Media discourse and paradigm shifts in Canadian refugee and child policy frameworks

By
Lara Bober
Department of Integrated Studies in Education
Faculty of Education
McGill University
Montreal, Quebec, Canada

A thesis submitted to
Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies Office
In partial fulfullment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
September 2014

© Lara Bober, 2014

Abstract

This study draws on sociological theories of education and the methodological frameworks of Critical Discourse Analysis and Frames Theory and Analysis in order to examine print media representations of new immigrant, refugee, and precarious status children in the three Canadian newspapers, the *Globe & Mail*, *National Post*, and *Toronto Star* in the historical period of 1989-2009. The objective of this study is to analyze the ways in which media discourse provides ideological legitimacy to exclusionary immigration and refugee policies and the denial of social rights, and to identify media support for immigration justice campaigns. The historical period provides a context for the case study of the Toronto District School Board adopting a Don't Ask Don't Tell Policy in 2007 so that children without immigration status would be able to access schooling without the fear of being reported to immigration authorities. The educational experiences of new immigrant and refugee children have been considered from the lens of social justice research paradigms in terms of the opportunities and outcomes of schooling. This study contributes new knowledge that can be useful for children, educators, policy-makers, and social activists, about the ways in which Canadian media discourses frame children's access to social rights and their experiences of education and migration. This knowledge contributes to the sociology of education, childhood studies, studies in social justice, and refugee and migration studies. Additionally, this study explores opportunities to disrupt conventional explanations for the social and material exclusion of children, in order to advance campaigns for immigration and educational justice.

Keywords: Children; Education; Immigration; Media; Migrant Justice; Neoliberalism

Resumé

Cette étude s'appuie sur les théories sociologiques de l'éducation et les cadres méthodologiques de l'analyse critique du discours et de la théorie et de l'analyse Cadres pour examiner les réclamations de la presse écrite de nouveaux immigrants, les réfugiés et les enfants précaires d'état dans les trois journaux canadiens: *Globe & Mail*, *National Post*, et *Toronto Star* dans la période historique de 1989-2009. Cette période historique fournit un cadre pour l'étude de cas de la Commission scolaire du district de Toronto l'adoption d'un politique “ne demandent pas ne disent pas” en 2007 afin que les enfants sans statut d'immigration seraient en mesure d'accéder à l'école sans la crainte d'être dénoncé aux autorités de l'immigration. Les expériences éducatives des nouveaux enfants immigrants et réfugiés ont été pris en considération de l'objectif de paradigmes de recherche de la justice sociale en termes de possibilités et les résultats d'études. L'objectif de cette étude est d'analyser la manière dont le discours médiatique donne une légitimité idéologique à l'immigration d'exclusion et politiques relatives aux réfugiés et le déni des droits sociaux, et d'identifier le soutien des médias pour les campagnes de la justice en matière d'immigration. Cette étude apporte des connaissances sur la façon dont les discours médiatiques canadiennes encadrent l'accès des enfants aux droits sociaux et de leurs expériences de l'éducation et de la migration. Cette connaissance peut être utile pour les enfants, les éducateurs, les décideurs et les activistes sociaux. En outre, cette étude explore les possibilités de defies explications classiques de l'exclusion sociale et matérielle des enfants, afin de faire progresser les campagnes pour l'immigration et de la justice de l'éducation.

Mots-clés: enfants; l'éducation; immigration; médias; la justice sociale; le néolibéralisme

Dedication

This thesis is dedicated to the children, teenagers and adults who live with political courage against the backdrop of violent, unjust and exclusionary practices. It is also written with the painful knowledge that too many deaths could have been prevented.

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Claudia Mitchell for her professional expertise, kind words, patience, enthusiasm, and committed work respecting the social theorizing of children. I would also like to thank committee member Dr. Teresa Strong-Wilson for her guidance in the early stages of the doctoral program, and for her constructive feedback on this thesis. For four years I was very fortunate to work as a teaching assistant for Dr. Aziz Choudry and learned so much from his committed social activism, scholarship, and strength of character. Thank you for being there as a mentor and committee member, and for helping me to believe that I could offer a contribution to these broader struggles for a better world.

I would also like to thank dedicated and influential professors from the Faculty of Environmental Studies at York University where I completed my MES degree and where I learned to apply social theory to practice: Dr. Deborah Barndt, Dr. Leesa Fawcett, Dr. Ilan Kapoor, and Dr. Peter Penz, as well as my MES project supervisor: the kind and insightful filmmaker, artist, and social activist John Vainstein. Thank you also to Dagny Gingrich who collaborated with me on an MES research project and who has been the most amazing friend ever since.

