentially an oral work-- is poor and uninteresting Arabic. In its chief printed manuscript versions, as distinguished from the bowdlerized and grammatically "corrected" modern Arabic editions, the Arabic <u>Alf Layla</u> wa-Layla is a bastardized mixture of literary language and colloquial dialect which in the context of Arabic literature as a whole must seem ungraceful. (48-49)

# AXIOM 2: A translation uses an elegant language in order to improve and correct the style of the original.

...Galland is most successful in achieving the delicate compromises translation requires. His free-flowing version captures the simplicity of the original, but the genius of the French language allowed him to do this without being (as the Arabic tales are) inelegant. (49)

AXIOM 3: A translation should not be literal but respect the target language grammar and find the appropriate equivalences for foreign constructions, idioms and locutions.

Lane's is overly literal: instead of finding equivalents of idioms, we get things like "he almost flew with delight" (taking the verb  $\pm \bar{tara}$  literally and in the wrong sense); but Lane's biblical style is not the <u>mere</u> result of this literalness: a phrase like "rejoiced with exceeding joy" is not <u>merely</u> "literal", but reflects its author's conscious efforts to echo biblical style. (50)

## AXIOM 4: A translation should not be repetitious and awkward.

After consulting the Arabic texts, however, one realizes that simplicity, even spareness of diction to the point of crudeness, is quite appropriate here. Mardrus and Khawam aim at capturing this crudeness in repetitions that are probably deliberately somewhat awkward ("palais...palais"; "endormis...dormaient"). (54)

### AXIOM 5: A translation should have a natural flow, a natural ring to it.

...the unadorned (and unpunctuated) Arabic narrative requires a little padding to give it a more natural flow in English or French. The sequence of verbs فرجع ودخيل قصره فوجد (3) is typical of Arabic vernacular narrative. More subordination is natural in French or English... (53)

# AXIOM 6: A translation should be written in a language accessible to the reader; a translator adapts the original to his own time and space.

...it is probably best, at any rate, for a translator to stay close to the idiom he is most familiar with and therefore most able to handle with ease-- the idiom of his own time and country. (51)

<sup>3. ...</sup> then he returned and entered his castle then found...

Throughout his article, Knipp's comments betray, if not a theory, at least some rudimentary idea of what a translation should be, thereby transforming his analysis into a series of <u>prescriptions</u>. The following definition of translation is an articulate reformulation of Knipp's sporadic, semi-explicit axioms:

Translating consists in producing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalent to the message of the source language, first in meaning and secondly in style. (...) By "natural" we mean that the equivalent forms should not be "foreign" either in form (except of course for such inevitable matters such as proper names) or meaning. That is to say, a good translation should not reveal its nonnative source.

The informed reader recognises E. Nida's definition of "natural equivalence" (1966: 19), referred to in other writings as "dynamic equivalence". For each axiom earlier listed, one can find the corresponding rule of translation stated by Nida so that Knipp's comments on translation appear to read as a vulgarisation of Nida's "scientific" approach to translation. Nida is against literality-- or "formal equivalence" as he names it -- in translation because it "inevitably overloads the message, so that [the reader] cannot decode it with ease or efficiency." (1964: 129) A translator must make the source text as accessible as possible to the reader. He therefore strives for "naturalness of expression"; he tries to ease the differences between cultures and language structures by finding the closest equivalence for the source expression in the receptor language. For Nida, the four basic requirements of a professional translation are the following: "1) making sense 2) conveying the spirit and manner of the original 3) having a natural and easy form of expression and 4) producing a similar response" from the receptor-reader as the original reader experienced from the source-text (1964: 165). Knipp is convinced that Galland's translation is the better one because it possesses the above four qualities:

1) Galland's translation makes sense

29

...Galland's knowledge was the most advanced possible in his time, and it enabled him to produce that rare thing among scholars, an entertaining, readable, gracefully written book... (48, emphasis mine)

as opposed to Burton's:

...Burton's only real distinctions are that his version of John Payne's version of the <u>Nights</u> is the lengthiest and the most <u>unreadable</u>. Perhaps the most telling remark on this subject is that of the distinguished Italian Arabist and the editor of the Italian <u>Arabian Nights</u> translation, Francesco Gabrieli, to the effect that to understand Burton's translation he often has to refer to the Arabic text: this is very nearly true for a native English speaker. (49, emphasis mine)

2) it conveys the spirit and the manner of the original:

...the simplicity and naturalness of the <u>Alf Layla</u> unmistakably call for a more direct language...at first one is inclined to feel that Galland may have watered down his source. After consulting the Arabic texts, however, one realizes that simplicity, even spareness of diction to the point of crudeness, is quite appropriate here. (54)

3) has natural and easy form of expression:

His [Galland's] free-flowing version captures the simplicity of the original... (49)

4) and produces a similar response from the target-text reader as the source-text reader experienced in the past:

...Galland was so imbued with the spirit and schooled in the method of Arabic story-telling that, faithful though he was, he was capable of creating an Arabic story himself out of a slender outline, had in effect himself become an Arabic story-teller...[and therefore produced a similar effect on his European audience as the original Arabic storytellers of the Nights had on theirs.] (54)

Knipp attempts to gloss over the importance and the extent to which Galland has modified the Arabic source text: "But if one agrees to admire Galland's translation, a few small betrayals are preferable to total abandonment." (52); "Galland's chief unfaithfulness consists in adding polish." (54) This is of course an understatement. Galland's translation is more of an adaptation of the source text like other translations of his time (rf. Mounin, 1955: Les Belles infidèles). As we shall see in Chapter 4, Galland modifies entire narrative sequences, censors any explicit sexual scenes and systematically recasts all foreign cultural elements in an 18th-century French mould. His translation is remote from the slightest notion of adequacy and renders any accurate comparative study of source and target texts an almost impossible task. A contemporary of Galland, the French poet Colardeau, describes an adaptive (ethnocentric) translation much in the same manner as a follower of Nida, P. Newmark, does two and a half centuries later:

Colardeau: S'il y a quelque mérite à traduire, ce ne peut être que de perfectionner, s'il est possible, son original, de l'embellir, de se l'approprier, de lui donner un air national et de naturaliser, en quelque sorte, cette plante étrangère. (Berman 1985: 49)

In communicative translation, the translator is trying in his own language to write a little better than the original...I assume that in communicative translation one has the right to correct or improve the logic; to replace clumsy with elegant, or at least functional, syntactic structures; to remove obscurities; to eliminate repetition and tautology; to exclude the less likely interpretations of an ambiguity; to modify and clarify jargon... and to normalize bizarreries of idiolect... Further, one has the right to correct mistakes of fact and slips, normally stating what one has done in a footnote. (Newmark 1982: 42)

Newmark's communicative translation is another version of Nida's dynamic equivalence which modifies the source text in order to make it readily accessible to the target-language reader. Literality and faithfulness are qualities that neither Newmark, Nida nor Knipp estimate to be the foundation of an adequate translation. As we have seen, Knipp is highly critical of Lane's English calques of Arabic locutions and syntactic constructions, much in the same manner that Nida condemns the abusive practice of literal translating which he calls "formal equivalence":

Formal equivalence focuses attention on the message itself, in both form and content. (...) Viewed from this formal orientation, one is concerned that the message in the receptor language should match as closely as possible the different elements in the source language. (1964: 159)

[Formal equivalence] is basically source-oriented; it is designed to reveal as much as possible of the form and content of the original message...[it] attempts not to make adjustments in idioms, but rather to reproduce such expressions more or less literally. (165)

The sample that Knipp gives of the Arabic text (4) and its corresponding translations is indicative enough of how the different translators tackled the problem of equivalence in one particular instance, but is hardly a sufficient sampling to determine the system of translation and its governing norms specific to each translation. The most revealing, of course, is Knipp's own translation of the excerpt, part of which will suffice in order to characterise his practice of translation:

Calcutta II:

فرجد زوجته راقده في فراشها معانقه عبدا أسود من بعض العبيد فلما رأى لهذا الأمر اسردت الدنيا في وجهه Knipp's translation: ...and found his wife laying in his [sic] bed embracing one of the black slaves. When he saw this he became enraged.

للما رأى لهذا الأمر اسودت الدنيا في وجهه Knipp's translation of the Arabic phrase (and when he saw this the world became black before his eyes, literally "in his face"), by the <u>colourless</u> equivalent, "when he saw this he became enraged", demonstrates that a translation need only reproduce the semantic value (the

<sup>4.</sup> Knipp only supplies the Calcutta II Arabic without indicating if it differs from the other Arabic versions: Galland's manuscript, Būlāq, Habicht and Calcutta I. This omission demonstrates that Knipp has not done the basic groundwork of a comparative analysis: the identification of source and target texts for each translator. Mahdi's edition of Galland's manuscript does differ in actual wording and event as can be seen in Galland's and Khawam's translations based primarily on this edition, i.e. the queen is found in bed with a young man (his colour is not mentioned) from the kitchen:

signified) of the source-text locution and that the syntactic value (the signifier) can be omitted when judged necessary:

Only rarely can one reproduce both content and form in a translation, and hence in general the form is usually sacrificed for the sake of the content. (Nida 1964: 157)

But can form and content be torn apart when signified and signifier are wrapped up all in one to create the meaning of a text? As stated by Meschonnic, the golden rule for the interpretation/translation of any text is: "Un texte est le sens de ses formes autant que le sens de ses mots." (1973: 420) Since Knipp limits himself to translating the semantic value of the locution, he remains blind/deaf to the play on words in the Arabic text. Like most Semitic languages, one distinctive trait of Arabic is that almost all words are derived from a triliteral verb (a verb with three radicals) to which is added different vowels, long or short, suffixes, prefixes, infixes in order to form other terms either far or close in meaning to the root verb. (Actes des troisièmes Assises de la traduction littéraire Arles 1986, Minkowski: 71) Often stories of the <u>1001 Nights</u> do contain an echoing effect created by the verbal play on the root verb and its derivations, a device which intensifies the effect the narrative produces on the listener/reader, in this case, the "degradation" of the queen's desires for the black slave... black as a connotation of evil and sinfulness... black symbolizing a fit of rage or loss of reason as with Shahzaman... blackout: loss of vision, consciousness or memory... in other words, a world plunged into chaos and perdition: "...cet adultère royal est commis avec des esclaves et, qui plus est, avec des esclaves noirs, ce qui ajoute au désordre de l'infamie et la perversité..." (Bencheikh 1989: 27). F. Ghazoul also comments on how the narrative derives its coherence from the "black" metaphor (which is less intense in the Galland manuscript since the colour of the kitchen-boy-lover is not specified):

The text alone plays the utmost on the semantic fields and associations of blackness, linking this opening and crucial incident to the stuff of the book, nocturnal narration. The text specifies that Shahzaman remembers the article he forgot in his palace at <u>midnight</u>, that is at the very peak of night. Night evokes the heart of darkness. Shahzaman, then, finds his wife in bed with a <u>black</u> slave. Blackness seems to crown this darkness. And when Shahzaman saw all this, "the world became black in his eyes." The final blakening completes the sombre process. One pigment has been sufficient to describe the timing, the adulterer and the reaction. (Ghazoul 1980: 47)

Thus the translator should not overlook the verbal play of the original text if he/she at all wishes to recreate the textuality and meaning of the source text. What is "specific to a language and literature" should be discarded as Nida repeatedly states in his writings, lest it overload the communication process, interfere with the reader's comprehension. However, given the events of the story, a husband who finds his adulterous wife in the arms of a slave (kitchen boy), the reader will undoubtedly guess at the meaning of the locution. As Berman points out, replacing an idiom, proverb, locution by an equivalent in the target language is an ethnocentric practice of translating. He refers to a certain intuition the reader possesses, "une-conscience-de-proverbe", of the corresponding meanings of different source-text proverbs and gives examples to illustrate his argument:

En outre, vouloir les remplacer est ignorer qu'il existe en nous une conscience-de-proverbe qui percevra tout de suite, dans le nouveau proverbe, le frère d'un proverbe du cru. Ainsi de la chaîne:

Le monde appartient à ceux qui se lèvent tôt. (français)

L'air du matin a de l'or dans la bouche. (allemand)

L'oiseau du matin chante le plus fort. (russe) (Berman 1985: 80)

[And we add the English proverb: L'oiseau matinal attrape le ver: The early bird catches the worm.]

Nida gives the example of J.B. Phillip's translation of the New Testament

Romans 16:16 (already mentioned in Part I of this chapter) where the need for "dynamic equivalence" is imperative if the seriousness of the text is to be upheld and the reader is to receive the <u>right</u> message:

...he translates quite naturally "greet one another with a holy kiss" as "give one another a hearty handshake all around." (Nida 1964: 160)

Perhaps in some American social contexts this transfer is justifiable-could such a greeting carry sexual overtones?--, however, one cannot help but wonder at the supposed cultural "foreignness" this target-language equivalence attempts to eradicate. When defining dynamic equivalence, Nida states that a translation should have a "naturalness of expression" (in other words, exclude any foreign locutions and constructions), and should try

to relate the receptor to modes of behavior relevant within the context of his own culture; it does not insist that he understand the cultural patterns of the source language context in order to comprehend the message. (1964: 160)

The history/poetics of the source text undergoes an ahistorical treatment in the translation. Translation becomes adaptation, adaptation to one's own cultural norms and biases. If translating should lead to the bringing together of two different cultures, in the case of Nida <u>et al</u>. it entails the domination of one culture over the other; the recipient culture erases all distinctiveness of the source text and culture.

Annexation and not translation, so labels H. Meschonnic Nida's theory and practice of translation. The prescriptions: 1) a translation should not read as one, and 2) it should have a "natural flow" as though it were written in the target language, both lead to the principle of "transparency", to the eradication of the textuality of the original, of the historical and cultural distances between source and target texts, opening the way to the ideological manipulation of the source text by the translator for his own goal and purposes. And what are the intentions of Nida, head translator of the American Bible Society who so proudly announces in the introduction of his 1966 article that this biblical "corporation" and army of translators have introduced the Bible into more that 1,109 languages, thus ultimately giving weight and authority to his own theoretical writings drawn from so many years of experience? Meschonnic provides us with the astute response that Nida transforms Bible translating into a means of evangelisation ("de rendre la traduction de la Bible efficace comme instrument d'évangélisation", 1973: 340):

Le pasteur Nida dérive sa pragmatique de Dieu et de sa vérité dans l'impérialisme culturel qui identifie à soi les universaux: la traduction comme fonction performative est le masque idéologique de la colonisation. (1973: 325)

On vise une transparence: annuler la distance culturelle, historique. Pour obtenir une réponse-- comportement (évangéliser, convertir) on fait comme si Dieu a parlé dans votre langue, pour vous, aujourd'hui. (412)

This project of evangelisation, the exportation of an "all-American" Christianity (the Bible source text is a standardised English version and not the Hebrew or Greek) to the "Third World" (Africa, South America, Asia, etc.) explains Nida's centering his theory on reader-response thereby eclipsing the problematic relationship between source and target texts:

Nida met sa modernité dans le déplacement de la question: non plus l'ancienne "est-ce une traduction correcte", mais la nouvelle "pour qui?" (...) Chez lui, la psychologie du comportement vise seulement vers ceci: convertir, obtenir une réponse somatique, un mode d'agir. (Meschonnic 1973: 330)

In his theory of formal and dynamic equivalence, Nida separates "form" from "response", and concludes that only the meaning, the communicative value of a text should be preserved in the translation. Meschonnic rejects this semantic-oriented theory of translation which dismisses as unimportant the materiality of the text, the role the signifier plays in the production of meaning. In Chapters 2 and 3, we will describe the poetics proper to the Arabic <u>Nights</u> which should be preserved in an adequate translation, relying principally on the critical writings of P. Zumthor and H. Meschonnic.

In place of Nida's annexation of the source text, Meschonnic advocates the "experimental translation" which "radicalises" the act of translating in an attempt to open up the target language and culture to the distinct nature of the source text. For example, in the material presentation of his own translation of Genesis, Meschonnic leaves large blank spaces between groups of words to visually reproduce the diction of the disjunctive accents (<u>te'amin</u>) of Hebrew which make up the rhythm of the text. Borrowing the term from the French orientalist Louis Massignon, Meschonnic defines translating as the <u>decentering</u> of the target language and culture:

Pour comprendre l'autre, il ne faut se l'annexer, mais devenir son hôte. (...) Comprendre quelque chose, ce n'est pas <u>s'annexer</u> la chose, c'est se transférer par un décentrement au centre même de l'autre. (Massignon quoted by Meschonnic 1973: 411-412)

Meschonnic observes, however, that Massignon in his own translations from Arabic to French was unable to practice this decentering of the self. This discrepancy between intent and performance will be studied in Chapter 4 by contrasting the translators' prefaces to the actual transformations which occur between source and target texts in their respective translations of the Nights.

These two conflicting attitudes towards the source text, Nida's disregard of the materiality and thus of the very meaning of the text, and Meschonnic's particular care in reproducing in translation the work of the signifier, have been described by Toury as the components forming the initial norm that the translator adopts towards the original, which the critic can determine through a comparative analysis of source and target texts: This most important notion is a useful means to denote the translator's basic choice between two polar alternatives deriving from the two major constituents of the "value" in literary translation mentioned earlier: he either subjects himself to the original text, with its textual relations and the norms expressed by it and contained in it, or to the linguistic and literary norms active in TL [target language] and in the target literary polysystem, or a certain section of it. (Toury 1980: 88)

The "subjected" translator attempts to reconstruct the source text as faithfully as possible; he is in the pursuit of an <u>adequate</u> translation. This type of translation produces on the reader an effect of estrangement because of its "incompatibility... with the target linguistic and/or literary norms". The reader is no longer on familiar ground. The translation leads to a deterritorialisation of the reader's mother tongue producing what Toury somewhat scornfully labels an artificial, non-existing language:

...the translation is not being made into TL at all, but into a model-language, which is at best some part of TL and at worst an artificial, as such non-existing language, and that TT is not introduced into the target literary polysystem but imposed on it. (Toury 1978: 89)

On the other hand, the "subjecting" translator imposes the literary and societal norms of his culture on the source text, and is therefore more concerned with creating an <u>acceptable</u> translation, one which the reader feels at home with. The acceptable translation is almost always greatly removed from the orginal text:

...what a translator is actually introducing into the target literature is not the original work at all, but some version of it cut to the measure of a preexisting literary and linguistic model. (5) (Toury 1980: 89-90)

Toury states that each individual translation occupies some point in space between these two attitudes, subjection or annexation, which the critic is called upon to evaluate:

<sup>5.</sup> In Berman's terminology, the adequate translation is ethical while the acceptable translation is ethnocentric and hypertexual.

Since no translation is either entirely "acceptable" (because it owes at least something to the alien adequacy pole) or entirely "adequate" (owing to the obligatory pole of acceptability), one of the main objects of translation analysis is to determine its actual position between these poles, or its "combination of (or compromise between) these two extremes". (Toury 1978: 89)

Toury's reworking of the concept of equivalence allows the critic to circumvent the most frequently repeated axiom ("l'objection préjudicielle"): that translation is an impossible and self-defeating enterprise either because of the syntactic and lexical differences between languages or because of the radically distinct life experiences of different peoples and cultures (let us recall the traditional examples of the numerous words in Inuit describing snow or the many terms in Arabic referring to camels which no other language possesses thus making it difficult for the translator to find the linguistic and cultural equivalences). Toury uses translation equivalence as a theoretical and descriptive term:

a) as a "theoretical" term, denoting an abstract, ideal relationship, or category of relationships between TTs and STs, translations and their sources.

b) as a "descriptive" term, denoting concrete objects-- actual relationships between actual utterances in two different languages (and literatures recognized as TTs and STs-- which are subject to direct observation. (Toury 1980: 39)

In analysing a translation and its source text, there is no "logical contradiction" in stating that "equivalence revealed by translation x [the descriptive term] is no equivalence [the theoretical term]." (Toury 1980: 39) Every translation is by definition an equivalent reconstruction of a source text. The critic is no longer exclusively preoccupied with the question of "absolute equivalence" (theoretically definable but practically non-existent), but with the question of the "type and degree" of equivalence (1980: 47), with how a translation

is able to function within a particular literary system and social context. Thus Toury's descriptive approach to translation has often been labelled "functionalist" (he uses the term himself) because it attempts to determine how a translation produces meaning for a given readership, how it is able to operate effectively within a particular cultural and literary system. However, the notion of "absolute" equivalence, that is to say "maximal" equivalence, is the first step to any descriptive analysis because the critic proceeds to construct from this concept the hypothetical text which mediates between source and target texts, the <u>adequate</u> translation (AT):

[The AT is] the reconstruction of all the features relevant to ST, or at least of the most important ones, according to the ST's hierarchy of relevance. (1980: 38)

Thus, the transformed concept of adequacy finds its main use in the methodology of TT-ST comparison... In the methodological framework it [AT] is conceived of as a <u>hypothetical</u> entity constructable on the basis of a systemic (textemic) analysis of ST..., and it is used as <u>the invariant of the comparison</u> (i.e., as a <u>tertium comparationis</u>) rather than as the invariant of translation... (1980: 49)

It [AT] is most suitable to serve as the invariant in a comparison of TT and ST proceeding from a theory of literary translation. (1980: 116)

Thus Toury proposes the following three-stage operation for the method of

comparing source and target texts:

a) a textemic analysis of ST, leading to the formulation of AT and to the identification of ST textemes;

b) comparing TT units corresponding to these ST textemes and noting their shifts (deviations) from the latter;

c) making generalizations about the distance between TT-ST equivalence and AT, on the basis of many (partial) comparisons of separate texternes balancing each other. (1980: 118)

The next two chapters will be devoted to establishing a "translation

program" ("un programme translatif", A. Brisset 1980: 136) of the main components of the hypothetical AT (stage 1), based on a textual-cultural analysis of the Arabic stories and their ensuing oral poetics. The final chapter will study the actual transformations- deformations to have taken place between source and target texts (stages 2 and 3), relying in part on the categories of "deformation" established by A. Berman's analytics of translation, and on the parameters of the target-text approach to translation elaborated by Toury, Lambert, Herman <u>et al</u>. In order to define the scope and strategies of our own descriptive analysis of the <u>1001</u> Nights, we will reopen our discussion of translation theory (which we momentarily leave suspended) by a re-evaluation of the DTS method and Berman's typology in the opening pages to Chapter 4.

...où j'entends soudain, étouffé mais audible, <u>ce</u> texte; où je perçois, dans une bonne éclaircie, <u>cette</u> oeuvre, moi, sujet singulier, qu'une érudition a (souhaitons-le!) dépouillé des présupposés les plus opaques tenant à <u>mon</u> historicité, à <u>mon</u> enracinement dans cette autre culture, la nôtre...

> Paul Zumthor, <u>La Poésie et la voix dans la</u> civilisation médiévale, 39 (Paris: PUF, 1984).

# Chapter Two: Historical and contextual background of the 1001 Nights

The first references made to the <u>1001 Nights</u> date back as far as the 10th century. The Arab historian and geographer, al-Mas'ūdi, summarises the frame story of the <u>Nights</u> and mentions its supposed source, the Persian <u>Hazār Afsāna</u> ("Thousand Tales") in his <u>Murūji al-dhahab</u> (947, revised in 956). Ibn al-Nadīm, a bookseller and scribe, gives a similar synopsis of the stories in his "Index" of Arabic books, <u>Kitāb al-Fihrist</u> (987-988). N. Abbott describes a paper fragment of a <u>Nights'</u> manuscript dated 879, which is material evidence that the stories were in circulation almost a century before they were made reference to:

Furthermore, this manuscript [of the <u>Nights</u>], originating most likely in the earlier decades of the century [9th], as we have tried to show above, emerges, exclusive of parchment Qur'āns, not only as definitely the earliest Arabic <u>paper</u> book known to come down to us out of the Moslem world but also as most probably the earliest known Arabic book extant, irrespective of the writing material, to come out of the Arab world, Christian or Moslem. (Abbott 1949: 149) (1)

As with all popular narrative, the <u>Nights</u> continued to undergo changes for centuries through the oral reworkings of the stories which resulted in the textual variants of the Egyptian and Syrian manuscripts known to us today:

Here is a book, then, whose author's name is a legion; a book that simply grew, snowball-fashion, at random, until finally the first printed editions settled more or less a fortuitous form of it. (Gerhardt 1963: 39)

Peu de peuples même autant que les Arabes auront contribué à ce point à nourrir collectivement une oeuvre, dont la source la plus probable, en

<sup>1.</sup> This statement was made by N. Abbott in 1949. It is possible that other important discoveries of Arabic manuscripts would now disprove her conclusions. However, what is certain is that the <u>1001 Nights</u>, in one form or another, were in circulation during the 9th century.

amont de la rédaction définitive, est le verbe vivant de mille et un conteurs populaires: oeuvre longuement mûrie au fil de veillées sans nombre, dont l'écriture n'est que le vêture ultime. (Khawam 1986, vol.2: 14-15)

As widely documented, the perfection of Arabic script and writing started with the recording of the holy scripture of the Qur'an during the 7th century ("C'est que le sacré est un fixateur." Meschonnic 1982: 17) : "...there is no other event of greater importance for the Arabic language than the rise of Islam." (Cantarino 1975: 9); "The Arabic book owes its origins to Islam, and this has given it a character it has retained." (Pedersen 1984: 3) Thus at the outset of the 10th century (2), writing had been standardised and the production of manuscripts in all fields of knowledge increased. Nonetheless, an oral mode of communication and transmission of knowledge prevailed in manuscript cultures of medieval times. This is all the more true of the Arab oral tradition, because even when the "Book of books", the Qur'an, was established and recorded in writing for eternity, it was and still is committed to memory and kept alive by oral recitation:

Thus, throughout the history of Islam, oral transmission of "the Book" proceeds alongside the written. Muslims say that even if every copy of the Qur'ān were to be burnt, the Qur'ān would still live, for it dwells in the hearts-- that is, memories-- of the faithful. Indeed, it is a peculiarity of Islam that despite the great respect paid to the Book, written exposition is not regarded as an independent mode of expression, valuable in its own right, but as a representation of oral communication. (Pedersen 1984: 16-17)

Likewise, other medieval texts were immersed in an all-encompassing orality and ultimately were intended to be communicated by the human voice:

Il est-- j'y reviens-- plus juste d'admettre, de façon très générale, que la finalité ultime de l'écriture médiévale est la communication vocale, avec (au moins virtuellement) toutes les stimulations sensorielles qui y sont liées. (Zumthor 1984: 93)

<sup>2. &</sup>quot;Il n'en reste pas moins qu'à partir du IXe siècle, grâce à la rigueur qu'impose un correct déchiffrement de la Vulgate [le Coran], le monde de l'Islam dispose d'un système graphique à la mesure de ses moyens et de ses exigences. On sent combien dans l'ensemble du «fait coranique» sont liées la réforme de l'instrument graphique et la constitution de la grammaire arabe." (Blachère 1973: 67)

J. Pedersen describes in his third chapter ("Composition and Transmission of Books") of <u>The Arabic Book</u>, the transmission by prominent medieval Arab scholars of their writings, demonstrating that the written word was only recognised and given credibility if publicly dictated and recorded. Here is the description he supplies of book production in the milieu of the intelligentsia, which confirms Zumthor's theoretical stance that the intimate interconnectedness of written and oral modes of expression existed even in the most <u>literate</u> of milieux during medieval times:

The oral path was followed in publishing. A work was published by being recited and written down to dictation, <u>imlā</u>, usually in a mosque. This was the only method by which Muslims of former days could conceive of a work being made public and brought before a wider circle. (Pedersen 1984: 24)

The book is recited first to the public by the author himself, then it is read publicly...in different versions by a copyist in the presence of the author. In the meantime the changes and addenda are produced by being dictated to a famulus, who then reads the dictated version back to the author. The work only attains its final shape by being read aloud to the author in the presence of the public, and the author gives his authorization to this version.

The authorization of the book is called <u>ijāza</u> which means "to make lawful." The author placed his <u>ijaza</u> (licence) on the copies that he approved. (<u>ibid</u>.: 31)

Let us recall that the milieu Pedersen describes is that of the medieval literati who worked within the confines of the Classical Arabic literary canon (comprised of the Qur'ān, pre-islamic poetry, <u>ahadîth</u> of the Prophet Muhammad, the <u>Sîrat an-Nabî</u> or official biography of the prophet, religious commentaries and interpretations of holy scripture, Islamic philosophy, etc.), thus highly distinct in many respects from the context of popular narratives and their audiences. Popular narratives, because of their low literary status, supposed lack of seriousness and fabricated (thus suspect and false) nature, were not subjected to the severe "copyright" practices of scholarly writings, and thus were to a greater extent fluid and unstable in form, characterised by multiplicity, inauthenticity (their authors or authorised transmitters remained anonymous), lack of unity, constant mobility and variability due to their numerous reiterations by professional and amateur storytellers. An oral tradition, especially of popular narratives, communicated by the performer's voice, as often stated by Zumthor, by nature belongs to the "domain of the variant": "La tradition, quand la voix en est l'instrument, est ainsi, par nature, le domaine de la variante: de ce que, dans plusieurs ouvrages, j'ai nommé la <u>mouvance</u> des textes." (Zumthor 1984; 160) The <u>Nights</u>, though recorded in manuscript form, actively circulated in a plethora of forms as spoken word, as "verbe vivant" (Khawam), as "parole vive" (Zumthor). Many scholars have described the oral recitation of popular narratives in Arab culture. D. Pinault summarises M. Mahdi's 1974 article, "Aspects of Recitation and Orality in Sources of the <u>1001 Nights</u>" (3), which recounts the oral transmission and reworking of the stories:

In Mahdi's view, the individual  $r\bar{a}w\bar{i}$  or storyteller composed his own independent version of given AL [Alf layla wa-layla] tales; such versions were passed on through an isnād or "chain of transmission" of storytellers who heard and in turn recited a given version of the AL. And as each apprentice  $r\bar{a}w\bar{i}$  learned the tales from his instructor, he would modify plot, characterization, and wording to suit a given audience during a given performance. Thus the highly oral, highly recitative nature of the AL would account in Mahdi's view for the numerous discrepancies among the MSS [manuscripts] in their varying versions of the same story. Hence, Mahdi argues (...) each MS is a reflection of independent storytellers' recitations, of distinct isnāds of rāwīs transmitting their own separate versions of the tales. (Pinault 1986: 29-30)

Other accounts of the oral delivery of Arabic popular narrative set the scene for an oral performance probably analogous to the recitations of the <u>1001</u> <u>Nights</u>. Despite the length of the following passages, the detail and information they give of the production and reception of popular narratives provide a historical understanding of the <u>Nights</u>' probable discursive context:

Nulle civilisation n'a cultivé avec plus de passion que les Musulmans du Moyen Âge l'art de conter et de rapporter des anecdotes. (...) Installés sur la place publique ou dans l'enceinte des mosquées, ils [les anecdotiers] débitaient pendant des heures, devant un public attentif, des historiettes

<sup>3. &</sup>quot;Mazāhir al-riwāyah wa-al-mushāfahah fī usūl Alf laylah wa-laylah," <u>Majallat</u> <u>Ma'had al-Makhtūtāt al-'Arabiyyah</u> 20 (1974): 125-44.

qui, aux Xe et XIe siècles, étaient surtout humoristiques, et, aux XIIe et XIIIe siècles, le plus souvent pornographiques. Ces <u>hadits</u>, ou anecdotes, mimées d'une manière très expressive et avec un art réel, faisaient les délices du public. L'anecdotier entrait tour à tour dans la peau de chacun de ses personnages et mimait avec beaucoup de brio sentiments et passions. Parfois ils se mettaient à deux et échangeaient, à la grande joie des badauds, d'irrésistibles dialogues. Certains jours ils donnaient une séance plus importante dans un cabaret. Selon que les auditeurs étaient <u>assis</u> ou <u>debout</u>, on appelait ces représentations des <u>maglis</u> ou des <u>maqamahs</u>. Leur répertoire, très élaboré, était surtout comique; cependant leurs discours, d'une forme très soignée, s'émaillaient de citations classiques et poétiques. (Mazahéri 1951: 178)

...les conteurs populaires professionnels (...) constituaient, jusqu'à une époque encore toute récente, un corps de métier fort bien implanté dans les villes arabes d'Orient. Il s'agit donc, fondamentalement, d'une littérature orale, en ce sens du moins qu'elle est conçue pour être racontée par un professionnel à un auditoire sinon illettré, du moins relativement étranger à la culture savante. Le plus souvent, cet auditoire était constitué par les "clubs d'hommes" qu'étaient (et que sont encore pour une large part) les cafés des quartiers populaires.

Chaque café avait en principe son conteur attitré qui s'y produisait chaque jour, entre l'appel à la prière du soleil couchant et celui de la nuit tombée. Le <u>Dictionnaire des Métiers de Damas</u>, qui date du début de ce siècle, précise que sa rétribution, versée par le cafetier, était égale à la moitié du bénéfice réalisé par celui-ci dans la soirée: ce qui montre bien à quel point le conteur était un élément essentiel à la bonne marche de l'établissement. Le plus souvent, un conteur était spécialisé dans un roman particulier, qu'il racontait sous forme de feuilleton, à raison d'un épisode par jour. (J.-P. Guillaume on the collective translation of the <u>Roman de Baïbars</u>, <u>Actes des</u> troisièmes <u>Assises de la traduction littéraire</u>. <u>Arles 1986</u>, 1987: 81)

As illustrated by these contextual descriptions, the oral recitation of popular narratives such as the <u>Nights</u> presupposes a dynamic interaction --often conflictual-- between the written and the spoken word. At the beginning of his 1984 Arabic edition of the <u>Nights</u>, Mahdi adds to the Galland manuscript the introductory passage to the Shahrāzād frame story of one of the Syrian variants (Arabic manuscript no. 647 A3 of John Ryland's Library, Manchester) which begins with the <u>basmalah</u>, <u>hamdala</u> and an invocation to God, <u>khutba</u>, which also states the contents of the book (4), and ends with the following phrase: التأليف... This reference to the oral performer who is about to undertake the telling of the stories, "the transmitter/author said"-- <u>qāla ar-rāwī şāḥib</u> <u>at-ta'līf</u>--, illustrates the interconnectedness between writing and the oral transmission of the narratives. (5) The author of the text is not our absent, disembodied author of modern literature, but the interpreter who is physically present before his audience: "L'interprète (serait-il simple lecteur public) est une présence. Il est, face à un auditoire concret, le «locuteur concret»..." (Zumthor 1987: 79) Just as the medieval manuscript was destined for oral communication, the author of a text was identified as its reciter. Throughout the Shahrāzād frame story of the Galland manuscript edited by Mahdi, narrative segments are introduced by the alternative terms:

the author of the story said (12 times) the author of the chronicle said (once), the transmitter said (twice), or simply, he said (three times). قال ماحب الحديث قال ماحب التأريغ قال الراوي قال

All of these references undeniably refer to the same person, that is the oral performer, as demonstrated by the simultaneous appearance of both expressions, <u>qāla ar-rāwī şāḥib at-ta'līf</u>, at the beginning of the text. The expression the copyist said, which occurs three times in the frame story (Mahdi 1984, vol.1: 59, 63, 66), could possibly refer to a second person, that is the recorder of the stories. (6) However, even if such were the case, it is difficult to establish the

<sup>4. &</sup>quot;It is well-known to any one [sic] familiar with Medieval Arabic texts that the <u>basmalah</u> and <u>hamdala</u> are stereotyped religious formulae that signal the beginning of a formal pronouncement. On the other hand, the passages following, called the <u>khutba</u> in which God is glorified tend to contain the bias of the book." (Ghazoul 1980: 61)

<sup>5. &</sup>quot;Par passage à une valeur métaphorique, le verbe <u>rawâ</u> et le nom <u>râwî</u> expriment la notion d'une transmission toujours orale d'un récit ou d'un poème recueillis aussi par voie orale." (Blachère 1952, vol. 1: 92)

<sup>6.</sup> This is P. Molan's theory which is based on similar references to the oral performer--  $q\bar{a}la$ ,  $q\bar{a}la$  ar- $r\bar{a}w\bar{a}$ -- found in the Calcutta II (MacNaghten) edition. According to him, these references are proof that the stories were transcribed by a second party during their oral delivery: "I would argue, therefore, that its use

differences in texture and function of the narrative segments introduced by this expression from the rest of the text. The distinction between the expressions, the transmitter/author of the story/copyist said, is therefore blurred. As many medievalists have remarked, the terms author, reciter, interpreter were hardly differentiated during medieval times ("A l'époque médiévale, on ne distinguait guère entre auteur, écrivain et interprète." Zumthor 1987: 115), just as the written text was rarely conceived as independent and isolated from its oral recitation and reworking:

In a civilization like the Middle Ages, where oral communications enjoyed absolute dominion and where every poetic act spontaneously aimed at taking an oral form, the opposition spoken language-written language became more or less neutralized. (Zumthor 1985: 191)

If written compilations did circulate within the small circle of professional writers, scribes, compilers, reciters, booksellers, for the audience, the stories existed only in an <u>oral-aural</u> form. The written text and its oral performance therefore coexisted in manuscript cultures. One mode of narrative production did not exclude the other, but on the whole one can affirm that medieval popular narrative was <u>alwavs</u> intended for oral performance:

La fixation même, par et dans l'écriture, d'une tradition qui fut orale ne met pas nécessairement fin à celle-ci, ni ne la marginalise à coup sûr. Une symbiose peut s'instaurer, au moins une certaine harmonie: l'oral s'écrit, l'écrit se veut une image de l'oral, de toute manière référence est faite à l'autorité d'une voix. (Zumthor 1984: 95)

An analysis of the textuality of the <u>Nights</u> must therefore presuppose an oral poetics derived from the performance of the text to have been the shaping force of the narratives: "La performance est ainsi à la fois un élément important de la forme, et constitutive de celle-ci. (Zumthor 1982: 388; 1984: 38)"; "...the definite formalization of the text always occurs exclusively in a vocal act." (<u>ibid</u>. 1985: 192)

here  $[q\bar{a}la \text{ and } q\bar{a}la \text{ ar}-r\bar{a}w\bar{i}]$  implies that the MacNaghten text has been taken down from an oral reciter with the scribe inserting the common phrase and reminding us of the tale's oral provenance." (1988: 195)

### Language and critical reception of the 1001 Nights

This interaction between written and oral forms has left its imprint on the language of the <u>Nights</u>. In the introduction to his Arabic edition of the <u>Nights</u> (1984, vol.1: 37-51), Mahdi describes the language of the narratives as a "storytelling language", a middle language or "hybrid" of the spoken and written (7):

وإن لغة الأصل الأول ليست لغة فصحى ولا هي لغة الكلام، وإنما هي لغة الحكاية \_ و هي نرع من (Mahdi 1984, vol.1: 45) (The language of the first source was neither the classical language [fushā] nor the colloquial language, rather it was the language of storytelling, and it was a type of middle language as some have named it...)

ولهذا نجد لغة الكتاب، ككل ما كتب بهذه اللغة الثالثة، تشبة (كذا) المخلوقات المخرافية (Mahdi <u>ibid.</u>, 47) (Pinault's translation: "Therefore we find the language of the book [i.e. G(alland's) (MS], as with everthing written in this "third language", to be like fairy-tale creatures which have as their head a man's head and, for the rest of their body, the body of an animal." 1986: 41)

Earlier in his introduction, Mahdi comments on the "corrupting effect" colloquial Arabic had on <u>fusha</u>, describing it as "one of the diseases which needs treatment" (Pinault's translation, 1986: 40). (8) Despite his rejection of the mother tongue (the Arabic dialects) as inferior and deficient— which he associates with animality in the above quotation— as opposed to the excellence and divine character of <u>fushā</u>— which engages the best of a person's intellectual capacities— (9), Mahdi does have the merit of acknowledging and thereafter preserving the

(Mahdi 1984, vol.1: 37)

<sup>7.</sup> Somekh similarly refers to the narrative prose of the <u>1001 Nights</u> as a semi-classical type. (1981: 194) Connelly also describes the language of popular epic narratives as a middle language, "the popular dialect corrected... so as to approach the Classical idiom." (1986: 8) 8.

وإذ كان أثر لهجات الكلام في الغصحى من الأمراض التي يجب علاجها ... (

<sup>9. &</sup>quot;Thus the learning of the purest language, <u>al-lughat al fușhā</u>, its use in the correct way prescribed by the rules and standards of the 'arabiyya, and the conscious effort by speakers and writers to achieve a linguistic and aesthetic realization of an ideal Arabic, are the most fundamental characteristics of Arabic and Muslim literary history."; "...it ['arabiyya] refers to the ideal Arabic language, fully realized only once in divine revelation." (Cantarino 1975: 11)

strong colloquial component of this "storytelling language" of the <u>Nights</u> when editing the Arabic manuscripts. By reproducing the graphics of the spoken diction found in the Arabic manuscripts (which in <u>fushā</u> standards are grammatically incorrect) and the references to the oral performer, Mahdi chooses to respect the textual specificity of the <u>Nights</u>, their oral provenance: "The true living voice spoke the mother tongue..." (Zumthor 1985: 197).

Mahdi's mixed feelings towards the literary value of the narratives (revealed by the quotation referring to colloquial Arabic as a sickness), did not prevent him from conscientiously preserving the oral character of the Nights. Other critics over the centuries, both Western and Arab, have unfortunately been less open-minded in their judgements of the literary value of the Nights, "recoil[ing] from anything that departed from the Classical canon." (Connelly 1986: 12) As a selection of their comments reveal, they, Hawari, Ibn al-Nadīm, al-Adalbi (sic, read al-Idlibī), Abdel-Halim, condemn the collection for its "poor literary quality",

#### for it not being composed in the language of literature, classical <u>fushā</u> (10):

I should, however, point out that the Arabic text which Galland had translated is written in a notorious hand and in a hopelessly unidiomatic Arabic that is quite unintelligible in some places and unevenly colloquial in countless many others. And yet the difficult, unfinished, sometimes undecipherable, far-from-exact, and sometimes almost illiterate quality of the Arabic did not deter Galland, writing as he was, for a reading public of aristocratic tastes and education. (Hawari 1980: 153);

for its subject-matter which is trivial and obscene rather than profound and morally elevating:

Le Fihrist d'Ibn an-Nadîm consacre la première section de son huitième

<sup>10. &</sup>quot;Theologians-turned-grammarians thus created an official language of letters  $[\underline{fush\bar{a}}]$  as the vehicle of court, state, and religious discourse, and as the poetic idiom of the educated, literate elite. Written discourse was established out of the need to protect the Word of God and his Prophet for the newly expanding nation of Islam." (Connelly 1986: 11)

chapitre à ce qu'il appelle <u>al-asmâr wa l-khurâfât</u>, c'est-à-dire aux contes. Le premier terme désigne les propos et récits que l'on tient ou rapporte au cours de la veillée. Paroles de la nuit, donc. Mais le second terme qualifie non plus une circonstance, déjà indicative, mais un contenu. Khurâfa signifie le délire d'un cerveau troublé ou le radotage d'un vieillard, c'est-à-dire tout ce qui n'a pas de sens. (11) Le mot s'applique aussi aux étranges discours tenus par un certain Khurâfa qui aurait fait d'invraisemblables récits de son séjour mystérieux parmi les démons. D'autres appellations, telle hikâva, ne véhiculent pas ces connotations. Il n'en reste pas moins certain que la culture arabo-islamique a tenu les contes sous surveillance. Elle en fait une littérature pour enfants, ou un exercice de distraction pas toujours recommendable, elle ne les considère jamais comme une partie intégrante d'elle-même. Même de nos jours, dans les universités par exemple, ces textes ne sont pas tenus pour être dignes de l'analyse, et les travaux en arabe qui leur ont été consacrés sont rares. (Bencheikh 1989b: 26)

"A hadith of Khurāfa" is a proverb current on the tongues of the people in ancient and modern times to express any narrative with no truth in it. (MacDonald 1924: 327)

...al-Adalbî [sic] also attacks the <u>AL</u> [<u>Alf layla wa layla</u>] on moral grounds, asserting that it "exceeds all bounds in some of its stories in portraying immorality, debauchery, and perversion." (Pinault's commentary on Iflah 'Umar al-Adalbî's [sic] evaluation of the <u>Nights</u> in his work <u>Nazrah fî</u> <u>adabinā al-sha'bî</u> (12), "A Look at Our Folk Literature", 1986: 21);

and for its inferior, redundant style and weak, uneven structure:

Ibn al-Nadīm (987):

و قد رأيته بتمامه دفعات وهو بالحقيقة كتاب غث بارد الحديث translations of Ibn al-Nadîm:

I have seen it complete several times and it is really a worthless book of stupid [literally, frigid] stories. (MacDonald 1924: 366)

I have seen it [the book of the 1001 Nights] in complete form a number of times and it is truly a coarse book, without warmth in telling. (Dodge 1970, vol. 2: 714)

<sup>11.</sup> Blachère gives similar definitions of the <u>samar</u>, "veillée" (737) and <u>khurāfa</u> (741) in his <u>Histoire de la littérature arabe</u>, vol.2, 1956.

<sup>12.</sup> Damascus: Ittihād al-Kuttāb al-'arab, 1974: 45-46.

[I have seen it in its entirety many times and] it is indeed a wretched book, weak of utterance. (Pinault 1986: 10)

Je l'ai maintes fois parcouru entièrement, mais en vérité c'est un livre corrompu de ridicules histoires. (Julia 1935: 22-23)

...et je l'ai vu tout entier à plusieurs reprises. C'est en vérité un livre sans valeur, d'une faiblesse de narration évidente. (Elisséeff 1949: 22)

...les <u>Mille et une nuits</u> ne constituaient aux yeux des Orientaux-- et jusqu'à une époque relativement récente-- qu'un vulgaire ramas d'histoires propres, uniquement, à entretenir les veillées populaires et souvent confondues avec une littérature érotique tenue à l'écart. Racontées la plupart du temps en langue vulgaire, compilées au hasard des soirées du Caire, de Damas ou de Bagdad sur un fond antique indo-persan, déformées par les narrateurs innombrables qui les colportèrent, elles ne sont pas une oeuvre d'art homogène. Aucune de leurs éditions ne peut se vanter d'être complète; et la plupart accusent des différences essentielles dans le style et dans la présentation. (Abdel-Halim 1964: 188-189)

And like Ibn al-Nadīm before him, al-Adalbī [sic] faults the AL [Alf layla wa layla] for its language, in particular for its technique of using repetition in descriptive phrases: "The work has other flaws, too, among which is its abundance of repetition. For the descriptions of splendor, places, and personnages generally resemble each other to a very high degree. Thus most of the beautiful women have faces like the full moon or the radiant sun... Likewise every 'ifrīt has a head like a dome, hands like long posts... All of this-- together with the great quantity of filler-material used to lengthen the story (most of it poetry of poor quality composed by story-tellers)-- generates boredom." (Pinault 1986: 21)

As J.-E. Bencheikh observes in the 1989 introduction to his monograph on medieval Arabic poetics, <u>Poétique arabe</u> (1975), medieval aesthetics was based on "error-analysis" criticism:

Il faut remarquer ici que l'esthétique médiévale a comme instrument de base la recherche de l'erreur. La question première adressée à la poésie n'est pas en quoi est-ce poétique et beau, mais en quoi est-ce incorrect, car l'écart par rapport à la norme admise porte une atteinte irrémédiable à toute beauté possible. (Bencheikh 1989a: XXIII-XXIV)

An aesthetics based on error-analysis dominates even modern evaluations of

the Nights. Added to this error-analysis aesthetics is the question of authenticity

and realism: Did this event really occur? is its account realistic and verifiable? As quoted by Abbott, the <u>khurāfāt</u> genre is condemned by medieval scholars because of its "fictitious" nature: "It comes from Tauhīdī, who, writing in 374/984, characterizes these narratives as «containing unfounded statements, mixed with the impossible, conjoined to the marvelous and the entertaining, and incapable of derivation and verification.»" (1949: 156). In fact, Tauhīdī's condemnation of the <u>khurāfāt</u> genre echoes a long-established disregard and suspicion by the Muslim community of storytelling. The Qur'ān equates the popular genre with the telling of lies, and disuades any believer from being lured and seduced by the poet's words:

The ongoing polemic concerning listening to poetry, music, song, and story which permeates the culture thus seeks to separate the secular, vain arts, which distract ears from God's Word, from the divinely revealed Truth and divinely emanating Sounds. Almost as a leitmotiv, condemnation of vain talk (laghw and lahw al-hadīth) runs through the Muslim Holy Book.(13) (Connelly 1986: 14)

...the Muslim Good Book strongly condemns lies and fictions, and by extension story telling in any form. (ibid.: 15)

The model of a "worthy piece of literature" the above-mentioned commentators of the <u>Nights</u> uphold, explicitly or implicitly, has the following qualities: grammatical correctness, original style, unified structure, completeness (the story/poem is brought to an acceptable and "logical" end), uniqueness (one author one version), etc. A work, such as the <u>1001 Nights</u>, which bears the marks of an oral tradition of composition and transmission, is excluded from the literary canon because it is: vulgar, popular, deformed, redundant, heterogeneous, incomplete, haphazard, etc. Their value-judgements show a total ignorance as to what an oral poetics and its discursive context can be and were in the case of the Nights. They have failed miserably in evaluating the collection on its own terms, which would entail a redefinition of medieval writing and textuality as subordinated to an oral mode of narration, rather than as the negative counterpart

<sup>13.</sup> Connelly lists the following references to "vain talk" in the Qur'ān: 17,64; 23,1-3; 25,72; 28,55; 31,5; 53,60-61.

or artless and uncivilised ancestor of high-lit culture. In fact, this rejection of the <u>Nights</u> as aesthetically inferior is yet another example of the dialectics existing between written and oral modes of expression which belong, in part as argued by B. Connelly in her work on popular Arabic epics, to the ongoing polemics in Arab culture between the "educated elite and uneducated masses": "For the relationship between 'oral' and 'written' is itself part of the cultural polemic that divides the educated elites and the uneducated masses in Arab societies." (1986: 268) The linguistic and literary diglossia we have referred to in our brief survey of the critical reception and biases concerning the "literary value" of the Nights is representative of the cultural and social conflicts in Arab society.

