

Exchanges and The Criollo Identity in *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí* by

Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela

Patricio Kobek

Department of Languages, Literatures, and Cultures, McGill University, Montreal

February 2020

A thesis submitted to McGill University in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the
degree of Doctor of Philosophy

© Patricio Kobek 2020

Table of Contents

Abstract	3
Resumen	5
Sommaire	7
Acknowledgements	9
Introduction	10
<i>Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí</i>	11
Dissertation Objectives: Examining Exchanges	19
A Comprehensive Review of the Relevant Literature	23
Chapter 1 – Exchange of Silver	28
Case 1 – Cashing in on Corruption	40
Case 2 – The Corrupt Corregidor	47
Case 3 – Antonio López de Quiroga	55
Chapter Conclusions	62
Chapter 2 – “Exchange” of Women	68
“Exchanges” of women in the New World	69
The “Exchange” of Women: A theoretical approach.....	75
Case 1 – Francisca and the imposter servant	77
Case 2 – Floriana and the unwelcome attention.....	93
Case 3 – La hechicera más poderosa de Potosí	101
Chapter Conclusions	112
Chapter 3 – Exchange of Culture	117
Case 1 – Abusing Authority	121
Case 2 – Francisco de la Rocha y la coca	129
Case 3 – The Indian Chocata.....	151
Case 4 – The Virgins of Potosí	157
Chapter Conclusions	164
Dissertation Conclusions	168
Notes	179
Bibliography	195

Abstract

Exchanges and the Criollo Identity analyzes the representations of exchanges in the work of Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela, *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí*, to consider the construction of the criollo identity in the city of Potosí, Bolivia, during the early eighteenth century. Arzáns' work tells the history of Potosí, a city founded in the mid sixteenth century to mine the *cerro rico*, one of the richest silver deposits in the Spanish Empire, and one of the symbols of wealth in the New World. Written in chronological order and narrating the most important events of each year, Arzáns' *Historia* articulates history and History, providing a perfect environment to consider how rewriting the past is instrumental towards the constitution of a new ideal citizen. I analyze in the *Historia* the representation of exchanges as central to the development of the city, namely of silver, women, and culture.

The study begins with the Introduction that situates Arzáns' work, its content, structure, and textual history. Chapter 1 analyzes selected cases of exchanges of silver, the element that is the entire reason for the founding and rapid growth of the city as people flocked to the area to make their fortunes through legitimate or illegitimate ways. Chapter 2 examines "exchanges" of women, a fundamental part of the foundation of society, and their efforts to regain control of their destinies. Chapter 3 analyzes exchanges of culture as knowledge, customs, and religion from Indigenous and European populations blend towards the creation of the city's unique identity. I will draw on the work of Immanuel Wallerstein and Marshall Sahlins for the concept of exchanges of silver, on Gayle Rubin to consider the concept of "exchanging" women, and on Fernando Ortiz Fernández to consider how culture can be exchanged given that it is an element that is more abstract relative to both silver and women.

A recurring theme related to the exchanges represented is the use of force. In most of the cases analyzed, exchanges were rooted in the threat of physical force, or featured the

abuse of power within the boundaries of legal authority to force participation by all parties. In all of the represented exchanges analyzed, the author's interjections of praise or condemnation can be viewed as a cautionary guide that aims to provide examples towards the betterment of the city and a harsh critique of the behaviors that have caused its steady decline. By considering the author's interjections as a guide for the behavior that directly affects the fate of his beloved city and its people, the text can be read as the creation of the ideal citizen.

Resumen

Exchanges and the Criollo Identity analiza las representaciones de intercambios en la obra de Bartolomé Arzáns Orsúa y Vela, *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí*, para considerar la construcción de la identidad criolla en Potosí, Bolivia, durante la primera mitad del siglo XVIII. La obra de Arzáns narra la historia de Potosí, ciudad fundada hacia la mitad del siglo XVI para explotar el “cerro rico”, uno de los yacimientos de plata más ricos del Imperio español, símbolo de la riqueza del Nuevo Mundo. Narrando los eventos más importantes año por año, la obra de Arzáns articula historia e Historia, lo que constituye un espacio ideal para considerar cómo la reescritura del pasado facilita la constitución de un nuevo ciudadano ideal. Analizo en la obra la representación de los intercambios de elementos que se consideran centrales para el desarrollo de la ciudad: la plata, la mujer, y la cultura.

La tesis se inicia con la Introducción que contextualiza la obra de Arzáns en términos de su contenido, estructura e historia textual. El Capítulo 1 analiza casos seleccionados sobre los intercambios de plata, el elemento que se considera la razón central para la fundación y rápido crecimiento a la que una gran cantidad de gente acudió para hacer su propia fortuna en formas legítimas como ilegítimas. El Capítulo 2 examina “intercambios” de las mujeres, lo que es una parte fundamental de la fundación de la sociedad, y sus esfuerzos para recuperar el control sobre sus destinos. El Capítulo 3 analiza los intercambios de cultura para ver cómo el conocimiento, las costumbres y la religión de las poblaciones indígenas y europeas se mezclan hacia la creación de la identidad potosina. Me baso en el trabajo de Immanuel Wallerstein y Marshall Sahlins para el concepto del intercambio de plata, en Gayle Rubin para considerar el concepto de “intercambiar” mujeres, y en Fernando Ortiz Fernández para considerar cómo la cultura puede ser intercambiada cuando se considera que es un elemento abstracto en relación con la plata y la mujer.

Un tema recurrente dentro de los intercambios representados en la Historia es el uso de la fuerza. En la mayoría de los casos analizados, los intercambios conllevan amenazas de fuerza física o abuso de poder dentro de los límites de la autoridad oficial. En todos los intercambios analizados, las interjecciones del autor en elogio o condena de las acciones referidas articulan una moraleja que tiene como objetivo mejorar la ciudad, y critican los comportamientos que han causado su deterioro constante. Al considerar las interjecciones del autor la obra se podría leer como una guía para la creación del ciudadano ideal.

Sommaire

Exchanges and the Criollo Identity analyse les représentations des échanges dans l'œuvre de Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela: *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí* pour considérer la construction de l'identité créole à Potosí en Bolivie pendant la première moitié du dix-huitième siècle. L'œuvre d'Arzáns raconte l'histoire de Potosí, une ville fondée au seizième siècle pour exploiter le *Cerro Rico*, l'un des gisements d'argent les plus importants de l'Empire Espagnol, et l'un des symboles de la richesse du Nouveau Monde. Rapportant les événements marquants année après année, le manuscrit d'Arzáns articule histoire et Histoire, en fournissant un espace privilégié pour observer la façon dont la réécriture du passé facilite la constitution d'une nouvelle identité créole. J'analyse dans l'*Historia* la représentation des échanges de certains éléments centraux pour le développement de la ville, notamment l'argent, les femmes et la culture.

La thèse débute avec l'Introduction, qui contextualise l'œuvre d'Arzáns, son contenu, sa structure et son histoire textuelle. Le premier Chapitre analyse trois cas sélectionnés sur les échanges d'argent, ce minerai étant considéré comme le moteur de la fondation et de l'expansion rapide de la ville, à laquelle les gens affluaient pour faire fortune, par des moyens légaux ou illégaux. Le Chapitre 2 examine les « échanges » de femmes, une composante fondamentale de la fondation de la société, et les efforts mis en œuvre par ces dernières pour reprendre le contrôle de leur destinée. Le Chapitre 3 analyse quant à lui les échanges culturels, afin de voir comment la connaissance, les coutumes et la religion des populations Autochtones et Européennes se mélangent pour créer une identité unique à la ville. Je me fonde sur les travaux d'Immanuel Wallerstein et Marshall Sahlins pour le concept d'échange d'argent, sur ceux de Gayle Rubin pour considérer celui « d'échange » de femmes, et sur ceux de Fernando Ortiz Fernández pour déterminer la façon dont la culture peut être échangée, dans la mesure où c'est un élément plus abstrait.

Un thème récurrent qui apparaît dans les échanges décrits est l'usage de la force. Dans la majorité des cas analysés, les échanges sont enracinés dans la menace de l'utilisation de la force physique ou impliquent un abus de pouvoir dans la limite de l'autorité officielle. Dans tous les échanges analysés, les interjections de l'auteur, qu'il fasse l'éloge ou qu'il condamne les actions mentionnées, articulent une morale. Leur objectif est de rendre la ville meilleure, et de critiquer les comportements qui ont causé le déclin de Potosí. En considérant les injonctions de l'auteur, cette œuvre pourrait se lire comme un guide pour la création du citoyen idéal.

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to those who have helped throughout my doctoral study and the completion of this dissertation. First and foremost, I extend my appreciation to my supervisor, Professor Fernanda Macchi, for her invaluable guidance, knowledge, insight, and patience. Thank you to Professor José Jouve-Martín for accepting to be the internal examiner on my oral defense committee.

A special thanks to Professor Lucia Chamanadjian, whose encouragement and mentoring myself and fellow instructors to constantly strive for improvement and self-reflection in language teaching. I also thank Lynda Bastien, whose warmth, mutual love of cats and dogs, and extensive knowledge of policy all helped make this journey easier.

I extend my gratitude to the McLennan-Redpath Library for their assistance with Interlibrary Loans, Rare Books and Special Collections, and my thanks to librarian Marcela Isuster. A sincere thanks to the Department of languages, Literatures and Cultures at McGill for the opportunities afforded in this time, for the financial support given in the form of Graduate Excellent Awards, Travel Grants, and Course Lecturer positions.

To my mother, Angelica, for her unwavering support, love, and belief in me, I cannot thank enough. To my fiancée Kirsty for being by my side and supporting my goals. To Diago, who started the journey with me, and to Iroh, who finished it.

Introduction

Potosí began with a rush to mine rich and abundant silver in 1545. The city grew in the viceroyalty of Peru, now present-day Bolivia, and as Peter Bakewell states, the mining of silver in its location made up a staggering quarter of all the revenue of the Spanish Crown in 1592 (*Silver and Entrepreneurship* 16). Over time Potosí paled in comparison to other mining centers in the New World, particularly in Mexico, registering only fifteen percent of American silver production by 1700 (Brown 29). However, at that point, the city had already become mythical in its own right as a symbol of wealth in the colonial system. In the decades following its foundation, there was an all-out scramble to reach this otherwise inhospitable area to join the silver rush, because as Bakewell informs, the densely packed veins of silver ore were unique in the New World as their accessibility and concentration made it possible for nearly anyone to mine with only the most basic of instruments (*Miners of the Red Mountain* 8). This ease of access to rich silver is what made “Potosí” become synonymous with enormous fortune, as it appears in Miguel de Cervantes’ *El ingenioso hidalgo Don Quixote de La Mancha* (Part II, chapter LXXI), when Don Quixote tells Sancho Panza that if for the whippings he might endure, he needed to pay what was deserved for, “la grandeza y calidad deste [sic] remedio, el tesoro de Venecia, las minas del Potosí fueran poco para pagarte” (380).

The statement is made half-heartedly of course, because Sancho cannot endure the pain of self-flagellation, and gives up after seven of the 3,300 whippings he stated he would give himself in exchange for a fortune. Much like the waves of people who went to Potosí in search of their fortune, there was a price to be paid in risk and effort, and not everyone would be up for the task. It should also be noted that, even if Sancho had completed his whippings, Don Quixote would not have had the funds to pay him. It was a proposed exchange that would never materialize because neither party would be able to fulfill their end of the deal. It

is thus an exchange in principle, but impossible for either party to complete, similar in a way to the numerous exchanges of Potosí, from the mundane to the fantastic. The purpose of this dissertation is to read the *Historia de la villa imperial del Potosí*, a totemic book of the city, to explore the concept of exchange as represented in its pages. It is my belief that through such a reading we will be able to contribute to the study of the construction of a criollo identity in the Andes region.

The abundance of silver found in Potosí cannot be understated, and for over one hundred years after its foundation, the city attracted people of many origins seeking their own fortune, mixing into strange, often fantastic events of goodness, or of evil and bloody conflict, constituting the perfect material for extraordinary stories. The *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí* by Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela, mirrors perfectly the complexity of the city and the richness of its stories and constitutes the heart of this dissertation.

Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí

The *Historia* presents the history of the city from before its official foundation date in 1545 until the death of its author in 1736 (Arzáns III 399-401), and then it is continued briefly by his son in the same year for a total of seven chapters until the year 1737 (Arzáns III 435). It follows a strong chronological order, marked in the book by the inscription of the year to which a chapter corresponds on the top right corner of the page. The book also includes relevant happenings in nearby locations such as Lima and La Plata, among others. It is a lengthy piece of literature presented with a heavy sense of poetic style written by a man who loved his city. The cases presented always focus on a mix of the people of the city, the significant events that affected its development, and the often-uncontrollable effects that occurred in that space. In the telling of nearly every major story in the text, the narrator will

be present to interject with an opinion rooted in morality, pointing out the good and bad, as well as the religiously devout and the problematic sinners.

The *Historia* has been covered by a mysterious veil almost since its beginnings. Its author seems to have loved privacy, as his name does not appear related to any public office, nor documents, and there is no solicitation for assistance to the Cabildo or any other authority (Hanke xxxiii). Almost all we know about him comes from his own pen; small traces of his life inscribed within the pages of the *Historia*. His name is a critical construction, because the few personal documents found about him showed different names through different periods. Mario Chacón Torres discovered in the parochial archives a Bartolomé Arzáns Dapífer, legitimate son of Mateo Arzáns Dapífer and doña María Jordana de Castro, that in 1701 married Juana de Reina. He also discovered that their only child, Diego, was born before their marriage, and that Bartolomé Orsúa y Vela, at 60 years, was buried in 1736 (Hanke xxxiii). Then “Arzáns, Dapífer, Martínez, Orsúa, y Vela” (Hanke xxxiii), all refer to our author; and also their small variations probably related to misinterpretations: Arzáns, was written as “Arranz, Arzay, Abranes, y Arzanes; Orsúa, como Arsiua u Ostusa; y Martínez, como Núñez” (Hanke xxxiii). The name that we use today, Bartolomé de Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela, was constructed as a decision of the critics, mainly Mario Chacon and Gunmar Mendoza, as Lewis Hanke lets us know (xxxiv).

The few details we know about his life were carefully collected by Lewis Hanke whose work regarding the study of Arzáns cannot be overestimated (xxxiv-xxxvi). In his work, Arzáns mentions his grandparents, signaling their 10 children as a reason for the little fortune of his own father, and therefore his own impossibility to dedicate himself to study (I 243). He tells us that his father was born in Seville (I 243), and he refers to him as “arriscado andaluz” (II 149). About his own life, he lets us know that he befriended Pedro Huancani, “indio de buen entendimiento” (II 393), that he considered that his wife was “buenísima” (II 282), and

that he considered himself a “buen aritmético” (II 282), loved bullfights (II 183), traveled to different mines as a child (II 154, 268), and to La Plata in 1705 (II 430). We know, as his son Diego tells, that Arzáns died in 1736 (III 400), and it is Diego who continues the *Historia* after Bartolomé’s death in 1736 for 7 chapters (Hanke xxxvi, Arzáns III 399-401).

The majority of the work appears to have been written between 1705 and 1708 according to the author’s statements in the text (I 11),¹ meaning that the author wrote 140 years of the history of Potosí within a span of three years. As far as the evidence indicates, Arzáns’ decision to write the *Historia* was a personal one, and as Hanke states, there is no indication that the author informed the Cabildo or any other formal authority of the work (I xxxiii). His desire to remain unpublished as he himself let us know seems to have been based on the fear of the possible critics of his work, that he saw as a danger to his own person (Arzáns Prólogo clxxxiv).² These dangers are not of the theoretical kind. The author mentions how for months an unnamed judge of Potosí took notice of the text for writings that exposed certain wrongs he committed against some poor individuals, taking from them the little money that they had (II 321). Only by hiding his writings and himself for a while was Arzáns able to avoid persecution from the judge who did not want the stories made public, and still, the author continued to write.

Word of the existence of the voluminous history spread and as early as 1707, as Arzáns himself notes in the chapter dedicated to that year Fray Sebastián Izquierdo used parts of the *Historia* in his sermon (Hanke xxxix, Arzáns II 440). Hanke signals that over twenty years after the death of Arzáns an *Informe* was written by Bernabé Antonio de Ortega y Velazco, at the request of the *corregidor*, to ascertain information about the *Historia*, including multiple testimonies about occasions when portions of the texts were read at Churches around the city (I xxxvii).

Hanke indicates that an unexpected financial hardship seems to have caused Arzáns' son to pawn the text. Diego died at the age of fifty-six in 1755 (Hanke I xli) and after a complicated search, only in 1756, "La Historia tanto tiempo oculta se manifestó por fin y fue enviada a España donde fue encaminada al Consejo de Indias" (Hanke xli). From there, the manuscript began to circulate on its own adventure. We know it was in the Biblioteca del Consejo, since Juan Bautista Muñoz registers it in the *Indice de la Biblioteca de la Secretaría del Despacho Universal de Indias de Gracia y Justicia* (Hanke xli). In the nineteenth century there appeared several manuscripts that were considered as originals, but without proper evidence to support the claim (Hanke xlii). Today we know there is one manuscript of the text in the library of the King of Spain, and another copy was bought by George E. Church in 1905 in Paris from the bookseller Cadenat (Hanke xliii). Following the death of Church in 1910, the manuscript was donated to Brown University according to Church's final testament. It is this version that was used to prepare the first edition of the text, that appeared in 1965 published by the Brown University Press, edited by Lewis Hanke and Gunnar Mendoza (Hanke I xliii), and used in this dissertation.

The manuscript used by Hanke and Mendoza consists of over 1,500 large folio pages, handwritten, its content divided into two parts. Each part is subdivided into books and chapters, ranging broadly in number. The first part has eleven *libros* within, each ranging from twenty to thirty chapters or so, while the second part has three books with a similar number of chapters in each. Every chapter inscribes on the top right corner the year to which the events narrated in it correspond. Only the first book of the first part, that consists of five chapters, does not respect this norm. That first book narrates a description of the city, its topography; a brief presentation of the Discovery of the New World and then of Peru; a brief presentation of the Incas of Peru; and in the last chapter, Arzáns concludes its presentation of the Incas and its conquest by the Spaniards, up to Tupac Amaru's death, telling the origin of

the name Potosí in a brief anecdote that points to the presence of silver in the *cerro*, and the Spaniards signaled as rightful possessors. The first part establishes that the city of Potosí is the main protagonist of the History.

Time begins with the tale of the discovery of the *cerro de Potosí* in 1545 in the first chapter of the second book of the first part. From then, the chapters continue chronologically.³ In his text, Arzáns will tell in detail the development of the infrastructure of the city, its mining industry, the battles for control over its silver mines, the different authorities and their failures and successes, but also he will tell about the people, the individuals and their adventures, their private lives and their stories that are framed in the large development of the city and its History. In almost all chapters, the reader will find cases relating to the daily lives of people in all manner of industry, in their commercial exchanges, their celebrations, their religious devotion, familial life, and more. In this sense, the *Historia* combines History and story, through a squinting gaze.

Arzáns' dedication to his city fits within what Karen Stolley describes in "The eighteenth century: narrative forms, scholarship, and learning", referring to the development of "urban history, a type of subgenre which is an outgrowth of the explosion of settlement and building which took place in the final century of the colonial period" (359). In his *Prólogo*, Arzáns states that he writes the history of his famous and memorable city "movido del amor de la patria" (I clxxxiii), and refers to four authors that shared his passion and commitment to the history of the city or shared his enterprise: Antonio de Acosta, Juan Pasquier, Pedro Méndez and Bartolomé de Dueñas (Arzáns I clxxxiv). Acosta is unique among the four because in his text, "se refieren algunos casos particulares, con las tres destrucciones de esta Villa, cuales fueron el derramamiento de sangre en aquellas memorables guerras de los [sic] vicuñas, la inundación de la laguna de Caricari y la rebaja en la moneda que hizo el presidente don Francisco de Nestares Marín" (Arzáns *Prólogo* clxxxiv). Don Antonio de Acosta, a

Portuguese writer as Arzáns tell us, from whom he quotes more than any other author in the text, is intriguing as to this day we cannot verify him to have existed. Antonio de Acosta, if we are to believe Arzáns, presents in his work *Historia de Potosí* a detailed description of the early days of the city when mining was first beginning, in a time of frenzied exploitation, and included a comprehensive report of the religious activities of the city, the activities of Portuguese citizens, and the civil wars that rocked Potosí, to name just a few of his points.

Captain Pedro Méndez is another source described in detail by Arzáns in the Primera Parte, Libro VIII, Capítulo 5 (II 28), and supposedly composed a history of the city covering the years 1545-1626, which was never published. However, to this day Méndez too only appears to exist in the references made by Arzáns in the *Historia*, along with Don Juan Pasquier, another source which cannot be verified, but who according to Arzáns was an Andaluz who translated the work of Antonio de Acosta to Spanish, and the text will be cited often nonetheless (clxxxiv). Arzáns also refers in his prologue to another 36 authors who mentioned cases or particularities of the city, and had constituted his sources, including 14 chroniclers of Peru, but unlike the authors listed above, these other individuals are verified to have existed (Prólogo clxxxiv).⁴

I am not concerned with the existence of the sources of the *Historia*, nor the fidelity of the text to the facts of history. However, it should be noted that given the scarcity of printed histories of Potosí, and the immense amount of information collected by Arzáns in the pages of the *Historia*, the text continues to be an unavoidable departure point for historians seeking to understand Potosí. Many of them often use Arzáns as a first step in an attempt to understand better the city from the eyes of one of its citizens. Jane Mangan's work *Trading roles: gender, ethnicity, and the urban economy in colonial Potosí* (2005) and Lisa Voigt's work *Spectacular wealth: the festivals of colonial South American mining towns* (2016) are

two examples. Both texts mention Arzáns briefly to launch into intricate observation of historical documents.

In the Prologue, Arzáns states clearly the objectives of his writing and shows the importance that he attributes to truth. He declares that in his text, it is truth what stands to compensate for his lack of rhetoric mastery (Prólogo clxxxiv). However, he states that he will try to ensure that everything in his *Historia* “será para deleite y provecho del ánimo, atendiendo también a que lo narrativo agrade por nuevo, admire por extraño, suspenda por prodigioso, por ejemplar exhorta, si dañoso escarmiente, si imitable provoque a lo bueno” (Prólogo clxxxv). He writes his literature with the truth in mind, but he also seeks explicitly to entertain and promote moral goodness.

Through the *Historia*, the narrator acts as a social critic and as Hanke asserts, “Como crítico social no perdió la menor oportunidad de introducir en el relato su propia versión y valoración de personas, instituciones y acontecimientos” (xc). Arzáns’ particular worldview becomes apparent in reading the text as interjections into the stories appear often to offer commentaries praising or condemning the characters, or as is more often the case, their actions in what is told. Those interjections are frequent, deliberate, and generally bring about topics relating to being good or bad. In this sense, Arzáns’ work is constantly a moral one, whereby the behaviors of the people in Potosí are considered, and more importantly, often have a corresponding effect on the fate of the city and the people within. Sometimes Arzáns imparts judgment of behaviors, but more often he simply comments about good versus bad conduct, sometimes rooted in Christian behavior and the consequences of living a sinful life versus a proper life are weaved in and out of his history. With that said, concepts of good and bad behavior appear contextual in each case, where right and wrong fall into a grey zone rather than always being attributable to any manner of concrete, black and white model of morality. While it is impossible to reconstruct a simple formula for the reading of the

morality within the *Historia*, the topic will be touched upon again later on with particularly problematic cases.

The analysis of Arzáns' text should be done keeping in mind Hayden White's representations of history in *Metahistory: the historical imagination in nineteenth-century Europe*. Even though White refers to another century, he mentions one manner of representing history that illuminates what Arzáns is constructing with his *Historia*. The narrative style of presenting history as tragedy, whereby high ideals are present, but some form of irrevocable damage has been inflicted and people are left to live with the consequences of previous conflict in their environment (*Metahistory* 6), which is an apt description of Arzáns' text. Arzáns is a citizen of Potosí who is witness to the rise and fall of his city through historical texts, and is wiser than those who came before him through the simple act of retrospection by reading of the sins that led to catastrophe, and speaking about their impact in his own text.

We have said that the *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí* entangles History and history. In this sense, it showcases what Enrique Pupo Walker names "la vocación literaria del pensamiento histórico en América". In its entanglement of History and history, in its fantastic story of seemingly endless richness, and in the construction of a criollo identity, it is silver that is at the heart of all the tales and of the city. During the period, silver was the key element for exchange, driving many fundamental aspects of daily life. Silver was exchanged for employment, for goods and services, to pay for celebrations, for infrastructure, and was sent back to the King in the form of taxation in the Royal Fifth. Silver is the heart of Potosí, because it was the heart of the exchanges that gave life to the city. A point that must be acknowledged from the beginning is how peculiar Potosí is among other centers of silver mining activity. It is not like Cuzco, for example, which was already in existence, appropriated by the colonial machine, and further developed under Spanish rule. Nor is

Potosí like Lima, which was founded because it was a place that suited the colonial advancement of Spain, located where geographically convenient, agriculturally friendly, and suitable for habitation along the flat coastal plains and rivers of Peru. Instead, Potosí was founded in a place that was cold, windy, agriculturally hostile, and despite this, came together in an almost instantaneous manner without any official decision on the matter. It was a space where silver awaited the many who flocked there and only later was thought given the proper consideration towards establishing infrastructure for the long-term development in an official capacity.

Dissertation Objectives: Examining Exchanges

This dissertation will analyze the *Historia de la Villa Imperial del Potosi* by don Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsua y Vela through the lens of the concept of exchange, which is a central concept in all economic history.

Historically, the period that concerns Arzáns' *Historia* could be argued as the period of emergence of a world economy, a global exchange market that lies at the heart of our capitalist structure, as Immanuel Wallerstein affirms in *The Modern World-System* (70). The importance of American gold and silver through that process cannot be denied in regard to the impact that the wealth from the New World had directly on Europe. This is evident in relation to the pursuit of Habsburg policy and changes to European currency (Wallerstein 75-76). Moreover, Wallerstein contends that this same period with its influx of metal bullion from the New World marks the point in which capitalism becomes the dominant mode of social organization of the economy (77). This is not contained to a single form of capitalism as we know today, but rather several primitive types within Europe that developed according to the needs of each area. As a distinct feature of a capitalist world economy, we can observe

that economic decisions are made with regards to the whole of the world economy (67), which is a point evident in the history of Potosí, and observable within cases in Arzáns' text.

My undergraduate studies were focused on Economics. Therefore, my first reading the *Historia* was an economic tale of the evolution of supply and demand of silver, as a metal, as money, and as a symbol of what people assign value in an economy. From an early point since the discovery of the cerro Rico (Book II, Chapter 5, corresponding to the year 1546), Juan de Villaroel, the Spaniard attributed by Arzáns with the discovery, was so wealthy from his short time mining there that he sent Carlos V a sum of 12,000 *marcos de plata* in addition to the entitled Royal Fifth (I 43), indicating an abundance in the supply of silver as a gift of that nature was of little consequence. Later in Chapter II, Book V, in the chapter corresponding to the year 1573, Arzáns shows the relation between silver bullion and price, when quoting Garcilaso de la Vega he describes the price of iron surpassing that of silver given the abundance of the latter in the city and the need to create tools with which to mine (I 149). Supply and demand inverted the symbolic value of those metals from what we would normally see elsewhere, and this special pushing and pulling of supply and demand throughout the text was a fascinating observation in terms of goods, both for daily use and of luxury items imported into the city.

This reading of the text revealed the need for a broad range of goods as Potosí grew in size and population in a race to mine silver, and exchange became apparent throughout the stories written by Arzáns. Adam Smith, the father of economics, states that exchange is broadly defined as the act of giving one thing and receiving another, often of the same type and equivalent value in return (35). While this simple definition is useful for cases in the text, Marxist philosophies argue that exchanges invariably result in one party gaining an unfair advantage due to market economies involving violence, exploitation of resources, and coercion (McNally 61). While not a pessimist, I concur that markets are never able to achieve

any form of Smith's lofty ideal of equal exchange between parties, and in the New World and in the *Historia*, this too is apparent when one considers the inequality between the European, Indigenous, and African populations.

The context of the book, and its apparent comprehensive representation of a city that had been a symbolic behemoth of wealth in the New World, made it the perfect arena to explore how exchange developed within its pages, and how it related to the creation of a criollo identity. The purpose of my dissertation is to analyze how exchanges are represented in the text and to consider if and how those representations relate to the construction of a criollo identity. My interest lies beyond the specific trading of silver, in the concept of exchange itself. I will then explore the concept through three elements whose exchanges abound through the text: silver, women and culture. Silver as we already alluded to, is the heart of the city for Arzáns and the reason for its existence. Women are also at the heart of the *Historia* because of the truly fantastic tales written by Arzáns of women engaging in exchanges equally incredible or even more than those experienced by men. Culture occupies the third element of examination for exchanges through the *Historia* because of the diverse space Potosí articulated throughout the centuries, which was a conjunction between many people from diverse backgrounds that brought distinct cultural components together. I will dedicate one chapter to the consideration of each element and its processes of exchange, and within each of my chapters, I choose to consider several cases, a variety that helped me approach the immense diversity contained in Arzáns' work.

Following this order, chapter one is dedicated to the analysis of exchanges of silver. For silver, the symbolic attachment is often tied to a commercial exchange, be it by exchanging payment to workers to mine the silver from a mine, and getting silver in return, or with the exchange of currency for goods imported into the city. However, exchange will also be considered from the perspective of the relationships that are formed, or even forced. As will

be seen in the work of Marshall Sahlins, *Stone Age Economics*, societal norms and the customs tied to giving and receiving in an exchange may be as or more important than the things themselves, where symbolic reciprocity is paramount to the act. We will analyze three paradigmatic cases where exchange is forced through the threat of violence in one case, through the abuse of authority in another, and finally, through the positive behavior of one of the most ideal citizens in the history of the city.

Chapter two will analyze the “exchanges” of women. From Lévi-Strauss to Freud, the “exchange” of women has been considered a fundamental part of the foundation of society, however my own analysis will be marked by Gayle Rubin’s classical essay “The Traffic of Women”, whereby we unravel the systems of control in place during colonial expansion and rule in the New World. Religion, honor, sexual reproduction, and marriage appear in Arzáns’ text with the women in each case finding it necessary to subvert established systems to accomplish their goals. The cases will focus on the efforts by young women to maintain their honor, the lengths that some men go to access them regardless of the harm this may cause, and methods of dealing with unwanted male attention through actions that fall out of social norms, and into the supernatural through witchcraft.

In the third chapter I will analyze the exchange of culture, given its intrinsic role in the development of the city and the constitution of a criollo identity. Potosí is born because of silver exploitation but only because knowledge was shared between the Indigenous and Spaniard population. Paradoxically, there are not many occasions where an exchange of culture can be identified or exactly pointed out in the same way as the first two chapters. The chapter is dedicated to the consideration of four cases where we observe traditional knowledge from one culture being used by another. We will explore through those cases how the narrator considers the different people in the city and their interactions and exchanges of cultures, towards the consideration of a new criollo consciousness. To this end Fernando

Ortiz and “Contrapunteo cubano del tabaco y el azúcar” will guide my analysis in the four cases analyzed, which appear as fundamental for this text as a monument to the criollo consciousness. The first case exposes the treatment of the Indigenous population by a Spaniard. The second case will examine how Spaniards profited from traditionally Indigenous items. The third case will examine issues of mimicry, and how greed can destroy a man who is already wealthy but unsatisfied. Finally, the last case will examine religion and devotion among the people of the city through the Virgin of Copacabana.

A Comprehensive Review of the Relevant Literature

Beyond the indispensable work of Lewis Hanke on Arzáns and his *Historia*, beyond Gunmar Mendoza’s studies and Mario Chacon’s research into the identity and real name of the author, and beyond the careful publication of Arzáns’ first edition thanks to the tireless work of Mendonza and Hanke, a new wave of study of Arzáns work through different theoretical frames has occurred since the eighties through to the present, to which I am particularly indebted. Below is a list of works with the *Historia* as principle area of study, highlighting those which most closely approximate the analysis I will be developing throughout this dissertation. This precludes the inclusion of all works associated with the *Historia* and narrows the focus to those that feature topics similar to what I hope to contribute.

Leonardo García Pabón’s position in his work, “Espacio andino, escritura colonial y patria criolla: la historia de Potosí en la narrativa de Bartolomé Arzáns” presents the importance of the *Historia* for the configuration of a criollo identity, which builds upon similar ideas presented by Hanke in the introduction the text. My analysis contributes to this premise with specific consideration given to exchanges.

Denise Sepúlveda's work, "City, myth, and morality in Bartolomé Arzáns's *Historia de la villa imperial de Potosí: a criollo project*" and "Of Legends and Lack: The Economy of Criollo Discourse in the *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí*", contribute to topics relating to how Arzáns writes towards the creation of the criollo identity, both implicitly and explicitly. Sepúlveda approaches Arzáns' writing as moralistic rhetoric (20), with a focus on the moral judgements made about others' behavior for the sake of moralizing. My own analysis begins with the author's principles of determining right and wrong behavior as exposed in the *Historia* but does not focus on moralistic rhetoric. Instead, I approach goodness and badness evaluated by the author as fundamental to determine the fate of the city, as Arzáns describes that God punishes or rewards citizens of Potosí based on their behavior. The author's commentary on good and bad behavior will serve to indicate what is best for the future of his city, and to point out the causes of its worst problems.

The topic of women in the *Historia* has been approached in a few different ways, as seen in Margaret Boyle's "Chronicling Women's Containment in Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela's History of Potosí", which explores how women dealt with matters of piety, devotion, excess, violence, and the shifting meaning of such experiences across spatial and temporal contexts. María Esther Choque's "La representación de la mujer en la obra de Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela", approaches women in Arzáns' text at the place where myth and legend are intertwined with history, which expands upon the already fantastic stories present in the text. Gina Herrmann's "Amazonic Ambivalence in Imperial Potosí", approaches women through the memorable cases of the Warrior Maidens, ultimately claiming that Arzáns is responsible for the representation of the ideological creations in his text, and that his narrative structures undermine the author's authority of a historical command. Leonardo García Pabón's "La adolescente en la colonia y los crímenes necesarios contra la familia. La 'dichosa pecadora' de Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela", approaches the topic of women

through the rules imposed by a social order meant to control young women. Ángela Robledo's "Brujería, intertextualidad creativa y discurso hispanoamericano en *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí*" approaches the topic of women by examining a witch in Arzáns' text named Claudia, through an affiliation and connection to European and classical works of literature. Kate McCarthy-Gilmore's "Subversive Frontiers: Space, Gender and Literature in Colonial Latin America" examines how Arzáns challenged the view of women in their role of developing colonial criollo culture. Several of these works have been excellent points of departure for my own analysis, each considering the women in the *Historia* through distinct methods. My analysis will focus on developing a framework of what constitutes the "exchange" of women, along with the methods used to control their behavior through honor, and the problems when men attempt to access women without regard to the harm that may come as a result of bypassing the established social order. I hope to contribute to the study of women in the *Historia* by focusing on how these women fought to retake control of their destinies.

The topic of culture has also been approached in different ways. Through religion, Shiddarta Vasquez Cordoba's work "La Crónica De Potosí Y Sus Milagros: Complejidad Cultural Y Modelación De Relaciones Simbólicas" examines processions and religious cycles that inadvertently worked towards the development of the new criollo subject. Leonardo García-Pabón explores aspects of religion in the *Historia* in "The Indian as Image and as Symbolic Structure: Bartolome Arzáns's *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí*". Juan Luis Suárez's work, "Unidad sin orden: milagros, rituales y caos en el Potosí barroco" examines cases where Arzáns' writing is marked by baroque characteristics and the presence of Saint Augustin, the latter being attributed to the arrival of the Augustinian order in the Peruvian Viceroyalty during the early colonization of the New World, and the use of specific Augustinian sources like *Crónica moralizada* by Antonio de la Calancha and *Crónica del*

Perú de San Agustín by Bernardo de Torres in the *Historia*. Representation of the baroque in the *Historia* is also examined in “Sleeping with Corpses, Eating Hearts, and Walking Skulls: *Criollo*’s Subjectivity in Antonio de la Calancha and Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela” by Leonardo García-Pabón, who argues that, “the *Historia* provides some of the most extraordinary examples of the baroque conception of death as an integral part of *Criollo*’s subjectivity” (229). Although death is ever present in the *Historia*, and occurs in all but one of the cases that will be examined in this dissertation, the baroque is not an area where I will focus, as at most, only one of the deaths that will be seen in my analysis could be described as baroque in a small part of its description. Kris Lane’s “The Ghost of Seventeenth-Century Potosí: An Autopsy” examines one specific case in the *Historia* that deals with El Duende, a black man who was captured and executed for violent crimes, and the subsequent fallout in the implementation of rules applied to all black men.

García-Pabón is also the anthologist of *Relatos De La Villa Imperial De Potosí: Antología*, which attempts to present aspects associated with the daily life of colonial Potosí through a selection of stories from the *Historia*. *Tales of Potosí* by R.C. Padden is another anthology translated to English, though far shorter and broader in its selection of stories. In my analysis there is a great opportunity to launch into my own examination under the approach of transculturation, to show how the XVIII century saw culture being exchanged over time towards something blended which then forms a part of the *criollo* identity in the city, in which religion is a strong component.

Beyond these initial works analyzing Arzáns’ text in distinct ways, several others have used the *Historia* as a launching point for other research into many topics that can be found within its pages. This is to be expected given how vast and broad the *Historia* is in its topics. Jane Mangan in *Trading Roles: Gender, Ethnicity, and the Urban Economy in Colonial Potosí* references the work of Arzáns briefly in her discussion of markets in the city

of Potosí, with the preoccupation of gender and ethnicity. Mariano Baptista Gumucio's work, *El mundo desde Potosí: vida y reflexiones de Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela, 1676-1736* discusses a broad range of topics in the text and how they are presented.⁵ The same author has also written *La ciudad de Potosí vista por viajeros y autores nacionales siglos XVI al XXI*, in which Arzáns' work is again briefly mentioned in broad strokes.

The immensity of the *Historia*, the complexity of its construction, make my work partial and incomplete. As such, the works listed above are some of the most relevant on the topics of women and culture that have been touched upon to varying degrees and in different ways in the *Historia*. Silver has not been a focal point of research to date, but since it is the reason for Potosí to exist in the first place, there is often a brief mention of its importance to the city in other works, such as in Shiddarta Vasquez Cordoba's work with a brief paragraph titled "Potosí y la economía de la plata" (56). By focusing on the exchange of, rather than simply the existence of silver, women, and culture in Arzáns' text, we are able to see how the author considered the behaviors of the people of the city in regard to those three crucial elements that make up the *Historia*. As the text has a strong moral component that is almost always present in the narrator's telling of stories, we will be able to analyze how these three crucial parts that made up the city influenced, corrupted, or simply developed against the backdrop of what we expect will be the emerging criollo identity throughout the text. By observing those cases of exchange in Arzáns' text and considering how the author interjects or responds to the characters in each of his stories, I hope to contribute to the study of the emerging criollo identity.

Chapter 1 – Exchange of Silver

There is one exchange that is prevalent throughout the history of Potosí, and through the *Historia de la Villa Imperial del Potosí de Bartolomé de Arzáns Orsúa y Vela*: the exchange of silver.

Mined as ore, refined and processed to become minted into official coinage, reported for taxation, unreported to avoid taxation, gifted, stolen, and fought over, silver was at the heart of exchanges, commercial and otherwise, and drove the motivations of the many people who settled in the city. The great quantities of silver ore mined at Potosí made the city well known and brought to life the expression “vale un Potosí”. The various ways in which silver was exchanged will be the focus of this chapter, as will be the men who control it. The earliest Chronicles of discovery did not focus on the wonders of silver in the New World, instead gold was the obsession. Historically much more valuable than silver, gold occupied the minds of the first Europeans that stepped foot in America. Before presenting the Potosí of Arzáns and the impact that silver had in it, it is important to understand how silver came to be so important for the city and all the New World.

Cristóbal Colón first wrote of the gold observed during his first voyage to the New World on October 13, 1492, “aquí nace el oro que traen colgado á la nariz, y por señas pude entender que yendo al Sur o volviendo la isla por el Sur, que estaba allí un rey que tenía grandes vasos de ello, y tenía muy mucho” (25). Colón was of course incorrect in his interpretation of what lay to the south of the island but was correct in the general notion that there was great wealth to be found in these new lands. The problem with observing some gold in the possession of the Indigenous peoples was that Colón extrapolated its mere existence on the island to an imagined extraordinary abundance that did not exist. The possible reasons for which this occurred are many. Kendall Brown in *A History of Mining in Latin America* sustains that through a gradual development of ideas based upon a mixture of

points from Christian mythology, the Bible, the Greek Historian Herodotus, Saint Jerome, and Saint Isidore, “[E]uropeans believed that somewhere in the East lay a great source of gold” (2). Colón was further influenced by his own personal admiration of Marco Polo, who in the thirteenth century had visited China, and, “by the time Columbus sailed in 1492, he had convinced himself that the gold of the Orient lay in Cipangu, the biblical Ophir” (Brown 3). Gold became a topic at the forefront of European discussion, helped no doubt by Colón’s exaggerated reports of discoveries that enticed European imaginations, and as a direct consequence of these exaggerated claims, “the monarchs ordered in 1494 that four or five miners from the royal quicksilver mines of Almadén be sent to the Caribbean to raise the technical level of gold mining there” (Brown 3). To process and refine the little gold that was found, the miners needed to use large amounts of mercury, which had the dual effect of damaging the environment and creating unsafe living conditions. This was cause for “diverting the indigenous population... [and] hard labor and unhealthy conditions weakened the islanders and made them more susceptible to unknown diseases” (Brown 5). Consequently, the harmful effects of the initial mining efforts were evident on the environment within the first decades, while producing far less gold than expected.