For my mother, Angelica Bober: from the beginning, in childhood, you believed in me as a social theorist and were a sounding board for ideas. I have learned from your strength and commitment to social equity principles. I am so proud of you for a multitude of reasons but most of all, for the love and solidarity you have shown on the 6th floor, even when you were in so much pain. I know that you will play an important role in drafting a social justice-oriented blueprint for a much improved mental health system, and that we will see this architecture in the years ahead.

In loving memory of my grandparents Adam and Sophie Bober who were able to fill five years of my childhood with a kaleidoscope of memories before dying too young. The suffering you endured is incomprehensible. Your kindness taught me the importance of stamping out bitterness with love.

I would like to thank Flora (Gerry) Griffin, Rosemary Spendlove and David Spendlove for helping me to navigate the rocky terrain of adolescence. From you, I have learned about compassion and trust.

I would also like to thank the young children I have worked with over the years in Ottawa, Halifax, Montreal, Toronto, and Wakefield (Quebec). You have drawn connections between disparate threads and helped me to solve theoretical puzzles. In the meantime, we have also found joy in building snow elephants, making pop-up books, and painting murals inspired by Diego Rivera.

I would like to thank the teachers and students of Fine Arts Core Education (F.A.C.E.) in Montreal and Canterbury Arts High School in Ottawa where I was educated in the 1990s. In these buildings it was confirmed that educational thought and practice are hollow if they are devoid of empathy and imagination, so central to the arts. Thank you for believing that teenagers are also artists in their own right.

I would also like to thank the amazing staff at the Halifax Public Libraries who tracked down every children's book I ever requested with dizzying speed. You have a wonderful and powerful collection of social justice-themed children's literature, and demonstrate again and again the importance of libraries as community hubs for learning and organizing.

And last but not least thank you to friends and partners who have stood by through the good, the bad and the ugly. Your kindness and love have meant so much to me.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract……………………………………………………………………………..ii
Dedication…………………………………………………………………………..iv
Acknowledgments…………………………………………………………………..v
Table of Contents……………………………………..………………………vii

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION 1
Children and migration.. 4
Precarious legal status 6
Media discourse and migration policy 8
Objectives and key research questions 8
Overview of the study 9
Situating myself as a researcher 11
Overview of the thesis 18

CHAPTER 2

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK: MIGRATION AND DISPLACEMENT THROUGH THE PRISMS OF SOCIOLOGICAL THEORIES OF EDUCATION 21
Introduction 21
Educational Progressivism 22
Marxist Educational Theory 23
From Multicultural to Anti-racism Education/Feminist Anti-racism Education 29
Post-colonial and Anti-colonial Theory 36
Literature review: Refugee and immigrant children 39
Conclusion 45

CHAPTER 3

ETHICAL CONCERNS IN SOCIAL JUSTICE RESEARCH WITH CHILDREN 47
Introduction 47
Social justice research and reflexivity 48
Researching displacement 50
Methodological and ethical implications of researching precarious legal status 54
Children, youth and research methodologies 58

Methodological approaches in studies of childhood and migration 59
Detention, deportation and criminalization:
Research in an adverse migration context 62
Conclusion 64

CHAPTER 4

METHODOLOGICAL APPROACHES TO THE ANALYSIS OF MEDIA DISCOURSE, MIGRATION AND SOCIAL POLICY 67
Introduction 67
Social policy, media and political discourse 68
Human rights reporting 74
Methodological approaches to media discourse and migration 76
Social psychology and migration policy 81
Critical Discourse Analysis 84
Frames Theory and Analysis 89
Methods 91
Limitations of the methodological approach 95

CHAPTER 5

THE END OF THE COLD WAR: THE COLLISION OF CHILDREN'S RIGHTS DISCOURSES AND NEOLIBERAL AGENDAS (1989-1995) 97
Historical context: Child welfare frameworks in Canada 98
Neoliberalism in Ontario: The 'Commonsense Revolution' 103
Neoliberalism, childhood, and schooling in Canada 107
Social austerity and shifting paradigms:
Immigration and refugee policy frameworks 110
The Canadian nation-state and international politics 116
Critique of media narratives: Children and nationalism, children and neoliberalism, new immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable'/'threatening' 120
Conclusion 158