Mahdi's accomplishment of providing the modern Arab reader with a grammatically and ideologically uncensored 1001 Nights, "errors and all", is a feat in itself amidst the flood of prejudices and misconceptions that surround this group of texts. What Mahdi cites in his introduction as the "oral" components of the text cannot, however, possibly constitute an adequate description of a poetics proper to the Nights: a textuality born of oral praxis. His observations concerning the language and textuality of the stories are based on philological comparisons of the different manuscripts. Consequently Mahdi equates the "storytelling" language of the Nights with the lexical and morphological differences between spoken and written Arabic. The major examples he gives of this colloquial influence on the language of the text are the morphological changes of lexical units resulting from the "lax" pronunciation of everyday speech: the medial and final hamzas are replaced by the letter "yā", letters "thā", "dhāl", "zā" are replaced by the easily pronounced "tā", "dāl" and "zā" or "dād", the "tā' marbūtah" is graphically indicated as a "hā" since the final vowel of most words are not voiced in spoken Arabic, the demonstrative pronouns hadha and hadhihi are not always used in accordance with the gender of the noun they modify or are reduced to  $d\bar{a}$  and  $d\bar{i}$ , etc. Our analysis

of the Nights bypasses this philological approach to the stories (14) and focuses on the textual strategies and language as material facts of an oral poetics. Paul Zumthor's redefinition of medieval textuality and his comprehensive description of an oral poetics pave the way to a better understanding of medieval works and consequently constitute the backbone of our analysis of a poetics specific to the Nights.

## Textuality of the 1001 Nights

Mahdi's assessment of the language of the <u>Nights'</u> manuscripts as a hybrid of spoken and written Arabic corresponds to Zumthor's definition of mixed orality. Zumthor, the renowed European medievalist who has been actively researching and publishing for now almost five decades, describes the manuscript culture in his "typology of orality" as functioning in a mixed orality:

...une oralité coexistant avec l'écriture et qui, selon le mode de cette coexistence, peut fonctionner de deux manières: soit comme oralité <u>mixte</u>, quand l'influence de l'écrit y demeure externe, partielle et retardée... (Zumthor 1983: 36; 1984: 49).

Up until now, we have used the term "text" to refer to medieval manuscripts. Zumthor reminds us, however, that the text of our highly literate, "literature" culture is far removed from a medieval textuality. Repeatedly throughout his writings, Zumthor criticises the syncretic expressions, "oral literature", "medieval literature" which obscure the fact that early manuscript

<sup>14.</sup> We do not wish to belittle Mahdi's great accomplishment of editing the sometimes indecipherable text of the Galland manuscript and its sister texts. Without his work, we would neither have access to the oldest known source of the Nights, which brings us closer to an oral poetics less influenced by literate handling, nor would we have been able to study Galland's and Khawam's translations without the comparison of source and target texts made materially and physically possible by Mahdi's edition. The philological study of a text and its variants is the determining factor in preparing a printed edition. However, problems encountered in translating the Nights are not centered on philological issues, but rather stem from the poetics of the text, that is how parts of texts (textemes) are organised and structured according to an oral mode of narration which, as the translations demonstrate, is not easily transferable to a target culture dominated by a tradition of written, literary texts.

cultures were immersed in an all-encompassing orality (15):

The Middle Ages before the fifteenth century was certainly aware of "literature", but its experience of it remained marginal for quite a long time. At no moment was its culture saturated by "literature". (Zumthor 1985: 191)

Philological prudence withstanding, I think however that I can present a priori the hypothesis that every tenth, eleventh and twelfth century text and for large part thirteenth and fourteenth century text was conveyed by the human voice, that is to say in concrete terms by the individual voice whose action was accompanied, naturally, by body movements (in accordance to [sic] the physiological chain of events). (ibid.: 195)

"Literature", in modern terms, refers to a <u>written</u> work, produced by an individual author, stable in form, and destined for individual reading. (16) It is thus historically foreign to the moving body of popular narratives, constantly changing in matter and form, and destined for a collective "hearing". In fact Zumthor situates the greatest difference between modern and medieval textuality in their reception: "L'opposition la plus radicale se manifeste dans la réception: perception visuelle-- différée-- d'un graphisme, ou audition toute présente." (Zumthor 1984: 50) The textual strategies, "internal economy" and grammar (Zumthor, <u>ibid</u>.) of medieval narrative are shaped by the "vocal transit" of the stories, and therefore the term "literature" is historically inappropriate to refer to a group of texts composed with the intention of being communicated orally:

Ainsi l'application naïve de notions empruntées, comme celle d'"écriture", conduisit ces dernières années plus d'un médiéviste à dénaturer en toute bonne foi, sinon à caricaturer, l'objet qu'il entendait saisir. (...) Autre

<sup>15.</sup> Zumthor's chronological observations and speculations regarding medieval textuality apply to a European time-frame, and therefore do not correspond to an Arab chronology of the Middle Ages. Nonetheless, Zumthor's general observations about medieval textuality and poetics have proven indispensable in our evaluation of the Nights' status as an orally composed and destined text.

<sup>16.</sup> In the conclusion to his 1987 monograph, <u>La Lettre et la voix de la</u> <u>"littérature" médiévale</u>, Zumthor gives a historical breakdown of the word "literature" (pp. 312-315) in order to show that, despite its multiple meanings and applications, it still remains inadequate to describe the poetics of the medieval work.

exemple: les distortions qui, pour nous, affaiblissent la valeur de l'héritage érudit légué par nos devanciers découlent pour une part de l'idée même qu'ils conçurent, d'une "littérature médiévale"-- désignant d'un terme dérivé de <u>littera</u> un ensemble de textes dont la transmission fut principalement, il faut insister, orale, fondée sur la proximité de la parole, indétachable de son lieu et du corps dont elle émane, non moins que de ceux qui l'entendent, le long d'une durée intermittente, d'un temps troué où périodiquement se reforme un sens jamais identique à soi. (Zumthor 1980: 30)

...ce transit vocal n'a pas été aléatoire, mais il constituait l'une des finalités des textes. Telle est la raison même pour laquelle, à propos de ceux-ci, j'évite autant que possible l'emploi du qualificatif <u>littéraires</u>, et lui préfère <u>poétiques</u>, moins historiquement marqué. (Zumthor 1984: 37; 1985: 195)

Likewise, W. Ong calls into question the inherent contradiction of the expression oral/medieval literature:

We (those who read texts such as this) are for the most part so resolutely literate that we seldom feel comfortable with a situation in which verbalization is so little thing-like as it is in oral tradition. As a result--though at a slightly reduced frequency now-- scholarship in the past has generated such monstrous concepts as "oral literature". This strictly preposterous term remains in circulation today even among scholars now more and more actively aware how embarrassingly it reveals our inability to represent to our minds a heritage of verbally organized materials except as some variant of writing, even when they have nothing to do with writing at all. (Ong 1982: 11)

Thinking of oral tradition or a heritage of oral performance, genres and styles as "oral literature" is rather like thinking of horses as automobiles without wheels. (Ong ibid., 12)

As with the writings of Meschonnic previously discussed in Chapter 1 (in particular pp. 17-19), Zumthor impresses on the reader that textual practice is not a given universal, and therefore must be historically reconstructed. This reconstruction, at the same time, is filtered by our experience as modern readers of literature which inevitably hinders us from experiencing the medieval work on its own terms. As reader and, in the context of the present research, as translator, it is imperative to redefine both "writing" and "text" at different moments of history so that the encounter between two histories and poetics eventually leads to the cultural distancing from one's own values and presuppositions about literature and results in a "truer" picture of how the medieval work functioned in its own social context, and how it could function more authentically in ours. The critical blindspot the medievalist is subject to in working with manuscripts is that he/she can only experience visually what was meant to be experienced on an oral-aural and even tactile level: "il [le médiéviste] ne peut saisir in situ la performance" (1984: 38); "il enregistre des yeux ce qui fut destiné à une perception conjointe de l'ouie, de la vue, du toucher même-- à une cénesthésie." (1987: 246) Zumthor underlines the fact that medieval poetic language always includes a performative aspect which the critic should not overlook in his/her interaction with the text. In order to reconstruct the medieval work in its fullest terms, the critic therefore should attempt to salvage the remnants of the performance, of the long lost voice of the oral performer. Likewise, the modern translator who decides to translate a medieval text of mixed orality such as the 1001 Nights, should tune his/her ear to the traces of the performing voice, much in the same manner as the medievalist who studies and edits manuscripts of early medieval times:

Autant que dominer les techniques de la philologie et de l'analyse textuelle, la tâche idéale du médiéviste serait de se convaincre des valeurs incomparables de la voix: d'y sensibiliser son attention... Cette exigence me paraît fondamentale, du fait même que... ce que l'on peut dire de l'oral constitue le point de départ et d'arrivée de ce que l'on dira de l'écriture, et non l'inverse. (Zumthor 1984: 72)

The point of departure for a poetics of translation and a poetics of the voice, as defined respectively by Meschonnic and Zumthor, is the listening to/for the traces of the performing voice:

Traduire... doit être un acte poétique, une écoute particulière. Cette écoute est le principe de traduction du rythme comme signifiance et signification, dans sa traduction textuelle... (Meschonnic 1973: 451)

Chaque texte en cela demeure incomparable et exige une écoute singulière: il comporte ses propres <u>indices d'oralité</u>... (Zumthor 1987: 37)

It follows that the initial question to be addressed when defining medieval textuality is: "what was the role of the voice in each class of texts--if not in each

text and in each performance?" (Zumthor 1985: 195) However this question is not easily answered for the medieval manuscript is only a faint echo of its initial form, and this "voicelessness" increases with editions which impose on the text modern punctuation, typographical presentation and divisions, and which are composite (fabricated) texts of more than one variant: "...nos textes ne nous livrent qu'une forme vide et sans doute profondément <u>altérée</u> de ce qui fut, dans un autre contexte sensori-moteur, parole pleine." (Zumthor 1984: 68)

## Importance of Mahdi's Arabic edition of the 1001 Nights

In the description to follow of the oral components of the <u>Nights</u>, we use as our reference-text Mahdi's edition. As previously mentioned in our introduction, he has edited the oldest known manuscript of the stories and its variants:

By publishing a critical edition of this text [Galland's manuscript], Mahdi has made available the earliest substantial Arabic MS of <u>AL</u> [<u>Alf layla wa</u> <u>layla</u>]. (Pinault 1986: 32)

...ils [the two volumes of Mahdi's edition] ont l'immense mérite de nous livrer enfin le texte le plus ancien des mss. des <u>Nuits</u>, celui de Galland." (Coussonnet 1987: 352)

Unlike other editors of the Arabic Nights, Mahdi did not make unwarranted additions to the text, replace colloquial by written diction and suppress references to the oral performer. He also did not present his edition as a unified whole, but clearly indicated in the margins the source texts of the variants he incorporated into Galland's manuscript. The Galland manuscript predates the manuscripts of the 19th-century editions of Būlāq and Calcutta II by four centuries. (17) Thus, it is closer to an oral tradition of storytelling. (18) It forms the oldest nucleus of

<sup>17.</sup> The Habicht edition (1824-1843) for the first 282 nights is almost identical, except for the odd word, to Mahdi's edition which confirms previous hypotheses that it is based, in part, on Galland's manuscript.

<sup>18.</sup> The numerous references made to the oral performer throughout the Galland manuscript, as earlier mentioned, suggest that this version of the <u>Nights</u> is closer to an oral mode of composition and transmission. In Molan's opinion, these references to the narrator/transmitter of the stories are a sure sign of the oral origin as opposed to a popular literary composition of the <u>Nights</u>. In comparing the Calcutta II and Būlāq editions, Molan finds that all references to the oral

stories (282 nights), 10 cycles which resemble the Shahrāzād frame story in theme and structure:

Thus it is not surprising if the tales in G[alland's manuscript] bear a close structural relation to the frame-tale, for, as Zotenberg demonstrated, these tales were allied with the frame from very early on. (...) One notes, in fact, as one reads through the B[ $\bar{u}$ laq] and MN [Calcutta II] editions of the AL [Alf layla wa layla], that as the narrative moves away from the initial G-core [the first 282 nights], the relation to the outer frame becomes more and more attenuated, and the reference to Shahrāzād and Shāhrayār become increasingly perfunctory. (Pinault 1986: 26)

In comparison to its 19th-century counterparts, the Galland manuscript has undergone the least amount of changes. It does not contain the later additions of the 18th-century manuscripts (the source texts of the 19th-century editions) which incorporated stories from different and later collections in order to attain the number of nights (1001) mentioned in the title. (19) It is for the above

19. "This means that not only these four printings [Calcutta I (1814-1818), Breslau-Habicht (1824-1843), Būlāq I (1835) and Calcutta II (1839-1842)], but even the manuscripts they utilized post-dated Antoine Galland's justly famous French translation (1704-1717) by almost a century, if not more. This fact would not be important by itself were it not for the massive evidence that not just the four printings, but also the manuscripts on which they were based were influenced directly or indirectly by Galland's translation. Furthermore, the two most widely used printings, Bulaq I and Calcutta II, were based on manuscripts whose common original was composed by a Cairene scribe in the late eighteenth century in order to satisfy a widespread desire for a 'complete' copy of the <u>1001 Nights</u>: readers had been told by unscrupulous copyists that Galland's translation was incomplete and that the main Arabic manuscript utilized by him contained only half, or one-fourth, of the complete work." (Mahdi 1984, vol.1: v)

performer (except in one instance) have been eradicated from Būlāq. He states that "in the first seventy-five pages of the MacNaghten [Calcutta II] text, thirteen similar examples of this verb <u>qāla</u>" occur. (1988: 195) He therefore concludes that Calcutta II "(and the Egyptian manuscript upon which it is based) stand[s] in fairly close relation to an authentically oral tradition", while, "conversely, the Būlāq edition (and the manuscript tradition upon which it is based)... exhibits the kind of literate handling of folklore...". (1988: 198) If we apply Molan's conclusions to the Galland manuscript, we can assume that this version is shaped even more so by an oral tradition because, for the same stories Molan tabulates, <u>approximately</u> 46 references (as opposed to thirteen) to the oral performer are to be found in Mahdi's edition.

reasons that we decided to analyse the cycle of the "King of China's Hunchback" since it belongs to the oldest core of the stories (nights 102-170). As Khawam observes concerning the translations of the <u>1001 Nights</u>, the farther one strays from the first 282 nights, the less in common the stories have: "...entre les derniers volumes des différentes éditions, il n'y a plus grande-chose à comparer: chacun puise n'importe où...et invente même s'il le faut." (1986-7, vol.4: 10) (20) The Hunchback cycle therefore exists in all of the translations which allows for a comprehensive study of both the English and French traditions.

The 282 nights of the Galland manuscript were not subject to the corrections and abridgements suffered by the same stories of the 19th-century editions. (21) Mahdi's edition of the Galland manuscript therefore remains the least manipulated of the printed Arabic versions of the <u>1001 Nights</u>. The only direct criticism that could be made of Mahdi's edition is that he added modern punctuation to Galland's manuscript. This addition is totally superfluous, and Mahdi uses the punctuation erratically, sometimes chopping up the text, other times leaving it intact. The Arabic text, and the Arabic language in general, do not require the Western system of punctuation--though now incorporated into modern Arabic usage-- since Arabic has a set of particles, notably <u>wa</u> (and), <u>fa</u> (so, then) and <u>thumma</u> (then), which form a "morphologized linkage system" (Sa'adeddin

<sup>20.</sup> One could apply the same criticism to Khawam's fourth volume (1987) which contains stories "translated for the first time into French" and which, according to its translator, constitutes the "authentic" version of the Nights: "...il ait fallu patienter près de trois cents ans-- disons depuis les premiers travaux de Galland, au début du XVIIIe siècle-- pour établir, c'est-à-dire pour retrouver, la version authentique d'une oeuvre qui, tout compte fait, n'attendait que cela." (1986-7, vol.4: 12) Khawam's comments, far from based on any substantial proof or new discovery of yet another manuscript, sound more like a sale's promotion for his fourth volume and remind us of past words of translators of the 1001 Nights who also claimed to have provided their respective publics with the complete, authentic version.

<sup>21. &</sup>quot;In fact, comparison of G[alland's manuscript] with the Egyptian texts suggests that, throughout the first few hundred nights of the <u>AL</u> [Alf layla wa layla],  $B[\bar{u}1\bar{a}q]$  shows more tendency than MN [Calcutta II] to abridge its source manuscript." (Pinault 1987: 133)

1987: 142) in order to mark the logical relations between phrases and sentences. In this sense, it is pleonastic to add a period (.) in order to mark the end of a sentence when the function of the "inter-utterance" (22) particle wa, for example, adequately "activate[s] in the minds of native receivers the concept of terminating a jumla, that is a complete unit of sense." (Sa'adeddin 1987: 144) The incongruity of modern Western punctuation in a medieval Arabic text-- and for that matter in any Arabic text (23)-- shows that Mahdi could not free himself from modern Western textual practices, despite his clearly stated intention of conserving the strong colloquial/oral components of the "storytelling language" of the Nights: "...la matérialité du texte est déjà filtrée. L'orientalisme est une occidentalisation." (Meschonnic 1981: 43) Some readers, however, would argue along the same reasoning as Mahdi himself, that by imposing a modern Western system of punctuation on the text one does not alter to any great extent the rhythm and poetics of the Arabic narratives. Mahdi claims that his intention of punctuating the 1001 Nights remains consistent with the language of the text, its meaning and mode of expression, in that it does not hinder its natural flow and does not cast it in the mould of classical fusha whenever it strays from "proper usage". (24) Nonetheless, as Meschonnic points out in his criticism of modern editing practices, the typographical space of a page (punctuation, chapter divisions, paragraphing, page formatting) is not neutral, rather it is a page in the history of discursive practices: "C'est toujours une poétique qui se montre, qui agit. Il n'y a pas d'espace poétique, typograhique qui soit neutre." (1982a: 307) Punctuation can be used to underline the logic and/or the rhythm of a sentence. Meschonnic argues that punctuation in modern French is dictated by logic rather

<sup>22.</sup> The "inter-utterance" wa acts as a connector between sentences while the "intra-utterance" wa functions somewhat as the conjunction "and" in English. (Sa'adeddin 1987).

<sup>23. &</sup>quot;The adoption of explicitly marked Western punctuation system entails the imposition of drastic changes on Arabic texts, causing a loss in their experiential validity." (Sa'adeddin 1987: 143)
than by rhythm. (25) Therefore by imposing modern punctuation on a 17th-century text, which is of another discursive time and space, one drastically alters the poetics of the text, notably its rhythm:

Plus qu'il se veut moderne, plus le signe rend invisible les ravages qu'il répand. L'établissement des textes anciens est son désastre majeur, son triomphe: la modernisation dans la ponctuation des éditions de Corneille, ou de Saint-Simon, par exemple. Pas un seul des "classique" français n'est lisible dans l'historicité de son rythme. Dans sa poétique. (Meschonnic 1986: 77)

The Arabic linkage system, rather than emphasising the separateness of units of meaning, underlines their relatedness:

...each [particle] is associated to a degree with the concept of utterance-termination. However, in addition the Arabic wa progressively activates in the minds of native Arabic text-users the expectation of a new, yet related, unit of sense. (Sa'adeddin 1987: 144)

In order to highlight what he considered to be the logical relations between sentences, Mahdi added punctuation to a text which, on the contrary, is structured according to the rhythmic grouping of words and units of meaning. Mahdi artificially divided a text which, in the first place, was self-sufficient and functioned according to its own internal rhythmic organisation. The examples of the Nights to be cited in illustration of an oral poetics are for the most part taken from Mahdi's edition; however, the punctuation has been eliminated in light of the above argumentation. If significant variants do occur in the other editions used by the translators, Būlāq, Calcutta II and Habicht, we mention their source and importance in relation to our analysis.

As illustrated by this digression on the hypertextual practice of imposing a foreign model on a culturally and chronologically distinct source text, the reader/translator must be attuned to the historical differences of discursive

<sup>25. &</sup>quot;La ponctuation va du logique au rythmique, les deux pouvant coıncider, ou s'opposer. Dans la ponctuation française moderne, le logique domine le rythmique. Pour une autonomie et une prédominance du rythmique, la poésie a supprimé la ponctuation." (Meschonnic 1982a: 300)

practices which, as we have seen, comprise even the typographical presentation of a text. Such inadvertence to the specific nature of a text, in this instance, to the double alterity-- cultural and poetic-- of the medieval textuality of the Nights, leads to an ethnocentric and hypertextual treatment of the text during the translation process, and to the condonation of such a treatment by critics who take pride in the national achievements of adaptive translations. G. May devotes a recent book, Les Mille et une nuits d'Antoine Galland ou le chef-d'oeuvre invisible (1986), to proving that the inventor and authentic author of the literary masterpiece the 1001 Nights is really Antoine Galland. Unwittingly, in praising Galland's translation, May refers directly to what in fact is the major constraint in translating the 1001 Nights: the confrontation between a modern and medieval textuality, the tension between a written and oral mode of narration:

... cette "autorité littéraire" (...), il est bien évident que c'est Galland qui la confère à l'ouvrage. C'est entre ses mains que, pour la première fois, une collection disparate et encore informe de contes d'origines diverses devient un ensemble homogène marqué de cette unité conceptuelle et stylistique faute de laquelle il n'y a pas de véritable chef-d'oeuvre. La sûreté de jugement de ce grand savant et la délicatesse de son goût, combinées à la connaissance exceptionnelle, en étendue comme en profondeur, qu'il avait de la culture des pays du Proche-Orient, expliquent le choix qu'il sut faire parmi tous les matériaux qui s'offrent à lui, choix dont l'excellence souveraine fut telle qu'il a encore force de loi. (...) C'est aussi grâce au long labeur qui transforma un texte encore pré-littéraire au dire des arabisants, en une oeuvre d'art écrite dans cette prose élégante, à la fois sans apprêt et discrètement aristocratique, qui est l'aboutissement et l'un des plus beaux titres de gloire de la culture louis-quatorzienne finissante, que ces contes au jourd'hui si profondément ancrés dans notre propre culture, sortirent pour la première fois de leur chrysalide folklorique pour devenir les chefsd'oeuvre littéraires qu'ils sont. (May 1986: 99-100)

In all of our readings on the <u>1001 Nights</u>, we have not yet come across such an inflated, fallacious and chauvinistic commentary on the translations. May's depreciative evaluation of the <u>Nights</u>' literary value resembles to a T previously quoted judgements made by Arab commentators. He sets up the same hierarchy between a high literature/literary canon and a low/popular literature: the literary masterpiece is synonymous with "un ensemble homogène marqué de cette unité

64

conceptuelle et stylistique", while the folkloric chrysalis remains a "collection disparate et encore informe de contes d'origines diverses." May commends both the hypertexual treatment of the stories and the ethnocentric ingredient of an assimilating translation such as Galland's. The transformation/deformation of the stories is legitimised by the "literary authority" derived from the innate superiority, May coolly states, of the French classicist model. The adaptive translation does not lead to an exchange between cultures, but to the replacement of one set of literary norms by another, supposedly in the name of the undeniable cultural superiority of the target society. Meschonnic describes ethnocentric and hypertextual translations as "literary" translations (1982a: 59), that is translations which reproduce the source text according to a model already operative in the target literary system. A translation which constitutes an experimental poetics, that is a writing which is transformed through its encounter with the source text, is likely to come closer to producing an adequate translation, a translation which embodies, or at least attempts to embody, the historical specificity of the source text. In regard to the textual specificity of the Nights, an experimental translation would be one which strives to salvage the traces of an oral mode of narration, which May casts aside as insignificant, underdeveloped and "pré-littéraire". In the chapter to follow, we shall commence with the excavation of these traces, relying for the most part on the guidelines provided by Zumthor's redefinition of medieval textuality and Meschonnic's observations concerning the translation of biblical texts and their ensuing poetics.

# Chapter Three: The Oral mode of narration of the <u>1001 Nights</u>

# Medieval textuality as performance

The modern text, because of its distinct conditions of production and reception, has few features in common with the medieval manuscript. Zumthor lists the major differences between a medieval and modern production of texts:

Matériellement, nous avons sous les yeux des "textes" médiévaux. Mais plusieurs facteurs concourent à fournir une définition différente de celle du texte moderne:

--complication de l'acte même d'écriture (faible maniabilité des outils; cherté); (1)

--spécificité des motivations possibles de cet acte (mécénat, commémoration, propagande) et des censures qui s'y opposent ;

--faible fréquence de cet acte; rareté relative du livre, objet de fabrication artisanale, sans doute privé de rentabilité économique ;

--faible diffusion (l'imprimerie ne modifiera sensiblement cet état de choses qu'au XVIe siècle); (2)

--incapacité de lire, pour la plus grande partie du public: soit par manque de livres, soit par analphabétisme ; (3)

<sup>1.</sup> N. Abbott, an experienced palaeographer, also refers to the scarcity and extreme cost of book-production during Arab medieval times in her illuminating article on the fragment of a paper manuscript of the <u>Nights</u>: "Book production of the time was slow and expensive, even when hastily executed by professional scribes from the author's dictation." (1949: 148)

<sup>2.</sup> The greater availability and diffusion of books due to the "printing revolution" occurred at a much later date, the nineteenth century, in the Arab countries. It follows that an oral tradition predominated and was kept alive (and still sporadically thrives in isolated clusters throughout the Arab world, rf. Connelly, 1986) to a much later date than Europe's 16th century.

<sup>3. &</sup>quot;Matériellement, écriture et lecture sont alors-- il faut le rappeler-- des opérations lentes, difficiles, coûteuses et, sans doute, dans la vie d'un individu, meme instruit, loin d'être quotidiennes. Peu d'hommes sont capables, et une infime minorité de femmes... et encore les deux opérations restent-elles distinctes: on peut savoir lire mais non écrire, signer un document mais non le lire. L'écriture ainsi n'est jamais tout à fait autonome: surtout quand elle note la

--consommation auditive de la majorité des textes: par lecteur public interposé, par récitation de mémoire, ou par improvisation orale. (Zumthor 1980: 84)

Based on these details of the discursive context of the medieval manuscript, Zumthor concludes that the medieval work was almost always intended to be communicated orally. Thus, in one form or another, it was linked to the physical presence of both performer and receiver:

...le texte médiéval est beaucoup plus proche du corps de celui qui le performe (auteur, récitant, chanteur) et de celui qui le consomme (auditeur ou lecteur) que ne l'est le texte moderne. Le texte médiéval, beaucoup plus que le texte moderne, est geste, action, chargé d'éléments sensoriels. Sa relation avec l'émetteur et le récepteur est nécessairement autre, et plus concrète. (Zumthor 1980: 84)

Zumthor states that the written text in a manuscript culture, often dictated to the scribe or recorded by him during an oral performance or reiteration, is subordinated to the human voice (4) : "Il est (...) plus juste d'admettre, de façon très générale, que la finalité ultime de l'écriture médiévale est la communication vocale, avec (au moins virtuellement) toutes les stimulations sensorielles qui y sont liées." (1984: 92-93) When speaking of a medieval poetics, Zumthor insists on using the more concrete term "vocality" (la vocalité) rather than the more traditional term "orality" which, he argues, refers to the "historicity of the voice, of its usage" (1984: 37) : "l'oralité est une abstraction, seule la <u>voix</u> est concrète, seule son écoute nous fait toucher aux choses." (ibid., 9) The vocality of a work refers to "la fonction large de la voix, la parole", "la puissance physiologique de la voix", "l'aspect corporel des textes médiévaux, leur mode d'existence en tant qu'objets de perception sensorielle". (1984: 37) The oral communication of the medieval work is therefore more accurately described as the <u>performance</u> of the text : "...je désigne du mot de <u>performance</u> l'action vocale par

langue vulgaire." (Zumthor 1984: 54)

67

<sup>4. &</sup>quot;Les graphies même et leurs altérations semblent bien impliquer que le copiste intériorisait une image sonore plutôt que visuelle des mots qu'il traçait." (Zumthor 1984: 53)

laquelle le texte poétique est transmis à ses destinataires." (1984: 38) Instead of referring to medieval narrative or poetry as a text, Zumthor uses the more global term of work, "oeuvre", which comprises both performance and text:

Je désignerai désormais précisément par le terme <u>oeuvre</u> la totalité des facteurs de la performance-- tout ce qui est poétiquement communiqué, <u>hic et nunc</u>: mots et phrases, sonorités, rythmes, éléments visuels--et par <u>texte</u> la séquence linguistique, mots et phrases, qui constitue l'un de ces facteurs. (1984: 38; 1987: 245)

The medieval work as performance is enacted in the <u>1001 Nights</u>. The oral formula repeated at the beginning and end of each nightly episode sets the scene for the oral delivery of the stories by Shahrāzād. The formula constantly reminds us of the physical presence of the storyteller and of her two listeners, King Shāhriyār, her husband, and Dīnārzād, her sister. The oral formulae and two notable variants which open and close the nightly episodes of the Hunchback cycle (5) read as follows:

فلما كانت الليله القابله قالت شهرازاد زعمرا (بلغنى) ايها الملك السعيد ان.... (When it was the next night Shahrāzād said: They claim/it has reached me, O fortunate King, that...)

فلما كانت الليله القابله قالت دينارزاد لشهرازاد يا اختاه ان كنتى غير نايمه فحدتينا بحدوته من احاديتك الحسان نقطع بها سهر ليلتنا هده قال الملك وليكن تمام حديت الاحدب الاكدب قالت نعم بلغنى يا ملك الزمان ان... (When it was the next night, Dînārzād said to Shahrāzād: O sister, if you are not tired, tell us one of your beautiful stories. We will cut short this night's vigil

with it. The King said: So as to finish the story of the deceiving hunchback (6) She said: Yes. It has reached me, O King of the age, that...)

<sup>5.</sup> Though we have chosen to present only one set of oral formulae, slight variants do occur in the other stories of the Galland manuscript.

<sup>6.</sup> This translation of the rhyming epithet, <u>al-ahdab al-akdab</u> does not adequately render the phonetic effect and compactness of the Arabic expression. An adequate translation is quite impossible in English; however in French, Khawam found a satisfactory substitute, "le bouffon bossu" (1986), which, though it is not a "literal translation" as his 1965 rendition, "le bossu menteur", does reproduce the succinctness of the original and replaces the rhyme with an alliteration. His translation is acceptable for the hunchback is the king's jester.

وادرك شهرازاد الصبح فسكتت عن الحديت فقالت دينارزاد لاختها ما اطيب حديتك واغربه قالت اين هذا مما احدتكم به في الليله القابله ان عشت وابقاني الملك

(Morning overtook Shahrāzād so she stopped talking. Then Dīnārzād said to her sister: How pleasant and wonderful your story is. She replied: This is nothing compared to what I shall tell you the next night if I live and the King spares me)

وادرك شهرازاد الصبح (...) ان عشت وابقانى الملك فقال الملك شاهريار والله لم اقتلها حتى اسمع ما يجرى لملك الصين مع الخياط والحكيم اليهودى والنصرانى والشاهد وتمام حديت المزين (night 159) (Morning overtook Shahrāzād... if I live and the King spares me. Then King Shāhriyār said: By God, I will not kill her until I have heard what happened to the King of China with the tailor, the Jewish doctor, the Christian, the inspector and the rest of the story of the disagreeable barber and his brothers. Then I will kill her like the others.)

These introductory and concluding phrases delimit each episode of the Hunchback cycle. The Hunchback cycle, like the overriding structure of the Nights, also begins with a frame story which introduces twelve connected stories told under the threat of death. Since we had to limit our choice of stories in order to avoid an atomistic type of comparison between the four source texts, we have made the tailor's story (nights 139-151; 169) the object of this chapter because of its central position in the cycle, along with its connected frame story (nights 102-109; 169-170). Here is a summary of the two:

The frame story opens with the encounter of a tailor and a hunchback, the King of China's jester. The tailor offers the hunchback a meal in exchange for entertainment. A large bone concealed in a mouthful of fish presented by the tailor to his guest(7) remains stuck in the hunchback's throat; he chokes to death. The tailor, who does not want to take responsibility for the death, carries the hunchback to the house of the Jewish doctor who in turn, believing himself responsable for the hunchback's death, transfers him to the steward's house, who, thinking he killed the hunchback, conceals the corpse in the marketplace where a drunk Christian broker stumbles across him, and mistaking him for a thief, beats him to the point that he believes he has also killed him. When the Christian broker is about to be hung, each of the assassins, one after the other, comes forward to confess to killing the hunchback. Word having reached the King of this extraordinary affair, he orders the Governor to bring the four murderers and their victim to the

<sup>7.</sup> In Būlāq and Calcutta II, it is the tailor's wife who presents the fatal mouthful to the hunchback.

court. The Governor relates to the King the story of the hunchback's death at the hands of the tailor, Jewish doctor, steward and Christian broker. Each of them is condemned to death unless they can tell a story stranger and more wonderful than that of the hunchback. The four men are threatened by an impending death sentence just as Shahrāzād is. The tailor's story, which is the last to be told, offers the solution to the four men's predicament by introducing the character of the barber, comically known as the Silent one though his chatter never stops and gets other people into trouble. In the conclusion to the cycle, the barber brings the crisis to a happy end when he revives the comatose hunchback.

The Tailor's Story:

The tailor tells of a banquet he attended before meeting the hunchback that same day. At the banquet, a young man with a limp refuses to sit and eat at the same table as one of the guests, the barber. He is on the point of leaving when the other guests implore him to tell his story. He tells of how he was secretly in love with the Qādī's daughter and close to death because of his yearning for her when an old woman visits him, guesses the source of his suffering and offers to act as a messenger between himself and the young woman whom she personally knows. The old woman arranges a meeting for the Friday and the plan is as follows: when the father is attending prayer, the young man will sneak into the young woman's apartment and make his escape before her father's return. Before leaving for his rendez-vous that Friday, the young man decides to cut his hair in order to appear his best for this first encounter with the young woman. A barber comes to his house and spends more time talking than cutting hair so that afternoon prayer is almost terminated. The young man implores him to hurry, though without disclosing his secret plans for fear of the barber's indiscreet tongue. The barber nonetheless suspects the real cause of the young man's impatience and decides to follow him under the pretence of securing his young master's safety. The young man barely introduces himself into the young woman's apartment when her father comes home from prayer. The father scolds and beats two servants, and the barber, mistaking the servants' yelling for his master's, imagines the father is beating the young man. The barber causes an uproar in front of the house and summons the neighbourhood to save the young man. The father steps outside in order to see what the commotion is all about, and the barber accuses him of beating his master who has come to see his daughter. The father, in order to save the reputation of his household, invites the barber in and challenges him to find the young man. The young man, having heard the uproar, conceals himself in a chest in the young woman's room. The barber enters the women's quarters and espies the chest, assumes it to be the hiding place of his young master, hoists it on his back and goes running out of the house. The young man, in the confusion, jumps out of the chest and injures his leg from the fall. The barber not only ruined his amorous projects but also was the cause of his permanent limp. The young man leaves Baghdad and

comes to Basra in order to avoid any further contact with the barber. Destiny has it that after a short time he meets up again with the meddlesome barber at the banquet. The guests are scandalised by the barber's indiscretion and are ready to chase him away when he offers to tell his own story of misfortunes in his defense. However, he ends up telling not only his story but the stories of his six ill-fated brothers. When he finishes, the guests are convinced of his interfering ways and throw him into prison. The tailor thus ends his tale of the young man and the barber.

The Frame Story continued:

The King of China is greatly entertained by the tailor's story and pardons the four men. He requests that the barber be brought before him and is amused by the self-important and smug attitude of the feeble shrivelled old man. The barber, upon seeing the dead hunchback requests that he be told his story. Thus for the third time, the hunchback's story is retold. The barber, suspecting the hunchback to be alive, asks for his bag of instruments. He extracts the bone from the hunchback's throat. The hunchback gasps for air and immediately springs up and runs for his life. The astonished King rewards the four men and the barber whom he keeps as a companion until death tolls its bell.

Given the Russian doll effect of the frame story and the imbedded stories of the Hunchback cycle, the oral formula which introduces Shahrāzād our storyteller is expanded to include a chain of transmitters, resembling the isnād or chain of authorities which guarantees the authenticity of sayings (ahadīth) attributed to the prophet Mohammed:

This painstaking recording of the chain of informants ( $\underline{isn\bar{a}d}$ ) reflects the fact that the book represents a continuing and unbroken oral tradition. The great importance attached to it certainly stems from the fact that the oldest Muslim literary activity centered upon the compilation of the sayings of the Prophet, the genuineness of which had to be attested, and that the form of transmission thus developed had percolated into other fields. (Pedersen 1984: 23)

The chain of transmitters is typical of a society which depends predominantly on an oral transmission/ preservation of knowledge and traditions, the result being that "the mode of presentation of the narrative is not direct, and is sometimes at many removes." (Ghazoul 1980: 74) The longest chain to be found in the tailor's story reads as follows:

بلغنى أيها الملك السعيد أن الخياط قال لملك الصين أن الشاب قال للجماعة أن المزين قال للشاب (Mahdi 1984, vol. 1: 149)

(It has reached me [Shahrāzād], O fortunate King, [Shāhriyār] that the tailor said to the King of China that the young man said to the company that the barber said to the young man : I [the barber]...)

The Hunchback stories, like other cycles of the <u>1001 Nights</u>, end with the authority, be he king or caliph, who orders the stories just related to him be taken down in writing in order to preserve them from the passage of time:

شم أمر ملك الصين أن يورخ قصة هذه المزين والاحدب (Mahdi 1984, vol.1: 379) (Then the King of China ordered the story of this barber and hunchback be recorded in the annals.)

In the frame story to the 1001 Nights we are told that Shahrāzād is knowledgeable, intelligent, wise and a woman of letters who has read many books, literary works, philosophy, medical treatises; she memorised poems, read accounts, learnt the sayings of the people and the maxims of the wise and of kings. (8) It follows that the stories Shahrāzād narrates to the King are taken from her numerous readings. Thus Shahrāzād's storytelling typifies the dialectical relation between oral and written modes of narration. The written word, as the 1001 Nights illustrates, of a manuscript culture is ultimately intended to be communicated by the voice of the oral performer. Each night, Shahrāzād's voice revives the oral tradition of storytelling: "De l'écriture procède l'autorité; mais la voix conserve la véridicité d'une présence irrécusable." (Zumthor 1984: 63) (9) The narratives therefore do not exist independently of their encompassing frame stories: "For the book is not only a story-book, but also, in many respects, a book about story-telling." (Gerhardt 1969: 378) The 1001 Nights thus constitutes the dramatisation of the text as performance, event and act. (Zumthor 1987: 247) To truncate or eliminate the oral foreword and afterword which hem in each episode of events, thus doing away with the presence of Shahrāzād as Galland, Lane, Payne and Khawam did, is to divorce the stories from their oral roots.

 <sup>8.</sup> The Arabic reference reads as follows: قد قرات الكتب والمصنفات والحكمه و كتب (Mahdi 1984, vol.1: 66)
9. "Writing produced authority; however, the voice maintained the authenticity of an undeniable presence." (Zumthor 1985: 198)

# Vocal signals of the medieval text

We have just shown by this first analysis of the Hunchback cycle how the Nights represents the dramatisation of the text as performance. As earlier discussed, Zumthor refers to the medieval manuscript as a "work" (oeuvre) rather than simply as a text, for "the textual" only constitutes the linguistic surface of the manuscript while its form comprises this "surface and all that relates to breathing, sound, gesture, instrumentation and decor" (1985: 195; 1987: 245) Zumthor also refers to this opposition between the surface and the form of the medieval work as the "textual signal system" and the "modal signal system", claiming that the textual dominates the written while the modal dominates the vocal arts. (1985: 194) Zumthor goes on to define this "modal system" as the vocal signals which have left their trace on the surface of the text; he names three types: 1. "the author's interventions (and by implication those of the listener as well)" 2. "the text's rhythmic elements such as versification and the distribution of phonic and narrative units", and 3. "information one possesses of its musical declamation and gestual commentary." (1985: 196) (10) Defining how the modal has influenced the textuality of the Nights comprises therefore a description of the above three elements. We shall first address the issues of authorial intervention, and then the musical and gestual accompaniment of the text. The last section of this chapter will describe the rhythmic components of the narratives.

# 1. Authorial intervention

As previously mentioned, direct references to the presence of the storyteller occur throughout the stories. These phrases are grammatically anomalous to their position in the narrative, and constitute a type of meta-discourse similar to directions one would read in a play. Translators using the Calcutta II and Galland

<sup>10. &</sup>quot;...l'étude des indices vocaux du texte même (...) conduit à interroger, en vue de définir un statut textuel, d'une part, les interventions d'auteurs (et implicitement, d'auditeurs) dans le texte; d'autre part les éléments rythmiques de celui-ci, tels la versification, la distribution des unités narratives, les refrains, en y intégrant si possible le peu que nous savons de sa déclamation musicale, et de son commentaire gestuel." (Zumthor 1984: 26)

texts (all such references having been eliminated from the Būlāq and Habicht editions) did not, however, translate these references to the reciter/transmitter. In addition to these explicit references, the author/reciter intervenes in the story-line in more subtler ways. Zumthor describes a poetics of the voice as the invasion of the grammatical by the corporeal, ("cette ingérence du corporel dans le grammatical" 1987: 182). The physical presence of the oral performer manifests itself by traces of the "phatic function" found in the text, such as : "digressions prospectives, rétrospectives et justicatives, apostrophes, exclamations, questions rhétoriques, passages du <u>il</u>, <u>eux</u>, au <u>je</u> ou <u>vous</u>, usage des présentatifs tels que <u>voyez</u>, <u>écoutez</u>, schématisation descriptive, énumérations," etc. (1987: 135) P. Molan, in his previously cited article, identifies a phrase in the Calcutta II edition he believes to be the reciter addressing his audience as "O sirs", "yā sādah": "The phrase (...) again seems to imply the presence of an audience..." (1988: 197). In the same edition of the Nights, he also encounters a sentence which he assumes refers to the gesturing of the storyteller:

As may readily be seen, the MacNaghten [Calcutta II] text includes, and the Būlāq text suppresses, the phrase "and the signal was thus." [wa-kanāt al-ishāra hākadhā] It seems inescapable that the statement must have been accompanied by the gesture of an oral performer. (1988: 196-197)

We have not yet come across such examples in the Hunchback cycle but have identified instances when the text jumps abruptly from third to first person narration, thus echoing the voice of the oral performer who often impersonates characters he is telling the stories of:

The professional reciter undoubtedly sought to enliven his performance by the use of gesture and changes of voice when, for instance, he impersonated the interlocutors in a dialogue. (Chaytor 1967: 117)

One amusing example occurs in the barber's story of his second brother. (nights 156-158) An old woman invites the second brother to a house where, she assures him, he will experience unimaginable pleasures providing he obeys every whim of the mistress of the house. When the brother agrees to this condition, instead of the narrator, the barber, saying "He said yes", "He followed her", "The old woman said to him", etc., says instead: "I said yes", "I followed her", "The old woman said to me", etc. For a few lines the narrative continues in the voice of the first person and then reverts to the third person as logic requires:

فقلت نعم فمضت العجوز وتبعتها حرما على ما قالت لى فقالت لى العجوز هدى الصبيه التى انت داهب اليها (...) فقال آخى لا أخالف لها أمراً (...) (Mahdi 1984, vol.1: 354-355) (Then I said yes. So the old woman left and I followed her desiring what she had said to me. Then the old woman said to me: "This young woman you are going to ....] Then my brother said: "I will not disobey her in anything.)

This modulation from third to first person occurs once again in the second brother's story told by the barber. At the crucial moment when the naked brother is in hot pursuit of his young hostess, "with yard standing terribly tall" (Burton 1885-86, vol.1: 328), running in and out, in and out of the many rooms, the barber, instead of saying, "My brother ran after her", says, "I ran after her":

وجعلت تدخل من مجلس وتخرج من مجلس وانا اجري خلفها وقد غلب الشوق على اخى و صار زبه (Mahdi 1984, vol.1: 457) (She started going in and out of rooms and I ran after her. Desire had overcome my brother and his cock (11) rose as if he were a madman.)

Unexpectantly the male listener is drawn into the story by the first person narration, and can claim the pronoun "I" in hot pursuit for himself. As Zumthor states, if the object of analysis is the medieval work, the critic (and the translator) must strive to become familiar with the body of the text: "Si l'objet est un texte médiéval, il me faut connaître son corps..." (1980: 90) In this instance, the corporeal does, in a rather dramatic way, invade the grammar of the text and drive it off its normal course. Let us remark, however, that this trace of the performer's voice enacting the characters of the stories is only to be found in Mahdi's edition. It has been corrected in the Habicht text (which, if the reader recalls, is based on the Galland manuscript for the first 282 nights) and eliminated from the Calcutta II and Būlāq printings. Mahdi, as already mentioned, has the

<sup>11. &</sup>quot;Penis" indicated by Wehr's Dictionary as the English equivalent for "zubb" does not adequately render the vulgar register of the Arabic term. We therefore reproduce the translation-- "cock"-- proposed by <u>A Dictionary of Egyptian Arabic</u> (Martin Hinds and El-Said Badawi, Beirut: Librairie du Liban, 1986: 364)

merit of reproducing the so-called errors of the text, thus bringing us closer to the oral form of the <u>Nights</u>.

# 2. Musical declamation and gestual commentary

At the beginning of this chapter, we did supply contextual descriptions of the recitation of popular narratives, be it in the coffee shop or in a public gathering place. The opening passage of the Hunchback cycle includes a brief description of a street performer, the hunchback himself, later identified as the King of China's jester. This vivid description does not occur in any of the translations and is only to be found in Mahdi's edition. Mahdi, for the first four nights of the Hunchback cycle, relies not only on the Galland manuscript to establish the text but also indicates a variant he inserts in square brackets taken from the Vatican manuscript (Codex Vat., ar. 782). We can assume therefore that this description of the hunchback is taken from the Vatican manuscript since it is not found in Galland's translation. Khawam claims to have worked from the oldest known manuscripts of the 1001 Nights, and he does indicate the Vatican manuscript as one of his sources in a footnote to the opening page of his translation of the Hunchback cycle (1986, vol.2: 157). However his translation also does not include the portrait of the hunchback, and we therefore question Khawam's claim to having worked through and included significant passages from other important sources of the Nights. The "missing" passage includes a description of the clothing of the hunchback, and the Galland manuscript like the other Arabic sources, though in less detail, also describes the hunchback as singing and playing a musical instrument. This concrete characterisation of the hunchback does not occur in the Būlāq and Calcutta II editons, which provide the more abstract epithet: "whose sight would make the deceived laugh and dispel grief from the sorrowful". (12) The translation we provide of this epithet does not attempt to reproduce the rhyming prose-- sai, which we will discuss in short-- and the corresponding rhythm of the source text, which would read as follows: rūvatuh tudhik

12. (Calcutta II: 199; Būlāq: 73) رويته تضحك المغبون و تزيل الهم عن المحزون

<u>al-maghbún // wa tuzíl al-hámm / 'an-al-mahzún.(13)</u> Here then is the portrait of the hunchback and the description of his singing and reciting of poetry accompanied by his tambourine playing:

فلقيوا في طريقهم انسان احدب خليع كيس عليه فوقانيه مخروطة الكم بزيق وحافر مصرى بطاروح وزهريه وجبه اخلاطيه وعلى راسه قبع شعط اخضر ابريسم اصفر معقود محشى عنبر (Mahdi 1984, vol.1: 280) والاحدب قصير(...) (They [the tailor and his wife] met a man on their way, a hunchback, depraved and

sly. He had on a long vest with sleeves cone-shaped at the hem, a <u>hāfir maşrī</u> <u>bi-tārūh</u>, a <u>zahriya</u>, and a multicoloured jubbah. (14) On his head was a grey cap with a green silk tassel, and a yellow cloth tied round (15), stuffed with amber. A small hunchback...)