The first substantial caches of riches would be discovered later by other men, those who explored the continental parts of the New World and engaged in conquest. Most of the earliest Europeans to arrive in the New World did not attain their wealth through the industrial process of mining. Hernán Cortés, for example, in his letters to the Holy Roman Emperor, Charles V, wrote of the gold he observed during the conquest of Tenochtitlan. Cortés claims, “habían hallado una tierra muy rica de oro...y dijiéronle que si él podía enviar navíos a rescatar oro, que habría mucha cantidad de ello” (9). From the perspective of the conquered Indigenous peoples, the Spaniards appeared to be all but consumed by the apparent boundlessness of their greed for gold. Miguel León Portilla asserts in *The broken*

spears: the Aztec account of the Conquest of Mexico, how the Aztecs later recalled, “The Spaniards burst into smiles...They picked up the gold and fingered it like monkeys...their bodies swelled with greed, and their hunger was ravenous; they hungered like pigs for that gold” (51). This serves to paint a portrait of a ceaseless search for gold, which simply did not exist in the quantity that was initially expected.

Enrique Tandeter asserts in “The Mining Industry” that while the first shipments of precious metals to Spain did in fact consist mostly of gold, it was owed to the period of massive appropriation and theft of stored gold wealth that belonged to the indigenous groups of the Caribbean and Mexico, a method that could not be sustained as the conquest carried forth throughout the New World (316). This method of acquisition had little to do with exchange, rather instead it should be considered spoils of conquest. Although gold was imagined to be existing in great quantity in the New World, “Gold deposits to the southwest of the Mexican capital were first mined in 1522” (Tandeter 316), long after the arrival of Spaniards.

Silver on the other hand was discovered in quantities that were unexpected. In essence, silver was present at the mythical levels that gold was imagined to exist but did not. As a testament to the disparity between the perceived amount of gold in the New World compared to the actual amount, official taxation records of the Royal Fifth paid to the Spanish crown over three centuries of colonization in all areas show that gold, either looted or mined, accounted for less than two percent of all precious metals from the New World (Tandeter 98). In addition, that two percent is not specific to gold alone, but includes all other precious minerals and gems as well. Silver meanwhile made up an astonishing ninety-eight percent of recorded, taxed mineral throughout the total time that Spain controlled its colonies (Tandeter 98-99). The disparity between silver and gold made silver far more useful, both because of the quantity available and for its practicality in day-to-day operations. As Tandeter

asserts, “Depending on the location of a market for silver...the exchange rate between gold and silver varied anywhere between 1:8 and 1:12 between the 16th and 18th century” (“The Mining Industry” 328). This meant that silver was more practical to exchange as a currency for daily transactions, simple bartering, and paying worker wages, something which could not easily be accomplished with gold.

As Peter Bakewell affirms in *Miners of the Red mountain*, Potosí was first founded as a mining town in 1545 (10-11), which was its first step towards becoming a mythical city. Mining towns originated throughout colonial history by necessity. When a vein of mineral ore was discovered, enterprising individuals would establish a bare-bones system of infrastructure to meet their needs, which consisted of simplistic, temporary, and highly nomadic structures. As Sherman states, some semblance of a community would form as miners, traders, and their families arrived, and this pattern of establishing mining towns persisted for centuries, often being abandoned as soon as the location became unprofitable (147). Over time the infrastructure could be further developed for roads, water systems, government buildings, more permanent and sophisticated architecture, larger trading centers, etc., but only if there were sufficient potential profit to be gained from the existing mineral deposits. As Bakewell affirms, sudden and unexpected drops in profitability were related to exhausting mineral deposits sooner than anticipated, and this is one reason there exists the remnants of ghost towns throughout Latin America, even today (10).

As the vast richness and unprecedented quantity of silver at Potosí was unknown during its foundation, the infrastructure for habitation was constructed quickly and made cheaply of adobe and straw, with a clear indigenous style and architecture. These settlements were known as *rancherías*, and, as Jane Mangan affirms, “the first grew up at the very foot of the Cerro Rico, logically enough given its proximity to the mines” (27). As the richness and quantity of the silver veins became clear, it too became evident that Potosí was going to need

planning for long-term mining, and the infrastructure was made with sturdier materials and a clear vision of long-term use. Bills of sale of property from 1549 show this to be the case with greater permanency in mind than mining towns that were temporary and short lived. (Mangan 27). The importance of Potosí became obvious, and new buildings were marked with increasingly European traits in their style and architecture. Some of the earliest examples of this European-styled infrastructure were the Casa de Morada, the Calle de los Mercaderes, a main parish church, government buildings and the first official town council hall, known as the Caja Real (Mangan 28-29). As Modesto Omiste affirms in *La casa de moneda de Potosí*, none of these structures exist today, with the exception of the Potosí mint, which itself is not the original, but the second of its name opened in 1770 (39).

With regards to the potential wealth of the *cerro* de Potosí, Bakewell affirms that, “the accessibility and concentration of ores in the upper *cerro* allowed, once fitting technology had been introduced, [for] an immensely rapid growth of silver production in the sixteenth century” (8). These conditions are what distinguished Potosí from other mining towns that could only support the mining industry for a short term. Despite the immense potential for wealth at Potosí, the development of infrastructure in the early decades was rudimentary, and eventually, insufficient. Between the foundation of the city and 1572, the infrastructure was only capable of smelting a small fraction of the silver ore that was mined there. This was not a problem at the beginning, since the type of ore found in abundance was of high quality, and easily smelted through the available methods. However, afterwards when the available ore was only of lesser quality, the methods of smelting became a problem. As Omiste asserts, silver was circulating through Potosí as the primary medium of exchange in 1545, since the official minting of coins only began in 1575 with the creation of the first Potosí Mint. Minted currency that circulated otherwise came from outside of the city, for example in the use of paying the salaries of officials (37). In the time between the foundation of Potosí and the

creation of the official mint, commercial exchanges largely used unrefined silver ore as a replacement for official, minted coinage. Only the two best types of ore were used to that end (Arzáns I 143).

An ad hoc system of classification was created to assign value to unrefined silver ore by measuring its weight and evaluating its color, which was a partial, though reliable, indicator of how difficult it would be to refine the silver. Arzáns lists the different names in descending order of desirability and value, based upon the quality of silver and effort required to extract it. The most valuable ore was brilliant in color and easily processed through smelting, it consisted of “plata blanca y el que llaman plomo ronco (que siempre son riquisimos a entrambos)” (I 143). This was followed by the less desirable group of ores, as they were more difficult to process through available smelting techniques. This second group included, “metal negrilla... mayor...rosicler, amasado y espejado...mazacotes, por ser en sí feas y como amasadas de cieno, pero muy ricas” (Arzáns I 142-143). The last group, the least valuable, was classified as “mulatos”, which consisted of various types of ore, of different colors and mixed with other minerals. All could produce valuable silver once refined, but only the first two were traded as currency. The rest were discarded because of the difficulty in ascertaining the quantity of silver they contained, and the effort required to extract it (Arzáns I 143).

The two most valuable types of ore could be refined within the Indigenous huayra, or guayra as it is also named, which were portable smelting ovens housed in tents, traditionally used by the Indigenous people (Arzáns I xxx). Between 1545 and 1572, the huayras were the principal technology used for smelting, operated and controlled entirely by the Indigenous population. Therefore, their use granted the Indigenous people a monopoly on all silver processing as it was the only option for the refinement of ore and it was kept a trade secret that stayed solely within the Indigenous peoples population (Mangan 31). Those who

operated these huayras attained special privileges over their Spanish counterparts during this timeframe. They were allowed to access the market of silver ore (where the various qualities were exchanged and bartered with) every day one hour before anyone else was permitted access (Mangan 33).

These conditions did not replicate themselves in other mining centers in the New World.⁶ The development of European infrastructure for processing silver ore could be seen throughout mining towns that grew to large cities in what is now the Mexican region, such as in Zacatecas, one of the most productive silver mining districts (85). There, the introduction of mercury into the process of refinement allowed for more efficient mining of a broad range of ore quality (Bakewell 87).⁷ In Potosí however, the abundance of high-quality ore gave no incentive to invest in new methods of infrastructure during the first decades. The existing technology that was used by the Indigenous peoples was sufficient at first. In the latter part of the 1560s, those two richest types of silver ore began to dwindle in quantity, and the Indigenous technology was no longer enough to sustain the mining industry.

The narrator describes the first shortage of silver ore in the chapter corresponding to the year 1560 titled, “En que se cuenta una tan extraña peste con que Dios castigó por sus pecados a los moradores de esta villa de Potosí, y la mucha gente que pereció” (Arzáns I 113). There, the shortage of silver is read as punishment from God, and presented alongside a plague of unknown illness that results in the death of over four hundred Spaniards (Arzáns I 113), describing the event as it would correspond to biblical disaster. However, it is a short punishment since another vein of rich silver was discovered and the fears subsided temporarily.⁸ The narrator asks rhetorically, “¿Quién pensara que habiendo Dios Nuestro Señor piadosamente castigado a los moradores de Potosí quitándoles la riqueza de sus metales, y a los 18 meses vuéltosela a dar aún con más abundancia que hasta allí, le pagasen esta benignidad con nuevas y repetidas ofensas?” (I 113). He describes then the sins of the

mine owners as, “fuera de los continuos [sic] pecados de homicidio, ambición y otros que les acarrea la abundancia de bienes corporales quitaban sin temor de Dios a los indefensos indios sus propias mujeres, y se habían adúlteramente con ellas” (I 113). Antonio de Acosta, don Juan Pasquier, Bartolomé de Dueñas and captain Pedro Méndez are cited to support this claim.⁹ That is an early example of the kind of moralist reading of the *Historia* the narrator executes and returns to frequently in the text.

As evident consequence of the bad behavior only five years later, in the chapter corresponding to the year 1565, the narrator describes that for, “segunda vez quita Dios al cerro la riqueza de sus metales” (I 125). The specific sins are not listed in 1565, “Pero todos en conformidad dicen que por faltarles la caridad y despedazarse los unos a los otros como crueles fieras, les quitó Dios [sic] segunda vez en este año a los moradores de Potosí la riqueza de los metales” (I 126). As a result of the decline in high-quality ore, profits dropped for everyone in the industry as less of the raw ore qualified for refinement in the huayra. As a direct consequence, prices of goods dropped throughout the city, and there was a shift away from employment in the mining industry since only the largest operators could afford to continue. This also meant that less tax in the form of the Royal Fifth was produced for the Crown. The decade of the 1560s saw a near collapse of the mining industry at Potosí, and without silver, the future of the city was in question.

As the *Historia* tells, the Spanish Crown sent Viceroy Francisco de Toledo and, among other things, tasked him with remedying the problems at Potosí. It must be emphasized that Toledo’s task, to repair decades of neglect in the infrastructure of the mining industry of Potosí, was a significant undertaking. As an outsider to the Potosí society, Toledo needed to first immerse himself in an industry where the private sector had been highly motivated by the lucrative wealth that could be gained, but that took shortcuts to achieve that wealth. As Bakewell asserts, advances in the processes pertaining to the extraction of metal

from ore had existed for many years in Europe and were actively used in other mining centers in the New World, but not in Potosí since it was possible to maximize profit using the huayras.

John Hemming states that before reaching Potosí, Viceroy Toledo first had his subordinate, Dr. Loarte, inspect the mercury mines at Huancavelica as part of his investigation into the working conditions and current levels of compensation of the Indigenous laborers, and as a component of his plan to modernize the operations of the mining industry at Potosí (404).¹⁰ At that point, with the higher quality of the ore depleted, there was no other option for the mine owners of Potosí than to adopt the large-scale use of mercury and other technological advances for smelting if the industry was to have any hope of a resurgence. However, mercury alone would not solve the issues at Potosí.

Once in Potosí, as the narrator states, Toledo spoke to the most influential and wealthy of mine owners, “a quienes propuso con discretas razones cuán conveniente sería el que se fabricasen ciertos ingenios donde se moliesen los metales del Cerro” (I 145). As Hemming asserts, the result was three million pesos spent “in the construction of a system of thirty-two lakes, a ten-mile artificial sluiceway, eighteen dams and hundreds of waterwheels: a remarkable feat of engineering that guaranteed the power to grind a steady flow of silver” (407). These were generally built along the watercourse that descended through Potosí and was known as the Ribera. At the time of its creation, the project was a marvel of technological innovation, a place for silver processing that Arzáns describes as a city within a city due to its sheer size and the number of people it employed (I 146).¹¹ With these developments, along with the introduction of the mita system, silver production was again able to resume, and so too did prices soar throughout Potosí on all manner of goods.¹²

As the city grew in population and size, the base of participants in commercial exchanges expanded. As Jane Mangan affirms, “Indians, both men and women, crowded together to sell ore...by grouping according to the quality of their product...[and] indigenous women sold coca from baskets in exchange for silver or for [silver] ore” (33). The involvement of all of these groups contributed to driving up demand and pricing for staple goods such as food, clothing, and tools, and “Indigenous men and woman became increasingly important consumers in the Potosí market” (Mangan 34). While the exchange of these types of goods was common among all mining towns, once it became apparent that Potosí contained a great wealth of silver, the population grew over time and a new type of consumer, a wealthier one, arrived in the city. As the socio-economic elite increased in number, so too did the demand for luxury goods in a place that was difficult to reach, however it was a demand that merchants were all too happy to provide in order to make great profits.

As José Torre Revello asserts in “Merchandise brought to America by the Spaniards (1534-1586)”, a thorough review of the registers associated with the vessels sent to authorized Spanish ports by the House of Trade at Seville presents the opportunity to examine both the industry of goods manufactured in Europe for exportation and the demand for their importation into the New World. While many of the goods forthcoming originated in Spain, there was significant activity and importation from, in descending order of quantity, Portugal, England, Italy, and Germany. In Spain, the busiest localities producing and exporting goods were Ciudad Real, Granada, Ocaña, Baeza, Jaén, Valencia, Ávila and Seville (775). Fine garments topped the list of most-imported goods, while numerous other items were popular with the elite, and so merchants happily engaged in the difficult, high-risk, but high-paying activity of trans-Atlantic commercial trade in the 16th century. As Revello states, some of the more popular types of goods exported from Europe consisted of:

combs from Paris and Italy; writing tables and desks from Germany and Brussels; Flemish cases and chests; paper from Venice and France; mirrors and glassware from Venice; chessmen from Paris; dolls from Flanders; clocks from Germany; knives from Flanders, Holland, bohemia, and Germany. (776)

The contrast between the types of goods exchanged in early Potosí, which were primarily necessities, with those imported later, which were both necessities and luxury goods, is significant in signaling a shift in the socio-economic level of the consumer base and their priorities. Early imports had a clear purpose towards the needs of those in the mining industry, while later imports were luxury goods with little or nothing to do with mining. All around, prices would be driven up by demand and entrepreneurial opportunity. In the *Historia*, wealth and luxury exchanges appear regularly, and the narrator is quick to condemn them as wasteful. As a matter of fact, the narrator will regularly comment on the growth of prices over time caused by the ever-increasing wealth of the shoppers due to the boom in mining.¹³

The chapter that corresponds to the year 1580, titled “De cómo se descubrieron nuevas y riquísimas labores en este cerro de Potosí, la abundancia de plata que gozaban los moradores de esta villa, y algunos cotejos de sus grandezas con la miseria Antigua de otros reinos” (I 178), is an example of the narrator’s position towards luxury in the city. In it, the narrator describes how an unexpected discovery of new, rich silver veins affected commercial exchanges in the city. He considers the unexpected windfall as, “tanta abundancia de plata que ninguno de los moradores de esta Imperial Villa sabía qué cosa era necesidad” (I 178). A lax attitude towards spending due to an influx in wealth had its consequences, “volvieron a subir de precio así las mercaderías como los mantenimientos...si hoy vale una carga de mantenimientos cinco o seis pesos...[ahí fue] vendido en la plaza de esta Villa por precios de 16 o 20 pesos” (I 178). The change of prices represents an increase of around three hundred

percent, an increase proportional to many goods in the city at the time, which in any other setting would be significant, but in Potosí, it was business as usual. All these commercial exchanges needed dedicated spaces in which to occur.

For example, there are two types of public spaces mentioned and used with greater frequency in the *Historia de la Villa Imperial del Potosí*: plazas and markets, of which there were various, and all used for public gatherings (events, ceremonies, fiestas), social exchanges, and commercial exchanges. As Hanke affirms, Arzáns made constant reference to the plazas, where important interactions took place, and they are, “...un elemento urbano frecuente en el relato de la *Historia* como centros de aglutinación social, y a veces de perturbación” (Arzáns I cxxxii). Among the different plazas in the city, “el Regocijo” is mentioned more than all others for incidents of exchange, both social and commercial, and quite often, when trouble was brewing (Arzáns I cxxxii). Markets that were places dedicated only to commercial exchanges are the second type of public space mentioned with great frequency. The largest market in Potosí was named “el Gato o Kjatu, el Mercado principal de Potosí”, which began as a small space for the exchange of the basic mining needs of the first people that settled in the Imperial Villa (Bakewell 40). As the city and its population grew, the demand for goods diversified to include imported, high-end luxury items (Bakewell 42). The first case I will present regarding commercial exchange occurs in el Regocijo, with a focus on the opportunities available for those who are not afraid to corrupt the status quo.

I have presented how silver became the most commonly used currency of exchange in the New World. As the preferred currency for daily exchanges, the *Historia* offers many examples of its changing of hands. As a matter of fact, the changes related to silver (from ore to coin, for example), as we saw, and its exchange are the heart of the *Historia* and perhaps even the reason of the existence of the text. As we will see, the narrator is constantly worried with the understanding of the decline of his city, in which economic health is related to silver

and its mining. I will analyze three cases where the exchange of silver is at the center of the story. The diversity of its participants will allow to us to consider how in the first half of the XVIII century the past wealth was considered and told.

Case 1 - Cashing in on Corruption

In the chapter that corresponds to the year 1573, the narrator describes the creation of the largest market in Potosí, el Regocijo, and tells us about the important exchanges that occurred within.¹⁴ The final paragraphs of the chapter are devoted to other events of that year considered worth mentioning. The narrator begins this chapter with praise for the actions of Viceroy Toledo, particularly with regards to the development of infrastructure in the city itself, resulting in the widening of streets, the division of communities between Indigenous and Spaniard populations, and the creation of the market (I 148). To emphasize the importance of these developments, the narrator describes the disasters that have occurred in those same areas due to inadequate infrastructure and narrow roads, mentioning specifically the storms in 1567 and 1570 that resulted in floods and the drowning of both Spaniards and Indians (I 148).

Among the improvements Toledo introduced, the narrator describes the creation of the Regocijo, which was a large plaza where many future social and religious events took place (Arzáns I 148). The plaza was adjoined by two markets, la plaza de las Gallinas, named so because chickens were one of the primary goods sold there (Arzáns I cxxxii), but it also went by the name plaza del Carbón for the same reason (Arzáns I cxxxii); and the second was known as the plaza del Gato. Later in the chapter, the narrator describes how el Gato was not only impressive for its size, but also because of the important exchanges that occurred there on a daily basis and the social aspect it fostered. Spaniards and members of the Indigenous population both sold their wares in this market, "...las indias venden cuantos mantenimientos

se cogen en el Perú, como también otras alhajas y ropa con mucha conveniencia. Los dichos mantenimientos se venden todos los días de la semana” (I 148). Sundays were busiest with more exchanges than any other day, “...por ser el día que reciben la satisfacción de su trabajo así los mineros españoles, mayordomos de ingenios, y demás oficiales, como también los indios” (I 148). The narrator describes the volume of activity in the market as nearly unmatched, “Esta plaza o mercado ha sido y es de tanta magnitud y riqueza que muy pocos o ninguno le iguala en el mundo” (I 148), which is not surprising when one considers the rapid growth in size and population of the city. The narrator goes on to describe the long list of goods that were exchanged in the market, ranging from necessary for sustenance to expensive luxury items, and here is where the first example of exchange takes place.

The narrator tells the story of a peculiar exchange, a partnership formed with the goal of profit in mind, as most do, but rooted in immoral behavior and corruption. Curiously, he delves into an event that was not from the year 1573, which is the year corresponding with this chapter, but from twenty-six years earlier in, “el año de 1547 cuando Gonzalo Pizarro tiranizaba este reino” then, the narrator tells, “Francisco de Carvajal, su maestre de campo, se topó en el camino de la ciudad de Los Reyes a esta Imperial Villa con cierto mercader, el cual...venía a vender 12,000 pesos de varios géneros” (Arzáns I 149). This sudden jump back to decades prior will be revisited later on. As Carvajal and the unnamed merchant travelled towards Potosí, the narrator states that, “Carvajal le dijo que ya sabía cómo en el estado que estaba la tierra todo lo que traía era suyo”, and that the merchant responded in a manner that prevented the loss of his goods, “el mercader astuto le respondió diciendo que desde el punto que cargó su mercancía había hecho el ánimo a partir de ganancias con él, y que así le diese seguridad para llegar a esta Villa de Potosí” (I 148). In this way, the merchant salvaged the situation by offering to share in his profits for “protection”. The narrator continues by stating that, “Carvajal (no sin falta de ambición y codicia de que por varios autores es notado) le

concedió paso seguro y demás mandó por escrito con amenazas a los mercaderes de esta Imperial Villa que ninguno abriese su tienda hasta que aquel mercader vendiese sus géneros” (I 149).

The result was success for Carvajal and the merchant, but the opposite for all the vendors who were forced to shutter their operations during this time, “Ejecutóse así el mandato y en sola una mañana, puestos los géneros a la vista en esta plaza, los vendió por menudo, pasando de 30,000 pesos con las ganancias, con que brevemente se volvió el mercader adonde estaba Carvajal” (I 149). The narrator stated earlier that 30,000 pesos was what the entire city exchanged in a given day, “en tiempo que las minas andaban prósperas” (I 149), but now was achieved by one single merchant thanks to the threats of violence made by Carvajal, ensuring that access to exchange was controlled and limited to isolate all business in Potosí for the pair of men.

In this case, three exchanges can be observed. The exchanges will not be addressed in chronological order, but from most simple and direct to what is more abstract. First, the unnamed merchant opened his stall, alone in the plaza with no others joining him thanks to Carvajal. He was allowed to exchange his goods with the people of Potosí without any competition. These exchanges would have been business as usual between the unnamed merchant and the people of Potosí, apart from the massive increase in the demand for his goods as the only merchant with goods to sell.

The second exchange we observe in this story is not as straight forward. It happens between Carvajal and the merchant. They agreed that the sharing of profits was going to be exchanged for what the merchant termed, “...seguridad” (I 148) on the remainder of their journey together to Potosí. This so-called agreement enters absurdity when one considers that the protection was not necessarily from any imagined thief, but from Carvajal himself who

stated that he was simply taking possession of the goods imported by the merchant. This is the only way for the merchant to salvage against Carvajal something of his own profit. Otherwise, Carvajal could have taken the goods by force. At the end of the morning, the unnamed merchant gives Carvajal half of the profits and kept the other half for himself as agreed, and their exchange is concluded.

The third exchange begins with the act of Carvajal writing to the merchants of the city, stating that if they value their safety, they should abstain from opening their stalls on that morning, and as the narrator has informed us, no other stalls opened that day. This begs the question if an exchange occurs when one party threatens another party with violence unless they abstain from a specific activity, as there is no silver involved in that exchange. Contemporary terms would call this coercion, compulsion, duress, or intimidation. I argue that it should be considered a form of exchange, but not in the commercial manner we have seen so far. What is exchanged is not a physical good, but rather a conditional promise of sorts, unilaterally imposed by one party and the outcome determined by the other: If a condition is met, no consequences will follow, but failure to meet this condition unilaterally imposed will bring a negative consequence, resulting in a choice that must be made, and that evidently was selected by all the merchants in the city. As stated, there is a twenty-six year difference in this chapter of Arzáns' text (1573) between the year when the story is said to happen and the year when it is told. By this point, we know that the story of Carvajal had already been told by Arzáns, up to his execution for his crimes against the Crown in the year 1548. The entire chapter corresponding to the year 1547 in Arzáns' text is dedicated to Carvajal, constructing his character as someone that could act with impunity and without consequence. As Felix Jay asserts in *Sin, crimes, and retribution in early Latin America*, Carvajal was described throughout several well-known chronicles as "The Demon of the Andes" because of his brutal, violent treatment of the Indigenous population and his Spanish

enemies (137-139). He held no formal position of authority within the city of Potosí, however, he travelled throughout the New World with a following of soldiers, all loyal to him and his cause, which in itself carried authority through the possibility of violence as acting *maestro de campo* for Gonzalo Pizarro (Jay 142). Oddly, Arzáns is restrained in his criticisms against Carvajal. The narrator acknowledges the impact that both men, Pizarro and Carvajal, had in the New World, from his first description of them in the first chapter of his text, “Descripción de la Villa Imperial de Potosí, su topografía y cielo, con algunas de las grandezas y excelencias que goza” (Arzáns I 3). There, the narrator presents briefly some of the most important and influential people, places, and events that shaped the history of his city. Some of these are the *cerro rico* itself, surrounding cities and provinces, the Indigenous populations who lived there before the founding of the city and after, geography, climate, mineral wealth to mine, Viceroy, Frays, and the sources that the narrator constantly references in his text. Both Pizarro and Carvajal are presented in this chapter, and the narrator states that, “Garcilaso de la Vega en sus *Comentarios reales* dice que en tiempo de la tiranía de Gonzalo Pizarro y su maestre de campo Francisco Carvajal en todo este peruano reino valía la arroba de vino 300 pesos” (Arzáns I 7), presenting in a subtle way the two men who would bring tyranny and violence to the New World.

As the text progresses, the narrator will almost always introduce both Pizarro and Carvajal with the key phrase used by Garcilaso de la Vega, “en tiempo de la tiranía”, while limiting his own harsh words against the men. I will not enter into the analysis of these two characters in the *Historia*. Suffice to say that the tyranny the narrator refers to begins with events dealing with the arrival of Virrey Blasco Núñez Vela, told in the chapter corresponding to 1546, who came to the New World and attempted to enforce *ordenanzas* that lessened the rights of conquistadors (in part by increasing those of the Indigenous populations), and spurred Pizarro to act in a short-lived rebellion that saw both men

executed for their crimes (I 46).¹⁵ The terrorizing that the narrator referred in the earliest descriptions of the man begin with the elimination of Pizarro's detractors. Carvajal is named by the narrator through the *Historia* as the one that acts as brutal executioner, "Ahorcaron en Carabuco a Francisco Pantaleón, clérigo presbítero, con el breviario al cuello, porque halló Carvajal que tenía escrito en un blanco de él 'Gonzalo Pizarro es tirano'" (I 48). When Pizarro attempted to legitimize his self-made claim to the title of *gobernador* by intimidating the judges to side with him and boost his authority and claim, "Carvajal sacó de la cárcel tres o cuatro hombres principales y los colgó de un árbol diciéndoles donaires. Los oidores respondieron a Pizarro no podían hacer lo que pedía sin petición de parte, y pidiéronle procuradores de los pueblos" (I 50). Arzáns thus describes a pattern of violence for Carvajal. When the Viceroy Blasco Núñez Vela was outnumbered by Pizarro and his men, and some began to fall behind in the chase to capture the Viceroy, the narrator tells "A cuantos cogía Carvajal que se iban quedando atrás por ir cansados sus caballos, ¡los colgaba de los árboles sin piedad ni compasión de cristiano. Hizo terribles crueldades este tirano" (I 51). Finally, it was also Carvajal who struck the deathblow to the Viceroy, and not Pizarro as perhaps would have been more appropriate, considering the symbolic leadership roles of each man, "Y al virrey, después de haber batallado como valiente señor siendo el que rompió la primera lanza, le acometieron cuatro... y el licenciado Carvajal viendo al virrey que ya quería expirar le cortó la cabeza" (I 51). However, as stated, the narrator is quite restrained in placing words of criticism against Carvajal, with the most direct being, "Hizo terribles crueldades este tirano" (I 51). In the entire rest of the text the narrator only directs a few more critical words against Carvajal, stating, "El inicuo maestre de campo Carvajal" (I 51), which could be either the wicked man, or the morally unjust man. This second possible use of "inicuo" might not even be considered criticism, but instead a statement of fact, as Carvajal did not only kill the enemies of Pizarro with impunity, he also stole at what appears to be every possible

opportunity, for example, “...después que se apartó de Pizarro llegó a Lima [y] pasó a buscar a Centeno al Cuzco y a Chuquisaca: iba por los caminos colgando hombres, entró a Arequipa y la robó” (1 51). The narrator continues to state that Carvajal roamed the cities, largely in search of opposers to Pizarro, but also stealing from everyone, “Dejamos a Francisco Carvajal en Arequipa, a quien después de haberla robado pasó al Cuzco por el mes de febrero del año de 1547, y lo primero que hizo en esta ciudad fue ahorcar cuatro hombres nobles por leales: robó también la ciudad, el oro, plata, armas y caballos” (1 52). The pattern of behavior is clear, Carvajal had the means and opportunity to threaten, kill, and steal with no immediate consequences, all the way until he was finally captured and executed.

Returning to the chapter corresponding to the year 1573 and the case of Carvajal and the unnamed merchant, I argue that this established pattern of behavior has allowed for Carvajal to normalize his actions with each successful trespass. The exchange here is the threat, transmitted by a written letter sent to the merchants as a group detailing the consequences of their actions should they not comply with his demands. From there the exchange was forced, either they complied, or they would resist, but they were certainly forced one way or the other. We can further split this into two categories: those who received the letter and complied, and those who did not receive the letter. For the former, those merchants were forced into the exchange with Carvajal, dealing not with goods and currency, but with threats and the decision to comply or resist in exchange for their own safety.

As stated, it may seem out of place at first for Arzáns to be discussing events in this chapter from twenty-six years prior, especially since the chapter corresponding to that year 1547 deals almost exclusively with the actions of Pizarro and Carvajal already. However, as the focus of this chapter of 1573 is the grand markets of Potosí and the exchanges that occurred there, this specific case is appropriate since the story of Carvajal relates directly to the markets and its function. It can also be noted that since this chapter is the founding tale of

the largest and most active market, it characterized all exchanges and Arzáns inclusion of events that were fueled by greed, corruption and savagery could be indicative of issues that harmed the city and its people. While Carvajal occupied a position that drew its power and authority from an illegitimate power grab, made effective by terror and violence, forced exchanges could be considered the mark of the market in Potosí.

Ultimately, the abuse of power allowed for Carvajal and the unnamed merchant to gain a substantial amount of silver through the controlling of commercial exchange on that one particular day. By reaching into the past and telling this story in the chapter corresponding to 1573, decades after it occurred, Arzáns presents forced exchange as one of the earliest origins of the markets in Potosí, which at its core was an abuse of authority to the detriment of many for the benefitting of only a few. The abuse of authority will continue to be the focus in the next case, dealing more with the bureaucratic abuse of power rather than Carvajal's abuse of physical threats.

Case 2 – The Corrupt Corregidor

After the initial conquest in the New World, there was less need for conquistadors and more need for officials to run the day-to-day operations of the colony. As we have already seen, Viceroys like Toledo were sent to Spain to represent the interests of the Crown and carried with them the authority to act on their behalf and enact significant, wide spread changes to the New World. Another position of official responsibility was the *Corregidor*, which was sometimes referred to as *alcalde mayor*, who quickly became involved in commercial ventures, selling tribute collected for the crown to fund their own trading (Brading 135). Historically speaking, the position of *Corregidor* was well-situated for abuse. As John Hemming asserts, “the new oppressor of the Indians became the Corregidor, the royal official appointed to administer Crown holdings [in the New World]. Corregidores were

appointed for only a few years: they had to intensify the pace and ingenuity of exploitation in order to make fortunes during their brief terms in office” (399).

That the position of *corregidor* came to have a negative connotation in a historical sense is paralleled in the *Historia*, and observable in the criticisms of the narrator. As Arzáns’ text is a moral history, the behaviors of individuals with authority to impact the city will always be a concern, particularly when the author paints most *corregidores* in the same negative manner. As Francisco Andújar Castillo states in “The venality of offices and honors in Spain and America in the eighteenth century”, the policy by which appointments of government positions were allocated was problematic because most were sold to the highest bidders, or given away as gifts, and this affected “offices at all levels, from the humblest posts in towns to the highest positions of government” (68-69). The origins of this practice existed long before the colonization of the New World and are frequently observable in fifteenth-century Spain. The primary motivation for selling positions in Spain was that the “monarchy [was] always keen for resources to sustain innumerable wars and the equally expensive royal estates...It was a quick way of collecting funds...without having to tax the population additionally” (69). In the New World, the discovery of new territories expanded the tradition of purchasing positions of authority and continued to entrench a flawed system from Spain, who would often sell positions for settlements not yet even constructed. As Teresa Meade affirms, the acquisition of the position of *corregidor* in the New World was based upon the same purchase and subsequent “appointment” for a period of time that ranged depending on the price paid (26).

In his text, Arzáns critiques several *corregidores* for acting in selfish, corrupt ways to enrich themselves at the cost of others, particularly the vulnerable Indigenous populations over whom the *corregidores* often had control. There are many examples of this criticism throughout the text. One of the first ones is seen in the chapter corresponding to the year

1554, where the narrator describes the insatiable greed that fuels certain people in the New World, “particularmente los *corregidores* de los partidos de indios, donde está tan introducida la codicia y la ambición que por llevarla adelante cada uno ejecuta mil crueldades en los miserables indios” (I 94).¹⁶ The narrator goes on in this fashion, concluding that this type of behavior will appear often throughout the history of the city. The *corregidores* had authority over a number of matters pertaining to the Indigenous population, and we will now examine one case whereby a *corregidor* initiates a forced exchange between Spanish mine owners and the Indigenous workers in order to enrich only himself.

In the chapter corresponding with the year 1564, titled “El Corregidor de Chuquisaca se pasa de asiento a esta villa de Potosí. Muéstrase riguroso con los vecinos, y comienzan nuevos bandos y enemistades entre las naciones”, a man named Carrión, or Carrillo as he was also known according to the narrator, took possession of the position of *corregidor* and proceeded to scheme in such a way as to profit as much as possible. He targeted the relationship between Indigenous tributary workers and the mine owners that exploited them. Carrión used that mistreatment as initial justification for the creation of his scheme, and as was within his authority as *corregidor*, he forced a payment for the labor provided by the Indigenous workers in the mines. The result was that the mine owners, “fueron obligados a dar...a cada uno de sus indios dos marcos de plata todos los meses el mismo día de la visita del corregidor...en sus propias manos [del corregidor] para comprar los mantenimientos y darlo personalmente a los indios” (I 124). The order carried tremendous weight as the official edict that included fines for noncompliance, “...si así no se hiciese serían multados por la primera vez en 4,000 pesos de a nueve reales, por la segunda en 8,000, y por la tercera en perdimiento de los indios y demás bienes que tuviesen” (I 148). Although there was some protest against Carrión by the mine owners, Arzáns does not mention a single individual who refused to comply or who received a fine. The payments were collected and held for the

benefit of the Indigenous workers by Carrión, or so he claimed. In this way, Carrión used his authority as *corregidor* to supposedly establish a forced exchange between the Indigenous workers and the Spanish mine owners, requesting compensation for services performed between two groups that were largely imbalanced in terms of power and authority.

The narrator continues telling us that during four months after the order was implemented Carrión collected payment on behalf of the Indigenous tributary workers, which amounted to, “4,000 indios que había en esta Villa tributarias de españoles, a dos marcos de plata cada uno, llegó a percibir 32,000 marcos” (I 124). However, Carrión continued to hold onto the silver and did not distribute any amount to the Indigenous workers for the labor given. There was also a negative shift in the relationship between Indigenous workers and the mine owners during this time. For the mine owners, those who were the lifeblood of the mining industry and by extension the true catalyst for the growth of Potosí, Carrión’s order was an additional expense, and in order to offset this new cost of doing business, the Indigenous workers were pushed to work harder, “...sin que los desventurados indios hubiesen sacado más provecho que añadirseles cada día un puñado de maíz y una manta y camiseta que se les dio el primer mes, y por esto les doblaban sus dueños las tareas: tal fue la avaricia y codicia de este corregidor” (I 124). The problem in this forced exchange lies in the greed of the *corregidor*. The exchange itself was corrupted, as the labor was provided, and the compensation was paid, but the *corregidor* set himself up in a position to take possession of the payment only for himself.

Months passed, and the breaking point was approaching as the Spanish mine owners no longer wished to tolerate Carrión’s order. As mentioned, one of the initial reasons given by the *corregidor* to justify the order was that the Spaniards were mistreating the Indigenous workers, and so, the Spaniards collectively committed to improve upon this. The narrator states that they attempted to persuade the *corregidor* by promising to change their past

abusive ways, “...ellos tratarían caritativamente a sus indos” (I 124), but Carrión rejected the proposal. This after all had nothing to do with the wellbeing of the Indigenous workers, and all to do with personal profit. At the beginning of the following month when the silver was due, one of the Spanish mine owners named don Julián de Cúpide reacted with violence to the situation. As they did every month, “fueron dos castellanos paisanos del *corregidor* a casa de don Julián de Cúpide...y como ya estaban llenos de impaciencia los que tenían indios, el don Julián, arrebatado de la cólera, sacando un puñal mató a uno de los mensajeros...[y] lo mismo hicieron los que allí estaban con el otro compañero” (I 125). News of the murder and its consequent rejection of Carrión’s order quickly spread. In response, Carrión rallied the support of over one hundred Spaniards who were swayed by the authority inherent to the position of *corregidor*, and marched on Cúpide, who in return rallied Spaniards against Carrión, which was not difficult as they were many mine owners who were forced to pay for the labor of the Indigenous workers each month. After a brief engagement that left men dead on both sides, Carrión fled the city in fear of his life, taking with him the 32,000 pesos not paid to the Indigenous workers.

Three years passed until Carrión returned in the chapter corresponding to the year 1567. The forced payment between Indigenous worker and mine owner is not mentioned again, and so we can assume that in the *corregidor*’s absence, the payments stopped. Even though Carrión had fled the city, the position of *corregidor* remained in his possession, and so too did the authority commanded by the title. Carrión continued to behave in corrupt ways, “...lo primero a que aspiró su codicia fue a atravesar todos cuantos mantenimientos entraban [a la ciudad], y para hacerlo con más desembarazo enviaba al camino 10 ó 12 hombres de aquellos que trajo en su compañía, a quitarlos [los mantenimientos atravesados] por fuerza, y traídos los revendía a muy subidos precios” (I 132). Once again Carrión was leveraging his authority, this time to rob merchants of their unspecified goods in order to sell them at great

profit. This was another exchange rooted in corruption, for the goods were acquired by abusing his position, and literally stealing from unsuspecting merchants who entered into the city. The fact that Carrión then sold those goods at elevated prices further demonstrates his greed, for selling at their normal price would already have been profitable given that his cost to acquire them was literally nothing.

The final exchange was the undoing of Carrión, as four men in Potosí were in the middle of a legal dispute, “dos hermanos Guevaras, naturales del valle de Mataca, traían en aquella sazón pleito muy reñido con Diego Lariz y Fernán Duero, castellanos, sobre una rica mina” (I 132). The conflict between them stemmed from distinct claims to the discovery of, and thus, mining rights. Carrión had the authority to decide who would have the legal claim to this mine, and he sided against the two brothers Guevaras, not because he considered one claim to be better than another, but because he had been bribed 4,000 pesos to do so by Lariz and Duero. The acceptance of the bribe for a favor would be Carrión’s final exchange, rooted in corruption and personal benefit at the cost to others. In their revenge, the two brothers Guevaras snuck into the home of Carrión while he slept, stabbed him repeatedly, dragged his bloody body out into a nearby, unnamed plaza, and executed him by sword (Arzáns I 132).

The case of Carrión brings up three points to consider. The first one regards the interjections made by the narrator during the story that pertain to the morality of the events. After the narrator described the bribe that Carrión had taken to rule against the brothers Guevaras, but before his bloody execution, the narrator launches into a long description on the consequences of the morality of actions, and how those actions can affect other individuals. The narrator begins his long interjection by stating:

Hacer bien a otro sin hacer mal al próximo ni a sí mismo, blasón es de Dios. No por esto pongo dificultad en el hacer bien, sino cuidado: hágase bien pero mírese a quién se hace, que esto es lo que digo. Ni tampoco niego que no se ha de [sic] hacer bien a

todos, a los buenos y a los malos, a los amigos y a los enemigos: a los buenos porque lo merecen, a los malos para que lo merezcan, a los amigos porque lo son, a los enemigos porque no lo sean. (I 131-132)

The narrator continues in this fashion, adding similar points and concluding that, “Si el *corregidor* Carrión mirara a quién hacía bien en Lariz y en Duero, no les diera ocasión de ser homicidas de quien les hizo el bien” (I 132). This is the final commentary that the narrator makes on Carrión before describing his death, and it is fitting since the three exchanges seen here can be tied to this general idea, always circling back to proper, moral behavior.