CHAPTER 6

CHILDREN DISPLACED AND ECONOMICALLY VULNERABLE: CONCEPTUAL TENSIONS AND POLITICAL PRAXIS (1996-2001) 160
Child welfare frameworks and children's rights discourses 160
Neoliberalism in Ontario 166
Neoliberalism, childhood and schooling in Canada 171

Immigration and refugee policy frameworks in a climate of austerity 173
Baker v. Canada 178
Media and displacement in the 1990s 181
Proposition 187 181
Critique of media narratives: Children and nationalism, children and neoliberalism, new immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable'/'threatening' 182
Conclusion... 205

CHAPTER 7

CONTESTING ILLEGALITY: EDUCATIONAL SPACES, RACIALIZED EXCLUSION, AND THE STRUGGLE FOR IM/MIGRATION JUSTICE (2002-2009) 207
Child welfare frameworks and children's rights discourses 207
Neoliberalism, childhood and schooling in Canada.. 211
Immigration and refugee policy frameworks in a climate of austerity 215
The Canadian nation-state and international politics 217
Immigration and refugee law post-9/11 226
Precarious legal status in a global context 229
Social work and professional ethics.. 231
Precarious legal status in Canada 233
Regularization programs in Canada 233
Sanctuary in the Canadian context 235
Political and social activism of people displaced.. 236
The city as a site of struggle for social and immigration justice............................ 240
Access to social rights for children with precarious legal status/ Don't Ask Don't Tell Policy 244
Critique of media narratives: Children and nationalism, children and neoliberalism, new immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable'/'threatening' 246
Conclusion 259

CHAPTER 8

SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH 261
Summary of thesis.. 262
Contributions to new knowledge 270
Limitations of the study.. 272
Implications for further research 273

REFERENCES.. 278
LIST OF NEWS ARTICLES 341

Chapter 1:
Introduction

The sociology of childhood grapples with a tension between structure and agency (Qvortrup, 1997). While recognizing the important contributions of studies on childhood agency, Qvortrup (1997) urges for such work to be grounded in frameworks provided by research on broader contexts in order to explicate the social patterns, practices within instituational spaces, and key issues and themes in relation to children's lives. Theoretical insights from studies of broader contexts can set some of the groundwork for strengthening possibilities for children to excersize social agency, especially when children's agency continues to be obstructed. As Qvortrup (1997) notes: "[i]f one were to capture the essence of the story told, one might suggest that childhood has become smaller, poorer, institutionalized, privatised" (p. 10). Children's political and economic vulnerability is compounded by the fact that they do not possess any legal rights or recourse in regards to distributive justice (Kitchen, 1995; Qvortrup, 1997).

A sense of social responsibility in the post-war years helped to establish the need for the welfare state; the work of T.H. Marshall (1992), writing in the 1950s and 1960s, elucidated the social aspect of citizenship in Western liberal democracies and a theorization of social entitlements/rights (Caragata, 1999, 2003; Evans & Wekerle, 1997; Ilcan & Basok, 2004; Little, 2001; Morrison, 1997; Sears, 2003; Thobani, 2000a). Marshall argued that the twentieth century was the third phase of citizenship rights (social rights), following civil rights (developed in the eighteenth century) and political rights (expanded in the nineteenth century).[1] Social rights were conceptualized as basic economic and social security through universal education, medical care, universal income transfers, and social insurance (Little, 2001; Morrison, 1997). The social and economic functions of the welfare state (including investments in housing, social insurance, education and health care) were intended to "create and maintain conditions conducive to

1Marshall's history of citizenship rights only applied to the legal status of men during this period (Morrison, 1997).

the profitable conduct of business (e.g. by investing in physical infrastructure) while, at the same time, [the state] needs to win the consent and loyalty of those who are exploited in the process" (Basok, 1996, p. 144). One of the criticisms levelled at the welfare state concerned its contradictory role in service provision, as Mynott (2002a) points out:

> On the one hand, it represented a beachhead for caring and co-operation against the cut-throat competition and rivalry which characterise capitalism. On the other, it could often exhibit a bureaucratic and sometimes moralistic approach to planning, in the style of the state-directed command economy, rather than a version of planning which grows out of genuine democratic discussion of popular needs and priorities. (p. 23)