ومعه دف وهر ينقر عليه ويغنى ويرمى زوايد مخارع بدخول وانطباع فلما نظروا اليه قربوا منه وجدوا سكران طافح سكر وقد جعل الدف تحت ابطه وضرب بكفه على كفه فى الايقاع والدخول (Mahdi 1984, vol.1: 280) (He had a tambourine, and while he was hitting it he was singing, projecting, augmenting and improvising the entry [of his words] and making an impression. When they [the tailor and his wife] saw him and drew near to him, they found he was drunk, replete with drunkenness. He put the tambourine under his arm, and clapped his hands to mark the rhythm and entry [of his words]. He was chanting and saying [these] five verses...)

The above passages are difficult to translate for two basic reasons: 1) the

15. This description of the hunchback's headgear is quite condensed due to the two-word rhythmic grouping of its components. Lane's depiction of early 19th-century Egyptian dress corresponds quite closely (except for the colours) to the three basic elements of the hunchback's turban: cap, silk and tied cloth (the amber being a sign of wealth and luxury), and thus assists the modern reader/translator in visualising the scene: "The head-dress consists, first, of a small, close-fitting, cotton cap, which is often changed; next, a <u>tarboosh</u> which is a red cloth cap, also fitting close to the head, with a tassel of dark-blue silk at the crown; lastly, a long piece of white muslin, generally figured, or a Kashmeer shawl, which is wound round the tarboosh. Thus is formed the turban. (...) Their turban ["men of the lower orders"] is generally composed of a white, red, or yellow wollen shawl, or of a piece of coarse cotton or muslin, wound round a tarboosh, under which is a white or brown felt cap..." (1954: 32-33)

<sup>13.</sup> We have used the sign  $\prime$  to indicate an accented syllable and  $\backsim$  to indicate an unaccented one.

<sup>14. &</sup>quot;a long loose outer garment with wide sleeves" (<u>The Collins Concise Dictionary</u> of the English Language, 1988, 2nd ed.); E.W. Lane describes a jubbah in the following terms: "The ordinary outer robe is a long cloth coat, of any colour, (...) the sleeves of which reach not quite to the wrist." (1954: 30)

realia of medieval dress, unfamiliar in part even to the native Arab speaker because of the distance in time and the regionalism of some of the vernacular terms, and 2) the condensed mode of expression, typical of a medieval poetics, which at times is elliptic to the point of obscuring the meaning of the text. The brachylogy and juxtaposition of the enumerations serve the purposes of the rhythmic grouping of words; as we shall see with later examples, the semantics of a medieval text is surbordinated to its rhythmic patterning. Even after consulting the best English/French-Arabic dictionaries (Lane, Dozy, Hava, Wehr, see bibliography) and the Lisan al-'Arab (which is really of no help because it does not include vernacular and regional expressions but indicates the prescribed usage, "le bon usage", of classical, literary Arabic), we were still unable to complete the translation of the hunchback's clothing. The reader/translator is therefore obliged to skim through the many lexicons (some of which are incomplete and idiosyncratic in presentation) of Arabic dialects, first starting with the Iraqi, Syrian and Egyptian dialects, since we know the Nights' manuscripts to have originated in these regions of the Arab world. In Lane, <u>hafir</u>, meaning "the hooves" of a horse, can be "applied to the foot of a man when it is meant to be characterized as ugly" (1984, vol.1: 601). Perhaps then the Arabic text refers to the shoes of the hunchback because the adjective "Egyptian" (masri) which modifies hāfir probably refers to the make or style of the article of clothing. For the remaining terms, our lexical investigations-- and the sky is the limit when it comes to spoken Arabic-- have been to no avail, but the importance of this passage lies elsewhere. The description of the hunchback's clothing is typical, we are told by Mazahéri and Lane, of the bright and multicoloured clothing of street performers, artists and the popular classes (people of a higher social standing wore plain-coloured clothes) :

C'est ainsi qu'antérieurement au XIe siècle les hommes distingués et de noble origine s'habillaient de blanc et de noir; seules les artistes, les chanteurs, les anecdotiers, qui donnaient libre cours à leur fantaisie, ou les esclaves et les paysans portaient des vêtements de couleurs. (Mazahéri 1951: 72)

Zumthor also comments on the eccentricity of the clothing of medieval performers and artists ("l'excentricité vestimentaire des jongleurs" 1987: 280), easily identifiable because of their vivid yellows, greens and reds. Thus the medieval listener, in this opening passage to the Hunchback cycle, most probably recognises the hunchback as a performer/artist of a certain standing because of his clothing, his tambourine, and the detail that his turban is stuffed with amber, a luxury affordable only to the privileged few. It is only when the tailor is about to be hanged for having killed the hunchback (end of night 108) that we find out who the hunchback is, the companion-jester of the King of China: وان الاحدب كان . مناحب ملك الصين ومسخرته... describes how the hunchback uses the tambourine to mark the rhythm of his words. Lane also describes the performances of the coffee shop storyteller (<u>muhaddit</u>) or poet (<u>shā'ir</u>), how he acted out the different characters of the stories and was often accompanied by the rabab, a viol-like one or two-corded instrument, with a sound box and played with a bow. (1954: 370-371; 397-400). In her detailed account of modern Egyptian performances of the popular epic "Sirat Banī Hilāl" (16), Arab Folk Epic and Identity (1986), B. Connelly expands on Lane's description of oral recitals:

The subject matter of these siyar [epic sagas], along with the <u>Alf Layla wa</u> <u>Layla</u> (The Thousand and One Nights), circulated not only in Egypt but throughout the Arab countries, told in varying form and manner by amateurs in Arabian desert tents, in Algerian cafés, on Tunisian street corners, and in Nigerian Shuwa Arab tribal compounds. Professionals in Fez intoned the tales to the rhythm not of the rabāb but of a square tambourine, while Jordanian rabāb minstrels much like those in Egypt sang the Banī Hilāl saga to the troops as recently as the 1950s. One or two <u>hakawātīs</u> (public storytellers) still recite Hilāli stories in Damascus and Baghdad cafés today. (1986: 6)

As Connelly mentions, the rebec poet is also accompanied at times by a

<sup>16. &</sup>quot;...the saga of the adventures of the Hilālī tribe in early centuries of Islam and their migrations, from the eleventh to the thirteenth century, out of Arabia, across North Africa via the Levant and Egypt, to Tunisia and as far south and west as Nigeria." (1986: 23)

fellow musician who plays the tambourine. What is important in regards to the 1001 Nights, is the distinction made by Connelly, and previously by Lane, between the poet ( $sh\bar{a}$ 'ir) and the reciter/narrator ( $r\bar{a}w\bar{i}$ ). The  $sh\bar{a}$ 'ir of the Egyptian tradition of the Banī Hilāl improvises while singing the story (17), while the  $r\bar{a}w\bar{i}$  of the Tunisian tradition narrates the story, his source being a printed version of the saga. In his chapter on "Public Recitations of Romances" (Modern Egyptians), Lane makes a similar distinction between the Abu Zaydiyya and Hilālī poets, and the 'Antariyya reciters who narrated "Sīrat 'Antar" and "Dhāt al-Himma" in the Cairene coffee shops:

There is, in Cairo, a third class of reciters of romances, who are called "Anátireh," or "Antereeyeh"...but they are much less numerous than either of the other two classes before mentioned...They bear the above-mentioned appellation from the chief subject of their recitations, which is the romance of "Antar" ("Seeret Antar"). ( ... ) The reciters of it read it from the book: they chant the poetry; but the prose they read, in the popular manner [vernacular diction]; and they have not the accompaniment of the rabáb. (...) The 'Anátireh also recite from other works than that from which they derive their appellation. All of them, I am told, occasionally relate stories from a romance called "Seeret al Mugáhideen" ("The History of the Warriors"), or, more commonly, "Seeret Delhemeh," or "Zu-l-Himmeh," [sic] from a heroine who is the chief character in the work. A few years since, they frequently recited from the romance of "Seyf Zu-l-Yezen" (vulgarly called "Seyf el-Yezen," and "Seyf El-Yezel,"), a work abounding with tales of wonder; and from "The Thousand and One Nights" ("Elf Leyleh wa-Leyleh"), more commonly known, in our country, by the title of "The Arabian Nights' Entertainments." The great scarcity of copies of these two works is, I believe, the reason why recitations of them are no longer heard: even fragments of them are with difficulty procured; and when a complete copy of "The Thousand and One Nights" is found, the price demanded for it is too great for a reciter to have it in his power to pay. (Lane 1954: 419-420)

The <u>1001 Nights</u> as performed by the Arab <u>rāwī</u> at the beginning of the 19th century was no longer that fluid and living tradition constantly undergoing changes, existing in a plethora of forms which the "Sīrat Banī Hilāl", as

<sup>17. &</sup>quot;...a performance by a <u>shā'ir al-rabāba</u> communicates itself as sung story. The medium for the story is the interaction of the poet's singing voice and the <u>rabāb</u> accompaniment." (Connelly 1986: 69)

documented by Connelly, remains in Egypt until today. However the mode of transmission of the stories, a "chanting [of] their contents in a rhythmic mode" (Connelly 1986: 241), left its mark on the grammar, structure and textual economy of the narratives which we propose to analyse under the general heading of "recurrence".

# 3. Recurrence and rhythmic components of the 1001 Nights

Zumthor identifies recurrence as the third component of a poetics of the voice to have left its trace on the surface of the medieval text: "Créatrice de rythmes, la récurrence-- maîtrisée en vue d'une fin expressive-- fonde le discours poétique." (Zumthor 1987: 225) Recurrence, in all of its manifestations, phonetic, lexical and syntactic, creates the rhythm of the text which in turn, is the organiser of meaning:

Une théorie du rythme est une théorie du sens non parce que le rythme est sens, mais parce que le rythme est en interaction avec le sens. (Meschonnic 1982a: 82)

...le sens est générateur du rythme, autant que le rythme est générateur du sens, tous deux inséparables-- un groupe rythmique est un groupe de sens-- et autant que le sens ne se mesure pas, ne se compte pas, le rythme ne se mesure pas. (ibid.: 215)

It is widely recognised that recurrence is the constant, universal and functional trait of a vocal poetics: as Zumthor sweepingly states: "...trait constatable aussi bien dans l'action des troubadours du XIIe siècle que dans celle de nos chanteurs de rock." (1984: 81) Rhythm is the shaping force and organiser of meaning: this is all the more true of a text, such as the <u>1001 Nights</u>, though now existing in a written form, which bears the eminent traces of an orally composed and conveyed work. As Meschonnic states, the rhythmic grouping of words modulates the meaning of a text. An analysis of rhythm and recurrence constitutes therefore a critical appreciation of the meaning of a text. (18) In the case of the present study, once the critic determines how rhythm shapes the narrative, he/she holds the key to conducting a descriptive analysis of the translations, for, as we have observed from comparing source and target texts, the least adequate of translations (hypertextual and adaptive) are the ones which undo the rhythmic patterning and systematically obliterate the recurrences of the text. On the other hand, a translation which treats rhythm as the major signifier of discourse and takes the rhythmic unit as the basis of the translation unit, constitutes, as reiterated by Meschonnic, a poetic translation which attempts to preserve the specificity/ historicity ("Le rythme est l'inscription d'un sujet dans son histoire." 1982a: 85) of the source text's internal economy and organisation: "Comme la théorie du rythme et la théorie de la traduction, terrains-- et non régions-- d'une même stratégie et d'un même enjeu, ceux d'une critique de l'historicité dans le langage." (Meschonnic 1981: 39)

If recurrence is the universal and constant trait of an oral poetics, some Western authors, in their attempt to define the characteristic traits of the Arabic language, what has been termed the "caractérologie" (Delisle citing J. Darbelnet 1984: 90) of a language, have stated Arabic to be an "oral language" to a greater degree than other languages (!), in the sense that recurrence, phonetic, lexical and syntactic, permeates Arabic even in a written mode of discourse. In his book on modern Arabic, V. Monteil devotes a chapter to the subject of "phraséologie", which he defines as "l'étude du rythme, de la pulsation de la langue." (1960: 269) He proceeds to describe Arabic as an oral language, "langue orale", ideally designed for the vocal arts:

L'arabe est voué à l'insistance, à l'inlassable répétition, où la tradition voit toujours un profit. (...) Il est fait pour l'oreille, pour la diction, la poésie, la récitation, l'orthoépie (<u>tajwid</u>), la lecture à haute voix, l'éloquence, la conférence, le théâtre, la radio. Celle-ci, comme les discours politiques, ne peut que le maintenir dans cette voie. Au fond l'arabe "écrit", c'est surtout

<sup>18. &</sup>quot;Le rythme est la critique du sens. C'est ce qu'il importe d'établir avant de définir le rythme." (Meschonnic 1982a: 67)

une langue orale. (...)

Aussi la phrase arabe procède-t-elle par "percussion". Ce qui explique le rôle, "bien plus légitime et étendu qu'en français", de l'allitération, de l'assonance, de tous ces "jeux de mots" inséparables du génie de la langue, de tous ces faits expressifs au premier rang desquels se trouve le <u>tajnîs</u>. (1960: 269)

In a more sober tone, V. Cantarino also identifies <u>tajnīs</u>, paronomasia, as the determining and intrinsic trait, and not simply the rhetorical device or stylistic feature "added" to the text, of Arabic morphology and syntax:

In all Semitic languages and particularly in Arabic the use of paronomastic expressions is, in comparison with European languages, extremely common and their use goes beyond the field of rhetoric to enter into that of syntax. The paronomastic expressions in the Semitic languages are utilized not only for a rhetorical and stylistic effect, but also to express ideas and aspects even in the simplest manners of speech. Some paronomastic constructions are used merely as the only possibility the language has for certain expressions which it otherwise has no way of stating. In Arabic, there is practically no syntactical relationship between words that do not have a paronomastic counterpart. Naturally, not all are equally common or equally important from the syntactical point of view. (1975a, vol.2: 439)

The abundance of paronomastic constructions in Arabic accounts for recurrences of assonance, alliteration, and contributes to the overall rhythmic patterning of the text. Connelly, in her comments on the ongoing dialectics between oral and written modes of expression in Arab culture, maintains that Classical Arabic, though predominantly a written language, bears the traces of an oral mode of expression: "Classical Arabic written discourse retains in its vivid narrative style the aura of oral speech on the model of the speaking voice contained in the Koran and in early oral poetry." (1986: 249) She states that "Rhyme, rhythm and assonance emerge as central in the oral Koranic recitation." (1986: 14) Therefore the importance of all three, rhyme, rhythm and assonance, in Arabic discursive practices cannot be underestimated since the Qur'ān still remains in the eyes of most Arabs the inimitable model of perfection of Arabic language and literature. As Monteil argues and illustrates with many examples, this "oral style" is still a predominant trait of modern Arabic prose. R. Blachère, commenting on the use of <u>saj</u> or "rhymed prose" (19) in medieval Arabic literature, claims that the formalised and abstract structure of the Arabic language allows for the overall patterning and abundance of rhythm and rhyme:

La naissance et le développement de cette prose [saj] ont sans doute été favorisés par la structure même de l'arabe littéral. Celui-ci, en effet, présente des thèmes morphologiques de même structure syllabique et de rythme identique ou voisin qui fournissent sans peine et en abondance à l'improvisateur, des clausules à rimes fortes et accusées. (1964: 189)

In his work on modern Arabic, J. Stetkevych points out that the Arabic language has often been designated by Arab grammarians and lexicographers as lughat al-ishtiqāq, the "language of derivation", the basis of which is the triliteral verb (20) --there being however a minority of two and four radical verbs-- which is derived from and built upon to form other verbs (21), nouns, adjectives, adverbs, etc., related (more or less) in meaning. The paradigms of the verb "to do", fa'ala, are used as patterns for the building of vocabulary. Derivation is obtained first by modifying the vowelling of the root verb and second by adding prefixes, infixes and suffixes. For example, all active participles, the doers of action, of the simple verb are patterned after  $f\bar{a}$ 'il, that is to say, the first radical receives a long "a" and the second a short "i", thus one who writes (writer) is a kātib, one who kills (killer) is a qātil, etc. The passive participle, the receiver of the action, is patterned after maf'ūl, thus something which is written is maktūb, someone or something which is killed is maqtūl, etc. Verbs are conjugated according to set patterns (to a higher degree than most languages), and nine

<sup>19.</sup> A. Beeston finds this translation unfortunate because "the rhyme is of less importance than the rhythmical and semantic parallelism, and without these two latter features a piece would not be <u>sai</u>." (1970: 113)

<sup>20. &</sup>quot;Arabic verbs are mostly <u>triliteral</u>, that is they are based on roots of three consonants. Thus, the basic meaning of <u>writing</u> is given by the three consonants k-t-b. The basic meaning of <u>killing</u> is expressed by the consonants q-t-1." (Haywood and Nahmad 1962: 94)

<sup>21. &</sup>quot;Although Arabic is poor in tenses, it is rich in <u>derived</u> verb forms which extend or modify the meaning of the root form of the verb, giving many exact shades of meaning." (<u>ibid</u>.: 150)

commonly used derivations of verbs ("with their respective meanings causitive, factitive, reflexive, of mutual action or effect, putative, and so on...". Stetkevych 1970: 14) also follow set paradigms. This sporadic description of Arabic morphology and derivation attempts only to evoke the highly formalised structure of the Arabic language which, because of its morphological system, facilitates the rhyming and rhythmic organisation of words.

The morphological system of derivation of the Arabic language accounts in part for the phonetic recurrence of a text. However, as we now intend to demonstrate, recurrence, at least in the case of the <u>1001 Nights</u>, is not exclusively attributable to Arabic's system of derivation or to the "paronomastic constructions" of its syntax, but is derived from an oral poetics of the medieval work. We have systematically read through the frame story of the Hunchback cycle and the tailor's story in order to select the most representative examples of recurrence, which have been grouped into three categories: phonetic, lexical and syntactic. Of course these three groups do overlap as key sampling from the narratives will demonstrate. Our intention is to make the reader aware of the richness of these narratives due to the effects of recurrence, which, in our opinion, constitute the major translation problem encountered, acknowledged in some cases, ignored in others, by the translators. This listing of and commentary on the recurrences of the text attempts to illustrate the dynamics and complexity of the narratives.

## Phonetic recurrence

Under this title we include paronomasia, isolexism, assonance, alliteration, rhyme, saj<sup>i</sup>, etc. According to <u>Gradus</u>, a dictionary of literary terms and tropes, paronomasia is the "Rapprochement de mots dont le son est à peu près sembable, mais dont le sens est différent." (Dupriez 1977: 332) Monteil reproduces in his <u>L'Arabe moderne</u>, the definition of paronomasia given by the German scholar, H. Reckendorf, who wrote an important treatise on paronomasia in semitic languages, <u>Über Paronomasie in den semitischen Sprachen</u> (Giessen, 1909: 1): "la paronomase est 'un rapport syntaxique entre deux ou plusieurs mots de même racine et de même sens ou de sens apparenté', avec cet exemple allemand: der Fluss fliesst 'le fleuve coule'." (1960: 270) Many of the paronomastic constructions listed by Monteil and Cantarino like the above German example resemble more what has been termed "isolexism by derivation": "L'isolexisme (néol.) est, dans les limites de la phrase, le retour, mais dans des conditions différentes, d'un lexème déjà énoncé."; "isolexisme par dérivation: sous différentes vocables, on a toujours la même lexie." (Dupriez 1977: 266) A favorite paronomastic construction with students and translators of Arabic is the couple verb-adverbial accusative called " المغمول المطلق (al-maf'ūl al-mutlag) 'the absolute accusative', by Arabic المغمول المطلق " grammarians and it is used either (...) 'for strengthening,' or (...) 'for magnifying,' the idea expressed by the verb." (Cantarino 1975a: 444) The absolute accusative occurs frequently in all types of Arabic texts. A simple example taken from Cantarino's selection from modern Arabic authors reads as follows: قهته تهتهة , <u>gahqaha gahqahatan tawilatan</u>. (445) He translates the sentence as "He gave a long laugh.", which is an acceptable English translation that does not, however, convey the pleonastic effect in Arabic, more adequately rendered as "He laughed a long laugh." Here are other examples of the adverbial accusative selected from the Hunchback cycle which we have conveyed in a literal manner close to hyperbole, not always acceptable in English, but adequate in communicating the Arabic construction:

# Example 1:

(Mahdi: 284) (22) تم اخد مطرق غليظ وهمز همزه واحده صار عند الاحدب و ضربه ضربه بحرقه (22) (then he took a stout cudgel, and <u>driving forward with one drive</u>, came at the hunchback and <u>struck</u> him a stinging <u>strike</u>).

#### Example 2:

(Calcutta II: 202; Būlāq: 74, similar phrase) وبقي يلكمه و يخنقه خنقا (and he continued to punch him [the hunchback] and <u>strangle</u> him <u>a strangling</u>, i.e. strangle him with force)

<sup>22.</sup> Remark: The reader will take note that all quotations from the Hunchback cycle are contained in the first volumes of the three Arabic source texts we refer to: Mahdi, Calcutta II and Būlāq.

Example 3:

فلما سمع ملك الصين دلك تعجب غاية العجب (Mahdi: 289; Calcutta II 239 and Būlāq: 77, similar phrases) (when the King of China heard that he <u>wondered</u> with the utmost <u>wonder</u>)

Example 4: (Mahdi: 378) (and he <u>laughed</u> a loud <u>laugh</u> guffawing until he fell backwards)

Example 5: (Būlāq: 105) (Būlāq: 105) (and he <u>laughed</u> a loud <u>laugh</u> until he fell backwards from the force of the <u>laughter</u>)

Example 6: (Calcutta II: 277; Būlāq: 105) (and the hunchback <u>sneezed a sneeze</u>, i.e. sneezed hard)

Example 7: (Calcutta II: 246; Būlāq: 92) (I remained <u>silent</u> for a long <u>silence</u>)

Similar in effect to the adverbial accusative are the many examples of isolexism by derivation to be found in the Arabic narratives. Let us recall that these are acceptable and frequently used constructions in all types of Arabic, unlike a literal translation in English or French which can be criticised as an error in style or grammar, as expressed by a reservation stated in <u>Gradus</u> concerning the "abusive" use of isolexism: "Cependant, l'isolexisme peut aussi n'être qu'une négligence (les skieurs skiaient) ou un moyen facile d'obtenir des <u>tautophonies</u> (un chasseur sachant chasser etc.)." (Dupriez 1977: 267) Our translations of the Arabic are deliberately abusive in some instances in order to reproduce the phonetic recurrence of the Arabic, and when this is not possible, we provide a phonetic transcription so the reader will get a sense of the "tautophonic effect" of the original construction:

Example 8: (Mahdi: 289)

واحكى له حكاية الاحدب من المبتدا الى المنتها

فسكت سكوتا طويلا

(and he <u>narrated the narration</u> of the hunchback from beginning to end.) (23)

Example 9: وراحت ارواحنا (Mahdi: 283) (and we will loose/are lives) (24) Example 10: (Mahdi: 289) انزل الى الوالى وايتى به والغتيل والغاتلين والجميع الى عندى ([The King addresses one of his attendants:] Go down to the governor and bring all, him, the killed one and the killers to me.) Example 11: (Mahdi: 285) یا ستار استرنی (O <u>Veiler</u> [God], <u>veil</u> me) Example 12: (Calcutta II: 201; Būlāg: 74) يا ستار استرنى بسترك الجميل (O <u>Veiler</u>, <u>veil</u> me with your beautiful <u>veil</u>) Example 13: (Mahdi: 335) فانى ضعيف من اتر الضعف (I am weak from the effect of weakness) Example 14: (Mahdi: 342; Calcutta II:244; Būlāq: 92) ما يلهى العقول من اللهو والمضحكة (what of <u>entertainment</u> and laughter <u>entertains</u> the senses ) Example 15: (Calcutta II: 245; Būlāq: 92) فانا أمضى بهذا الأكرام الذي أكرمتنى به (therefore I will leave with this present you have presented me with; Example 16: فلما سمعت دلك ازددت مرضاً حلى مرضى (Mahdi: 332; Calcutta II: 237; Būlāq: 89) (therefore when I heard that I increased sickness on my sickness, i.e. I became even sicker)

Example 17:

<sup>23.</sup> Phrases with the couple "narrate-narration" occur throughout the Hunchback cycle; other examples taken from the frame and tailor's stories are: Calcutta II: 236; Būlāq: 88, 105; Mahdi: 286, 378.

<sup>24.</sup> This clever translation is proposed by Payne (vol.1: 228); the derivation is replaced by an alliteration in English. The same expression, literally "[our] souls will depart" is also found in Calcutta II: 245; Būlāq 92.

(Mahdi: 280)

ووجدوه سكران أطغع سكر (and they found him [the hunchback] <u>drunk</u>, replete with <u>drunkenness</u>)

Example 18:

فحرك المزين راسه وقال والله اذ هذا لعجب عجيه (Calcutta II: 277; Būlāg: 105, similar phrase) (then the barber moved his head and said: by God, this is a wondrous wonder)

Example 19:

وخلم عليه خلعة سنية (...) و رتب له الرواتب (Calcutta II: 278; Būlāq: 106; Mahdi: 379, similar phrase) (and he [the King] honoured him with a dress of honour and appointed him a salary)

Let us recall that the above examples are taken from a total of 18 nights (the frame and tailor's stories of the Hunchback cycle). They have been selected from a pool of examples as the most representative. However, the reader should bear in mind the relative frequency of such constructions in Arabic; many more are therefore to be found in the remaining 264 nights of the collection. Our analysis of recurrence does not attempt to exhaust all the possibilities of the source text, but endeavours to evoke the different levels, from the simplest to the most complex, of an oral poetics, of which phonetic recurrence is the foundation and whose effect is the most difficult to reproduce when translating.

Other examples of paronomasia depend less on derivation than homophony and therefore correspond to the restrictive definition given earlier of paronomasia (Gradus): similar in sound but dissimilar in meaning. The following phonetic recurrences are impossible to translate, we therefore have underlined the elements of the transliteration of the Arabic which constitute the play on words:

Example 20:

فما كفاني اني قتلت مسلم بغير علمي ولا دريت حتى اخد في دمتي مسلم تاني واتحمل دمه في (Mahdi: 287) دمتنى (fa-mā kafānī// anni qatalt muslim bi-ghayr 'ilmī// wa-lā darayt hatta ākhud fī dimmatī muslim tāni// wa-atahammal <u>damah</u> fī <u>dimmatī</u>: then doesn't it suffice that I killed one muslim without my realisation and without knowing (25), that I also burden my <u>conscience</u> with a second muslim, that I bear his <u>blood</u> on my <u>conscience</u>)

Example 21: (Mahdi: 342) (wa ammā z-zabbāl// fa-innah yughanni bi- $\frac{1}{t-t}ar//$  fa yuwaqqifu l-atyar: as for the garbage collector, he sings with the <u>tambourine</u> so that he suspends <u>birds</u> [from their flight])

Example 22: (Mahdi: 329) (fa-nțalaq fī <u>qalbī</u> n-nār// wa-<u>nqalab</u> bughḍu n-nisā'/ bi-l-maḥabbah: then fire burst forth in my <u>heart</u> and my hatred of women <u>turned into</u> love)

Up until now, we have presented examples of phonetic recurrence without demonstrating how assonance and alliteration contribute to the rhythmic patterning of the text and thus to the semantic grouping of words. Obvious examples of the interaction between sound and rhythm is the co-presence of isolexism and <u>saj</u>, "rhymed prose", also designated as "homeoteleuton" and defined in <u>Gradus</u> as "On place à la fin des phrases ou des membres de phrase des mots de même finale." (Dupriez 1977: 232) Blachère provides the following description of <u>saj</u>, "une prose cadencée à clausules rimées":

Sous le nom de <u>saj</u>, les auteurs arabo-musulmans désignent un genre de prose distinct à la fois de la <u>prose libre</u> et de la <u>poésie métrique</u>... Cette prose est caractérisée par l'emploi d'unités rythmiques, en général assez courtes, allant de quatre à huit ou dix syllables, parfois davantage, terminées par une clausule. Ces unités rythmiques sont groupées par séries sur une même rime. Dans ces groupes, chaque unité rythmique ne comporte pas obligatoirement le même nombre de syllables et, en dernière analyse, l'élément essentiel est constitué par la clausule rimée. (1964: 189)

<sup>25. &</sup>quot;Without my realisation and without knowing" is an example of synonymic pairing which is a common trait of Arabic medieval prose. (Somekh 1981) Examples of synonymic pairs are to be found in the Hunchback narratives-- to be discussed shortly--, however, they do not attain the degree of ornamentation and artificiality typical of later medieval prose: "Yet, in the course of the Middle Ages, the language of official, canonical literature acquires a thick façade of artificiality and the author in the late Middle Ages becomes more interested in ornamenting his sentence than in telling a story." (Somekh 1981: 194)

The rhythm characteristic of saj is not to be confused with the metrics of poetry, of which there are sixteen set types in Classical Arabic poetry. As Meschonnic points out, saj defies the Western division of discourse into prose and poetry: "La prose rimée, en arabe, saj, est rythmée, et brouille la bipartition occidentale. (...) La prose rimée peut avoir des parallélismes de mots, de syllabes; des assonances de finales, des rimes, mais non les mètres de la poésie." (1982a: 463) As earlier cited, Beeston maintains that the rhyme of saj is of less importance than its "rhythmic and semantic parallelism" (1970: 113). Even though parallelism (26) does occur in most of the examples we have selected, we do not limit saj to a binary structure and prefer the wider definition of homeoteleuton earlier cited.(27) Isolexism, saj and parallelism are all found in this first example (23) taken from the Būlāq edition of the <u>1001 Nights</u>. After discussing example 23, we will analyse the corresponding passages of the Mahdi and Calcutta II editions (example 24), which are not rhymed prose as such but do receive their rhythmic patterning from the alliteration ending each semantic grouping of words.

# Example 23:

وقال لكل موتة سبب من الاسباب و موتة هذا الاحدب من عجب العجاب يجب ان تؤرخ في (Būlāq: 105) (wa-qāla/ li-kull mawta <u>sabab min al-asbāb</u>// wa-mawtat hadha l-ahdab min <u>'ajab</u> (wa-qāla/ li-kull mawta <u>sabab min al-asbāb</u>// wa-mawtat hadha l-ahdab min <u>'ajab</u> <u>al-'ujāb</u>// yajib/ an tu'arrakha fi <u>s-sijillāt</u>// li-ya'tabira bi-mā madā man <u>huwa āt</u>: and he said: for every death there is a cause among causes and the death of this hunchback is a wonder among wonders, which should be written down in the records so that a moral lesson may be learned from what passed by him who is coming)

The above citation contains in fact two rhymed segments which are divided by the verb <u>yajib</u> ("should"), which phonetically acts as a caesura or counter-accent (Meschonnic 1982a: 254-255), 'ujáb// ýajib, with its corresponding assonance and

<sup>26. &</sup>lt;u>Gradus</u> defines parallelism as: "La correspondance de deux parties de l'énoncé est soulignée au moyen de reprises syntaxiques et rythmiques. Le procédé engendre des phrases ou des groupes binaires..." (Dupriez 1977: 322).

<sup>27. &</sup>lt;u>The Oxford Dictionary of English</u> (1989, vol. 7: 338) also defines homeoteleuton as: "A rhetorical device consisting in the use of a series of words with the same or similar endings."

alliteration. The two isolexisms, sabab min al-asbāb and 'ajab al-'ujāb, constitute the rhyming couple of the first saj' and the endings "āt" of the words as-sijillāt and huwa āt make up the rhyming pair of the second saj'. A strong parallelism of the first saj' is underlined by the repetition of the word "death" (mawta)-- each death/the Hunchback's death--, and the alliteration of the final "bā" creates the semantic/rhythmic grouping of words of the first saj': sabab/asbāb; ahdab/'ajab-'ujāb; yajib. This detailed description of phonetic recurrence attempts to communicate to the reader the complexity and richness of the Arabic text. The corresponding passages in the Mahdi and Calcutta II editions do not contain saj', but the prosodic organisation (28) of the text, i.e. the recurrence of the accented phoneme "bā" at the end of each group of words-- 'ajab/sabab/ahdab/tajib/dahab--accounts for its rhythmic construction:

D'autre part le rythme ne se réduit pas au seul nombre de syllabes d'un groupe rythmique. Il porte autant sur le nombre des accents, sur l'organisation prosodique. (Meschonnic 1982a: 411)

Example 24:

وقال العجب لكل مرتة سبب قصة هذا الاحدب تجب ان تورخ بماء الدهب (Mahdi: 378; Calcutta II: 277) (wa-qāla/ al-'ajab// li-kull mawta sabab// qiṣṣat hada l-aḥdab// tájib/ an tu'arrikha bi-ma' d-dahab: and he said: A wonder! for every death there is a cause; the story of this hunchback should be recorded in golden ink)

Homeoteleuton (especially in cases of enumerations) and <u>saj</u> are interwoven throughout the narratives. The following example taken from the Mahdi and Calcutta II editions derives its alliteration and <u>saj</u> from the personal pronouns (possessive and object) which, in Arabic, are attached to the end of words. Thus the pronomical suffix which is repeated at the end of each rhythmic group, in this case "i" (me/my) and "ak" (you/your), coupled with a similar syllabic

<sup>28.</sup> By prosodic, we are referring to the distribution of vowels and consonants of a text: "l'organisation vocalique et consonantique" (Meschonnic 1982a: 147).

count creates the rhythmic echoing (29) and <u>saj</u> (<u>khabarak</u> and <u>wuşlatak</u>) of the text.

#### Example 25:

فدخلت على عجوز فراتنى فما خفى عليها حالى وجلست عند راسى ولاطفتنى وقالت يا ولدى قل (Mahdi: 329; Calcutta II: 236) (fa-dakhalat 'alay 'ajūz// fa-ra'atni// fa-ma khafā 'alayhā ḥālī// wa-jalasat 'ind ra'sī// wa-lāṭafatnī// wa-qālat/ yā waladī// qul lī khabarak// w-anā akūn sabab waşlatak: then an old woman called on me, she looked at me and my condition did not alarm her and she sat at my head and was complaisant toward me and she said to me: O my child, tell me your affair and I will be your means of contact)

A similar use of the pronominal suffix, in this instance second person feminine singular "ki" (you/your), is integrated into the dialogue (example 26) between the old woman and the adolescent (whom the young man is in love with) in preparation for the monorhymed verse also ending in "ki" (verse 1: yahwākī, verse 2: hawākī, verse 3: lafākī, etc.) and of similar syllabic count which immediately follow the dialogue and are recited by the old woman on behalf of the young man in praise of the adolescent (the pronoun "ki" refers to the adolescent). This example of phonetic recurrence (only found in Mahdi's edition) disproves the criticism often made concerning the poor quality ("simple doggerel") and artificiality of the poetry contained in the Nights; on the contrary, it testifies to the dynamic interplay between verse and narrative of the stories.

### Example 26:

فقالت هر ولدى وكان من ايام قد راكى في الطاقه وانتى تسقى زرعكى وقد نظر وجهكى ومعصمكى فتعلق قلبه بك وهام عشقاً فيكى وهر الدى قال هده الابيات... (fa-qālat/ huwa waladī// wa-kāna min ayām qad <u>ra'āki</u> fī ṭ-ṭāqa// w-intī tasqī <u>zar'akī</u>// wa-qad naẓar <u>wajhakī</u>// wa <u>mi'şamakī</u>// fa-ta'allaq qalbuh <u>bi-ki</u>// wa-hām 'ishqan <u>fī-kī</u>// wa-huwa l-ladī qāla hadihi l-abyāt ...): and she said: He is my son and one day he saw you at the window, and you were watering your plants, and he saw your face and your wrist, and his heart clung to you and he fell passionately in love with you and he is the one who said these verses...)

As previously mentioned, the highly patterned system of derivation of Arabic also accounts for the rhythmic organisation of the text. The following

<sup>29. &</sup>lt;u>Gradus</u> defines "écho rythmique" as: "Le rythme d'un groupe est repris dans le suivant, parfois à plusieurs reprises." (Dupriez 1977: 169)

example relies both on alliteration and the repetition of the same morphological paradigms, the forms  $fa^{(+)}a$  and  $f\bar{a}^{(+)}a$ , both active participles designating occupations. The repetition of proper noun and occupation, with its corresponding alliteration, sets the measure for the following enumeration:

#### Example 27:

ما عندى الاساد، محترمين متل زنتوت الحمامى وصليع الفامى وسلوت الغوال وعكرشه البقال وسعيد الجمال وسويد العتال وحميد الزبال وابو مكارش البلان وقسيم الحارس وكريم السايس (Mahdi: 341; Calcutta II: 244 and Būlāq: 91-91, similar phrases) (mā 'andī illa sāda muḥtaramīn mitla// zantūt al-ḥammāmī// wa-ṣalī' al-fāmī// wa-salwat al-fawwāl// wa-'akrasha al-baqqāl// wa-sa'īd al-jammāl// wa-suwayd al-'attāl// wa-ḥamīd az-zabbāl// wa-abū makārish al-ballān// wa-qasīm al-ḥāris// wa-karīm as-sāyis: I only have honourable guests such as Zantut the bath-keeper, Ṣalī' the roofer (30), Salwat the bean-seller, 'Akrasha the grocer, Sa'īd the camel-driver (31), Suwayd the porter, Ḥamīd the scavenger, Abu Makārish the bathman, Qasīm the watchman, Karīm the groom)

The lexical coupling of the above example is typical of enumerations, in particular the physical portraits of the characters of the stories. Consecutive dyads are often similar in morphological structure and contain alliteration. Here then are a few examples of lexical coupling in character descriptions. The last two rhythmic ensembles of example 28 contain morphological parallelism (fa'il fa'alah) and alliteration, example 29 is an illustration of semantic parallelism coupled with rhyme, typical of saj', and the parallelism of example 30 is also marked by rhyme:

### Example 28:

ودلك سبب دلك المزين الشيخ النحس الأسود الوجه القبيع الفعايل التعيس الحركه القليل البركه (Mahdi: 327–328)

(wa-dalika sabab// dalika l-muzayyin// ash-shaykhu n-naḥs// al-aswadu l-wajh// al-qabīḥu l-fa'āyil// at-ta'īsu l-ḥarakah// al-qalīlu l-barakah: the cause is that barber, an ominous old man, blackened face, vile in deeds, wretched in action, seldom blessed)

Example 29: (Mahdi: 329) (wa-ṭallat min-hā ṣabiyah// ka-anna-hā sh-shamsu l-mudiyyah: a young woman

<sup>30. &</sup>quot;le couvreur": translation suggested by Khawam (1986, vol.2: 264).

<sup>31.</sup> Translation proposed by Payne (278-79).

emerged [from the window] like the radiant sun)

Example 30: راه شيخ كبير قد جاوز تسعين سنه ابيض الدقن والحواجب مقرطم الادان طويل الانف في نفسه

(Mahdi: 378; Calcutta II: 276; Būlāq: 105, similar phrases)

(ra'āh shaykh kabīr// qad jāwaz tis'īn sanah// abyadu d-daqn wa l-ḥawājib// muqartamu l-adān// ṭawīlu l-anf// fī nafsih balhān: he saw an ancient man, more than ninety years old// white of beard and eyebrows, lop-eared (32), long-nosed, and stupid by nature)

The concluding examples of phonetic recurrence rely on parallelism to mark the rhythmic and semantic organisation of the text. We add to the previously stated definition of parallelism (footnote 26) the following qualification:

La reprise est un parallélisme plus poussé mais purement formel. Pour qu'il y ait parallélisme, il suffit que deux objets (ou deux êtres) soient rapprochés avec quelques éléments de syntaxe et de rythme en commun. (Dupriez 1977: 322)

Gradus refers to a more formalised parallelism as "reprise", a type of syntactic repetition defined as follows: "Nous proposons de donner à ce terme [reprise] un sens restreint, celui de répétition, non du lexème, mais de son environnement grammatical: forme et fonction..." (Dupriez 1977: 398) Phonetic recurrence in this case stems from the repetition of syntactic constructions, in example 31, of the pair verb-object/ verb-object pronoun for a total of 5 times; the concluding phrase is marked by the semantic and syntactic parallelism of saj. Sentence 32 exploits Arabic's highly formalised system of derivation, and is a typical example of parallelism based on the repetition of morphological paradigms of the same syllabic count and of almost identical prosodic organisation: maf'ūl (passive participle of the simple verb), the 3rd person feminine singular of the simple verb in the present, <u>fu'alā'u</u> (the broken plural of the form <u>fa'īl</u>), and <u>taf'īl</u> (the verbal noun of the derived verb <u>fa''ala</u>). This ensemble of morphological parallelisms also is terminated by a segment of rhymed prose.

Example 31

<sup>32.</sup> Burton's translation (1885, vol.1: 350)

وقد قرات الكتب ودرستها ومارست الأمور وعرفتها وحفظت العلوم واتقنتها وعلمت الصنعه واحكمتها ودبرت جميع الأشيا وركبتها وانما كان سبيلك ان تحمد الله تعالى على ما اولاك (Mahdi: 336; Calcutta II: 239, similar phrase) (wa-qad qara'tu l-kutub wa darastu-hā// wa-mārastu l-'umūr wa-'araftu-hā// wa-qad qara'tu l-kutub wa darastu-hā// wa-mārastu l-'umūr wa-'araftu-hā// wa-hafiztu l-'ulūm wa-atqantuhā// wa-'alimtu s-san'ah wa-'ahkamtuhā// wa-dabbartu jamī'a l-'ashyā wa-rakibtuhā// wa-innamā kāna sabīluka// an taḥmada l-llāh t'ālā 'alā mā 'awlāk// wa-tashkurahu 'alā mā 'a'tāk : I have read books and studied them, I have experienced many matters and understood them, I have memorised the sciences and mastered them, I have learnt a trade and done well in it, I have planned many things and succeeded in them, your path is only to praise God, may He be exalted, for what He has entrusted you with and thank Him for what He has given you)

### Example 32:

وقال قد بقى لرقت الصلات تلت ساعات محسوبه لا تزيد ولا تنقص محدوده معدوده على ما دكرته العلما وتكلمت فيه الحكما من اصحاب التنجيم والتقريم فقلت له يا هذا بحق الله اسكت عنى فقد والله فتتت كبدى

(Mahdi: 340; Calcutta II: 242 and Būlāq: 91, similar phrases but highly truncated) (wa-qāla/ qad baqiya li-waqti s-salāt talat sā'āt/ mahsubah/ lā tazīd wa-lā tanqus// mahdūdah ma'dūdah// 'alā mā dakarathu l-'ulamā wa-takallamat fī-hi l-hukamā/ min ashābi t-tanjīm wa-t-taqwīm// fa-qult la-hu/ yā hadā bi-haqqi l-llāhi uskut 'annī// fa-qad wa-l-llāhi fattatta kabidī: and he [the barber] said: there remains for the time of prayer three hours as calculated, no more no less, as marked as counted, according to what the learned state and the wise say among astrologers and chronographers. I said to him: By obligation to God man, be quiet, for, by God, you have broken my liver into many pieces)

We have terminated this section on phonetic recurrence with lengthy examples in order to underline the complex and intricate verbal play at work in the narratives otherwise qualified by critics (previously cited) as simple, unrefined, inferior, etc. To counter this impetuous and unfounded judgement of the <u>1001 Nights</u> as literary trivia or trash, we have attempted to communicate to the reader the seriousness of the problem of phonetic recurrence that the text poses to the translator whose intention is to convey the oral poetics of the medieval narrative. Even the most common of expressions, such as the often repeated invocations and exclamations of surprise or entreaty marked by heavy assonance-- i.e. lā hawla wa-lā quwwata illā bi-l-llāhi l-'aliyyi l-'azim  $\forall y \rightarrow \neg$ , or the simplest of constructions-- i.e. the previously quoted example of the hunchback's epithet, <u>al-ahdab al-akdab</u>, Khawam's translation being the most fortunate, "le bossu bouffon" while Burton's being the most unfortunate, "Gobbo Golightly" (1885, vol.1: 351)--, defy the translator's imagination and skills, and the flexibility and receptivity of the target language and culture because of their overall phonetic untranslatability.

# Lexical recurrence

Connelly, in her study of popular Arabic epics, describes the "oral style" of the poet and reciter as "marked by lexical economy and redundancy." (1986: 75) This lexical economy, which consists in the repetition of the same vocables or of entire phrases, runs throughout the narratives of the 1001 Nights, first on the metatextual level as the oral foreword and afterword repeated at the beginning and end of each nightly episode, and as the opening phrase of each night which for the most part is the concluding sentence verbatim of the previous night. The lexical recurrence resulting from the episodic structure of the stories also occurs on the microtextual level through the repetitious use of vocabulary in the narratives, which has led many critics to qualify the Nights as poor and unvaried in style and expression. As we will see shortly, this limited vocabulary is in part related to syntactic repetition which accounts for the "additive and cumulative" style (Connelly 1986: 72) of the stories. Lexical recurrence occurs to an even greater extent in the Hunchback cycle because it plays a role in creating the comic effect of the frame story when the hunchback is killed and disposed of for the umpteenth time:

Example 33:

فمات فحملته تحايلت حتى رميته في دار هذه اليهودي الطبيب وتحايل الطبيب حتى رماه عند الشاهد وتحايل الشاهد حتى رماه في طريق النصراني السمسار (Mahdi: 377; Calucutta II: 276; Būlāq: 105)

(then he [the hunchback] died so I transported him and contrived to throw him into the house of the Jewish doctor and the doctor contrived to throw him into the inspector's house and the inspector contrived to throw him on the path of the Christian broker)

Likewise, when the executioner places the rope around the Christian broker's neck to hang him, each previous would-be assassin-- the inspector, the Jewish doctor and the tailor-- comes forward to take the blame for the huncback's death, and the following sequence is repeated almost word for word concerning each of the assassins:

Example 34: فاخده المشاعلى وجعل الحبل فى رقبه (اليهردى) وادا (بالخياط) قد شق بين الناس وقال للمشاعلى لا تفعل وهدا ما قتله وما قتله الا انا

(Mahdi: 285-6, 286, 287; Calcutta II: 202-203 and Būlāq: 74-75, similar phrases) (then the executioner took him and put the rope around the neck of the Jew and suddenly the tailor broke through the crowd and said to the executioner: Don't do it! This man did not kill him. No one killed him but me)

Lexical recurrence occurs equally at the end of the frame story, when the barber is introduced to the King of China and asks he be told the story of the people assembled. The King of China grants his wish and orders their stories be told:

### Example 35:

فقال الملك اشرحرا للمزين حال هذا الأحدب وما جرى له وقت العشاء وما حكى النصراني وما حكى اليهردي وما حكى الشاهد وما حكى الخياط فحكوا له حكايات الجميع;Būlāq: 105) (Calcutta II: 277

(then the king said: Explain the situation of this hunchback to the barber what happened to him in the evening and what the Christian narrated and what the Jew narrated and what the inspector narrated and what the tailor narrated. Then they narrated all of their stories [narrations])

Once the barber has revived the comatose hunchback, the King of China pardons the supposed assassins and rewards each of then accordingly. The text is again highly repetitious:

#### Example 36:

ثم خلع على اليهودي والنصراني والشاهد كل واحد خلعة سنية وامرهم بالانصراف فانصرفوا ثم اقبل السلطان على الخياط وخلع عليه خلعة سنية وجعله خياطه ورتب له الرواتب واصلع بينه وبين (Calcutta II: 278; Būlāq: 106) الاحدب خلعة سنية مليحة ورتب له الرواتب وجعله نديمه وانعم على المزين (then he bestowed a splendid dress of honour upon each of them, the Jew, the Christian and the inspector and ordered them to leave, so they left; then the sultan approached the tailor and bestowed upon him a splendid dress of honour and made him his tailor and appointed him a salary and made peace between him and the hunchback and he bestowed upon the hunchback a splendid dress of honour and appointed him a salary and made peace between him and the hunchback and he bestowed upon the hunchback a splendid and beautiful dress of honour and appointed him a salary and made him his companion and he conferred favours upon the barber and bestowed upon him a dress of honour and gave him an allowance and made him the barber of the kingdom and his companion)

Lexical recurrence occurs throughout the narratives, however, on a much
smaller scale than the above sampling. Another type of lexical economy is the reiteration of one or two words in a narrative segment, though not to the same degree and redundancy as examples 33 through 36. Here then are a few examples of lexical economy typical of oral narratives:

#### Example 37:

فقلت له عندى خمسة الران طعام وعشر دجاجات مطجنه وخروف شرا فقال احضرهم لى حتى انظر اليهم فامر بعض غلمانى ان يحضر دلك جميعه ويشتريه وياتى به عاجلاً فاتى به عاجلاً فلما عاينه قال يا مرلاى قد حضر الطعام بقى الشراب فقلت له عندى جاوليتين نبيد فقال احضرهم فقلت للغلام احضرهم فلما حضروا (Mahdi: 340; Calcutta II: 243 and Būlāq: 91, similar phrases)

(then I said to him: I have five kinds of dishes, ten cooked chickens, and one roasted lamb. He said: Bring them to me so I may see them. So I ordered one of my servants to bring all of that, to buy it and to come with it at once, so he came with it at once. When he saw it he said: My lord, the food has been brought, there remains the drink. So I said to him: I have two containers of wine. He said: Bring them. So I said to the servant: Bring them, and they were brought)

Example 38:

فلما راى اليهودى ربع دينار أجره فى نزوله من السلم فرح ومن فرحه قام عجل فى الظلام وقال للجاريه أوقدى لى نور ونزل اليهودى فى الظلام عاجلًا فأول ما نزل برجله عتر فى الأحدب فانقلب وتكركب من فوق الى أسغل فأندها اليهودى وصرخ على الجاريه عجلى بالنور فجات الجاريه بالنور فنزل اليهودى إلى الأحدب فوجده قد مات

(Mahdi: 283; Calcutta II: 200 and Būlāq: 74 greatly truncated)

(then when the Jew saw the fee of a quarter dinar for his going down the stairs he rejoiced and because of his rejoicing he stood up in a hurry in the dark and said to the woman-servant: Turn on the light for me; and the Jew descended in the dark, hurrying, and as he began to descend his foot tripped on the hunchback and he was knocked over and he tumbled down from the top to the bottom so he yelled and called the woman-servant: Hurry with the light. So the woman servant came with the light; then the Jew went down to the hunchback and found that he was dead)

Example 39:

وادا بمعلم كبير سمسار السلطان وهو نصرانى وهو ماحب دولاب وهو سكران وكان كما سكر فى بيته وخرج يريد الحمام وقد قال له سكره ان التسبيح قريب (Mahdi: 285; Calcutta II: 201 and Būlāq: 74, greatly truncated)

(and behold there is an important personage, the Sultan's broker, and he is

Christian and he is the owner of a mill (33) and he is drunk and as usual he gets drunk in his house and goes out looking for the bath and his drunkenness tells him that morning prayer is near)

As the reader might have noticed, the never-ending repetition of the verb "to say",  $q\bar{a}la$ , throughout the Arabic narratives poses a problem in English and French which, on the contrary, use alternative terms to refer to the interlocutors of a dialogue. This leads the translators to invent a long chain of substitutes, sometimes highly elaborate and inflated, which we will discuss in Chapter 4.