In the first forced exchange between the Indigenous workers and the mine owners, the idea of providing a guaranteed wage for the Indigenous population could have been a foundation on which positive effects for Indigenous tributary workers could have been built. Yet, we know that Carrion’s case is not about providing the tributary workers with deserved compensation or better treatment, instead he is robbing the Indigenous workers of what was owed to them, bringing them nothing but harm as the mine owners demanded more work to compensate for what they paid them. Carrión’s second exchange was again rooted in a morally corrupt behavior by using his authority to rob merchants who arrived in Potosí to sell their goods and keep the profits for himself, much in the same way Carvajal with his threats of violence against merchants who did not comply with his threats. The third and final exchange was again made possible by the corrupt abuse of his position of *corregidor*, to sell a favor in exchange for a bribe, which in turn brought on the moral interjection of the narrator. It is fitting to have this interjection, since this final corrupt exchange formed the catalyst to bring about the violent death of Carrión. The interjection itself is again telling of the overall moralistic message that Arzáns repeats and sets as a standard for good behavior, “Hacer bien a otro sin hacer mal al próximo ni a sí mismo, blasón es de Dios” (I 132), which in his final act can refer to the favoring of one group at the expense of another, and doing wrong unto

oneself through immoral actions. While lofty and idealistic in its message, the *Historia* is not without these types of individuals who do strive to act in morally good ways. It would be fair to say that if everyone in the text acted with this creed in mind, the *Historia* would not be as exciting as it is, but it would certainly be more wholesome. If Carvajal from the first case had minded this advice, he would not have sent a threat of violence against every merchant in the city. This particular interjection by the narrator could be applied to virtually any case in which there is conflict in the text, whereby following the advice would in all likelihood lead to peaceful resolutions, instead of violence and death. In making this critique, Arzáns advocates for a better class of citizen, which will be present in the third case of this chapter.

It must also be stated that despite the moralistic tone of much of the *Historia*, Arzáns is always steadfast in his commitment to the Spanish Crown. As Hanke asserts in the introduction to the text:

A pesar del vigoroso sentido de americanismo manifestado a través de la *Historia* y los agudos comentarios contra la insolencia, crueldad y presunción de muchos españoles que trataban de oprimir y explotar a los criollos e indios, Arzáns se muestra firme y espectacularmente leal a la Corona. (I lxxxii)

By selecting the story of Carrión and other *corregidores* who were corrupt, Arzáns places a spotlight on the problems that plagued his beloved city that leads any reasonable reader to see that this system of governance was inefficient and prone to being exploited, and that there must be an alternative to such abuse.¹⁷

While both Carvajal in the first case and Carrión in this one represent some of the vilest, most morally reprehensible individuals in Arzáns' text and therefore perverted exchange, there are other cases that represent positive role models in the city. Before presenting an example of a positive case of silver exchange it is fitting to close with the

words of the French criminologist Alexandre Lacassagne (1843-1924), “the social environment is the breeding ground of criminality, the germ is the criminal, an element which has no importance until the day where it finds the broth which makes it ferment...justice shrivels up, prison corrupts, and society has the criminals it deserves” (18). These early examples of Carvajal and Carrión are symptoms of an environment that allowed for the abuse of authority to occur, infecting exchanges for personal gain at the cost of others. All of this, the narrator would sustain, can be said to contribute towards the downfall of Potosí in the seventeenth century. From the temporal space that the narrator occupies, there needs to be a drastic change in order to emerge from the dark place to which his beloved city has fallen. To this end, Arzáns will present those well-meaning Spaniards, Criollos, and Indians who did operate in the silver exchanges as the ideal candidates to make Potosí the best that it could be.

Case 3 –Antonio López de Quiroga

The third case is presented long after the previous two in the text, in the latter part of the seventeenth century. Antonio López de Quiroga, who is considered to be Potosí’s single most successful mining operator in the history of the city, is the focus. Being the most successful mining operator is a significant achievement but is even more impressive during this timeframe because mining outputs had gone through a steady, permanent decline in the early seventeenth century in that place. As Bakewell asserts in “Registered Silver production in the Potosí district 1550-1710”, ups and downs in silver production were not uncommon in the history of Potosí, as we have previously seen, but a permanent decline of silver production finally began in 1615 and saw only the slightest momentary upturn in 1642 before once again resuming its permanent spiral downwards (95). As Bakewell states, “That silken purse, once crammed with silver, had become a sow’s ear full of rubbish...what needed to be done now was to explore the hill for other concentrations of wealth” (21).

While it was possible to go to Potosí in the sixteenth century and profit as a miner with little risk and initial investment, the decline in the seventeenth century made the situation comparable to any other mining city in the New World. There was still profit to be made, but the costs associated with beginning a career as a mine owner of silver were much higher than even a few decades earlier, as were the risks of losing everything. As a result of the decline in silver production, Potosí also saw a decline in its social relevance, spiraling down into the time and place from which the author writes, which was a mere six to eight years after the death of Quiroga. In this way, this third case is far closer in time to Arzáns' life than the earlier cases.

In the chapter that corresponds to the year 1699, titled, “En que se cuenta la gran riqueza que en esta villa tuvo el maestro de campo Antonio López de Quiroga y su muerte, cómo se formaron capítulos contra el general don Fernando, y lo demás que sucedió”, the narrator presents a detailed list of the lifelong achievements of don Antonio López de Quiroga in the year of his death, describing it as “La prosperidad tan grande en que se vio un hombre particular en esta Imperial Villa” (II 394). Wealth alone is not the primary reason for which Quiroga constitutes the focus of this case. Nor should it be, for there were countless wealthy individuals in Potosí. It would be his behaviour as a mine owner, employer, and philanthropist later in life that would grow the reputation of the man that Arzáns will idealize so greatly.

Quiroga is a historical character, and the exact date of birth is not known for certain, and the earliest record of his involvement in Potosí comes in the form of, as Bakewell asserts in his extensive work, *Silver and Entrepreneurship in Seventeenth-Century Potosí: The Life and Times of Antonio López de Quiroga*, “the record of a loan of 1,400 pesos he made in April 1649 to a man named Felipe García de Alcántara” (6). Arzáns writes that Quiroga came to Potosí motivated much in the same way that most Spaniards were, “en busca de riquezas,

como todos los que vienen de los reinos de Europa, y con la ayuda de algunos buenos hombres puso una tienda de mercancía en la calle antigua de los Mercaderes” (II 395), and so the origin of Quiroga’s wealth is rooted in the commercial exchanges of goods for money. The narrator continues to describe how Quiroga established himself gradually, making acquaintances slowly and earning the ability to acquire more credit through his commercial exchanges (II 395).¹⁸

The first significant exchanges in this case are apparent as the narrator describes the various positions of employment in Quiroga’s mines, and the salaries paid for their work, beginning with, “Los españoles que le servían de minadores, de mayordomos de ingenio y de haciendas, pasaban de 50 [pesos]. Tiraban de salario cada semana los beneficiadores 100 y 200 pesos algunos; los minadores mayores 100, los menores y los guardas a 50 y otros a 30 pesos” (II 395). The narrator then describes the same for the Indigenous workers, “Quinientos indios tenían cédula en las minas de este Cerro y 150 en los ingenios, sin otros 200 alquilados, que en aviarlos o pagarlos se gastaban más de 3,000 pesos cada semana. En las minas e ingenios de varios asientos ocupaba otros 2,000 indios en que gastaba 8,000 pesos cada semana” (II 395). This is considered well-paid for the time, as the narrator delves into how these employees benefitted in the long term as, “Todos los españoles que servían al maestro de campo Quiroga en cuatro, cinco o seis años salían con buen caudal, que adelantándolo quedaban ricos” (II 396). It is clear that the men who worked for Quiroga not only were treated and compensated fairly for their work, but that their long-term prospects were also secured.

Even though the men who worked for Quiroga were well compensated for their labor, some of the workers would steal from him, and they would find little to no punishment for these actions. The narrator states that Quiroga’s position towards those stealing from him was, “Dejalo que hurte, que él trabajará y me dará más provecho en la labor por aquello que

se lleva” (II 396), which is an optimistic, light-hearted reaction to news of theft, that shows that Quiroga was more interested in the benefit he would receive from this employee in the long term. One mayordomo stole around 6,000 pesos over an unspecified period of time, and when Quiroga was informed by *un soplón*, he took the money back. When the mayordomo explained that “le había hurtado con intención de remediar una hija pobre que tenía” (II 396), Quiroga responded “con toda mansedumbre le replicó diciendo: ‘¿Por qué no los llevaste con tiempo a vuestra casa.?’”, y llamando a un criado le envió a decir a su cuñado le volviese todo cuanto le había embargado” (II 396). While the narrator has presented Quiroga as dealing fairly in his exchanges, first as a merchant, then as a silver trader and refiner, and now in compensating his employees, this example of allowing the mayordomo to keep the 6,000 pesos is different. It no longer fits into the model of exchange, since there is nothing being given in exchange for those 6,000 pesos. The money is given away freely in an act of compassion, and therefore seems to fall under the category of a gift.

As Marshall Sahlins’ presents in his text, *Stone Age Economics*, three types of reciprocities appear in all societies; generalized, balanced, and negative. All three fall within a framework of substantivist economics, which presupposes that an economy is not affected on a daily basis by rational decision making or conditions of scarcity, but towards forming long-term relationships for survival (2). People in a society engage in relationships of exchange with an expectation of reciprocity. Although Sahlins is not speaking of the New World, similar principles of reciprocity have been considered in pre-Columbian Andean societies (Murra 20). The principle argument of Sahlins’ work concludes on this same theme, stating “the spirit of exchange swings from disinterested concern for the other party through mutuality to self-interest” (193). In the most literal form of exchange, seen commercially in Arzáns’ text, reciprocity is as simple as a good given in return for currency (symbolic or real), but in the most abstract sense of the term, reciprocity means building long-lasting social

relationships where acts of kindness ultimately exist to establish self-interests over time, with the expectation of receiving something in return later on (Hanke 4). Quiroga breaks away from Sahlins' expectation of reciprocity in the example with the mayordomo. Quiroga receives nothing in giving freely those 6,000 pesos initially stolen from him, except perhaps fidelity from his employees, though this could also be remedied through the termination and recruitment of new employees. Because of his compassion, it is a true gift that is free from the expectation of reciprocity now or in the future, as the narrator ends the story of the mayordomo there. It could be said in a moralistic sense that Quiroga will ultimately receive in return for his generosity a rewarding afterlife, as the narrator states at the beginning of the chapter, "...podemos creer piadosamente que está gozando de las felicidades eternas" (II 394). That the money must be considered to have been given freely, not as a part of exchange, but as a gift is further supported by the narrator in describing the other gifts given later in his life.

In general, it can be said that the poor in Potosí were in a better situation than others would be elsewhere because there was so much wealth circulating the city that on various occasions Arzáns is able to write about the generosity of the elite class.¹⁹ In this chapter, Quiroga leads by example. The narrator states that he "Tuvo grande devoción con la madre de Dios de la Purísima Concepción, cuyas fiestas hacía con grande lucimiento y gastos" (II 397), and gifts of his wealth to the less fortunate formed a routine part of Quiroga's life, particularly during religious celebrations, "La Semana Santa...[Quiroga] se sentaba en su sala cerca de cuatro sacas de moneda en pesos de a ocho reales, y entrando los que pedían las demandas metía con fuerza un plato de plata a una de las sacas, y llenándolo lo daba a cada uno" (II 397). This generosity was not limited to times of religious celebrations, but continued on throughout the year, "En cuanto a la caridad que tenía con los pobres... algunos dicen que las dio a muchos vergonzantes, a unos 200 pesos, 500 a otros, y 1,000 a otros y que

éste era su modo de darlas” (II 397). In both, the narrator does not state that Quiroga received anything in return for his gifts in any of these examples, and so these acts must be considered as true gifts, freely given.

The generosity of Quiroga elicited a false sense of entitlement in certain individuals. As Arzáns states, Quiroga’s generosity towards the poor was so well-known that on occasion when he saw it appropriate to deny a request, some were surprised, “algunos pobres (o todos ellos) tienen por costumbre murmurar si no les dan lo que piden como si se les debiera por empréstito” (II 397). The reaction to the rejection of a petition for a *limosna* is replicated on a larger scale in another example of Quiroga’s behaviour. Throughout the *Historia*, the narrator presents many cases of petitions to wealthy citizens to finance military expeditions throughout the history of the city,²⁰ as well as the development of infrastructure relating to plazas and churches. The narrator states that Quiroga “Gastó en la infructuosa conquista del Paititi...más de 300,000 pesos” (II 397).

Despite the trouble Quiroga faced because, as ridiculous as this may sound, of his overgenerosity, he was unique in his altruism. Quiroga exemplifies a quality that goes beyond simple generosity. Many individuals in Arzáns’ text can be considered generous, yet Quiroga is unique in that his gifts were many and made seemingly without the expectation of reciprocity over the course of many years.²¹ The narrator presents him as an ideal citizen of Potosí, bringing nothing but goodness. This may be why the narrator begins the chapter by describing Quiroga in overly positive ways, “Era para detenerse cuerdo; para arrojar, atrevido; para emprender, animoso; para amigo, leal; para aconsejar, prudente; para dar, liberal; para comunicar...sumamente devoto de la madre de Dios de la Inmaculada Concepción y de nuestro padre San Francisco, para tan embarazado en sus corporales negocios” (II 394), and concludes the chapter by launching into another descriptive model by which one should live their life:

Cual hubiera sido la vida de cada uno tal será su muerte, porque la muerte es sombra que sigue a la vida como la sombra naturalmente al cuerpo, y así para juzgar si uno murió bien véase si vivió bien (porque su alma en la vida del mismo será bendita): no hay mala muerte si precedió buena vida, y la muerte del pecador siempre es mala.

Buena fue la vida del maestro de campo Antonio López de Quiroga en todo, y así fue correspondiente su muerte. Pasó, pues, al descanso de la eterna (como podemos creer piadosamente) en el mes de abril de este año de 1699. (II 397)

Throughout Arzáns' history of the city, people die with great frequency, often brutally as a result of punishment for their sins, or peacefully for a life honorably lived. The life and death of Quiroga however is presented in a unique way in the attention given by the narrator.

Compared to the exchanges presented earlier in this chapter, Quiroga was the ideal citizen, not only exchanging fairly in his commercial enterprises, but giving freely gifts of his wealth throughout his life with no expectation of reciprocity. This ideal behavior justifies the significant narrative space the narrator devotes to Quiroga. To Arzáns, Quiroga serves as a model citizen in a time when they were desperately needed if Potosí was ever going to emerge from its nearly one-century old steady decline, which we know today, it never did.

Beyond framing Quiroga as an ideal citizen, this case allows Arzáns to tie the fate and prosperity of Potosí to that of Spain. The narrator states that the positive contribution of Quiroga can be measured as a quantifiable benefit to Spain in the form of taxes paid as part of the Royal Fifth. Arzáns states that in total, “Los quintos que dio a su majestad desde que fue azoguero hasta el año de 1686 en el espacio de 20 años fueron 15,000,000 y desde el de 1686 hasta éste de 1699 que falleció dio otros 8,000,000, que todos son 23,000,000 cuyo principal son 115,000,000” (II 397). During his time as a silver producer, Quiroga alone is recorded to have contributed roughly one-seventh to one-eighth of all silver taxes paid to the crown from Potosí and was not involved in any scandals regarding tax avoidance. When adjusted for

inflation, and the drastic changes undergone in the mining industry since the days of Quiroga, Bakewell says it best, “On such a scale, even in today’s vast and industrialized economies, only a fraction of producers could rank themselves as high [as Quiroga]” (*Silver and Entrepreneurship in Seventeenth-century Potosí* 154).

Quiroga is the archetype of the sort of individual that Potosí needs to flourish, and his idealized exchanges and behavior is a theme that the narrator posits throughout the text. Moreover, the altruistic behavior exhibited in this third case serves to counteract the terror of the first two. Rather than exchange for the purpose of exploitation and self-interest, Quiroga presents exchange for the good of the city and its people, and from the narrator’s perspective, eternal reward awaits him in the afterlife for having been so good during his life.

Chapter Conclusions

The *Historia de la Villa Imperial del Potosí* is a long, winding tale that deals with the triumphant, unexpected growth of a city to mythical status, and its gradual, unstoppable decline to the point in time from where its author writes. The three selected cases regarding various exchanges of silver seem to sustain the existence of this quest at the heart of the text to answer why the decline was possible, and how to revert it. Extraordinary wealth often seems to call for a greater desire to seek out more wealth, and motivates immoral behaviors in some individuals, while in others, the opposite is true with morally ideal behavior. Quiroga occupied the space of the good model as the most charitable individual and least concerned with acquiring more wealth at the expense of others. These extremes fit within a consistent moral framework on which the text is built.

Our cases allowed for a glimpse into how XVIII century Potosí perceived the fate of the city and how its decline could be considered and explained. A strong moral component

seems to sustain all explanations of the city destiny. Since silver is the fundamental reason for the Potosí to exist, silver seems to be at the heart of all explanations.

The chosen examples allowed us to observe the extremes of models, where wealth is not a mark for success in Arzáns' eyes. Carvajal represented the higher levels of socio-economic wealth, obtained primarily through looting and plundering in the eyes of the narrator. Increasing in overall wealth to the extreme level, Quiroga began with little and acquired more through exchanges that were founded upon fair, or even generous dealings, and gradually became the most successful miner of silver in the history of Potosí. These men were in positions of clear economic advantage and had an above-average impact on their surroundings, both positive and negative. These immense, notable events can guide the reader towards a greater understanding of how the city grew in magnificence, and at the same time, suffered its downward trend of decadence.

I return now briefly to Carvajal with regards to how the narrator treats him, because of an uncommon but notable deviation that occurs in the text that at first glance seems to run counter to the moralistic theme that otherwise is always present. The point was not addressed during the observation of the case, for it had little to do with the events directly relating to both him and the unnamed merchant, or to their exchange. The restraint in the narrator's condemnation feels out of place, as the narrator clearly described how might is right and that in 1547 men like Carvajal could ride into town, threaten all of the merchants, and face zero consequences, but with hardly a word of criticism against him for such actions. This restraint continues until the death of Carvajal, and through this all, the most criticism appears to be, "Hizo terribles crueldades este tirano" (I 51), which is more a description of the actions and not of the man.

This uncharacteristic restraint continues in most of the rest of the text, with only a few critical words directed against Carvajal, stating, “El inicuo maestro de campo Carvajal” (I 51), which is appropriate as all his actions do seem to be morally wrong. Carvajal did not only kill the enemies of Pizarro with impunity, he also stole at what appears to be every possible opportunity. I offer two possible explanations regarding the narrator’s mild treatment of such a vile man. The first, as Hanke states, is that Arzáns as an author of a history of the city needed to be cautious with his criticism if the target of those words had living relatives during the time of writing. The relatives could have sued for dishonoring their ancestor, even if the accusations were all true, or they could have killed the author outright, as was not uncommon and made the profession of writing histories a risky affair (Hanke I xxxix). While we know that Arzáns had no intention of publishing the book, it is known that he often provided portions of the manuscript for use in religious sermons, which could have the same result.²² The second possible explanation requires a consideration of the narrator’s comments regarding the actions of both Pizarro and Carvajal after their deaths. In the chapter that corresponds to the year 1594, long after the deaths of each man, the narrator is describing how some considered, “Francisco Carvajal, maestro de campo de Pizarra, era verdugo de la divina justicia, y que vivió hasta que el castigo se hizo y después pagó él con la muerte los graves pecados que hizo en la vida (I 224). The narrator however neither accepts nor rejects the idea outright, he merely points it out. It therefore reasonable that perhaps the narrator does in fact fall among one of those individuals who supports the idea of Carvajal as a tool of God to deal out divine punishment, and who in the end, received his own punishment for his other sins, of which rampant theft, and the threats of violence in the market with the unnamed merchant, would be prime examples. Despite the restraint shown by the narrator against Carvajal, any reader would surely see how detrimental this manner of behavior and exchange was to the city.

This fits within the pattern the narrator follows regarding exchanges and morality. When considering the role of the faithful Christian narrator in his observation of all exchanges that occur in the history, so much can be traced back to appropriate versus inappropriate moral behavior, and the corresponding divine reward or punishment given in exchange. As was stated earlier, the text was almost named for the three great disasters that affected the city, all brought on according to the narrator by sinful behavior (Hanke 15). If Carvajal were in fact a tool of divine justice, punishing those who sinned, and then ultimately paying the price himself for his own behavior, then there is no discrepancy between how the narrator restrains his critique against Carvajal. In this way, the restraint is appropriate, as Carvajal does not escape his own punishment, and is little more than a tool of God, which will be explored further in Chapter three of this dissertation, whereby acts of divine intervention or punishment often override any need for the narrator to comment, as the actions of God speak louder than the narrator ever could with his own words in the text.

The second case involving Carrión as a corrupt *corregidor* allowed us to observe similar themes in terms of the abuse of power in exchange, and something different in that the most affected victims were the Indigenous workers in the mines that belonged to Spaniards. Here, the narrator was clear about both his opinion of Carrión and his opinion of *corregidores* in general. The exchange of silver in this case was made under a deceptive premise. There was no physical threat involved as in the previous example, but a threat nonetheless through bureaucracy that was monetary in nature against those who disobeyed. As a *corregidor*, Carrión acted as a false champion for the Indigenous workers in a manner that was forward thinking, and far ahead of the times. In betraying the Indigenous workers for personal gain, he reinforces the narrator's consistent message in the *Historia* that *corregidores* brought little more than corruption to his city. This case also presented one of the recurring themes in the text, the negative outcome of the exchange of silver for the

Indigenous laborers. In the case of Carrión, they were already in positions of vulnerability and their situation only worsened when they were suddenly asked to give even more effort to their Spanish employers for what amounted to no return. This abusive treatment of the Indigenous population is repeated throughout the text, and the narrator will describe how salvation for the Indigenous population rests only in proper Christian behavior. With Carrión's bloody execution, the narrator closes with his own interjections on the consequences of such immoral behavior and remains consistent in his condemnation of such exchanges rooted in greed and personal gain.

The final case, leapfrogging in time by over a century, presents the idealized life and actions of Quiroga and presents a model of good, moral behavior through exchanges and gifts. His tale is marked by generosity, compassion, and altruism. Evoking again the Christianity of our character, Arzáns shows a positive economic model. At the end, as we saw, Quiroga culminates his professional life as the greatest miner of silver in the history of the city, and as for its tale, he behaves through a generous heart. If you give, if you gift, they will work harder. Most importantly, and distinguishing itself between the first two cases, the positive effects made by Quiroga were done solely by him, without the use of mediators, as seen with Carrión, or threats of violence, as seen with Carvajal. A strong-willed entrepreneur without external forces corrupting his actions, Quiroga in the late XVII century represents the ideal citizen that Potosí needs to thrive in a time of economic downturn.

From the point in time where the author writes, which if we recall from the introduction would have been approximately only seven or eight years after the death of Quiroga, the narrator can point to this positive influence and write with pride that even in his declining city, with a devastated silver mining industry, there are still ideal models of citizenry to look upon and seek to emulate. By contrasting these initial exchanges of silver, the narrator allows us to see how those that were rooted in corruption affected the city

negatively. Meanwhile, an idealized moral behavior represented in exchanges of silver done in good faith, including the altruistic gifts given freely, offer a more optimistic view of what the narrator's city could be if more people behaved like Quiroga, as ideal citizens. In the end, the narrator's focus on morally proper behavior is the model that citizens should emulate, while the immoral actions equally serve as a warning against improper behavior.²³

Chapter 2 – “Exchange” of Women

La Historia de la villa imperial de Potosí is a text regarded for its detailed historical account and its multiple and exquisite stories of men and women that inhabited the city. As stated earlier, it exposes cases that often evoke a strong moral and religious critique. Lewis Hanke states that Arzáns planned to name the text for the three most notable disasters that were brought down onto the city "The Three Destructions of the Imperial City of Potosí" (15), which according to the narrator, were all acts of divine punishment by God for long-term, sinful behaviors, many of them presented in the work. The divine interventions for punishment or reward are constructed around fantastic elements and extraordinary individuals that appear in the text. However, among those elements, women and their deeds seem to be central, or at least quite enduring in the memories of the readers. Many cases exhibit their behavior outside of the norms and what was expected. It is easy to remember the two extraordinary warrior "Amazonians" that walked the streets dressed as men, rejecting their supposed place in society, fighting and punishing men during the year 1653.²⁴

This chapter will focus on “exchanges” involving women, since women are not only a constant obsession for the narrator of the text but also because they are central in the Potosí society depicted in the *Historia*. There is however a major distinction between this chapter and the last. Previously, it was men who acted as the parties that were exchanging with one another. Here the focus will not always be on women as parties of exchange, but as “things” being exchanged for something in return by other individuals. However, the tales will speak about their resistance, rather than their complacency. To enter into a discussion of these intended exchanges of, rather than by women, it is first necessary to consider the ways in which women were controlled in terms of their moral behavior, the spaces they occupied, and both socioeconomic and hierarchal constraints. Once this has been achieved, we will see then that the *Historia* showcases subversion of the established norms and also that the narrator’s

moralistic commentary aims to demonstrate proper and improper behavior of women who cope with extreme situations, and also of the men who cause the problems in the first place.

“Exchanges” of women in the New World

From the beginning of the conquest in the New World, one of the various challenges came when dealing with notions of sex and relationships between the newly intersecting cultures. One institution that was instrumental regarding this in Spain, and also in the New World, was the Church. As Asunción Lavrin explains in her text *Sexuality in Colonial Mexico*, a specific issue for the Church was the mingling of distinct and previously unmixed cultures, which, “posed special problems for the Iberian church and state insofar as European traditions had to interact with those of other cultures, creating a unique experiment in cultural adaptation of sexual behavior and the personal and social aspects of marriage” (3). In addition, it was soon evident that many customs existed among the Indigenous peoples, further complicating matters, “The conquistadors found a variety of indigenous sexual mores comprising strict definitions of sexual morality, as in the Aztec and Inca societies, and looser definitions in many groups of Central and South America” (Lavrin 3). It was no easy task implementing Spanish customs and rules with regards to sex and marriage onto the Indigenous people, but like most other customs, the dominant Spanish culture was heavily imposed upon the Indigenous populations in most aspects of their lives, with varying effects of acceptance, rejection, and the blending in between.

When considering the rules governing women in the New World, it is necessary to begin in Spain before the conquest began as that is the origin from which so many cultural norms and rules were transported to the New World. As Richard Boyer states in “Women, *La Mala Vida*, and the Politics of Marriage”, “the politics of marriage in early times was played out against the backdrop of patriarchalism...as the underlying principle of all social relationships in Spain” (253).²⁵ This meant that at its core, a family consisted of a “husband

dominant over wife, children, and any others in the household” (253), and women and children were the responsibility of the husband, duly charged under Christianity in a moral sense to not only be in charge, but also, to be a protector. Guides were published and directed towards women so that they too would know exactly what was expected of them, as seen in “Fray Alonso de Herrera’s celebrated and widely circulated *Espejo de la perfecta casada*” (Boyer 257), which described in detail how best to maintain a proper marriage, how to raise children in a moral sense, and the “governance of her family in love and the fear of God” (Boyer 257). Yet, this is not to say that the relationship between husband and wife was one of simple domination and subordination, but rather a union of reciprocity for, “A married man is at once lord and slave of his wife: lord in that he orders and governs her; slave in that he serves and esteems her and would sacrifice himself for her” (Boyer 257). It extends the idea of control over wife and children to something more substantial, to responsibility over the family as a whole unit, with “the moral economy of marriage, then, based on the ideal of reciprocity, transmitted to families through secular and cultic means” (Boyer 257). Though rooted in an idealized notion of reciprocity that was not always carried out in practice, the main point remains that wife and children were under the protection of the father, and lacking that, susceptible to all manner of problems both in Spain and by extension, the New World.

Put simply, maintaining family honor was important to members of Spanish society, and by extension to those who crossed over to the New World. Both the level of expectation that honor be kept, and the methods to do so, varied greatly among differing levels of socioeconomic class. Honor was in theory an important quality for all, but not something equally protected or afforded to the entire spectrum of social classes. Like in past and present society, a delicate hierarchy dictated who was expected to have and safeguard honor. As Ann Twinam explains in *Public Lives, private secrets: gender, honor, sexuality, and illegitimacy in Colonial Spanish America*, “honor was the ethos which rationalized the existence of the

colonial hierarchy. It included those self-conscious differences of birth and conduct that distinguishes people who had it (*gente decente*) from those who did not (*gente baja*)” (123). Inheritance, bloodlines, and the ability to prove ancestry, “was not only a heritage of racial and religious purity, but a family history of proper action, as signified by generations of sanctified marriages and of legitimate births” (Twinam 123). This latter requirement meant that there were three documents of utmost importance in the life of an individual in either Spain or the New World, “the birth certificate, the marriage certificate, and the will – which recorded the personal histories of preceding generations by noting whether a person was or was not legitimate” (Twinam 123).

The ability, and sometimes necessity to prove lineage was part of the social structures meant to control the behavior of certain individuals. Strictly regulated and highly scrutinized actions within gender-defined boundaries were also required, specifically for women. In the New World, the Church seems to have played a major part in the colonial code of honor, which as Twinam states, “attempted to control female sexuality through either virginity or marital chastity” (124). Challenges to maintaining honor in this regard were apparent throughout colonial history, however, violating social norms did not always result in tragedy. As Twinam affirms, “It was possible to manipulate the system for years and avoid loss of honor. Colonial elites employed diverse strategies to achieve such ends” (124). These options were limited to those with only the proper network of personal and financial support. Postponing or avoiding such loss of honor could be done by methods such as, “immediate or post hoc matrimony, as well as forms of private and public pregnancies” (Twinam 124), referring to extended engagements or concubinage, for example. With the proper conditions met, such as an effective male guardian and network of support, loss of honor was thoroughly avoidable, at least in the most ideal of circumstances.²⁶

Of course, the most ideal theoretical circumstance is hardly ever the reality of a situation. As mentioned earlier, the expected safeguard of family honor lay not only with the proper judgement of a daughter or mother, but primarily in the watchful eye of the father. In truth, few families could afford the luxury of worrying about honor, either because of their social status, racial or religious heritage, or the legitimacy of their own birth, all of which were circumstances completely out of their control. A father of lower socioeconomic class may not always be available to keep a vigilant watch over his family, and may be absent for work, or in death, permanently removed from the position of family protector. As these were real challenges faced by many, combined with the accessibility of certain remedies that are rooted in financial privilege, at a fundamental level the concept of honor was something that was important for upper social classes and relaxed for lower classes.²⁷

The above described conditions dealt primarily with women that were Spanish or criolla, whereas Indigenous women faced different challenges and rules. The same protections and stipulations surrounding honor were not held for the majority of them, as Irene Silverblatt presents in, *Moon, sun, and witches: gender ideologies and class in Inca and colonial Peru*. One immediate challenge lies with the notion of a strong, capable male guardian being present to defend a family against transgressions, since “Under the colonial system, in contrast to the Inca system of tribute appropriation, all indigenous men of ‘common origin’ between the ages of eighteen and fifty-regardless of marital status-were subject to tribute demand” (126). For this reason, only elite male members of Indigenous society could be present to assist their families when needed, leaving the majority ripe for abuse during the long periods in which the fathers were absent. Tributary demands also resulted in the exploitation of Indigenous women’s labor by high levels of authoritative power, “Colonial administrators commonly abused women. The Corregidor’s, most of whom envisioned their stay in the colonies as a way to make quick money, obliged women to weave

clothing for them at less than half the free market rate” (135). They were the most vulnerable to exploitation, having little economic resources or social status to assist them against abuses.

Indigenous women of elite social classes had notable advantages over women of lower social classes, as is true in any society. As discussed, since systems in place in Spain acted as the foundation from which Spaniards established themselves in the New World, a small portion of women from the Indigenous population used the Spanish customs of inheritance to their benefit. One such custom was the claiming of personal ownership of land as a right, “The Spanish conquest introduced to the Andes new concepts of property ownership and land tenure, along with a complex legal system through which these forms were maintained and transmitted” (Silverblatt 114). For a tiny percentage of Indigenous women in the post-conquest era, these rights allowed them to declare claims to land through inheritance. Silverblatt explains that, “These women, however(...), as descendants of the Inca dynasty, did not just receive use-rights, but actual titles of ownership. They could, therefore, personally dispose of their fields according to the dictates of Spanish law” (114). As Silverblatt concludes, the only obstacle to these noble Indigenous women enjoying the control and sale of their property could be a husband, which by law labelled women as minors under the care of the male in marriage (133). For this reason, staying unmarried was the only way for a woman from the Indigenous population to ensure control over property claims made through her birthright, though once again, this was limited to a small proportion of the Indigenous population.

There is one more point about Indigenous women that should be mentioned; their involvement in the markets as merchants. As men were primarily mining or working in other labor-intensive roles, women had the opportunity to venture into the commercial side of Potosí. Jane Mangan asserts that Indigenous women used the rules within the colonial landscape to their advantage, edging out European competitors, both men and women, for

similar types of goods. Mangan states how one Indigenous woman named Leonor Sasytom sold a variety of native Andean clothing in the late 1500s, such as, “*acsus* (dresses) and *llicllas* (shawls), cinched at the waist with *chumbes* (belts) and fastened at the shoulders with decorated gold or silver *topos* (dress pins)” (134), to name a few items. As mentioned in the previous chapter, this was a period of time in following the technological advances made by the Toledo reforms that various forms of currency were used in the markets by Spaniards and Indigenous alike (7), and Sasytom too participated in these opportunities. Mangan states that, “the manner in which people obtained the clothes—paying pesos, buying on credit or in exchange for pawn items—represented new types of exchanges” (134),²⁸ demonstrating that Indigenous women were not only engaged in commercial exchange, but in the most versatile types of exchanges, accepting different kinds of compensation for their goods.

There was one particular rule that made all the difference for Indigenous merchants when it came time to compete with European competitors. Mangan states that, “...Spanish laws did not require indigenous men and women to pay sales tax, the *alcabala*, on goods considered native products” (139),²⁹ meaning that all the previously mentioned Andean goods were exempt from taxation. The exemption was a point of contention among Spaniards who considered it difficult to compete against, as it did place them at an economic disadvantage relative to their Indigenous competitors when dealing in certain wares. As Enrique Tandeter asserts in “Indians in Late Colonial Markets: Sources and Numbers”, the *alcabala* was a point of contention for centuries. It was not until late in the eighteenth century that it was cancelled. Tandeter states that on:

January 30, 1779, as part of the Bourbon drive to increase fiscal revenues, Jose Antonio de Areche, the general inspector (*visitador general*) of the viceroyalties of Peru and the Rio de la Plata, decreed the end of this tax exemption. Areche noted that the original exemption included the clause ‘for now’ and that, two centuries later, the

moment had come to increase Crown revenues by means of abolishing the Indian tax privileges. (201)

The decree was ineffective however, or rather, rejected by the colonial authorities, and the exemption remained with only the condition that Indigenous merchants accurately report their goods sold, while still maintaining their tax exemption. Overall, the use of the alcabala allowed for Indigenous merchants to truly compete in the sale of certain goods at markets with a significant economic advantage for over two centuries after the conquest. In the historical context of the city, Potosí certainly had its share of commercially savvy Indigenous women who embraced the capitalistic style of European commercial exchanges to their advantage. Specific women of this type are not common in Arzáns' text but were important enough to be listed alongside official lists of individuals who paid taxes originating from merchant business.³⁰ What is also curious is that the term alcabala, widely known and officially implemented in the New World, and as Mangan points out, clearly cited and used in Potosí, is absent in Arzáns' text. Not once does it appear, which begs the question of why Arzáns omitted it, especially when one considers that Arzáns routinely discussed taxation as it related to Spanish merchants.

The “Exchange” of Women: A theoretical approach

The “exchange” of women is something that is interpreted differently depending on the author, location, and period in which each occur. It is a concept directly linked to the deliberate oppression of women and the processes of maintaining that oppression. However, there were some that used the concept in a procedural sense among tribal groups to describe how cultures functioned in more isolated and past times. Lévi-Strauss proposed in *The Elementary Structures of Kinship* that the “exchanges” of women were rooted in overall larger processes that seek to maintain societal bonds between different, non-related groups of

tribes to ensure both access to women, and to other transactions of food and items necessary for the long-term development of a people. The “exchange” of women, sisters, mothers, and aunts, permitted for men the reciprocal acquisition of other women from external family units, preventing and eliminating the need for incest, which Lévi-Strauss affirms on numerous occasions throughout as being an unacceptable taboo behavior in all tribal units (47-48). Maintaining positive relations among these tribal groups was to the benefit of all involved, ensuring access to women. Even during times of war, the exchanges of goods and women were maintained among certain tribes for the importance that such bonds represented, regardless of conflict (Lévi-Strauss 323). The work of Lévi-Strauss on exchanges and gifts are later adopted and expanded upon by Marshall Sahlins in *Stone Age Economics*. Both authors heavily build upon the notion of formal and highly ceremonial transactional exchanges of goods and women, as well as the notion of the gift, which also is heavily involved with the expectation of ceremonial giving and reciprocity (153-155).

A more focused consideration of the “exchange” of women lies with Gayle Rubin, who states in "The traffic in women: notes on the 'Political economy' of sex", that the process of exchange as described by Lévi-Strauss is too self-limiting due to its mercantilization of women and the primitive societies in which the argument is made. Rubin expands the notion and argues that the “exchange” of women is, "attractive in that it places the oppression of women within social systems, rather than in biology. Moreover, it suggests that we look for the ultimate locus of women's oppression within the traffic in women, rather than within the traffic of merchandise" (45). Rubin adds that one need not find it difficult to locate examples of the trafficking in women, since women are, “given in marriage, taken in battle, exchanged for favors, sent as tribute, traded, bought, and sold. These practices seem to become more pronounced and commercialized in 'civilized' societies” (46). These exchanges involving women are at the heart of Arzáns' text.³¹

Rubin offers both an alternative and a development of Lévi-Strauss' work in what she terms the sex/gender system. She defines it as, "the set of arrangements by which a society transforms biological sexuality into products of human activity, and in which these transformed sexual needs are satisfied" (34). Such a sex/gender system as termed by Rubin allows for a more relevant and focused observation of the "exchange" of women in Arzáns' text. A sex/gender system exists in any given society, and, "Sex is sex, what counts as sex is equally culturally determined and obtained. Every society has a sex/gender system—a set of arrangements by which the biological raw material of human sex and procreation is shaped by human, social intervention and satisfied in a conventional manner, no matter how bizarre some of the conventions may be" (Rubin 39). In this way, the "exchange" of women in Arzáns' text is not merely observable through the social structures by which women are "obtained", but also through the behaviors of those responsible for them, and others who subverted the system for their own gain.

Case 1 – Francisca and the imposter servant

In the chapter corresponding to year 1676, the narrator recounts three events that at first seem to be unrelated: An unnamed priest breaks his vows by giving into temptations of the flesh, an Indigenous couple mourn for the sudden loss of their only son to illness, and a young girl is deceived by a treacherous man in order to take her virginity at knifepoint. Each case is separate insofar that the individuals of each event do not know one another, but they share a driving force that leads them towards the divine, molding their behavior for the future. All three cases involve as part of their resolution the individuals placing themselves in an unwavering service to God. In the resolution of the first case, the priest and his lover contemplate the nature of their relationship as sinful, devoting themselves to God's work instead, fearful of the potential for divine retribution should they instead choose to continue living in sin. The Indigenous couple experiences a miracle as their recently deceased child is

resurrected by divine intervention after placing his body in the local church and kneeling to pray for an extended period of time. In this case, after the resurrection, many witnesses and the parents gave thanks to God for the life of the child, and the miracle is publicized and praised. The third case of the young woman and the treacherous man results in her obtaining some manner of restitution for the crimes against her, before she too devotes herself to the service to God for the remainder of her life. They all continued living in service to the Lord and find comfort and satisfaction by placing their lives in God.

The three cases told in 1676 mark a common trend throughout Arzáns' work that has been mentioned previously: the focus is placed upon the moral judgement of the behaviors of Potosí's citizens and the consequences of their actions for themselves and the city. In this chapter of the text, the cases are evidence of choices leading to positive moral behavior, often tied to the worship of God or leading a life as a good Christian. By doing so, the priest avoids divine punishment, the devout Indigenous couple experience the resurrection of their son, and the young woman whose case we will now examine will resolve her challenges, spending the remainder of her life in service to God.

As the *Historia* goes, the young woman was named Francisca Mirueña. She was born in Oruro to doña Feliciana, who herself was born in the New World, in Los Reyes. After a short three years of marriage, Feliciana's husband, who was also Francisca's father, passed away from an unexpected illness. The family moved to Potosí now lacking a permanent male guardian in the household. The year 1676 marked an important time in the life of the daughter, doña Francisca, as she reached fourteen years of age. This was a noteworthy age since it had been previously agreed to as the moment when Francisca would enter into marriage with a man named, "don Luis de Villasirga, caballero del hábito de Santiago, que estaba en Los Reyes" (Arzáns II 279).

The narrator does not expand upon the importance of don Luis' affiliation as a caballero del hábito de Santiago, however it is a detail that speaks volumes with regard to the current social status of the man and past ancestry of his family. Military orders such as this can be traced back to the reconquest of Spain, as A.J. Forey states, "Santiago was founded in 1170" (201),³² as orders created appropriate infrastructure to defend what had been recaptured, and so, "one of the main tasks allotted to them was the defense and sometimes also the construction of strongholds in the frontier region" (202). In practice, the orders had few responsibilities after much of the initial reconquest. In the New World, the orders again made their presence known, and as L.P. Wright states, some of the most well-known and impactful men in the history of the New World were involved with one order or another (37).