Conceptions of social rights in the 1960s and 1970s opened up space in which women and women's movements could articulate claims to the translation of social rights into practice (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004). However, asymmetrical power relations within historical and contemporary Canadian women's movements should be recognized as contrary to principles of social equity; exclusionary practices have been long endured (and fought) by racialized and Indigenous women (Agnew, 1996; Bannerji, 2000, 2011; Bunjun, 2010, 2012; Razack, 1999a; Stasiulis & Jhappan, 1995; Strega & Esquao; Thobani, 2007a, 2007b). Additionally, within the Canadian context, conceptions of citizenship rights as an historical progression did not lead to greater equality for Indigenous Peoples (Thobani, 2000a). Untangling these tensions and placing anti-racism squarely on the agenda of feminist politics has positioned racialized academics and activists in the line of attack. One example occurred in 1993 when, prior to accepting the presidency of NAC, Dr. Sunera Thobani was vilified in media attacks and by politicians such as a federal Tory MP who described her as an 'illegal immigrant' (Nadeau, 2002)[2]. Conceptions of social rights/citizenship, therefore, need to be placed alongside critiques of the ways in which the welfare state has been differentially experienced in terms of uneven distribution of benefits/exclusion of social groups including Indigenous Peoples,

---

2 The notion of 'illegality' is critiqued in this thesis. In the incident described here, the ascription was employed by the politician in order to exclude and viciously attack the credibility of a strong intellectual who articulated injustices and contradictions within the Canadian nation-state (and on a global scale).

immigrants and racialized peoples (Thobani, 2000a, 2007a). As Thobani (2007a) notes:

> Strange encounters constituted excluded Others as individually unworthy of entitlements and their families as deficient. Moreover, social citizenship deepened the meaning of 'belonging' to the national community, strengthening the historically entrenched commitment of national subjects to protect it from the encroachments of undeserving Others. (p. 118)

In the 1970s and 1980s, the issue of publicly funded universal access to child care was better positioned on the political field with many strategies employed to support this objective (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004; Jenson, 2004; McKeen, 2004, 2006; Pulkingham & Ternowetsky, 1997). Of key concern was how inaccessible child care adversely impacted on the social, political, and economic status of women in Canada. Inadequate or absent child care provision created barriers to employment and severely constrained the economic autonomy of women (Caragata, 2003; Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004; Jenson, 2004; McKeen, 2004, 2006; Pulkingham & Ternowetsky, 1997). The campaign for universal child care was strengthened by its framing as a social citizenship right and through collaborative efforts of a coalition including members of the labour movement (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004; Jenson, 2004). Throughout the early and mid-1980s, there was widespread consensus in policy circles supporting the issue (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004; Jenson, 2004). Changing conditions in the Canadian (and global) political economy halted the public pressure that had been generated and, in the late 1980s, members of the Special Parliamentary Committee on Child Care reframed the debate with a stronger emphasis on private sector child care provision (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004; Jenson, 2004).

In the late 1980s, the Canadian nation-state was entangled in deeply divisive conflicts over constitutional reform, at the same time that it was negotiating a free trade agreement (FTA) with the U.S. (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004; Mackey, 1999). The FTA of 1988 was strongly critiqued at all stages of drafting and implementation by the National Action Committee on the Status of Women (NAC), along with other social justice-oriented groups concerned about the practices of many U.S. corporations and the deepening of market relations in Canada (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004; Evans &

Wekerle, 1997). The FTA was an intensification of previous economic relationships between the U.S. and Canada with the former dominating the continental economy during the rise of monopoly capital (1926-69) (Dickinson & Wotherspoon, 1992). The FTA's implementation coincided with the Canadian Multiculturalism Act. As Gilbert (2007) points out: "The idea of multiculturalism as a market incentive to attract global capital and investments and to strengthen trading links with other nation-states has become a dominant economic and political discourse" (p. 21). The political direction of late capitalism followed the map of a profit-driven social order. The economic and social imperatives of neoliberalism have been uncompromising, as MacGregor (1999) observes:

> Like a hurricane, neo-liberalism swept across the political landscape laying all before it waste. In its wake, it left demolished social infrastructure, polarisation, fragmentation, inequality, poverty, rising crime and disorder (personal and social), collapse of confidence of progressive forces, privatisation and individualisation. (p. 94)

The economic recession of 1990 and 1991 foreclosed opportunities for many social groups, including working-poor and middle-class families, and resources were felt to be increasingly scarce. Unemployment rates in Canada had not been as high since the Great Depression (Swift & Birmingham, 2000). This set the scene for intensified right-wing populism in Canada subsequent to the recession (Mackey, 1999). Different levels of government began to view, and reflect, social welfare through a neoconservative prism (Caragata, 2003). Canada ratified the 1989 United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in 1991, at the same time that deficit reduction became a political and ideological priority (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004; Stasiulis, 2002, 2004; Wiegers, 2002). Niewenhuys (1998) astutely asserts: "As market thinking reinforces rather than weakens the divide between the poor and the rich areas of the world, one cannot therefore but wonder at the deeper political consequences of states ratifying a convention they will never be able to implement" (p. 285).