In his study of the first Arabic translations of European literature, Somekh (1981) identifies three stylistic features imposed on the source texts which were common practices of late medieval Arabic literature: the abundance of rhyming prose, parallelism and synonymic pairing. We have already discussed in some detail the first two, and would like to add to this section on recurrence synonymic pairing as a type of lexical recurrence. Synonymic pairing consists not in repeating the exact same vocables, but in using pairs of words close in meaning in order to convey with insisitence an idea or set up a rhythmic patterning of the text. It occurs frequently throughout the narratives and we have selected the following examples as illustrations:

Example 40:

ان اعجب ما جرا لى واتغق لى البارحه قبل ان اجتمع بهدا الاحدب الاكدب (Mahdi: 327; Calcutta II: 235) (the most wondrous of what happened to me and what befell me yesterday before I met this liar of a hunchback was...)

Example 41: (Calcutta II: 235; Būlāq: 88) (I had left Baghdad and departed from it)

وقد سافرت من بغداد ورحلت منها

Example 42:

يا جماعه جرا لى مع هذا المزين فى بغداد بلدى وهر سبب عرجى وكسر رجلى (Mahdi: 327; Calcutta II: 235; Būlāq: 88) (O company, what happened to me with this barber in Baghdad my country is the cause of my limp, of the breaking of my leg)

<sup>33. &</sup>quot;le propriétaire d'un moulin à eau": Khawam's translation (1986, vol.2: 163)

# Example 43:

(Mahdi: 377) وقال اشتهى ان ابصر هده المزين الصامت وانظر اليه واسمع حديته وكلامه (and he said: I wish to see this barber the Silent One and to look at him and to listen to his story and his words)

Example 44: (Mahdi: 378) (so when the King of China looked at him, he saw an old man)

#### Example 45:

و کلما فی داری من طعام وشراب فهو لك آن آنت انجزت آمری وزینت راسی واخدت شعری (Mahdi: 340) (all the food and drink in my house is yours if you finish my affair, shave my head and cut my hair)

The final example of synonymic pairs is an explicit case of rhythmic patterning due to lexical recurrence. The grouping of words into delimited segments of meaning with similar syllabic count and rhyming endings, as in the last three groups of example 45-- in anta anjazta 'amrī// wa zayyinta ra'sī// wa 'akhadta sha'rī--, testifies to the interdependent relation between the prosodic and rhythmic organisation of a text.

#### Syntactic recurrence

Syntactic recurrence refers to the juxtaposed and coordinated sentence structure of the Arabic text of the <u>1001 Nights</u>. Syntactic juxtaposition, also termed parataxis (34), has been identified by medievalists and other scholars as the determining trait of an oral mode of narration:

...la fréquence de la parataxe caractérise tous les genres oraux, y compris l'épopée. Le registre narratif tend à juxtaposer les éléments sans les subordonner, dans un espace à deux dimensions. (Zumthor 1982: 399; 1984: 85)

In this oral poetry, ideas are linked to each other additively, one juxtaposed to the other coordinately rather than subordinately, paratactically rather

<sup>34. &</sup>quot;Parataxe: Disposer côte à côte deux prépositions...sans marquer le rapport de dépendance qui les unit. (...) Rem[arque] 1 La mise en parataxe consiste essentiellement en un effacement des <u>taxèmes</u>-- par ce terme nous désignons les segments de discours (prépositions, conjonctions, verbe copule, etc.) dont le rôle est d'indiquer le rapport des syntagmes entre eux." (Dupriez 1977: 328)

than hypotactically. (...) The narrative thus proceeds in a serial, adding style-- one element is added to another cumulatively. (Connelly 1986: 72)

We previously mentioned the importance of parataxis in our discussion of the morphologised linkage system of Arabic and the inappropriateness of imposing the Western system of punctuation on the Arabic text which, on the contrary, is self-regulatory and sufficient in establishing logical relations between units of meaning. Here is Sa'adeddin's argument quoted once again, this time in full:

...the inter-utterance wa "and" is satisfying many of the functions of the full stop [of the period]. (...) Both wa and the full stop communicate similar information to the receiver, in so far as they activate in the minds of native receivers the concept of terminating a jumla, that is a complete unit of sense. Thus each is associated to a degree with the concept of utterance-termination. However, in addition the Arabic wa progressively activates in the minds of native Arabic text-users the expectation of a new, yet related, unit of sense. (1987: 144)

Just as paronomasia was signalled as an integral part of Arabic syntax, parataxis could also be equally identified as such. Example 39 is a prime specimen (though one would have to prolong the citation in order to fully appreciate the paratactic structure of the passage) of syntactic juxtaposition where the repetition of the connector wa combined with the relative short segments of meaning (no more than five words) set the rhythm of the text. The translation we gave of this exert) as with most of our other translations, especially evident in the longer examples cited, i.e. examples 35 through 38, deliberately preserved the run-on structure of the Arabic in order to communicate to the reader the paratactic structure of the narratives. Another instance of parataxis is asyndeton (35), found predominantly in the enumerations of character portraits (the hunchback, barber, etc.), and in part attributable to the grammatical

<sup>35. &</sup>quot;Asyndète: Sorte d'ellipse par laquelle on retranche des conjonctions simplement copulatives qui doivent unir les parties dans une phrase. (...) Rem[arque] 2 L'asyndète étant caractérisée par l'absence de conjonction et la virgule, il arrive que rien, sinon le sens, ne permette de distinguer si le premier [sic: deuxième] élément s'ajoute au premier avec la même fonction que lui, où s'il se rapporte à lui par apposition." (Dupriez: 1977: 84)

arrangement of epithets in Arabic: "Where two or more adjectives qualify the same noun it is not necessary to put 'and' between them." (Haywood and Nahmad 1962: 23) Though parataxis is in some instances determined by Arabic syntax, the frequency or absence of syntactic juxtaposition really depends on the nature of the text. Subordination exists amply in all types of Arabic texts, modern and medieval, but in popular narratives, orally composed and destined, subordination is not frequent, and in characterising Arabic texts of an oral mode of narration (as Meschonnic has done with biblical Hebrew, 1981: 36), one could speak of a "paratactic syntax". What is important in this issue is that parataxis, now identified as the source of syntactic recurrence of the Nights, when translated into English is retained for the most part while in the French translations it is eradicated to a greater extent because deemed inappropriate in a written, literary text. Meschonnic makes a similar observation concerning the French translations of biblical texts:

Le transport de la Bible vers le français est une traduction-annexion. La syntaxe paratactique (asyndètes, juxtaposition, coordination) de l'hébreu y devient uniformément une syntaxe de la subordination. Le primat de l'oralité y devient un primat de l'écrit. La rythmique y devient une ponctuation logique, avec les modulations sémantiques, purement interprétatives du <u>et</u> biblique (Meschonnic 1981: 36)

The question to be asked is whether or not a paratactic syntax is functional in French, and if it is, why it remains unacceptable as translating practices have demonstrated. With regards to lexical recurrence and the syntactic juxtaposition of sentences, we are no longer talking about the untranslatability of a text, because the two are more often than not transferable into English and French, rather we are addressing the issue of translation as a tradition, as an acceptable and endorsed system of assimilating texts into one's culture. It would appear that English admits coordination and juxtaposition in sentence structure much more than French; at least this is what J. Delisle tries to convince translation students of when he describes the "characterology" of a language, using English and French as contrastive models. This is how he defines "characterology", i.e. the intrinsic and global traits and characteristics of a language: C'est la façon de camper les idées et de les enchaîner les unes aux autres qui varie d'une langue à l'autre. Les langues diffèrent par le lexique et la syntaxe, et aussi par l'exposition et l'agencement des idées. Il n'est pas rare que des énoncés juxtaposés ou coordonnés en anglais soient mieux traduits s'ils sont subordonnés en français. (Delisle 1981: 198)

Delisle describes French (referring back to the writings of Darbelnet) as having a preference for nominal forms-- "le goût pour les formes substantivées"-and for subordination and articulation-- "goût pour la subordination et l'articulation"-- while English prefers verbal constructions-- "préférence pour les tournures verbales" -- and coordination and juxtaposition-- "prédilection pour la coordination et la juxtaposition". (1984: 90) However, if one examines carefully the utility of such sweeping generalisations, one cannot help but conclude that a prescribed and unique recipe for translating many different types of texts is indeed preposterous. The syntactic organisation of a text is related to and determined by its nature, whether it be a written or verbal communication, and by its historical time and space. If one were to describe the characterology of the Arabic language, one would undoubtedly say that it resembles English as opposed to French based on Delisle's description. However, as C. Duneton points out, spoken French (which he names "popular" French), and pre-18th-century French prefers verbal to nominal constructions:

Cette tendance à l'abstraction nominale me paraît caractériser une langue bien définie, le français officiel, mais ne me semble pas correspondre nécessairement aux besoins fondamentaux d'un langage populaire. Du reste, cette tendance à l'abstraction était infiniment moindre avant le XVIIIe siècle, comme on peut juger à la lecture de Rabelais. (Duneton 1973: 110-111)

...la tendance populaire serait plutôt d'employer des verbes de préférence aux tournures nominales. (ibid.: 114)

Likewise, a literal translation of the Arabic sentence coordinator wa into English would create the effect of a run-on sentence; nonetheless a similar construction, the reiteration of "and" as a sentence coordinator, is typical of spoken English as observed by K. Beaman: This high percentage of coordinate structures in the spoken narratives is attributable largely to a high percentage of occurence of the coordinator and. However, as Kroll says herself, in spoken discourse and (often pronounced [n] or [n]) functions other than simply as a coordinator; primarily, it serves as a filler word, to hold the floor for the speaker to indicate that he or she is about to say something more (Kroll 1977: 95). (Beaman 1984: 47)

Beaman lists the following differences between written and spoken modes of discourse: "written texts are syntactically more complex than spoken because they exhibit a greater number of subordinate structures"; "spoken texts are syntactically simpler... they show a greater reliance on coordinate structures" (45); "the average length of syntactic units in written language is greater than in spoken language"; "[there is] a greater number of dependent clauses in written discourse" (47), etc. Beaman views the two crucial features of discourse as modality, "spokenness or writtenness", and register, "purpose and formality" (51). The <u>1001 Nights</u>, as clearly demonstrated in this chapter, are of a spoken modality and of an informal register, intended for entertainment, destined, at least in their initial stages of composition, to be reiterated and to undergo innumberable changes through oral retellings, and influenced to a limited degree by literary reworking (the Būlāq edition excluded).

We have attempted to show through our analysis of phonetic, lexical and syntactic recurrence that the textual economy, strategies and grammar of the <u>1001</u> <u>Nights</u> is determined by an oral poetics:

La plupart [des] procédés comportent, dans leur mise en oeuvre, quelque règle phonique: la manipulation du donné linguistique contribue à provoquer ou à renforcer la rime, l'allitération, les échos sonores de toute espèce ou, plus généralement, accuse la scansion des rythmes. Lorsqu'ils atteignent une certaine densité, ces jeux influent sur la formation du sens. (Zumthor 1982: 401)

Of the three types of recurrence, phonetic recurrence, which is the major organiser of rhythm in the text as underlined by the above quotation, is by far the most difficult to translate in the target language because of the difference in morphological patterns, and sounds from one language to another. The rhythm of the text is inevitably modified, if not entirely botched because of the undoing of the prosodic organisation of the text. One would therefore assume lexical and syntactic recurrence to have posed less a problem to the translators, however, as sometimes eluded to in this chapter, and as will be confirmed by our discussion of the translations in Chapter 4, recurrence, in all of its manifestations and instances, is the major problem in translating the <u>1001 Nights</u> (though other translation problems will be shown to have existed), because foundational to an oral poetics.

# Chapter Four: Descriptive Analysis

We have detailed in the preceding chapter what an oral poetics could be for a group of narratives which, though intended to be communicated orally, have nonetheless existed and been transmitted in written form over many centuries. This <u>mixed orality</u> of the <u>1001 Nights</u> with its determining trait of recurrence---phonetic, lexical and syntactic--- is the major translation problem which confronts the translator because of his/her bond to a highly literate-literature culture.

In this final chapter, we will bring to a conclusion the three-stage process of DTS (Descriptive Translation Studies) previously announced at the end of Chapter 1, part 2, that is, the selective comparison between source and target texts (stage 2), and the interpretation of the distance (shifts, deviations, deformations) between source/target-text equivalence and the hypothetical AT text described in Chapter 3 (stage 3). We also stated in our conclusion to Chapter 1 that DTS could be used in conjunction with Berman's typology of deformations. Berman's critical apparatus for source/target text comparison allows the critic to situate each translation between the opposite poles of acceptability and adequacy (Toury) in order to arrive at an overall appreciation of each translator's system of transformation/deformation. In this final stage of our research, we find it therefore necessary to momentarily reopen our chapter on translation theory in order to specify the scope and strategies of our own descriptive analysis. The difficulty we experienced in understanding and interpreting the reasons and motivations behind many of the transformations in the Nights' translations has led us to re-evaluate the DTS method and Berman's typology.

The term "deformation" used by Berman presupposes (but also denounces the fact) that translation is never a transparent activity; it always involves a degree of adaptation to one's own literary norms and culture. While keeping in

107

mind the hypothetical AT text reconstructed in Chapter 3 by a description of the oral poetics proper to the Nights, we are able to see how most translators impose on the source text a logic and system of expression totally foreign to the original's. This foreign system of expression corresponds for the most part, as we will soon demonstrate, to Berman's classification of deformations typical of a "Western" practice of translating. However, by relying uniquely on such a typology in order to describe a tradition (or conjoint traditions) of the same source text(s), the critic risks effacing their differences. For example, if one makes a general claim that Galland, Mardrus and Khawam systematically amplify their respective source texts (in contrast to Lane, Payne and Burton) in order to "clarify", "explicate" or "give a certain (exotic) colouring" to the meaning, and "improve" or "highlight" certain stylistic features of a given passage, one has left the qualitative differences of these amplifications, and the functions they serve, unexplained. Though Berman does recognise that a retranslation is more often than not undertaken with the prospects of "correcting" the deficiences or infidelites of its predecessors (1) (thus all prefaces to successive French and English translations of the Nights claim to be utterly faithful, even more faithful than their rivals), his typology privileges the binary relation between source and target text; the many instances of non-coincidence between originals and translations of the Nights therefore remain unexplained by this typology.

By contrast, DTS assumes (and does not denounce the fact) that a translation is always based on a literary model and mode of expression already operative and predominant in the target culture. Moments of non-equivalence are not labelled "deformations" but are designated simply as "transformations". The DTS mandate is to reinsert a given translational activity in its historical context, what the newly-founded journal of translation studies, <u>Target</u>, names the

<sup>1. &</sup>quot;<u>Celui qui re-traduit n'a plus affaire à un</u> seul text, l'original, mais à <u>deux</u>, ou plus... La re-traduction a lieu pour l'original et contre ses traductions existantes. Et l'on peut observer que c'est dans cet espace qu'en général, la traduction a produit ses chefs-d'oeuvre." (Berman 1985: 116)

CONTEXTUALIZATION OF TRANSLATION (1989 (1): 6). Thus the descriptive method is not restricted to the binary relation of source and target text because the "source text is never the sole model on which a translation is based." (Lambert 1989: 155) If we take the "Synthetic Scheme for Translation Description" proposed by Lambert and Van Gorp (1985: 52-53) as a possible framework for DTS, the four levels of analysis postulated are the 1) metatext, also called the "paratext" by other critics-- preface, footnotes, etc.--, the 2) macro-structure (typographical presentation of the text)-- chapter divisions, types of narratives, dialogue, etc,--3) micro-structure-- phonetic, lexical and syntactic components, metre, rhyme, etc-- of the text, and 4) intertextuality and intersystemic relations-- genre structures, stylistic codes, etc. The DTS scheme is offered as a response to the following question: "How has text 1 been translated into text 2, in relation to which other texts?" (Lambert, Van Gorp 1985: 45); its object of analysis is literary interference between cultures and their ensuing poetics, that is the textual practices and intertextual borrowings at work within and surrounding both source and target texts. However, other parameters than those proposed by this "practical model for textual analysis" should be incorporated into DTS. Many transformations/deformations which occur in the Nights' translations have, in certain cases, less to do with literature and its various textual practices and realisations during the translator's time, than with the discursive practices and climate of his/her society, that is how SEX, for example, can be written and spoken about in the public sphere, how the restrictions and rules surrounding this topic-- the "transgression" of which Burton and Mardrus owe their celebrity and longevity to-- have led either to innumerable omissions or amplifications of sexual scenes and allusions to bodily parts/functions in the Nights' translations:

Et il faudrait substituer à la notion de langue cible celle de <u>discours cible</u> pour souligner que la traduction est tributaire d'un discours préconstitué, c'est-à-dire d'un ensemble de systématicités réglées non seulement sur le plan de la langue, mais aussi sur le plan des codes socioculturels forgés par les usagers de ce discours et au nombre desquels figurent les systèmes d'idées et de valeurs. (Brisset 1989: 61)

Though Lambert and Van Gorp clearly state in their 1985 article that it is

not necessarily a model from the literary system of the target culture which has been the shaping force of a translation-- "translations of literary works may also function outside literature" (1985: 44)--, their scheme privileges such an interdependence, and remains within the confines of the all-encompassing notion of intertextuality. What we shall attempt to do on a limited basis is to resituate the literary translation in the larger network of interdiscursivity, i.e. the discursive context of a given society which comprises all the possible stereotypes, topoî, opinions, about a topic or theme, in our case the Western experience and representation of Arab society and culture.

Pour conclure, la comparaison d'un text originel et sa traduction présente un réel intérêt lorsqu'elle se soutient de l'ensemble textuel et discursif où cette traduction vient se placer. (Brisset 1989: 61)

Not all translations of the <u>1001 Nights</u>, however, lend themselves in the same manner to an interdiscursive analysis. Oriental exoticism-- i.e. abundant and licentious sex, spices, silks, incense, decor, etc. (2)-- which the <u>1001 Nights</u> notoriously incarnates for a Western audience to this very day (3)-- belongs very much to Burton's and Mardrus' and to a lesser extent Galland's (the sex excluded) translation systems (4), but is not exploited deliberately by the other translators to promote their work and guarantee its monetary success. By contrast, Lane's and

<sup>2. &</sup>quot;...Oriental clichés: harems, princesses, princes, slaves, veils, dancing girls and boys, sherbets, ointments, and so on." (Saïd 1978: 190)

<sup>3. &</sup>quot;C'est par les <u>Mille et une Nuits</u> ou par les oeuvres qui en sont dérivées que la majorité des images d'Orient ont pénétré dans notre culture." (Abel 1939: 17)

<sup>&</sup>quot;L'image du monde arabe que révèlent les traductions est donc marquée par l'exotisme somptueux, sensuel et naïf des <u>Mille et une nuits</u>. Nous avons noté l'importance numérique des traductions des <u>Mille et une nuits</u> et le voile d'exotisme dont elles ont longtemps recouvert l'image que se faisait le monde latin du monde arabe." (Tomiche 1978: 2; 70)

<sup>4.</sup> As we shall see, Mardrus and Galland amplify their respective source texts in order to augment the elements of Oriental exoticism while Burton's system of translation is "adequate" in that he does not augment the source text; nonetheless, he litters his translation with footnotes and a terminal essay of licentious paraphernalia which feeds off the narratives and into a phantasmagoria of perversions associated with the Orient, having little to do with the narrative events of the different source stories.

Burton's translations, and to a lesser degree Payne's, explicitly announce their discursive affiliation to the field of Oriental studies through their explicative notes and terminal essay (in Payne's and Burton's cases) on Islamic history, beliefs and customs as practiced in the different Arab countries, legitimised by the objective and scrutinising eye of the ethnographer. In the case of Lane and Burton, the Nights' are treated as a type of historical or ethnological document on Arab society, and serve as introductions ("pre-texts") to the translator's own narrative contained in the cumbersome end/footnotes of his many voyages to the Arab world. Thus, the translations of Lane and Burton are to be read in conjunction with their ethnological/travel writings, Lane's Manners and Customs of the Modern Egyptians (1836), and Burton's Personal Narrative of a Pilgrimage to al-Medinah and Meccah (1855-56). Lane constantly makes reference to his Modern Egyptians in the endnotes to his translation, and Burton often refers his reader to his **Pilgrimage** but also to Modern Egyptians for Lane's authoritative statements on Arab culture and society. As for Payne's and Khawam's translations, they do not function within the above discursive contexts, Oriental exoticism and the proto-anthropological study of Arab society and culture. Berman's typology of deformations therefore can account for the majority of transformations in Khawam's translation, and to a lesser degree for the transformations of Payne's translation, since translational norms of 19th-century England (to be described in greater detail shortly) explain the systematic archaism of lexical units and syntactic structures in all of the English translations of the Nights.

Collective norms and individual motivations converge to make up the contextual framework of translations. Translation choices made by the individual no longer appear arbitrary when reunited with the material conditions of production and social context of the translation. It is therefore imperative to resituate a given translation in the discursive context of its mother-culture. The context of the ethno-sociological discourse of the 19th-century Nights' translations can be reconstructed, in part, with reference to E. Saïd's monograph, <u>Orientalism</u>, which traces the evolution and consolidation of the field of Oriental studies in its English, French and American traditions. Marc Angenot's comprehensive study of French social discourse at the end of the 19th century (1889) has proven indispensable in analysing the strategies, acceptability (ideological and aesthetic), "charm" and success of Mardrus' translation. As suggested by our introductory statements to the Nights, a translation bears the marks of a network of constraints and strategies: 1) translational norms (the modus operandi of translating particular to a given culture), 2) the public one translates for, 3) personal interest and motivation (what is there to gain from this translation?), 4) competing translations of the same source text (the strategy of correcting, improving and perfecting one's predecessors), etc. The scholar's task is therefore to decide which relations constitute the shaping forces of the individual translation.

The six major translations of the Nights we propose to study span three centuries, and belong to distinct national traditions-- two factors which, rather than constituting an advantage, complicate our descriptive analysis. However, a brief historical survey of the first translations of the Nights demonstrate that their English and French versions share a common evolution and constitute two closely-knit traditions. As alluded to above, the French tradition, notably because each translation belongs to a different century, does not show the same cohesion in translational norms and overall strategies as do the English translations of the Nights. For example, Mardrus' version of the Nights, though it belongs in part to the 20th century (1899-1904) (thus one would assume it to be comparable to Khawam's translation, both translators also being of Arab origin), belongs more to the 19th century, greatly influenced by the French literary models of the "Belle époque" and Burton's translation; it consequently has much more in common with the English tradition than with fellow French versions. Therefore, to study the translations in chronological order, confining them to their respective traditions--Galland, Mardrus and Khawam constituting the first group, Lane, Payne and Burton the second-- would constitute a methodological blunder and historical fallacy. An equally ineffective way of conducting a descriptive analysis of the

112

Nights' translations would be to group them according to their corresponding source texts, i.e. Galland and Khawam for Galland's manuscript (Mahdi's edition), Lane and Mardrus for Būlāq, and Payne and Burton for Calcutta II (this last translation couple being justified though), as suggested by Gerhardt in her survey of the <u>1001 Nights</u>. Since Gerhardt does not read Arabic (5), and wishes, however, to give an overall appreciation of the "quality" and "reliability" of the different translations of the <u>Nights</u>, she reiterates Orientalists' judgements of the translations, and concludes that Enno Littmann's translation is the "best" and therefore can be used as a norm to judge the "less faithful and incomplete" English and French translations:

As regards the fidelity of the rendering, this question can most often be answered too. The ample documentation furnished by Arabic scholars contains much information on the character and general reliability of the different translations. Among this information one vital fact stands out: namely that Littmann is guaranteed by all authorities to be an absolutely faithful rendering of Calcutta II. In comparing and checking, Littmann may therefore serve as a standard. Burton's [and Payne's] Calcutta II translation can be checked entirely by means of Littmann, Mardrus's [sic] Bulak translation by means of Lane as far as the latter is complete. Moreover, since after the first 200 Nights Calcutta II and Bulak are as good as identical, not only Littmann and Lane permit a word for word comparison, but Mardrus can be checked, to a large extent, also with the aid of Littmann. Only Galland cannot be checked in detail with any other translation. [Gerhardt's book was published in 1963, therefore two years before Khawam's first rendition of the Nights which is also based on Galland's manuscript.] (Gerhardt 1963: 69-70)

Gerhardt's proposition that a translation in one language can be used to describe the adequacy or acceptability of a translation in a second language without consulting their common source text is untenable from a theoretical and methodological point of view. It presupposes that the "best" of translations is a transparent transposition of the source text into the target language. Unable to

<sup>5. &</sup>quot;It may seem strange that '1001 Nights'-translations should be discussed, and not only their literary merits but also their fidelity estimated, by someone who has no knowledge of Arabic. Yet this is not an entirely impossible thing, as I hope to show." (Gerhardt 1963: 69)

consult the Arabic source texts of the Nights, it is evident that the critic cannot begin to appreciate or, even less, describe the oral poetics of the narratives (such was our ambition in Chapter 3), and consequently is unable, based on this initial confrontation between source and target texts, to hypothesise as to the motivations, both individual and collective, behind transformations/ deformations operative in the translations. Gerhardt establishes a dubious hierarchy of the Nights' translations: Littmann's rendition is secured the rank of the best translation of the Nights, Lane's the best English translation, though incomplete in comparison to Littmann's, and Galland's, more of an adaptation, the best of the French translations. Gerhardt's method of analysing the Nights is inadequate because it does not resituate each translation in its context of production, and poses a German translation as a tertium comparationis for the descriptive analysis of the English and French translations, two traditions of the Nights intimately connected in their evolution, but totally foreign to translations of the German tradition and their corresponding strategies. In short, a descriptive analysis based on the sub-grouping of translations according to their common source texts is historically <u>off-target</u>.

We have found it more profitable to divide our descriptive analysis into sections based on thematic recurrences belonging to the (Western) discursive heritage of the <u>1001 Nights</u>. One cannot discuss the Western reception of the <u>Nights</u> without addressing the issue of Oriental exoticism. Oriental exoticism as exploited by translators of the <u>Nights</u> guaranteed them an economic/ symbolic success. If there is a common thread which unites the translations of the <u>Nights</u>, and thus justifies a global presentation of the translations, despite differences in translational norms, readership, conditions (milieu/ moment) of production, etc., it is definitely the "hot item" of Oriental exoticism. The ethnologisation of the narratives, which is a parallel development to Oriental exoticism, belongs to the English tradition of the <u>Nights</u> and merits a separate examination. Galland's sociocultural acclimatisation of descriptive elements of décor, social <u>habitus</u>, mannerisms, etc., of the narratives is alone in its genre: the occidentalisation of

114

the Orient is particular to his translation and proves an interesting counterpart to the more predominant phenomenon of orientalising the Orient (Saïd) at work in the ethnological discourse of Lane and Burton, and the sensationalism of Oriental exoticism predominant in Mardrus' translation. The elaboration of an exotic lingo derived from calques of Arabic syntax and locutions into English by Burton and to a lesser extent into French by Mardrus is a predominant strategy used by these translators to create an "oral style" in imitation of the oral poetics proper to Nights. Whether the oral poetics of the Nights is preserved or obliterated in the translations by this linguisitic exoticism along with the deliberate archaism of the english translations remains to be commented on in a section devoted to the oral poetics of the translations.

# Galland: Occidentalising the Orient (6)

Of all the translations of the 1001 Nights, Galland's has been studied and commented on the most. One could conclude then that yet another study has little or nothing to contribute to previous scholarship. However, as mentioned in Chapter 1, all critics (Knipp, Hawari, Hagège and May), after pointing out a few errors here and there in Galland's knowledge of Arabic, and remonstrating against his sometimes too frequent liberties and adaptations, inevitably finish by felicitating Galland for his polished and refined version of the otherwise coarse, unfinished and redundant Nights (rf. Chapter 2, May's eulogy, pp. 64-65). These critics belittle the extent to which Galland transformed, deformed, amputated, condensed, reconstructed, reformulated and acclimatised his source text(s). Though we will undoubtedly repeat much of what has already been iterated about Galland's system of translation, we intend to resuscitate an interest in his version by contrasting it to successive translations (English and French) (7). We will measure the type and frequency of transformations/ deformations of Galland's translation which occur in the 12 stories of the Hunchback cycle (published between 1704-1705), motivated by the desire to "see for oneself" whether the critical heritage surrounding this translation is well-founded or not, and how previous analyses could be systemised and ridded of their impressionistic and atomistic character. Our analysis will not proceed line by line; such an enterprise is impossible because, as other critics (Abdel-Halim 1964, Hagège 1980 and May 1986) have mentioned, and we agree with them based on our reading of the Hunchback cycle, Galland did not use only one source text for his translation (now edited by Mahdi), but relied on other versions (and the oral delivery of some stories--

<sup>6.</sup> Epithet taken from Abdel-Halim 1964: 203.

<sup>7.</sup> The reader will recall that only one analysis, Knipp: 1974, attempted such a comprehensive presentation of the English and French traditions of the Nights, and failed in conducting a descriptive study which goes beyond an atomistic approach (i.e. privileging the binary relation of source and target texts) and takes into account the conditions of production (target public, literary system, translational norms and personal motivation) of the individual translation.

notably of volumes IX, X, XI and XII--by the Alepian Hanna, see Elisséeff 1949: 75), as his incorporation of descriptive elements existing in other Arabic editions demonstrate. Based on our collective reading of the major Arabic editions of the 1001 Nights, we were able to identify segments of Galland's own invention, which we have presented at the end of this section (pp. 124-135). These samples have been numbered and classified under thematic titles and subtitles in order to facilitate both our description and the reader's understanding of Galland's translation system. We encourage the reader to peruse these excerpts before proceeding further, for the discussion to follow is an account of the possible conditions of production which motivated the transformations/ deformations of Galland's translation.

As previous studies of Galland explain, the adaptive nature of his translation of the <u>1001 Nights</u> is due predominantly to the social rule and translational norm of <u>bienséance</u> (propriety/ decorum). Most translations of the 18th century, because of their assimilative nature, are designated by the famous epithet, <u>belles infidèles</u> (unfaithful beauties):

Le grand siècle [18e], imbu de sa supériorité, prétend mettre les Anciens au goût du jour. Le purisme et la mode font prendre à leur égard les pires libertés: on les mutile, on les travestit, on les amende au nom de la politesse ou de la moralité. Ce n'est pas sans raison qu'on a pu surnommer le grand siècle français l'âge d'or des 'belles infidèles'. L'expression vient de Ménage (1631-1691) qui, critiquant les traductions de Nicolas Perrot [d'Ablancourt], s'exclama; 'Elles me rappellent une femme que j'ai beaucoup aimé à Tours, et qui était belle mais infidèle.' (Van Hoof 1986: 43)

Mounin, in his 1955 monograph, <u>Les Belles infidèles</u>, describes the assimilating practice of translating of the 18th century as follows: "Les 'belles infidèles' ne prétendaient pas autre chose comme on l'a vu, qu'éviter ce qui répugnait au goût de leur temps." (80) This global tendancy to transform the cultural references as well as the poetics of the source text by imposing a distinct aesthetics has been identified by A. Berman as "l'essence de la traduction classique française: elle est adaptatrice, naturalisante et ethnocentrique." (Berman 1990: 13) In the foreword to the first volume of his Nights, Galland subordinates his

#### translation programme to the social constraint of bienséance:

Tous les Orientaux, Persans, Tartares et Indiens, s'y font distinguer, et paraissent tels qu'ils sont, depuis les souverains jusqu'aux personnes de la plus basse condition. Ainsi, sans avoir essuyé la fatigue d'aller chercher ces peuples dans leurs pays, le lecteur aura ici le plaisir de les voir agir et de les entendre parler. On a pris soin de conserver leurs caractères, de ne pas s'éloigner de leurs expressions et de leurs sentiments, et l'on ne s'est écarté du texte que quand la bienséance n'a pas permis de s'y attacher. Le traducteur se flatte que les personnes qui entendent l'arabe, et qui voudront prendre la peine de confronter l'original avec la copie, conviendront qu'il a fait voir les Arabes aux Français, avec toute la circonspection que demandait la délicatesse de notre langue et de notre temps. (Galland: 1704)

In the above quotation, bienséance is associated with circonspection and délicatesse, which are presented by Galland as attributes of French language and culture, thus implying that Arabic language and Arab culture are of a less delicate and circumspect nature. Often critics have reduced the notion of bienséance to instances in Galland's translation where sexual scenes and the mention of bodily functions were omitted or alluded to by evasive formulae, such as the following example taken from the frame story of the Nights when the queen and her female servants secretly organise an orgy with black slaves: "La pudeur ne permet pas de raconter tout ce qui se passa entre ces femmes et ces noirs, et c'est un détail qu'il n'est pas besoin de faire." This euphemistic formula of the opening pages of Galland's Nights sets the tone for the rest of the translation. However, bienséance does not only regulate matters of sex in many translations of the 18th century, but extends to elements of social conduct, etiquette, manner of speech, gesticulation, etc., what has been named "habitus social" by Pierre Bourdieu. (8).

<sup>8. &</sup>quot;Tout permet de supposer que les instructions les plus déterminantes pour la construction de l'habitus se transmettent sans passer par le langage et par la conscience, au travers des suggestions qui sont inscrites dans les aspects les plus insignifiants en apparence des choses, des situations ou des pratiques, les manières de regarder, de se tenir, de garder le silence, ou même de parler ("regards désapprobateurs", "tons" ou "avis de reproche", etc.) sont <u>chargées</u> d'injonctions qui ne sont si puissantes, si difficiles à révoquer, que parce qu'elles sont silencieuses et insidieuses, insistantes et insinuantes..." (Bourdieu 1982: 37)

Gerhardt's description of Galland's system of transformation/deformation makes reference, though in the most general of terms, to this socio-cultural acclimatisation of his translation:

...the exquisitely polite, entirely frenchified dialogue, the reverant and eulogious way of speaking about princes and high dignitaries, the discreet moralizing or rationalizing touches and brief explanations given in passing. And most of all, a certain vague generality in the description of manner, conduct and things of everday life." (Gerhardt 1963: 73)

Gerhardt's commentary of Galland's translation evokes some of the strategies (though not without a certain vagueness) he used to make the 1001 Nights acceptable to his initial readership. His target public was the educated classes, people of the court, and in particular women of the court; he dedicated his translation to "Madame la Marquise D'O, dame du palais de Mme La Duchesse de Bourgogne", and we know that his translation circulated among other ladies, nobles and even members of the clergy (9). Galland's Nights was situated at the crossroads of two genres destined for the larger public of fashionable society: "les contes" (i.e. Charles Perrault (10), Mme d'Aulnoye <u>et al.</u>) and travel literature, which had both reached their peak of popularity by the end of the 17th century. In the foreword to his first volume of stories previously cited, Galland associates the Nights with travel literature by offering his reader an imaginary trip to the East: "Ainsi sans avoir essuyé la fatigue d'aller chercher ces peuples dans leurs pays, le lecteur aura ici le plaisir de les voir agir et de les entendre parler." Galland's

<sup>9. &</sup>quot;Sa [Galland's] traduction obtint un succès immédiat. C'est ainsi qu'il note dans son journal (12 décembre 1709) que l'abbé Bignon, membre de l'Académie des Inscriptions, a dévoré la copie du tome IX en préparation 'dans son carrosse, avec une bougie, en revenant de Versailles'."; "...[il] recherche les suffrages féminins, ...[et] note, entre autres remarques analogues dans son journal: 2 février 1709: 'Je prêtai mon IXe volume des Mille et Une Nuits à Mlle de Versamont afin qu'elle en fît la lecture avec Mme la duchesse de Brissac...' 31 décembre 1709: 'Je présentai à Mme la marquise d'O deux exemplaires du VIIIe tome des Mille et Une Nuits, reliés en maroquin rouge, l'un pour elle, et l'autre pour Mme la duchesse de Bourgogne.'" (Gaulmier 1965: 9; 12)

<sup>10.</sup> Galland's translation (the first eight volumes) was published by Claude Barbin, editor specialised in the publication of "contes", notably Perrault's.

Arabian stories were an immediate success with fashionable society, avid consumers of "entertainment literature" (one recalls the title of the first English translation of Galland, 1708 (?): "The Arabian Nights' Entertainments"). Before the Nights, Galland had participated in other publications, most of the academic type, the best known of them being the <u>Bibliotèque Orientale</u> of d'Herbelot (1697). Galland's translation was paid a certain attention by academe since the <u>Journal des Savants</u> devoted an article to it (19. 5. 1704). It is only after the "societal" success of his <u>1001 Nights</u> that his previous obscure and modest academic career finally received the ultimate consecration (11) for Galland was named to the Chair of Arabic at the Collège Royal in 1709 and occupied it until his death in 1715.

Galland's 1001 Nights as entertainment literature was destined for the larger public of fashionable society, therefore he adapted the stories in order to create a "sustained tone of good breeding and good taste" destined for "good society" (Gerhardt 1963: 72-73). His translation is in fact addressed to the most fashionable portion of his readership: Ladies of High Society ("les dames de qualité"), and consequently the stories bear the marks of the different "textual strategies" the translator employed in order to meet with the approval of his distinguished readership. Nobiliary culture is imprinted on many of the characters who, in the source stories, do not belong to a social elite: "À son air noble et à ses manières honnêtes, lui dis-je, j'ai jugé que c'était quelque dame de considération." (1: 391) In examples 1-3 of our selection of Galland, well-to-do merchants are attributed by the translator servants to serve them and their guests. Characters are recast according to French social classes: the host of a gathering is referred to as a city bourgeois (ex. 4) and the female characters of all the stories are elevated to the rank of ladies, "les dames de considération/condition et d'esprit" (ex. 3, 5-12, 36). This transformation attains comic proportions when servants or slave girls

<sup>11. &</sup>quot;Alliance avec les mondains qui font le nombre des lecteurs ou spectateurs, et alliance avec les institutions. (...) À la différence de ce qui se produit dans le champ littéraire contemporain, où il est possible de miser soit sur la sphère restreinte, soit sur la large diffusion, la double approbation était nécessaire pour se faire un nom [in 17th/18th-century France]." (Viala 1985: 168)

(jawār) are referred to euphemistically as "dames du palais" (ex. 1: 397), and when a young girl, an obvious seductress, is also referred to as a "dame". Most of the women characters of the stories are admired for their beauty by the male characters. Contrary to Galland's rendering, the male characters are not seduced by the "elevated minds" or "cultivated persons" (ex. 7, 8, 10) of the women, such expressions being typical 17th/18th-century epithets which designate the qualities and virtues of women of high society. Thus when Galland places beauty and mind on the same level, "l'espérance de posséder une dame qui avait tant d'esprit et de beauté" (ex. 10), he inserts the stories in a courtly context of gallantry with the "image du cavalier galant, serviteur attentif de sa 'dame'" and "l'honnête homme qui cultive la politesse et l'art de plaire." (Viala 1985: 136) These transformations are intended by Galland as a homage to his principal addressees: women of the French Royal Court.

Jawari

The exquisite politeness and generalised "vouvoiement" of dialogues in examples 13-15 as opposed to the direct and unceremonial Arabic are meant to reflect the social graces and good manners natural to members of high society, incarnated by the notion of "honnêteté": "Cet idéal social [of "honnêteté"] se fonde sur la politesse, donc sur un art des formes de la relation sociale." (Viala 1985: 148) Added to this nobiliary habitus of social conduct is the manner in which one pays respects to and addresses oneself to one's sovereign. The traditional bow of the Arabic stories, the kissing of the ground at the feet of one's sovereign, is replaced with the French-styled bow and reverence (ex. 16-17). The subject is to assume an attitude of humiliation before his ruler as in example 19 which the translator conveys in a melodramatic manner, incongruent with the sober but not overly submissive form of address in Arabic. The sovereign is accorded his/ her position of supremacy and superiority, symbolised by the "throne", which replaces the simple chair of the Arabic source text (ex. 18).

This socio-cultural acclimatisation is carried over to scenes of eating and entertainment. The most persistent change in decor is the "sofa" which Galland introduces repeatedly into the narratives. Out of the eleven references (ex. 20-29,

121

39) made to a sofa in Galland's translation of the Hunchback cycle, only once does the word <u>suffah</u> (ex. 24) occur in the Arabic. As footnote 13 explains, the Arabic term has nothing in common with the French referent. Hawari also mentions this verbal tic Galland has of inserting sofas whenever it suits him:

...we have an interesting example of Galland's misinterpretation of some key words in the text he translated. For the Arabic text wich [sic] he misinterpreted does not signify sofas, but simply benches of bare stone or brick. A sofa is a kind of divan furnished with mats and cushions, and it is interesting to note that Galland employs the word in other tales in association with cushions of fine silk curiously embroidered with all sorts of flowers. But he is so fond of sofas that he consistently brings them in whenever he describes the interior or, as in the case of the example above, the exterior of any Arabian Nights home, mansion, or court-yard. (Hawari 1980: 154)

Contrary to Hawari's analysis, we are not convinced that Galland's translation "error" is so much a "misinterpretation" as a deliberate displacement of the Arabic in order to refurnish the stories in a French mode. A similar example of cultural interference is that of the "tablette de chocolat" (ex. 1, 29-30), which, we can assume, was a favorite dessert in 18th-century France. The Arabic uses the generic term halwa which means "sweets", "pastries". Galland narrows down the extension of the word to a specific time and space with its cultural reference: an after-the-meal sweet of 18th-century France. Another important amplification is made to the source text when Galland details the manner in which one of the Barber's brothers drinks wine (ex. 31). The Arabic reads, "then he made a gesture and drank"; it is this gesture which becomes the object of amplification in Galland's translation. The wine-drinking is described in terms familiar to the modern reader. Galland's depiction evokes the ritual of the wine drinker who first observes the colour of the wine, then smells its aroma before drinking it. Likewise, table manners of the Arabic characters are modified (ex. 32-33) in order to suit, one could assume, a French etiquette: you do not hand-feed your guests (a sign of hospitality and affection in Arab culture), and you do not expose your feet at the supper-table. After a meal and wine, Galland inserts into one of the stories (ex. 34) a moment of dance (in the Arabic, the Barber's Second Brother is bidden to dance so that he may be mocked at by the women), where ladies and gentlemen mingle for a bit of after-dinner entertainment. The stories are adapted to depict the social life and habits of their prospective readership: the social elite of the French court and salons (12).

The final examples illustrate the 18th-century French literary and societal norm that "les belles-lettres" are expected to reflect and propose to the reader a model of "bonnes manières". The aesthetic value of literature is intimately connected to its moral value ("la valeur esthétique est aussi une valeur morale", Viala 1985: 141); before a work is publishable, its author first must fulfill his moral obligations so that he may avoid censorship: "Les droits moraux des auteurs ont été les premiers à s'imposer... avant d'espérer vivre de la plume, il faut survivre, ne pas encourir de sanctions indues par ses écrits." (Viala 1985: 87). Based on the transformations/ deformations of Galland's translation, abstinence from alcohol (ex. 35), attenuation of violence (ex. 36, 37), the non-representation of bodily functions, sexual acts and nudity (ex. 38-45) are the moral sanctions the translator imposed on the Arabic source text in order to render the narratives acceptable to his readership. The tolerance of cultural differences in Galland's translation is minimal. The transformations/ deformations we have discussed are for the most part a socio-cultural annexation of the narratives. Nonetheless, already manifest in Galland's adaptation of the stories is the fascination of the cultural foreignness or "exoticism" of the Arabic narratives which he accentuates by inserting references (non-existent in the source text) to "spices of the Orient" (ex. 46-47), and by embellishing the magnificence and richness of the decor (ex. 48-49). However, in addition to this fascination, the modern reader is still able to detect a certain horror of differences, as in example 50 where the black skin of an Ethiopian (reference absent in the source text) is the epitome, in the eyes of the translator, of physical and moral loathsomeness.

123

<sup>12. &</sup>quot;La noblesse est donc devenue la force sociale dominante dans le milieu littéraire [of the 17th century], et le sera encore un siècle durant." (Viala 1985: 264)

# Excerpts From Galland's Translation (See Appendix 1 for Arabic)

# Upper Classes Should Have Servants

#### To Serve Meals: Christian Broker's Story

1. Après le repas, dit-il, lorsque mes gens eurent desservi et se furent retirés, nous nous assîmes tous deux sur un sofa. Je présentai au jeune homme d'une tablette excellente pour la bonne bouche, et il la prit encore de la main gauche. (vol. 1: 369)

[(the Christian said to the King of China) when we finished, I poured water on his hands and offered him something to dry them with and we sat down to talk after I had served some sweetmeats)

# To Clean: Jewish Doctor's Story

2. Je fus vivement affligé de cet accident. "Que ferai-je? dis-je alors en moi-même. Que vais-je devenir?" Comme je crus qu'il n'y avait pas de temps à perdre, je fis lever par mes gens, à la clarté de la lune et sans bruit, une des grandes pièces de marbre dont la cour de ma maison était pavée, et fis creuser en diligence une fosse où ils enterrèrent le corps de la jeune dame. Après qu'on eut remis la pièce de marbre, je pris un habit de voyage avec tout ce que j'avais d'argent... (1: 410)

[I thought for a while then I took off the clothes that were on her and undressed myself. I said to myself: I'm not sure whether the young woman will inform people of the victim; women cannot be trusted because of their cunningness. I stood up and dug a hole in the middle of the courtyard and took the young woman and her jewellery and put them in the hole and threw earth on them and put back the marble of the pavement as it was before. I dressed myself in clean clothes and took the rest of my money in a small box...]