As Wright affirms, the individuals who joined the orders in sixteenth and seventeenth century Spain compared to earlier during the twelfth century reconquest did so for quite different reasons, and the requirements to do so were different as well. During this later time, there were, "well over a thousand caballeros de hábito, knights with no land or income apart from a derisory *real* a day for their upkeep" (39), with no hope of utilizing the membership for financial gain. Instead, Wright states that the drive for membership was a drive towards *Hidalguía*, which "was the first essential quality which formed the basis of all nobility; entry into the Orders was, in theory at least, impossible without it, for personal merit was still widely considered the exclusive preserve of the blood aristocracy" (39). Merit alone was not sufficient to obtain entry into the order of Santiago, and assumption of the hábito was "by no means an archaic ritual: it was at once a proof of family *nobleza* and *limpieza de sangre*, and a major step up the ladder of the noble hierarchy" (43), requiring a young man to prove his lineage as worthy to even be considered. While the orders were no longer necessary in terms of their initial purpose, they served as a clear distinction between social classes, rewarding those lineages who remained pure of blood, and encouraging a strict selection of marriage

partner to ensure that such standards remained in place for their families. The narrator then has ever so casually name-dropped this tightly controlled institution singling don Luis de Villasirga's status. While the narrator says little of Francisca in terms of her family heritage and social status, her arrangement to marry don Luis clearly mark the pair of individuals as socially equivalent and appropriate partners for marriage.

As Francisca's family unit permanently lacked a male guardian in the form of father or husband, it was doña Feliciana who remained to undertake the responsibility to arrange the details of an appropriate marriage for her daughter. The "exchange" of women, in this case, involved Francisca being transferred from her original family unit, in this case from her mother, to the responsibility of her future husband in a newly formed family unit. Her mother transfers not only possession of her daughter, but also responsibility and obligation. In this sense the mother receives relief, as the liability is no longer present in her day to day life. Conversely, the future husband does not merely gain a wife through matrimony, he also accepts the increased responsibility associated with maintaining the honor of not only himself, but of his new wife in their newly formed family. Don Luis would also gain from this exchange not only a wife, but also the means to produce a legitimate heir in a manner to pass on his elite family lineage and social status. All of this would come to pass, so long as a number of strict conditions be maintained in primarily controlling her honor and sexuality.

However, the narrator tells us there was an incident that changed everything in the months leading up to the agreed upon date for marriage. Don Luis travelled outside of Potosí to distract himself from the beauty of his fiancé. After Francisca's birthday, don Luis received the correspondence he had been waiting for, informing him that at last doña Francisca was of age to be married. The narrator describes don Luis as just and honorable, which fits the type of profile expected of a member of the order of Santiago. He travelled with his servant, a

Spaniard named Pedro de Triesta, who developed a particularly unhealthy obsession with doña Francisca, Arzáns says that Triesta “...andaba perdido idolatrando en su hermosura” (II 279). Such lustful thoughts of infatuation are harmless, if left as nothing more than thoughts, but taken any further, they risk trespassing the norms of the social systems in the colonial space. It is this man named Triesta who causes significant trouble for everyone else in this case.

Don Luis began his preparations to return to the city to be married and stated that within a month he and his servant would begin the journey home. At this point, the narrator states that Triesta, “como estaba muy vivo su amor” (II 279), began his own plans to have Francisca for himself. The narrator seems to construct a contradiction as in the preceding paragraph he described Triesta as simply worshiping her beauty at first, to having strong feeling of love, though Triesta’s true intentions be revealed as we see his ill-intent manifest.

The story continues with Triesta sneaking away from his master, stealing approximately 20,000 pesos to aid himself in his grand scheme, which was not simply to seek a monetary gain in nature. Had Triesta sought only to be wealthy, the theft of the money would have been sufficient, perhaps even for the rest of his life.³³ Instead, the stolen pesos were but one necessary component of a larger plan to steal his master’s fiancé in his place; in other words, to supplant his master and to be with Francisca.

With a substantial amount of money now at his disposal, Triesta moved onto a plan of pure deception with Francisca as both target and ultimate goal for acquisition. Triesta impersonated his master don Luis, first through letters, “falseando la firma de su amo, escribió muy enamorado a doña Francisca diciéndole que...dentro de cuatro días...se hallaría en sus brazos, pues eran ya los de su propia mujer” (II 279). Upon receiving Triesta’s correspondence with the forged name of don Luis, doña Francisca fell without hesitation into his trap, and “llena de terribles incendios con la confianza de que aquel caballero había de ser

su marido” (II 279) agreed to his requests. Triesta -passing as don Luis- arranged a meeting with Francisca, stating that above all else, “lo más que le suplicaba era el que su madre no supiese ni por indicio su venida ni llegada” (II 279), which was necessary to prevent Francisca’s mother from discovering his plans. Francisca’s reaction to the letter ensured that this would be possible, arranging a spot where she would await don Luis at ten in the evening with the aid of one of her trusted servants on the day that he would arrive to Potosí.

For an unmarried woman to engage in such a clandestine meeting would surely cause a scandal among individuals of their social class, however, as Susan Socolow affirms, concerns about the honor of a woman and her virginity entered a grey zone under these types of circumstances. Don Luis and Francisca were not strangers to one another or even good friends, but instead nearing the end of a long-standing agreement to enter into marriage. Among much of Colonial society, this often brought an unofficial, “acceptance of sexual relations between espoused persons...a woman did not lose her honor as much by giving her virginity to the man she was to marry as she did by failing to marry that man” (Socolow 226). Doña Francisca’s reaction to the proposal in the amorously worded letter was typical behavior at the time in colonial society, and still she took the appropriate steps to ensure that everything remain as private as possible by meeting late at night, away from prying eyes to avoid speculation as to the nature of her fiancé’s visit. If don Luis had been the one seeking to meet doña Francisca, there would have been little issue if discovered in the public realm, providing of course that the marriage came to fruition, and therefore the cooperation of Francisca was understandable.

The day of the planned meeting, Triesta arrived at midnight at the home, two hours later than agreed, and he was granted access as planned by one of the servants. As doña Francisca believed that her fiancé would not arrive because his tardiness, “(desesperada de que viniese) se desnudó y acostó en aquel cuarto en una cama que la criada le dispuso allí por

no poder volver a su camarín sin ser sentida de su madre” (II 279). The tardiness of Triesta was simply another part of his plan as the narrator let us know, “eso es lo que el malvado...había prevenido, hallarla acostada para ejecutar su mal intento” (II 279), and now the narrator is describing Triesta with words such as “malvado”, giving us a glimpse into how he perceives the individual.

At this point, Triesta is in possession of his former master’s money, has stolen his identity through the forging of letters, and now covers his own face in a continuing masquerade to secure access to doña Francisca, “con una montera de embozo” (280). His efforts proved successful, and Triesta reached her. When the two were alone in the room, he admitted his identity but tried to continue his deception distorting the truth of his social class, “Sabed que soy Pedro de Triesta, compañero de don Luis de Villasirga vuestro dueño, no criado como se entiende, que los nobles no son de particulares” (II 280). He states that he has acquired, for her, a sum of 20,000 pesos, a carefully chosen statement since the acquisition was in fact a theft. Finally, he makes one final, futile attempt to convince Francisca by slandering the reputation of don Luis with a false accusation of unfaithfulness and womanizing behavior, at which point the narrator interjects forcefully to convey his opinion of Triesta, “¡oh traidor, mil veces ingrato a tu señor!” (II 280). The narrator echoes what Francisca displays in her own total and complete rejection of Triesta’s actions and motives, which will not bode well for the future as Triesta moves to respond.

As the narrator, Francisca answers first by commenting on the general nature of men, “no dudo yo que don Luis pudiera haberme trocado con otra indigna de su persona, pues es hombre y lo puede hacer como lo hacen otros muchos” (II 280), and then by honing in specifically on the truth of the treachery at hand, “pero lo más a que me inclino es a tener por mentira cuanto me habéis dicho y que todo me huele a traición” (II 280). Francisca is nobody's fool and reacts in a reasonable manner to the incredulous proposal put forth by

Triesta, and even if she did believe him, it would be wildly unreasonable to assume that she would accept his proposal, so easily abandoning those rigid social systems that have been a fundamental part of her upbringing. Francisca knows well her social status, that of don Luis who is considered her equal for marriage, and most certainly, that Triesta is not sufficiently equal in terms of social positioning to make such a proposition to her. Francisca leaves no doubt as to her beliefs about Triesta, “vos que siendo su criado (aunque lo negáis) me da a entender vuestra arenga que en todo sois de bajas obligaciones” (II 280). Despite all of Triesta’s planning and scheming, the large sum of money he had stolen from his master, along with the forging of his name in order to deceive those around him that he is of equal stature, his actions fell well short of tricking this young criolla.³⁴

Francisca handles the rejection of this inappropriate proposal quite well, but unfortunately for her, Triesta reacts with savagery. Unable to reach his lofty and unrealistic goal of being equal to his master don Luis through trickery and theft, Triesta regresses to the worst kind of behavior, like so many others whose sinful actions brought the inevitable divine wrath inflicted upon the city of Potosí.³⁵ He moves to complete his conquest of Francisca without her consent, “todo puede ser como decís, pero pues la ocasión se me ha venido a las manos no la he de perder, y así con vuestra licencia o sin ella yo os he de gozar” (Arzáns II 280). For her part, Francisca did attempt to remove herself from the situation, but to no effect, because “Levantóse la doncella con terrible furia, y queriendo arremeter a abrir las puertas la detuvo el malvado, y echando mano a un puñal le dijo que la haría pedazos si levantaba la voz y no le permitía hacer su gusto” (II 280). With a threat against her life, Francisca found herself with no choice, if she wished to remain alive, “Entonces con la turbación cayó en el suelo, y tomándola en brazos aquel mal hombre la tornó a su lecho adonde hizo lo que quiso de ella, y después atándola de pies y manos se salió de aquel cuarto” (II 280). Triesta failed in his attempt to seduce the young Francisca, but no matter, for he still conquered the young girl

with a real threat of violence instead. As Marianne Hester states in *Lewd Women and Wicked Witches*, “to use the penis, which is probably the most vulnerable part of a man’s anatomy, as a weapon seems ridiculous. But in rape that is exactly what men are doing” (45). With the despicable act completed, Triesta calmly left the scene of his terrible crime.

The sexual assault of Francisca marks a crucial turning point in her life, both for the unacceptable violation of her mind and body, and for the change in her status as a virgin, which will affect her path for the future as an appropriate spouse for don Luis. While terrible, acts of such a nature were further problematic in colonial society because of the complexity of processes and requirements necessary to attain any form of satisfaction by the victims and their families, and the same rings true even today. As Asunción Lavrin explains in her text *Sexuality in Colonial Mexico*, during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries there were social norms and legal precedents put into place to punish acts of sexual violence, however, “Despite the readiness to punish the crime of rape with haste, the mechanisms of justice had little to offer to the women involved” (70). First, the cases required that the primary complainant in all situations be the male guardian responsible for safeguarding the honor of the family name in question (70). In a situation that was not unusual for the time, such a male guardian is absent in Francisca’s life following the death of her father. Second, if a complainant in the form of a male guardian were available, as will be the case for Francisca, as the narrator will soon present, the end result would only be financial compensation for the loss of virginity, something that Francisca did not need.³⁶ Third, and perhaps the most important point, was that any process that sought to indemnify the woman would immediately become public knowledge, and so too would the dishonor that would come to her name. In the case of Francisca, there could be negative implications for her proposed marriage (Lavrin 71).³⁷ Rather than make any attempt to resolve the assault against her in the ways just mentioned, Francisca instead took charge to execute a plan that would bring about

some form of satisfaction while ensuring that the truth of the events of that night remain forever hidden within a veil of secrecy.

The narrator states that Francisca worked quickly and relied upon the service and total discretion of two individuals, beginning with her servant, that she “la mandó al punto que siguiese a aquel hombre con el secreto que pudiese y advirtiese bien su posada” (Arzáns II 281), and who returned after successfully following and observing the location where Triesta had gone without being detected. With the information in hand, Francisca wrote to the second individual that would help to exact her revenge, “Lucas Álvarez... era un hombre ya de edad, natural de esta Villa, de nobles obligaciones...el cual tenía parentesco con doña Francisca por parte de su padre” (II 281). Without a father of her own, Francisca selected a substitute paternal figure with notable similarities to what her father would have offered, and who knew her father in life.

As a matter of fact, the absence of the father seems to be a condition for Francisca's story. Triesta created a deceptive plan that worked more or less as intended, but its success hinged upon the condition that he meet with Francisca alone to control the situation. Perhaps the plan would not have been attempted had there been a male guardian present as well, but then again, it may have made no difference since Triesta's threat was to slice up Francisca should she raise her voice in alarm. Since Arzáns has chosen to present a case in which a young woman is assaulted, and it is explicitly mentioned that her father is deceased, it cannot be ignored. This lack of a paternal guardian resonates with what Socolow details in *The Women of Colonial Latin America*, “women, even temporarily without husband, father, or brothers, were treated as ownerless property, waiting to be claimed through sexual prowess” (153). While Francisca's family is without a male guardian in the traditional sense due to the death of her father, Francisca shows an understanding of the importance of being able to access such a dependable individual that was obligated to protect the honor of a family and its

name. Lucas Álvarez, the surrogate male guardian, rushed to act as that primary protector of family honor, “volvió a su casa y se previno de otro ligero caballo y las armas necesarias, porque el traidor había hecho lo mismo, y dando aviso a la afligida doña Francisca la consoló y esperanzó de que presto se hallaría vengada” (II 281). This leads the reader to believe that the resolution would be rooted in violence, which is a key point to keep in mind for later on, when we consider that Francisca was not capable of engaging in such a resolution herself, but only through the aid of others, such as a substitute father figure.

Francisca received the news from Álvarez, and replied with haste, “ella se lo envió a agradecer con la criada llevándole también 200 pesos para aviarse y tres sortijas de oro con piedras de gran valor” (II 281). However, Álvarez rejected all compensation, taking only one of the three rings to wear as a token, “para infundirle valor” (II 281). It is no small gesture that the narrator has chosen to state that Álvarez rejected any form of payment. In this case, financial consideration is not accepted as part of the assistance. Álvarez acts to avenge Francisca, as a close friend of the father of Francisca in life prior to his death, he works to fulfill that essential role, or better yet, to take his place. Meanwhile, we have already seen that money was also of no interest to Francisca when Triesta tried to seduce her. For Francisca and Alvarado, honor is something that money cannot buy, and it creates a clear point of difference when considering Triesta, who believed that with sufficient funds, Francisca could be persuaded to forget all about her honor and commitments to don Luis. Put another way, Triesta’s actions to persuade Francisca to leave with him by speaking of the “acquired” twenty thousand pesos, and not of the sexual assault, can perhaps reveal how an individual of lower classes treated relationships and money. As Mannarelli states, “there was little control wielded over the sexual behavior of women belonging to subordinate social groups...society would be less interested in illegitimacy occurring among the lower social orders because their position was of less importance to the larger social structure” (100). In this sense, with Triesta

occupying a lower social position than his master, perhaps he genuinely believed that all he needed to woo Francisca was a sufficiently large offering of money.

Armed with weapons, a fresh horse, and the symbolic courage of Francisca's ring, Álvarez gave chase. After much travel, Álvarez located and confronted Triesta who was escaping from the city with two companions, "Alonso de Prada (su paisano) y el criado [un mulato]" (II 281), all of whom were armed to defend themselves. Álvarez wasted no time in declaring his intentions, "venía a satisfacer el agravio que había hecho al capitán don Luis de Villasirga y a doña Francisca Mirueña, y luego retándole de traidor, fementido, ingrato y aleve, le convidó a batalla lanza a lanza porque el Triesta también la traía, aunque de asta muy corta" (II 281). The act of such a formal declaration by Álvarez fell well within normal behavior for the time as Mannarelli states, "another option to regain honor is a duel by a male family member against the offender. However, everyone in society would know of the offense, which does little to actually regain honor" (108). In this circumstance, Álvarez has acted according to colonial society norms in demanding a duel as a means of solving the problem of lost honor, and the decision is also strategic in that it was done in a location where there was no one to hear it outside of the offender and his allies. This declaration made by Álvarez is a unique blend of tradition and performance. On the one hand, Johnson affirms in *The faces of honor: sex, shame, and violence in colonial Latin America* that in some cases, we can observe the public nature of honor and redemption when attempting to rectify a damaged reputation (1), and yet, Álvarez has made a declaration seemingly to the smallest possible group. Yes, he has stated his objective to the three men, but he then proceeded to kill the primary offender and the servant. It is a blend of the formal declaration of intent to restore honor lost, combined with the privacy to ensure that the news does not spread further than it already has.

The narrator writes in detail how over the course of an hour the four men engaged in combat until, tired and beaten, Lucas Álvarez defeated all three of his opponents. Triesta lay mortally wounded with little time left to live, and despite his despicable behavior towards Francisca, Álvarez did the honorable thing and allowed Triesta's cousin to go and locate a priest, “le trajesen un confesor...llevólo adonde estaba Pedro de Triesta y administrándoselos, pasadas dos horas murió con muestras de arrepentimiento de sus culpas” (Arzáns II 282). Despite his behavior, Triesta died well, with the courtesy afforded to him that would have been extended to other men of a certain class, while the mulato who also perished, is not mentioned again and there is no reason to believe that he also had the opportunity to die well. Triesta's death may or may not have been part of Álvarez's plan from the beginning, and the narrator does not mention an intention to kill or simply defeat his opponent in combat. One thing that is certain, however, is that Triesta's death results in the most convenient outcome for Francisca, with vengeance served for the crime against her while also permanently silencing the offender. The knowledge of those events would remain a secret thanks to Francisca's quick thinking and Álvarez for substituting the missing role of paternal guardian.

With the duel complete, Álvarez returned to Francisca to explain in detail all that had occurred, “alegre esta señora (Francisca) de su venganza agradeció el beneficio y luego dio cuenta de todo a su madre, que atónita de oír tales sucesos no sabía qué hacerse” (II 282). Francisca then also informed her *prometido* don Luis of everything that transpired at the hands of his servant, omitting no detail or truth, “y también suplicándole se volviese a Lima y se casase con quien tuviese gusto porque ella ya veía cómo estaba de inútil para su honor” (II 282). Despite successfully attaining her vengeance through the use of Álvarez, a suitable substitute male guardian for her absent father, and maintaining the events that transpired private, keeping her honor in the eyes of the general public unharmed, Francisca considered herself as no longer suitable to be the wife of don Luis. He meanwhile replied, stating,

“lastimado de aquel caso la envió a consolar y ofrecer su hacienda, pero doña Francisca nada aceptó y sólo sí tornó a suplicarle que se volviese a Lima, como lo hizo, y ella se estuvo en esta Villa llorando siempre su desdicha” (II 282). Francisca then commits the remainder of her life to the service of others, and “Al cabo de 10 años así pasó de esta vida, habiendo éstos ocupándolos en obras de virtud frecuentando los sacramentos y ejercitándose en grande caridad con los pobres” (II 282), letting virtuous acts become her legacy.³⁸ In making this choice for herself, Francisca spends the rest of her life removed from the system of marriage, refusing to submit to any man.

Regarding the “exchange” of women in this case, the arrangements through which colonial society transformed biological sexuality into products of human activity for the control of women are evident through the sex/gender systems. The case of Francisca shows that women could take charge of their own futures by having internalized the system. For Francisca to be an appropriate candidate for marriage to don Luis, her social status and virginity were of the utmost importance, and after losing the latter to the imposter Triesta, Francisca considered herself no longer a suitable partner in marriage, even though don Luis did not agree. Despite Francisca lacking a father figure to make the arrangements for her to marry, Francisca’s mother, Feliciana, was able to successfully do so. Feliciana ensured not only that her daughter would marry, but that the man was of appropriate social status at least equal to that of Francisca, and that she maintained her virginity. The narrator presented don Luis as a man who was honorable, and of noble background. Despite the successful match made by her mother, and don Luis’ willingness to proceed even after the violation of Triesta, it was Francisca who ultimately decided, unhindered, to remove herself completely as a candidate for marriage, rejecting the agreements made regarding her exchange from being a ward of her mother to a ward of her future husband. Although the specifics are not given afterwards, the narrator is clear that Francisca spent the next ten years of her life acting on her

own terms and as she saw fit helping those less fortunate than herself, choosing a life of virtue over one as a spouse. This control over her own life allows Francisca to remove herself from circulation, so to speak, effectively allowing no one to “exchange” her within the expected procedures of marriage.

There is also a point to be made regarding the range of consequences for the most immoral individuals in the text. Triesta engaged in deception and absolute vile behavior, transgressing against Francisca and don Luis in different ways. Triesta was able to write letters and pass them off as those of don Luis, going undetected by Francisca. This first successful step allowed Triesta to step into his master’s shoes, so to speak, and present himself from a position of authority, with all the privilege that entails, in this case to arrange the secret meeting with Francisca. Then, Triesta successfully stole 20,000 pesos from his master and then left him when it best suited him. In this way Triesta knew briefly the excessive wealth known only to the most elite of society. While the method was immoral to be sure, the enrichment of so many Spaniards in the New World originated from the massive theft and appropriation in conquering the Indigenous population. Ultimately, Triesta is not punished for the theft of money, nor is it even mentioned in the resolution of the duel because as we have seen, money is not what matters in this case. We know that the narrator does not shy away from chastising men and women in the text who behave in morally negative ways, and that often those individuals die tragic, violent, or divine deaths. And yet, while the narrator criticized Triesta for his actions, his death was unlike other sinners in the text, for example in the chapter corresponding to the year 1653, regarding Antonio Bran de Brizuela (II 147), and the chapter corresponding to the year 1661, regarding Gaspar Díaz de Santos (II 203). These are two common examples where individuals who sinned were chastised and punished severely for their actions. Triesta meanwhile received an honorable death by an honorable opponent, Lucas Álvarez, and given the opportunity he died a good death after

confessing his sins, even though he was condemned by the narrator for his despicable actions. This end to Triesta differs from the majority of deaths given to the most immoral individuals in the text, and perhaps instead of being a focus on the less harsh punishments for Triesta, this should be read as a testament to the character of Álvarez for allowing such a death despite the despicable behavior.

Some of these actions could be viewed as a desire to break free of a pre-determined low social status. Triesta tries to break free of his class constraints even if by using theft and deception, and he obtains a good death at the hands of an honorable opponent. Triesta attempted to climb up the social ladder of the New World without concern about whom he trespassed along the way. He faced condemnation from the narrator and swift justice for his actions. In the *Historia*, as wealth in itself does not make one a good citizen of Potosí, only proper, honorable behavior does.

Ultimately, despite all of Triesta's terrible actions, the focus of the chapter falls on Francisca. After the events of that night, the narrator describes how she spent the following ten years lamenting her bad luck and serving the poor. By working daily towards charity, she puts the needs of others ahead of her own, while also taking control of her destiny. Fooled by Triesta, she pays this price through her own moral behavior to obtain her own good death. Whatever her exact motivations which we as readers are not made fully aware of, the narrator does not condemn her choices. She removes herself from the "exchange" of women with the rejection of marriage, instead she serves others through charity, and so she too benefits the city positively without the need to fall within the normal constraints of marriage and reproduction, or by submitting to a convent. Much in the same way that Quiroga impacted the city in a positive manner through his altruistic behavior, Francisca too works towards the greater good of Potosí through a vastly different set of circumstances, with both individuals embracing morally good behavior, which the author commends throughout the text.

Case 2 - Floriana and the unwelcome attention

In the chapter corresponding to year 1598, the narrator presents a series of events that all pertain to one young woman, and unlike the previous chapter, focuses on nothing else. This is a slight deviation in format from the majority of chapters that, as seen for example with the chapter involving Francisca, contain the history of different events from a year, as well as notable occurrences to more than one individual. However, the model used in the chapter dedicated to 1598 is not an isolated occurrence and underlines a particular narrative interest in the case. Gunnar Mendoza remarks that this chapter seems modelled after themes seen in the *Novelas ejemplares* by Cervantes (I civ), which reveals several parallels in theme and plot as seen in “El celoso extremeño” (155), though this is not specifically stated by Arzáns to be the case.

The narrator introduces the reader to a young woman named Doña Floriana Rosales, mentioning that he is taking the story from three sources, Pedro Méndes, Antonio de Acosta y Juan Sobrino. Floriana was daughter to two Extremadurans of noble background named Don Alvaro Rosales Montero and Doña Ana Quintanal, and the youngest sibling to two brothers. She was the first of their family born in the New World, in the “valle de Tarapaya que aunque no es muy caliente...es bueno y se goza mejor la vida” (I 235), and not in Potosí, as decided by her mother. Floriana stayed in Tarapaya until the age of three before moving to Potosí, which became her home from that moment onward. The narrator describes Floriana as a beautiful young woman, which like other women in Arzáns’ text, that beauty was a source of constant, unwanted attention from men, both prospective, appropriate suitors in terms of social rank, and from men who were driven only by lust. Despite the repeated advances of these men, Floriana had no interest in any suitors and took careful steps to avoid such individuals, “ejercitada siempre en la virtud y recogimiento de su casa...huyendo las

ocasiones de ver y ser mirada de los hombres, que en mirar incauto hace tal vez se ame lo que no se quisiera haber amado” (I 235). Despite her efforts to remain unseen, persistent men worked tirelessly to catch glimpses of her as she travelled from her home to the church, or at the market, where she would purchase prayer candles. Unlike the previous case, this chapter involves three men of otherwise good reputation and decent social background.

The narrator presents the first suitor as Captain Rodrigo de Albuquerque, stating that his business in Potosí was to raise troops and the necessary finances in order to serve the King’s interests in nearby Chile. He was also, the narrator tells us, publicly committed to marriage in La Plata to a woman his equal. His public engagement is sufficient reason to disqualify him from having any association with Floriana, yet he would persist. The second man is not named, however he is signaled to be a governor of Tucumán who was initially only passing through the city on his way to Los Reyes, but who was so shocked by the beauty of Floriana that he remained in Potosí for the sole purpose of courting her, through legitimate means at first, and as we will see, illegitimate means later. The third man presented is Don Julio Sánchez Farfán, the *corregidor* of Porco, whose involvement was at first more a coincidence, but then deliberate and unwavering in his desire. Arzáns states that “fuera de estos caballeros forasteros había otros vecinos pretendientes, y unos y otros a toda hora rondaban la calle de aquella hermosa doncella” (I 235), so the young Floriana was constantly surrounded by unsolicited attention; however Arzáns focuses on only these three men who, similar to Triesta, begin a chain of events that will permanently change the course of Floriana’s life.

The narrator is clear in describing Floriana as resolute in her vigilance to remain unseen and not provoke the innumerable men who sought her attention. Despite this, the governor was somehow able to have a note placed on a desk for Floriana to find inside of her family residence. While the words committed to paper were not strictly speaking romantic in

nature, the very act enraged Floriana, and the narrator states that the signature to the note read, “Criado de vuestra merced, el gobernador”, with the content of its writing omitted by previous authors that told the story due to its inappropriate content and being undeserving of retransmission to the reader. How the governor was able to smuggle his inappropriate declaration of ill-intent into the home is unknown, according to the narrator (I 235).

Regardless of what steps were taken to ensure the message reached Floriana, her reaction indicates her disapproval, “porque otra cosa no merecía lo entregó al fuego que en un brasero le deparó allí su enojo” (I 235).

At this point, Floriana decides not to communicate the matter to her parents because of their already bad image of the *gobernador*. She instead decides to answer herself, as the narrator tells us, writing as though she were in fact her parents, to deal with the matter herself, a transgression of norms that would normally put her father in charge. Floriana writes to the governor stating, “Hanme dicho que el cielo os negó el nacer de nobles padres, y yo así lo creo por lo que acredita la desatención de vuestro papel; más él tuvo su merecido porque semejantes liviandades no merecen otra cosa que el fuego” (I 235). The governor mistakenly assumed that the reply was from her father, and that he was considered unworthy of her daughter, therefore he sought to duel Floriana’s father. The result was a predictable mix of confusion, rejection, and only the briefest of scraps between the two men occurred before two passing ladies intervened, “no sin falta de valor se metieron de por medio, y tan buena maña se dieron que apartándolos no los dejaron volver acometerse” (I 236). When Don Alvaro returned home from his unexpected duel, Floriana received a bitter reprimand.

As in the previous case, Floriana takes her protection into her own hands. Whereas in the previous example Francisca Mirueña lived within a family unit that had neither father or brother to act as male guardian responsible for the protection of family honor; Floriana has a father and brothers, and she does not lack a male guardian. However, she continues taking her

own matters into her own hands. Against the paternal advice, as the governor was the cause of her *agravio*, she arranged with him directly again a date for the following night, where they would be alone. Once again, her parents are left ignorant of what is about to transpire.

Believing that Floriana had succumbed to his seductive nature, as the narrator tells us, the governor arrived at the predetermined location dressed in expensive clothing, highlighting his personal vanity, which Arzáns describes as, “vicio abominable en los hombres, así buscando telas exquisitas como colores” (I 236). Vain and misdirected in his understanding of the situation at hand, he said to Floriana as she entered the room, “Señora, aquí tenéis a vuestro esclavo y fino amante, mejor dijera el indigno de mereceros, pues dos veces os tiene agraviada” (I 236), blissfully ignorant of her true intentions to punish him for his inappropriate behavior. As Floriana stalked towards her offender, “sacó una daga que traía...y le arrojó a la cara un envoltorio de mantas que allí topó, con tan buen acierto que a un mismo tiempo le embarazó la vista...y tan gran golpe le dio en los pechos y frente que cayó sin sentidos el gobernador” (I 236). Despite her young age of only twelve years old, she berated him with insults, and although he ultimately did fend her off, she was able to penetrate his hand from palm to thumb with a deep laceration that went all the way to the bone, and then, she knocked him unconscious. While at first Floriana attempted unsuccessfully to deal with the governor by writing an offensive rejection, now she seeks a more definitive solution, using a dagger, a clear phallic symbol, and then *a gran tronco*. We could consider this as Floriana’s attempt to finish the job her father left unaccomplished earlier when the unexpected duel was interrupted, choosing a secluded space for her ambush, and defeating the man.

The commotion and noise of the conflict attracted the people from her home and people who were nearby, who upon seeing the governor lying bloody on the floor assumed him dead. Fearing the worst, Floriana moved quickly, “y sus padres con gran pesadumbre y

sobresalto trataron de esconderla, mas ya no fue posible, porque como estuviese allí cerca el corregidor vino a toda diligencia” (Arzáns I 236). With limited options, “no pudo hacer otra cosa Floriana más de subir a un cuarto y arrojarla por una ventana a la calle” (I 236), which left her, ever so gracefully, hanging upside down with her petticoat having been snagged on the way down, again choosing to take matters into her own hands, though rather foolishly and getting herself stuck in this awkward position.

As Floriana hung, don Julio Sánchez Farfán, the *corregidor* of Porco, quickly learned of her predicament. Don Julio was so obsessed with Floriana that he had employed paid sources, most of whom were young maids in neighboring households, to inform him about her daily movements and routines. It was one of these young women who moved quickly to inform don Julio of the events, and to Floriana's current inverted position in the alley. Capitan Alburquerque, another of Floriana's stalkers was nearby and observed don Julio speaking to la criada, knowing that she was paid to give him information, “fue siguiendo hasta entrar en el callejón, sin que lo sintiese” (I 237). Seeing Alburquerque approach, “don Julio, ardiendo en celos se puso en pie, y sacando un puñal arremetió contra el capitán, diciéndole era un traidor villano, que a su vista tenía aquel atrevimiento” (I 237). Alburquerque meanwhile “sacó una daga e hizo lo mismo con don Julio, y sin dar tiempo a otra cosa en un instante fue malherido en los pechos el capitán que cayó en tierra pidiendo confesión” (I 237), resulting in unnecessary violence in the name of a misguided effort to sway the love of a young girl who hadn't the faintest interest in being owned as a wife or lover.

Seeing all this, Floriana fled with don Julio after he agreed to safeguard her honor. The pair left and split up at don Julio's suggestion in order to lead people away from Floriana, and “tanto por huir de don Julio como de la justicia, siguiendo las orillas del arroyo que por allí pasaba llegó...al rancho de unas indias, donde la acogieron con mucho cariño” (I 237). Floriana found temporary relief in the company of these Indigenous women, and “luego hizo

saber a su padre dónde se hallaba, el cual también se había ocultado aquella noche porque el corregidor quería prenderlo” (I 237). The trouble in this case began with Floriana asserting her own defense against the unwanted advances of a man, then that she now finds support in other women is not surprising. Since her father is also threatened, Floriana is now left to fend for herself. The men who sought her attention seemed almost driven to madness at the very sight of her, and she fears the *gobernador* to be dead, she must again work to hide herself. The narrator describes how Floriana dressed in “hábitos de india” (I 237), and we can presume that the Indigenous women gave them to Floriana in her time of need, although the narrator does not state it.

However, the disguise failed to provide Floriana with an escape, because, “...en cualquiera se levantaba de todo punto su hermosura y estando para ponerse en una mula no faltó quien avisase al corregidor” (I 237). The *corregidor* took Floriana into custody, but unable to resist her beauty, brought her back to his home rather than the local jailhouse as he should have, though there would be little difference to Floriana, as both would act as a type of prison.

Meanwhile, don Julio discovered that the *corregidor* was keeping Floriana in his home in an attempt to win her over, “y lleno de celos rabiosos escribió a la doncella sus sentimientos” (I 237), driven only by his own obsession to possess her. Floriana’s father was still nowhere to be seen, and so Floriana accepted the assistance of don Julio to escape the *corregidor*, only after making him promise to honor her virginity. With his help, Floriana escaped the *corregidor*’s home, though not quick enough to avoid detection and an ensuing pursuit by not only the *Corregidor*, but also his servants. Seeing them approach, don Julio hurried Floriana to escape and perceiving the danger in which both were in he took her on his shoulders and walked quickly towards the plaza del Gato. There, don Julio sat briefly to catch his breath, and suddenly died with no warning, and no explanation from the narrator.³⁹

Floriana was afraid to be suspected also of don Julio's death, a reasonable fear if we remember that she had been already implicated in two other attacks. The solution lay once again in a disguise, this time as a man, more specifically, as don Julio. The narrator describes how, "tomando la capa, espada y sombrero de don Julio y poniéndoselo todo se fue para el cementerio" (I 238). Dressed as a man, Floriana was finally independent and free to move about, unrestricted in a way that a woman could not, and like that, "se encaminó hacia los barrios de San Lorenzo, que allí vivía una amiga de su madre" (I 238). Her final march, alone after she has transformed her gender into that of a man, she walks to the home of a female friend of her mother, and so one last time, she finds refuge and safety through another woman, as there is no male guardian capable of assisting her in any way, or as we have seen, even necessary.

Inevitably, Floriana was assigned the blame for don Julio's mysterious death, but eventually this was dropped as there was no official cause of death determined. In many ways, these events served as a series of trials through which Floriana was truly able to acquire what she most desired in life, which was to be left alone by the many suitors who hounded her without rest. Don Julio had already perished, captain Albuquerque died a few days after him, and the *gobernador*, "se fue a Los Reyes a fines de este mismo año de 1598, y llegando a la ciudad de La Paz le dio un fiero tabardillo que a pocos días le quitó la vida" (I 238). The only man to survive was the *corregidor* Lopidana, perhaps because he only became infatuated with Floriana after coming into contact with her and did not actively pursue her as the others did, tirelessly and through unwelcome advances. However, it was not until he vacated his official position of authority that Floriana "salió de donde estaba escondida, y con mucho recogimiento en casa de sus padres guardó perpetua castidad, y dice don Juan Pasquier murió de mucha edad con opiniones de que fue gran sierva del Señor" (I 238),⁴⁰ leaving all the men involved dead.

Much like Francisca, Floriana ultimately chose how to live her life, and where. She did not enter into a convent, and never submitted to marriage, maintaining authority over herself. One could say that this last point is not entirely accurate, given that she lived in the home of her parents, however from what we have seen, Floriana does not restrict herself to their wishes, otherwise much of the drama in her life would have been avoided. While the death of three men is tragic, for Floriana the result of her actions was to sustain a life away from the seemingly uncontrollable male gaze, “escondida y con mucho recogimiento” (I 238).

When considering the series of events that unfolded in Floriana’s story, many of the problems are begun and further propelled by the continuous bypassing of the established sex/gender systems in place to facilitate the appropriate “exchange” of women from the responsibility of her patriarchal family unit to a new one of her own under the responsibility of a spouse. The governor of Tucumán was the first to bypass the established sex/gender systems of colonial society when he somehow had his secret note left for Floriana to find. In doing so, the governor bypassed Floriana’s father as guardian of the family name, which would have been the correct first step in the process of exchange if the governor were serious about entering into a formal relationship with her. Floriana then continued the bypassing of the normal process of exchange by choosing to write to the governor directly rather than inform her father, which led to the confusion as to the author of the reply and the short, awkward confrontation between the two men. Each subsequent man in the story bypassed the established steps in the legitimate “exchange” of women in their own way. Albuquerque had his spies watching Floriana’s movements daily so as to know when to approach her, the *corregidor* imprisoned Floriana in his own home, hoping to make the young girl fall in love with him, and Don Julio both attacked Albuquerque in a jealous rage, and then helped Floriana escape the home of the *corregidor* before dying so mysteriously.

All of these men sought to possess Floriana for themselves without respecting the established processes of exchange, and so it was no surprise that her attitude remain unchanged regarding an unwillingness to choose a suitor for marriage. Once Floriana was hidden in the relative safety of the home belonging to her mother's friend, Floriana permanently removed herself from the expected role within the sex/gender system that would have had her be a wife or enter a convent. By deciding to remain single and live in her family home, Floriana subverted the expected processes of exchange, which allowed her to live as she chose, within a narrow scope certainly as she was still with her parents, but ultimately not within the confines of the route that was expected of her by society.

The cases of Francisca and Floriana have shown similar processes through which the established sex/gender systems were rejected by women in favor of taking charge of their own destinies. Both women were of a certain level of social class that brought with it an expectation that family honor should be safeguarded. In addition, both women found solutions to their problems by reaching out and receiving assistance from individuals outside of the immediate family units. Francisca found a willing, eager substitute for the male guardian in her life, while Floriana found countless women, some known to her, others not, to assist in her troubles. Now we will turn to another woman who rejected the sex/gender system and engaged in processes of exchange entirely different from what we have seen, but still with a focus on and about women and exchanges. For this, we turn to Claudia the Witch.

Case 3 – La hechicera más poderosa de Potosí

The third case differs in terms of the social position and age of the woman implicated. Claudia is forty-five years old in the chapter corresponding to 1674. Here it is not her honor that needs to be safeguarded, neither is she lusted over uncontrollably by men, but she is highly sought for her skills and profession, which is witchcraft powered in great part by coca leaves. Throughout Arzáns' text, the coca leaf appears often and has an important impact on

the people of the city in both positive and negative ways. The narrator is first clear on his opinion, “quiero significar la desdicha y sumo mal que entre tantas felicidades tiene este reino del Perú en poseer la yerba llamada coca (que es la que toman aquellos ministros del diablo para sus abominables vicios y maldades tan execrables)” (II 267), but follows that by saying, “si bien declararé primero algunas de las buenas propiedades de esta yerba” (II 267), showing an ongoing ambivalence towards the coca leaves, which he presents as also benefiting a number of people.

First the narrator presents the coca leaves through the words of Pedro Cieza de Leon, and it is related to the benefit that they bring to the Indigenous miners who use them daily in their work. Specifically, the chewing or holding of coca leaves in the mouth staves off hunger, and it produces a feeling of vigor and strength, qualities needed while working in the dangerous and strenuous conditions of the mines (II 267). Then, he mentions a tradition among the Indigenous, which linked the use of coca to the richness of metals that could be mined, “no hayan de entrar en las minas sin poner esta yerba en la boca ... que tienen por abusión [sic] de que se perderá la riqueza del metal si así no lo hacen” (II 268). So strongly did the miners believe in this superstition that the narrator explains, telling us about his own experiences, that “queriendo un día entrar a la labor principal me lo impidieron los indios diciendo que no podía entrar sin tomar aquella yerba en la boca” (II 268). Third, he tells us the coca leaves also had practical uses by the general public, “molida esta yerba y puesta en agua hirviendo, y después bebiendo unos tragos de ella, abre los poros, calienta el cuerpo y abrevia el parto a las mujeres, añadiéndose a esta otras muchas virtudes que tiene esta yerba coca” (II 268). Through the narrator, Cieza also presents the economic consequences of its commercialization in the markets of Potosí, “Algunos están en España ricos con la que hubieron del valor de esta coca, mercándola y tornándola a vender, y rescatándola en los tiangués o mercados a los indios” (II 268).

Despite these legitimate uses, the narrator then describes how the use of coca leaves are connected directly to activities which often tied to demonic influence. He believes witchcraft and women go hand in hand in the popular use of coca leaves, "...pues son muchas las mujeres que la han tomado y toman [la coca] para el pecado de hechicería, invocando al demonio y atrayéndolo con ella para sus maldades" (II 269). Yet he mentions other situations, in which coca leaves are still used without any intention for witchcraft, but still damn their users, "...son innumerables los que enviciados en ponerla en la boca (que no la comen ni beben el zumo) se han perdido, así hombres como mujeres, y luego dan en pordioseros y cuanta limosna recogen es sólo para mantener este infernal vicio" (II 269). The narrator points out that the ability to acquire coca leaves is widespread and common, "En esta Villa de Potosí se vende públicamente por los indios de las minas, conque no se puede remediar el daño que de su abundancia se sigue en ella, pero ni tampoco es remediable en otras grandes ciudades de este reino" (II 269). He believes that overall this is a negative trend that must be addressed. And so, the narrator implores the Crown to act on such a vile plant despite its positive qualities, "Pudiera el rey nuestro señor mandar desarraigar de las partes donde se da esta nociva yerba y no permitir que quedase ni memoria de ella" (II 269). To reinforce his point on the negative effects that coca leaves can have, the narrator then presents the story of Claudia the witch and her misdeeds in life.