3. En nettoyant et en balayant la salle où j'avais mangé avec les dames, un de mes gens trouva un collier d'or en forme de chaîne, où il y avait d'espace en espace dix perles très grosses et très parfaites; il me l'apporta, et je le reconnus pour celui que j'avais vu au col de la jeune dame qui avais été empoisonnée. (1: 411)

[then he (the owner) opened the house and I broke the seal and entered. I swept and cleaned and found under the bed on which I had slept with the murdered girl a gold necklace set with ten jewels. When I saw it I recognised it...]

# Social Classes Recast in a French Framework of the 18th Century

# Arab Bourgeois: Tailor's Story

4. "Sire, un bourgeois de cette ville me fit l'honneur, il y a deux jours, de m'inviter à un festin qu'il donnait hier matin à ses amis..." (1: 418) [behold the host, and a handsome foreign young man entered with him]

# Female Characters Are Not Women But "Ladies" ("Dames de Condition") Who Are Not Only Beautiful But Endowed With Wit and Learning ("Avoir de l'Esprit")

# Christian Broker's Story:

5. Un lundi que j'étais assis dans la boutique d'un de ces marchands, qui se nommait Bedreddin, une dame de condition, comme il était aisé de connaître à son air, à son habillement, et par une esclave fort proprement mise qui la suivait, entra dans la même boutique et s'assit près de moi... (1: 371)

[I sat beside the merchant who was called Badr ad-dīn al-Bustānī and spoke with him for a while when behold a woman with a shawl, splendid turban and fragrant smelling appeared before us and sat in the shop]

# Steward's Story:

6. A son air noble et à ses manières honnêtes, lui dis-je, j'ai jugé que c'était quelque dame de considération-- Vous ne vous êtes pas trompé dans ce jugement, répliqua l'eunuque: elle est favorite de Zobéide, épouse du calife... (1: 391)

[Then I said to him (the servant): Who is she? He said: She is the girl whose mistress is Zubaida, wife of the caliph]

7. Je ne fus pas moins charmé de son esprit que je l'avais été de la beauté de son visage... (1: 388)

[and I was embarrassed by her beauty]

8. Je revins, et j'eus encore le bonheur d'entretenir la dame jusqu'à ce que toutes les boutiques du bezestein furent ouvertes. Quoique nous ne parlassions que de choses très communes, elle leur donnait néanmoins un tour qui les faisait paraître nouvelles, et qui me fit voir que je ne m'étais pas trompé quand, dès la première conversation, j'avais jugé qu'elle avait beaucoup d'esprit. (1: 389)

[I started talking to her until the opening of the market. Then I paid every man his money]

9. À son air noble et à ses manières honnêtes, lui dis-je, j'ai jugé que c'était quelque dame de considération. (1: 391) [then I said to him: Who is she?]

10. ...l'espérance de posséder une dame qui avait tant d'esprit et de beauté. (1: 395) [Translator's addition without equivalent in the source text.]

11. ...[elle] se mit à faire des cris épouvantables qui attirèrent bientôt dans la chambre toutes les dames de l'appartement, qui voulurent savoir le sujet de ses cris. (1: 397)

[and she called for help and the servants entered from all sides and surrounded her]

# Jewish Doctor's Story:

12. Un jour que j'étais assis à la porte de ma maison et que je prenais le frais, une dame fort proprement habillée, et qui paraissait fort bien faite, vint à moi et me demanda si je ne vendais pas des étoffes. En disant cela, elle entra dans le logis... (1: 407)

[one day I was sitting at the entrance of my house when a young girl approached us and she was well-dressed and I had never seen more beautiful than her and I invited her in and hardly believed it when she entered the house]

# Generalised "Vouvoiement" and Exquisite Politeness in All Types of Requests

# Frame Story of the Hunchback: Tailor's Wife Addresses the Jewish Doctor's Servant

13. Remontez, s'il vous plaît, répondit le tailleur, et dîtes à votre maître que nous lui amenons un homme bien malade... (1: 357-358)

[(the tailor's) wife gave her a quarter dinar and said to her: O mistress, take this to your master and tell him to come down to see this brother of mine who is afflicted with a grave weakness]

# Jewish Doctor Addresses the Governor:

14. "Renvoyez-le donc, s'il vous plaît, et me mettez à sa place, puisque personne que moi n'est cause de la mort du bossu." (1: 363)

[Don't hang him for nobody killed the hunchback but myself]

# Christian Broker Addresses the King of China:

15. "Sire, avant que je m'engage dans le récit que Votre Majesté consent que je lui fasse, je lui ferai remarquer, s'il lui plaît, que je n'ai pas l'honneur d'être né dans un endroit qui relève de son empire." (1: 366)

[Learn, O King, that before I arrived in this region, I am a foreigner to your country and I came for business and arrived here and destiny caused me to remain with you for two years]

# The Appropriate Reverence Before One's Sovereign

# How to Bow: Frame Story of the Hunchback

16. Lorsqu'ils furent tous devant le sultan, le juge de police se prosterna aux pieds de ce prince, et, quand il fut relevé, lui raconta fidèlement tout ce qu'il savait de l'histoire du bossu. (1: 365)

[he (the governor) stopped them and kissed the earth and repeated their story and narrated to him (the King) the narration of the hunchback from the beginning to the end]

#### Christian Broker's Story:

17. Le marchand chrétien, après s'être prosterné jusqu'à toucher la terre de son front, prit alors la parole... (1: 365)

[then the Christian stepped forward, kissed the earth and said: O King of the Age]

# A Sovereign Sits on a Throne and Not a Chair

# Steward's Story:

18. Zobéide parut au milieu de celles-ci avec un air majestueux, et si chargée de pierreries et de toutes sortes de joyaux qu'à peine pouvait-elle marcher. Elle alla s'asseoir sur le trône. J'oubliais de vous dire que sa dame favorite l'accompagnait, et qu'elle demeura debout à sa droite, pendant que les dames esclaves, un peu plus éloignées, étaient en foule des deux côtés du trône.

D'abord que la femme du calife fut assise, les esclaves qui étaient entrées les premières me firent signe d'approcher. Je m'avançai au milieu des deux rangés qu'elles formaient et me prosternai le tête contre le tapis qui était sous les pieds de la princesse. (1: 395-396)

[among them (slave girls) was lady Zubaida and she could hardly walk because of the jewelry and clothing. When she approached, the servants separated and they brought her a chair on which she sat down. She called out to the servants and they called out to us and I came before her and kissed the earth]

# A Subject Owes Total Obeisance and Humiliation to His Sovereign

#### Christian Broker's Story:

19. Voilà l'histoire que j'avais à vous conter: ne la trouvez-vous pas plus surprenant que celle du bossu?"

Le sultan de Casgar se mit en colère contre le marchand chrétien: "Tu es bien hardi, lui dit-il, d'oser me faire le récit d'une histoire si peu digne de mon attention, et de la comparer à celle du bossu. Peux-tu te flatter de me persuader que les fades aventures d'un jeune débauché sont plus admirables que celles de mon bouffon? Je vais vous faire pendre tous quatre pour venger sa mort."

A ces paroles, le pourvoyeur effrayé se jeta aux pieds du sultan: "Sire, dit-il, je supplie Votre Majesté de suspendre sa juste colère, de m'écouter et de nous faire grâce à tous quatre, si l'histoire que je vais conter à Votre Majesté est plus belle que celle du bossu.--Je t'accorde ce que tu me demandes, répondit le sultan: parle." (1: 383-384)

[this is what happened to me; it is strange what befell me. O King, isn't it more wonderful than the story of the hunchback. Then the King of China said: It is not more wonderful than the story of the hunchback therefore I must hang all four of you because of the hunchback. Then the steward approached and said to the King of China: O auspicious King, I will tell you a story which happened to me last night before I met up with this hunchback. If it is more wonderful than the hunchback's story grant us our lives and free us. The King of China said: Yes]

# French Entertainment:

# Furniture: Galland's Sofa

# Christian Broker's Story:

20. ...nous nous assîmes tous deux sur un sofa, où nous nous entretînmes avec toute la satisfaction imaginable. (1: 377)

[then we sat down to talk and my head was bowed towards the ground]

21. ... je marchais par plusieurs rues détournées, et me rendis enfin chez la dame, où j'arrivais si faible et si fatigué que je me jetai sur le sofa... (1: 380) [and I walked until I arrived at the house, then threw myself on the bed]

# Tailor's Story:

22. Nous nous levâmes tous, et, pour faire honneur au maître du logis, nous priâmes le jeune homme de s'asseoir avec nous sur le sofa. (1: 418)

[we rose in honour of him (the young man) and the owner of the house. He was about to sit down when he saw among us a man who was a barber by profession. He then refused to sit down]

23. Nous joignîmes nos prières à celles du maître de la maison, et enfin le jeune homme, cédant à nos instances, s'assit sur le sofa, et nous raconta ainsi son histoire... (1: 419)

[we insisted that he (the young man) sit down and tell us what happened to him with the barber in Bagdad]

# Barber's Second Brother's Story:

24. La vieille le fit asseoir sur un sofa bien garni, et lui dit d'attendre un moment, qu'elle allait avertir de son arrivée la jeune dame. (2: 29-30) [then she sat my brother down in a handsome alcove (13)]

25. ...et, lorsque la jeune dame fut près du sofa, mon frère, qui s'était levé, lui fit une profonde révérence. Elle prit la place d'honneur; et puis, l'ayant prié de se remettre à la sienne, elle lui dit... (2: 30)

[when she approached and my brother saw her, he stood up and offered her his services and she welcomed him and bid him to sit down and he sat down. Then she drew near him and said]

26. ...on le ramena devant la jeune femme, qui se prit si fort à rire en le voyant

<sup>13. &</sup>lt;u>A Dictionary of Egyptian Arabic</u> (Beirut: Librairie du Liban, 1986) gives the following definition of <u>suffah</u>: "alcove raised above floor level" (p. 506) Other English-Arabic dictionaries describe <u>suffah</u> as a "stone ledge" and Khawam translates it as a "stone bench".

qu'elle se renversa sur le sofa où elle était assise. (2: 33)

[and the slave girl brought him before her mistress. She was greatly amused by him and she laughed until she fell backwards and she said]

# Barber's Fifth Brother's Story:

27. Alors fatigué de ses prières, je lui lancerai un regard terrible et lui donnerai un bon soufflet sur la joue, en la repoussant du pied si vigoureusement qu'elle ira tomber bien loin au-delà du sofa. (2: 52)

[then I will shake my hand in front of her face and kick her with my foot and I will do it like this]

# Barber's Sixth Brother's Story:

28. Il avança, et entra dans une salle...où il aperçut un homme vénérable avec une longue barbe blanche, assis sur un sofa à la place d'honneur... (2: 62)

[then he walked towards the door of a room and entered it and found in the heart of it a man with a handsome face and beard then he walked up to him]

#### Food Habits: "Tablette au Chocolat" as Dessert

Christian Broker's Story:

29. Après le repas...nous nous assîmes tous deux sur un sofa. Je présentai au jeune homme d'une tablette excellente pour la bonne bouche, et il la prit encore de la main gauche. (1: 369)

[and we sat down to talk after I had served some sweetmeats]

#### Barber's Sixth Brother's Story:

30. Puis, avançant la main, comme s'il eût présenté quelque chose: "Tenez, continua-t-il, voici une tablette excellente pour aider à faire la digestion." (2: 65) [Translator's addition without equivalent in the source text.]

#### Wine Savouring: Barber's Sixth Brother's Story

31. Mon frère feignait de prendre le verre, de le regarder de près, comme pour voir si la couleur du vin était belle, et de se le porter au nez pour juger si l'odeur en était agréable; puis il fit une profonde inclination de tête au Barmécide pour lui marquer qu'il prenait la liberté de boire à sa santé, et enfin il fit semblant de boire avec toutes les démonstrations d'un homme qui boit avec plaisir. (2: 65) [then he made a gesture and drank]

#### Table Manners

# You Do Not Stuff Food Into Someone's Mouth And Force Him to Gulp It Down: Frame Story of the Hunchback

32. Ils se mirent tous trois à table; mais, en mangeant, le bossu avala par malheur une grosse arrête ou un os, dont il mourut en peu de moments, sans que le tailleur et sa femme y pussent remédier. (1: 357)

[They started to eat and they ate until they were satisfied. Then the tailor took a

piece of fish and fed it to the hunchback and blocked his mouth with his sleeve, laughed and said: By God, you will eat this in one piece-- his life was cut short. He had to eat it. He did not take his time in chewing it. He gulped it down. In it was a large fishbone and it caught in his throat and continued to choke him. Then he died]

# You Do Not Expose Your Feet at the Supper Table: Steward's Story

33. Le maître de la maison prit aussitôt la parole: "Vous n'avez point de pouce, lui dit-il; par quel accident l'avez-vous perdu? Il faut que ce soit à quelque occasion dont vous ferez plaisir à la compagnie de l'entretenir. --Seigneur, répondit-il, ce n'est pas seulement à la main droite que je n'ai point de pouce, je n'en ai pas aussi à la gauche." En même temps il avança la main gauche, et nous fit voir que ce qu'il nous disait était véritable. "Ce n'est pas tout encore, ajouta-t-il: le pouce me manque de même à l'un et l'autre pied, et vous pouvez m'en croire. (1: 386)

[We said to him: What happened to this thumb? Did God create it that way or did something happen to it? Then he said: By God, this thumb is not the only one; there is my other thumb and the toes of my feet, but see for yourselves. Then he revealed the thumb of the other hand and we found it was like the right one and his feet were also without toes. When we saw this our astonishment increased]

# Minuet Dancing: Barber's Second Brother's Story

34. Dix esclaves prirent des instruments et commencèrent à jouer et à chanter; d'autres se mirent à danser. Mon frère, pour faire l'agréable, dansa aussi, et la jeune dame même s'en mêla. Après qu'on eut dansé quelque temps, on s'assit pour prendre haleine. (2: 30-31)

[then ten slave girls like full moons arrived and in their hands were lutes and they started to sing with moving voices and my brother delighted in them]

# Defense of Morals

# Against Wine Drinking: Barber's Sixth Brother's Story

35. "--Mon hôte, reprit le Barmécide, après avoir si bien mangé, il faut que nous buvions. Vous boirez bien du vin?-- Seigneur, lui dit mon frère, je ne boirai pas de vin, s'il vous plaît, puisque cela m'est défendu.-- Vous êtes trop scrupuleux, répliqua le Barmécide: faites comme moi.-- J'en boirai donc par complaisance, repartit Schacabac. A ce que je vois, vous voulez que rien ne manque à votre festin. Mais, comme je ne suis point accoutumé à boire du vin, je crains de commettre quelque faute contre la bienséance, et même contre le respect qui vous est dû: c'est pourquoi je vous prie encore de me dispenser de boire du vin; je me contenterai de boire de l'eau.-- Non, non, dit le Barmécide, vous boirez du vin." En mème temps, il commanda qu'on en apportât; mais le vin ne fut pas plus réel que la viande et le fruit. Il fit semblant de se verser à boire et de boire le premier; puis, faisant semblant de verser à boire pour mon frère et de lui présenter le verre: "Buvez à ma santé, lui dit-il; sachons un peu si vous trouvez ce vin bon." (2: 65) [then he said: O my guest, do you want to drink and make merry? One must not go hungry. (...) Then the man said: Serve the drink. Then he presented my brother with a cup and said: Taste this cup and if it pleases you let me know. Then my brother said: Its aroma is good but I'm used to another type. Then he said: Serve him wine different from this one. Then he said: To your health and good condition]

# Attenuation of Violence

# Decapitation Replaced by Poisoning: Jewish Doctor's Story

36. Nous continuâmes de boire; mais, à mesure que le vin nous échauffait, la nouvelle dame et moi nous nous agacions avec si peu de retenue que son amie en conçut une jalousie violente, dont elle nous donna bientôt une marque bien funeste. Elle se leva, et sortit en nous disant qu'elle allait revenir; mais, peu de moments après, la dame qui était restée avec moi changea de visage; il lui prit de grandes convulsions, et enfin elle rendit l'âme entre mes bras, tandis que j'appelais du monde pour m'aider à la secourir. Je sors aussitôt, je demande l'autre dame; mes gens me dirent qu'elle avait ouvert la porte de la rue, et qu'elle s'en était allée. Je soupçonnai alors, et rien n'était plus véritable, que c'était elle qui avait causé la mort de son amie. Effectivement, elle avait eu l'adresse et la malice de mettre d'un poison très violent dans la dernière tasse qu'elle lui avait présentée elle-même. (1: 409-410)

[I and the young girl stood up and we embraced and we slept together that night. In the middle of the night she (the first girl) woke up and made her bed on the upper floor and slept alone and I and the young girl (the second one) slept together. In the morning I awoke and found myself in sweat, at least what I reckoned was sweat and without taking notice of the young girl moved her shoulders; then her head rolled off. I went crazy and screamed and said: O Beautiful Protector. I found she had been murdered. I got right up and the world became black before my eyes and called out to the girl (the first one) but did not find her and then I knew she was the one who murdered the girl (the second one) from jealousy. Then I said: There is no power and no strength save in God the Highest and the Greatest, what am I to do?]

# Invitation to Dinner Replaces a Night in Prison: Conclusion to the Frame Story of the Hunchback

37. Quand le barbier, continua-t-il, eut fini son histoire, nous trouvâmes que le jeune homme n'avait pas eu tort de l'accuser d'être un grand parleur. Néanmoins, nous voulûmes bien qu'il demeurât avec nous, et qu'il fût du régal que le maître de la maison nous avait préparé. Nous nous mîmes donc à table, et nous nous réjouîmes jusqu'à la prière d'entre midi et le coucher du soleil. Alors toute la compagnie se sépara, et je vins travailler à ma boutique en attendant qu'il fût temps de m'en retourner chez moi. (2: 69)

[(the tailor said to the King of China): O King, when we heard the story of the barber and the abundance of his speech and that the young man had been mistreated by him, we seized hold of him and ganged up on him and put him into prison and we sat down yesterday and ate and finished the party until after afternoon prayer and I left and came home]

# Censor of the Body and of Sexual Acts

#### Urinating Euphemised: Frame Story of the Hunchback

38. Néanmoins, quand il fut au bout de la rue, il s'arrêta pour quelque besoin contre la boutique où le pourvoyeur du sultan avait mis le corps du bossu... (1: 361) [and he squatted to make water in front of him (the hunchback) and stood up]

#### French Kissing Eliminated: Christian Broker's Story

39. Je ne vous parlerai point de la joie que nous eûmes à nous revoir: car c'est une chose que je ne pourrais que faiblement exprimer. Je vous dirai seulement qu'après les premiers compliments, nous nous assîmes tous deux sur un sofa, où nous nous entretînmes avec toute la satisfaction imaginable. On nous servit ensuite les mets les plus délicats et les plus exquis. Nous nous mîmes à table, et, après le repas, nous recommençâmes à nous entretenir jusqu'à la nuit. (1: 376-377) [when she saw me, she smiled at my face and pressed me to her chest and my mouth was on hers, then she started to suck my tongue and I did the same then she said: Is it true, O my little master, that you have come to me? Then I said: I am your slave and I am with you. Then she said: By God, since the day (I saw) you, neither food nor sleep have been pleasant to me. I said: For me, it has been the same. Then we sat down and talked and my head hung to the ground]

#### Breasts Censored: Steward's Story

40. Je n'y étais pas entré que vingt dames esclaves, d'un âge déjà avancé, toutes vêtues d'habits riches et uniformes, sortirent du cabinet de Zobéide et vinrent se ranger devant un trône en deux files égales, avec une grande modestie. Elles furent suivies de vingt autres dames toutes jeunes et habillées de la même sorte que les premières, avec cette différence pourtant que leurs habits avaient quelque chose de plus galant. Zobéide parut au milieu de celles-ci avec un air majestueux... (1: 395)

[and behold there were ten slave girls like moons who approached and stood in a line and twenty other slave girls, full-breasted virgins who approached and among them was lady Zubaida]

#### Buttocks Censored: Steward's Story

41. Couchez-le par terre, ajouta-t-elle en s'adressant aux dames, et qu'on m'apporte un nerf de boeuf. "Elles me renversèrent aussitôt, et, tandis que les unes me tenaient par les bras et les autres par les pieds, ma femme, qui avait été servie en diligence, me frappa impitoyablement jusqu'à ce que les forces lui manquèrent." (1: 397)

[then she yelled to her servants and said: Throw him down. Then they threw me down on the ground and she took in her hand a braided whip and brought it down on my back and on my buttocks until her arm became tired]

#### Barber's Third Brother's Story:

42. On mit donc le voleur sous le bâton, dit le barbier, et il eut la constance de s'en laisser donner jusqu'à vingt ou trente coups; mais, faisant semblant de se laisser vaincre par la douleur, il ouvrit un oeil premièrement... (2: 40)

[when the governor hit the seeing man four hundred blows on the backside and the hitting pained him then he opened one eye]

#### Deflowering Censored: Jewish Doctor's Story

43. En disant cela, il fit appeler des témoins et dresser un contrat de mariage; ensuite j'épousai sa fille sans cérémonie. (1: 416)

[he sent for the witnesses to be brought and the marriage contract was written for his daughter and I went into her-- i.e. deflowered her]

#### Nudity Dressed and Erect Phallus Censored: Barber's Second Brother's Story

44. "Vous saurez que ma maîtresse a coutume, lorsqu'elle a un peu bu comme aujourd'hui, de ne se pas laisser approcher par ceux qu'elle aime, qu'ils ne soient nus en chemise. Quand ils sont dans cet état, elle prend un peu d'avantage, et se met à courir devant eux par la galerie, et de chambre en chambre, jusqu'à ce qu'ils l'aient attrapée. Cest encore une de ses bizarreries. Quelque avantage qu'elle puisse prendre, léger et dispos comme vous êtes, vous aurez bientôt mis la main sur elle. Mettez-vous donc vite en chemise; déshabillez-vous sans faire de façons."

"Mon bon frère en avait trop fait pour reculer. Il se déshabilla, et cependant la jeune dame se fit ôter sa robe, et demeura en jupon pour courir plus légèrement. Lorsqu'il furent tous deux en état de commencer la course, la jeune dame prit un avantage d'environ vingt pas, et se mit à courir d'une vitesse surprenante. Mon frère la suivit de toute sa force, non sans exciter les ris de toutes les esclaves, qui frappaient des mains. La jeune dame, au lieu de perdre quelque chose de l'avantage qu'elle avait pris d'abord, en gagnait encore sur mon frère. Elle lui fit faire deux ou trois tours de galerie, et puis enfila une longue allée obscure... Imaginez-vous s'il [second brother] eut lieu d'être surpris de se trouver au milieu d'une rue de corroyeurs. Ils ne le furent pas moins de le voir en chemise, les yeux peints de rouge, sans barbe et sans moustache. (2: 34)

[it is her custom when she is drunk not to let anyone take possession of her unless he takes off his clothes and pants and remains naked then she runs in front of him as though fleeing and he follows her from place to place until his cock stands up and becomes firm and thus she stops and lets him take possession of her. Then she said: Take off your clothes. So my brother took off all of his clothes and remained stark-naked. Then the girl said to my brother: Stand up and run. She also took off her clothes but kept on her pants. She said to him: If you want to get me then follow me until you overtake me. Then she started going into one room and coming out another and "I" [logically he] was running after her and desire overcame my brother and his cock stood erect as if he were crazy. The girl in front of him entered into a dark place... When they (the leather merchants) saw him in that state, naked, beard shaved and eyebrows painted red, they yelled at him]

#### Barber's Sixth Brother's Story:

45. "Le Bédouin avait une femme assez jolie, et souvent, quand il allait faire ses courses, il laissait mon frère seul avec elle. Alors la femme n'oubliait rien pour consoler mon frère de la rigueur de l'esclavage. Elle lui faisait assez connaître qu'elle l'aimait; mais il n'osait répondre à sa passion, de peur de s'en repentir, et il évitait de se trouver seul avec lui. Elle avait une si grande habitude de badiner et de jouer avec le cruel Schacabac toutes les fois qu'elle le voyait que cela lui arriva un jour en présence de son mari. Mon frère sans prendre garde qu'il les observait, s'avisa, pour ses péchés, de badiner aussi avec elle. Le Bédouin s'imagina aussitôt qu'ils vivaient tous deux dans une intelligence criminelle; et, ce soupçon le mettant en fureur, il se jeta sur mon frère, et, après l'avoir mutilé d'une manière barbare, il le conduisit sur un chameau au haut d'une montagne déserte où il le laissa. (2: 67-68)

[and he had a wife with a beautiful face and when her husband would go out, she would turn her attention to him [the Barber's Sixth Brother] and attempt to seduce him and he would refuse. One day, she attempted to seduce him and he stood up and started playing with her and she likewise and her husband entered. When he saw my brother, he said to him: Woe to you, do you want to corrupt my people? Then he took out a knife and cut off his penis and put him on a camel and abandonned him at the foot of a mountain]

# Culinary Exoticism and Magnificence in Décor

Barber's Sixth Brother's Story:

46. Peu de temps après, il demanda une oie à la sauce douce, accommodée avec du vinaigre, du miel, des raisins secs, des pois chiches et des figues sèches... (2: 63-64) [then he said: O servant, bring us the <u>sikbāj</u> (14) with fatted goose]

47. Qu'on apporte à présent le ragoût, s'écria le Barmécide; je crois que vous n'en serez pas moins content que de l'agneau. Hé bien, qu'en pensez-vous?-- Il est merveilleux, répondit Schacabac: on y sent tout à la fois l'ambre, le clou de girofle, la muscade, le gingembre, le poivre et les herbes les plus odorants; et toutes ces odeurs sont si bien ménagées que l'une n'empêche pas qu'on ne sente l'autre. Quelle volupté! (2: 64)

[then he said: Bring the <u>tabāhajāt</u>. (15) Then he said: Have you ever seen more delicious spices than in these dishes? Eat more and do not be ashamed. Then my brother said: O Lord, I've had enough food]

Steward's Story:

<sup>14.</sup> Lane provides in his endnotes (note 98) a description of <u>sikbāj</u>: "a dish composed of meat, wheat-flour and vinegar." Burton translates <u>sikbāj</u> as "marinated stew", and Khawam as "ragoûts de viande au vinaigre".

<sup>15.</sup> Khawam translates tabāhajāt as "les viandes aux petits oignons et aux oeufs".
48. Après cela, elle me conduisit dans une salle où tout était d'une richesse, d'une propreté et d'une magnificience surprenantes. (1: 395) [then I came down and sat in a small vestibule]

## Barber's Sixth Brother's Story:

49. Un jour qu'il passait devant un hôtel magnifique... (2: 61) [when he saw a handsome house...]

## A Touch of Racism

## Tailor's Story:

50. "Seigneur, répondit le jeune homme, au nom de Dieu, je vous supplie de ne me retenir, et de permettre que je m'en aille. Je ne puis voir sans horreur cet abominable barbier que voilà: quoiqu'il soit né dans un pays où tout le monde est blanc, il ne laisse pas de ressembler à un Éthiopien: mais il a l'âme encore plus noire et plus horrible que le visage..." (1: 418)

[then the young man said: O master, by God, do not oppose me. The cause is that barber, a ominous old man, black face, vile in deeds, wretched in action, seldom blessed]

## Mardrus: Orientalising the Orient

Mardrus incarnated the Arab type for the French public at the end of the 19th century, and for the restricted circle of French poets and littérateurs to whom he dedicated his translations (Mallarmé (16), Blum, Maeterlinck, Gide, Hérédia, France, Louÿs, Valéry, etc.); he was christened by the publisher of his 1001 Nights, La Revue blanche (20.5.1899), "ce vrai fils de la Cité du Caire" (Aboul-Hussein 1970: vi). He owes his success (4 editions of the first volume within 2 months) to the intense publicity surrounding his Egyptian origins: "La Revue blanche annonce [22.4.1899] une traduction littérale et complète du livre des 1001 Nuits et orchestre une publicité tapageuse autour du jeune traducteur 'musulman de naissance et parisien par accident'." (Aboul-Hussein 1970: v) In fact, he is the first Arab to have translated the Nights. Consequently, a consensus was formed that his version would authentically convey the Arab "essence" and "character" of the stories, though, as we will see, his system of translation was modeled after the strategy of scandal which prevailed among French authors as a means for promoting their work. Mardrus was thus under great pressure to "Arabicise" the narratives, i.e. to litter the stories with details of Arab life and culture known to his Western audience, in order to give an "ever more genuine" savour to them. He did not drown his translation in a cumbersome paratext (as Burton and Lane had done), but expanded individual passages beyond recognition. Excerpts of Mardrus' translations presented at the end of this section have been selected from these passages. His amplification of the stories attains exaggerated proportions. For example, in the Tailor's Story, it is mentioned that Friday-noon prayer was announced from the minaret (Būlāq 92: 27). Mardrus therefore inserted

<sup>16. &</sup>quot;Mardrus se présente chez Mallarmé et lui soumit quelques échantillons de sa traduction. (...) D'après Mme Veuve Mardrus, ce fut Mallarmé qui engagea son mari à terminer sa traduction et qui l'aida à la publier. (...) Mardrus représentait pour lui [Mallarmé] un de ses rêves les plus chers: remettre en vogue le conte oriental. Mallarmé regrettait le XVIIIème siècle, âge d'ôr du conte oriental."; "Mallarmé qui collaborait à la <u>Revue Blanche</u> était très lié avec ses propriétaires les Nathanson, ses voisins à Valvins. Or c'est lui, en quelque sorte, le parrain des <u>Mille et Une Nuits</u>." (Aboul-Hussein 1970: 72, 293)

into the narrative a translation of the opening chapter of the Qur'an recited during services in Arab mosques. Likewise, he incorporated descriptive detail into other stories of the Hunchback cycle so that any mention of Arab cuisine reads as the breakdown of its recipe (examples 26-28); clothing and decor are rendered more sumptuous than the original (ex. 14, 15, 22, 31). Luxury items, silver atomisers for rose and orange blossom water (ex. 25), chased copper trays (ex. 29), porcelain dishes and patterned tiles (ex. 29, 31), etc, the type of souvenirs Western tourists bring back home after an outing in an oriental bazaar or souk, are finishing touches to the stories which enhance their exoticism. These transformations/deformations undergone by the <u>Nights</u> at Mardrus' hand resemble the earlier tendency to "exoticise" the narratives belonging to Galland's system of translation. However, Mardrus carries this exoticism one step further and makes "Oriental sex and sensualism" the central issue of his translation in order to guarantee himself (and his publisher) a bestseller. (17) Based on the English example of Burton's literary and economic success due, in part, to his "scandalous" footnotes and terminal essay (described by Elisséeff as a "statistique du vice", 1949: 81), and based on the general strategy of scandal literature of French authors at the end of the 19th-century as a means of marketing their work (18), Mardrus secured himself a place among the genre of the exotic/colonial novel (the 19th-century version of the 18th-century "conte oriental") by plugging into the widespread representation of Arab people and society as licentious, primitive,

<sup>17. &</sup>quot;Le succès de l'ouvrage fut tel que deux mois ne s'étaient pas encore écoulés qu'on en tirait la 4ème édition."; "Mardrus qui avait surgi depuis deux jours, dit Valéry, est parti hier soir pour la mer. En Septembre paraîtra le 3e volume. Les Nathanson [owners of the <u>Revue blanche</u>] prédisent 100.00 à 150.000 francs de bénéfice. Le fait est que l'on tire déjà la quatrième édition du premier volume." (Aboul-Hussein 1970: 300, 301 footnote 1)

<sup>18. &</sup>quot;C'est, d'autre part, une stratégie des 'entrants' dans le champ littéraire que de chercher le succès de scandales que procure le roman 'faisandé'." (Angenot 1986: 13); "On a montré que les années 1890 furent celles d'une grave crise commerciale de l'édition française à quoi a correspondu dans l'ordre symbolique toutes sortes de stratégies de "containment", de renouvellement, de tactiques de scandale et de provocation. L'écrit-marchandise..." (Angenot 1989: 1104)

barbaric and ultimately violent and despotic. The fact that Mardrus was of Arab origin gave his work an ideological weight and notoriety; the image he imparted of his <u>own</u> people and society confirmed what the Western world had suspected all along and striven to perpetuate: that the Orient was an inexhaustible source of sensualism, depravity and brutality. As E. Saîd points out "Oriental" sex was a standard commodity of 19th-century literature; little could be said or written about the Orient without its mention:

...so the Orient was a place where one could look for sexual experience unobtainable in Europe. Virtually no European writer who wrote on or traveled to the Orient in the period after 1800 exempted himself or herself from this quest: Flaubert, Nerval, "Dirty Dick" Burton, and Lane are only the most notable. In the twentieth century one thinks of Gide, Conrad, Maugham, and dozens of others. What they looked for often-- correctly, I think-- was a different type of sexuality, perhaps more libertine and less guilt-ridden; but even that quest, if repeated by enough people, could (and did) become as regulated and uniform as learning itself. In time "Oriental sex" was as standard a commodity as any other available in the mass culture, with the result that readers and writers could have it if they wished without necessarily going to the Orient. (1978: 190)

What is important to underline is that the standardisation and regulation of Oriental sex has little to do with actual practices and representations of sex in the Arab world, but has much more to do with "French sexual culture" (19) at the end of the 19th century and its respective themes and discursive practices. How then does Mardrus' system of translation fit into and betray its affliation to French sexual culture?

The end of the 19th century is the great era of sex, of pornography in French publications as M. Angenot demonstrates. (1986: 178) Its privileged themes are prostitution in the forefront (20), adultery, precocious/perverted young girls,

<sup>19.</sup> The expression is borrowed from Angenot, 1986.

<sup>20. &</sup>quot;S'il est pertinent d'appeler 'pornographique' la littérature du <u>Gil-Blas</u> et de la presse du Boulevard, c'est que le genre qui y domine c'est l'apothéose de la cocotte."; "La prostitution sera aussi <u>le</u> thème dominant du roman de circuit distingué où chaque écrivain en vue a écrit au cours des années récentes l'histoire d'une fille'." (Angenot 1986: 97, 98, <u>idem</u> 103)

sapphism, animal-like sexuality of the colonies, etc. The majority of "pornographic novels" are centered on women characters of two types: "la jeune fille détraquée et pervertie (...), et la femme adulte et adultère, névrosée et nymphomane." (Angenot 1986: 117) Let us recall that the structuring theme of 1001 Nights is the infidelity of women and the second most important theme is the social disorder and chaos resulting from illicit sexual relations, i.e. relations non-consecrated by marriage, fornication. All the stories of the Hunchback cycle (except for the frame story) belong to the second type, and there is often an exchange of money for sexual favours in the stories (Christian Broker, Jewish Doctor, Barber's Fifth Brother). Mardrus adds to the fornication and venal love typical of these <u>Nights</u>' stories female types, and themes dear to <u>19th-century</u> literature. The perverted young girl ("Dès son enfance elle fut pleine de perversité") and sapphic love ("corruptions", "tous les genres de libertinage", "expertes dans la débauche") are incorporated into the Jewish Doctor's story (ex. 7), an improvised striptease of a young slave-girl (ex. 15) is inserted into the Barber's Second Brother's story, hot and animal-like sex of the colonies ("elle était chaude et brûlante en copulation", "ce produit du désert arabe") is added to the Barber's Sixth Brother's story (ex. 24), and the young woman of the Barber's Fifth Brother's story, who lures men in order to take possession of their money, is presented as a nymphomaniac (ex. 22). Literary licentiousness and debauchery as a marketing strategy for guaranteeing sales is typical of late 19th-century artistic production. (21) The logic of transgression dominates this scandal strategy, thus the manner in which sex is written about goes against what is considered tolerable and moral: "Le désir est partout, et jamais moral ni conjugal, mais vénal, adultère, ou pathologique-pervers (ce sont les trois connotations du sexe comme transgression des convenances)." (Angenot 1986: 111) This transgression is never a

<sup>21. &</sup>quot;...la pornographie a envahi tout le champ artistique, depuis la littérature de vadrouille et les cartes transparentes qu'on vend sur les boulevards jusqu'à Zola, Maupassant et autres écrivains à prétentions novatrices et élevées." (Angenot 1986: 54)

## direct representation of sex, rather it consists in a rhetoric of veiling and disguise:

Car il faut faire mieux (ou pire) que Mendès ou Rachilde, si l'on veut percer sur le terrain, mais on ne saurait imaginer que la pure et simple "fuite en avant" dans la peinture la plus directe et la plus explicite de la sexualité soit <u>possible</u>. Il s'agira toujours d'opérer avec une audace signalée mais prudente, une indécence rhétoriquement vêtue, une transgression compensée et contrôlée: ces oxymorons signalent l'aporie essentielle... Le vocabulaire fait défaut comme le cadre idéologique qui rendrait cette peinture possible et ruinerait du même coup tout cet art dit "pornographique" qui consiste surtout à "tourner autour", à suggérer, à parler d'objets métonymiques: femmes vénales, couples sodomites, ou lesbiens silhouettes, atmosphère de luxe "indécent" où les indécences mêmes sont seulement suggérées. L'art du romancier indécent est un art du frôlement... (Angenot 1986: 53)

The impossibility of the direct representation of sex leads to a twisted and contrived mode of expression. Vocabulary is euphemistic, highly codified-comprehensible to the initiated few-- or tainted by value judgements: sex or bodily functions are dirty business. The most common words used to refer to coitus are "posséder" ("lorsque nous possédons une belle femme"), a favorite term of scientific discourse which ascribes to women a passive role modeled after female animal behaviour (Angenot 1986: 23), "stupre", "acte", "acte sexuel", "possession charnelle", and "geste d'amour".(22) In the Hunchback stories, the five references made to sexual encounters between men and women are expressed in a succinct and direct Arabic of the type, "I slept with her"/ "we slept together" or "I played with her"/ "she played with him". Mardrus, however, uses expressions typical of late 19th-century French discourse: "copuler"/"copulation" (ex. 4, 10, 22, 24, 47), "posséder"/"prendre" (ex. 5, 6, 12, 14), "monter" and "charger" (ex. 16, 19, 23, 47), "perversité, corruptions, libertinage" (ex. 7), "fornications" (ex. 11), "figure peinte comme une putain" (ex. 18), "assauts, foutreries, s'entrebaiser" (ex. 24), "vieille putain, fille de putain" (ex. 47). Sex and sensualism are never

<sup>22. &</sup>quot;...le romancier du dix-neuvième siècle, qui use bien pour son compte d'un langage oral direct et vulgaire-- celui où on "baise" (voir <u>passim</u> dans le journal des Goncourt), ne trouve au niveau de l<sup>\*</sup>imprimable' que des périphrases et des tropes maladroitement latinisants, lyriques, ou médicaux..." (Angenot 1986: 128)

represented without a component of animality, pathology and brutality in French social discourse at the end of the 19th century, and this representation is intensified when it's a question of sex in the colonies:

Si le sexe est désormais toujours situé en un "la-bàs", dans les profondeurs de pathologies dissimulés, il peut être aussi situé dans les lointains <u>coloniaux</u>. ...le récit érotique, où triomphe Loti, est toujours connoté de sensualité primitive et de libérations des interdits. (Angenot 1986: 123) Si le sexe en Europe rend fou, il vous transforme donc en animal en Afrique. Tous les sémantismes du roman servent cette mélopée du sexe bestial...On trouve dans le roman exotique la confirmation de cette proposition élémentaire que j'ai souvent formulée, le sexe ne va jamais seul, il ne se thématise qu'avec un autre thème: ici, celui de l'imperfectibilité morale de la race noire..." (<u>ibid</u>.: 124)

We could replace "black race" by "Arab race" in the above exert (23) for the primitivism and morally-base character of Arabs is presupposed by representations of Oriental sex as animal-like and depraved. Mardrus adheres to this mainstream representation of Arabs for he does not talk about sex in his translation without adding to his description an element of violence and brutality. Oriental sex is therefore always tinged by sadism and bestiality. The potent mixture of violence and sex is carried over to parts of the narratives where sex is originally absent. Mardrus inserted sex where there is none (ex. 8, 9, 10, 15, 20, 21, 22, 23, 47), and introduced violence in actions and words into passages (the most violent being the anal impalement of ex. 32) devoid of any (ex. 32-42, 47). At other times when sex is alluded to in the narratives, Mardrus is explicit and multiplies its representation: ex. 16, 17 and 22 are of this type of deformation. In the source text of the Barber's Second Brother's story, the erect phallus is referred to twice in ex. 16 and 17, however, Mardrus mentions it 4 times. Similarly, the almost euphemistic expression in Arabic "she played with him" is grossly expanded in ex. 22. In all

<sup>23. &</sup>quot;Theses of Oriental backwardness, degeneracy, and inequality with the West most easily associated themselves early in the nineteenth century with ideas about the biological bases of racial inequality. (...) To these ideas was added second-order Darwinism, which seemed to accentuate the "scientific" validity of the division of races into advanced and backward, or European-Aryan and Oriental-African." (Saïd 1978: 206)

three examples and in additional instances (ex. 8, 24, 47), Mardrus introduced into French the neologism "zebb" (the term "zobb", a loan word from Arabic, exists in English though), a calque of the Arabic word (of vulgar register) for "penis" and added "balls" ("deux oeufs") to complete the picture. Any description of sex in Mardrus' translation is an overstatement of the actual wording and representation in Arabic; he renders the somewhat playful and burlesque description in Arabic "downright dirty" and scandalous. Gratuitous obscenity is incorporated into the text such as "the sheep with the big tail" of example 46: "Il excellait dans la vente des viandes et hachis, et savait à merveille faire l'élevage et engraisser les moutons à grosse queue." However this blatant obscenity is also accompanied by subtler additions which prepare for the staging of the luxuriant and voluptuous ambiance associated with Oriental sex and sensualism: almond-shaped eyes darkened with kohl (ex. 2), black eyebrows and eyes like the night (ex.24), a young slave-girl hand-feeding succulent morsels of food to her guest (ex. 3), slave-girls stretched out on carpets (ex. 13), rhythm of drums (ex. 14), silk underpants (ex. 15), a young slender body like a palm tree shivering in the wind (ex. 17), gold velvet couches (ex. 22), vibrating breasts, stomach and hips (ex. 24), etc. Mardrus accentuates the sexual compliance and accessibility of the women characters in the narratives thus reinforcing for his Western/French reader the common idea that the Orient is an object (rather than a subject on equal footing) which is to be consumed, possessed, and on a political level, colonised:

Every one of them [writers of the 19th century] kept intact the separateness of the Orient, its eccentricity, its backwardness, its silent indifference, its feminine penetrability, its supine malleability; this is why every writer on the Orient, from Renan to Marx (ideologically speaking), or from the most rigorous scholars (Lane and Sacy) to the most powerful imaginations (Flaubert and Nerval), saw the Orient as a locale requiring Western attention, reconstruction even redemption. (Saïd 1978: 206)

This "feminine penetrability" and "supine malleability" are conveyed by Mardrus in his translation by a certain "feminisation" of the narratives. In the preface to the original edition of his translation (<u>Revue blanche</u> 24.5.1899), Mardrus talks of the <u>Nights</u> as though they were young virgin female objects to be consummated and appropriated by the Western male reader ("mes amis"): "J'OFFRE, toutes nues, vierges, intactes, naïves, pour mes délices et le plaisir de mes amis, CES NUITS ARABES vécues, rêvées et traduites sur leur terre natale et sur l'eau." He continues in the same tone for a few paragraphs then refers to his method of translation, literalism, "littéralité", in the same sexuated terms:

Car... une méthode, seule, existe, honnête et logique, de traduction: la littéralité, impersonnelle, à peine atténuée pour juste le rapide pli de paupière et savourer longuement... Elle produit, suggestive, la plus grande puissance littéraire. Elle fait le plaisir évocatoire. Elle recrée en indiquant. Elle est le plus sûr garant de vérité. Elle plonge, ferme, en sa nudité de pierre. Elle fleure l'arome primitif et le cristallise. Elle dévide et délie... Elle fixe.

Mardrus transposes this analogy between the feminine and sex associated with the Orient even to his inflated descriptions of Arab cuisine; just as the Oriental woman is offered up for the eager Western consumer, the exotic dish, a delight for the palate, is devoured with pleasure:

Le veillard dit: "Aussi, ô mon hôte, je n'attends pas moins de ta faim et de ta politesse que de te voir avaler les quarante-quatre aubergines farcies qui sont dans ce plat!" Mon frère dit: "Il m'est aisé de les avaler, car elles sont plus délicieuses que le sein de ma nourrice et plus caressantes à mon palais que les doigts de jeunes filles!" Et mon frère fit le geste de prendre chaque aubergine farcie l'une après l'autre et de l'avaler, en hochant la tête de plaisir et en faisant claquer sa langue sur son palais. (ex. 28)

Until his death, Mardrus' literary production fed off of the success of his 1001 Nights. His consecutive works were reiterations of the Oriental exoticism and sex already exploited in the Nights: La Reine de Saba (1918), L'Histoire charmante de l'adolescente Sucre d'amour (1927), Le Marié magique (1930)... Mardrus continued to play the role of the "exotic son of the Egyptian desert" French society had casted him in. His mandate was to "eternally" portray the Orient as an inexhaustible source of pleasures and sensualism, prone to primitivism, despotism and irrationality.

## Excerpts from Mardrus' Translation (See Appendix 2 for Arabic)

Remark: We have underlined amplifications of the source text which have been the object of our discussion.

#### Sex and Sensualism

Christian Broker's Story:

1. Alors je frappai à la porte de la demeure. Et la porte me fut ouverte par deux fillettes, deux jeunes vierges aux seins droits et <u>blancs arrondis comme deux</u> <u>lunes...(1: 158)</u>

[then I knocked on the door and two young girls, round-breasted virgins, resembling the moon, came out to me]

2. ...le visage lumineux et <u>les yeux allongés de kôhl</u>. Elle me sourit... (1: 158) [when she saw me, she smiled at my face]

3. Et tous deux nous mangeâmes jusqu'à satiété, et <u>elle me mettait elle-même les</u> morceaux à la bouche, et m'invitait chaque fois avec les termes les plus pressants. (1: 158)

[then I ate with her until we were satisfied then they brought the basin and the ewer]

4. Là nous nous assîmes à manger et à boire, puis à <u>copuler</u> jusqu'au matin. (1: 159) [then we ate and drank and slept until morning]

Jewish Doctor's Story

5. Je la <u>pris</u> alors. Et la nuit que je passai avec elle jusqu'au matin comptera parmi les meilleures, c'est évident. (1: 173)

[then I slept with her during the best of nights until morning]

6. Et aussitôt je m'étendis contre ma nouvelle amie et la <u>possédai</u> jusqu'au matin. (1: 174)

[and I slept with the new girl until morning time]

7. Sache donc, ô mon enfant, que la première adolescente est ma fille ainée. Dès son enfance elle fut <u>pleine de perversité</u>, et fut, pour cette raison, tenue par moi avec une grande sévérité. Mais, à peine fut-elle pubère... et elle me revint et réintégra ma maison. Mais elle n'avait pas manqué de profiter de son séjour en Égypte pour apprendre des Égyptiens tous les vices, <u>toutes les corruptions et tous</u> les genres de libertinage. Et tu sais, puisque tu as été en Egypte, combien expertes dans la débauche sont les femmes de ce pays. Les hommes ne leur <u>suffisent point, et elles s'aiment et se mêlent entre elles, et s'enivrent et se perdent</u>. Aussi, à peine de retour ici, elle te rencontra et se donna à toi et t'alla trouver quatre fois de suite. (1: 177)

[learn, O my son, that the older girl is my daughter and I was very severe with her. When she was of age... then she returned to me and she had learnt debauchery from the inhabitants of Egypt and she went to you four times]

#### Tailor's Story:

8. "Car cette ville de Bagdad ne se prête guère à ces sortes de rendez-vous, oh! pas du tout! Et surtout depuis que nous avons ce nouveau gouverneur qui est d'une terrible rigueur pour ces sortes de choses; <u>car on dit qu'il est sans zebb ni oeufs. et</u> <u>que c'est par haine et jalousie qu'il punit si sévèrement ces sortes d'aventures!</u>" (1: 188)

[in this city of Bagdad one cannot do these type of things, especially these days for the governor of Bagdad is extremely severe]

9. Je sais, en effet, et je veux maintenant que tout le monde le sache, que ta fille est éprise de mon maître et que mon maître le lui rend bien! Et je l'ai accompagné moi-même jusqu'ici. Et alors, toi, <u>tu l'as surpris dans le lit avec ta fille</u> et tu l'as assommé à coups de bâton, aidé de tes serviteurs. (1.: 190)

[the truth of the matter, all of it, is that your daughter is passionately in love with him and he is passionately in love with her. You found out that he entered your house so you ordered your slaves to beat him]

#### Barber's First Brother's Story:

10. Lorsque, le soir venu, Bacbouk voulut s'approcher de l'esclave blanche, <u>elle lui</u> <u>dit: "Non, non! pas ce soir!" Et il ne put, malgré tout son désir, prendre même un</u> <u>baiser de la jolie esclave</u>.

Or, pour l'occasion, comme Bacbouk logeait d'ordinaire dans la boutique, on lui dit de dormir, ce soir-là, dans le moulin situé dans le bas de la maison pour qu'ils eussent plus de place, lui et sa nouvelle épouse. <u>Et. après le refus de copulation de</u> <u>l'esclave</u> qui était remontée chez sa maîtresse, Bacbouk fut obligé de se coucher tout seul. (1: 195)

[at night he wanted to enter into her; they said to him: Spend the night in the mill until tomorrow, it is better. He believed their intention sincere so he spent the night in the mill alone]

11. Je suis sûr que tu viens de passer une nuit dans le bonheur pur, dans les ébats les plus amusants et les plus intimes et dans les embrassades, baisers et fornications depuis le soir jusqu'au matin!" (1: 196)

[and he (the sheikh) said to (my brother): May God grant you a long life! May your marriage be blessed! For sure you spent the night taking pleasure, caressing and embracing from evening until morning]

#### Barber's Second Brother's Story:

12. ...où tu trouverais des joues lisses à baiser, des tailles fines et <u>pliantes à</u> <u>posséder</u>... (1: 197)

[and a smooth cheek to kiss and a graceful form to embrace]

13. ...il tomba au milieu d'un groupe formé par quatre jeunes filles incomparables; <u>étendues sur les tapis</u>, elles chantaient d'une voix délicieuse des chansons qui auraient ému les roches les plus dures. (1: 198)

[then my brother looked and saw (in the palace) four girls and one never saw more beautiful than them and they were singing with voices that would have moved even the hardest of rocks]

14. Puis la plus belle des jeunes filles s'avança vers lui et dit: "O mon maître, tu viens maintenant de conquérir mon âme par la vue de tes charmes. Aussi je n'ai plus qu'une grâce à te demander, c'est d'exécuter devant nous, ainsi nu et joli, quelque danse suggestive et élégante!" Et comme El-Haddar se refusait un peu, elle lui dit: "Je t'adjure, par ma vie, de le faire! <u>Et ensuite tu me posséderas!</u>" Alors <u>El-Haddar</u>, au son de la darabouka, rythmiquement maniée par la vieille, s'entoura la taille d'un foulard de soie et, s'avancant au milieu de la pièce, dansa. (1: 198)

[and she said: My master, you have taken control of me by your handsome character. Then she entreated him by her life that he stand up to dance. So he stood and danced and there wasn't a pillow in the room which she did not hit him with]

15. ...elles se mirent à lui lancer à la tête tout ce qu'elles avaient sous la main: les oreillers, les fruits, les boissons et jusqu'aux flacons.

Mais c'est alors seulement que se passa la dernière chose. La plus belle des jeunes filles se leva, et un par un, et en prenant toutes sortes de poses, et en regardant mon frère avec des yeux en coulisse et comme éperdus de passion, elle se mit à enlever ses vêtements et il ne lui resta plus que la chemise fine et l'ample caleçon de soie. Et, à cette vue. El-Haddar, qui avait interrrompu sa danse, s'écria: "Allah!" Allah!" et il s'affola extrêmement.

Alors la vieille femme s'approcha de lui et lui dit: "Maintenant... (1: 199)

[likewise all of the slave-girls started hitting him with the likes of oranges, lemons and citrons until he fell down fainting from the blows and the slapping on his back and the casting of things in his face did not cease until the old woman said : Now]

16. Alors la vieille femme s'approcha de lui et lui dit: "Maintenant, il s'agit d'attraper ton amoureuse à la course. Car ma maîtresse a l'habitude, une fois excitée par les danses et la boisson, de se dévêtir toute, et de ne pas se livrer à l'amoureux que si, <u>après l'examen de ses membres nus, de son zebb en érection et</u> <u>de sa légèreté à la course, elle le juge digne d'elle</u>. Tu vas donc la poursuivre partout, de chambre en chambre, et le zebb debout, jusqu'à ce que tu puisses l'attraper. Et c'est alors seulement qu'elle te laissera <u>monter</u> sur elle!" (1: 199)

lit is her custom when she is drunk not to let anyone overtake her until she has

taken off her clothes and her pants and she remains naked without all of her clothes and you hereafter take off your clothes and run behind her and she runs before you as though fleeing from you and you don't stop following her from place to place until your penis stands erect then she will allow you to overtake her]

17. A ces paroles, mon frère rejeta la ceinture de soie, et s'apprêta à la course. De son côté, la jeune fille rejeta sa chemise fine et son caleçon, et apparut aussi nette qu'un jeune palmier frissonant sous la brise; et elle prit son élan et s'élança, en riant aux éclats, et fit deux fois le tour de la salle. Et mon frère Haddar, le zebb debout en avant, la poursuivait. (...) Mon frère Haddar, le zebb debout et en avant, se mit à la poursuite de l'adolescente légère et rieuse. Et à cette vue, les trois jeunes filles et la vieille, devant la figure peinte et sans barbe ni moustaches ni sourcils de mon frère Haddar dont le zebb nu s'érigeait follement, furent prises d'un rire considérable, et se mirent à trépigner et à battre des mains.

Quant à la jeune fille nue, après deux tours dans la salle, elle enfila une longue galerie, puis d'autres chambres, l'une après l'autre, et toujours suivie et serrée de près par mon frère qui haletait et dont le zebb s'érigeait à la folie. Et elle courait toujours rieuse de toutes ses dents et mouvementée de ses hanches. (1: 199)

[when the old woman said to him: Stand up and take off your clothes, he stood up, quite beside himself, and took off his clothes and remained naked. Then the slave-girl said to my brother: Stand now and run after me and I will run in front of you and if you want something then follow me. Then she ran in front of him and he followed her then she started going in and out of the rooms repeatedly with my brother behind her and lust had overcome him and his penis stood erect as though he were crazy and she didn't stop running in front of him and he behind her until he heard a soft cry from her]

18. Mais soudain, à un détour, le [sic] jeune fille disparut, et mon frère, en ouvrant une porte par où il croyait la jeune fille sortie, se trouva au milieu d'une rue. Et cette rue était la rue des courroyeurs de Bagdad. Et tous les courroyeurs virent El-Haddar, la barbe rasée, et les moustaches et sourcils rasés, et <u>la figure</u> <u>peinte comme une putain</u>, et ils le huèrent, et ils prirent des courroies et se mirent à le fustiger, tout en riant aux éclats, et à le battre si fort qu'il perdit toute connaissance. (1: 199)

[when she was running in front of him and he behind her, he suddenly found himself in the middle of a street and this street was the market of the leather-sellers, who were crying skins for sale. When the people saw him in this state, naked, erect penis, beard, eyebrows and moustache shaven and face rouged, they yelled at him and started laughing and guffawing and began to hit him with their skins, and him being naked, until he fainted]

#### Barber's Third Brother's Story:

19. Nous sommes ici quatre faux aveugles qui trompons les gens pour recevoir l'aumône, et surtout pour avoir la facilité d'entrer dans les maisons, de regarder les femmes à découvert, et de les corrompre et <u>de les monter et de les charger</u>, et de

les voler ensuite, et d'inspecter l'intérieur des maisons et de préparer le vol à coup sûr. (1: 202)

[then he said we four pretend to be blind and we intrude on people and enter houses and see the women and use artful means to corrupt them and to win money from them]

#### Barber's Fifth Brother's Story:

20. Il s'accroupit tranquillement, s'appuya le dos contre le mur d'une maison, et se mit à offrir sa marchandise aux passants, en la criant: "O verres! ô gouttes de soleil! <u>ô seins des adolescentes d'albâtre</u>! yeux de ma nourrice! ô verres! ô verres!" (1: 206; <u>idem 209</u>)

[then he leaned against it (the wall) and sat down thinking to himself]

21. "Mon fils, cette jeune femme, qui est fort belle, ne t'a fait cette générosité que pour t'exprimer son penchant pour toi, qui es jeune, beau et vigoureux, <u>alors</u> que son mari est impuissant et bien en retard. une fois au lit. avec elle: car il est <u>affligé d'une paire d'oeufs froids à faire pitié</u>. Lève-toi donc, mets tout ton or dans ta ceinture, de peur qu'on ne te le vole dans cette maison sans cadenas, et viens avec moi." (1: 210)

[she said: O son, she has taken a liking to you but she is the wife of a wealthy man so take all of your money with you]

22. Elle s'approcha alors de mon frère, lui prit la main, et l'attira à elle sur <u>le divan</u> <u>de velours d'or</u>. Là il serait inutile de détailler tout ce que, une heure durant, mon frère et l'adolescente se firent l'un à l'autre en <u>embrassades</u>, <u>copulations</u>, <u>baisers</u>, <u>morsures</u>, <u>caresses</u>, <u>coups de zebb</u>, <u>torsions</u>, <u>contorsions</u>, <u>variations</u>, <u>premièrement</u>, <u>deuxièmement</u>, <u>troisièmement</u>, <u>et autrement</u>.

Après ces ébats, la jeune femme se releva et dit à mon frère: "Mon oeil, ne bouge pas d'ici avant que je ne revienne!" Puis elle sortit vivement et disparut. (1: 211)

[then my brother sat down and she sat down beside him and played with him for a while then stood up and said to him: Don't leave until I come to you, and she vanished from my brother for a while]

23. ...puis elle prit mon frère par les pieds et le traîna à travers les chambres jusqu'à un endroit de la cour où, par une ouverture, elle le lança au fond d'un trou noir où elle avait l'habitude de précipiter les cadavres de tous ceux que ses artifices attiraient dans cette maison pour <u>servir de monteurs solides à l'assaut de sa jeune maîtresse</u>, et pour ensuite être dépouillés et jetés dans ce souterrain... (1: 211)

[then the old woman came to my brother and pulled him by the feet to a long, obscure basement where she threw him on the other victims]

#### Barber's Sixth Brother's Story:

24. Or, le Bédouin avait sous sa tente, comme épouse, une merveille d'entre les

femmes, aux sourcils noirs et aux yeux de nuit: et elle était chaude et brûlante en copulation. Aussi elle ne manquait, chaque fois que son mari le Bédouin s'éloignait de sa tente, de se proposer à mon frère et de venir s'offrir à lui de tout son corps, ce produit du désert arabe. Quant à mon frère Schakâlik, qui, contrairement à nous tous, n'était pas fameux en assauts et en foutreries, il se refusait à cette Bédouine, par honte d'être vu par Allah le Très-Haut! Pourtant, un jour d'entre les jours, cette Bédouine enflammée réussit à troubler la continence de Schakâlik, mon frère, en rôdant sans cesse autour de lui avec des mouvements fort excitants de hanches, de seins et de ventre harmonieux. Et mon frère la prit, joua avec elle des jeux de circonstance et finit par la prendre sur ses cuisses. Et pendant qu'ils étaient tous deux dans cette posture, en train de s'entrebaiser, soudain le Bédouin terrible fit irruption dans la tente et vit le spectacle de son propre oeil. Alors le Bédouin plein de férocité tira de sa ceinture un coutelas large à trancher d'un seul coup la tête d'un chameau d'une veine jugulaire à l'autre. Et il saisit mon frère et commença par lui couper les deux lèvres adultérines, et les lui enfonça ensuite dans la bouche. Et il s'écria: "Malheur à toi, ô traître perfide, voilà que maintenant tu as réussi à corrompre mon épouse!" Et, en disant ces paroles, le Bédouin dur saisit le zebb encore chaud de Schakâlik, mon frère, et le trancha à la racine d'un seul coup, lui et les deux oeufs. Puis il traîna Schakâlik par les pieds et le jeta sur le dos d'un chameau et le conduisit au sommet d'une montagne où il le jeta, et partit en l'état de son chemin. (1: 219)

[then the tyrannical bedouin took out a broad knife that could come down on the neck of a camel and cut it from one end of the jugular vein to the other; he took it in his right hand and approached my poor brother and cut his lips with it and persisted in his demand. This bedouin had a beautiful wife and when the bedouin would go out, she would turn her attention to my brother and try to seduce him but he would resist because of his shame before God the Highest and it came to pass one day that she tried to seduce him and he stood up and played with her and sat her down on his lap and while the two were in this position, suddenly her husband entered. When he saw my brother he said to him: Woe to you, you wicked person. Do you want to corrupt my wife? Then he took out his knife and cut off his penis with it and put him on a camel and abandoned him on top of a mountain and left him and went his way]

## Culinary Exoticism

#### Tailor's Story: Dialogue Between Young Man and Barber

25. "J'ai à ta disposition cinq marmites remplies de toutes sortes de choses délicieuses: <u>aubergines et courges farcies</u>. feuilles de vigne farcies et assaisonnées <u>au citron</u>, <u>boulettes soufflées au blé concassé et à la viande écrasée</u>. du riz aux tomates avec de petits morceaux de filet de mouton, du ragoût aux petits oignons; de plus j'ai dix poulets rôtis et un mouton grillé; puis <u>deux grands plateaux</u>. l'un de kenafa et l'autre de pâtisserie au fromage doux et au miel; des fruits de toutes sortes: des concombres. des melons, des pommes, des limons et des dattes fraîches, et bien d'autres encore!" Il me dit alors: "Fais donc apporter tout cela en ma présence, que je voie!" Et moi, je fis apporter toutes ces choses, et il les examina et goûta à chaque chose, et il me dit: "Ta générosité est une grande générosité. Mais il manque des boissons!" Je lui dis: "J'ai cela!" Il me dit: "Fait apporter cela!" Et je fis apporter <u>six pots remplis de six espèces de boissons</u>, et il goûta à chacune et me dit: "Puisse Allah te munir de toutes ses grâces! Que ton âme est généreuse! Mais il manque l'encens, le benjoin et les parfums à brûler dans la salle, et aussi <u>l'eau de rose et l'eau de fleur d'oranger</u> pour en asperger mes hôtes!" Je lui fis alors apporter une cassette remple d'ambre gris, de bois d'aloès, de nadd, de musc, d'encens et de benjoin, le tout valant plus de cinquante dinars d'or; et je n'oubliais pas non plus <u>les essences aromatiques et les aspersoirs d'argent contenant les eaux</u> <u>de senteur</u>. (1: 186)

[then I said: I have five types of dishes and ten roasted chickens and one broiled lamb. Then he (the barber) said: Bring them for me to see. Then I brought all of that to him. Then when he saw that he said: The drink remains. I said: I have some. He said: Bring it. So I brought it to him. He said: How excellent you are! There is no one more generous than yourself! But there remains the incense and the perfume. So I brought to him a box in which there was incense (24), aloeswood, ambergis and musk worth fifty dinars]

#### Barber's Sixth Brother's Story:

26. "Mais, ô mon hôte, prends et mange de ce plateau où tu vois se dorer cette admirable <u>pâte losangée de kébéba au beurre, cuite au four</u>! Crois bien que la cuisinière n'y a épargné ni <u>la viande rouge bien battue, ni le blé mondé et</u> <u>concassé, ni le cardamome, ni le poivre</u>! Mange donc, pauvre affamé, et dis-moi, que penses-tu de son goût, de son odeur et de son parfum?" (1: 215)

[then the master of the house called out: O servant, bring us the <u>sikbāj</u> (25), the likes of which is not found among meals for kings. Then he said to my brother: Eat my guest for you are indeed hungry with a great hunger and need to eat]

27. Le vieillard dit: "Comme tu me fais plaisir, ô mon hôte! mais je pense que je ne mérite pas ces louanges, car alors que dirais-tu de ce mets qui est là, à ta gauche, de ces merveilleux poulets rôtis, farcis aux pistaches, <u>aux amandes, au riz</u>, <u>au raisin sec. au poivre, à la cannelle et à la viande hachée de mouton</u>? Et que dis-tu de leur fumet!" (1: 215-216)

[then he called out: Bring the chicken stuffed with pistachio nuts to us. Eat! you've never eaten anything like it]

28. Et le vieillard fit le geste de confectionner une bouchée qu'il aurait prise à un plat sur la nappe et, l'approchant des lèvres de mon frère, lui dit: "Prends et mange cette bouchée, ô mon hôte, et tu me donneras ton opinion sur ce plat où les

<sup>24. &</sup>quot;nadd": incense made of aloeswood, ambergis, musk and frankincense.

<sup>25.</sup> As indicated by Lane in his notes to the Hunchback cycle (no. 98), sikbāj is a "dish composed of meat, wheat-flour and vinegar".

aubergines farcies nagent dans leur sauce appétissante!" Et mon frère fit le geste d'allonger le cou, d'ouvrir la bouche et d'avaler la bouchée; puis il dit en fermant les yeux de plaisir: "Ya Allah! que c'est agréable et bon à digérer! Je constate avec un plaisir inouî que nulle part ailleurs que dans ta demeure je n'ai goûté d'aussi bonnes aubergines farcies! Tout y est ménagée avec l'art de doigts experts: la viande hachée d'agneau, les pois chiches, les pépins de pin, les grains de cardamome, la noix muscade, les clous de girofle, le gingembre, le poivre et les herbes aromatiques. Et je perçois, tant c'est bien fait, le goût de chaque aromate!" Le viellard dit: "Aussi, ô mon hôte, je n'attends pas moins de ta faim et de ta politesse que de te voir avaler les <u>quarante-quatre aubergines farcies</u> qui sont dans ce plat!" Mon frère dit: "Il m'est aisé de les avaler, car elles sont plus délicieuses que le sein de ma nourrice et plus caressantes à mon palais que les doigts de jeunes filles!" Et mon frère fit le geste de prendre chaque aubergine farcie l'une après l'autre et de l'avaler, en hochant la tête de plaisir et en faisant claquer sa langue sur son palais. Et il pensait en lui-même à tous ces mets, et sa faim s'exaspérait, et se disait qu'il se contenterait fort bien, pour assouvir sa faim, d'un simple pain sec de fèves moulues ou de maîs. Mais il se garda bien de trahir son sentiment. (1: 216)

[and he gestured as though he were approaching his hand to my brother's mouth in order to feed him bit by bit with his hand and he enumerated the dishes, describing them to my brother and he being hungry and his hunger intensifying and he started to crave a flat loaf of barley. Then the owner of the house said to him: Have you seen spices more delicious than in these dishes? Then my brother said to him: No, O my master]

29. Alors le vieillard frappa ses mains l'une contre l'autre et s'écria: "Vous autres! enlevez cette nappe, et tendez-nous la nappe du désert! et portez-nous toutes les pâtisseries, toutes les confitures et tous les fruits les plus choisis!" Et aussitôt accoururent les jeunes esclaves qui se mirent à aller et venir, et à agiter leurs mains, et à élever leurs bras arrondis au-dessus de leur tête, et à changer la nappe pour en mettre une autre; puis, à un geste du vieillard, ils se retirèrent. Et le vieillard dit à mon frère Schakâlik: "C'est maintenant, ô mon hôte, le moment de nous dulcifier. Commençons par les pâtisseries. N'est-elle pas réjouissante à l'infini, cette pâte fine, légère, dorée, arrondie, et farcie aux amandes, au sucre et aux grenades, dans cette assiette, cette pâte de kataîefs sublimes! Par ma vie! goûte une ou deux pour voir! Hein! le sirop en est-il assez lié et juste à point, et la poudre de cannelle gentiment saupoudrée au-dessus! On en mangerait, sans se rassasier, une cinquantaine; mais il faut réserver une place pour cette excellente kenafa du plateau de cuivre ciselé. Regarde comme ma pâtissière est habile, et comme elle a su enrouler artistement les écheveaux de la pâte! Ah! de grâce, hâte-toi de t'en réjouir le palais avant que son julep ne s'écoule et qu'elle ne s'effrite: elle est si délicate! Oh! regarde! et cette mahallabieh à l'eau de rose et saupoudrée de pistaches pulvérisées! Et ces porcelaines remplies de crème soufflée. relevée d'aromates et d'eau de fleur d'oranger! Mange..." (1: 216)

[then the man called out to his attendants: Bring the sweets. Then they moved

their hands in the air as though they were bringing the sweets then the owner of the house said to my brother: Eat this variety, it's excellent and eat these <u>qatāif</u>, on my life, and take this <u>qataifa</u> before the julep falls from it. Then my brother said to him: I'm well served, O my master. Then my brother proceeded to question him about the quantity of musk that was in the qatāif. He said to him: This is the custom in my house. Always they put for me in every <u>qataifa</u> a miskal (26) of musk and half a miskal of ambergis. Eat this one]

30. Le vieillard continua: "Aux confitures maintenant et aux fruits! Comme confitures, ô mon hôte tu n'as que l'embarras du choix, comme tu peux le constater. Tu vois là, devant toi, des confitures sèches, et des confitures dans leur jus. Je te conseille beaucoup les sèches, que je préfère, quoique les autres me tiennent à coeur également. Vois cette transparence et rutilante confiture sèche d'abricots, étalée en large lames fines, fondantes, sympathiques! et cette confiture sèche de cédrats et au sucre cristallisé, parfumée à l'ambre! et l'autre, l'arrondie en boules roses, de pétales de roses et de pétales de fleurs d'oranger! oh! celle-là surtout, vois-tu, j'en mourrai un jour! Réserve-toi! Réserve-toi! car je te conseille de te plonger un peu dans <u>cette confiture humide de dattes farcies d'amandes et de</u> clous de girofle. Elle me vient du Caire, car à Bagdad on ne la fait pas si bien. Aussi ai-je chargé un de mes amis d'Égypte de m'envoyer cent pots remplis de cette délicieuse-là! Mais ne vas pas si vite, quoique ton empressement et ton appétit m'honorent extrêmement! Je veux que tu me donnes particulièrement ton avis sur cette confiture sèche de carottes au sucre, aux noix et parfumée de musc!" (...) Le vieillard continua: "Mais n'oublie pas ces fruits! car j'espère que tu as encore de la place. Voilà des limons, des bananes, des figues, des dattes fraîches, des pommes. des coings, des raisins et d'autres et d'autres! Mange, ô mon hôte!" (1: 217)

[then the owner of the house called out to his attendants: Bring the dried fruits and nuts. Then they moved their hands in the air as though they were bringing the dried fruits and nuts and he said to my brother: Eat these almonds, and these walnuts and these raisins and the others. Then he began to enumerate to him the types of dried fruits and nuts saying: Eat, don't be ashamed. Then my brother said to him: O my master, I've had enough and I am no longer able to eat another thing]

# Exoticism and Magnificence in Decor

# Barber's Sixth Brother's Story

31. Alors mon frère entra, franchit le grand portique, traversa la cour spacieuse et le jardin, qui était rempli <u>des plus beaux arbres et d'oiseaux chanteurs</u>. Cette cour était pavée des plus beaux marbres <u>blancs et noirs</u>, et le jardin était incomparable

<sup>26.</sup> An Egyptian measure of 4.68 g (Lane).

de tenue, et nul humain n'en avait jamais vu le pareil. Tout autour, régnait une galerie à jour pavée de marbre; de grands rideaux y entretenaient la fraîcheur pendant les heures chaudes. Et mon frère continua à marcher et entra dans la salle principale, <u>qui était toute couverte de carreaux de porcelaine colorés de bleu, de</u> <u>vert et d'or, avec des fleurs et des feuillages entrelacés; au milieu de la salle, il y</u> <u>avait un beau bassin d'albâtre où coulait l'eau fraîche avec bruit fort doux. Une</u> <u>merveilleuse natte colorée tapissait la moitié surélevée du sol; et, appuyé sur des</u> <u>coussins de soie brodée d'or</u>, sur la natte était assise à son aise un très beau vieillard à la longue barbe blanche et à la figure éclairée par un sourire bienveillant. (1:214)

[then he entered the vestibule and walked through it for a while until he arrived at a residence of extreme beauty and elegance, in the middle of which was a garden whose beauty no one has ever seen before and whose floor was paved with marble and whose curtains were lowered. My brother didn't know where to proceed so he advanced towards the middle of the abode when he saw a man handsome of face and beard]

## Oriental Despotism, Barbarism and Violence

Jewish Doctor's Story:

32. Et le roi de la Chine dit: "Si tu dis vrai, je vous pardonnerai à tous! Mais malheur à toi si tu me racontes une histoire faible d'intérêt et dénuée de choses sublimes. <u>Car je n'hésiterai pas à vous empaler, toi et tes compagnons, en vous faisant forer d'outre en outre, de la base jusqu'au sommet!</u>" (1: 178)

[then he (the King of China) said: O tailor, if you tell me something more wondrous than the story of the hunchback I will forgive all of you your offenses. So the tailor advanced]

#### Tailor's Story

33. Et le kâdi, à peine entré, se mit à donner la bastonnade à cette jeune esclave, et il devait lui fouetter très fort le derrière, car elle se mit à pousser des hurlements de travers... (1: 189-190)

[a slave girl had committed an offense against the owner of the house therefore he beat her and she cryed out]

34. Je me précipitai dans l'intérieur de la boutique et priai le propriétaire d'empêcher ce maudit d'entrer derrière moi. Et il put l'en empêcher <u>en lui</u> montrant un énorme gourdin et en lui faisant des yeux terribles. Mais le barbier ne partit qu'en maudissant le marchand. le père et le grand-père du marchand, et lui disant toutes les injures qu'il connaissait. (1: 191)

[I entered a shop in the middle of the market and appealed for aid from its owner and he kept him (the barber) away from me]

## Barber's Second Brother's Story:

35. Et mon frère obéit et resta et supporta patiemment toutes les fantaisies de la

jeune fille, qui le <u>piquait</u>, le <u>pinçait</u>, et lui caressait vivement la nuque d'une manière, en somme, pleine de malice et désagréable. Et les trois autres rivalisaient de leur mieux à qui lui jouerait la meilleure farce; <u>l'une lui tirait l'oreille à</u> <u>l'arracher</u>. <u>l'autre lui donnait des chiquenaudes à le faire pleurer, et la troisième</u> <u>s'appliquait de préférence à le pincer avec les ongles</u>. Et mon frère patientait beaucoup, car la vieille lui faisait toujours signe de ne rien dire. (1: 198)

[then he returned and sat down and did not speak. Then she returned to slapping him on the back until he fainted]

#### Barber's Third Brother's Story:

36. L'homme répondit: "<u>O toi qui es plus bas que mon cul</u>, pourquoi ne répondais-tu donc pas, toi-même, quand je criais de l'intérieur: "Qui est là? Qui est à la porte?" (1: 200)

[then he said: O vilest of the vile! Why didn't you ask me for something in the name of God when you heard my words the first time while you were knocking on the door?]

#### Barber's Fourth Brother's Story:

37. Mais, un jour, El-Kouz voulut compter tout l'argent qu'il avait amasser de cette manière, pour ensuite acheter de beaux moutons et <u>surtout quelques béliers</u> qu'il voulait dresser à se battre entre eux, exercice fort recherché à Bagdad, ma <u>ville</u>. Mais à peine avait-il ouvert le coffret... (1: 203)

[then he wanted to take them (dirhams) out and buy some sheep then he opened the chest]

38. "Fasse Allah que ce maudit cheikh revienne maintenant, et je lui arracherai la barbe et le turban de mes propres mains!" (1: 203) [perhaps that shiekh will come then I will have him arrested]

39. Mon frère protesta vivement: "Si la chose est prouvée comme tu le dis, <u>ô chien</u> fils de chien, mes biens et mon sang t'appartiennent légitimement!" (1: 203) [then my brother said to him: If the matter is as you mention it to be then my property and my blood are lawfully yours]

40. Aussitôt une clameur s'éleva de la foule qui se précipita dans la boutique de mon frère et la prit d'assaut. Et, à la vue de tous, un cadavre d'homme apparut

suspendu au crochet, <u>écorché, préparé, nettoyé et vidé</u>... (1: 204) [then the people rushed into the store of my brother and saw that the ram had

become a man hooked up and when they saw that]

## Barber's Fifth Brother's Story

41. Et elle alors finira par s'enhardir un peu, devant mon silence, et insistera auprès de moi pour me faire prendre la coupe de vin, et l'approchera elle-même gentiment de mes lèvres. Mais moi, devant une pareille familiarité, je deviendrai furieux, je la regarderai terriblement et <u>lui appliquerai sur la figure un grand</u> the stories as illustrations and examples of modern Arab society as they experienced it. In their annotations, the modern and the medieval, fiction and reality are blended as they edited and reconstructed them. If the "Modern Egyptians" were still living in the "Dark Ages", Western civilisation would serve as a model of advancement and progress for them to emulate. In our discussion of their annotations, we do not intend to give an exhaustive inventory of their themes and subjects, but rather intend to demonstrate how the stories are used as a springboard for a tendentious and ideologically manipulative discourse on Arab society and culture.

Lane made himself known to the English public by the success of his <u>Modern Egyptians</u> (29): the first edition (1836) was sold out in a fortnight, and 6,500 copies of the second edition were bought in a short time; in all, three reprints appeared between 1836-1847. His "Arabian Nights" followed suit: it was sold in monthly instalments at a very affordable price between 1838-1841, and was re-published several times (1847, 1853, 1855, 1859...) before Payne's and Burton's translations appeared. Its immediate popularity was due to the translator's annotations:

For Lane's contemporaries, it was the notes to the translation that formed the most arresting and important part of the work. All reviewers praised the <u>notations</u> [sic]. (Ahmed 1978: 141)

On six occasions in the endnotes to the Hunchback cycle (notes 29, 38, 54, 59, 69, 80), Lane referred his reader to <u>Modern Egyptians</u> for ampler detail. The chapter titles of Lane's <u>Modern Egyptians</u> read as follows:

Country and Climate-- Metropolis-- Houses-- Population; Personal Characteristics, and Dress, of the Muslim Egyptians; Infancy and Early Education; Religion and Laws; Government; Domestic Life (Men of the Higher and Middle Orders); Domestic Life (The Lower Orders), Common Usages of Society; Languages, Literature and Science; Superstitions (Genii, Saints, and Darweeshes, Charms and Auguration); Magic, Astrology, and

<sup>29. &</sup>quot;Lane's book on the Egyptians was influential, it was frequently read and cited (by Flaubert among others), and it established its author's reputation as an eminent figure in Orientalist scholarship." (Saîd 1978: 158)

integrated into the corpus of Orientalist scholarship of the highest status.(30) It is evident by his detailed and scholarly paratext that Lane wished to prove himself an authority on the East of the same expertise and learning as any other Orientalist scholar. Alongside this researched and documented commentary on Arab society of the <u>Nights</u> are observations of a "personal type" drawn from the translator's travels to modern Egypt. These observations are of an "unacademic" nature, belonging more to the "travel literature" genre, giving practical advice to the prospective traveller to the Arab world, or relating anecdotes of the curiosities and peculiarities of the Orient. Here are some examples taken from the Hunchback cycle:

Most Arab cities abound with cats, which are much favoured by the inhabitants. These animals are often seen leaping across from the terrace of one house to that of another on the opposite side of a narrow street; and often has my kitchen in Cairo been robbed by them. They are said to contribute greatly to the spreading of the plague. (note 4)

(...) I was once told that the master of an English merchant-vessel, having fallen asleep in a state of intoxication on the shore of the harbour of Alexandria, at night, was devoured by [wild] dogs. (note 5)

For this monthly rent (or about a guinea of our money), a large and handsome house may be hired at the present day in Cairo. (note 51)

Lane seemed to address his <u>Nights</u> to a specialised readership by his erudite annotations, while at the same time he intended his work for a larger readership because of the "unscholarly" anecdotes and mini-narratives of his trips to Egypt included in his endnotes, and because of the elimination of passages of a licentious or explicit nature: the French kiss of the Christian Broker's story, the whipping of the backside of the Steward's story, the night in bed with the young girl of the Jewish Doctor's story, the stripping of the Barber's Second Brother and the young

<sup>30.</sup> i.e. Silvestre de Sacy: "Sacy's work canonizes the Orient; it begets a canon of textual objects passed on from one generation of students to the next. And the living legacy of Sacy's disciples was astounding. Every major Arabist in Europe during the nineteenth century traced his intellectual authority back to him." (Saîd 1978: 129)

hostess, and his chasing after her with an erect penis, and the castration of the Barber's Sixth Brother of the Hunchback cycle. However, it is clear that Lane strove to establish his reputation as an orientalist for his later publications, notably his <u>Lexicon</u>, were works of professional scholarship. It is because of this personal ambition that Lane introduced the <u>1001 Nights</u> into the realm of Oriental studies, and contributed to rendering it one of the "classics", though of a popular nature, of Western scholarship. As a result, every major orientalist of the past two centuries has had something to say about its origin, narrative structure and themes.

To know more than the specialist and the "native" himself: this will to knowledge and power is the ideal Burton proposes to his English reader and fellowman:

I here end these desultory but necessary details to address the reader in a few final words. He will not think lightly of my work when I repeat to him that with the aid of my annotations supplementing Lane's, the student will readily and pleasantly learn more of the Moslem's manners and custom, laws and religion than is known to the average Orientalist; and if my labours induce him to attack the text of The Nights he will become master of much more Arabic than the ordinary Arab owns. (Burton 1885, vol.1: xxiii)

Burton portrayed himself as the "professional discoverer" and "collector of unknown facts". His objective was to map the unmapped in his <u>Pilgrimage to</u> <u>al-Medinah and Meccah</u>: "...I offered my services to the Royal Geographical Society of London, for the purpose of removing that opprobrium to modern adventure, the huge white blot which in our maps still notes the eastern and the central regions of Arabia." (1855, vol.1: 1) His strategy as an outsider to the academic field of Orientalism was to mention the unmentionable, knowledge deemed unfit for print and publication: "These volumes [of the <u>1001 Nights</u>], moreover, afford me the long-sought opportunity of noticing practices and customs which interest all mankind which 'Society' will not hear mentioned." (1885, vol.1: xviii) In Burton's translation, there are approximately 200 notes to the Hunchback cycle, while Lane inserted only 102 notes. Of these 200 notes,

161

Burton makes 13 references to his <u>Pilgrimage to al-Medinah and Meccah</u> (31), 7 to Lane's <u>Modern Egyptians</u> (32), 7 to Lane's annotations of the <u>1001 Nights</u> (33), 6 to the Qur'ān (34), and 2 to George Sale (35). Burton did not associate the <u>Nights</u> with scholarly works of Orientalism to the same extent as Lane did. His remaining annotations are of a personal type, based on his observations (or should one say preconceptions) of customs and habits of Arab people. The element particular to Burton's footnotes is his deliberate exploitation of any mention of the body and sex. He owed the notoriety of his translation to the scandal surrounding his annotations and his "unexpurged" translation of the few sexual scenes found in the <u>Nights</u>: "The different versions, however, have each its proper destination: Galland's for the nursery, Lane for the library, Payne for the study and Burton for the sewer."(36) As critics have pointed out, Lady Burton's efforts to salvage the reputation of her husband and of his translation by publishing a "household edition of the Arabian Nights", "that no mother shall regret her girl's reading" (1886), was an economic failure:

The importance of the notes to the success of Burton's translation is fully realized by the complete failure of Lady Burton's expurged edition. Only 457 copies were sold in two years... (Ma'at 1978: 193)

Burton could not compete with Lane's erudition, however, he could furnish his predominant male readership with a "seamier" type of knowledge bordering on pornography. Both his translation and Payne's were published in a limited edition for private subscribers. It is a well-established fact that Burton undertook his translation with the aim of "satisfying"-- and making a fact profit, 10,000 guineas

<sup>31.</sup> p. 256: note 1; 263:2; 266:1,3; 269:3; 284:1; 294:2; 308:3; 316:1; 326:1; 330:2,3; 338:1

<sup>32. 259:4; 291:3; 298:2; 311:2,4; 313-314:2, 321:2</sup> 

<sup>33. 266:1; 269:2; 270:3; 313-314:2; 317:1,2; 340:4</sup> 

<sup>34. 256:1; 257:1; 274:2,3; 298:1; 308:3</sup> 

<sup>35. 256:1; 307:1</sup> 

<sup>36.</sup> Stanley Lane-Poole's criticism of Burton: <u>The Edinburgh Review</u>, July 1886: vol.164: no.335, p.180.

net (37)-- the remaining 1000 subscribers who had requested copies of Payne's 500 printings. Both translations were addressed to an elite (male) minority. Burton's intention was to provide a male-type of entertainment by means of his obscene and "pornographic" footnotes for his private-club subscribers. Burton founded the Kama Shastra Society with his friend F.F. Arbuthnot. The aim of this society was "to translate the rare works concerning love and sex." (Ma'at 1978: 237) His 1001 <u>Nights</u> was the first publication of the society; its title page reads as follows: "Benares MDCCCLXXXV: Printed by the KAMASHASTRA SOCIETY for Private Subscribers Only. Volume 1. A Plain and Literal Translation of the Arabian Nights' Entertainments, Now Entitled The Book of the Thousand Nights and a Night with the Introduction Explanatory Notes on the Manners and Customs of Moslem Men and a Terminal Essay Upon the History of the Nights By Richard F. Burton." When Burton claimed that unlike former translators of the 1001 Nights, he wished to "produce a full, complete, unvarnished, uncastrated copy of the great original..." (1885, vol.1: ix), his objective was to add to his translation subjects considered "taboo" by society as a means of giving it a distinct character from previous versions. However, he greatly exaggerated the sensualism and exoticism associated with the 1001 Nights, and alluded to sexual matters not found in the original narratives, such as his footnotes on female circumcision (vol.4: 228), and the 50 pages devoted to pederasty in his Terminal Essay (vol. 10: 205-254). Many annotations to the Hunchback cycle are illustrations of the translator's gratuitous obscenity and ideologically tendentious discourse on the Orient. For example, in the opening pages to the frame story, Burton inserted the following note which comments on the Christian Broker's manner of urinating as opposed to the Western manner:

In the East women stand on minor occasions while men squat on their hunkers in a way hardly possible to an untrained European. The custom is

<sup>37. &</sup>quot;Another reason for undertaking this task [of translating] was the prospect of wealth. Burton had never made any substantial gains from any of his literary works before the Nights." (Ma'at 1978: 179)

old. (...) The custom was perpetuated by Al-Islam because the position prevents the ejection touching the clothes and making them ceremonially impure; possibly they borrowed it from the Guebres... (p. 259: note 1)

Whether Burton's remark is based on empirical evidence, which in itself is highly debatable, the symbolic importance of his observation is that it establishes an inverted order attributable to the Orient: if men in the West stand to urinate, in the East they squat or sit. This inverted order extends to other aspects of everyday life and customs. In the following pages, Burton commented on the "barbaric" method of executing prisoners in the Orient, and the "primitive" eating habits:

I need hardly say that the civilised "drop" is unknown to the East where men are strung up as to a yardarm. This greatly prolongs the suffering. (260: 1)

Arab. "Lukmah":= a mouthful. It is still the fashion amongst Easterns of primitive manners to take up a handful of rice, etc., ball it and put it into a friend's mouth <u>honoris causa</u>. When the friend is a European the expression of his face is generally a study. (261: 1)

Though these two annotations appear unrelated, the first referring to a technique of hanging, the second to eating habits, the positioning of the two on adjacent pages, and the opposition in terms, "civilised" European customs and "primitive" Eastern customs, establish a link between them. The message therefore transmitted in these three consecutive pages of Burton's translation is that the Orient as a primitive society is the negative counterpart to the civilised West. The supposed effeminacy of Arab men alluded to in the note on urination is openly stated by the translator in successive pages. While commenting on the widespread practice of prostitution in the Orient, Burton remarked that Kabul women were not to blame for their debauchery since their husbands were known to be sodomites:

(...) The same was the case at Kabul (Caboul) of Afghanistan in the old war of 1840; and here the women had more excuse, the husbands being notable sodomites as the song has it:--

The worth of the slit the Afghan knows;

The worth of the hole the Kábul-man. (298-299: 2)

Burton's preoccupation with the Orient as a source of homosexual practices cannot be derived from the <u>Nights</u> for the stories themselves do not contain any mention of homosexuality. The fifty pages he included in his Terminal Essay on pederasty is extraneous to the <u>Nights</u>, and can only be considered as personal interest or obsession. It is repeated in another annotation that Arab men are effeminate and weak, while Arab women masculine and domineering. Thus Burton attributed the military inferiority of the Orient and its colonisation by the West to the absence of "normal" masculine behaviour among Arab men:

The women of Damascus have always been famed for the sanguinary jealousy with which European story-books and novels credit the "Spanish lady". The men were as celebrated for intolerance and fanaticism, which we first read of in the days of Bertrandon de la Broquière and which culminated in the massacre of 1860. Yet they are a notoriously timid race and make, physically and morally, the worst of soldiers: we proved that under my late friend Fred. Walpole in the Bashi-Buzuks during the old Crimean war. The men looked very fine fellows and after a month in camp fell off to the condition of old women. (295: 1)

The gratuitous obscenity of Burton's annotations resembles many of Mardrus' amplifications. When the Barber's First Brother asks his neighbour, who has been exploiting his infactuation with her (him being a tailor she commissions clothing for herself and her husband free of charge) for a kiss, "By Allah," cried he, "kiss me quick before thou give me aught else.", Burton added the following note using his favourite trope, alliteration: "Alluding to the saying, 'Kiss is the key to Kitty'." (323: 1) The physical description given of the barber when the King finally meets the notorious talker is also transformed into an occasion of gratuitous obscenity. The Arabic states that he had a long nose, thus Burton included a footnote claiming that the facial features of an individual indicate the shape and size of his/her genitalia:

The Arabs have a saying corresponding with the dictum of the Salernitan school: (...)

A maiden's mouth shows what's the make of her chose;

And man's mentule one knows by the length of his nose.

Whereto I would add:--

And the eyebrows disclose how the lower wig grows.

The observations are purely empircal but, as far as my experience entends, correct. (350:1)

As observed from these few examples taken from the Hunchback cycle, Burton transformed the <u>1001 Nights</u> into an occasion for displaying the sexual oddities he, and other Westerners, associated with the Orient. Oriental exoticism and sensualism is transformed into a degraded and suspect form of pleasure, unlike former representations of the East as a spiritually elevating experience close to mysticism, associated with the senses and nature, though this earlier representation of Arab life was equated with "an animal existence", "the passive enjoyment of mere sense", and a "facility for voluptuousness", as opposed to the "northern regions" of Europe which found "happiness (...) in the exertion of mental and physical powers". (Burton 1855, vol.1: 12-13)

We opened this discussion on Burton by describing how he portrayed himself as an adventurer, putting his life at risk to tread unknown (Africa) or forbidden (Medina and Mecca) lands, and as a "rebel against authority", daring to speak out about matters censored by society. However, his trips to the East were not disinterested, sponsored by learned Societies, themselves backed by powerful colonial forces. Burton was not your friendly tourist, but a potential agent for colonial expansionism: in his <u>Pilgrimage</u>, he provided detailed maps of Medina and Mecca indicating fortifications, ruins, and other points of military interest. With Burton's annotations and the preoccupations revealed by them, we enter into the modern phase of Orientalism whereby the textual and academic appropriation of the Orient is coupled by a territorial appropriation and economic exploitation:

What we must reckon with is a long and slow process of appropriation by which Europe, or the European awareness of the Orient, transformed itself from being textual and contemplative into being administrative, economic, and even military. The fundamental change was a spatial and geographical apprehension so far as the Orient was concerned. (Saîd 1978: 210)

As we have seen from Burton's annotations, the translator was unable to enter into dialogue with the Orient without making pronouncements on what he considered to be the most widespread and deeply rooted stereotypes about Arab society: its primitivism, barbarity, sexual depravity, cultural inferiority, etc. Why did the <u>1001 Nights</u> become so important to scholars, translators, and readers of the 19th century? If the Arab world continued to be represented as a society living in medieval times, backward and cut off from the modern (Western) world of progress and its industrial and cultural superiority, then perhaps in the minds of all, the Western project of "civilising the East", an epithet for crass colonialism, was justified.

#### Oral Poetics: Micro/Macro-structure of the Translations

Up until now we have attempted to explain the motivations behind the numerous amputations and amplifications the translators imposed on the Nights. In this final section of our descriptive analysis, we propose to evaluate the effectiveness of the translations in recreating the oral mode of narration proper to the Nights. We had concluded our analysis of the oral poetics of the Nights (Chapter 3) by stating that the least adequate (hypertextual and adaptive) of translations undo the rhythmic patterning and systematically obliterate the recurrences (phonetic, lexical and syntactic) of the source text. We had added that phonetic (prosodic) recurrence was the foundation of an oral poetics, but at the same time recognised the difficulty involved in reproducing the effects of phonetic recurrence in translation. We therefore will begin our discussion by describing the factors present in the translations which <u>distance</u> the stories from their oral mode of narration.

#### Macro-structure of the translations:

For all six translations, their respective target cultures are dominated by the written, literary text which presents itself in the form of a book, is produced by an individual author, stable in form, and destined for individual reading. The literary text is thus historically foreign to the moving body of popular narratives, constantly changing in matter and form, and intended for a collective hearing. Therefore, on the macro-structural level, the first transformations the stories underwent were editing practices specific to printing: paragraphing, punctuation, chapter divisions, titles, subtitles etc. Let us recall Mahdi's Arabic edition of the oldest manuscripts is formatted according to modern Western editing practices and Calcutta II, the Arabic edition prepared by W. H. MacNaghten, "Esquire of the Bengal Civil Service", includes chapter divisions and subtitles. The only printed Arabic versions which seem to imitate manuscript forms are the Habicht and Bülāq editions. Thus the presentation of the 1001 Nights in a Western literary form occurs not only in the English and French translations but is carried over to the printed Arabic source texts. A direct consequence of these editing practices

and of the mode of reception of the stories by the target cultures (i.e. individual reading), is the truncation or exclusion of the oral foreword and afterword which encompass each nightly episode. This elimination of Shahrāzād's narrative voice by the translators, Galland, Lane, Payne and Khawam, does away with the dramatisation of the text as performance and the enumeration (isnād) of successive narrators of the stories emblematic of the oral transmission and preservation of knowledge of manuscript cultures. Galland's experience typifies this progressive assimilation of the stories into the Western literary hemisphere. In the foreword to his third volume, he asks the forgiveness of his readers ("les personnes d'esprit") for having fatigued them with the redundant oral formulae of each episode:

Le lecteur ne trouvera plus à chaque nuit: "Ma chère soeur, si vous ne dormez pas, etc." Comme cette répétition a choqué plusieurs personnes d'esprit, on l'a retranchée pour s'accomoder à leur délicatesse. Le traducteur espère que les savants lui pardonneront l'infidélité qu'il a fait à son original... Il [le traducteur] avait pressenti que cette répétition pourrait bien déplaire aux Français... (vol.1: 225)

Galland does not eliminate Shahrāzād's words of introduction and the closing formula of each episode, but varies the wording in order to render them less repetitious. However, in the foreword to his seventh volume, he definitely does away with the oral formulae and Shahrāzād; this later presentation of the stories is totally detached from their oral roots:

Les lecteurs des deux premiers volumes de ces contes, ont été fatigués de l'interruption que Dinarzade [Shahrāzād's sister] apportait à leur lecture. On a remédié à ce défaut dans les volumes qui ont suivi. On ne doute pas qu'ils ne soient encore plus satifaits de celui-ci, où ils ne seront plus arrêtés par les autres interruptions à chaque nuit. (...) On est bien aise cependant d'avertir encore les lecteurs que Scheherazade parle toujours sans être interrompue. (vol. 2: 257)

On the contrary, Burton and Mardrus preserved the oral formulae, isnād and Shahrāzād as narrator. However, Mardrus incorporated into the oral foreword and afterword of the Būlāq edition a meta-narrative about the daily preoccupations and activities of Shahrāzād and King Shāhriyār. His systematic amplification of

the stories thus begins even at the macro-structural level of the narratives. Nonetheless his strategy of augmenting the meta-narrative of the Nights as a means of highlighting or accentuating (38) their oral "origins" does not counterbalance the massive dismantling in his translation of the phonetic, lexical and syntactic recurrence proper to an oral poetics. Similarly, Galland's progressive elimination of the meta-narrative of the storyteller and her two listeners in addition to the many amplifications, amputations, rewritings and re-organisations of his translation efface the oral mode of narration of the stories. Any attempt at a systematic analysis of the translated Nights on the micro-textual level is an impossibility from the outstart in the case of the source text which is transformed/deformed almost beyond recognition. In this final section, we will therefore analyse the translations of Lane, Payne, Burton and Khawam since their translations present a minimum of adequacy on the micro-textual level. However we will still proceed by a negative analysis, i.e. by determining at first the factors at work in the translations which <u>undermine</u> the oral poetics of the source texts before turning to aspects of the translations which allow the medieval text to function more authentically.