Claudia, surname unknown, was born around 1629 according to Arzáns' statement of her age, "fue esta mujer natural de una de las ciudades del Tucumán. Sus padres fueron de España, su nombre Claudia, y su rostro y talle de buen parecer" (II 269). No details regarding family lineage are given by the narrator in this case. Her profession was witchcraft, providing solutions to a broad variety of problems, "congelaba cuando quería las nubes cubriendo con ellas la faz del sol, y otras veces volvía sereno el más turbado cielo...formaba hermosos

jardines...a cierto caballero corregidor de Porco le hizo ver a Madrid su patria en un espejo, que lo deseaba” (II 269).

The narrator begins presenting Claudia through an incident involving a young woman, whose name is also not provided, who visited Claudia to ask for assistance against, “el contador Andrés Sáenz Bretón diciendo que la perseguía por sus amores, de que ella no gustaba” (II 270). After enduring his repeated, unwanted advances, the young lady petitioned for assistance, and Claudia in turn “la consoló y prometió remediar su mal aquella noche misma” (II 270). It is not stated by the narrator if this young woman lacked a male guardian in her life, like Francisca, or if she had one but decided to inquire herself into the matter, like Floriana. In either case, she arrives alone to ask for assistance. The narrator tells us that Claudia prepared the coca leaves through a process not described to the reader, which would allow for a physical transformation to occur. Claudia sought the assistance of an older woman who lived with her, who was from Lima, “era esta vieja gran persona de apadrinar buenas voluntades, y volatína de media noche arriba” (II 269), though the narrator also describes how this woman was involved in other questionable activity as well. Claudia then, “Tomó la coca recogiendo en otro cuarto donde estaba una mujer setentona, tan fea y terrible que quitaba el cuidado de pensar cómo sería el demonio” (II 270). The narrator states that Claudia told the young woman not to worry about her problem any longer, because the old woman would be transformed to look identical to her and would then seduce Sáenz Bretón. After a night together, she would revert to her true form, causing him to be revolted and lose all interest in the young girl. That evening, “Así sucedió todo...que nunca más se acordó de la dama, teniendo presente la transformación de la horrible vieja a quien echó de su casa a toda prisa” (II 270).

In a single night, without the use of violence or the inclusion of men for assistance, the matter was resolved, allowing the young woman to proceed in her life with one less affront to

her personal honor and well-being. With the aid of Claudia and her coca leaves, and the old woman and her willingness to assist, the narrator demonstrates how women can take charge of their problems without depending on other men in their lives, but on other women instead. With this in mind, we have now seen in each of the three cases in this chapter there has been a unique solution to the problem of unwanted male advances attempting to bypass the established processes of “exchange” of women. In this way, Claudia serves as another example of an efficient alternative to the systems in place.

While in the previous example, Claudia’s witchcraft served to defend the honor of one woman, the next example results in the opposite with tragic consequences. A man, once again unnamed by the narrator, was aware of Claudia’s skillset and sought out her assistance, “le pidió ciegamente dispusiese modo para que cierta doncella tan hermosa como noble de quien estaba perdido, correspondiese a su afecto y torpe deseo, porque aunque se lo había declarado no era posible le admitiese” (II 270). He offered to exchange a valuable piece of jewelry for the payment.⁴¹ The narrator leaves this open and vague, and so while Claudia is sought after for her services, there is ambiguity regarding if she requests compensation from all, or only from some (II 269-271). Claudia agreed, promising that this would be done, “con sólo que le trajese alguna cosa que la doncella se hubiese vestido o calzado. El torpe mancebo adquirió un chapín por mano de una criada y llevóselo a la hechicera” (II 270). At this point, it was clear that if completed, the act would dishonor the young woman, and so with what the narrator considers an act of divine intervention, “...permitió Dios que la doncella se librase de aquel mal, pues dándole una calentura le sobrevino un fiero tabardillo y antes de 12 días murió” (II 270). In this case, there is again a departure from the norm because it is more often the case that sinners face consequences for their actions, whereas neither Claudia or this *torpe mancebo* suffer any real harm, while the young woman loses her life. However, the divine intervention is presented almost as a positive result since she is able to die pure before any

possible dishonor could befall her. One thing is clear however, that Claudia works for those who she wants.

The narrator then tells us about fifteen thieves who stole from a merchant an amount nearing almost 20,000 pesos in money and goods but were observed and pursued by the alcalde don Diego Muñoz de Cuéllar y Umbría. The thieves knew of Claudia and her abilities, and so, “se entraron en casa de esta Claudia, famosa hechicera, y llegando a su cuarto aquellos ladrones... se metieron en él junto con todo el robo y le pidieron su favor” (II 270). Claudia resolved their problem without hesitation, “puso aquella mujer 15 hojas de la yerba coca en su boca, y en un momento les dijo se arrimasen a un lado del cuarto y se apegasen al montón del robo que ya habían allí descargado” (II 270). The result was a literal transformation of their human bodies into something else, “transformados ya éstos con la fuerza del encanto de aquella hechicera en perros y gatos y el robo en un montón de carne, comenzaron éstos a gruñir y morderse unos con otros” (II 270). The alcalde left as he was unable to locate the men, who were then transformed back into their human forms, and, “muy conformes partieron de la presa dando mucha parte de ella a Claudia que supo hacer la transformación” (II 270). Once again, Claudia has assisted those in a position to pay for her services. In this case, the inversion of typical gender roles is apparent as well, in that the fifteen men were at the mercy of a woman whom they knew had the power to help, something that no man among them was capable of doing in that moment. Had Claudia deemed it so, the men could have been caught and arrested. Such was Claudia’s power, inverting what we observed about gender relations in the previous two cases presented.

In those examples of Claudia’s power, the narrator points out that he does not believe in the spells he is describing, yet he refers to them constantly in this chapter. It is a curious statement by the narrator, given how strongly his argument against the use of coca leaves in the colony rests upon the negative abilities it grants some of its users in the very spells he

claims to not believe in (II 270). At the same time, it is a logical statement, and almost unnecessary, when considering how strongly the narrator leans towards proper Christian behavior as a requisite to be considered a model citizen, and otherwise describing any belief into the power of spells through witchcraft is perhaps to near the realm of blasphemy.

The narrator moves onto a case that again deals with helping a young woman out of a self-caused predicament. He presents a woman who sought help for her daughter to whom, “le habían tratado un casamiento con un forastero y que ciertamente su hija no se hallaba ya doncella” (II 270). The narrator states that, “La maldita hembra la consoló y aseguró de que por eso no perdería casamiento” (II 270), showing his opinion of Claudia, and without explanation other than the allusion to demonic influence, “la muchacha se halló diabólicamente otra vez cerrada, y tanto que afirmaba el marido entre sus amigos que había tenido por dificultoso consumir el matrimonio aquella noche según estaba, dando que reír a los que sabían de los primeros amores de aquella niña” (II 270). In this way, thanks to Claudia, the young woman avoided the consequences that the sex/gender system reserved for those that did not safeguard virginity, which may have been the loss of the opportunity to marry at a certain social level. Rather than subvert the sex/gender system, these women were able to hide their problems, allowing them to still reap the benefits afforded to women who in the eyes of Arzáns and society ensured that honor was safeguarded. This case demonstrates the subjectivity of honorable behavior, as the husband of this woman was satisfied that his bride was a virgin because of his own experience with her. Only the women involved, and some of their friends, knew the truth of the matter. They manipulated the system in their favor and ultimately decided how to proceed. In the same way that Francisca was able to resolve her loss of virginity, and keep the dishonorable events mostly private, and then decided afterwards to remain single, this case demonstrates once again how women could decide for

themselves how to proceed in a situation involving lost honor. In this case, she will marry, after the closing of her hymen, thanks to the services of Claudia.

Until now, Claudia's involvement with each individual or group has had three things in common: a gender inversion of power, bypassing social norms, and a distinct lack of consequences for those seeking to bypass the norms. The gender inversion is clear, particularly when the fifteen men rushed towards the home of Claudia, begging for help to avoid capture and imprisonment. Few other women in the text command such power, and with good reason. Although Claudia's methods were rooted in what the narrator deemed to be demonic influence, the competence of this woman is without question in solving problems, and it would be difficult to find a man of similar capabilities in the text. Bypassing social norms is what each example of Claudia's behavior deals with at its root, and as a matter of fact, that was the fundamental reason that Claudia was sought out. Each problem was rooted in the inability to turn to legitimate sources for the desired solution. Only the first example with the young woman could be debated. Each case leaves no doubt however that Claudia provided the means to bypass social norms towards achieving certain otherwise inaccessible goals of each person or group. Lastly, the distinct lack of immediate consequences is shared by all. Others suffered as a result of Claudia's magic, such as the young woman from the second example who was killed through divine intervention to spare her any dishonor, but no consequences were levied against those who sought her services. Overall, Claudia provides an exchange of unique services to individuals that require a subversion of established social norms and rules that are otherwise not widely available. In doing so, the results of her actions were mixed in terms of moral behavior, but there is no doubt that she is effective in subverting the norm to accomplish her goals in all cases, except of course, for when God intervenes directly.

In her personal life, Claudia also used witchcraft for her personal benefit. As the narrator describes, there was a romantic relationship with a man named Don Pedro de Ayamonte, a Spaniard from the South-Western region of Spain. At the onset of their relationship, he was unaware of Claudia's abilities and reputation. One day he made an offhand comment to Claudia, which the narrators states were common among those from Spain, "dijo que las tortas de su patria Utrera ordinariamente eran tan grandes que pesaban 200 onzas cada una" (II 270). Claudia responded with skepticism, thinking that the claim was untrue, "A lo que dijo Claudia: 'No es así don Pedro, porque yo he estado en Utrera y las he visto, y no corresponden a tal grandeza como decís'" (II 270). An argument ensued with Don Pedro confidently boasting that he was in fact correct, and that his lies could not be countered by her, to which she invited him to return later, and they would see, "tomando la coca aquella hechicera invocó el demonio, habló con él y en brevísimas horas le trajo las tortas, que viéndolas don Pedro y comiendo de ellas (que en realidad lo eran) halló que eran las propias de su patria" (II 270). Claudia communicates directly with the devil through the coca leaves, resulting in the rebalancing of power between she and don Pedro, whose exaggerations have been refuted beyond argument. While there are no victims in this case, the narrator is clear on the connection between the coca leaves and the literal communication with demons to ask a favor, further supporting his overall claims that the use of coca leaves should be halted in the New World.

Claudia also had a group of women followers who she taught in the ways of the coca leaf so that they could emulate her, with predictably negative outcomes. The narrator states that "No sólo fue mala para sí esta mujer sino que inficionó a otras y ellas no excusaron de seguir sus pasos, porque en gran parte de este sexo hay mucha incapacidad y mengua...se entregan con facilidad en manos de la serpiente" (II 271). One day, four of these women were engaging in a ritual without Claudia present, and were interrupted when, "entró un mozo

músico de arpa, y como las hallase en aquella casa tomando la coca (que la tenían en una fuente de plata, como si para ensuciar sus almas fuera necesario tanto aseo) se turbaron al ver que las había hallado en tan infernal ejercicio” (II 271). To safeguard the secret of their activities, the women offered to share the coca with him, and when he refused, they offered him instead wine that he drunk without hesitation. The drink caused him to lose his mind and wander the streets where his wife would find him on all fours, believing that he was a beast. Afterwards the wife of this man pleaded for assistance, and the narrator describes how a priest approached her and announced the arrival of a woman that would repair the situation, but only if nothing was asked during the process. The woman arrived, disguised and hiding her face, as announced, and gave the man a drink mixed with herbs. This cured him of his imagined beastness, “aunque a poco más de un año murió aceleradamente de este o de otro achaque” (II 271). The narrator does not identify the women, but the procedure is similar to the one used by Claudia, a drink mixed with herbs that in this case are not recognized. Not everything is black and white in Arzáns’ text, but rather a large area of activity falls within a grey zone with regards to how it affects both the people and the city. This example seems to show that women and herbs can have multiple associations.

The narrator moves on to the end of Claudia’s life by stating that, “Finalmente fue esta hechicera Claudia tan única en su oficio que (en cuanto a española) no se vio semejante en este reino” (II 271), describing some of the fantastic things that she could do, as well as the demonic rituals that she and other practitioners of witchcraft would complete. In her final days, now aged forty-five, Claudia called for a priest from the Jesuit order, and asked him to “...sacar de una gavetilla ciertos bultos de cera y otros instrumentos infernales, y quitándoles unos alfileres y vendas que tenían, cobrarían toda su salud cinco sacerdotes a quienes había maleficiado” (II 271). There were others still cursed, but as she was at the end of her life, she could not undo what had been done. The priest asked her to use this time to ask for

forgiveness from God, but instead, Claudia spoke with a terrible voice, asking her servant to bring her the coca leaves. The servant did not comply, and so, “ella se levantó furiosa, echó mano de un cesto que en un aposento estaba, y sacando un puñado de aquella yerba se lo metió en la boca y diciendo notables disparates cayó allí difunta a la vista del padre, que en nada pudo valerla” (II 271). With this final act of desperation, Claudia rejects God once more, and the narrator bids farewell to Claudia and states again the negative qualities of the coca leaves, “Estos y otros innumerables daños se han seguido del vicio de la coca en este reino. Permita Dios el que se desarraigue donde la hay, para que no perezcan tantas almas y se eviten tantos daños en las personas y haciendas” (II 271). In “Brujería, intertextualidad creativa y discurso hispanoamericano en *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí*”, Ángela Robledo claims that with the death of Claudia, “La brujería se convierte entonces en una protesta contra la opresión social y es signo de un deseo de justicia social” (53). Given the broad range of services that Claudia engaged in, it is difficult to agree with this statement by Robledo, as some of her actions could align with that point of view, but not all.

With the death of Claudia, the anti-religious theme has occurred four times throughout the chapter in regard to these various events. Upon closer inspection, it would seem that the narrator is establishing an ongoing battle between the coca leaves, or rather, their demonic influence and power on the one hand, and God on the other. First, recall the young woman was spared dishonor as God intervened and took her life while she slept, pre-emptively stopping Claudia from completing her task. Second, the priest who consulted Claudia sought the help of a mysterious woman to solve the strange ailment that had befallen the poor man who thought himself a beast with the use of these “mysterious herbs”. Third, in her final moments Claudia revealed the curses she had placed on five priests who she had cursed in the past, but then released from their demonic scourge. The fact that the number of priests cursed was five is also of religious significance. The number five is associated with God’s grace

(Kalvesmaki 8-9), and so Claudia cursing exactly five priests is another representation of her rejection of that grace, and of God. Finally, with her last breath, she rejected any notion of asking for divine forgiveness in favor of stuffing her mouth with a handful of coca leaves, symbolically rejecting God in favor of the devil, mockingly through what can only be described as the ritualistic eating of the communal bread, with coca leaves in place of the body of Christ (II 271).

In the end, Claudia is one of the most fascinating women in the *Historia*. At first glance it is clear that she assisted a wide range of individuals, men and women, in engaging in exchanges that were otherwise unavailable within the realm of socially accepted behavior. She too rejected every bit of the sex/gender systems of Potosí, having never married and removing herself from circulation, so to speak, ensuring too that she played no part in the biological reproduction expected of other women, while still engaging in romantic relationships at her discretion. The manner in which she dealt with religion was also a subversion of social norms.

Chapter Conclusions

Each case reviewed in this chapter has presented a woman of Potosí who found methods of survival that fell outside of the typical sex/gender system of the time. None of them were successfully “exchanged” from one family unit into another to occupy the role of wife, nor the one of mother, and they are not underneath the authority of a husband for the purpose of biological reproduction, nor under the authority of a father, and in the end, there seems to be no reason to consider them unsatisfied with the outcomes of their lives. As Arzáns often focuses moral behavior, the cases we have seen fall deep into a grey zone where strictly speaking, many of the actions taken by these women were acceptable only within the context of their unique, and often extreme situations.

The division of women into “good” or “bad” has been examined at length by Margaret Boyle in “Chronicling Women's Containment in Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela's History of Potosí”. Boyle affirms that there is a clear attempt to use the simplistic division between “good” and “bad” within the “evaluative tools of custodial institutions, where the exemplarity of women’s behavior, ‘good’ or ‘bad’, is directly linked to maintaining social order” (290). In some cases, the “good” and the “bad” are clearly marked by the narrator, often tied to acts he labelled as sinful. Yet there are too often women who behave in ways that do not fall clearly into one of the two binary categories, and, “numerous examples throughout the chronicle reveals the way these categories are mutable, shifting and often times arbitrary” (Boyle 290). At no point are any of the women presented in this chapter labelled as “bad” by the narrator, and even Claudia is excused with the narrator focusing instead on the near-demonic influence of coca leaves, and we must acknowledge that her assistance also falls in that spectrum, sometimes good and at other times, bad. The same can be said of the two “Amazonian women” as presented by Gina Herrmann, whereby the actions of two young women, resulting in the death of numerous men, is brushed off not as something “bad”, but simply a necessary series of events for two women to deviate away from the expected roles within a sex/gender system.

As we have seen, the three women presented here came from different backgrounds. Both Francisca and Floriana were of similar age, separated by only a single year at fourteen and thirteen years old, respectively, and both occupied a higher level of social class than most people, but that is where their similarity ends. In the case of Francisca, she was thought to be an appropriate match as a potential spouse to a member of the order of Santiago; in the case of Floriana, is it not specified nor is it relevant, as she wanted nothing to do with finding a husband. Similarly, Claudia too seemed uninterested in becoming a wife, and in stark contrast to the younger women of this chapter, was as the narrator claims, a practitioner of witchcraft

unmatched in her time. While these three women were different in these ways, they are all united by the common theme of self-determination, of choice. In each example presented, their individual choices are what allowed them to flatly reject the sex/gender systems in place by which most women were expected to follow.

In this way, writing from eighteenth-century Potosí, the narrator provides understanding of those tightly wound social systems, and he shows progressive positions for women from his perspective with varying degrees of “goodness” or “badness” attached.⁴² The cases presented here demonstrate clearly how the sex/gender systems in Potosí were trespassed, and while causing significant trouble, did not spell calamity for everyone involved. Rather, the women in each case could still thrive in their lives without submitting to the established order and removing themselves from the pool of candidates that men would pursue to dominate. Regardless of the intention of the narrator, even if simply to showcase varying degrees of “goodness” and “badness” along a spectrum, he clearly has provided a long history of the evolution of a collection of unconventional choices that women had in the New World.

As stated in the introduction to this chapter, the “exchanges” of women are well established in the New World and were based heavily upon long-standing customs from Spain. Women of a certain minimum level of social status and reputation would be trained from a young age to be aware of the sex/gender systems and their place in them, guiding them, or more appropriately, controlling them through sexuality and behavior if they want to ensure the ideal match, according to these systems. If a young woman were keen to acquire a spouse of appropriate social status to her own, the rules would be clear, and so too the route she must take in order to accomplish this. The problem in each of the cases presented arises when someone decides to ignore the established ruleset for something that better suits their needs at the expense of others.

It is precisely this issue that befalls Francisca, who was both fortunate enough to have an appropriate marriage set up by her mother, and was keen to marry don Luis, but everything was ruined by Triesta. In his quest to supplant his master and elevate himself in social status, he became an uninvited interloper in the process of exchange that should have occurred between Francisca's mother and don Luis, setting off the chain of events that ultimately led to his death. This also led to Francisca's choice to remain single for the rest of her life and engage in virtuous acts to the benefit of the people of Potosí, rather than attempt to complete the exchange to either a new family marry or enter in a convent. Floriana too followed the rules of the established sex/gender system by doing everything in her power to avoid being seen in public so as to prevent the male gaze from turning into uncontrollable infatuation but was through no fault of her own unsuccessful. She in turn took a different route, deciding to deal with her unwanted suitors personally rather than involve her father, who was both an available and capable male guardian. When everything was resolved, resulting in the death of all the men who attempted to bypass the proper methods of exchange necessary to acquire her as a wife, she too removed herself from the established sex/gender system, choosing to be neither wife nor enter a convent. Finally, Claudia worked in many cases as an alternative, effective option to achieve goals that were unobtainable through legitimate routes, using the coca leaves which as the narrator reminds us often, is akin to demonic influence, yet quite effective.

In all of these cases, the narrator offers distinct opinions. He is most critical of individuals who act in inappropriate ways, which also means establishing context for each situation. This means that for Francisca and Floriana, all their subversion and deviation from the established social systems receive no chastisement from the narrator, while the unwanted men in their lives do receive his scorn. Claudia as we have seen is a complex case with great ambivalence, for according to the author she did good with her witchcraft in some cases, but also

performed work to the benefit of criminals and men with dishonorable interests. Altogether, the cases demonstrate how the established processes of exchange could be successfully subverted with varying results, revealing flexibility within social norms and resistance for women. In these exchanges, the women were able to avoid being objectified, resisting their expected placement into the roles they deemed unsuitable, and removing themselves entirely from the exchanges meant to control them.

Chapter 3 – Exchange of Culture

Bronislaw Malinowski defines culture as “the integral whole consisting of implements and consumers' goods, of constitutional charters for the various social groupings, of human ideas and crafts, beliefs and customs” (36). This definition will broadly guide my analysis in this chapter that seeks to analyze how the *Historia* represents the exchanges of culture that occurred in the city during more than 150 years.

The concept of culture in the *Historia* requires a broad view as the history of the city is characterized by an unprecedented influx of people from diverse backgrounds in a short amount of time. As the city was built for the sole purpose of mining silver, the initial pull to come to Potosí was based on the possibility to acquire wealth. This brought Spaniards and members of the Indigenous population to the city, some by choice and others forced.

In his text, “Contrapunteo cubano del tabaco y el azúcar”, Fernando Ortiz coins the term transculturation to express, “the different phases of the process of transition from one culture to another” (102). As Ortiz explains, transculturation is a useful word that differs from others that were popular at the time, specifically acculturation and deculturation. Those other terms were limiting, Ortiz explains, because a relation between peoples, “...does not consist merely in acquiring another culture of a previous culture” (Ortiz 102), or of losing one's own. Instead, transculturation is akin to a long-term exchange, “in which something is always given in return for what one receives, a system of give and take” (Ortiz 59). Over time, the back and forth of these exchanges result in the gradual loss of the two entirely distinct cultures, towards an inevitable blending of one and the other, resulting in something new and distinct.

We can consider culture as able to be broken down to the sum of its parts, which includes but is not exclusive to the customs, institutions, technologies, achievements,

consumer goods, and languages of a people. Compared to chapter one of this dissertation, the exchange of culture may not be as obvious as the exchange of silver. The tangibility of what is given and received is generally neither easily apparent, nor immediate, but subtle and occurring over time. Mary Louise Pratt states that there are “social spaces where cultures meet, clash and grapple with each other, often in contexts of highly asymmetrical relations of power, such as colonialism, slavery, or their aftermaths as they lived out” (34). Pratt calls these spaces contact zones. I believe that the term embodies the spirit of Potosí, with its explosive growth in population resulting in a wide range of groups coming together in one space, allowing for the strange, often fantastic tales that appear in Arzáns’ text.

As Arzáns tells the history, the city of Potosí’s existence is tied to the exchange between two different cultures. The discovery of the mountain is presented as credited to three different Spaniards but the narrator specifies that don Juan de Villarroel should be recognized above the rest. The narrator states that one of Villarroel's Indigenous servants was named Hualca, from the Chumbivilca nation,⁴³ and it was he who first discovered the location where Potosí would later be founded. Arzáns describes the discovery by stating that, “Era la noche oscura, y así le convino quedarse encima del mismo Cerro de Potosí, porque allí había venido guiado de providencia divina, pues ya era tiempo de dar a los humanos la plata de aquel rico Cerro” (I 35). Hualca mined some of the silver by hand but kept his discovery a secret from everyone, “por tener ya su voluntad entregada a la riqueza de lo hallado” (I 36).

With his newfound wealth, Hualca “Vestíase bien, comía mejor y traía a su mesa algunos amigos indios después que tenía la oculta plata” (Arzáns I 36). Soon, another Indigenous man also in the repartimiento of Villarroel by the name of Huanca observed the silver belonging to Hualca, and the two engaged in a long conversation whereby the location where the silver was mined was both revealed and then shown. Yet, the silver had an adverse effect on Hualca, “sucedió que como a los más los ensoberbece la abundancia de corporales

bienes, así el indio Hualca por la sobra de ellos se ensoberbeció” (Arzáns I 36), and began to be haughty with his friends, and among them also Huanca. Pride is among the seven deadly sins, and the bible says, “The Lord detests all the proud of heart. Be sure of this: They will not go unpunished” (Proverbs 16:5). Arzáns portrays Huanca as someone “de mucha razón, (que) servía fielmente no sólo a su señor (que asimismo lo era el capitán don Juan de Villarroel) mas también a otro cualquier español, por entender el beneficio de metales y haberlo todos menester para las fundiciones” (Arzáns I 36). Therefore, Huanca revealed the secret and gave freely the information to Villarroel, and after it was confirmed that the place had rich silver that was easy to mine, other Spaniards began to arrive. While the discovery of Potosí by Hualca is presented as guided by divine providence, his secrecy and haughty behavior was the reason he lost his source of wealth. The conflicted change in behavior caused by wealth is recurrent in the text and will reappear in some of the cases to follow.

As a result, Huanca benefitted by revealing the discovery made by Hualca. Juan de Villarroel, “no lo tuvo de allí adelante por criado sino por compañero y amigo, gozando entrambos de la abundante plata que sacaron” (I 37). Hualca is in contrast forgotten, while Villarroel received praise for the discovery of what would become the city. By casting Hualca aside, speaking well of Huanca, and showing that praise went to Villarroel, the narrator shows that the wealth that Potosí gave to Spain and Spaniards in the New World is due to the efforts of the Indigenous population, of which they received little in return. There is also a clear religious connotation to the discovery of the silver, as seen when the narrator writes in the Primera Parte, Libro 1, Capítulo 5, that some members of the Indigenous population were about to begin mining the silver at the place where Potosí would be founded, but stopped when, “se oyó un espantoso estruendo que hizo estremecer todo el Cerro y tras esto fue oída una voz que dijo: No saquéis la plata de este Cerro, porque es para otros

dueños” (Arzáns I 27). Here the message is clear in that according to Arzáns, the silver in the New World was destined for the Spaniards by divine providence.

The location of Potosí seems to be the first significant piece of Indigenous knowledge used by the Spaniards in the history of the city. The use of the huayras, portable smelting tents employed by the Indigenous population to separate the metal from the ore, is the second. They were used during the first twenty-seven years of exploitation of Potosí and were the only means through which the silver ore that was mined from the mountain could be smelted, thereby removing all impurities and other minerals and leaving only the precious silver.⁴⁴ The difference between these two knowledges is that unlike the location of the veins in the mountain, the technological knowledge associated with the huayra was not disclosed to the Spaniards,⁴⁵ and was only operated by the Indigenous population. The huayra was a technological secret that allowed the Indigenous population to smelt in the cold temperatures and high elevation of Potosí, while traditional European smelting practices simply did not work in those conditions (*Miners of the Red Mountain* 15).

Unlike the discovery made by Hualca, the narrator does not attribute the huayra to divine intervention, but to the intelligence of the Incas. In the chapter corresponding to the year 1557, the narrator describes the complications pertaining to the refinement of silver at Potosí and praises the intelligence of the Inca people that created a solution (Arzáns I 107). Although the Spanish dominated the Indigenous population through the conquest, the Indigenous were responsible for the revelation of the silver vein to begin with, and for the knowhow needed to refine silver ore in adverse conditions. The beginning decades of Potosí were molded by the combined drive of both the Spanish and Indigenous who came willingly to mine and refine as much silver as possible. It was one of the first and most important exchanges of culture in the text from which the city could begin to grow.

Case 1 – Abusing Authority

In the chapter that corresponds to the year 1549, the narrator describes the return of two hundred Spanish soldiers from, “la pacificación del reino de Tucma (que los españoles llamaron después Tucumán)” (I 67). These types of expeditions were not uncommon, as described in Chapter 1 with regards to Antonio López de Quiroga (39). As the soldiers returned to the city, a local judge named Francisco Esquivel witnessed several using Indigenous men to transport heavy loads on their backs, “aunque las provisiones de la real audiencia de Lima lo prohibían” (I 67). It should be noted that the majority of this story in the text is credited to Gacilaso de la Vega in his work *Comentarios reales* (second part).

The narrator states that many soldiers were abusing the Indigenous, however judge Esquivel waited until the last of them entered the city before moving to punish the behavior by singling out the last soldier, known as Aguirre, for the abuse of the two Indigenous servants who were carrying his belongings. Esquivel ordered that the offence be punished with the payment of a fine; however, the narrator indicates that Aguirre did not have sufficient silver nor gold to pay. As a result, Esquivel ordered that he receive two-hundred whippings. Aguirre sent friends to speak to Esquivel, asking instead to be hung rather than whipped because of the offense that the first punishment would cause him. He reminded Esquivel that, “...aunque él era hijodalgo no quería gozar de su privilegio, que le hacía saber que era hermano de un hombre que en su tierra era señor de vasallos” (I 67). The status of hidalgo should have been sufficient to prevent such corporal punishment. However, after the visit, Aguirre was ready to be punished. Other friends of Aguirre tried to make Esquivel change his decision, however they found the judge to be determined, so the *padrinos*, “el sargento Pedro de Lerma y el capitán Antonio de Meló...amenazándole de muerte si ejecutaba la sentencia se salieron de su presencia muy indignados” (I 67). More friends visited Esquivel, “El Contador Pedro de Zumarraga, Agustin Matienzo, Diego de Santa Cruz con

otros hombres principales y honrados de la Villa (y)...le suplicaron que no pasase adelante aquella sentencia porque era muy rigurosa” (I 67). All the pleas only succeeded in obtaining a delay of the punishment by eight days, which was flatly rejected by Aguirre who would prefer not to wait for the insult and to get it over with as soon as possible.

The primary issue then, from the perspective of Aguirre and the narrator, was that the severity of his punishment was disproportionate to the crime, and the attitude of Esquivel only escalated the matter through his arbitrary decisions and unwillingness to grant an appropriate change in the sentence. As Aguirre was led towards the place where he would be whipped, the narrator states that along the way, "corrió su carrera con mucha lástima de indios y españoles de ver una crueldad y afrenta ejecutada con tan poca atención en un hombre noble por tan poca causa" (I 67), indicating that it was not only Spaniards supporting Aguirre, but also members of the Indigenous population. This is noteworthy because it is logical to expect that the Indigenous population would support laws meant to safeguard them against abuse by the Spanish, and yet the punishment set out by Esquivel seems to be so arbitrary and unfair that it causes the opposite effect, causing tears and lamentation among some of the Indigenous population for the Spaniard who abused of two Indigenous men, as the narrator tells us.

And so, Aguirre received the whippings as ordered by Esquivel, taking it as “una afrenta”. The narrator states that in time, Aguirre would attain vengeance for the dishonor he suffered. This began with Aguirre abandoning his plans to continue working with his fellow Spaniards as a soldier and instead remained living in the outer parts of the city, waiting for the day in which Esquivel would vacate his official position to exact revenge, “en andarse tras él como hombre desesperado para matarlo como quiera que pudiese por vengar su afrenta, valiéndose del disfrazado traje por lograr más bien su intento (I 68). When Esquivel completed his term as judge, Aguirre began stalking him for revenge. Esquivel in turn

assumed incorrectly that with enough distance between them, the desire for revenge would diminish, but it was not so. First, Aguirre followed Esquivel to Los Reyes, and so he again moved, this time to Quito, only to be followed there as well. Finally, Esquivel moved to Cuzco, where despite his best efforts, which included the contracting around the clock protection through a number of bodyguards, wearing custom-made body armor of chainmail, and being armed with both knife and sword even when spending the day in his own home, Aguirre succeeded in his assassination and attained the restoration of the honor he thought stained by Esquivel. A part of Aguirre's strategy to gain access to Esquivel was to change his appearance and, "ni parecer donde gentes lo viesen, ni vestirse como noble sino como el más vil esclavo, y era así que por su mal traje nadie le conocía si él no se daba a conocer" (I 68). By dressing down and isolating himself, Aguirre was able to avoid detection until his task was complete, all the while being virtually unrecognizable.

The motivation that drove Aguirre in his actions towards the restoration of personal honor followed perfectly the honor-bound behavior of Spain beginning in the sixteenth century. As Scott Taylor affirms in *Honor and Violence in Golden Age Spain*, there was a rigid code of expectations surrounding the maintenance of honor, although much like the women in the previous chapter, this expectation differed greatly among socio-economic groups with both a higher burden of expectation and resources available for the most affluent and privileged people of society. Taylor states that a man, "must commit violence in order to avenge dishonor," (195), and while such violent actions towards restoring honor were harsh, and not seen in overwhelming numbers in everyday situations, they were still present and observable as a behavior in Spain (195). In the New World, most of the customs and terminology that was used mirrored that used in Spain, as described by Juan de Hevia Bolaños, author of a guide for the practice of criminal law, *Curica philippica*. There, he states

that the guide was published in Peru in 1602, and that the, “law used the term vengeance, implying personal enmity and an active search for retribution” (Taylor 68).

In the aftermath of the murder, the narrator describes how Aguirre had no more plans. Even though he stalked Esquivel for a considerable amount of time, and across four different cities and towns in preparation for the killing, Aguirre had no exit strategy for the inevitable chase that sought to bring him to justice. In his escape, he doubled back towards the scene of his crime to retrieve his forgotten hat at Esquivel’s home, and became lost in the streets. As news of the murder spread throughout the city, the narrator states how the Spaniards were restricted from exiting Cuzco by judge Alonso de Alvarado as part of the effort to capture Aguirre, while guards patrolled the streets with vigor. Aguirre wandered aimlessly until he happened upon a pair of Spaniards, “llamado el uno Santillán y el otro fulano Cataño, caballeros de mucha nobleza” (Arzáns I 68), who would provide him help and salvation. Although the two men did not know Aguirre personally before that moment, the narrator makes clear that news of what had occurred had already reached their ears, “Los caballeros, que le conocían y sabían su pretensión, le preguntaron: “¿Habéis muerto al licenciado Esquivel?” (I 68).

Upon confirming that the man who lay begging at their feet was in fact Aguirre, the two men assisted in hiding him without hesitation, “en la casa de un cuñado, donde a los últimos de ella había tres corrales grandes, y en uno de ellos una zahurda” (Arzáns I 69). For forty days and nights Aguirre remained hidden and fed, as with every meal each of the men, “disimuladamente metía en las faltriqueras todo el pan y carne y cualquier otra cosa que buenamente podía” (I 69). Considering how difficult it was to produce food in Potosí, resulting in the need for expensive importation in that time, which was still an early part of the development of the city,⁴⁶ Aguirre was fortunate to be eating meat on a daily basis while in hiding.⁴⁷ After the first forty days, Santillán and Cataño decided that keeping Aguirre

hidden was too great a danger to them, one that grew with each passing day, “les pareció a aquellos caballeros que sería bien poner a Aguirre en más cobro y librarse del peligro que corrían de tenerlo en su poder, porque el juez era riguroso y temían no les sucediese alguna desgracia” (I 69). Although Aguirre had vocal supporters in Potosí against the punishment imposed by Esquivel, and also in Cuzco, it was clear to them that he needed to leave the city as that informal support would not shield them from the law if it came down on them.

It was difficult to plan an escape because all Spaniards were scrutinized closely by the guards before leaving the city. This meant that Santillán and Cataño would need to disguise Aguirre to assure his escape. The simplest changes were to cut his hair and shave his beard. Yet, that would not be sufficient, and so an extraordinary change was made through the use of, “una fruta silvestre que ni es de comer ni de otro provecho alguno, llámanla los indos *uítoc*, es de color, forma y tamaño de una berenjena de las grandes” (Arzáns I 69). The narrator states that the *uítoc*, “echada en agua, y dejada estar así tres o cuatro días, y lavándose después con ella el rostro y las manos y dejado enjugar al aire, a tres o cuatro veces que se laven pone la tez más negra que un etíope” (Arzáns I 69), and does not wash off easily, taking about ten days with the natural shedding of the skin. The narrator does not indicate how the Spaniards came to the possession of such Indigenous knowledge. He only states that the fruit has an Indigenous name, and we can deduce that it is one more piece of knowledge that came into the Spaniards’ possession through the Indigenous population.

Aguirre washed himself in this way until his skin turned to a dark black, leaving him unrecognizable. To complete the portrait of a “negro”, “...lo vistieron como a tal del campo con vestidos bajos y viles” (Arzáns I 69). At noon, all three men left the home and walked through streets and the market towards one of the busiest exits of the city. The narrator continues, “El negro Aguirre iba a pie delante de los que parecían sus amos con un arcabuz al hombro, y uno de sus amos llevaba otro en el arzón, y el otro llevaba en las manos un halcón

fingiendo que iban a caza” (Arzáns I 69). As the group reached the city limits, the guards demanded to see the written permission that all Spaniards needed to obtain before being granted leave, which they had not obtained on purpose. Aguirre, now appearing to be a black servant with one of his masters, was permitted to continue along while the other master claimed that he would return after obtaining the permit for both the Spaniards. In the meantime, this allowed Aguirre and one of the two Spaniards, though the narrator does not specify which one, to exit the city and reach the limits of Cuzco’s jurisdiction. Once there, Aguirre was gifted a horse and some silver, and told, “Hermano, ya estáis en tierra libre que podéis ir os donde bien os estuviere, que yo no puedo hacer más por vos” (Arzáns I 69). The narrator concludes by describing that Aguirre arrived to Huamanga where he was well received by a member of his family, and then departed to an unknown destiny, forever escaping state justice.

At the conclusion of the story, Aguirre’s assassination goes unpunished and he lives his life in peace thanks to three distinct cultural components: he crossed paths with a pair of Spaniards who were sympathetic to his situation and had the means to hide him from the authorities, they were in possession of a useful piece of Indigenous knowledge, and he was then able to disguise himself in the skin of a black man. After forty days of hiding, a symbolic number relating to Lent where Jesus fasted in the desert before his public ministry, according to the Gospels of Matthew, Mark and Luke, during which all throughout he endured temptation by Satan, it was not Spanish knowledge that saved the day, but rather the strategic implementation of Indigenous knowledge through the use of the fruit to disguise Aguirre as a black servant. Similar to the Indigenous knowledge mentioned previously relating to the location of the silver veins that became the origin of Potosí, and the smelting technology of the huayra tents, Aguirre’s use of the fruit was a clear benefit to a Spaniard. Here the narrator has not stated how the knowledge was acquired, and so we do not know if it

was shared freely and in turn compensated in some way, or if it was simply appropriated.

While Arzáns does not provide the details of how the Indigenous knowledge was acquired, it is clearly now within the realm of the Spaniards and used to the benefit of Aguirre in this case.

Finally, the act of Aguirre changing his skin to that of a black man is without a doubt a complete appropriation, to seize the darkened skin of a black man and dress in the clothes that belonged to a servant to complete the disguise, all for the benefit of a Spaniard. Later, Aguirre was able to cast off both disguise and skin to return to his own Spanish flesh. Although Aguirre is not mentioned again in the text, we know for certain because of the narrator that these combined cultural elements granted Aguirre the possibility to live out the rest of his life in complete peace without consequence.

With Aguirre's story concluded, we can observe the overall meaning of the events that took place. As stated, Aguirre was guilty of abusing Indigenous men from the beginning, and Esquivel sentenced a punishment for the crime as was within his authority, but far too severe as the narrator previously let us know. In acting so excessive with assigning a punishment, Esquivel drew the ire of other Spaniards and the lamentations of the Indigenous, and as the narrator stated, what resulted in Aguirre seeking and obtaining revenge. Aguirre's behavior, while violent, was nonetheless rooted in Spanish cultural norms as explained earlier by Taylor, and thus not unexpected for a Spaniard to adhere to in the New World. Esquivel, despite moving from town to town in search of safety, with round the hour protection from two bodyguards and wearing his armor, sword and knife at all times in his own home, could not avoid a violent death. The root of all these problems lay with Esquivel in assigning too extreme a punishment against Aguirre and ignoring his hidalgo status, as the narrator let us know previously.