#### Micro-textual level of the translations:

The common factors shared by the English tradition of the Nights are 1) the translational norm of archaism (the modus operandi of 19th-century translating), 2) the conscious attempt on the part of the translator not to stray from the meaning of the text, and 3) the reproduction of lexical and syntactic recurrence (and phonetic recurrence in the case of Burton). For the modern English reader the "pseudo-biblical, neo-gothic, mock-Elizabethan, bogus Oriental style" (Lewis 1980: 47) of Victorian translations is unacceptable and situates the Nights in a time and space totally foreign to the stories; the utility of archaising the English has little merit from our perspective. Nonetheless, for 19th-century England the intention

<sup>38. &</sup>quot;Ce phénomène, l'<u>accentuation</u>, le traducteur le connaît aussi, quand, pour compenser la perte de tel ou tel élément, il en accentue certains autres." (Berman 1985: 55)

behind this systematic achaism was to remind the reader of the cultural and temporal foreignness of the source text:

The theory of Victorian translation appears from our point of view to have been founded on a fundamental error. The aim was to convey the remoteness both in time and place of the original work by the use of a mock-antique language...(39) (Cohen 1962: 24)

Bassnett-McGuire identifies four major norms of the Victorian translation: "literalness, archaising, pedantry and the production of a text for an elite minority". (1980: 72) All four concepts are present in Payne's and Burton's translations. Their titles of the <u>1001 Nights</u>, <u>The Book of a Thousand Nights and a</u> <u>Night</u>, a calque of Arabic syntax, is a foretaste to the so-called "literalism" of meaning and expression characteristic of their translations. Payne's attitude towards literature and translation was closer to pedantry and his search for the "rare word" was a deliberate strategy of directing his translation to the educated few for he deplored the "common" reader for his "idleness and lack of receptive capacity". (Wright 1919: 28) Conversations transcribed by his biographer, T.W. Wright, reveal this elitist attitude of Payne:

"The general public is much like rats, who are perfectly comfortable in the sewers, and who regard it as nothing short of an outrage if one ventures to hint at the least defect in the atmosphere in which they are content to pass their lives." (Wright 1919: 21)

"I do not write for the vile crowd." (ibid.: 193)

Of all the English and French translators of the <u>Nights</u>, Payne is the only one to have made a profession of his translating; he translated the great authors of "univeral literature": Villon, Boccaccio, Omar Khayyam, etc. On the other hand, he is also the only translator of the <u>Nights</u> (English and French) not to have first-hand experience in the Arab world. Therefore his knowledge of the Orient is of a bookish nature and is opposed to "another tradition [to which Galland, Lane and Burton belong] that claimed its legitimacy from the peculiarly compelling fact

<sup>39. &</sup>quot;The need to convey the remoteness of the original in time and place is a recurrent concern of Victorian translators." (Bassnett-McGuire 1980: 69)

of residence in, actual existential contact with, the Orient." (Saïd 1978: 156) Payne sets himself off from other translators of the <u>Nights</u> by his "aristocratic" attitude. In fact he projects himself in the role of the translator/poet at odds with society, contemptuous of the masses and the utilitarianism of the "Philistines" (Wright 1919: 163-164):

"Since the world began, every poet of distinction and individuality has been accused of archaism and of the illegitimate use and coinage of neologisms and barbarisms." (Wright 1919: 28)

Payne's concept of literature is articulated along the same lines as end-of-the-century authors in France: the contrast between the Poet, exiled aristocrat, and the vulgar masses. (Angenot 1989: 819) Through the archaism of the English Nights, Payne distances his translation from everyday language, a similar strategy put into practice by late 19th-century French authors as a means of conferring on their work a "literary" quality and value distinct from other forms of writing, notably the "bête noire" of journalism:

Comment bloquer l'invasion en poésie de la vulgarité doxique, comment effacer les <u>marques sociales</u> du vocabulaire? On ne peut se contenter d'énoncer de l'éthéré et de l'inaccompli. Il faut en effet pratiquement changer de langue pour être sûr de rester incompris des foules. (...) Au plan du lexique, l'opération était facile et le ridicule à portée de main. On pouvait chercher le <u>rare</u> et le <u>riche</u>. (...) Archaïsmes, latinismes ne risquent pas de porter du social et font donc obstacle au volapük de la populace. Chez les prosateurs, la recherche de l'épithète "rare" marque le travail du style. (Angenot 1989: 820)

However, the archaism of the English translations weighs down the narratives, and results in a contorted and convoluted syntax often obscuring the meaning of the text. The modern, concise and accessible English prose of Burton's and Lane's foot/endnotes contrasts with the out-dated text of the stories. Thus for the modern reader, the archaic lexis and syntax of the English translations of the <u>Nights</u> throws a veil over the narratives, distorting the very simple, conversation-like prose of the Arabic.

Despite the cumbersome paratext of the English translations of the Nights, all three translators do not amplify the stories, adding descriptive elements completely extrinsic to the stories in the manner of Galland and Mardrus. There is a greater respect for the integrity of the stories on the micro-textual level, and this led to certain attempts on the part of the translators to recreate the oral poetics of the text. As mentioned in Chapter 3 in our discussion of syntactic recurrence, English admits coordination and juxtaposition in sentence structure much more than (written) French. The English translations of the Nights preserve to a higher degree the paratactic syntax of the Arabic stories, and consequently reproduce a rhythm closer to that of the Arabic. We have selected examples from the English translations of the Nights and have contrasted them with Khawam's translation in order to point out the adequacy of the English renditions and the "latent" adaptive nature of the modern French translation. We use the term "latent" for Khawam's translation at first glance does not bear the obvious (to the ear/eye of the modern reader) socio-cultural and linguistic markers which historically (out)date Mardrus' and Galland's translations. By contrasting the translations, our intention is not to establish a hierarchy, but simply to underline the qualitative differences which will permit us to better define the translation system of the individual translator. The following examples have been chosen because they are representative of the transformations/ deformations which consistently occur in the translations.

(See Appendix 3 for Arabic)

Hunchback Frame Story:

1. Khawam vol.2: 164

L'ivresse se dissipa, laissant la place, pour ce reste de nuit passé dans la maison du gouverneur en compagnie du corps, à une réflexion qui put durer jusqu'au lever du jour.

Lane vol.1: 294

Intoxication had departed, and reflection had come. The humpback and the Christian passed the remainder of the night in the house of the Wálee... Payne vol.1: 230

...where they passed the night; and all the while the broker kept saying, "O Messiah! O Virgin! how came I to kill this man? Indeed, he must have been in a great hurry to die of one blow with the fist!" And his drunkenness left him and reflection came in its stead. As soon as it was day...

#### Burton 1: 259

Presently, as his drunkenness fled, came dolour in its stead. So the broker and the body were kept in the Governor's place till morning morrowed...

#### Christian Broker's Story:

2. Khawam 2: 185

Le lendemain, dès l'aube, en quittant la maison, je lui remis les cinquante pièces d'or nouées dans le mouchoir. Le muletier m'attendait, son âne me reconduisit à l'auberge, où je dormis une heure...

Lane 1: 304: omitted

Payne 1: 242-243

Then I rose and went away, leaving the fifty dinars with her as before. I found the ass-driver at the door and mounting, rode to the Khan, where I slept awhile... Burton 1: 272:

I then arose and fared forth from her leaving the fifty dinars with her as before; and, finding the donkey-boy at the door, rode to the Khan and slept awhile.

3. Khawam 2: 220

Jusqu'à la nuit, ce ne furent que jeux et ris alternant avec boisson, nourriture et éclats de rire. Puis, de nouveau, à la lueur des chandelles, la boisson fit son effet. Je me levai et dormis avec elle.

Lane 1: 323

...so we now ate and drank and fell asleep as before; and in the morning... Payne 1: 262

...so we ate and drank and lay together, as before, till the morning...

Burton 1: 293

...so we ate and drank and lay together, as we had done, till the morning...

Tailor's Story:

4. Khawam 2: 236

La cause de ma retraite précipitée, tu la vois devant toi: c'est ce barbier, une calamité d'homme, avec un visage tout noir des maux que cause sa seule présence, bref un désastre. Il n'a pas besoin d'en faire beaucoup pour déclencher des cataclysmes, il lui suffit de bouger le petit doigt, et il vous tombe dessus des catastrophes en série; inutile de compter sur lui pour attirer la bénédiction sur les lieux où par malchance on a mis le pied en même temps que lui.

Lane 1: 328

...for the cause of my departure is this barber, who is sitting with you. Payne 1: 269

...for the cause of my turning back is yonder barber of ill-omen sitting there. Burton 1: 301

... for the cause of my turning back is yon Barber of bad omen, yon black o' face,
yon ne'er-do-well!

### Barber's Sixth Brother's Story:

5. Khawam 2: 320

[Derrière une vaste cour se dressait] une haute porte, barrée par une foule de clients et de domestiques. Tous les visiteurs n'étaient pas admis, car les domestiques faisaient le tri entre eux, repoussant à grands cris les indésirables.

Lane 1: 369 ...at the door of which were servants, commanding and forbidding... Payne 1: 312 ...and servants and others at the door, ordering and forbidding. Burton 1: 343 ...at the entrance, where sat sundry eunuchs bidding and forbidding.

#### Conclusion to the Tailor's Story

6. Khawam 2: 329

Je le chargeai sur moi et imaginai une ruse pour l'abandonner dans la maison du médecin juif. Lui s'arrangea pour le faire passer chez l'inspecteur par la cheminée de ventilation, et ce dernier trouva le moyen de laisser entre les mains du courtier chrétien.

#### Lane 1: 371

...whereupon I took him up, and contrived to throw him into the house of this physician, and he contrived to throw him into the house of the steward, and the steward contrived to throw him in the way of the broker.

Payne 1: 317

Then I took him up and made shift to throw him into the house of the Jewish physician. He in his turn let him down into the house of the controller, who threw him in the way of the Christian broker.

Burton 1: 349

Then I carried him off and contrived to throw him into the house of this leach, the Jew; and the leach contrived to throw him into the house of the Reeve; and the Reeve contrived to throw him on the way of the Nazarene broker.

Example 1 contains <u>saj</u>, and is marked by parallelism and short segments of meaning. The paratactic syntax was adequately reproduced by the English translators (Payne, however, added filler phrases and changed the order of enunciation) unlike Khawam's translation which has completely undermined the rhythm of the Arabic by subordinating the second sentence to the first. Of the translations, Burton's is the only one to have reproduced the <u>saj</u> (i.e. the balanced syllabic count and final rhyme) of example 1, though not without a shift in meaning. In order to augment the "phonetic" effects characteristic of a medieval poetics, Burton added to this particular example isolexism by derivation, "the morning morrowed", in imitation of the Arabic construction of the "absolute accusative". This "oral style" which Burton tacked on to the Arabic text is the major transformation/ deformation undergone by his <u>Nights</u> on the micro-textual level. Other "special effects" of Burton's oral style are the alliteration of the letter "f" of example 2, the tortuous rhyme of the obscure term "plebotomisation" in an attempt to preserve the <u>saj</u> of example 5, and the paranomasia of example 6 which is intended to emphasise the parallelism of the Arabic. However, throughout Burton's <u>Nights</u>, this oral style attains exaggerated proportions. Before continuing with our commentary of the examples taken from Khawam and the other English translators, we have selected a limited number of transformations/ deformations of Burton's translation in illustration of this contrived oral poetics. Key words and phrases have been underlined in order to highlight elements of Burton's oral style (See Appendix 4 for Arabic):

1. It hath reached me, O auspicious King, that <u>there dwelt during the times of</u> yore, and years and ages long gone before (1), in a certain city of China, a Tailor who was an open-handed man that loved pleasuring and merry making (2); and who was wont, he and his wife, to solace themselves from time to time with public diversions and amusements (3). One day they went out with the <u>first of the light</u> and were returning in the <u>evening</u> (4) when they fell in with a Hunchback, <u>whose</u> semblance would draw a laugh from care and dispel horrors of despair (5). So they went up to enjoy looking at him and invited him to go home with them and <u>converse and carouse</u> (6) with them that night. He consented and accompanied them afoot to their home... (1: 255)

2. Presently the Tailor's wife took a great <u>fid</u> of <u>fish</u> and <u>gave</u> it in a <u>gobb</u>et to the <u>Gobbo</u>... (1: 255)

3. ...so take this quarter dinar and give it to thy master and let him come down and see my son who is sore sick. (1: 256)

4. There is no <u>Majesty</u> and there is no <u>Might</u> save in Allah, the <u>G</u>lorious, the <u>G</u>reat! (1: 258)

5. ...a garden full of all manner of fruits; whose streams were <u>railing and rilling</u> and whose birds were <u>trilling and shrilling</u>... (1: 270)

6. Eortune and Eate afflicted thee so that thou didst lose thy right hand for my sake... (1: 276)

7. ...and she endured but fifty days before she was numbered among the folk of <u>futurity and heirs of immortality</u>. (1: 277)

8. ...till none remained unopened but the box in which I was boxed. (1: 285)

9. ...and one day, as I was walking along a street in Baghdad a party of females met me face to face in the footway; so I fled from them... (1: 301)

10. Allah hath bounteously bestowed on thee a Barber... (1: 305)

11. Yet I cannot conceive the cause of thy hurry and flurry... (1: 307)

12. There is not among the whole of them a bore or a bully in his cups; nor a meddler nor a miser of his money, and each and every hath some dance which he danceth and some of his own couplets which he caroleth... (1: 311)

13. I seek only to introduce thee to these fellows of infinite mirth, the sons of men of worth, amongst whom there is neither procacity nor dicacity nor loquacity... (1: 312)

14. Had I been a man of many words, a meddler, a busy body... (1: 317)

15. ...O people, is it not a proof of my courtesy and <u>spareness</u> of <u>spee</u>ch, that I held my <u>peace</u> and did not <u>please</u> to <u>speak</u>? (1: 317-318)

16. My brother humbled himself to him... (1: 323)

17. ...my brother scampering after her in a rage of desire like a veritable madman with yard standing terribly tall. (1: 328)

18. ...lo! there came in to him a black slave big of body and bulk... (1: 340)

19. My brother could not return him a reply, being tongue-tied for terror... (1: 340)

20. So my brother began wagging his jaws and made as if <u>champing</u> and <u>chewing</u>... (1: 345)

21. ...till he was left a pauper without a penny to handle. So he quitted the city and fled forth following his face... (1: 347)

The incipit of the Hunchback cycle (ex. 1) already contains

transformations/ deformations which hint at Burton's over-all strategy of accentuating the "oral" mode of narration of the Nights. We numbered segments of example 1 which constitute an oral poetics: (1) and (5) saj, (2) synonymic pairing and (4) parallelism. The synonymic pairing of (3) and (6), and the alliteration of (6) are of Burton's fabrication. These subtle additions remain imperceptible to the reader for they blend in with the other recurrences of the text. Nonetheless, the majority of transformations/ deformations of Burton's translation are not motivated by the poetics of the Arabic source text which is devoid of recurrence such as the alliteration of examples 2, 3, 6, 9-12, 14-21, the synonymic pairing of examples 5-6, 11, 13, 14, 20, paranomasia of examples 2, 15, saj of examples 7, 13, and the absolute accusative of example 8. Alliteration is the most used trope by Burton in order to create the "oral style" of his Nights. In the foreword to his translation, Burton states the importance of alliteration (while using it at the same time) as means of fabricating this oral style:

Despite objections manifold and manifest, I have preserved the balance of sentences and the prose thyme and thythm which Easterns look upon as mere music. This "Saj'a" or cadence of the cooing dove, has in Arabic its special duties. It adds a sparkle to description and a point to proverb, epigram and dialogue; it corresponds with our "artful alliteration" (which in places I have substituted for it) and, generally, it defines the boundaries between the classical and the popular styles which jostle each other in the Nights. (1: xiv) [emphasis ours]

For example, in order to convey the phonetic recurrence typical of many Arabic invocations to God, Burton replaces the assonance of example 4 with alliteration, though not without a displacement in meaning. Whenever the absolute accusative, <u>saj</u>, parallelism, synonymic pairing, etc. <u>do</u> occur in the Arabic text, Burton almost always attempts to give an adequate translation as his commentary on <u>saj</u> asserts: "This rhymed prose may be 'un-English' and unpleasant, even irritating to the British ear; still I look upon it as a <u>sine qua non</u> for a complete reproduction of the original." (1: xiv) It therefore strikes the reader, even after looking at the few examples we have selected, that somehow Lane and Payne were "deaf" to the oral poetics of the Arabic, for their translations in comparison to Burton's remain "mute". Distinct from the other translations of the Nights, Burton's work constitutes a type of "experimental poetics" (Meschonnic), that is, a writing which is transformed through its encounter with the source text, and consequently which comes closer to producing an adequate translation, that is a translation which embodies, or at least attempts to embody, the historical specificity of the source text. Burton's fabricated oral style strives to reproduce the traces of an oral mode of narration typical of the Nights. Though Burton's experimental poetics has its merits, it nonetheless is undermined by the English translational norm of archaism and by his ideologically tendentious paratext as previously discussed.

We shall end this section on translation and oral poetics by returning to the first examples cited of the English translators and of Khawam (pp. 173-175). In example 2, in order to vary the paratactic structure of the Arabic, i.e. "I rose, offered, went away, found, rode, went, and slept", Khawam changes the subject of enunciation: it's the "ass-driver" who awaits and the "donkey" who drives. In example three, the paratactic structure and redundancy of the subject results in a stringing-together of verbs in the Arabic, "we ate, drank, played, laughed, lit, drank, got drunk, and I stood and slept" (in the Calcutta II source text, there are only three consecutive verbs). Khawam replaces the verbs by a series of nouns, "jeux, ris, boisson, nourriture, éclats de rire, la lueur, boisson", in order to avoid parataxis and redundancy. The substitution of nouns for verbal constructions is frequent in Khawam's translation as a means for eliminating the syntactic and lexical recurrences of the Arabic. Berman, in his typology of deformations of modern translating practices, refers to this tendency to abstraction by the substitution of nouns as "rationalisation":

La rationalisation porte au premier chef sur les structures syntaxiques de l'original... La rationalisation re-compose les phrases et séquences de phrases de manière à les arranger selon une certaine idée de l'<u>ordre</u> d'un discours. (...) Elle anéantit aussi un autre élément prosaïque: <u>la visée de</u> <u>concrétitude</u>. Qui dit rationalisation dit abstraction, généralisation. (...) La rationalisation fait passer l'original du concret à l'abstrait, pas seulement en ré-ordonnant linéairement la structure syntaxique, mais, par exemple, en traduisant les verbes par des substantifs, en choisissant, de deux substantifs, le plus général, etc. (Berman 1985: 69)

This practice of "substantivating" verbal constructions is a persistent transformation/ deformation throughout Khawam's translation. However, the most frequent transformation to occur in Khawam's translation is amplification ("allongement") combined with clarification and embellishment ("ennoblissement"). Here are descriptions Berman provides of these deformations:

Rationalisation et clarification exigent un allongement, dépliement de ce qui, dans l'original, est "plié". (...) L'allongement, ici, horizontalise ce qui est vertical... (Berman 1985: 71-72)

L'ennoblissement (...) On aboutit à ceci, que la traduction est "plus belle" (formellement) que l'original. (...) L'esthétique vient ici compléter la logique de la rationalisation: tout discours doit être un <u>beau</u> discours. (...) L'ennoblissement n'est donc qu'une ré-écriture, un "exercice de style" à partir (et aux dépens) de l'original. (<u>ibid</u>.: 72-73)

In examples 4 and 5, Khawam expands the Arabic which is marked by a condensed mode of expression. The brachology serves the parallelism and rhythmic grouping of the Arabic to the point of being elliptic and obscuring the meaning of the text. These two examples are excellent illustrations of how semantics is subordinated to and derived from rhythmic patterning. Khawam's expanded phrases are intended to make explicit and clarify the meaning of the source text, however, they undo the lexical coupling (and thus the rhythmic patterning) of the enumeration of example 4 (the Calcutta II version does not contain an enumeration of character traits; Burton included those of the Galland manuscript), which should read as follows: "the cause is that barber, an ominous old man, black face, vile in deeds, wretched in action, seldom blessed". Likewise, the parallelism and brachology of example 5, "at the door were servants and attendants commanding and forbidding", is expanded beyond recognition by Khawam; the essential traits of an oral poetics are erased from the modern French translation. Example 6 is marked by lexical and syntactic repetition, which adds to the comic effect of the hunchback being killed for the umpteenth time and passed on from one "assassin" to the next. Khawam eliminates the lexical repetition, giving three variants for each verb: "to contrive": "imaginer une ruse", "s'arranger", "trouver le moyen", and "to throw": "abandonner", "faire passer", "laisser entre les mains". Based on these few examples (there being many more), we can conclude that the modern French translation, as opposed to the English tradition of the Nights, distances the reader to a greater degree from the oral poetics of these stories by eliminating recurrence on the phonetic, lexical and syntactic levels. Khawam describes his retranslation of the Nights (the first dating from 1965-67), as an endeavour to create a "literary style" more "pleasant to read" for the French public. (40) Azar, who gives his critical appreciation of the French translators of the Nights in an article commending the modern translation, claims that Khawam's translation was executed according to the "demanding standards" of today, authenticated by the "scientific" excavation of "original" manuscripts (of which there exists not even a reliable Arabic edition according to Khawam-- and Mahdi's 1984 edition?). Azar states that, unlike his French counterparts, Khawam "was not influenced by his target public", and that his translation is the one which remains closest to the "letter" of the Arabic. (41) The remaining examples of Khawam's translation we have chosen to present will illustrate what the translator implied when he stated that he added to his 1986-1987 rendition all the "varnish, sheen and fire of an accomplished work" (1986: vol.1, 30):

#### Amplification and Embellishment (See Appendix 5 for Arabic)

1. Un beau jour-- c'était un lundi-- j'entrai au bain public de bon matin, me baignai, revêtis ma plus belle tenue, revins au caravansérail <u>me rafraîchir d'un</u> verre et <u>refaire mes forces par un petit somme</u>... (2: 177)

[one day, and it was Monday, I entered the bath early and went out and I put on some handsome clothes and went to the khan and entered my abode and I had something to drink for breakfast and slept]

<sup>40. &</sup>quot;J'ai également davantage serré le texte, retravaillant ma traduction pour lui donner un style à la fois plus littéraire et plus agréable à lire." (Chikhani 1987: 151) 41. "Le but que Khawam s'est proposé n'a pas été biaisé par l'influence du public-cible, comme ce fut le cas pour Galland... [et] pour Mardrus... il faut considérer que la version de Khawam est celle qui colle le plus étroitement à leur [the manuscripts'] lettre." (Azar 1987: 168-169)

2. Enfin <u>le sommeil jeta sur nous ses filets</u> et nous nous couchâmes. (2: 185) [then we went to the bedroom and slept]

3. ...après quoi je <u>fis fructifier pour mon compte</u> le capital qui me rapporta, au bout du compte, une jolie fortune. (2: 196) [and I began to increase my fortune]

4. Mais cette <u>vie en vase clos</u> commençait à me peser. (2: 210) [then my chest became cramped, i.e. I was weary]

5. Quant à elle, elle me <u>faisait les yeux doux</u>... mon amie comprit alors que les intentions de la pucelle s'étaient fixées sur ma personne et que nos désirs se correspondaient. (2: 222)

[and she looked at me... and my companion understood that she had an eye on me and I on her]

6. Tandis que <u>s'égrenait</u> pour notre hôte <u>le chapelet</u> de ces spécialités bu barbier... (2: 236)

[then when the host listened to the attributes of this barber]

7. Dès qu'elle me vit, la jouvencelle sourit. <u>Une armée d'invisibles archers</u> <u>l'entourait qui, prenant pour cible mon coeur, y décochèrent leurs flèches</u> <u>enflammées</u>. L'incendie qui s'y alluma à l'instant même transforma en amour ardent la froideur que je ressentais jusque-là pour les femmes. (2: 238)

[then she smiled when she saw me.. then my heart was set on fire and my hatred of women changed into love]

8. Tu m'as tout l'air, remarqua-t-il, de <u>vouloir me faire prendre des vessies pour</u> <u>des laternes</u> en cet instant: tu te dis que moi parti, tu pourrais aller seul à ton rendez-vous; mais tu tomberais dans une infortune dont tu ne pourras pas te délivrer. (2: 269)

[then he said: I'm with you now and you try to deceive me. You will leave alone and throw yourself into a misfortune from which you won't escape]

9. Mon frère n'apprécia pas ce procédé insolite et <u>tordit quelque peu le nez</u>, pendant que la vieille lui faisait un signe de l'oeil pour lui faire comprendre qu'il n'avait pas à s'offusquer de cette familiarité. (2: 290)

[then when my brother saw that, he disliked it and was annoyed and the old woman continued to beckon him with her eyes and my brother returned and the slave girl ordered him to sit down]

10. Oui, c'est cela, me dit-elle: tu te goberges, tu te dévergondes, et moi, qui <u>suis</u> <u>là entre mes quatre murs</u>, qu'est-ce que j'ai pour me distraire? (2: 329) [and (my wife) said: You're carousing and wandering about and I'm stored away] 11. O Dieu, Toi qui mets le voile de la miséricorde sur nos laideurs morales, accorde-moi Ta protection! (2: 162-163)
[O Veiler, veil me]

12. Chéri, la chose pourra se faire chez moi, à moins que cela ne te convienne pas, et à ce moment-là, c'est moi qui me rendrai chez toi. (2: 181) [then she said: O beloved, your place or mine?]

13. ...et [nous] allâmes nous asseoir non loin de là, faisant cercle pour bavarder un peu. La conversation tomba sur les merveilles qu'on pouvait voir dans les différents pays et sur les curiosités qui s'offrent à l'oeil des voyageurs dans chacune des grandes villes. (2: 214)

[then my father and uncles sat down together and they were seated in a circle talking about the wonders of countries and the strange things in cities]

14. C'est quand il ne me resta plus le moindre sou que Satan me tendit un piège où le decret divin, selon les règles qui gouvernent notre sort, avait inscrit que je devais tomber. (2: 225)

[and the devil beguiled me by fate and divine decree]

In examples 1-10, we have underlined the translation units of Khawam's fabrication. In his 1965-1967 version, these additions are not to be found. The "accomplished" translation therefore consists in "acclimatising" the source text by littering it with set expressions and locutions of the target language (ex. 4, 7-10), and "embellishing" the text, giving it an "elevated", "varied" style: "to drink": "se rafraîchir d'un verre"; "to sleep": "refaire ses forces par un petit somme" (ex. 1); "to increase": "faire fructifier" (ex. 3); "to look at": "faire les yeux doux" (ex. 5), etc. The "compact" mode of expression of the Arabic (ex. 11-14) is "stretched out" and expanded on for reasons not at all evident to the reader. Examples 11 and 12 could easily have been translated into French as: "O Protecteur, protège-moi", and "Mon amour, chez moi ou chez toi?". These types of amplifications occur consistently throughout Khawam's translation, dismantling the rhythmic patterning and ensuing recurrences of the Arabic. Khawam's translation on the micro/macro textual levels belongs to a literary tradition which bars the modern reader from the oral poetics of the <u>1001 Nights</u>.

# Conclusion

Translation is never a transparent activity; the translator always adapts the source text to his/her own literary norms and culture. At the same time, all translations are faithful, that is to say, some sort of equivalence is presupposed between source and target texts. Our descriptive analysis intended to determine what the respective English and French translators of the 1001 Nights were faithful to when making their translation choices. We therefore proceeded to resituate the individual translation in the discursive context of its mother-culture as a means of identifying the network of constraints (collective norms) and strategies (individual motivations) born out of that context. In the case of Galland, it was the societal and translational norm of bienséance (propriety) which was the shaping force of his translation. Cultural references and the poetics of the source text(s) were transformed to suit his target readership and the "elevated style" of French classical literature. Nobiliary culture was imprinted on many of the characters so that the stories depict the social life and habitus of their prospective readership: the elite of the French court and salons. The acclimatisation of the 1001 Nights therefore extended to elements of social conduct, étiquette, manner of speech, gesticulation... as a means of situating the stories in the courtly context of gallantry. In addition to these amplifications, Galland excluded any element objectionable to his readership, for the aesthetic value of literature was considered to be intimately connected to its moral value in 18th-century France.

Our description of Galland's translation system was the first of our analyses to demonstrate how translational norms, readership and discursive contexts particular to a target culture distance the source text from its original form and composition by imposing on the narratives a foreign system of expression, a distinct aesthetics, and details and events which have nothing to do with the original story-line. Translation choices therefore no longer appear arbitrary or manifestations of individual whims when reunited with their conditions of production and social contexts. Mardrus and Burton made Oriental exoticism and sex a central issue of their translations (the latter by his notations, the former by his amplification of the stories) not predominantly because, as individuals, they were obsessed by sex, but because by the end of the 19th century, little could be said or written about the Orient by any European without these two items, in addition to other central themes such as Oriental primitivism, barbarity and despotism, being on the agenda. By the many amplifications Mardrus imposed on the source text of the 1001 Nights, his translation was affiliated to the very popular genre of the exotic/colonial novel, itself a sub-group of pornographic literature of late 19th-century France. As we saw, Mardrus made explicit and multiplied any mention of sex or the body, inserted sex where there was none in the narratives, and often introduced violence (in words and actions) into passages devoid of any. Thus any reference to sex in Mardrus' translation was an overstatement of the actual wording and representation in the Arabic source text. However, what is incumbent for the reader to understand is that Oriental sex and exoticism in Mardrus' translation had very little to do with representations of sex in the narratives, or with actual sexual practices in the Arab world; rather they were linked to French sexual culture, that is to say, the manner in which authors wrote about sex at the end of the 19th century. Mardrus imposed on the 1001 Nights themes, characterisations (types), and rhetoric typical of French discourse on sex. Sex was never represented in French social discourse at the end of the 19th century without a component of animality, pathology and brutality, and this representation was intensified when it became a question of sex in the "colonies".

The many amplifications, amputations, rewritings and re-organisations Galland and Mardrus made to the source text undid the recurrences and rhythmic patterning characteristic of the oral poetics of the <u>1001 Nights</u>, and therefore excluded the possibility of conducting a systematic analysis of these translations on the micro-textual levels. A minimum of adequacy was required if any one of the <u>Nights</u>' translations was to re-create or at least evoke the intricacies of recurrence and rhythm of the source text.

The three English translations of the Nights remained closer to the

meaning of the source text and reproduced its lexical and syntactic recurrences. However, the systematic archaism, the <u>modus operandi</u> of translating in 19th-century England, which was intended to remind the reader of the cultural and temporal foreignness of the source text, is unacceptable to us today for this norm imposed on the <u>Nights</u> a time and space entirely extraneous to the stories. As we have shown, Burton's translation stood apart because of his personal endeavour to create an "oral" style in imitation of the oral poetics of the <u>1001 Nights</u>. His work (its cumbersome paratext excluded) therefore constituted an "experimental poetics", that is, a writing which was transformed through its encounter with Arabic and attempted to embody the historical specificity of the source text.

The English translators, Lane, Payne and Burton, preserved to a higher degree than Khawam the paratactic syntax and the recurrences of the Arabic stories; because they treated rhythm as the major organiser of meaning and thus made the rhythmic unit the basis for the translation unit, their translations are more adequate than Khawam's. Khawam replaced parataxis by subordination, elongating and rendering more grammatically complex the short syntactic units of the Arabic. Consequently he obliterated the rhythmic patterning of the source text and its condensed mode of expression. Khawam also littered his translation with French expressions and locutions in order to make the stories more "pleasant" to the ear of his French readers. In a recent conference/debate (1) surrounding Khawam's latest translation, La Jambe sur la jambe of Faris Shidyaq, he stated that he does not have a preconceived method or theory of translation before translating, but that he simply wants to transpose the beauty of the Arabic text into French: "Quand un texte est beau en arabe il doit être beau en français." However we must assume that the 1001 Nights was not so "beautiful" after all for Khawam "improved" on the Arabic, omitting redundancy, repetition, and making a heterogeneous text into a closely-knit narrative, in other words, dispossessing the Western reader of the oral poetics of the source text.

1. June 19, 1991 at the Institut du monde arabe in Paris

Since its existence, the 1001 Nights has challenged the most ingrained prejudices of both Arab and Western scholars, writers, readers, etc. The former for their rejection of the 1001 Nights because of its poor literary quality, i.e. the fact that it is not composed in the language of literature-- classical fusha, its trivial and obscene subject-matter rather than profound and morally elevating, etc. The latter because of the translators who, taking advantage of the textual instability and low literary status of the 1001 Nights, have considered themselves warranted in executing hypertextual and ethnocentric translations, and also because of scholars and thinkers, despite a few disagreements here and there, for condoning the "national achievements" of adaptive translations. They have all failed at evaluating and appreciating the Nights on its own terms which would entail a redefinition of medieval works of manuscript cultures as a textuality born of oral praxis. Modern times must salute Muhsin Mahdi's editorial work on the oldest manuscripts of the 1001 Nights for he conserved the strong colloquial component of the "storytelling language" of the Nights by reproducing the graphics of the spoken diction (which are grammatically incorrect according to classical Arabic standards), the references to the oral performers, and other errors on the narrative level. Western translators (or translations destined for Western readers but executed by Arabs, i.e Mardrus and Khawam) have yet to match his accomplishment of allowing the Nights to function more authentically in our modern culture by giving a voice to its double (cultural and poetic) alterity.

187

# Chapter Four: Arabic Source Text For Galland's Translation

1. Mahdi 292: lines 4-6 ان النصراني قال (لملك الصين) فلما فرغنا وسكبت على يده الماَّء وناولته شي يمسع فيه يده وجلسنا للحديت بعد ما قدمت شي من الحلوى... 2. Mahdi 321: 20-24 فافكرت ساعه تم قلعت ما عليها من التياب وتعريت فقلت في نفسي لا امن ان تغمز على الصبيه اهل هذه المقتولة النسا لا يومن من مكرهم فقمت حفرت في وسط القاعة حفره واخذت الصبية ومصاغها وجعلتها في الحفره ورديت عليها التراب واعدت الرخام والبلاط كما كان ولبست تياب نظاف واخدت معي بقيه مالي في صندوق صغير... 3. Mahdi 322-323: 14-17 فغتحها (القاعه) وفكيت ختمها ودخلت كنستها ومسحتها ووجدت تحت الحوايج الدى كانوا تحتنا لما نمت مع الصبيه المدبوحه طوق دهب وفيه عقد جوهر عشر جوهرات تحير الفكر فلما رايته عرفته... 4. Mahdi 327: 13 وادا بصاحب الدعوه دخل ومعه شاب مليع غريب... 5. Mahdi 294: 18-21 وجلست بجنب تاجر يقال له بدر الدين البستاني فتحدت معه ساعه وادا نحن باامراة قعدت على الدكان بايزار وعصبه هايله وروايع فايحه... 6. Mahdi 308: 5-6 فقالت له من هذه فقال هذه صبيه ربتها الست زبيده زوجة الخليفه... واستحيت امام حسنها ... 7. Mahdi 306: 10 وصرت اتحدت معها الى فتع السوق فدفعت لكل انسان ماله... 8. Mahdi 307: 9 9. Mahdi 308: 5-6 فقلت له من هده... 10. Not found in the Arabic source text وهي صرخت صرخه اقبلت الجوار اليها من كل مكان وصاروا حواليها ... 18-17 11. Mahdi 312: 17 12. Mahdi 319: 22-24 فيرم من الايام انا جالس على باب قاعتي وادا بصبيه قد اقبلت علينا ملبسه مليحه ما رات عيني أحسن منها فعزمت عليها فما صدقت فدخلت القاعه... 13. Mahdi 283: 9-10 فاعطتها المره ربع دينار وقالت لها يا سيدتي اعطى هده لسيدك ودعيه ينزل يرى هدا اخي قد لحقه ضعف خطر … فلا تشنقه فما قتل الاحدب الا انا ... 14. Mahdi 287: 18 15. Mahdi 289: 19-21 اعلم يا ملك ان قبل ان اصل هده الديار وانا رجل غريب من اوطانكم فاتيت بمتجر وتوصلت به إلى هاهنا واقعدتنى المقادير عندكم في هده السنين 16. Mahdi 289 13-14 واوقفهم وقبل الارض واعاد قصتهم واحكى له حكاية الاحدب من المبتدا الي المنتها ... 17. Mahdi 289: 16-17 فتقدم النصراني وقبل الارض وقال يا ملك الزمان... 18. Mahdi 311: 17-20 وبينهم الست زبيده وهي ما تقدر تمشى من الحلي والحلل فلما اقبلت تغرقوا الجوار واتوا لها بكرسي فجلست عليه وصرخت على الجوار وصرخن علينا الجوار فاتيت لها وقبلت الارض بين

يديها 19. Mahdi 303-304: 13-20 وهده ما جرى لى وغريب ما أتغق لى فهذا أيها الملك ما هو أعجب من حديث الاحدب فقال ملك الصين ليس هذا أعجب من حديث الاحدب ولا بد لي من شنقكم انتم الاربعه على أجل الاحدب تم أن الشاهد تقدم وقال لملك الصين أيها الملك السعيد أن أحكيت لك حديثا أتغق لي ليلة البارحه قبل ان التقى هذه الاحدب عندى فان كان اعجب من حديت الاحدب تهب لنا ارواحنا وتعتقنا فقال ملك الصين نعم... 20. Mahdi 298: 9 تم جلسنا نتحدت وراسي مطرقه الي الأرض... 21. Mahdi 301: 15-16 وتمشيت حتى جيت الى القاعه فرميت روحي على الفراش... 22. Mahdi 327: 14-16 فقمنا له أجلالا لصاحب المنزل فجا يجلس فرأى انسان بيننا صنعته مزين فامتنع من الجلوس... فدخلنا عليه أن يجلس ويحدتنا ما جرا له مع المزين في بغداد... 23. Mahdi 328: 10-11 24. Mahdi 355: 27 فاقعدت اخي في صغة حسنه... 25. Mahdi 355: 28-30 فلما اقبلت وراها اخى قام قايماً وخدمها فرحبت به وامرته بالجلوس فجلس فاقبلت عليه وقالت... 26. Mahdi 356: 22-23 واحضرته قدام سيدتها ففرحت به وضحكت حتى استلقت على قفاها وقالت ... 27. Mahdi 367: 18 فانغض يدى في وجهها وارفصها برجلي واعمل هاكدا... 28. Mahdi 372: 21-22 فمشي نحو باب المجلس فدخله فوجد في صدره انسان حسن الوجه اللحيه فقصده... 29. Mahdi 292: 5-6 وجلسنا للحديت بعد ما قدمت شي من الحلوي... 30. Not found in the Arabic source text. 31. Mahdi 374: 27 ثم انه اومی وشرب... 32. Mahdi 281: 11-14 وشرعوا في الأكل واكلوا حتى اكتفوا فاخذ الخياط قطعة سمكه ولقمها للاحدب وسد فمه بكمه وضحك وقال والله ما تاكل هدى الا قطعه واحده وقطم نغسه فاحتاج ان ياكلها فما امتهل بمضغها فزلطها وكان فيها شوكه كبيره فاشتبكت في حلقه واتصلت في زردمته فمات... 33. Mahdi 305: 10-13 وقلنا له ما هر هده البهام خلقه الله ام حدت لك فيه حادت فقال والله ما هو هده البهام وحده ولكن أبهامي الآخر ورجلي الاتنين ولكن حتى تروآ تم كشف عن بهام يده الآخرا فوجدناها متل اليمين وكدلك رجله بلا بهامات فلما رأيناه كذلك ازددنا من ذلك تعجبا ... 34. Mahdi 355: 24-26 تم حضرت عشره جوار كالبدور وبأيديهن العيدان فجعلن يغنين بكل صوت شجى فطرب منهم اخی . . . 35. Mahdi 374: 22-23; 24-27 فقال يا ضيغي تريد أن تشرب وتتفرح لا يكون جايعا (...) ثم قال الرجل قدموا الشراب تم ناول أخي قدحا وقال دق هده القدح فان اهجبك فعرفني فقال اخي انه طيب الرايحه لكنني تعودت بغيره فقال قدموا له غير هدا من المسكر فقال هنيا وصحة... 36. Mahdi 321: 13-20 وقمت إنا والصبيه تعانقنا ونمنا تلك الليله وطلعت هي نصف الليل وفرشت لها في الطبقه ونامت وحدها ونمت انا والصبيه الى الصباح فتحركت وجدت روحي في عرق عظيم فحسبت انه عرق فقعدت انبه الصبيه وهزيت اكتافها فتدحرجت راسها فطار عقلي وصرخت وقلت يا جميل الستر فرجدتها مدبرحه فنهضت على حيلي وقد أسردت الدنيا في عيني وطلبت صاحبتي فلم أجدها فعلمت أنها هي الدي دبحت الصبيه من غيرتها فقلت لا حول ولا قرة الا بالله العلي العظيم كيف

18**9** 

يكرن عملى... 37. Mahdi 377: 6-9 (ان الخياط قال لملك الصين) يا ملك لما سمعنا قصة المزين وكتره كلامه وان الشاب قد ظلم معه اخدنا المزين وتعصبنا عليه وادخلناه الحبس وجلسنا نحن امس واكلنا وتمينا الوليمه الى بعد العصر فخرحت وجيت منزلي... 38. Mahdi 285: 11 وقعد يريق الماء قباله و قام... 39. Mahdi 298: 6-9 فلما راتني تبسمت في وجهى ولمتنى الي صدرها وفمي على فمها فشرعت تمص لساني وانا كدلك تم قالت هو صحيح يا سويدى أتيت عندى فقلت أنا عبدكي وعندكي فقالت والله من يومك ما لد لي طعام ولا منام فقلت وانا كدلك تم جلسنا نتحدت وراسي مطرقه الي الارض... 40. Mahdi 311: 16-17 وادا بعشر جوار كانهم الاقمار قد اقبلت واصطغت وعشرين جاريه اخرى قد اقبلت وهم نهد ابكار وبينهم الست زبيده... 41. Mahdi 312-313: 23-25 تم صرحت على الجوار فقالت أرموه فرموني إلى الأرض واخدت في يدها سوط مظفور ونزلت على ظهرى مع مقاعدى بالضرب حتى كل ساعدها ... 42. Mahdi 360: 5-6 الالما ضرب الوالي البصير اربع مايه عصاه على تقبه فاوجعه الضرب فغتع عينه الواحده... 43. Mahdi 326: 25 وارسل احضر الشهود وكتب كتابي على ابنته ودخلت بها ... 44. Mahdi 357: 6-16 ان عادتها ادا سكرت لم تمكن احدا من نغسها حتى تقلعه تيابه وسراويله ويبقى عريان تم تجرى قدامه كالهاربه وهو يتبعها من مكان الى مكان حتى يقوم احليله ويستحكم قيامه فعند دلك تقف وتمكنه من نغسها تم قالت قم اخلع تيابك فقلع اخي تيابه جميعها وبقى عريان زلط فقالت الجاريه لاخي قوم اجرى وتعرت هي ايضا وبقيت بسراويلها وقالت له الااردت وصلي فاتبعني حتى تلحقني وجعلت تدخل من مجلس وتخرج من مجلس وانا اجرى خلفها وقد غلب الشوق على اخي وصار زبه قايم كانه المجنون ودخلت الجاريه قدامه في مكان مظلم ( . . .) فلما راوه بدلك الحال عريان محلوق الدقن محمر الحواجب صاحوا عليه... 45. Mahdi 376: 18-23 وكان له زوجة حسنة الوجه وكان ادا خرج زوجها تتعرض الى اخي وتراوده وهو يمتنع فلما كان يوما راودت أخى فقام اليها ولاعبها فهى كذلك وزوجها دخل فلما نظر إلى أخى قال ويلك أتريد إن تغسد في أهلي ثم أنه أخرج سكينا وقطع دكره وحمل أخي على جمل وطرحه في سفع جبل... 46. Mahdi 373-374: 7-8 تم قال يا غلام قدم لنا السكباج الدى فيه البط المسمن... 47. Mahdi 374: 14-16 تم قال قدموا الطباهجات تم قال هل رايت اطيب من ابازير هده الاطعمه جود الأكل ولا تستحى فقال اخى يا سيدى لقد اكتفيت من الطعام... 48. Mahdi 311: 15-16 فنزلت وجلست في الغاعه الصغيره... 49. Mahdi 372: 15 اد رای دار اُ حسنه... 50. Mahdi 327: 17 فقال الشاب يا مولاي بالله لا تتعرض على ودلك سبب دلك المزين الشيخ النحس الاسود الرجه القبيح الفعايل التعيس الحركه القليل البركه...

C

## Chapter Four: Arabic Source Text For Mardrus' Translation

Sex and Sensualism 1. Būlāq 78: lines 20-21 فطرقت الباب فخرج لي بنتان صغيرتان بكران منهدتان كانهما قمران... 2. Būlāg 78: 30 فلما رأتنى تبسمت في وجهي... فاكلت معها حتى اكتغينا ثم قدموا الى الطشت والابريق ... 3. Būlāg 79: 1-2 4. Būlāg 79: 20 ثم اكلنا وشربنا ونعنا الى الصباح... 5. Būlāq 86: 13-14 شم نمت معها في أطيب ليلة الى الصباح... 6. Būlāq 86: 28-29 ونمت مم الصبية الجديدة الى وقت الصبح... 7. Būlāq 88: 5-6 اعلم يا ولدى إن الصبية الكبيرة بنتى وكنت احجر عليها فلما بلغت (...) فجاءتنى وقد تعلمت العهر من اولاد مصر وجاءتك اربع مرات... 8. Būlāq: 92: 20-21 فان هذه مدينة بغداد لا يقدر احد أن يعمل فيها شياً من هذه الأشياء لأسيما في مثل هذا اليرم وهذا والى بغداد مبارم عظيم... 9. Būlāq 93: 11-12 وحقيقة الامر كله فبنتك تعشقه وهو يعشقها فعلمت انه قد دخل دارك وامرت غلمانك فضربوه... 10. Būlāg 95: 7-8 وليلة اراد إن يدخل عليها قالا له بت الليلة في الطاحون إلى غد يكون خيرا فاعتقد اخي إن لهما قصدا صحيحا فبات في الطاحون وحده... 11. Būlāg 95: 14-15 وقال له حياك الله زواجك مبارك انك بت الليلة في النعيم والدلال والعناق من العشاء الي الصبا ح... 12. Būlāq 96: 7 وخد اسیل تقبله وقد رشیق تعانقه... 13. Būlāg 96: 11-12 فنظر اخي فرأى فيه اربيع بننات ما رأى الراؤن احسن منهن وهن يغنين باصوات تطرب الحجر الاصم... 14. Būlāq 96: 26-28 وقالت يا سيدى لقد ملكتنى بهذه الأخلاق الحسنة ثم حلفته بحياتها الايقوم ويرقص فقام ورقص فلم تدع في البيت مخدة حتى ضربته بها .... 15. Būlāq 96: 28-29 وكذلك جميم الجوارى صرن يضربنه بمثل نارنجة وليمونة واترجة الى ان سقط مغشيا عليه من الضرب ولم يزل الصغع على قغاه والرجم في وجهه الى ان قالت له العجوزالان... 16. Būlāq 96: 30-33 ان من عادتها انها اذا سكرت لا تمكن احدا من نفسها حتى تقلع ثيابها وسراويلها وتبقى عريانة من جميع ثيابها وانت الاخر تقلع ثيابك وتجرى ورأها وهي تجري قدامك كأنها هاربة منك ولم تزل تابعها من مكان الى مكان حتى يقوم أيرك فتمكنك من نفسها ... 17. Būlāq 97: 4-8 لما قالت له العجوز قم أقلع ثيابك قام وهو غائب عن الوجود وقلع ثيابه وصار عريانا فقالت الجارية لاخي قم الان واجر ورائ واجرى انا قدامك واذا اردت شيا فاتبعني فجرت قدامه وتبعها ثم جعلت تدخل من محل الى محل تخرج من محل الى محل آخر واخى ورأها وقد غلب عليه الشبق

وايره قائم كانه مجنون ولم تزل تجرى قدامه وهو يجرى ورأها حتى سمم منها صوتا رقيقا ... 18. Būlāq 8-11 وهي تجرى قدامه وهو يجرى ورأها فبينما هو كذلك اذ رأى نفسه في وسط الزقاق وذلك الزقاق في سوق الجلادين وهم ينادون على الجلود فرأه الناس على تلك الحالة وهو عريان قائم الاير محلوق الذقن الحواجب والشوارب محمر الوجه فصاحوا عليه وصاروا يضحكون ويقهقهون وصار بعضهم يصغعه بالجلود وهو عريان حتى غشى عليه... 19. Būlāq 98: 8 فقال نحن اربعة نعمل ارواحنا عميانا ونمر على الناس وندخل البيوت وننظر النساء ونحتال في فسادهن واكتساب الاموال من طرفهن ... 20. Būlāq 100: 1-2 فاسند ظهره اليها وقعد متفكرا في نغسه... 21. Būlāq 101: 17-18 قالت يا ولدى انها تميل اليك لكنها زوجة رجل موسر فخذ جميع مالك معك... 22. Būlāq 101: 25-26 فجلس اخي وجلست بجانبه ولاعبته ساعة زمانية ثم قامت وقالت له لا تبرح حتى اجيء اليك وغابت عن اخي ساعة... 23. Büläq 102: 1-2 فجاءت العجوز الى اخى وجرته من رجله الى سرداب طويل مظلم ورمته فيه على جماعة مقتولين فاستقر في مكانه يومين كاملين... 24. Būlāq 104: 19-24 فاخرج البدوى الجبار من حزامه سكينا عريضة لو نزلت على رقبة جمل لقطعتها من الوريد الى الوريد واخذها في يده اليمين وتقدم الي اخي المسكين وقطع بها شغتيه وشدد عليه بالمطالبة وكان للبدوى زوجة حسنة وكانت اذا خرج البدوى تتعرض لاخى وتراوده عن نغسه وهر يمتنع حياء من الله تعالى فاتفق أنَّ راودت أخي يوما من الآيام فقام ولاعبها وأجلسها في حجره فبينما. هما كذلك واذا بزوجها داخل عليهما فلما نظر الى اخي قال له يا ويلك يا خبيث اتريد الان ان تغسد على زوجتي واخرج سكينا وقطع بها ذكره وحمله على جمل وطرحه فوق جبل وتركه وسار الى حال سبيله... Culinary Exoticism 25. Būlāq 91: 24-27 فقلت عندى خمسة اوان من الطعام وعشر دجاجات محمرات وخاروف مشوى فقال احضرها لي حتى انظر فاحضرت اليه جميع ذلك فلما عاينه قال بقي الشراب فقلت له عندى قال أحضره فاحضره له قال لله درك ما اكرم نغسك لكن بقى البخور والطيب فاحضرت له درجا فيه ند وعود وعنبر ومسك یساوی خمسین دینار ... 26. Būlāg 103: 18-19 ثم صاح صاحب الدار يا غلام قدم لنا السكباج الذي لا يوجد مثله في طعام الملوك ثم قال لاخي كل يا ضيفي فانك جائع شديد الجوع ومحتاج آلى الأكل... 27. Būlāg 103: 21 ثم صاح يا غلام قدم لنا الغراريج المحشوة بالغستق فكل ما لم تاكل مثله قط... 28. Būlāq 103: 22-24 واقبل يومي بيده الى فم اخي حتى كانه يلقمه بيده وكان يعدد هذه الالران ويصفها لاخي بهذه الاوصاف وهو جائع فاشتد جوعه وصار بشهوة رغيف من شعير ثم قال له صاحب الدار هل رأيت اطيب من أبازير هذه الأطعمة فقال له أخي لا يا سيدي... 29. Būlāg 103: 25-30 فصاح الرجل على اتباعه إن قدموا الحلويات فحركوا أيديهم في الهواء كانهم قدموا الحلويات ثم قال صاحب المنزل لاخي كل من هذا النوع فانه جيد وكل من هذه القطائف بحياتي وخذ هذه القطيغة قبل ان ينزل منها الجلاب فقال له اخي لا عدمتك يا سيدى واقبل أخي يسأله عن كشرة المسك الذي في القطائف فقال له أن هذه عادتي في بيتي فدائما يضعون لي في كل قطيفة مثقالا من المسك ونصف مثقال من العنبر هذا كله...

30. Būlāq 103: 30-33 ثم مناح مناحب الدار على اتباعه ان احضروا النقل فحركوا ايديهم في الهواء كانهم احضروا النقل وقال لاخي كل من هذا اللوز ومن هذا الجرز ومن هذا الزبيب ونحر ذلك ومنار يعدد له انواع النقل ويقول له كل ولا تستح فقال له اخي يا سيدي قد اكتفيت ولم يبق لي قدرة على اكل شئ...

Exoticism and Magnificence in Decor

31. Būlāq 103: 7-9 فدخل الدهليز ومشى فيه ساعة حتى وصل الى دار فى غاية ما يكرن من الملاحة والظرف وفى وسطها بستان ما رأى الراؤن احسن منه وارضها مغروشة بالرخام وستورها مسبولة فصار اخى لا يعرف اين يقصد فمضى نحو صدر المكان فرأى انسانا حسن الوجه واللحية...

Oriental Despotism, Barbarism and Violence 32. Būlāg 88: 17-18 ثم قال يا خياط الاحدثتنى بشىء باعجب من حديت الاحدب وهبت لكم ذنربكم فعند ذلك تقدم الخباط... 33. Būlāq 92: 31 ان صاحب الدار اذنبت جارية عنده فضربها فصاحت ... 34. Būlāg 93: 27-28 ودخلت دكانا في وسط السوق واستجرت بصاحبها فمنعه عني... 35. Būlāq 96: 14-15 فرجع وجلس ولم ينطق فاعادت الصغع على قغاه الى أن أغمى عليه... 36. Būlāq 97: 19-20 فقال له يا أسفل السغلة لم تسألني شيأ لله حين سمعت كلامي أول مرة وأنت تدق الباب 37. Būlāq 98: 27-28 ثم اراد ان يخرجها ويشترى غنما فلما فتم الصندوق... 38. Būlāq 98: 30 لعل ذلك الشيخ يجئ فاقبض عليه... فقال له آخي آن كان الامر كما ذكرت فمالي ودمي حلال لك... 39. Būlāq 99: 1 40. Būlāq 99: 3 فهجم الناس على دكان اخي فرأوا ذلك الكبش صار انسانا معلقا فلما رأوا ذلك... 41. Būlāq 100: 1-2 فتلح على وتقول لا بد من شربه وتقدمه الى فمى فانغض يدى في وجهها وارفصها برجلي واعمل هاكدا . . . اخذنا المزين وقبضها عليه وحبسناه... 42. Būlāq 104: 32 Burlesque and Derision 43. Not found in the Arabic source text 44. Būlāq 95: 10-11 فعلقه في الطاحون الى قريب الصبح فجاء صاحب الدار فرأى اخي معلقا في الطاحون والطحان يضربه بالسوط فتركه... Obscenities ثم ضحكت حتى استلقت على قفاها ... 45. Būlāq 96: 26 فأنه كان جزارا ببغداد يبيع اللحم ويربى الخرفان... 46. Būlāq 98: 22 47. Būlāq 102: 16-19 ثم نادى اين العجوز فجاءت فقال لها اتعرفيننى يا عجوز النحس فقالت لا يا مولاى فقال لها انا صاحب الدنانير الذي جئت وتوضأت عندي وصليت ثم تحيلت على حتى اوقعتني هنا فقالت اتق الله في امرى فالتغت اليها وضربها بالسيف فصيرها قطعتين ثم خرج في طلب الجارية...

# Chapter Four: Arabic Source Texts For The English And Khawam's Translations

وراحت السكره وجت الفكرة تم إن السمسار والأحدب باتوا في دار الوالي إلى الصباح... قد راحت السكرة وجاءت الفكرة ثم إن الاحدب والنصراني باتا في بيت الوالي... - Būlāq 74: 31 Calcutta II (1) 202: 8-9 فراحت السكرة وجاءت الفكرة ثم ان السمسار والاحدب والنصراني باتوا في بيت الوالي الى الصباح... 2. Mahdi 299: 28-30 الى الصباح فقمت وناولتها الدهب الخمسين في المنديل وخرجت فوجدت المكارى فركبت ورحت الى الخان ونمت ساعه... Calcutta II 212: 15-17; Būlāq 79: 16-17, idem الى الصباح فقمت وناولتها الخمسين دينارا على العادة وخرجت من عندها فرجدت الحمّار فركبت الى خان فنمت ساعة... 3. Mahdi 320: 16-18 فاكلنا وشربنا ولعبنا وضحكنا الى الليل اوقدنا الشموع وشربنا اقداحاً حتى سكرنا وقمت نمت انا واباها... Calcutta II 229: 20-21; Būlāq 86: 17-18, idem ثم اكلنا وشربنا ونمنا مثل العادة الى الصباح... 4. Mahdi 327-328: 18-19 ودلك سبب دلك المزين الشيخ النحس الاسرد الرجه القبيع الفعايل التعيس الحركه القليل البركة... Būlāq 88: 25 فان سبب خروجي هذا المزين الذي هو قاعد... Calcutta II 235: 17 فان سبب رجوعى هذا المزين النحس الذي قاعد...

5. Mahdi 372: 16 Calcutta II: 272; Būlāq 104: 5, <u>idem</u>

1. Mahdi 285: lines 20-21

وعلى الباب حشم وخدم وامر ونهى... وعلى الباب خدم وامر ونهي...

6. Mahdi 377: 15–17; Calcutta II 276: 6-8; Būlāq 105: 7-8, almost identical فحملته تحايلت حتى ارميته فى دار هده اليهردى الطبيب وتحايل الطبيب حتى رماه عند الشاهد وتحايل الشاهد حتى رماه عند النصرانى السمسار ...

<sup>1.</sup> The Arabic text of Calcutta II contains an error for the broker and the Christian are the same person. Payne and Burton therefore rectified this error in their translations.

# Chapter Four: Arabic Source Text For Burton's Translation

1. Calcutta II 199: lines 3-10 بلغني اياها الملك السعيد أنه كان في قديم الزمان وسالف العصر والاوان في مدينة الصين رجل خياط مبسوط الانامل يحب اللهو والطرّب وكان يخرج هو وزوجته في بعض الاحيان يتغرجون على التغرجات فخرجوا يوما من أول النهار ورجعوا آخره إلى منزلهم عند المساء فوجدوا في طريقهم رجلا احدب رؤيته تضحك المغبون وتزيل الهم عن المحزون فعند دلك تغدم الخياط وزوجته يتغرجون عليه ثم انهم عزموا عليه ان يروح معهم الي بيتهم لينادمهم تلك الليلة فاجابهم ومشي معهم ألى البيت... فاحدت أمرأة الخياط جزلة سمك كبيرة ولقمتها للاحدب... 2. Calcutta II 199: 13 فخذي هذا الربع دينار واعطيه لسيدك وخليه ينزل يرى ولدي... 3. Calcutta II 200: 12-13 لا حول ولاقوة الا بالله العلى العظيم... 4. Calcutta II 201: 13 5. Calcutta II 210: 20 فيه (البستان) الغواكه الوان وبه انهار دافقة وطيورها ناطقة.... 6. Calcutta II 216: 13 فقد جرى عايك الغضاء بسببي حتى عدمت يمينك... 7. Calcutta II 216: 21-22 ولا مكثت غير خمسين يوما الا وهي من اهل الآخرة... حتى لم يبق الا الصندوق الذي انا فيه ... 8. Calcutta II 223: 23 9. Calcutta II 236: 6-7 وفي يوم من الايام أنا ماشي في أزقة بغداد وأذا بجماعة النسوة تعرضن لي في الطريق فهربت... 10. Calcutta II 239: 7 فقد من الله عليك بسزين... 11. Calcutta II 241: 7 وما ادرى سبب عجلتك... 12. Calcutta II 244: 5-6 كل هؤلاء ما فيهم ثقيل ولا معربد ولا فضولى ولا منكد ولكل واحد من هؤلاء رقصة برقصها وابيات بنشدها ... 13. Calcutta II 245: 3-5 ما طلبت الا أن أعاشرك بهؤلاء الاقوام الاكياس أولاد الناس الذين ما فيهم فضولى ولا كثير الكلام... ولو كنت كثير الكلام ما فعلت معه الجميل... 14. Calcutta II 249: 11 15. Calcutta II 250: 1-2 فهذا يا جماعة ما هو من مروتي وقلة كلامي الذي سكت وما رضيت اتكلم... 16. Calcutta II 255: 3 فتضرع اليه اخي... 17. Calcutta II 258: 17-18 واخى وراءها وقد غلب عليه الشوق وزبه قائم كانه مجنون... 18. Calcutta II 268: 18-19 اذ دخل عليه عبد اسود عظيم الخلقة... 19. Calcutta II 268: 20-21 فلما رآه لم يقدر اخي ان يرد عليه جوابا وانعقد لسانه عن رد الجواب... 20. Calcutta II 273: 3 فصار يدور حنكه وبمضغ... حتى خلاه فقيرا لا يقدر على شيء فخرج اخي هاربا على وجهه... 21-19 274: 274: 21 274: 274

# Chapter Four: Arabic Source Text For Khawam's Translation

1. Mahdi 293: 15-16; 294: 17 الى يوم من بعض الايام وكان يوم الاتنين فدخلت بكره الحمام وخرجت منها ولبست اتواب جميله وجيت الخان ودخلت موضعي وافطرت على شراب ونمت... 2. Mahdi 299: 28 فقمنا الى مجلس النوم ونمنا ... 3. Mahdi 305: 20 وصرت ازيد في مالي... 4. Mahdi 314: 6 فضاق صدرى... 5. Mahdi 321: 8; 10 وهي تنظرني ( . . . ) ففهمت صاحبتي ان عينها على وعيني عليها . . . 6. Mahdi 328: 19-20 فلما سمع صاحب الدعوه هذا الصغات التى بهذا المزين... 7. Mahdi 329: 19-20 فتبسمت لما نظرتني (...) فانطلق في قلبي النار ونقلب بغض النساء بالمحبه... 8. Mahdi 344: 15-16 فقال كاني بك الساعه تخادعني وتمضى وحدك فترمي نغسك في مصيبه لا خلاص لك منها ... 9. Mahdi 356: 7-8 فلما راى اخى دلك منها انكره وحرد وبقت العجوز تغمزه فرجع اخي فامرته الجاريه بالجلوس... 10. Mahdi 377: 9-10 وقالت (زوجتی) انت فی قصغك وتيهك وانا مخزونه... 11. Mahdi 285: 5-6 یا ستار استرنی... 12. Mahdi 296: 15 فقالت يا حبيبي عندي والا عندك... 13. Mahdi 317: 6-7 فجلس والدى وعمومتي الجميع وقعدوا حلقه يتحدثون في عجايب البلدان وغرايب المدن... 14. Mahdi 323: 19-20 وقد غرنى الشيطان والغضا والقدر...

# Bibliography

**Primary Sources** 

Al-'Adwi, Muhammed Qittat, ed. 1836, <u>Alf laylah wa-laylah</u>. 2 vols. Cairo: Bulaq.

Burton, Richard F. 1885-1886. <u>The Book of the Thousand Nights and a</u> <u>Night. A Plain and Literal Translation of the Arabian Nights'</u> <u>Entertainments</u>. 10 vols. London: The Burton Club.

Galland, Antoine. 1955 (1704-1717), <u>Les Mille et une nuits</u>, G. Picard, ed., 3 vols., Paris: Garnier.

Khawam, René. 1965-1968, <u>Les Mille et une nuits</u>, 4 vols., Paris: Albin Michel.

-----. 1986-1987, Les Mille et une nuits, 4 vols., Paris: Phébus.

Lane, E.W. 1859 (1838-1841), <u>The Thousand and One Nights; Commonly</u> <u>Called, in England, The Arabian Nights' Entertainments. A New</u> <u>Translation from the Arabic with Copious Notes</u>, 3 vols. London: East-West Publications.

Macnaghten, W.H. ed. 1839-1842, <u>The Alf Laila or Book of the Thousand</u> <u>Nights and One Night</u>, 4 vols., Calcutta: n.p.

- Mahdi, Muhsin, ed. 1984, <u>Kitāb alf laylah wa-laylah: min uşūlihi al-'arabiyah</u> <u>al-'ūlā</u>, 2 vols., Leiden: E.J. Brill.
- Mardrus, J. C. 1985 (1899-1904), <u>Le Livre des Mille et une nuits</u>, 2 vols., Paris: Laffont.
- Payne, John. 1882-1889, <u>Arabian Nights. The Book of the Thousand Nights</u> and One Night from the Original Arabic, 9 vols. London: n.p.

Secondary Sources

- Abdel-Halim, Mohammed. 1964, <u>Antoine Galland: sa vie et son oeuvre</u>, Paris: Nizet.
- Abdullah, Adel M. 1962, "The Arabian Nights in English Literature to 1900." Diss. University of Cambridge.
- Abel, A. 1939, <u>Les Enseignements des 1001 nuits</u>, Bruxelles: Wellens-Pay; Castaigne.
- Abbott, Nadia. 1949, "A Ninth-Century Fragment of the Thousand Nights: New Light on the Early History of the Arabian Nights." <u>Journal of</u> <u>Near Eastern Studies</u> 8: 129-164.
- Aboul-Hussein, H. 1970, "Le Docteur Mardrus, traducteur des <u>Mille et une</u> <u>nuits</u>." Diss. Sorbonne.
- ----- et Ch. Pellat. 1976, Cheherazade personnage littéraire, Algérie:

Société nationale d'édition et de diffusion.

Ahmed, Leila. 1978, Edward W. Lane, New York: Longman.

- Ali, Muhsin Jassim. 1981, Scheherazade in England: A Study of
  - Nineteenth-Century English Criticisms of the Arabian Nights, Washington: Three Continents.
- ----. 1980, "The Growth of Scholarly Interest in the Arabian Nights." <u>The</u> <u>Muslim World</u> 70: 196-212.
- Allen, Roger. 1984, "An Analysis of the 'Tale of Three Apples' from the <u>Thousand and One Nights</u>," in Roger M. Savory and Dionisius A. Agius, <u>Logos Islamikos: Studia Islamica in Honorem Michaelis</u> <u>Wickens</u>, Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 51-60.

Angenot, Marc. 1989, <u>1889</u>; un état du discours social, Longueuil, Québec: Préambule.

- ----. 1986, <u>Le Cru et le faisandé: sexe, discours social et littérature à la</u> <u>Belle Époque</u>, Bruxelles: Labor.
- "L'Arabie heureuse." 1989, Corps écrits 31.
- Arberry, A.J. 1960, "The Lexicographer: Edward W. Lane," in <u>Oriental</u> <u>Essays: Portraits of Seven Scholars</u>, London: G. Allend and Unwin; New York: MacMillan, 87-121.
- Arnold, Matthew. 1911 (1861), "On Translating Homer," in <u>Essays</u>, London: J.M. Dent; New York: E.P. Dutton, 210-275.
- -----. (1862), "Last Words on Translating Homer. A Reply to Francis W. Newman," in <u>Essays</u>, 337-380.
- Azar, Amine A. 1987, "La Ruse nuptiale de Shéhérazade." <u>Cahiers de l'Orient</u> 5: 160-180.
- Barchilon, Jacques. 1975, <u>Le Conte merveilleux français de 1690-1790</u>, Paris: Champion.
- Barney, Natalie. 1960, "Les Mardrus," in <u>Souvenirs indiscrets</u>, Paris: Flammarion, 147-185.
- Bassnett-McGuire, Susan. 1980, <u>Translation Studies</u>, London; New York: Methuen.
- Bauman, Richard. 1986, <u>Story, Performance, and Event: Contextual Studies</u> of Oral Narrative, Cambridge; New York: Cambridge UP.
- Beaman, Karen. 1984, "Coordination and Subordination Revisited: Syntactic Complexity in Spoken and Written Narrative Discourse," in Deborah Tannen, ed., <u>Coherence in Spoken and Written Discourse</u>, Norwood, N.J.: Ablex, 45-80.

Beeston, A.L.F. 1970, The Arabic Language Today, London: Hutchison.

- -----. 1974, "Parallelism in Arabic Prose." Journal of Arabic Literature 5: 134-146.
- Ben-Amos, Dan, ed. 1976, Folklore Genres, Austin; London: Texas UP.
- Bencheikh, Jamel-Eddine. 1969, "Les Mille et une nuits." <u>Encyclopaedia</u> <u>Universalis</u>, vol. 11, 29-30.
- -----, Claude Brémond et André Miquel. 1980, "Dossier d'un conte des <u>Mille</u> et une nuits." <u>Critique</u> 394: 240-277.

- ----. 1981, "Premières propositions pour une théorie d'un schéma générateur: essai d'analyse du texte narratif d'un conte des <u>Mille et</u> <u>une nuits.</u>" <u>Analyses, Théorie</u> 1: 136-189.
- -----. 1989a (1975), Poétique arabe, Paris: Gallimard.
- -----. 1989b, <u>Les Mille et une nuits ou la parole prisonnière</u>, Paris: Gallimard.

Berman, Antoine. 1984, <u>L'Epreuve de l'étranger. Culture et traduction dans</u> <u>l'Allemagne romantique</u>, Paris: Gallimard.

- ----. 1985, "La Traduction et la lettre de l'auberge du lointain," dans <u>Les</u> <u>Tours de Babel</u>, Mauvesin: Trans-Europ-Repress, 31-150.
- ----. 1986, "L'Essence platonnicienne de la traduction." <u>Revue d'esthétique</u> 12: 63-73.
- ----. 1990, "Préface," in A. Brisset, <u>Sociocritique de la traduction</u>, Longueuil, Québec: Préambule, 9-19.

Blachère, R. 1952, 1964, 1966, <u>Histoire de la littérature arabe des origines à</u> la fin du XVe siècle de J.-C., 3 vols., Paris: Adrien-Maisonneuve.

-----. 1973 (1966), <u>Le Coran</u>, Paris: P.U.F. (collection Que sais-je? no. 1245)

Bodine, T. Jermain. 1977, "Magic Carpet to Islam: Duncan Black Macdonald and the Arabian Nights." <u>The Muslim World</u> 67: 1-11.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1982, Ce que parler veut dire, Paris: Fayard.

Brisset, Annie. 1980, "Structures de signifiance et traduction. Réflexions sur un poème de W.H. Auden." M.A. Thesis. University of Ottawa.

- ----. 1984, "Poésie: le sens en effet. Étude d'un translème." <u>Meta</u> 29 (3): 259-266.
- ----. 1986, "Ceci n'est pas une trahison." Spirale juin: 12-13.
- ----. 1989a, "Sociocritique de la traduction: un corpus québécois." <u>Cahiers</u> <u>de recherche sociologique</u> 12: 51-62.
- ----. 1989b "In Search of a Target Language: The Politics of Theatre Translation in Quebec." <u>Target</u> 1 (1): 9-27. (Trans. Lynda Davey)
- ----. 1990, <u>Sociocritique de la traduction: Théâtre et altérité au Québec</u> (1968-1988), Longueuil, Québec: Préambule.
- Broeck, Raymond van den. 1978, "The Concept of Translation Equivalence in Translation Theory: Some Critical Reflections," in J.S. Holmes, ed., 1978, 29-47.
- ----. 1985, "Second Thoughts on Translation Criticism: A Model of its Analytic Function," in Theo Hermans, ed., <u>The Manipulation of</u> <u>Literature</u>, New York: St. Martin's Press, 54-62.

Brower, R.A., ed. 1959, On Translation, Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard UP.

- Bulos, Afif A. 1965, <u>The Arab Triliteral Verb. A Comparative Study of</u> <u>Grammatical Concepts and Processes</u>, Beirut: Khayats.
- Burton, Isabel (Arundell). 1893, <u>The Life of Capt. Sir Rich[ar]d F. Burton</u>, 2 vols., London: Chapman and Hall.

Burton, Richard. 1886, "Terminal Essay," in <u>The Book of the Thousand</u> <u>Nights and a Night</u>, London: Burton Club, vol. 10, 63-302.

Cantarino, Vincent. 1975, "Paronomasia," Syntax of Modern Arabic Prose:

<u>The Expanded Sentence</u>, vol. 2, Bloomington; London: Indiana UP, 439-452.

-----. 1975b, Arabic Poetics in the Golden Age, Leiden: E.J. Brill.

- Caracciolo, P.L., ed. 1988, <u>Arabian Nights in English Literature</u>, London: Macmillan.
- Cary, Edmond. 1963, "Antoine Galland et les traducteurs des <u>Mille et une</u> <u>nuits</u>," in <u>Les Grands traducteurs français</u>, Genève: Georg, 61-91.
- Catford, J.C. 1965, <u>A Linguistic Theory of Translation</u>. An Essay in Applied <u>Linguistics</u>, London: Oxford UP.
- Cayron, Claire. 1987, Sésame, pour la traduction, n.p.: Le Mascaret.
- Chaytor, H.J. 1967, <u>From Script to Print: An Introduction to Medieval</u> <u>Vernacular Literature</u>, New York: October House.
- Chikkani, M.T. 1987, "Un Pont jeté entre l'Orient et l'Occident: entretien avec René Khawam." <u>Cahiers de l'Orient</u> 5: 149-157.
- Cohen, J. M. 1962, <u>English Translators and Translations</u>. London: Longmans, Green and Co.
- Conant, Martha Pike. 1908, <u>The Oriental Tale in England in the Eighteenth</u> <u>Century</u>, New York: Columbia UP.
- Connelly, Bridget. 1986, <u>Arab Folk Epic and Identity</u>, Berkeley; Los Angeles; London: University of California Press.
- Coussonnet, Patrice. 1985, "Pour une lecture historique des <u>Mille et une</u> <u>Nuits</u>. Essai d'analyse du conte des deux vizirs égyptiens." <u>IBLA</u> 155: 85-115.
- ----. 1987, "Note de lecture: à propos d'une édition récente des <u>Mille et une</u> <u>Nuits.</u>" <u>IBLA</u> 160: 339-352.
- -----. 1989, <u>Pensée mythique, idéologie et aspirations sociales dans un</u> conte des Mille et une Nuits: le récit d'Ali du Caire. Introduction. essai d'analyse et d'interprétation, Le Caire: Institut français d'archéologie orientale (Supplément aux annales islamologiques, Cahier no. 13).
- Dearden, Seton. 1953 (1936), <u>The Arabian Knight: A Study of Sir Richard</u> <u>Burton</u>, London: A. Barker.

Delarue, Lucie. 1938, Mes mémoires, Paris: Gallimard.

- Delisle, Jean. 1984, <u>L'Analyse du discours comme méthode de traduction:</u> initiation à la traduction française de textes pragmatiques anglais. <u>Théorie et pratique</u>. 3 vols. Ottawa: Éd. de l'Université d'Ottawa.
- D'hulst, Lieven. 1989, "Le Discours sur la traduction en France (1800-1850)." <u>Revue de littérature comparée</u> 2: 179-187.
- Dimić, M.V. and M.K. Garstin. 1988, "Appendix, The Polysystem Theory: A Brief Introduction, with Bibliography," in E.D. Blodgett and A.G. Purdy, eds., <u>Problems of Literary Reception/Problèmes de réception</u> <u>littéraire</u>, University of Alberta: The Research Institute for Comparative Literature, 177-196.
- Dodge, Bayard, ed. and trans. 1970, <u>The Fihrist of al-Nadim: Tenth- Century</u> <u>Survey of Muslim Culture</u>, 2 vols., New York; London: Columbia UP.

- Dozy, R.P.A. 1845, <u>Dictionnaire détaillé des noms des vêtements chez les</u> <u>Arabes</u>, Amsterdam: Jean Müller.
- ----. 1967 (1881), <u>Supplément aux Dictionnaires arabes</u>, 2 vols., Leiden: E.J. Brill; Paris: Maisonneuve et Larose.
- Duneton, Claude. 1973, Parler Croquant, Paris: Stock.
- Durpiez, Bernard. 1977, <u>Gradus. Les Procédés littéraires (Dictionnaire)</u>, Paris: 10/18.
- Elisséeff, Nikita. 1949, <u>Thèmes et motifs des 1001 nuits: essai de</u> classification, Beyrouth: Institut français de Damas.
- Even-Zohar, Itamar. 1978, <u>Papers in Historical Poetics</u>, Tel Aviv: Porter Institute for Poetics and Semiotics.
- -----. 1979, "Polysystem Theory." <u>Poetics Today</u> 1 (1-2): 287-310.
- -----. 1981, "Translation Theory Today: A Call for Transfer Theory." <u>Poetics</u> <u>Today</u> 2 (4): v-xi.
- -----. 1986, "Literary Dynamics," "Literary Interference," "Literary System," in Thomas A. Sebeok et al., eds, <u>Encyclopedic Dictionary of</u> <u>Semiotics</u>, vol. 1, Berlin; New York, Amsterdam: Mouton de Gruyter, 459-466.
- Farag, F.R. 1976, "<u>The Arabian Nights</u>, A Mirror of Islamic Culture in the Middle Ages." <u>Arabica</u> 23: 197-211.
- Finnegan, Ruth. 1988, <u>Literacy and Orality: Studies in the Technology of</u> <u>Communication</u>, New York; Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
- Gall, Michel. 1972, <u>Le Secret des "Mille et une nuits": Les Arabes</u> possédaient la tradition, Paris: Laffont.
- García Yebra, Valentín. 1982, <u>Teoría y prática de la traducción</u>, 2 vols., Madrid: Gredos.
- -----. 1983, <u>En Torno a la Traducción: Teoría, Crítica, Historia</u>, Madrid: Gredos.
- Gaulmier, Jean. 1965, "Introduction," in A. Galland (trans.), <u>Les Mille et une</u> <u>nuits</u>, vol. 1, Paris: Garnier-Flammarion, 7-15.
- Gerhardt, Mia I. 1963, <u>The Art of Story-Telling: A Literary Study of the</u> <u>Thousand and One Nights</u>, Leiden: E.J. Brill.
- Ghazoul, Ferial J. 1980, <u>The Arabian Nights: A Structural Analysis</u>, Cairo: National Commission for UNESCO.
- Goffin, Roger. 1985, "La Science de la traduction 1955-1985," in <u>Communiquer et traduire. Hommage à Jean Dierickx</u>, Bruxelles: Éd. de l'Université de Bruxelles, 27-36.
- Gorp, Hendrick van. 1985, "Translation and Genre. The European Picaresque Novel in the 17th and 18th Centuries," in Theo Hermans, ed., <u>The</u> <u>Manipulation of Literature</u>, New York: St. Martin's Press, 136-148.
- Gournay, Jean-François. 1983, <u>L'Appel du Proche-Orient: Richard Francis</u> <u>Burton. 1821-1890</u>, Lille: Atelier de reproduction des thèses.

Grunebaum, Gustav E. von. 1981, <u>Themes in Medieval Arabic Literature</u>, London: Variorum Reprints.

Hagège, Claude. 1980, "Traitement du sens et fidélité dans l'adaptation

classique: sur le texte arabe des <u>Mille et une nuits</u> et de la traduction de Galland." <u>Arabica</u> 27: 114-139.

- Hamori, A. 1966, "Notes on Two Love Stories from the <u>Thousand and One</u> <u>Nights.</u>" <u>Studia Islamica</u> 43: 65-80.
- ----. 1971, "An Allegory from the <u>Arabian Nights</u>: The City of Brass." Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies 34: 9-19.
- -----. 1974, <u>On the Art of Medieval Arabic Literature</u>, Princeton: Princeton UP.

----. 1983, "A Comic Romance from the <u>Thousand and One Nights</u>: The Tale of the Two Viziers." <u>Arabica</u> 30: 38-53

Hava, J. G. 1964 (1899), <u>Al-Farā'id Arabic-English Dictionary</u>, Beirut: Catholic Press.

Hawari, Rida. 1980, "Antoine Galland's translation of the <u>Arabian Nights</u>." <u>Revue de littérature comparée</u> 54: 150-164.

Haywood, J.A. and H.M. Nahmad. 1962, <u>New Arabic Grammar of the</u> <u>Written Language</u>, Cambridge: Harvard UP.

Heath, Peter. 1987, 1988, "Romance as a Genre in <u>The Thousand and One</u> <u>Nights.</u>" Journal of Arabic Literature 18: 1-21, 19: 1-26.

Hermans, Theo, ed. 1985, "Images of Translation. Metaphor and Imagery in the Renaissance Discourse on Translation," in <u>The Manipulation of</u> <u>Literature: Studies in Literary Translation</u>, New York: St. Martin's Press, 103-135.

Holmes, J.S. et al. 1970, <u>The Nature of Translation: Essays on the Theory</u> <u>and Practice of Literary Translation</u>, The Hague; Paris: Mouton; Brastilava: Publishing House of the Slovak Academy of Sciences.

----, José Lambert and Raymond Van den Broeck. 1978, <u>Literature and</u> <u>Translation. New Perspectives in Literary Studies</u>, Leuven: Acco.

Hoof, Henri van. 1986, <u>Petite histoire de la traduction en Occident</u>, Louvain-la-Neuve: Cabay.

Jakobson, Roman. 1959, "On Linguistic Aspects of Translation," in R.A. Brower, ed., 232-239.

- Julia, Émile-François. 1935, <u>Les 1001 Nuits et l'enchanteur Mardrus</u>, Paris: Malfère.
- Kabbani, Rana. 1986, <u>Europe's Myths of Orient: Devise and Rule</u>, London: Macmillan.

Kelly, Louis. 1979, <u>The True Interpreter. A History of Translation Theory</u> and Practice in the West, Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Kilito, A. 1985, <u>L'Auteur et ses doubles: essai sur la culture arabe classique</u>, Paris: Seuil.

Knipp, C. 1974, "The Arabian Nights in England: Galland's Translation and its Successors." Journal of Arabic Literature 5: 44-54.

Ladmiral, J.R. 1979, Traduire: théorèmes pour la traduction, Paris: Payot.

---- et H. Meschonnic. 1981, "Poétique de.../Théorèmes pour... la traduction." Langue française 51: 3-18.

-----. 1986, "Sourciers et ciblistes." <u>Revue d'esthétique</u> 12: 33-42.

----- et A. Berman. 1987a, "Les Sourciers et les ciblistes." Préfaces 7: 80-82.

- ----. 1987b, "Traductologiques." Le Français dans le monde (numéro spécial: "Retour à la traduction") août-septembre: 18-25.
- Lambert, José. 1977, "Traduction, traduction littéraire et littérature comparée," in Paul Hoguelin, ed., <u>La Traduction. une profession</u> (Actes du XVIIe Congrès de la FIT), Montréal: Conseil des traducteurs et interprètes du Canada.
- -----. 1980a, "Production, traduction et importation: une clef pour la description de la littérature et de la littérature en traduction." <u>Canadian Review of Comparative Literature/Revue Canadienne de</u> <u>littérature comparée</u> 7: 246-252.
- ----. 1980b, "Théorie de la littérature et théorie de la traduction en France (1800-1850)." <u>Poetics Today</u> 2 (4): 161-170.
- ----. 1983, <u>Un Modèle descriptif pour l'étude de la littérature: la littérature</u> <u>comme polysystème</u>, (Katholicke Universiteit Leuven, paper 29) Leuven: Universiteit.
- ----. 1984, "Plaidoyer pour un programme des études comparatistes: littérature comparée et théorie du polysystème," <u>Actes du XVIe</u> <u>Congrès de la société française de littérature générale et comparée</u>, Montpellier.
- ----. 1985a, "La Traduction, les genres et l'évolution de la littérature. Propositions méthodologiques," <u>Actes du Xe Congrès de l'Association</u> <u>internationale de Littérature comparée</u>, vol. 1, New York: Garland, 127-131.
- ----- and Gorp, Hendrick van. 1985b, "On Describing Translations," in Theo Hermans, ed., <u>The Manipulation of Literature</u>, New York: St. Martin's Press, 42-53.
- ----. 1988, "Twenty Years Research on Literary Translation," in H. Kittel, ed., <u>Die literarische Uebersetzung. Stand und Perspektiven ihrer</u> <u>Erforschung</u>, Berlin: Eric Schmidt.
- ----. 1989, "La Traduction," in Marc Angenot et al., eds, <u>Théorie littéraire:</u> problèmes et perspectives, Paris: PUF, 151-159.
- Lane, Edward William. 1954 (1836) <u>Manners and Customs of the Modern</u> Egyptians, London: J.M Dent; New York: E.P. Dutton.
- ----. 1971 (1883), <u>Arabian Society in the Middle Ages. Studies from The</u> <u>Thousand and One Nights</u>, S. Lane-Poole, ed., London; Dublin: Curzon.
- -----. 1984 (1863-1893), <u>An Arabic-English Lexicon</u>, 2 vols., Cambridge: Islamic Texts Society.
- Larose, Robert. 1987, <u>Théories contemporaines de la traduction</u>, Sillery: Presses de l'Université du Québec.
- Laurens, Henry. 1978, <u>Aux sources de l'orientalisme: La Bibliotèque</u> <u>Orientale de Bathélemi d'Herbelot</u>, Paris: Maisonneuve et Larose.
- Lewis, Bernard. 1980, "Translation from Arabic." <u>Proceedings of the</u> <u>American Philosophical Society</u> 124 (1): 41-46.
- Littmann, Enno. 1960, "Alf layla wa layla." Encyclopaedia of Islam, vol. 1,

358-364.

Ma'at, Yassin Salhani. 1978, "The Book of the Thousand Nights and a Night," in "Sir Richard Burton: A Study of His Literary Works Relating to the Arab World and Islam." Diss. The University of St. Andrews, 139-232.

Macdonald, Duncan B. 1900, "On Translating the <u>Arabian Nights</u>." <u>The</u> <u>Nation</u> 71: Aug. 30, 167-168; Sept. 6, 185-186.

- ----. 1909, "Maximillian Habicht and His Recension of the <u>Arabian Nights</u>." J.R.A.S. 685-704.
- ----. 1919, "From the Arabian Nights to Spirit." <u>Muslim World</u> 9: 336-348.
- ----. 1922, "A Preliminary Classification of Some Manuscripts of the Arabian Nights," in <u>A Volume of Oriental Studies Presented to</u> <u>Professor E. G. Browne</u>, Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 304-321.
- ----. 1924, "The Earlier History of the Arabian Nights." J.R.A.S 353-397.
- -----. 1929, "Thousand and One Nights." Encyclopedia Britannica.
- -----. 1932, "A Bibliographical and Literary Study of the First Appearance of the <u>Arabian Nights</u> in Europe." <u>The Library Quarterly</u> 2 (4): 387-420.
- ----. 1938, "Alf layla wa layla." Encyclopaedia of Islam, vol.1, 17-21.
- Mahdi, M. 1985, "Exemplary Tales in the <u>Thousand and One Nights</u>," in M. Mahdi, ed., <u>The 1001 Nights: Critical Essays and Annotated</u> <u>Bibliography</u>, Cambridge, Mass.: Dar Mahjar, 1-24.
- Mataraso, Michel. 1982, "Éloge de la double sexualité dans les <u>Mille et une</u> <u>nuits</u>: la geste de Boudour, approche anthropologique." <u>Diogenes</u> 118: 15-47.
- May, George. 1986, <u>Les Mille et une nuits d'Antoine Galland ou le chef</u> <u>d'oeuvre invisible</u>, Paris: P.U.F.
- Mazahéri, Aly. 1951, <u>La Vie quotidienne des musulmans au Moyen Age. Xe</u> <u>au XIIe siècles</u>, Paris: Hachette.
- Meschonnic, Henri. 1973, "D'une linguistique de la traduction à la poétique de la traduction," in <u>Pour la poétique II</u>, Paris: Gallimard, 327-366.
- ---- et J.R. Ladmiral. 1981a, "Poétiqe de.../Théorèmes pour... la traduction." Langue française 51: 3-18.
- -----. 1981b, "Traduire la bible, de Jonas à Jona." Langue française 51: 35-52.
- ----. 1982a, <u>Critique du rythme: anthropologie historique du langage</u>, Paris; Mesnil: Verdier.
- -----. 1982b, "Qu'entendez-vous par oralité?" Langue française 56: 6-23.
- ----. 1986, "Alors la traduction chantera." <u>Revue d'esthétique</u> 12: 75-80.
- Miller, Judith. 1985, "Egypt Bans Copies of the <u>1001 Nights.</u>" <u>The New York</u> <u>Times</u>, May 20, A6.
- Miquel, André. 1977, <u>Un Conte des Mille et une nuits. Ajib et Gharib.</u> <u>Traduction et perspective d'analyse</u>, Paris: Flammarion.
- -----. 1981, <u>Sept contes de Mille et une nuits, ou il n'y a pas de contes</u> innocents, Paris: Sinbad.

- "Modes de pensée, modes d'expressions: de l'arabe au français du français à l'arabe." 1987, <u>Actes des troisièmes Assises de la traduction littéraire</u> (<u>Arles 1986</u>), ATLAS/Acters Sud, 59-98.
- Molan, P.D. 1978, "Ma'rūf the Cobbler: The Mythic Structure of an <u>Arabian</u> <u>Nights</u> Tale." <u>Edebiyat</u> 3: 121-136.

-----. 1988, "The Arabian Nights: The Oral Connection." Edebiyat 2: 191-204.

Monteil, V. 1960, "Phraséologie," in <u>L'Arabe moderne</u>, Paris: Klincksieck, 269-303.

Montet, E. 1930, <u>Le Conte dans l'Orient musulman: études littéraire et</u> critique des 1001 nuits, Paris: Leroux; Genève: Georg.

Mounin, Georges. 1955, Les Belles infidèles, Paris: Cahiers du Sud.

----. 1963, Les Problèmes théoriques de la traduction, Paris: Gallimard.

- ----. 1976, Linguistique et traduction, Bruxelles: Dessart et Mardaga.
- Moussa-Mahmoud, Fatma. 1988, "English Travellers and the <u>Arabian Nights</u>," in Peter L. Caracciolo, ed., 95-110.

Newman, Francis W. 1911 (1861), "Homeric Translation in Theory and Practice. A Reply to Matthew Arnold," in M. Arnold, <u>Essays</u>, 276-336.

Newmark, Peter. 1981, Approaches to Translation, Oxford: Pergamon.

Nicholson, R.A. 1977, <u>A Literary History of the Arabs</u>, Cambridge: Cambridge UP.

Nida, E.A. 1964, Towards A Science of Translating, Leiden: E.J. Brill.

- ----. 1959, "Principles of Translation as Exemplfied by Bible Translating," in R.A. Brower, ed., 11-31.
- ----- and C.R. Taber. 1982 (1969), <u>The Theory and Practice of Translation</u>, Leiden: E.J. Brill.
- Ong, Walter. 1982, <u>Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word</u>, London; New York: Methuen.
- "On <u>Target</u>'s Targets." 1989, <u>Target</u> 1 (1): 1-7.

"Les Partis pris de traduction: la pratique implique-t-elle une théorie?" 1986, <u>Actes des deuxièmes Assises de la traduction littéraire (Arles 1985)</u>, Actes Sud/A.T.L.A.S.

Pavel, Sylvia. 1974, "La Prolifération narrative dans les <u>Mille et une nuits.</u>" <u>The Canadian Journal of Research in Semiotics</u> 2: 21-40.

Pedersen, Johannes. 1984 (1946), <u>The Arabic Book</u>, trans. Geoffrey French, Princeton: Princeton UP.

Pinault, David. 1986, "Stylistic Features in Selected Tales from the <u>Thousand</u> and <u>One Nights</u>." Diss. University of Pennsylvania

----. 1987, "Būlāq, MacNaghten, and the New Leiden Edition Compared: Notes of Story-telling Techniques from the <u>Thousand and One</u> <u>Nights.</u>" Journal of Semitic Studies 32: 125-157.

Piroué, G. 1958, "La France et les <u>1001 nuits</u>." <u>La Table ronde</u> 127-128: 104-112.

Popovic, Anton. 1970, <u>Dictionary For the Analysis of Literary Translation</u>, Edmonton: Department of Comparative Literature of the U. of Alberta. "Rhythm and Orality." 1985, Style 19: 151-298.

Sa'adeddin, Mohammed A. 1987, "Target-World Experiential Matching: The Case of Arabic/English Translating." <u>Quinquereme</u> 10: 137-164.

Said, Edward. 1978, Orientalism, New York: Random House.

Schwab, Raymond. 1964, <u>L'Auteur des "Mille et une nuits": vie d'Antoine</u> <u>Galland</u>, Paris: Mercure de France.

Seleskovitch, D. 1984, "Histoire des princes Amgiad et Assad." <u>Communications</u> 39: 125-140.

- Somekh, Sasson. 1981, "The Emergence of Two Sets of Stylistic Norms In the Early Literary Translation into Modern Arabic Prose." <u>Poetics</u> <u>Today</u> 2 (4): 193-200.
- Steiner, George. 1975, <u>After Babel: Aspects of Language and Translation</u>, London: Oxford UP.
- Stetkevych, Jaroslav. 1970, <u>The Modern Arabic Language: Lexical and</u> <u>Stylistic Developments</u>, Chicago; London: University of Chicago Press.
- Todorov, Tzvetan. 1971, "Les Hommes-récits: les <u>Mille et une nuits</u>," in <u>Poétique de la prose</u>, Paris: Seuil, 33-34.
- Tomiche, Nada. 1978, <u>La Littérature arabe traduite: mythes et réalités. De</u> <u>l'image que ce fait l'Occident du monde arabe en langue française et</u> <u>anglaise</u>, Paris: Paul Geuthner.
- Toury, Gideon. 1978, "The Nature and Role of Norms in Literary Translation," in J.S. Holmes et al., eds, 83-100.
- ----. 1980, <u>In Search of a Theory of Translation</u>, Tel Aviv: The Porter Institute for Poetics and Semiotics.
- -----. 1981, "Translated Literature: System, Norm, Performance: Toward a T-T-Oriented Approach to Literary Translation." <u>Poetics Today</u> 2 (4): 9-27.
- ----. 1983, "Sharing Relevant Features: An Exercise in Optimal Translating." <u>Meta</u> 28 (2): 116-129.
- -----. 1984, "Translation, Literary Translation and Pseudo- Translation." <u>Comparative Criticism</u> 6: 73-85.
- -----. 1985, "A Rationale for Descriptive Translation," in Theo Hermans, ed., <u>The Manipulation of Literature</u>, New York: St. Martin's Press, 16-41.
- ----. 1986, "Translation: A Cultural Semiotic Perspective," in Thomas A. Sebeok et al., eds, <u>Encyclopedic Dictionary of Semiotics</u>, vol. 2, Berlin; New York: Amsterdam: Mouton de Gruyter, 1111-1124.
- "La Traduction littéraire: Qui Juge?" 1987, <u>Actes des troisièmes Assises de la</u> <u>traduction littéraire (Arles 1986)</u>, ATLAS/Actes Sud, 135-153.

"Translated Literature." 1989, <u>Revue de littérature comparée</u> 62:2.

- Valesio, Paolo. 1976, "Sketch for a Theory of Translation." <u>Semiotica</u> 18 (1): 1-96.
- Viala, Alain. 1985, <u>Naissance de l'écrivain: sociologie de la littérature à l'âge</u> classique, Paris: Éd. de Minuit.
- Wehr, Hans. 1979 (195), A Dictionary of Modern Written Arabic, J.M.

Cowan, ed., Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.

- Wiet, Gaston. 1966, <u>Introduction à la littérature arabe</u>, Paris: Maisonneuve et Larose.
- Wilss, Wolfram. 1982, <u>The Science of Translation: Problems and Methods</u>, Tübingen: Gunter Narr Verlag.

Wright, Thomas. 1906, <u>The Life of Sir Richard Burton</u>, London: Everett. -----. 1919, <u>The Life of John Payne</u>, London: T.F. Unwin.

Zuber, Roger. 1968, <u>Les "Belles infidèles" et la formation du goût classique.</u> Perrot d'Ablancourt et Guez de Balzac, Paris: A. Colin.

Zumthor, Paul. 1979, "Pour une poétique de la voix." <u>Poétique</u> 40: 514-524. ----. 1980, <u>Parler du Moyen Age</u>, Paris: Éd. de Minuit.

----. 1982a, "Le Rythme dans la poésie orale." Langue française 56: 114-127.

- ----. 1982b, "Le Discours de la poésie orale." Poétique 52: 387-401.
- ----. 1983, Introduction à la poésie orale, Paris: Seuil.
- ----. 1984, La Poésie et la voix dans la civilisation médiévale, Paris: Seuil.
- ----. 1985, "Spoken Language and Oral Poetry in the Middle Ages." <u>Style</u> 19: 191-226.

----. 1987, La Lettre et la voix de la "littérature" médiévale, Paris: Seuil.

Zwettler, M. 1978, <u>The Oral Tradition of Classical Arabic Poetry</u>, Columbus (Ohio): Ohio State UP.