Santillán and Cataño, the two helpers of Aguirre, are introduced after Esquivel is killed. The narrator specifies that they are noble men who do not hesitate to assist their fellow Spaniard in his hour of need. They also are in possession of the Indigenous knowledge used to disguise Aguirre and allow him to appear as a black servant. These points all allow us to read this case as rooted in the exchanges of culture that all benefitted Aguirre. He did not even need to be the one to first acquire the Indigenous knowledge, for it has already entered into Spaniard knowledge through Santillán and Cataño. Finally, we have mentioned that Arzáns uses the *Comentarios Reales* by Garcilaso de la Vega as a source for this story. He is faithful to the source material, except at the close where there is an omission, “Los soldados bravos y facinerosos decían que si hubiera muchos Aguirre por el mundo, tan deseosos de vengar sus afrentas, que los pesquisidores no fueran tan libres e insolentes” (Segunda Parte Libro VI Chapter XVIII). The omission could therefore be unintentional and simply a mistake by Arzáns, or intentional as a sign that the author agrees with the actions of Esquivel, for we must recall that all of the problems in this case are rooted in a Spaniard abusing two men of the Indigenous population. On the one hand, Esquivel abused his authority in punishing a hidalgo, and on the other hand, Aguirre was abusing of the Indigenous population. The omission of Garcilaso’s complete text allows for the case to be presented but without lauding Aguirre

This chapter in the text represents the exchange of cultures because of the benefit that came to Aguirre in the use of the *úitoc* fruit, and the black skin that he was able to appropriate for his own disguise. The *úitoc* fruit is not referred to either by Arzáns nor Garcilaso by a Spanish name, only by its Indigenous name, but both authors focus on the importance of its use, and how a Spaniard benefitted from its applications. Apart from the story of Aguirre, the fruit will not appear again in either of the texts. There is no history of exchange nor of appropriation regarding the use of the fruit, which is to say that unlike the two other examples

we have seen so far, of the knowledge of the Cerro where Potosí would be founded and of the Huayras, here the *uitoc* fruit apparently only benefits Spaniards, with no benefit described in return to the Indigenous population. This is a clear example of distinct cultural components blending into something new to the benefit of a single Spaniard relatively early in the text at a mere sixteen years into the one hundred and ninety-two that make up the *Historia*.

The next case begins with another commodity that was of significant importance to the Spaniards in the New World, and that is the coca leaf.

Case 2 - Francisco de la Rocha y la coca

Our second case deals with a man whose actions are presented initially as positive for the city and indirectly later as negative, as the narrator will go on to describe. His story begins around the coca leaf, a widespread commodity that easily traversed all cultures present in the Andean space. The coca leaf was a natural resource that underwent a massive shift in its collection, use, and distribution in the New World once the Spanish settlers became involved, and its importance to European settlers cannot be understated. As Plutarco Naranjo affirms, coca leaves were used by pre-Columbian cultures in a variety of ways such as in religious ceremonies and medical treatments (171). In the *Historia de la Villa Imperial del Potosí*, the narrator first describes the coca leaf in the chapter corresponding to the year 1573, where he mentions that coca is already popular among not only the Indigenous population, but Spaniards as well. Often it was sold in the largest markets in the Peruvian Viceroyalty (Arzáns I 149). It is not until later in the text, in the same chapter presented earlier of Claudia the Witch, that the narrator describes its various applications in the New World, “en todo él se usó y usa traer esta coca en la boca, y desde la mañana hasta que se van a dormir la traen [los indios] sin la echar de ella” (I 267). When chewed, the coca leaf helped the Indigenous workers during long days in the mine by reducing hunger and providing strength (I 267). It had other uses within traditional Indigenous culture, but the narrator focuses on a few

particular uses in the text, mainly as a commodity sold in the markets, (I 267), and illicit use of coca leaves in rituals pertaining to witchcraft, as seen with Claudia the witch considered in the year 1673 (II 269).

In the chapter that corresponds to the year 1642, the narrator introduces *capitán* Francisco de la Rocha, who amassed a fortune in the city and through a combination of greed and ill will, authored his own ruin. Unlike other cases presented in this and the previous chapters, the events involving Rocha are not limited to one chapter and one year. This occurs most often when the individual impacts the city in some significant manner, for better or worse, and Rocha will do both. The narrator introduces Rocha and places his arrival in the city around 1638, but write about it in the chapter corresponding with 1642, by which point the character was well liked and known, with a song that was sung in that later year about him:

‘Yo soy Rocha el que llegué
a Potosí desdichado,
y en una cancha arrojado
vendiendo coca empecé.

Con la plata que busqué me puse a labrar moneda’. (II 87)

Rocha will be mentioned at various points in the chapters that follow this one,⁴⁸ up to his eventual execution in 1651. He is not the main focus of most of those chapters, but his actions do appear. Afterwards, the narrator will again refer to Rocha in the chapter corresponding to the year 1656 with regards to the aftermath of his execution and the impact it had on the people and the city, as we will now see.

Rocha’s origin is not explicitly explained by the narrator, but we are told that like many Spaniards he enriched himself through the resources of the New World. Rocha

exemplifies how a Spaniard could benefit from the Indigenous population in ways beyond their labor, as consumers. The coca leaf became a created necessity for the Indigenous miners in Potosí and elsewhere, which is to say that the creation of mines and the forced labor of Indigenous workers required the use of the coca leaf to endure the altitude of the mines and also the stave off hunger. Once more referring to the chapter dedicated to Claudia, in the year 1674, the narrator states that, “el expendio de la coca en Potosí hacía malgastar a los indios el dinero que debían emplear en comida. Los mercaderes del Cuzco, fuertemente interesados en este tráfico, se agraviaron y alegaron ante el virrey que 400 españoles sólo en el Cuzco vivían del comercio de la coca” (II 269). In this way, Rocha’s wealth originated with the sale of coca leaves.

The narrator tell us that the initial capital used to buy his first inventory came from others, “se prestó de un paisano algunos pesos” (II 111) and “...y no falta quien con mucha verdad diga que una india de mediano caudal con quien él tuvo amistad ilícita porque lo mantuviese y socorriese su miseria, le dio también el dinero para la compra de dichas arrobas” (II 111). As the narrator describes, Rocha owes his wealth to the opportunities provided through a blend of cultural components; the Spanish commercialization of coca leaves that were previously only the domain of the Indigenous, and the consensual carnal relationship between a Spaniard and a member of an Indigenous people that apparently inverted economically a traditional power relation between colonizer and colonized.

Throughout the decade of the 1640s in the *Historia*, Rocha gained not only wealth through his commercial enterprises but also significant power in all things social and political. The narrator mentions that “se hallaba tan opulento de caudal que la cantidad de dinero que poseía no se componía de millares sino de millones” (II 111). Arzáns also praises Rocha for his acts of charity, “Demos fin a este capítulo volviendo a hacer buenas memorias del capitán Francisco de la Rocha... en este año de 1645 acabó de obrar la iglesia del hospital real que

comenzó a su costa” (II 103). However, as we stated that narrator also speaks to the negative parts of Rocha’s story, as seen in the chapter corresponding to the year 1647, the narrator states that Rocha was given the position of Alcalde by the Viceroy and explains that he wanted the position “sólo por vengar algunos agravios que los criollos le habían hecho” (II 111). The narrator concludes the description by stating “Con este cargo se mostró tan cruel que se hizo el horror de Potosí y de toda su provincia” (II 112).

One particular episode allows us to evaluate Rocha’s character. This can be seen in a criollo that felt the wrath of Rocha, who was, “don Juan de Armuña, ilustre caballero natural de la ciudad de Santiago en el reino de Chile, mozo galán, discreto y valiente” (II 112). Armuña engaged in a number of crimes to avenge certain unspecified grievances,⁴⁹ such as in the “asiento de Titiri mataron al teniente de justicia de aquel Partido” burning down some homes belonging to Basques (II 112). Three other men accompanied Armuña, one named Sebastián Niño de Figueroa, and the other two unnamed in the text. After a long chase, Rocha and his men located the fugitives as they slept in their hideout and after a brief struggle, only Armuña was left resisting.⁵⁰ To end the confrontation peacefully, that narrator states that Rocha gave his word, not as an alcalde but as an individual, that if Armuña dropped his weapons and came quietly, he would be safe. Armuña agreed, and all of the men were taken prisoner. Even though Armuña was not harmed when apprehended, his social status was disregarded, “poniéndolo en prisiones sin respeto de su nobleza y méritos (que a la verdad fue [Armuña] capitán de caballos en Chile y obtuvo otros puestos honoríficos)” (II 112). As we saw with Aguirre, severe problems can come from not respecting individuals in a manner befitting their social rank.

The promise made to Armuña for his safety was apparently only meant for him, as the accomplice Sebastián Niño de Figueroa was then taken aside, garroted, and his head was placed on a pike that Rocha carried back into the city, which was done as the narrator states

because “El alcalde provincial era sumamente vanaglorioso” (II 112). Later the narrator states in the chapter corresponding to the year 1648 that Rocha’s finances “pasaba ya su caudal de 7,000,000 en moneda solamente, y así mantenía muchísima vanidad” (II 118). These two descriptions sum up the motivations of Rocha throughout the text. The narrator describes how actions like those taken by Rocha should be avoided, speaking about his death in the chapter corresponding to the year 1648, “nadie debe desconfiar en sus miserias ni ensoberbecerse en su prosperidad” (II 132). For now, it is useful to consider how the narrator describes Rocha with the above descriptions throughout the chapters that detail his life and his actions. To become consumed with pride, and as we also have seen, vanity and vainglory, is something that the narrator states should be avoided.

Shortly after Rocha enters the city while displaying the decapitated head of Figueroa on a pike, the narrator comments on the nature of such actions, as he describes the difference between posturing for the creation of self-image, and what constitutes genuine honorable behavior:

Bien pone en cuidado la honrilla de esta vida la estimación y la loa del siglo, la vanidad de las obras y aplauso de ellas, aun siendo malas, que cuando son buenas dignas son de loa; pero no se engañen, que así esa prosperidad como el resto de la demás grandeza y mando secular está sujeta a mudanzas y engaños, y la honra no es la que hace virtuoso al hombre ni excelente, sino solamente es señal de que hay (o según buena razón había de haber) excelencia de virtudes y merecimientos en la persona honrada. (II 113)

As this statement goes, the entrance of Rocha is pure posture, as also seen in how he decorated his horse, “en un caballo ricamente aderezado” (II 113). While it was his responsibility to enforce the laws and dispense justice as alcalde, the theatrical entrance only serves towards an image that Rocha wants to construct for himself. As a consequence, to his

actions, the living relatives of Figueroa threaten Rocha for such disrespectful treatment of a family member. Rocha flees inside of a convent there, "...arrepentido de haber traído la cabeza de Figueroa porque unos parientes de este difunto le enviaron a decir que antes de muchas horas trocarían las cabezas y pondrían la suya donde tenían puesta la de Figueroa" (II 113). Rocha begged for divine assistance, but his words implied a blindness to his own actions, "hablando con la santa imagen decía: 'Señor, defende mi causa, pues por cumplir con la obligación de juez que ha castigado a unos malos hombres me quieren quitar la vida'. A estas palabras añadía otras que más provocaban risa que compasión de su miedo" (II 113), as the quintillas transcribed by Arzáns and circulating of the text showed.

Rocha did not respect his word to Armuña, who learned on his second day in the public jail that he was going to be executed. He has a brief, primal reaction: he vomits. Even if he faces the sentence with fear, the narrator describes him after the execution in an almost poetic manner, "Quedó en fin dividida la cabeza, que puesta después sobre un cojín y salpicadas las mejillas con su misma sangre enternece su hermosura, que cierto la tuvo en vida el malogrado don Juan con otros dotes de naturaleza" (II 113). The narrator has described Armuña in death with a beauty and peacefulness that seemed to elude him in life, without offering much in the way of excusing the criminal behavior that resulted in this execution. This could serve as a compromising middle ground for the author, as it is not possible to excuse such criminal acts, so instead Armuña is described as all but perfect in appearance in death as a way to focus on the behavior of Rocha, who seemed far more interested in his vanity as a Alcalde than in keeping his word to the man he arrested. In this way, it is the criminal who becomes elevated by the narrator, as opposed to the Alcalde who captured him.

In the chapter corresponding to the following year 1648, the narrator restates how in 1641 Rocha worked to augment his already considerable wealth, "haciéndose mercader de plata, como en efecto comenzó a labrar moneda" (II 115). The activity was done properly by

him until about 1643, but then some members of the group, “comenzaron a cargar la mano en la liga cuando se fundían las partidas” (II 115). According to the *Diccionario de Autoridades*, Tomo IV, in 1734, the term *liga* in the context of minting coinage “Se llama tambien la porción pequeña de otro metal, que se hecha al oro o a la plata, quando [sic] se bate moneda, o se fábrica alguna pieza”, allowing for them to spend less on silver but still produce the same amount of fraudulent coin. The narrator then describes that a new *ensayador*, which is an officer of the mint, named Ergueta came from Spain and continued to add more and more copper to the *liga*, and in “los principios del año de 1647 y entró luego en el oficio de ensayador don Felipe Ramírez, que era de la casa de Rocha, con que se adelantó tanto la desvergüenza que aun más de la mitad de la moneda era cobre” (II 116).

With this fraudulent coin, Rocha was generous with the people of the city, “Cuando se hacían fiestas de caballería en la plaza o se acercaban las Pascuas, dicen que el alcalde Rocha le decía al ensayador que echase porción de granalla aún más que otras veces en la partida de plata que se fundía, para que de las creces se gastasen en lucimientos, y todo se ponía en efecto” (II 116), establishing publicly that Rocha was actively involved in the fraud, though it is not specified by the narrator if he was the primary instigator of this act within the group, or simply one of many willing participants. At this point, the narrator is still describing Rocha’s use of the coin as a positive point for the city, but also linked to his desire to create a good figure in front of the city pointing once again to his extreme vanity. Earlier we described how Rocha paid for the construction of a church, however that must have been paid for with his own funds since it was before he became involved in the minting of silver coins. In this way, the narrator writes two representations of Rocha, one as loose with ill-gotten money, and another that may have been generous with legitimate funds.⁵¹ In the end, the source of funds is irrelevant, for Rocha was dedicated to his own vanity and seemed willing to pay one way

or another to maintain a perception of himself among the people of the city. Even if the funds used for the betterment of the city were illegitimate, his goal is still the same.

The initial observations of subpar coinage did not immediately bring forth accusations of fraud, as the narrator let us know. In the chapter corresponding to the year 1648, Arzáns states that at first the fraud, “se conoció en los reinos de Europa y no en éstos” (II 115), and there were official inquiries made to correct the situation, presented as innocent errors in production and without malicious intent (II 115-116). Since the fraud continued after the initial inquiries, the narrator states that Felipe IV was informed again that in Potosí they minted bad coins (II 116). To deal with the serious problem, a serious individual was chosen, don Francisco de Nestares Marín, who was praised extensively by Arzáns in presenting him. The narrator refers to Marín in a number of different ways; by his name as Marín, as *el presidente*, and as *el visitador*.⁵² The narrator concludes by stating that, “Encargóle, tocante a los ministros que hubiesen cooperado en lo mal labrado de la moneda, que los castigase con piedad, sin escándalo ni daño de la república, y que todo lo dejaba a su prudencia y discreción” (II 116).

News that Marín would soon arrive to investigate the fraud spread among the “abandalizados” (II 117). The narrator states that Rocha prepared for the eventual arrival by safeguarding his assets, “...escondió hasta 7,000,000 que en moneda, piñas y barras tenía” (II 122), though not doing any of the work himself “...(según cuenta don Juan Pasquier) más de 30 noches estuvieron sus negros acarreándola en mulas” (II 122). When the work was completed and everything was hidden in an undisclosed location, “se desaparecieron los seis negros que la acarrearón, y fue cosa averiguada que los mataron con veneno” (II 122). This marks a turning point in the narrative. Before Rocha acted violently within the scope of his authority as alcalde and vaingloriously, now the murder of six black servants can only be attributed towards a desire to keep safe his personal wealth. There is no commentary made by

the narrator regarding the assassination of the six servants, only that it was found to have been committed. Upon Marín's arrival, he took swift action to detain and punish those responsible for the silver minting fraud, "la primera diligencia que hizo fue prender al ensayador Ramírez y ajustándole la causa le hizo dar garrote a los nueve días de su prisión" (II 122), while also detaining Rocha and forty-two other men, "...que eran ministros y oficiales en la Casa de Moneda. Con estas prisiones horrorizó toda la Villa" (II 122).

The narrator states that Marín, "Con estas prisiones horrorizó toda la Villa y se vio el efecto que adelante se dirá" (II 122), which is the first of a few negative comments to be made regarding the adverse effect to come. In the following year, the narrator describes in the chapter corresponding to 1650 that Marín, "...suspendió la labranza de moneda más de cuatro meses con notable daño de esta Villa y de todo el Perú" (II 124).⁵³ This is a complex affair of events, but to the narrator it is considered among the very worst that the city endures in its history:

Tercera vez castiga Dios a Potosí por mano de los hombres, y fue tan general esta destrucción que alcanzó a todos los reinos del Perú, sin escaparse en ellos y particularmente en esta Villa (como fuente de las riquezas) español ni indio que no experimentase grandísimo daño y menoscabo en sus caudales. Por esto, pues, fue la más terrible destrucción en castigo de sus muchas culpas. (II 123)

Specifically, the narrator describes that Marín devalued a large portion of the silver coins that circulated the city which belonged to the people, by half (II 124). The result of this massive devaluation of currency hurt not only those who committed fraud, but a great many more who were innocent bystanders, "que por todos corrió la pérdida: por ricos, por los de mediano caudal, y por los pobres; por españoles y por indios" (II 124), making Marín highly unpopular. The narrator describes that Marín's actions were fueled by passion in the moment, and then states that to make such impactful decisions, one should be, "libre de cualquier

passion” (II 124). The narrator continues by criticizing Marín in a more subtle way and offering a simple solution to the problem that would have been far less heavy handed:

Lo que digo es que nunca los reyes envían a los ministros para que destruyan a sus vasallos. Bien pudiera el señor presidente haber dejado que en este peruano reino corriese aquella moneda en su propio valor, digo el de ocho reales peso, y castigado a los ministros y oficiales que cometieron el delito para ejemplar en adelante, y no que el castigo lo hizo tan general. (II 126)

In this way the narrator is clearly indicating that what occurred was by no means intended by the Spanish Crown, but still have adverse effects on many people, when the obvious answer to the problem would have been to hold only those engaged in the activity accountable.

Rocha and his conspirators would eventually be sentenced to harsh punishments, with six of the responsible sentenced to have their throats slit, twelve others to be choked to death, and the rest would face lesser punishments and fines (II 126). However, many of the conspirators acted to avoid justice rather than face it, escaping confinement in various ways and going to Buenos Aires or Spain to hide (II 126).⁵⁴ Marín meanwhile had become so unpopular in the city for his devaluation of the people’s silver that he thought those men to be lost, thinking that the people would side with them in helping facilitate an escape (II 126), while also needing to take drastic measures to ensure his own safety from the people of the city.⁵⁵

The narrator then describes how Rocha alone, “...no pudo o no quiso [escapar], pero viendo que el señor presidente estaba contra él muy indignado porque todos le cargaban de mayor culpa, tentó el librarse por plata y tuvo efecto en esta primera ocasión, habiéndose compuesto en 50,000 pesos” (II 126-127). The narrator adds a pointed comment here with regards to the money that Rocha was able to produce so easily, stating that, “...el mundo

suele medir el poder con el tener, de donde Plutarco refiere...que la riqueza son los nervios del buen despacho en los negocios, habiendo en buena razón de ajustarse el tanto de la estimación personal con el cuanto de la virtud y méritos propios” (II 127), and then follows up by pointing out that Rocha lacked virtue and merit, and that instead it was only the wealth he possessed that commanded any manner of power.

By this point, the actions of Marín caused lasting and negative effects on Rocha, “...y por esto buscaba modos para la venganza, que no debiera, pues había incurrido en tan grave delito y al fin tenía vida (aunque fuese a costa de la plata). Hallaba por todos caminos embarazo, y su mala suerte le ofreció el peor pues determinó quitar la vida al señor presidente con veneno” (II 127). The narrator continues on in a way that is unique compared to most stories, where rather than condemn Rocha for the plan to assassinate a representative of the Crown, he states of Marín, “Hízose tan aborrecible ya en este año su señoría por haberles menoscabado sus caudales a los moradores de esta Villa, que deseaban beberle la sangre todos” (II 127). The narrator chooses to point out how everyone wanted blood from Marín, before moving on to matters concerning other parties entirely in this chapter.

In the following chapter, but still corresponding to the same year of 1651, the narrator describes Rocha’s plan that involved the use of a third party, whereby Rocha, “se valió de una negra esclava del presidente, que la había traído de la ciudad de Lima” (II 127). Rocha tempted this black slave woman with the intention of gaining her assistance as an assassin for his own benefit (II 128). Eventually, as the narrator describes, the black slave was tasked with poisoning Marín, and in return, Rocha “...le prometió que le daría cantidad de pesos para su libertad, y demás de esto otra buena porción para que después viviese muy descansadamente” (II 128). The narrator comments on this not by condemning Rocha, but again by describing the adverse effects of passion that can overtake rational behavior, “oh pasión vengativa y fuerza que tienes, pues alentaste a un caballero que (por tomar satisfacción de lo que parecía

haberle hecho agravio siendo hasta allí piadoso castigo de su grave delito) arriesgase la vida y al fin la perdiese en la demanda” (II 128). We saw the narrator describe this same passion earlier when Marín devalued the silver in the city, and in this way Arzáns is not critiquing the men but shifts some of the blame over to an over emotional response. This allows for a viewpoint that is more ambivalent than either in support or against the two men, which is understandable in that both engaged in actions that were controversial.

Rocha left poison with the black servant and allowed for an unspecified amount of time to pass. Then, one day, “Avisó a la negra y dióle orden y señal para el día cuando de mañana le enviase una fuente de plata y en ella un desayuno, ese sería el que le había de dar el veneno a su señor” (II 129). Despite the planning, when the day came that Rocha executed his portion of the scheme, everything fell apart:

El indio pongo que servía en la cocina al presidente [Marín] trajo a la negra la fuente y en ella una empanada. Entró a las casas reales donde vivía su señoría, subió a los cuartos y comenzó a llamar a la primera puerta, y con dormir la esclava en la primera sala no oyó los golpes y pudo oírlos su señor que estaba más adentro. El cual muy indignado, cubriéndose con un capote salió a ver quién llamaba. (II 129)

Marín demanded to know about the recipient of the meal, since it was not the Indigenous man who would normally deliver his food, “Respondió que para la negra. Tornóle a preguntar que quién lo enviaba, y sin más rodeos dijo que el capitán Francisco de la Rocha” (II 129). At this point, the plans had come undone for Rocha.

The narrator continues by stating that Marín roused the other servants at the home and sent them out in order to, “...traer al escribano de la hacienda real y a su secretario, que al punto vinieron, y en todo ese tiempo dormía la negra” (II 129). When everyone was back in Marín’s home, they woke the black servant to question her about the connection to Rocha.

The narrator states that they asked of her, “¿Qué conocimientos qué cuentas tienes con Rocha?”. Respondió: ‘Ningunas, ni conozco a ese hombre’” (II 129), all the while unaware that the Indio pongo had already told that he received the empanada with instructions to deliver it to her from Rocha himself. The narrator continues by stating, “Entonces llamó al indio, y éste ante ella le dijo y se afirmó en que Rocha se lo había dado para la negra” (II 129), leaving the black servant in a delicate predicament as the evidence was presented to her. In order to encourage her to be more truthful, “Mandó el presidente trajesen el potro para que en él confesase la verdad al rigor del tormento, lo cual oyendo la negra dijo que no era necesario la atormentasen, que ella declararía cuanto en aquel caso había” (II 129). The threat of torture was sufficient to stop her from maintaining the charade and she confessed to the crime, implicating Rocha along the way. Fortunately for the black servant, Marín decided that the fault for the murderous plot lay not with her, but with Rocha. For her part, “la mandó azotar por las calles y luego la echó a una viña” (II 129), which is a light punishment compared to what Rocha would receive. As we know from the beginning of the chapter in the eyes of the narrator, Rocha’s plan was doomed to fail for placing his faith in this servant, a woman, as Arzáns states, “Este vengativo caballero sembró la semilla de su venganza (mala, por ser contra el precepto divino) en la tierra frágil de una inconstante mujer (y de las menos buenas, pues las más son malas)” (I 128). The narrator is again deflecting responsibility and condemnation from Rocha, this time to the negative qualities he perceives in women, which is not out of the ordinary for Arzáns in the rest of the text.⁵⁶

The narrator describes that Rocha was arrested in Tarapaya soon after, where he had fled in an unsuccessful attempt to hide from the law (II 129). From the moment in which Rocha was arrested, he appeared astonished at the charge against him, and vehemently denied any wrongdoing (II 129). Once back in Potosí, Rocha was submitted to the *tormenta de cuerda*, but remained steadfast in his denial of any crime, stating that he had a number of

jealous enemies that would accuse him falsely, and that any one of them must be at fault.

Two men were present during the torture according to the narrator, Marín and the newly named *alcalde de la Casa de Moneda*, don Antonio Cerón, who was described as a friend of Rocha in the past. Don Antonio Cerón interrogated Rocha because it was his responsibility, and yet the narrator describes how this man was an untrustworthy and opportunistic besides being a friend to Rocha before, now jealous and driven only by this desire to see him fall.

As the interrogation went on, Rocha continued to deny any guilt. When the *potro* finally broke Rocha's arm (II 130), he stopped answering altogether, sitting in silence as the questions were repeated over and over regarding the attempt to murder Marín with poison. During this time, the narrator describes that Rocha kept his eyes on a window without taking his stare away and continues stating that “piadosamente creen y afirman los que lo vieron y oyeron que allí se le apareció la sacratísima [sic] Virgen” (II 130). The narrator describes how Rocha said, “Ea, Señora, sea en satisfacción de mis pecados este tormento” (II 130).⁵⁷

For the crime of the assassination attempt for which he was accused, but adamantly denied being guilty of, Rocha was sentenced to death. In the days leading up to the execution, the narrator described how his many supporters in the city asked for leniency, seeking mercy and to avoid execution, “hubo grandes empeños de toda la Villa pidiendo por su vida. Fue primero el ilustre cabildo en forma, luego el gremio de los señores azogueros...Luego fueron una por una las sagradas religiones” (II 131). These pleas were unsuccessful, and Rocha's sentence was set for death, and it is at this point that the narrator deviates completely in the story.

In describing Rocha's actions up to this point, the narrator has stated everything as though it were fact, although he does not quote any sources with regards to the plot to assassinate Marín, in persuading the black servant to assist in the scheme, or the origins of the poison. However, following the narrator's description of the people who sought clemency for

Rocha, but failed to do so, he enters into an alternate series of events that show Rocha as innocent, all of which are described equally as factual. Arzáns states that, “Muchos afirman que fue [falso] testimonio lo del veneno, y don Juan Pasquier defiende con muchas razones este particular diciendo que al capitán Rocha le tenía el presidente un odio mortal, y sobre esto ciertos malos hombres le levantaron aquel falso testimonio” (II 130-131). The narrator describes a series of events from his source Juan Pasquier that provides an alternate version of events, stating that the poison powder was actually from an entirely separate occurrence. An Indigenous ladino named Juan had killed another man in a squabble, and Marín, caring personally for this Indigenous man, helped hide him from the *corregidor* Juan Velarde. The poison was slipped into Rocha's home by an unnamed group of individuals for they knew that, “Rocha le tenía el presidente un odio mortal, y sobre esto ciertos malos hombres le levantaron aquel falso testimonio” (II 131), where it was found, and he was implicated in the plot to kill Marín. Arzáns goes on to state that this series of events “que se hallaron los polvos en casa del señor presidente, el dicho autor don Juan Pasquier lo afirma (más dice que no fue por orden de Rocha) y se verificó por este caso que sucedió poco después de su muerte” (II 132).

This shows that Arzáns has presented two versions of a single event that entirely contradict one another, and he does not address the contradiction, nor does he offer caveats to the reader when first describing the assassination plot of Rocha. Both are presented as factual events. From pages 128 to 130 of Volume II, Arzáns speaks as though Rocha were a man so overcome with hatred for Marín that he plans and then fails in his scheme to murder. Immediately afterwards, we are presented with a counter whereby Rocha is made to seem completely innocent of the plot. The contradiction is never resolved, and the reader is left with two versions, one where Rocha is the perpetrator and Marín the potential victim, and another where Rocha is the victim, and Marín the origin of the poison in his own attempt to

help an Indigenous ladino escape the law for a murder of his own. In this way, Arzáns has portrayed both men in varying states of guilt or innocence in the final action that resulted in the death of Rocha, before again delving into a critique of certain characteristics such as vanity and pride.

What everybody agrees to is that nearing his end, Rocha gives an oral account of his will, and assigns funds to various ecclesiastic members and to the king, continuing to be charitable even close to death, stating however that the money is held by Marín because of the fraud of silver minting. This is left unresolved by the narrator, so following Rocha's execution, it is not clear if the funds were distributed, or kept by Marín. Similar to before when Rocha was charitable with fraudulent silver, it is easy to be so charitable moments from death, for he does not need the wealth, and the declaration, regardless of the turnout, is yet another public performance to augment his insatiable vanity. This point is relevant later in discussing the public perception of both men until the end of Rocha's story.

Rocha died “prevenido como buen cristiano...por disposición del presidente y sentencia del alcalde Antonio Cerón, su compadre y amigo, le dieron garrote en la misma vivienda del presidente en un retirado aposento” (II 131). Following the execution of Rocha, the narrator states that “No faltó quien a la trágica muerte de este capitán Francisco de la Rocha hiciese las siguientes décimas” (II 132), written from the perspective of Rocha himself:

Vasallos de Potosí

los más nobles y leales,

considerad estos males

que hoy han pasado por mí.

El capitán Rocha fui que con aplausos y honores

gocé fiestas y favores,
pero fortuna voltaria,
como es inconstante y varia,
me los convirtió en dolores.
¿Quién dijera que mi suerte
a ser infeliz llegara
y la plata me quitara
y padeciera por ella?
Mas fortuna que atropella
puestos más altos de honor,
hizo que un visitador
declarase mis delitos
pues están todos escritos
y los pago con rigor.
En un confuso tropel
juntos venís a mirarme
en esta plaza, a notarme
cómo estoy en un cordel.
Fue mi riqueza oropel,
no surtió ningún provecho,
ella me ha puesto en estrecho,

de mi honor me ha derribado

cuando entendí ser honrado

con un hábito en mi pecho.

Yo fui el lamentable mal

de muchos soberbios pechos

pues les quité vidas y hechos

siendo alcalde provincial,

y he llegado a extremo tal

qui si cortaba cabezas

ahora estoy hecho piezas

y la mía está colgada

y a pique de ser cortada

sin que aprovechen riquezas. (II 132)

The selection of this decima by the narrator would be considered as a further deflection of direct condemnation by the narrator, in that the piece includes declarations of guilt, of the ruinous effect of wealth on character, of the falls of excessive pride and vanity, and of being a cruel alcalde. The narrator does not need to describe these points as his own, because he describes how, “Estas décimas hallé entre unos papeles de aquellos tiempos y no quise dejar de ponerlas pareciéndome ser más cortos que otros que he dejado en varios asuntos, por ser más largos” (II 132), providing no source or author.

After Rocha's death, the narrator concludes with two additional points. First, "Muerto ya el capitán Rocha quedaron también por el presidente destruidos 42 hombres nobles que tenían cargos y oficios en la Casa de Moneda, los cuatros solos naturales de esta Villa, y los

38 de varios reinos de España” (II 132), which is expected punishment for those who defrauded the Crown of its currency and destabilized the silver market on which Spain depended. The narrator’s description is again partly deflecting attention away from the men and their crimes, and onto Marín as a destroyer of these noble men. Second, the narrator describes the various rumors about what happened to the seven million pesos hidden by Rocha:

Afirman algunos que por mano de un religioso de la orden de Nuestra Señora de las Mercedes fue llevado a España la mayor parte de este caudal, y el resto se repartió entre los deudos de este religioso que tenía en esta Villa; otros dicen que fue llevado a Tarapaya y allí lo enterraron sin saberse dónde, y por esta noticia cavaron las casas de recreo de Rocha que allí tenía y no hallaron nada, y también se ha dicho que están en la misma laguna; otros dicen que no ha salido de Potosí y que está aquí enterrada en algún paraje que se ignora, y de este modo hay varias opiniones’. (II 132)

The narrator does not comment on any of the rumors or confirm one to be correct over others, however the description of four distinct possibilities for the location of his wealth demonstrate that for Potosí, the wealth was more important than Rocha himself.

The life of Rocha is a curious tale, but altogether familiar in terms of themes presented by the narrator. He grew a fortune from humble beginnings, selling coca leaves, funded in part by an Indigenous woman. We could consider him generous with his initial wealth by spending on infrastructure, and we know too that later this funding was made with fraudulent coin, and pride and personal vanity were the motivations for his actions and the trouble that came as a result. Rocha is not motivated by altruism, but only vanity and pride. After Rocha’s death, the narrator states that:

Éste era el ya dicho capitán Francisco Gómez de la Rocha, a quien un todo le sobró primero y todo junto le faltó después. No le duró, no le duró [sic] mucho este contento y alegría, esta prosperidad, este lucimiento y vanidad que son altos y bajos de la felicidad humana, cuyas desdichas sirven de víspera a los acrecentamientos y a los gustos, por lo cual nadie debe desconfiar en sus miserias ni ensoberbecerse en su prosperidad, pues con el mismo viento menguan aquéllas y éstas crecen. (II 132)

The narrator brings the focus to the dangers of pride which in this case attributed to Rocha's downfall. It is then curious to see that in this same paragraph, the narrator shifts once again despite these shortcomings to speak of the positive impact made by Rocha, stating,

No se le puede negar que fue este caballero de mucha caridad con los pobres, pues quien lo experimentó dice que cada semana pasaban de 200 pesos los que repartía a pobres vergonzantes. Ya dije cómo entre otras obras buenas que hizo fue una de fabricar la iglesia del hospital real, y también mejoró las rentas de los pobres que en él se curan. (II 132)

As we have stated, these acts of charity are far less impressive when we consider that the funds came from fraud, at least on some occasions. The same goes for the offer to gift silver coins to the King:

Estas y otras obras de caridad hizo este caballero, indigno por cierto de morir con tanta afrenta sólo por la demasiada pasión del señor presidente, el cual por venganza suya quiso que el rey perdiese 400,000 pesos de buena [sic] moneda que ofreció últimamente por su vida, que no quiso concedérsela su señoría. (II 132)

The duality in the representation of both Rocha and Marín returns here once again. The narrator sways between describing Rocha as characterized for his greed, pride, and vanity, while at the same time mentioned the good of his charity towards the people and the city.

Marín is likewise presented at times in a positive manner in representing the Crown towards a necessary task, which was to stop the silver coin minting fraud, but despised by the citizens as his actions fueled by passion and greed in the devaluation that affected everyone in the city, guilty and innocent alike. It is a curious point, that Rocha be lauded for his generosity, even though that quality stemmed from defrauding the Crown, while Marín is written in a way that chastises his character for his own apparent greed. It is not as though most of the story told by the narrator about Rocha portrays him as an innocent man. Quite the opposite is true in describing the minting of silver and the fraud that went on, and so there must be something that pushes the presentation of good and bad back and forth.

The problem for author is that Rocha and Marín represent both good for the city and bad depending on whose perspective we consider, and this could be why Arzáns sways between the two viewpoints, as well as why he offers the two contradictory explanations that led to the execution of Rocha. Each story was presented as factual, despite such a situation being impossible. The narrative thus becomes a balancing act in which the interests of both Crown and city are presented by swaying between a positive and a negative vision of the morality of the men who impacted both. In the same way that we can see two distinct versions of what occurred that lead to Rocha's death, we can also say that there are two distinct interests for the author, which is to be loyal to the Crown, but also to his city. Obviously, defrauding the Crown had to be dealt with, of that there is no question for the narrator who speaks highly of Spain and the Monarchy, but so too must his city and its people be considered as victims to an overzealous Marín. By refusing to assign a definitive logo of good or bad to either man, the reader is left to consider all points and draw their own conclusions.

In sum, the story of Rocha deals with the exchange of culture in a variety of ways. At first, Rocha is a Spaniard who gained his wealth through the commodification of coca leaves,

something that was purely a part of the Indigenous world prior to colonization, and which was sold in large amounts back to the members of the Indigenous population forced to work in the mines. We also saw Rocha benefit from the financial gift provided by the Indigenous woman with whom he had a carnal relationship to begin his commercial work of selling coca leaves. Later we see Rocha interact with black men and a single woman in a negative way, but with a pattern. First Rocha sought to hide his fortune from Marín, a large portion of which has come as the result of his involvement in fraudulent silver minting. To do so, we recall how the narrator states that “más de 30 noches estuvieron sus negros acarreándola en mulas” (II 122), of which there were six men. It is not clear if “sus negros” implies that these men were slaves, or free men who were in his employ. Regardless, the outcome was that Rocha used these black men to hide his ill-gotten wealth, and then killed those men when they were no longer needed. So too does Rocha persuade Marín’s black servant with a reward sufficient to buy her freedom, but first she too much do his dirty work in the failed plot to poison the *empanada*. Twice Rocha benefitted from the efforts of these black individuals, and at least once with the woman we know that it was proposed as an exchange of money for a service, and only using them for his dirty work is a normal act for him.

The final part of the story in which the narrator sways back and forth on the behavior and Rocha and Marín, as well as the contradicting stories as to the plot with the poison is indicative of the problem of idealizing or critiquing either character in the text. Marín as a character is a delicate subject to write about in the *Historia*, because as stated, he performed a function in stopping the fraudulent minting of silver coins that was necessary, but at the same time, detrimental to the city. To criticize the man directly is problematic because he was acting in the official capacity set forth by the Spanish Crown, and he did solve the problem of fraud. In this way, the exchange is more of a forced interaction with a negative impact forced upon the city, which to a point was necessary, but far more harmful than it needed to be

according to the author when he states that the men responsible could have been punished adequately without needing to devalue the silver as much as it was. If we recall the case of Carrión from the first chapter of this dissertation, he forced a situation onto two individual groups for his own benefit, and Arzáns offered a critique of both the man and the position of *corregidor* in the New World. Here the critique was of the action taken by Marín, and the misdirection caused by the narrator including contradictory accounts of what occurred between him and Rocha.

Case 3 – The Indian Chocata

The story of the Indigenous man named Don Francisco Chocata Sapa is about moral corruption in the pursuit of wealth and power. In the final portion of the chapter that corresponds to the year 1648, the narrator introduces Chocata as someone that was born and that lived in Potosí all his life. The majority of this chapter has already been covered, as most of it had to do with Rocha. This was the year before Nestares Marín arrived in Potosí to begin his investigation into the issue of fraudulent silver minting. Chocata was wealthy and he is described as an, “indio de nación y natural de esta Villa” (II 118), that obtained information, “de una mina que le descubrió otro de su nación que le dio en breve tiempo más de 100,000 pesos” (II 118). The narrator does not describe how Chocata came to have this knowledge, nor if there was any kind of exchange in place for that information.

This wealth was the primary factor that allowed him to gain, “amistad con el nuevo *corregidor* don Juan Velarde a quien hacía muchos y espléndidos banquetes y presentes costosos en que gastó mucha plata” (II 118). Chocata formed in this manner an intimate network of individuals who occupied positions of authority in the city. The extravagant banquets held by Chocata for the *corregidor* were key in his maneuvering among the social elite since they provided him with the opportunity to become close to those in power, an opportunity made possible only through wealth, something that most members of the

Indigenous population did not have access to. The narrator tells us that Chocata dressed, “costosamente en traje de español, y jamás apartaba de sus hombros y pechos una grande y rica cadena de oro” (II 118), creating an overall effect in his guise that, “Estimábanlo los ricos y temíanlo los pobres” (II 118).

In the following chapter corresponding to the year 1649, the narrator describes that in addition to the considerable wealth Chocata had gained through his good fortune in the mining industry, he had a loose claim to the position of *Gobernador de Indios* by a distant relative. With the death of the former occupant of that position, don Pedro Francisco Cusipáucar, Arzáns let us know that it was established that “por herencia le venía derechamente el gobierno a don Juan Cusipáucar, su hijo natural, porque los legítimos eran Muertos” (II 119). Chocata made an effort to undermine this inheritance, because, “tenía parentesco (aunque no muy cercano) con la mujer del difunto don Pedro, y sólo por esto se le antojó el bastón. Hizo por empuñarlo cuantas diligencias fueron posibles, pero no tuvo efecto su pretensión aunque le ayudó mucho su compadre el corregidor, porque no había para ellos razón habiendo heredero forzoso” (II 119). The help Chocata received from the *corregidor* don Juan Velarde demonstrates that their relationship was strong, as it would be no small favor for a member of the Indigenous population to make a request like that to the *corregidor*.

Chocata tried in many ways to use his social and political connections to sway the minds of anyone with the authority to overturn the granting of that position unto himself. Ultimately these all failed, since his claim was in every way subordinate to that of Juan Cusipáucar. As Chocata exhausted legitimate means to wrest control of the position, “trató de adquirirlo con toda malicia...llamó a un español [sic] a quien comunicó su intento, y prometiéndole cantidad de dinero le dijo...quitasen [sic] la vida a don Juan Cusipáucar” (II

119). This scheme for murder was motivated by greed in the pursuit of power, as the narrator let us know.

The three Spaniards set out in this murderous plot,⁵⁸ hoping to secure payment in exchange for the life of one unsuspecting member of the Indigenous population. The three would-be assassins attacked Cusipáucar, stabbing him nearly two dozen times and tossing his body over a bridge, yet they failed to kill him. When Cusipáucar found assistance after dragging himself from the water beneath the bridge, "Bien había visto y conocido el indio a sus ofensores, y así luego al punto envió a llamar al general Velarde, el cual vino" (II 119). One of the men escaped, and the other two were captured and subjected to a "cuestión de tormentos confesaron todo lo que en aquel caso había, condenando siempre a su compadre Chocata" (II 119).

Before the narrator reveals the consequences that Chocata would face for his actions, he adds his own thoughts on the matter of murder, "Por todas tres leyes divinas (natural, escrita y evangélica) está vedado el homicidio voluntario. La vida propia naturalmente es la más amable cosa de todas cuantas hay en los bienes de naturaleza" (II 119). Throughout the text, the narrator insists on the punishment of sinners, and this is simply one more interjection condemning murder as one of the worst sins that can be committed.

News of the failed assassination and the interrogation of the Spaniards soon reached Chocata, who took precautions to safeguard his wealth, "...escondió en aquel brevísimo tiempo mucho dinero, plata labrada, oro y joyas," but as the narrator describes, "...más por permisión divina no ocultó un escritorio" (II 119-120). This writing desk was where Chocata kept a series of correspondence between himself and the Viceroy, "en respuesta de otras que Chocata le había escrito dándole cuenta de lo mal que obraba el general Velarde, y de cómo en cierta manera era cómplice en la moneda que tan mala se labraba, y por esto no castigaba a los ministros y oficiales" (II 119). This blatant implication made by Chocata was an ultimate

betrayal between men who were supposedly friends. As the narrator states, the correspondence was found by Velarde while searching for evidence relating to the attempted murder. As the narrator describes, the fury and rage felt by him at such a blatant betrayal was clear, “Indignése fieramente contra Chocata, fuese a quejar de él a la cárcel, y sin querer admitirle descargos ni ruegos, ajustada brevemente su causa lo sentenció a muerte de horca juntamente con los dos españoles” (II 119). The narrator harshly condemns Chocata in this moment not for the attempted murder of Cusipáucar, but for how he treated Velarde, a man he considered a friend:

La acción de este indio fue sobremanera malísima por ser contra su amigo, compadre y respetuoso juez, quien por mantener su amistad era murmurado de toda la Villa.

Pero ¿qué se podía esperar de un perverso, malintencionado, soberbio y ambicioso?

Hemos de estar en que los ingratos vienen a menospreciar a los amigos, a los padres, a la patria y al mismo Dios, y que suele la ingratitud acompañarse con la desvergüenza, que es la capitana de las torpezas. (II 119)

The narrator speaks harshly of those who are arrogant, prideful, and ungrateful. They undervalue friends, and subsequently do the same to parents, the motherland, and God. The narrator critiques Chocata for acting in ways completely against what is good for friendship, and then by extension all the way up to God. As Arzáns has shown, going against God often results in consequences for the individual, and at times for the entire city, as seen in one of the earliest examples in the chapter corresponding to the year 1560, where the sins of the miners were punished by a shortage of silver (I 113). By beginning with something as simple as showing Chocata as an ungrateful, backstabbing friend, the narrator extends his character to the absolute worst betrayal, against God. There is little else for the narrator to say on the matter, since nothing could be worse than such an attitude toward the divine.

Following the sentencing of Chocata for the crime of hiring assassins to murder his distant relative, a great number of petitioners asked for leniency. This is one of the few cases in the text in which an Indigenous man has Spaniard friends come to speak on his behalf, and failing that, they attempt to sabotage the execution, "Viendo, pues, los amigos españoles que no tenía remedio mandaron con secreto picar los cordeles, para que rompiéndose y cayendo antes de ahogarse lo tomasen y cargasen con él a la iglesia mayor más de 150 señores sacerdotes clérigos y religiosos que estaban prevenidos para el efecto" (II 120). Ultimately, this did not work as intended, as the narrator states, "...cuando todos entendieron que rompiéndose el cordel había de caer vivo y socorrerlo, no fue así (por divina permisión) porque se habían trocado los cordeles." (II 119). Chocata was executed as planned, and even if the sabotage had succeeded, it likely would only have prolonged the outcome. One of the ropes belonging to one of the Spaniards contracted for the murder did in fact break, but even after being promptly whisked away to the church as had been planned to do with Chocata, Velarde marched into the church with his men, dragged the Spaniard outside, and finished the execution with his own two hands (II 120).

After the execution, the narrator describes how Velarde, "Mandó hacer cuartos a Chocata y poner su cabeza sobre el puente donde por su causa se cometió el delito, y allí estuvo muchos años" (II 119). Arzáns continues, stating that as time went on, this served as a reminder to people of the consequences of behavior motivated by greed, "...porque como estaba ya hueca el viento la hacía silbar para aumentarles el miedo, y aun muchos barbados no osaban pasar de noche por el puente porque decían los indios y vecinos españoles que allí se oían tristes ayes y ruidos espantosos" (II 120), staying in place for years after his death. For him the knowledge of rich silver deposits granted wealth that in turn opened doors that would not be otherwise available to a poor man.

As Albert Memmi affirms in *The Colonizer and the Colonized*, the colonized individual living under the rule of the colonizer has two options: to reject or accept the colonial system and the position occupied within it (120, 129). Those who live within the system may attempt to assimilate into the colonizer's group through the impossible task of negating one's existence, only to eventually face ultimate rejection by the colonizer (124).

According to Arzáns, Chocata uses his newfound wealth to befriend those with power in the colonial system, such as Velarde, but he also betrays that powerful figure in the colonial landscape. Chocata is not attempting to assimilate into the colonized group, even if the narrator makes the point that he holds banquets for Spaniards, and dresses in fine Spanish clothing, he is only attempting to augment his own power within the Indigenous community, obtaining a position that reproduces domination. As we are told by the narrator, Chocata's destiny ends in death, as there is no other outcome that can be sustained within the colonial system. Even though there are Spaniards who defend him, they are not successful because Chocata's existence does not work in the colonial structure, as he neither accepts the colonial rule by seeking to assimilate himself, nor rejects it outright by befriendng Velarde, and ultimately betrays that powerful symbol of Spanish domination.

The strategies that Chocata used to exploit his connection with the colonizer, namely spending on banquets, befriendng Velarde, and hiring Spanish assassins, do not give him the results he wanted. They do not generate a successful man, otherwise the position of *Gobernador de Indios* would have been acquired. This story is not one of success, but of a colonized individual's repeated failures despite making use of the strongest facets of the colonizer's tools. In this way the exchange of culture is present in how the colonized Chocata used the colonizer to his advantage in various ways. By using Velarde's influence, Chocata was able to wield some power and influence that was out of his reach, although it did not help him acquire his goal. Later he hired three Spanish assassins to do his dirty work, again

invoking members of the colonial power towards his goals. Despite using Spaniards in two distinct ways, his ultimate failure was rooted in the betrayal of a friend. The narrator has little problem with the way Chocata acted until the betrayal was revealed, as we have been told with his feeling on ungrateful friends. The narrator does not focus on the ways in which Chocata used the resources of the Spanish, because that is already a part of the culture of the city, whereas there is no room for betrayal in his text, and that is why he condemns the single action so much.

As we will explore in the next case, other members of the Indigenous population acted in ways that were positive for Arzáns through the exchange of culture, where the gradual adoption of certain cultural practices provide not only respite from daily life, but salvation. To this, the Christianization of the Indigenous population in Arzáns' text is the next focus of a story in the text, with a focus on the positive effects of proper moral behavior and devout worship of the Christian faith, within the purview of the virgins of the city.

Case 4 – The Virgins of Potosí

The three cases discussed so far dealing with Aguirre, Rocha, and Chocata, exemplify what can be considered immoral acts in Potosí. Those individuals abused of the Indigenous, betrayed friends, murdered or attempted to murder their enemies, hired assassins, and defrauded the Crown in the minting of silver. These cases embody the worst in the city for the narrator and show instances where the exchange of cultures occurred through appropriation, through willing participants, and through individuals who sought to use the colonial situation to their advantage, only to fail. And yet, while those cases focused on men who behaved in immoral ways, which is to say, violent, deceptive, abusive, and murderous, there are certainly examples within Arzáns' text that embody morally positive behavior that

is European in origin and thoroughly modified by Indigenous culture. Religion and worship are an area of particular richness in this respect.

As has been discussed by Hanke and Mendoza, Arzáns writes a history in which divine intervention is embedded into much of daily life and is of great importance to the development of the city and its people (I lxvii).⁵⁹ In this way, Arzáns' text is a moral history of his beloved city.⁶⁰ At times, there are clear consequences for deviating from proper moral behavior that are divine in nature. However, we must also recall that there are also times in Arzáns text when actions performed are not black or white in terms of being good or bad, but rather fall into a grey zone, depending on the author.

Divine intervention in Arzáns' text is often manifest through the literal appearance of a virgin, observed by many, in a time of great need for those who are deserving of being saved. In some cases this is represented through Shiddarta Vásquez Córdoba's work "La crónica de Potosí y sus milagros: complejidad cultural y modelación de relaciones simbólicas" (126), where she argues that an established network of religious connection in the city, primarily linked through rituals such as procession, reveals a pattern for religious interventions. While Córdoba is correct in her analysis, there are also several instances of divine intervention in the *Historia* that appears in isolated events, though still most often to only the most devout individuals who live morally ideal lives, and culture, race, and gender play no part who receives such divine treatment. In the *Historia*, the virgins are worshiped by Europeans and Indigenous alike, and both receive her boons.

Among the different virgins mentioned in the *Historia*, the virgin of Copacabana will be our concern, along with the images of her that were created and worshiped in Potosí. This virgin was often associated with miners in the city, both from the Spaniard Indigenous population within the mita system, as well as the people of the city. All three components are quintessentially representative of Potosí and thus seem most appropriate to observe the

exchange of culture that occurs with the development and adoption of the virgin as a part of the city identity.

The steps through which the virgin of Copacabana came to be revered by both Spaniards and Indigenous begins long before the discovery of the New World, going back to the virgin of Candelaria. As Alonso de Espinosa states it is around the year 1400 that the image of Candelaria was found (47),⁶¹ and later from about 1497 the virgin (46) and was brought to the New World by Spanish conquistadors.⁶²

Once in the New World, the influence of Candelaria began to spread because of the success connected to Spanish victories in the conquest. As Sabine MacCormack affirms in “From the Sun of the Incas to the Virgin of Copacabana”, Candelaria, “could be connected with the Virgin who had miraculously intervened at the siege of Cuzco on behalf of the Spaniards and their allies, among whom could be counted the Incas of Copacabana” (49). In seeing this, the Inca decided that they would prefer, “the Virgin who had brought the Spaniards victory, just as the Sun had brought victory to the Incas” (49).⁶³ MacCormack continues by asserting that in this choice, “one may view the Incas of Copacabana as integrating themselves into the new ruling class. They incorporated these elements by using a time-honored Inca method: seeing that the Sun could no longer be an imperial deity, the victorious Virgin of Cuzco succeeded the Sun in this role, and in this way became the Sun's successor at Copacabana” (49).

By 1582, the opinion had spread that this virgin was the “patron and protector of the conquerors”, yet there was no image for the Indigenous population to observe and establish a cult (MacCormack 48-49). The use of images in the Christianization of the Indigenous population was an essential component of the conquest, because “Images served as a vehicle to teach Christianity, and also were a means of acculturating the Indians to European perceptions in a broader sense, for they drew on a European, not an indigenous artistic

tradition” (MacCormack 50). Eventually, during the XVI century Francisco Tito Yupanqui took it upon himself to create an object of worship to correspond with this virgin.⁶⁴ Yupanqui first sculpted a clay version of the virgin, however this was quickly removed as “...the idea of an Indian making a Christian image was unacceptable” (McCormack 51). Undeterred, Yupanqui travelled to Potosí to learn the art of image making from Diego Ortiz, a master of the craft, and, “After studying various images of the Virgin, he determined on copying a Virgin of the Purification, La Candelaria” (MacCormack 52). This attempt was also censured at first by the priests in Copacabana, and mocked by both Spaniards and Indigenous, but “In due course, various individuals accepted Tito Yupanqui’s [work] as a true Christian image and approached it with the reverence which, as such, it was entitled to receive” (51). Julia Costilla affirms in “El milagro en la construcción del culto a Nuestra Señora de Copacabana (virreinato del Perú, 1582-1651)”, that the cult of the virgin of Copacabana began to spread throughout Potosí as the Indigenous population from Copacabana who went to and from the city for their tributary obligations brought their new virgin of worship as the virgin stands as a model of cultural exchange (43).

As Teresa Gisbert affirms, “En el siglo XVI aparece una religión que es mezcla de cristianismo y cultos prehispánicos” (53). In the case of the virgin of Copacabana, elements of her image were incorporated and read as a new manifestation of an ancient deity Dagón, which primarily was an aquatic deity, “A este adoraban por dios de su laguna, por creador de sus peces y dios de sus sensualidades. Queda así establecido que Copacabana es el dios principal del lago, un dios acuático” (51). As Gisbert affirms, Copacabana represents the duality of an old-world, pre-European individual of worship in its progression from a water deity to that of Candelaria as seen in Arzáns’ text, which is truly a myth undergone a serious process of transformation where underlying elements are identified, substituted, and in their

seemingly contradictory opposition, work together to unintentionally create something unique for the New World.

As stated, the divine protection in the *Historia* is never limited to one specific group of people, nor is there a specific type of miracle offered, rather the help given varied according to the need. In some cases, the virgin is associated with the resurrection of the dead, as seen in the chapter corresponding to the year 1630 where an Indigenous couple mourn the death of their young child, and after a plea made to the virgin, see the child brought back to life (II 33). In other instances, as seen in the chapter corresponding to the year 1643, she protects devoted individuals proactively. In that year, a man was suddenly struck by lightning, and “Fue cosa admirable y favor que Dios hizo por su santísima madre a su devoto mayordomo, porque habiéndole quemado el sombrero y fundídole los botones de oro que llevaba en la ropilla no le hizo ningún daño en su persona” (II 91). Both of those cases saw the intervention of Copacabana. The case that interests will be examined involves an intervention that has the dual effect of saving an Indigenous man from harm and showing the integration of Copacabana into the identity of the city.

In the chapter that corresponds with the year 1630, titled, “De cómo obró Dios un prodigio en socorro de la necesidad de una pobre, y de cómo nuestra señora de Copacabana libró a un indio del peligro de la muerte, con otros sucesos dignos de memoria”, the narrator explains, “pueden estar muy aseguradas las personas virtuosas de que cuando se hallaren más fatigadas con las necesidades, entonces pondrá Dios en ellos los ojos de su misericordia y les dará a manos llenas aquello que les conviniere” (II 31).

The narrator introduces an Indigenous man named Juan Condori, a mitayo working in the mines in that year as part of his compulsory tribute. The mitayo workers in that mine worshiped the image of the virgen de Copacabana and sought her protection, as the narrator describes, “...se puso delante de esta imagen el indio Juan de rodillas y le pidió muy

encarecidamente que lo librase de todo peligro y lo volviese con bien a su tierra" (II 33).

Worship of the virgin of Copacabana in silver mines is typical in Arzáns' text and performed by both Spaniards and members of the Indigenous population. There was a geographical divide that dictated the worship of one virgin over another, as Hanke states, "Los minadores estaban divididos en dos parcialidades correspondientes a las dos caras del Cerro, la del sombrío, que caía entre el sur y el oeste, y la del sol, que caía entre el norte y el este", while the image of worship was the same, "Los primeros tenían por patrona a la Virgen de la Candelaria de la parroquia de San Pedro, y los otros a la misma imagen en la parroquia de Copacabana" (I CLV), but ultimately each mine had its own shrine for protection against harm.

Eight months passed without incident until one day Condori fell asleep from exhaustion after placing metal in a mortar. The Spanish mayordomo violently grasped the head of the Indigenous man and brought it close to the machine, a punishment the narrator uses to manifest the cruelty of mayordomos against Indians. The Indigenous man requested at that point the protection of the virgin, and the machines stopped in the air. Otherwise they might have ended his life with a mighty blow to the head, but instead the virgin provided divine protection from physical harm. The divine intervention also had the secondary effect of granting reconciliation between the two men, as the mayordomo surrendered to the power of the virgin and gave thanks to God and the santísima madre, and both the Indigenous and Spaniard went forth to tell of the event so everyone could know of her piety (II 33).

According to the narrator, the virgin de Copacabana was at the time firmly established in the beliefs of the people of the city. The narrator describes that her image is placed in the mine where the Indigenous men worked, and they all prayed to her for safety, Juan Condori being among them.⁶⁵ The fact that Copacabana is entrenched in the daily life of the people of

the city, who only the century prior was an unknown virgin Potosí, demonstrates a firm blending of culture.

Furthermore, not only has the worship of la virgin de Copacabana become the norm in the city, but so too has the Catholic religion become well established in the lives of the Indigenous population. With the act of Condori reaching out for assistance from the virgin, and then receiving her divine intervention to save his life, the narrator shows how the Indigenous population has embraced the Catholic religion and benefitted from it. The narrator is sympathetic to this character for the abuse suffered at the hands of the mayordomo, but the ultimate gift, that of preserving Indigenous life through the divine, demonstrates another blending of culture. In this case, the virgin of Copacabana and her worship by the Indigenous population are a part of life in the city.

This reconciliation of behavior from cruelty to walking together to spread the word of this great virgin underlies a progression towards a single, unified identity. However, the narrator does not state that the mayordomo is changing in any long-term, nor permanent manner. It is simply the devotion to the virgin that the two individuals are partaking in, but past that, there is nothing to confirm or even indicate that the behavior will change towards Juan Condori. While there are other examples in Arzáns' text of a more permanent change following a divine intervention,⁶⁶ this is not one of them. All we see in this case is the narrator pointing out that this mayordomo's abuse of Condori took a literal intervention by a divine force to stop, which may be construed by a reader as a general critique against those who abuse of others. The miracle demonstrates not only the holy reward for proper Catholic devotion by the Indigenous Condori, but also that the virgin of Copacabana is an established, normalized part of Potosí for both the Indigenous and Spaniard population.

Chapter Conclusions

In the beginning of this chapter, the exchange of culture was described as the long-term blending of components through what Ortiz termed transculturation. As we saw, the difference between the exchange of culture and the exchanges of silver and women was that those exchanges in the first two chapters could often be seen as they were occurring, whereas it may not be immediately apparent that an exchange is occurring with culture, since the tangibility is subject to being abstract, subtle, and sometimes requiring time to be observed.

We can read the origin of Potosí as an exchange of cultures. Huanca revealed to his master a secret that was not in fact his in origin but of his friend Hualca, to receive recognition, and to be a loyal servant. On the origin of the city, Indigenous knowledge of the huayras and silver refinement was provided to allow the Spaniards to achieve large-scale exploitation of the mines, the foundation of the city, the richness of Spain, and the glory of God in the eyes of the narrator. The case of Rocha and Chocata are examples of exchanges where culture has already blended in such a way that each man benefits from aspects not of his own culture. The narrator presented Rocha as benefitting from the sale of the coca leaf, and the funds gifted to him by an Indigenous lover in a way that is a normalized part of life in Potosí. So too was Chocata attempting to make use of Spaniards to benefit himself, both through Velarde and assassins. The narrator demonstrated in each case that those cultural components were no longer separate, but a normal part of life, and neither man died because of any problems relating to the exchange of culture, but in their own personal failings against the Crown and friends.

The cases presented in this chapter demonstrate that in the *Historia* the blend of cultures was strongly marked by appropriation and considered often through a one-sided point of view. Aguirre, the Spanish soldier that exploited Indigenous men and avenged his punishment, only escaped justice by using a fruit known by the Indigenous peoples. He

succeeded in his escape thanks to the help he received from two Spaniards, and the knowledge that had its origins in Indigenous cultures that they somehow had acquired, and finally through disguising his white skin as a black man. The paradox that this story posits is the fact that Aguirre is able to avenge the punishment received for exploiting Indigenous men thanks to a piece of Indigenous knowledge, yet this is not recognized in the story, where the narrator focuses instead on Aguirre and the abuse of authority inflicted on him by the judge named Esquivel. However, it cannot escape us as readers because it is so fundamental to a resolution in Aguirre's favor. Even more, the narrator specifies in the story that the Indigenous lamented Aguirre's punishment alongside his fellow Spaniards. Both the narrator's mention of the fruit and the lamentation of the Indigenous without any special attention drawn to those points means that the blending of culture has already occurred. Could we think that in the *Historia*, the Indigenous population had internalized to such a point the imposed rule as to feel genuine sorrow for the punishment of their own abuser? Or instead, at the heart of the matter we can recognize that the lack of respect for laws lies at the heart of the story: the laws that abolished the exploitation of Indigenous are displaced, while the laws that governed punishments for hidalgos are privileged and reinforced? Or perhaps the narrator can only see this through his worldview, and can only interpret the conduct of the Indigenous as sorrow when perhaps it was something different?

Our third case involved a member of the Indigenous population of an unspecified nation who constituted an example of how assimilation worked in a colonial society. Chocata was a wealthy Indigenous man whose behavior is presented as mimicking that of the colonizer. Dressing as him, mingling with them, and contracting them to do his bidding, Chocata is fundamentally characterized by greed. In the end, Chocata's friendship with powerful Spaniards, wealth, and contracting of Spanish assassins conclude with this Indigenous man in Spanish clothes dead by the end of the story, successfully condemned for

his attempt at murder and for the betrayal of friendship against Velarde. He was not satisfied with the wealth he possessed, nor with the friendship and social status he had earned among the Spaniards of the city, and in betraying his friend, the narrator condemned Chocata as one of the worst types of people for the city.

Condori, the protagonist of our final example, showed the goodness and reward that sprung from the embrace of Spanish religion. The Virgin to which Condori was devoted was already an example of transculturation. Made in the New World by a member of the Indigenous nations, the Virgen de Copacabana is in itself a symbol of a new origin, the origin of the city in which she is patrona, her prowess demonstrated when Condori is saved from being killed by a Spaniard that, as we said, will go on to announce his devotion of the Virgin with his own (almost) victim by his side.

We already discussed that the narrator insists in adding his own commentary when dealing with matters of morality, and he is constantly and explicitly trying to control the reading of his stories. In each case discussed in this chapter, the exchange of culture served to sustain a hierarchy that exists in the *Historia*. We read of the abuse of authority in the New World and its consequences, and of the benefits afforded to individuals who had the ability to draw from different sources of knowledge, as seen with Aguirre in his escape. Over the span of these cases it becomes evident that Arzáns privileges no one race or culture over another, and instead it is actions and where they fall on a moral spectrum of good or bad that determine praise or condemnation. At the same time, Arzáns seems intimately aware that actions are not always black and white, as seen in the constant back and forth between the story of Rocha and Marín to the point where the narrator does not ever settle on a final version of events. The focus for the narrator seems to lie in doing no harm to the people and the city, and those that do receive his narrative condemnation.

Within this narrative of praising what is good for his city and condemning what is bad, Arzáns appears as the emerging Criollo identity which points to the best and the worst to befall the city. As he writes from a time when Potosí has seen its silver mining production fall steadily since 1650 through the writing of the text from around 1705 until Arzáns' death over thirty years later, and the city has been mismanaged by those in the text who seek only to enrich themselves, it should come as no surprise that the narrator condemn so heavily those who bring problems to the city. In observing these cases, the exchange of culture is evident, not as a process occurring within the year of each case, but more as a process that has been continuously developing, and we are seeing the effects afterwards. In the end, these cases where we can observe the exchange of culture reveal not only the good and the bad of what occurred in the city, but how Arzáns perceived the development of the identity of Potosí.

Dissertation Conclusions

Exchanges that can be described as chaotic, fantastic, violent, and supernatural make up a large part of the stories in the *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí*, and Arzáns is always ready to interject condemnation or praise of those involved. Over the course of this dissertation, exchange has been broadly examined and through them we saw how the narrator interpreted the development, reinforcement, and subversion of the elements that constitute the identity of his city. Even though men and women of all races were judged through those interactions, the majority of stories dealt with only a few groups of individuals at the forefront of the *Historia*. Spaniards, *criollos*, peninsulars, or members of the Indigenous population occupy most of the stories. On the other hand, black men and women appear to occupy secondary roles in most of the tales and in comparison, they are less visible. They are certainly present, as we saw in our second and third chapter, but mainly within positions as servants. Such was the case of Francisco de la Rocha and his six black murdered slaves, and the black slave woman seduced to be convinced to partake in a plot to murder the Corregidor, Juan Velarde.

A recurring theme within exchanges represented in the *Historia* is the use of force. These forced exchanges were rooted in an abuse of power, such as in our first analyzed case, when Francisco de Carvajal implied to the unnamed merchant that his goods may be seized by if he did not cooperate, and then to threaten all of the merchants in the city so they did not open their stores during the first hours of that day. In that case, the threat of physical force allowed the exchange to take place despite a total lack of legal authority, but we also saw forced exchanges by way of power abused within the boundaries of legal authority, as seen in our second case involving Carrión who took on the role of a regulator of exchanges to swindle mine owners to enrich himself. In the first case, the force applied would have been considered outside of the law, while the second case depended upon the legal authority of an

official position. This manner of forced exchanged, particularly by the *corregidores* of Potosí, is only made possible by the ability to enforce laws that have been twisted for the benefit of a select few, and the result is that the laws are obeyed only because they carry power to be upheld, and not because they are just.

In “Force of Law: The ‘Mystical Foundation of Authority’”, Jacques Derrida distinguishes law from justice, stating that, “laws are not just as laws. One obeys them not because they are just but because they have authority” (12). For Carrión, authority translated to the ability to fine the Spanish mine owners if they refused to pay the required monthly salary to the Indigenous workers, and to take those workers away entirely if his words were not obeyed. There was nothing just about Carrión’s behavior, as evidenced by the theft of the funds owed to the Indigenous workers, and yet his forced exchange was obeyed because of his authority and the available means to enforce his orders. As such, Arzáns is keen to present stories that expose corruption as evident and detrimental to the people of his city, which could be construed as a critique of the systems that allow for such corruption to occur in the first place, in this case in the exploitation of the position of *corregidor*. Law and its enforcement, as Derrida argues, is not justice, nor should it be construed to be. Instead, “law is the element of calculation, and it is just that there be law, but justice is incalculable, it requires us to calculate with the incalculable; and aporetic experiences are the experiences, as improbable as they are necessary, of justice, that is to say of moments in which the decision between just and unjust is never insured by a rule” (16). Of course, Derrida spoke of the deconstruction of law and the impossibility to deconstruct justice within the purview of those who sought to blend the two in an ultimate act of perversion in creating the final solution against the Jewish people during the second world war (62-63), but the core concept remains applicable within Arzáns’ text as well in seeking to root out the worst for his city and to only keep the best.

Among those stories that insist on the disjunction between force and justice, Antonio López de Quiroga in the case analyzed in Chapter One of this dissertation, was presented by Arzáns as a model of the good citizen. Quiroga did not use force, nor threats in his exchanges. Instead, he occupied a position on the opposite side of a spectrum of moral behavior compared to Carvajal and Carrión by being interested in the good of the city and not driven by personal gain. Quiroga is described by Arzáns as choosing to give freely to those most in need, to pay for infrastructure development, and for a while, even for the costs of military expeditions meant to protect the city. Quiroga later went beyond the premise of exchange, embracing the logic of the gift instead, even when the recipients were ungrateful. While it would have been easy to only select cases of exchange that were rooted in violence and corruption, for the *Historia* has many, stories like that of Quiroga, and the women of the second chapter of this dissertation, illustrates what Arzáns chose to highlight as the best people that the city has to offer.

Exchanges of women have traditionally been considered as a necessary element for the foundation of societies (Lévi-Strauss 323). In Arzáns' text, some of the most famous stories of the *Historia* are related to women and the alteration of their expected circulation. In the cases we observed, men disturbed the established rules of exchange for their own selfish reasons and resulted in the women acting to retake their own agency. This was evident in the first case involving young Francisca, who was perfectly content to abide by the systems in place that would have seen her exchanged from one family unit, that of her mother's, to a new one, forming a family with a husband. The disturbance in the process of exchange came from Triesta, the servant who stole his master's money, his identity, and finally forced himself on his fiancé. Francisca worked to attain satisfaction of her own *deshonor* through her own decisions and requesting the help of a suitable substitute for the male guardian lacking in her life. At the end, Francisca kept everything secret, took control of her own

future and decided for herself what to do, cancelling her planned marriage, and choosing a life of devotion. Conversely, Floriana, the focus of our second case, was not able to keep the secret, but took justice into her own hands. The motions set forth in Floriana's story began and ended through demanding agency over her own actions, with the men who disturbed the traditional system meant to exchange women all dead, which is indicative of the worst fate the author could bestow on individuals who forced their way into the young woman's life.

Both women turned to force to reconcile their issues, and of great importance is that the narrator had nothing negative to say about their behavior that resulted in violence and death against the men who caused trouble in the first place. Here, the perturbations of the established exchanges are the focus for Arzáns who censors harshly the male transgressors. The final case of women, that of Claudia the Witch, further demonstrates how different types of exchanges were used to disturb the status quo, all of which were fueled by unorthodox methods through witchcraft.

Unlike the first two cases, Claudia worked through the power of coca leaves to perform witchcraft to provide services to a broad range of individuals. We read about how she assisted two young women in matters relating to other men, of the physical transformation of men and women, and overall, we were told how in demand these services were despite the morality of her methods. However, Arzáns is clear on both his opinion on the use of coca leaves for witchcraft and on Claudia. In some ways she was simultaneously one of the most powerful individuals in the *Historia* and at the same time the weakest. According to the narrator, her power came from the evil the coca leaves instilled in the New World, from the devil himself. In this reading, the lack of agency on Claudia's part, at least to some degree, explains why her more negative and immoral actions, those that caused the death of a young woman, and the assisting of the criminals who had robbed a merchant, were not met with immediate or harsh condemnation from the narrator. Ultimately, the way in

which Arzáns reacts to the three women and their actions is indicative of the rejection of something altogether worse that does not conform to the boundaries of what is good and proper for the city. Even though not all actions, specifically those of Claudia, were particularly good in all aspects, the desire for a better behaving citizen in the city is clearly observable and preferable, which can also be said of the cases in the third chapter.

The third chapter and its exchanges of culture demonstrated a strong difference from the previous chapters in that exchange was far more of a slow and gradual process, and the cases evoked effects observable in long term events, rather than immediate actions and reactions. As we saw with the soldier Aguirre for example, the knowledge about the *uítoc* fruit used to darken the skin of the fugitive was at some point acquired from the Indigenous population, but that exchange has no story. Aguirre's case tells only that the Spaniard use of that information has already been appropriated, mentioned briefly, in passing, and having no tale of its own, perhaps because it is already a normal part of Arzáns' life. In that sense, the absence of a story explaining the origin of the *uítoc* fruit is in itself indicative of an exchange of cultural knowledge already passed. Still, while these exchanges were of a nature more inclined to long-term observations, each case examined also contained clear interjections made by the narrator on the nature of the behavior of the people involved. Throughout this dissertation, Arzáns has been shown incapable of telling a story without interjecting on the behaviors at hand and their consequences, and this is due to the condition of the city as experienced in his lifetime.

The *Historia de la Villa Imperial del Potosí* was written in a time when Potosí was no longer the shining beacon of wealth and prosperity that it once was. Arzáns had begun to write the text a full half century after the initial decline of silver production, and from that time until his death, the city never left its decadent spiral. The *Historia* can be read then as a tragedy, where hindsight over immoral behavior shows the path that led the city to its ruin,

filled with human actions and divine consequences that through Arzáns' eyes hold the key for the decline of Potosí. The condemnation of bad behavior serves as a dire warning to readers, while on the other hand, praising the good behavior in the text sets as an example to follow. This latter part can lead us to consider that for Arzáns there is an ideal archetype of a citizen of Potosí, a perfect type of individual that does only good and brings positive impact to the city and its people compared to the many sinners that brought the city to ruin. There is hope for the future in this way, as readers in the future can learn from the mistakes of the past.

In the cases we have examined in the text, this comes across in several ways predominantly differentiated by the degree to which Arzáns looks to praise an individual. The most obvious and forthcoming praise was observed in the first chapter in the case involving Antonio López de Quiroga. Throughout his exchanges and growth in wealth, Arzáns has only positive things to say about the man and his charitable actions. The chapter focuses on the life of Quiroga as a whole because it was the year of his death, and Arzáns is clear in his admiration of the man's actions and describes the greatness that lies ahead in the afterlife after devoting themselves completely to the good of the city.

In this way the praising of good behavior points to an ideal individual that Arzáns desires for his city. In the second chapter of this dissertation, we saw how Arzáns spoke highly of Francisca and Álvarez for holding honorable behavior above a desire for wealth, while condemning Triesta for his numerous wrongdoings. With praise that goes on for an entire chapter, Arzáns tells his reader what makes a good person and what makes a bad person in his beloved city, with the corresponding rewards and consequences for each type of individual.

Therein lies the desire to see only the best for Potosí, as does an early connection to the criollo consciousness that will eventually bloom to a desire for, and then a demand for independence. Arzáns speaks highly of the *patria* and offers only kind words to the Spanish

Crown, but within the city he is direct in expressions of dissatisfaction and condemnation when individual men and women act badly and bring negative consequences to Potosí, regardless of their place of birth, race, or the official positions they occupy while representing the Crown. The author channels a passionate admiration for his city in a time of decadence and economic downturn, and his model citizens are not motivated for the search of wealth, but instead act honorably, or with the city in mind above their own personal gain.

At times however, Arzáns assigns praise or judgement in his text not related to a clear set of parameters. Right and wrong are not obvious, nor always evoked. There are too many instances when the narrator shows either restraint in highly questionable behavior, or the opposite, is overly critical towards individuals for behavior that is relatively unimportant. As stated previously, instances of divine intervention, be it for a reward or punishment, are most often left to speak for themselves as there is no need to elaborate further due to the simple fact that God's will is the highest power and cannot be circumvented. Yet, divine intervention accounts for a small proportion of outcomes in the text, and so still the question remains regarding the narrator's decision-making process of who is to be and judged and in what way.

The most obvious choice lies initially in stating that the narrator is directed by a moral code rooted in what is best for the city. This is supported in ways already stated, with divine interventions, and in speaking of eternal rewards for those citizens who behaved well in life, as was so earnestly described for Quiroga in chapter one. This is further seen when the narrator uses the seven deadly sins in explaining why certain individuals act as they do. We focused upon greed, vanity, and pride as one or more of those were so often the motivator for those who coveted silver and wealth above all else. At the same time, sinful behavior only goes so far as a qualifier for condemnation, as seen in the most glaring omission of the narrator's judgement in the case of Rocha.

In the third chapter of this dissertation, Rocha was described as spending considerable time and effort in concealing his wealth, and when the job was done, the narrator describes that it came to be known that he poisoned the six black men who were his servants in order to keep the location secret. If the narrator were guided by the principles of living a life free of sin, then this omission of judgement for the murder of six men is an unacceptable exception.

In the prologue to the *Historia*, the narrator lists a number of the authors that were useful in his task of writing the history of the city: Valerio Máximo, San Agustín, Curdo, Escévola, Marco Bruto, Cayo Mario, Codro, Menelao, tebano; Ancuro, hijo del frigio Midas; los filenos cartagineses, y la madre de Cleómenes, Sócrates, Plutarco, and Aristóteles. These writers appear in the text, but most often only as a brief, unsuspecting addition by the narrator in relation to an event or an action and are more telling than they appear at first glance. Of these, Aristotle has a greater impact than others on the entire *Historia* in trying to decode the moral structure by which Arzáns praises or condemns the people in his stories.

In his work *Nicomachean ethics*, Aristotle asserts that defining what is meant by the term “universal good” is problematic for various reasons:

Since ‘good’ has as many senses as ‘being’ (for it is predicated both in the category of substance, as of God and of reason, and in quality, i.e., of the virtues, and in quantity, i.e., of that which is moderate, and in relation, i.e., of the useful, and in time, i.e., of the right opportunity, and in place, i.e., of the right locality and the life), clearly it cannot be something universally present in all cases and single; for then it could not have been predicated in all the categories but in one only (7).

The notion of establishing a set, objective list of universal rules is impossible, and so the focus broadens towards individuals and the context of their environment. The moral character of men and women for Arzáns may too then be guided towards a similar goal of contextual goodness.

The narrator cites from Aristotle, “como dice Aristóteles ‘Si no puedes hacer lo que deseas, desea lo que hacer se puede’” (I clxxxiv). For a text in which the author praises behaviors that are good for the city, and condemns those that are bad, I can think of no better or more optimistic message. The author asks the reader to do what is possible, even if it is not all that one may wish to accomplish. If we recall the altruism displayed by Quiroga in chapter one, there should be no surprise that the narrator showers so much praise for what appears to be a lifetime of charitable behavior for the people and the city.

Arzáns continues later in the text by stating that, “Aristóteles dijo que es peor hacer mal y daño por malicia que por flaqueza, y en otra parte el mismo filósofo dijo que la virtud y malicia descubren el ánimo de cada uno si es noble, villano, libre o esclavo” (II 302). This too fits within the ideas expressed throughout this dissertation with the narrator praising what is good for the city and condemning what is bad.

The narrator’s restraint in condemning Rocha offers a clue to understand Arzáns’ criterium of evaluation. Despite his shortcomings, his vanity and pride, his cruelty as an alcalde, his defrauding of the crown, and most importantly, his decision to murder his six servants, the good that he did for the city through the construction of “la iglesia del hospital real que comenzó a su costa” (II 103) appears to justify a pious silence of the narrator rather than any manner of condemnation. In this sense, the context to consider Rocha’s behavior must lean more towards the side of “good” than that of “bad” for Arzáns. Looking more closely, this would imply that the net effect of Rocha’s behavior benefitted the people of the city because Rocha spent so much of “his” funds, gained through illicit means, to pay for the construction of churches, for fiestas, and in other charitable ways discussed earlier, even though they appear to be few in number. The hiding of the wealth and the killing of his six servants is a terrible thing, however it meant that the funds were not appropriated by Marín, who despite being sent on behalf of the Crown, crippled the economy with his stopping of

silver production, was unpopular with the people of the city, and was described as fueled by his own greed. This is the third disaster after which the text was almost named, and so, in this context, good and bad do not align so easily from our perspectives and time, whereby we as readers can see the long-term damage that can be caused by such fraud. To assign values of good or bad is problematic for the same reasons that Aristotle described. However, public perception for the overall good of the city may have been more important in the writing of the *Historia*, despite what we know of the events and therefore justify the peculiar censorship of the narrator.

By considering Aristotle's explanation of the challenges associated with attempting to define a clear set of rules for what is considered "good", we can better understand how Arzáns views "good" and "bad" in the people of the city. The quotes listed above represent nearly the totality of all references to Aristotle in the text, as there are few. Other mentions are often brief and not detailed quotes from Aristotle's writings, but rather general additions on actions made, seen in the form of, "as Aristotle describes", of which Arzáns also uses for other Greek thinkers, such as "as Socrates says/as Plutarch says". The references are thus few and spread far in between in the text, but they are present. The advantage in that the references to Aristotle are few is that we can easily sum up the message that Arzáns takes from him quite easily: Do not be cruel, do your best, even when your best is not what you wish it could be. This is not meant to be an all-encompassing explanation of the ethical forces that mold the narrator's judgments, but it is clear that the selections from Aristotle represent and coincide with the overall themes of doing good, even when it is difficult to pinpoint exactly what constitutes "good" in the evolving context of the New World, and the emerging criollo consciousness. In examining the exchanges of silver, women, and culture in this dissertation, Arzáns relays through his praise and condemnation the principal message that in a time of decline in Potosí, there is a need for good people now more than ever, and that need

drives his commentary on the actions of the individuals he writes about. If now I were asked to summarize the primary message within the many exchanges that constitute Arzáns' text, it would be one simple phrase: Be excellent to each other.

Notes

¹ In the first part of Book I, Chapter I, Arzáns describes the place where Potosí was founded, including its geography and topography, stating that he writes of times “desde el año de 1545 de su admirable invención hasta el punto que esto se escribe, que es el de 1705, en espacio de 160 años ha dado” (I 11).

² In Book X, Chapter 1, the author elaborates by stating, “he tenido grandísimo deseo de poner fin a este mi trabajo con el último libro de esta *Historia*, aunque con el grave peligro a que se ponen los que gastan su tiempo en escribir cosas que todos las han visto pasar, si bien este mismo reparo me hará ser breve y sucinto en la narración de las cosas que sucedieron en esta memorable Villa de Potosí en los pocos años que me faltan de escribir hasta llegar con el divino favor a los últimos de esta Historia” (II 321).

³ Refer to Volume II, Book VIII, Chapters I-IV for an example that covers the events of only 1626 (II 1-20).

⁴ Arzáns uses the following sources or references the texts in a general way, such as *Crónica del Perú* by Pedro Cieza de León (I 144), Diego Fernández el Palentino (I 103), Bartolomé de las Casas (I 26), el Inca Garcilaso de la Vega (I 20), Antonio de Herrera (III 311), Juan de Torquemada (III 422) y Antonio de la Calancha (I 4). For matters relating to the War of the Vicuñas and Basques, Juan de Medina (II 135), Pedro de Guilléstegui (I 322), Juan Sobrino (I 322), José Velázquez (I 277), a Dominican named Francisco Jaramillo (I 322), a Franciscan named Marcos de Guadalajara y Javier (I 322), and a Jesuit named Alonso de Ovalle (I 322). As Hanke states, Arzáns wanted to be considered a writer of history that was devoted to the truth, he did so as an amateur, making no effort to comb through the archives of either Potosí or La Plata (lix). There are other sources in the book that seemed to come into the hands of the author by chance, such as “un cuaderno manuscrito sobre la inundación de la laguna de Caricari” (II I), Juan de Yepes, “Relación sobre las guerras contra

los indios infieles en las provincias de Chichas y Porco”, (I 223), “Noticias que remitió Bartolomé Astete de Ulloa al rey don Felipe IV de la reedificación de la Ribera” (I 64), and Antonio Martínez de Moreira “a la corte y al consejo de Indias sobre las pretensiones de Potosí” (II 196-197). He refers also to anonymous manuscript sources, such as “Relación sobre el trágico hallazgo de un precioso carbunclo en el paraje de Cantumarca” (I 294-295), “Testimonio sobre la nubecilla de Potosí” (I 109-110), and “Testamento de un poderoso avariento, mercader de los gruesos cargadores de España” (II 55). There are also vague references, with statements such as “otro escritor, cuyo nombre se ignora, que también escribió en verso” (I 267), “según afirma una relación antigua que hallé entre unos papeles, escrita por García del Pilar” (I 70), “otros autores, con lo que se reconoce en varios archivos” (I 41), “la relación manuscrita de aquel autor incógnito” (I 327), which are placed liberally throughout the *Historia* (Hanke lx).

⁵ Gumucio presents examples in the text on the manuscript, el Cerro Rico, the city, life and death, good government, the situation of the Indigenous population, money and wealth, love, sins, men, women, families, and other topics. Each section appears to be a brief compilation of quotes from the text on the subject matter, but it is difficult to examine each easily as no citations are provided, and one would need to seek each out individually to place it within some context.

⁶ As Bakewell affirms, the quality of this silver ore during the first two decades was so rich, and so easily accessible, that for years it was possible to simply arrive and begin digging with the most basic of hand tools. Many would use little more than pick, axe, and shovel, and find this valuable silver ore. Unlike other centers that required substantial initial capital to tap into, the cerro of Potosí truly was unique in this sense, and unfortunately, can also be one reason for stifling the investment in other infrastructure. For decades, the wealth

was simply there and easy to acquire, it made no sense to invest further until it was too late (Bakewell 19-20)

⁷ This is not to be confused with the Introduction chapter to this dissertation, where the use of mercury in the amalgamation was first used to refine for gold, and not silver. It was not until 1555 that Bartolomé de Medina developed a method of refining silver ore with mercury in Mexico, which required substantial amounts of water, and are the reason Toledo ordered the creation of riberas in 1572 (Brown 19).

⁸ This is mentioned for the first time here and explained in greater detail in the chapter corresponding to the year 1562 (1 117).

⁹ It should be noted once again that Juan Pasquier is one of the unverifiable sources used by Arzáns in his text, who may or may not have existed. As Hanke affirms, “Arzáns considera que Pasquier escribió con gran elegancia y toma de él uno de los episodios más bravos de la Historia” (I lv), referring to the two warrior maidens doña Ana y doña Eustaquia who dressed as men and walked the streets at night, looking for fights and trouble with men (Arzáns II 149).

¹⁰ As a curious side note, Arzáns does not make reference to Dr. Loarte despite having spent considerable time gathering the necessary information on the deficiencies of the mining industry of Potosí. His contributions to the mining industry at Potosí should not be understated and can be further seen as discussed by Guillermo Lohmann Villena in *Las Minas De Huancavelica En Los Siglos Xvi Y Xvii*.

¹¹ Bakewell in “Technological Change in Potosí: The Silver Boom of the 1570’s” presents in detail that the specifics of the machinery used to grind the silver ore into a fine powder, which was a requisite step of using mercury for amalgamation. Most of these consisted of mills powered by either man, beast, or water. The Ribera and reservoirs were created for the large-scale usage of mills in this sense and was more practical than relying on

massive amounts of manpower or beasts to prepare the ore. This did not replace the previous methods, but rather was used alongside often for more demanding tasks and consistency (66-67).

¹² For a detailed analysis of the need for and gradual implementation of the mita system refer to Jeffrey Cole, *The Potosí mita, 1573-1700: compulsory Indian labor in the Andes*.

¹³ These comments are repeated often in the text, all the way until the mid-seventeenth century when the overall economic decline began. The narrator states that, "...todo se vendiese y comprase por tan excesivos precios en todo el reino... mantenimientos y mercaderías valían a tan altísimos precios que al referirlos en España a unos causaba risa y a otros se les hacía increíble" (I 179).

¹⁴ As Bakewell affirms, the Regocijo was large in terms of its overall space, however held less merchants than el Gato. The description of being larger in Arzáns' text is because a large portion of the Regocijo was a plaza for social events, and often held fiestas and processions, among other things (40).

¹⁵ Let it be known that Carvajal, facing certain death as punishment for his part in the rebellion, had perhaps the greatest retort to Diego Centeno, his adversary and man he had constantly made retreat. With Centeno finally capturing Carvajal, "Francisco Carvajal aún estando ya para ser ajusticiado no dejó sus agudezas y dichos celebrados, pues como cuentan varios escritores el día que fue preso se llegó a él Diego Centeno, y con palabras imperiosas le preguntó si le conocía, a lo que respondió Carvajal diciendo que no le conocía porque siempre lo había visto por detrás" (I 61). Carvajal was then quartered and killed.

¹⁶ For other cases involving corrupt *corregidores* in Arzáns, refer to Volume II 190, 407-8, and 412. This is not an exhausted list, but rather a list of cases with similar themes of greed and corruption in occupying the position.

¹⁷ Note that as the source that Arzáns uses for this story is one of the unverifiable sources, Carrión's existence may be the product of the author's imagination and not actually a real person in the history of Potosí.

¹⁸ Quiroga's progression through the various exchanges of silver and silver related projects made him adept in each area. As Bakewell asserts, "there were many steps along the way where one could be cheated of silver, so it was necessary to be aware of it all" (46), and so some of the most successful individuals knew how best to buy and sell silver ore, mercury, and the pitfalls of fraudulent coin minting. Kendal Brown describes the consequences of one such individual who chose to cheat both his fellow silver traders and the Crown of their due silver and taxation, "In January 1650, Gómez de la Rocha was garroted in Potosí, after which his head was cut off and displayed as a warning to others who might debase the royal coinage or attack the King's emissaries" (27). As can be seen in Chapter 3, this manner of fraud adversely affected the city and the Crown.

¹⁹ See for example I 288-289, which shows how a man of low socioeconomic status came to Potosí, worked hard to afford the dowries of three daughters, but was then swindled out of his earnings. After lamenting his loss, a number of kind, generous, and most importantly, wealthy men banded together and gifted the man the funds to pay for the marriages of all three daughters.

²⁰ For an example early in the history of the city, see the chapter corresponding to the year 1598 (I 235) where Captain Rodrigo de Alburquerque was in Potosí to raise troops and the necessary finances in order to serve the King's interests in nearby Chile. There are countless others, generally found described as "la pacificación" of an area to refer to Indian activity.

²¹ This extends to positions of authority in the city. Quiroga held various positions of office and influence throughout his life, generally related to the mining industry, and

Bakewell affirms that if Quiroga benefitted personally from these positions in any way, it was incidental not the primary motivator to occupy those positions. In all official positions that Quiroga held, there are no historical records of abuse of authority, and no commentary in Arzáns' text to indicate that Quiroga ever sought to obtain a position solely for the purpose of increasing his own power and authority, though his upstanding reputation and funds could have granted him access to virtually any position of his choosing (133).

²² As Hanke states, "Fray Juan de la Torre también había utilizado la Historia para unos sermones en 1714" (I xxxix).

²³ For reference, and as stated, the narrator presents many cases of extreme generosity or altruism on the part of citizens of Potosí who gift their silver or other material goods to those in need. Some of the more prominent examples can be seen in the case of Fulgencio Orozco in 1612 (I 289), of Ambrosio de Soto in 1678 (II 287-288), and Fray Juan José Ortiz in 1682 (II 307-308).

²⁴ For a thorough analysis on these two particular women in Arzáns' text, refer to Gina Herrmann's work, "Amazonic Ambivalence in Imperial Potosí".

²⁵ See also Scott Taylor in *Honor and Violence in Golden Age Spain* for additional discussion on the importance of honor, and the situations that called for violence as a solution to violations of that honor. Lisa Vollendorf's work *The Lives of Women: A New History of Inquisitional Spain* is useful if considering issues relating to the control of unsanctioned relationships by different races in the New World.

²⁶ This refers specifically to the area of the Viceroyalty of Peru. Refer to Patricia Seed's text *To Love, Honor, and Obey in Colonial Mexico: Conflicts Over Marriage Choice, 1574-1821* to compare points between the region of Mexico and the viceroyalty of Peru, for while each developed distinct methods of dealing with similar issues, there is significant

overlap of key points regarding the loss of honor due to the non-completion of marriage following the loss of virginity.

²⁷ For a detailed study into the distinct social pressures placed upon women at differing social levels, see Asunción Lavrin “Women in Spanish American colonial society”. Lavrin discusses not only the differences in expectation of behavior, but also of options to remedy perceived harm to honor, “Women of the lower classes were under less social pressure than elite women. For them, consensual unions were not necessarily a bad thing.” (332).

²⁸ For more on the diverse and impactful ways that Indigenous women operated in the markets of Potosi, refer to Mangan 136 (married couples who contribute to a singular business venture), 143 (married women who operated independent of their husbands), and 147 (widows operating after the death of a husband).

²⁹ The exemption applied to all goods made in the traditional Andean way, as well as goods traded among the Indigenous, which allowed for a merchant to offer an extensive range of goods (139-140).

³⁰ Archivo Nacional de Bolivia, *Cabildo de Potosí, Libro de Actas*. Vol 9, fol. 92v-102, 105-12, 164-73v, three consecutive annual lists of taxes paid by Potosí merchants and businesses, 5 Aug. 1599, 1600, 24 July 1601.

³¹ Nancy Hartsock provides additional support to these points in *Money, Sex, and Power: Toward a Feminist Historical Materialism* with additional emphasis on class difference in contemporary and recent history to develop ideas of systems of control over women. Janet Lee and Susan M. Shaw work in a similar fashion in *Women Worldwide: Transnational Feminist Perspectives on Women*. Both texts are useful, but not as complete as Rubin’s work on a proposed sex/gender system.

³² Forey goes on to state that the majority of the orders founded at this time, which is to say, towards the end of the twelfth century, were formed “in imitation of the Templars and Hospitallers” (200-201). Besides the order of Santiago, other notable orders with similar goals of reconquest were the order of Calatrava, of Mountjoy, of San Julián de Pereiro and Evora, of Santa Maria de España and finally of San Jorge de Alfama (201). In general terms, the sum of the work of all the orders by the turn of the thirteenth century was to have “reached the southern coasts of Spain” (201).

³³ Recall from the first chapter involving the exchange of silver in the case involving Quiroga. There, a reasonable salary for an Indigenous worker was about four pesos a month, and fifty for a Spaniard or natural born citizen of the city working in a managerial role with significant responsibilities in the chapter corresponding to the year 1699, which was a retelling of the major events of his life before (Arzáns II 395). Twenty thousand pesos would likely have been more than Triesta could have earned in his entire life in most legitimate forms of employment, a sum that would have taken over thirty years to accumulate in the above noted role.

³⁴ It should be made clear as well that there is no textual evidence to support any notion that Triesta is of noble background. When the narrator introduces him, he states, “Asistía en servicio de este caballero Pedro de Triesta, de los reinos de España, (...)el cual, siendo mozo de poca edad y buen parecer” (II 280). Other than that, when Lucas Álvarez is dueling Triesta, the narrator states that Triesta is able to defend himself reasonably well because, “como había sido soldado de a caballo en algunas compañías de España no se le hizo nuevo el escaramuzar sangrientamente con aquel viejo” (II 282). There is nothing to point to nobility, all we know is that he was a Spaniard who had experience as a soldier in Spain and then worked as a servant for Don Luis.

³⁵ In saying this, I refer to any of the countless individuals who seemed able to solve their problems through violence, or those who simply were violent for the sake of needless violence. On the lighter end of the spectrum, our first chapter showcased Carvajal, who used the imminent threat of violence to achieve his ends, while on the opposite end of the spectrum, such mindless violence can be analyzed in cases such as in the chapter corresponding to the year 1625, in the character of where a man named Antonio Bran de Brizuela. In most of these cases, the characters harass the citizens of Potosí until they all come to an untimely end, facing execution for their crimes.

³⁶ See Maria Mannarelli in her text *Private Passions and Public Sins* for case studies on legal decisions that assign concrete values to virginity: “virginity nevertheless had a price that varied according to who the deflowered woman was. The experience of doña María Gabriela de Espinosa, a woman from Lima born from an extramarital relationship, illustrates this...[she] initiated proceedings in the criminal court of the royal audiencia against Tomás, who before leaving for Spain had to pay three thousand pesos to his lover for her lost virginity” (106). This is a unique and insightful study that would be useful to return to later to determine how these values were calculated, who else did attempt to bring a case before the courts, if they were successful or not, and because as Mannarelli states, “It is unknown how many women were able to successfully pursue this course” (106).

³⁷ To be clear, control over female sexuality was not the only component to determine honor, as Nicole von Germeten affirms in, “Sexuality, Witchcraft, and Honor in Colonial Spanish America”. Rather, “It should be noted that although an individual’s sexual activity could play a role in their personal, familial and even communal sense of honor, *honra* had many more components besides sex, such as heritage, occupation, age, class, and family status” (374), all of which are presented by the narrator regarding Francisca. The focus of this case is on the sexual violation, for that is what will be damaging to her honor, whereas all the

other components that make up honor remain intact and are undisturbed by the actions of Triesta.

³⁸ As Lyman Johnson asserts, honor and honra (honor-virtue) were the two most often made points in regard to an individual and their place in society. While honor was often related to the inherited characteristics from birth, such as elite status (largely excluding most of the population), honra was actively gained or lost through the actions of one person or the family (3-4). Arzáns does not discuss honor and honra in these ways, and instead focuses simply on moralistic behavior, of being a good or a bad Christian and citizen of the city.

³⁹ As mentioned in the Introduction, the narrator often uses divine wrath or intervention to punish or reward the citizens of Potosí (15). When this occurs, the narrator is clear about the source of any manner of divine intervention, as will be seen in the next case involving Claudia and in cases in the third chapter of this dissertation.

⁴⁰ It is important to remember that Juan Pasquier makes up one of the unverifiable sources used by Arzáns in his text, who may or may not have existed. As Hanke states, “Arzáns considera que Pasquier escribió con gran elegancia y toma de él uno de los episodios más bravos de la *Historia*. Este es el relato de las dos bellas y nobles doncellas, doña Ana y doña Eustaquia, que vestidas de hombre deambulaban de noche por las calles de Potosí Arzáns refers to the work of Pasquier” (I lv), which is the case of the Amazonic Warriors mentioned earlier.

⁴¹ It should be noted that payment is not always mentioned by the narrator.

⁴² Boyle concludes by noting that “the meaning of and possibility for redemption too varies and its potential is often limited to particular classes of women.” (291). It would be useful to catalogue all such occurrences with the text (a long-term task, to be certain) to see how great this disparity of redemption was among classes in the *Historia* to further analyze links between them and disturbances in what Boyle referred to as “maintaining the social

order” (290). Race and ethnicity would also need to be considered, as seen in chapter 1 where a black female servant was bribed to help assassinate her master in exchange for the funds necessary to buy her freedom, who received no punishment for her participation. To this end, Janet Lindman’s work “Women, Gender, and Religion in the Early Americas” provides a relevant launching point from where to begin, with her focus on women from all socioeconomic levels, races, and religions.

⁴³ Note that Mendoza points out that while Arzáns names the Indian as Hualca, citing both Mendez and Pasquier, that name also appears differently in other texts. Mendoza affirms that records by Luis Capoché refer to Hualca by the name Gualpa, and in Spanish translates to Huallpa, in registered documents pertaining to the petitions made by descendants in 1578 (I 34). It is unclear why Arzáns uses this alternate name.

⁴⁴ Refer to chapter 1 for an in-depth analysis of all obstacles preventing European technology from assisting in Potosí, and the role of Viceroy Toledo in implementing the solutions of those obstacles (10, 17).

⁴⁵ For historical details about the huayra and its importance see Peter Bakewell, *Miners of the Red Mountain, Indian Labor in Potosí 1545-1650*, page 14-22, Jane Mangan, *Trading Roles: Gender, Ethnicity, and the Urban Economy in Colonial Potosí*, page 24, 32. Luis Capoché refers to them as guairas in *Relaciones historico-literarias de la América meridional*, page 54. Arzáns does not specifically state that the technological secret remained only among the Indians, nor that any Spaniard appropriated or operated the huayra at any point. He does however always refer to the huayras as operated by Indians only.

⁴⁶ The process developed to meet the needs of the inhabitants of Potosí is fascinating, especially when one considers the rapid expansion of the city and growth of the population past the typical crowds seen in mining towns to the cosmopolitan symbol that it became. Many individuals have discussed the markets of Potosí and how they operated and were

supplied, and in specific I refer to the work of Enrique Tandeter, *Coercion and market: silver mining in colonial Potosí, 1692-1826*. In particular, see chapter sixteen for information relating to the origin of merchandise, taxation, merchants and their challenges, and demand for particular goods that were difficult to create in Potosí, mainly pertaining to high-end imports, agricultural and mean products.

⁴⁷ See Peter Bakewell's text *Miners of the Red Mountain* for a detailed summary of the challenges associated with developing Potosí in its less than hospitable, but evidently manageable, geographic location. Beef was available, but not locally, as cattle were brought in, "in large numbers from what is now northern and central Argentina, providing both meat and leather" (24). Bakewell also discusses in this section the massive amount of construction material brought in for both the city and the development of the Ribera for the mining industry. See Jose Revello "Merchandise Brought to America by the Spaniards (1534-1586)" for a list of goods imported in from Europe and parts of Asia.

⁴⁸ The narrator will present the activities of Rocha in each of the chapters corresponding to the years 1646 through 1651, and afterwards only as a point of reference, dealing with events that relate to after this death.

⁴⁹ The narrator does not name the individuals targeted in these crimes, only the men who dealt with Rocha, "entrando al asiento de Titiri mataron al teniente de justicia de aquel partido y a otros vascongados, quemáronle las casas y luego se vinieron a esta Villa de Potosí" (II 112).

⁵⁰ As a side, there is a fascinating discussion between Figueroa and his wife while the men are in hiding. She has a dream where she saw Rocha approach and arrest Figueroa, and then pleaded with him to hide in the hills. The advice was ignored, and she was called "loca", right before the vision came true (II 112).

⁵¹ For a detailed historical analysis of Rocha refer to “Corrupción y Dominación Colonial: El Gran Fraude a la Casa de la Moneda de Potosí en 1649” by Kris Lane (pp. 111-112). For a detailed analysis of the same theme in both Potosí and other areas in the New World, refer to Daniel Oropesa Alba en *La falsificación de la moneda* (pp. 61-74 for Rocha in specific).

⁵² The Crown gave these titles, “de presidente de los Charcas, visitador de la real audiencia de La Plata, visitador de las cajas reales y Casa de Moneda de Potosí, y demás de esto le dio muchas firmas en blanco para hacer mercedes en su real nombre” (II 116).

⁵³ This event is what Arzáns considers to be the third of the great catastrophe to have struck Potosí, hence the title of this chapter is, “En que se cuenta la tercera destrucción que tuvo Potosí con la rebaja de la moneda hecha por el presidente don Francisco de Nestares Marín, y lo demás que sucedió en esta Villa”.

⁵⁴ As Hanke and Mendoza point out, “El episodio de Rocha acaece en 1648-1650 y Arzáns lo relata unos 60 años después, si aceptamos que comenzó a escribir la Historia en 1705, según él mismo dice. Arzáns pudo muy bien escuchar de boca de algunos ancianos de la Villa los pormenores que nos trasmite” (II 133). We will return to this later, as it may contribute to the reasoning behind the narrator constantly referring to most of Rocha’s questionable activity as rumor, and not as fact. Rocha’s arrested and eventual execution, despite necessary in accordance with the King’s law by Marín, was unpopular in the eyes of the public as his charity was a benefit to the city, at the expense of long-term, economic variables not considered on a day-to-day basis.

⁵⁵ “Hizo mudar las puertas de la Casa de Moneda que estaban en la calle Imperial, y las sacó a la plaza (adonde al presente están) para fortalecerse en dicha casa si tuviese algún rebato, y todas las rejas de las ventanas que de las cajas reales donde vivía salían a la plaza y eran de madera las mandó hacer de hierro para la seguridad de su persona. Demas de esto,

como trajo su señoría 12 hombres de España por criados (sin sus deudas que también trajo) a todos los armó de arcabuces, escopetas y pistolas, mandándoles no se apartasen de su antesala a todas horas” (II 127).

⁵⁶ Hanke states that “Arzáns especula tanto sobre el carácter femenino que resulta obvio que el tema le fascinaba, y atribuye a las mujeres muchas malas cualidades” (I xxxv).

⁵⁷ The divine virgins of Potosí are further developed later in this chapter in the fourth case. For now, it is sufficient to point out that a Rocha, a Spaniard, is experiencing the presence of a virgin whose identity is strongly tied to the city in its origin, as well as Indian customs towards a blend of cultural religious components, yet this vision grants neither salvation or punishment, as most other appearances of the virgins does.

⁵⁸ Arzáns is careful here not to name the Spaniard, “de quien no es conveniente decir su nombre porque hoy viven sus herederos en grandeza” (II 119). As stated in the first chapter, naming such an individual could easily bring about the wrath of any living descendants, be it in physical harm or through monetary lawsuit for damaging the honor of a family (51).

⁵⁹ A brief list of examples they give are, “Las virtudes y acciones de muchas personas encuentran larga expresión: fray Gaspar Martínez, que resistió las tentaciones; doña Mariana de Benavides, que tuvo visiones; fray Gaspar de Villarroel, sabio prelado; el capitán Francisco de Oyanume, que invitaba a su mesa a 12 menesterosos cada domingo “en reverencia de los 12 apóstoles, el dominico fray Vicente Bernedo, preciosa mina de virtudes descubierta en el Potosí” (I lxviii).

⁶⁰ As has been seen in most of examples in this chapter and the preceding chapters, each case contains some manner of moral interjection whereby the narrator has either spoken on the pitfalls of poor behavior, the benefits of good behavior, or has included divine

consequences for sinners or a life dedicated to serving God for those who change towards a more ideal, moral set of behaviors.

⁶¹ The worship of what would become the image of Candelaria thus began not in Christianity, and Espinosa offers a number of descriptions of some of the symbolic representations that may have formed the pre-Spanish worship of the image. Some of the mentions are “The Sun-God”, “Life of the Sky”, “Divine title of the sun”, “Spirit of the Sky”, “The mother”, “Sun Spirit of the Mountains”, and “Mother of the Spirit of the Sky” (XX-XXI).

⁶² Espinosa provides an extensive list of the men who participated in the conquest of Tenerife and their subsequent administrative roles on the island in the index of the text (Catalogued by name, year, and with the description “One of the conquerors of Tenerife” in the year 1497. It would be fascinating to research these men to see if any wrote subsequently about how the virgin of Candelaria was worshiped by the Spaniards and non-Spaniards, and how that worship subsequently evolved from the Island of Tenerife, to Spain, and finally throughout the Peruvian Viceroyalty during the spread of the cult of the virgin of Copacabana. Did certain aspects remain from pre-Spanish conquest of Tenerife to spread in Potosí, or were most customs adapted by the Spaniards before coming to the New World?

⁶³ As McCormack discusses, the patterns used by the Incan empire prior to the arrival of the Spaniards allowed for the integration of worship of the Sun deity. Rapid expansion around the time of Spanish conquest made for unstable implementation of the Incan custom and made the transition to something new, like Copacabana, possible (39-46).

⁶⁴ Yupanqui was a relative of Pablo Inca and Alonso Viracocha Inca, the latter being the gobernadora of Anasaya at Copacabana at the time when the virgin was wanted as patron saint (MacCormack 49).

⁶⁵ The virgin of Candelaria is also worshiped for the same reason, using the same image in a nearby mine. The narrator privileges neither of the virgins, nor calls attention to this difference in worship. They are both an established part of the daily worship for the Indigenous and Spanish men that work in those mines, having blended old, individual cultural components towards something new that is unique to Potosí.

⁶⁶ Another example appears in this same chapter corresponding to the year 1630, where Arzáns introduces a Potosino named Don Diego who murdered a man from the frontier of Andalucía over the matter of a debt that was owed. When the resolution is reached in that story after what is also described as divine intervention, don Diego is granted a second chance to do good in life, “vivió de allí adelante muy ajustado, siempre temiendo la justiciar de Dios” (II 34). In that case, there too is no further commentary from the narrator, only the divine action, and the corresponding change in the individual. Further to this, a similar pattern was seen in Chapter two of this dissertation with the case of Francisca, where two other groups of people received some manner of divine intervention or sign and also changed for the better (12).

Bibliography

- Ajens, Andrés. "La Historia de Potosí de Arzáns y el ciclo dramático altooperuano de la muerte de Atahualpa." *DRD De Raíz Diversa. Revista Especializada en Estudios Latinoamericanos*, vol. 3, no. 5, 2017, pp. 23.
- Alcaraz Masías, Delio. *Bolivia: mitos, tradiciones y leyendas: antología*. Primera edición ed., Editorial Educación y Cultura, 2012.
- Aristotle. *The Essential Aristotle*. Start Publishing LLC, 2013.
- Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela, Bartolomé. *Historia De La Villa Imperial De Potosí*. Edited by Lewis Hanke and Gunnar Mendoza L, Brown University Press, 1965.
- , and Leonardo García Pabón. *Relatos De La Villa Imperial De Potosí: Antología / Bartolomé Arzáns De Orsúa Y Vela*. Edited by Virginia Ayllón. La Paz: Plural, 2012.
- , and R.C. Padden. *Tales of Potosí*. Translated by Frances M. López-Morillas. Brown University Press, 1975.
- Bakewell, P. J. *Miners of the Red Mountain: Indian Labor in Potosí, 1545-1650*. University of New Mexico Press, 1984.
- . "Registered Silver Production in the Potosí District, 1550-1735." *Jahrbuch Für Geschichte Lateinamerikas*, vol. 12, no. 1, 1975.
- . *Silver and Entrepreneurship in Seventeenth-Century Potosí: The Life and Times of Antonio López de Quiroga*. 1st Southern Methodist University Press ed., Southern Methodist University Press, 1995.
- . "Technological Change in Potosí; the Silver Boom of the 1570's." *Jahrbuch Für Geschichte Lateinamerikas*, vol. 14, no. 1, 1977.

- Boyer, Richard. "Women, La Mala Vida, and the Politics of Marriage." *Sexuality and Marriage in Colonial Latin America / Sexuality and Marriage in Colonial Latin America*. Edited by Asunción Lavrin, University of Nebraska Press, 1989.
- Boyle, Margaret E. "Chronicling Women's Containment in Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela's History of Potosí." *Studies in Eighteenth-Century Culture*, vol. 39, 2010, pp. 279–96.
- Brading, D. A. *The First America: The Spanish Monarchy, Creole Patriots, and the Liberal State, 1492-1867*. Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- Brown, Kendall W. *A History of Mining in Latin America: From the Colonial Era to the Present*. University of New Mexico Press, 2012.
- Calancha, Antonio de la, and Gustavo Adolfo Otero. *Crónica Moralizada*. Artística, 1939.
- Capoche, Luis. *Relaciones Histórico-Literarias De La América Meridional: Relación General De La Villa Imperial De Potosí*. Edited by Lewis Hanke and Pérez de Tudela y Bueso Juan, Ediciones Atlas, 1959.
- Castillo, Francisco Andújar. *The Venality of Offices and Honours in Spain and America in the Eighteenth Century*. En Garavaglia, J. C. - Braddick, M. J. - Lamouroux, C. (Eds), *Serve the Power (s), Serve the State. America and Eurasia*. Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2016.
- Cervantes Saavedra, Miguel de. *El ingenioso hidalgo Don Quixote de la Mancha*. Nueva ed., corr. denuevo : Madrid: G. De Sancha, 1798. *HathiTrust*, www.catalog.hathitrust.org/api/volumes/oclc/22935029.html. Accessed 12 April 2019.
- . *Novelas Ejemplares*. Linkgua Ediciones, 2008. *HathiTrust*, babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=umn.31951002377934i&view=1up&seq=171. Accessed 10 November. 2019.

Chacon Torres, Mario. *Documentos En Torno a Bartolome de Orada y Vela*. Universidad Tomas Frias, 1960.

Choque, María Esther. “La Representación De La Mujer En La Obra De Bartolomé Arzáns De Orsuá Y Vela.” *Arizona State University*, 1989.

Cole, Jeffrey A. *The Potosí Mita, 1573-1700: Compulsory Indian Labor in the Andes / The Potosí Mita, 1573-1700 : Compulsory Indian Labor in the Andes*. Stanford University Press, 1985.

Colón, Cristóbal. *Carta de Colón anunciando el descubrimiento*, El Cid Editor, 2004. *ProQuest Ebook Central*, www.ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/mcgill/detail.action?docID=3157944. Accessed 8 September 2018.

Cortés, Hernán. *Cartas de relación*. Editorial Linkgua USA, 2009. *ProQuest Ebook Central*, www.ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/mcgill/detail.action?docID=3194183. Accessed 18 May 2018.

---. *Fernando Cortes, His Five Letters of Relation to the Emperor Charles V [1519-1526]*. Rio Grande Press, 1977.

Costilla, Julia. “El Milagro En La Construcción Del Culto a Nuestra Señora de Copacabana (Virreinato Del Perú, 1582-1651).” *Estudios Atacamenos*, vol. 1, no. 39, 2010, pp. 35–56.

Derrida, Jacques. “Force of Law: The Mystical Foundation of Authority.” *Deconstruction and the Possibility of Justice*. Edited by Drucilla Cornell, Michel Rosenfeld, David Gray Carlson. Routledge, 1992.

Espinosa, Alonso de. *The Guanches of Tenerife: The Holy Image of Our Lady of Candelaria, and the Spanish Conquest and Settlement*. Edited by Sir Clements Markham. Routledge, 2016.

Forey, Alan. *The Military Orders from the Twelfth to the Early Fourteenth Centuries*. University of Toronto Press, 1992.

- Freud, Sigmund. *Totem and Taboo: Some Points of Agreement between the Mental Lives of Savages and Neurotics*. Translated by James Strachey. Routledge, 2001. *Taylor & Francis Online*, www-taylorfrancis-com.proxy3.library.mcgill.ca/books/9780203164709. Accessed 2 November. 2018.
- García Pabón, Leonardo. “Espacio Andino, Escritura Colonial Y Patria Criolla: La Historia De Potosí En La Narrativa De Bartolomé Arzans.” *University of Minnesota*, 1990.
- . “The Indian as Image and as Symbolic Structure: Bartolome Arzans's *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí*.” *Amerindian Images and the Legacy of Columbus*, Edited by Jara René and Nicholas Spadaccini, University of Minnesota Press, 1992, pp. 530-564.
- . “La adolescente en la colonia y los crímenes necesarios contra la familia. La ‘dichosa pecadora’ de bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y vela.” *Revista De Critica Literaria Latinoamericana*, vol. 44, no. 88, 2018, pp. 339–362.
- . “Sleeping with Corpses, Eating Hearts, and Walking Skulls: Criollo's Subjectivity in Antonio De La Calancha and Bartolome Arzans De Orsua Y Vela.” *Hispanic Issues*, vol. 31, 2005, pp. 222–240.
- Gisbert, Teresa. *Iconografía Y Mitos Indígenas En El Arte*. La Paz, Bolivia. Gisbert, 2004.
- Gumucio, Mariano Baptista. *El mundo desde Potosí: vida y reflexiones de Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela, 1676-1736*. Banco Santa Cruz, Grupo Santander Central Hispano, 2001.
- Hanke, Lewis. *Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela's History of Potosí*. Brown University Press, 1965.
- . *El otro tesoro de las Indias: Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela y su Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí*. Por La Asociación Internacional De Hispanistas, Instituto Español De La Universidad De Nimega Holanda, 1967.
- Hartsock, Nancy C. M. *Money, Sex, and Power: Toward a Feminist Historical Materialism*. Longman, 1983.

Hemming, John. *The Conquest of the Incas*. Abacus, 1972.

Herrmann, Gina. "Amazonic Ambivalence in Imperial Potosí." *MLN*, vol. 114, no. 2, 1999, pp. 315–40.

Hester, Marianne. *Lewd Women and Wicked Witches: A Study of the Dynamics of Male Domination*. Routledge, 1992.

Jay, Felix. *Sin, Crimes, and Retribution in Early Latin America: A Translation and Critique of Sources--Lope De Aguirre, Francisco De Carvajal, Juan Rodríguez Freyle*. E. Mellen Press, 1999.

Johnson, Lyman L., and Sonya Lipsett-Rivera. *The Faces of Honor: Sex, Shame, and Violence in Colonial Latin America*. University of New Mexico Press, 1998.

Kalvesmaki, Joel. *The Theology of Arithmetic: Number Symbolism in Platonism and Early Christianity*. Center for Hellenic Studies, 2013.

Lacan, Jacques. "The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psychoanalysis: June 24, 1964." *Essaim*, vol. 21, no. 2, 2008, pp. 135–135.

Lacassagne, Alexandre. *Le Criminel aux points de vue anthropologique, psychologique et social*. Vigot frères, Paris, 1908. *BnF Gallica*, <https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k496834/f3.image>. Accessed 19 September 2018.

Lane, Kris. "Corrupción y Dominación Colonial: El Gran Fraude a La Casa de La Moneda de Potosí En 1649." *Boletín Del Instituto de Historia Argentina y Americana Dr. Emilio Ravignani*, no. 43, 2015, pp. 94–130.

Lane, Kris. "The Ghost of Seventeenth-Century Potosí: An Autopsy." *The Americas*, vol. 76, no. 2, 2019, pp. 327–350. Accessed 14 February 2020.

- Lavrin, Asunción. *Sexuality and Marriage in Colonial Latin America / Sexualidad y Matrimonio en la América Colonial*. University of Nebraska Press, 1989.
- León Portilla, Miguel. *The Broken Spear: The Aztec Account of the Conquest of Mexico*. Translated by Garibay K Angel María and Lysander Kemp, Expanded and updated Edition, Beacon Press, 2006. *ALCL Humanities E-Book*, [www.fulcrum-org.proxy3.library.mcgill.ca/epubs/73666468d?locale=en#/6/4\[xhtml00000002\]!/4/1:0](http://www.fulcrum-org.proxy3.library.mcgill.ca/epubs/73666468d?locale=en#/6/4[xhtml00000002]!/4/1:0). Accessed 29 December 2019.
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude, et al. *The Elementary Structures of Kinship (Les Structures Élémentaires de La Parenté)*. Edited by Rodney Needham. Translated by John Richard Von Sturmer and James Harle Bell, Revised edition, Beacon Press, 1969.
- “Liga.” *Diccionario De Autoridades*. Edición facsímil, Editorial Gredos, 1964. *Real Academia Española*, www.web.frl.es/DA.html. Accessed 22 October 2019.
- Lohmann Villena, Guillermo. *Las Minas De Huancavelica En Los Siglos Xvi Y Xvii*. Edited by Escuela de estudios hispano-americanos (Séville, Espagne), Escuela De Estudios Hispano-Americanos, 1949.
- McCarthy-Gilmore, Kate Alicia. “Subversive Frontiers: Space, Gender and Literature in Colonial Latin America.” *Washington University*, Washington University, 2009.
- MacCormack, Sabine. “From the Sun of the Incas to the Virgin of Copacabana.” *Representations*, vol. 8, no. 8, 1984, pp. 30–60.
- Malinowski, Bronislaw. *A Scientific Theory of Culture and Other Essays*. Oxford University Press, 1960.
- Mangan, Jane E. *Trading Roles: Gender, Ethnicity, and the Urban Economy in Colonial Potosí*. Duke University Press, 2005.

- Mannarelli, María Emma. *Private Passions and Public Sins: Men and Women in Seventeenth-Century Lima*. University of New Mexico Press, 2007.
- McNally, David. *Against the Market: Political Economy, Market Socialism and the Marxist Critique*. New York, 1993.
- Meade, Teresa A. *A History of Modern Latin America: 1800 to the Present*. Wiley-Blackwell, 2010.
- Memmi, Albert. *The Colonizer and the Colonized*. Expanded edition, Beacon Press, 1991.
- Murra, John V. *Reciprocity and Redistribution in Andean Civilizations: Transcript of the Lewis Henry Morgan Lectures at the University of Rochester, April 8th--17th, 1969*. Hua Books, 2017.
- Naranjo, Plutarco. "Social Function of Coca in Pre-Columbian America." *Journal of Ethnopharmacology*, vol. 3, no. 2–3, 1981, pp. 161–72.
- Omiste, Modesto, and Vicente G. Quesada. *La Casa de Moneda de Potosí*. Editora "El Siglo," 1996.
- Ortiz, Fernando. *Cuban Counterpoint, Tobacco and Sugar*. Duke University, 1995.
- Pratt, Mary Louise. "Arts of the Contact Zone." *Profession*, 1991, pp. 33–40.
- Pupo-Walker, Enrique. *La Vocación Literaria Del Pensamiento Histórico En América: Desarrollo De La Prosa De Ficción : Siglos Xvi, Xvii, Xviii Y Xix*. Gredos, 1982.
- Revello, José Torre. "Merchandise Brought to America by the Spaniards (1534-1586)." *The Hispanic American Historical Review*, vol. 23, no. 4, 1943, pp. 773–76.
- Robledo, Ángela I. "Brujería, Intertextualidad Creativa Y Discurso Hispanoamericano En Historia De La Villa Imperial De Potosí." *Bulletin of Hispanic Studies*, vol. 69, no. 1, 1992, pp. 49–54.
- Rubin, Gayle. *Deviations: A Gayle Rubin Reader*. Duke University Press, 2011.
- Sahlins, Marshall. *Stone Age Economics*. Routledge Classics, 2017.
- Samuelson, Paul, and William Nordhaus. *Economics*. Nineteenth Edition, McGraw-Hill Irwin, 2010.

Sepúlveda, Denise Galarza. "City, Myth, and Morality in Bartolomé Arzáns's *Historia De La Villa Imperial De Potosí: A Criollo Project*." *Emory University*, 2002.

---. "Of Legends and Lack: The Economy of Criollo Discourse in the *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí*." *Revista de estudios hispánicos*, vol. 42, no. 1, 2008, pp. 3-30.

Sherman, James E., and Barbara H. Sherman. *Ghost Towns and Mining Camps of New Mexico*. University of Oklahoma Press, 1975.

Silverblatt, Irene. *Moon, Sun, and Witches: Gender Ideologies and Class in Inca and Colonial Peru*. Princeton University Press, 1987.

Smith, Adam. *Wealth of Nations*. Generic NL Freebook Publisher. *EBSCOhost*, search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=nlebk&AN=2008591&scope=site. Accessed 12 October 2019.

Socolow, Susan Migden. *The Women of Colonial Latin America*. Second Edition, Cambridge University Press, 2015.

Stolberg, Victor. "The Use of Coca: Prehistory, History, and Ethnography." *Journal of Ethnicity in Substance Abuse*, vol. 10, no. 2, 2011, pp. 126–46.

Stolley, Karen, "The Eighteenth Century: Narrative Forms, Scholarship, and Learning." *The Cambridge History of Latin American Literature: Discovery to Modernism*. Edited by Roberto González Echevarría and Enrique Pupo-Walker. Cambridge University Press, 1996, pp. 336–374.

Suárez, Juan Luis. "Unidad Sin Orden: Milagros, Rituales Y Caos En El Potosí Barroco." *Criticón*, doi-org.proxy3.library.mcgill.ca/10.4000/criticon.371. Vol. 118, 2013, pp. 163–174. Accessed 7 March 2019.

- Tandeter, Enrique. *Coercion and Market: Silver Mining in Colonial Potosí, 1692-1826*. 1st ed., University of New Mexico Press, 1993.
- . "Indians in Late Colonial Markets: Sources and Numbers." *Indians in Late Colonial Markets: Sources and Numbers*, 2012, pp. 196–223.
- . Enrique. "The Mining Industry." *The Cambridge Economic History of Latin America*. Edited by Victor Bulmer-Thomas, John H. Coatsworth, and Roberto Cortés Conde. Cambridge University Press, 2006, pp. 315-356.
- Taylor, Scott K. *Honor and Violence in Golden Age Spain*. Yale University Press, 2008.
- Torres, Bernardo de. *Crónica Agustina*. Edited by Ignacio Prado Pastor, Universida Nacional Mayor De San Marcos, 1974.
- Twinam, Ann. *Public Lives, Private Secrets: Gender, Honor, Sexuality, and Illegitimacy in Colonial Spanish America*. Stanford University Press, 1999.
- Vollendorf, Lisa. *The Lives of Women: A New History of Inquisitional Spain*. 1st ed., Vanderbilt University Press, 2005.
- Vásquez Córdoba, Shiddarta. "La Crónica De Potosí Y Sus Milagros: Complejidad Cultural Y Modelación De Relaciones Simbólicas." *University of Western Ontario (Graduate Program in Hispanic Studies)*, School of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies, University of Western Ontario, 2010.
- Vega, Garcilaso de la. *Comentarios Reales de Los Incas*. Biblioteca Ayacucho, 1976.
- Voigt, Lisa. *Spectacular Wealth: The Festivals of Colonial South American Mining Towns*. First edition, University of Texas Press, 2016.

Wallerstein, Immanuel. *The Modern World-System I: Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins of the European World-Economy in the Sixteenth Century, With a New Prologue*. University of California Press, 2011.

---. *World-Systems Analysis: An Introduction*. Duke University Press, 2004.

White, Hayden V. *Metahistory: The Historical Imagination in Nineteenth-Century Europe*. Johns Hopkins University Press, 1973.