Children and Migration

In order to understand the experiences of new immigrant and refugee children, it is

essential to examine the interplay of colonialism, capitalism, and displacement. The convergence of Sharon Stephens' (1995) analysis of childhood and the politics of culture, and David Harvey's (2000, 2003) analysis of the history of capitalist society, discussed in Stephens' work, provides important theoretical insights. Drawing from Harvey's concerns over an emerging global "regime of flexible accumulation" which has led to global inequalities, increasing conflicts and shifting national frameworks, Stephens (1995) argues that it is critical to theorize capitalist society in relation to children. Children's labour was essential in the expansion of capitalism, as Boyden (1997) has also argued, pointing to educational processes both past and present that have reproduced a "skilled and differentiated labour force". This historical snapshot introduces theorizing about the ways in which schooling reproduces social and economic patterns, discussed throughout the following chapters.

The historical and contemporary role of capitalism must be interrogated in any analysis of migratory processes. As Stafford (1992) writes: "The single major force dictating fluctuations in the migrations of significant numbers of people in the past three hundred years has been the changing structure of capitalism" (p. 70). Colonial histories, ideological manifestations of racism and inequalities endemic in capitalism (Fanon, 1989a, 1989b) are all significant factors implicated in forced migration (Arat-Koç, 1992, 1999a; Basok, 1996, 2002; Chimni, 1998, 2000; Choudry, Hanley, Jordan, Shragge & Stiegman, 2009; Cohen, 2002a, 2002b; Haytor, 2000; Kapur, 2003; Mynott, 2002a; Sassen, 1998, 1999a, 1999b, 2002; Thobani, 2000a, 2000b). As Kapur (2003) asserts: "Earlier colonial patterns also inform current migration patterns, captured in the slogan, "We are here, because you were there"" (p. 11).

Bretton Woods institutions (General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade-World Trade Organization, the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund) expanded neoliberal globalization in the global South (Brenner & Theodore, 2002; Chimni, 2000). The World Trade Organization (WTO) was established in 1993 and the number of trade agreements has grown sharply, from more than 70 regional agreements by the late 1990s to 150 by 2004 (Sassen, 2012). There are concerns pertaining to the organizational structure and decision-making processes of the WTO. As Rojecki (2002) argues: "The

organization's secret deliberations draw an ironic parallel to the formerly demonized command economic system…" (p. 156). A sharp growth in interest rates in the 1980s compounded the struggles of increasing numbers of debtor countries in the global South. The Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs) introduced by the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank have had devastating social impacts (Alldred, 2003; Chimni, 1998, 2000; Hyndman, 1996; Joshi, 2002; Konadu-Agyemang, 1998, 1999; Razack, 1999b). Economic disparities have been accentuated by SAPs due to inadequate food provision, and severe cuts to health care and education. The displacement of more and more people can be attributed to these economic and political relationships (Alldred, 2003; Chimni, 1998, 2000; Hyndman, 1996; Joshi, 2002; McNevin, 2009; Konadu-Agyemang, 1998, 1999; Razack, 1999b).

Precarious Legal Status

Precarious legal status refers to a number of situations including someone whose application for refugee status has been rejected, or who had an immigration sponsorship agreement which broke down, or who has overstayed a work or student visa (Goldring & Landolt, 2013). Non-status, irregular, and undocumented are terms that have also been used to describe situations in which people are living without citizenship status or papers. Precarious legal status has been defined as: "authorized and unauthorized forms of non-citizenship that are institutionally produced and share a precarity rooted in the conditionality of presence and access" (Goldring & Landolt, 2013, p. 3). Critical analysis of the concept of non-status/precarious legal status in the Canadian context has been expanding in recent years alongside immigration justice campaigns (Bauder, 2013; Bernhard, Goldring, Young, Berinstein & Wilson, 2007; Berinstein, McDonald, Nyers, Wright & Zarehi, 2008; Bhuyan, 2011; Bou-Zeid, 2005; Burns, 2010; Fortier, 2013; Goldring, Berinstein & Bernhard, 2009; Goldring & Landolt, 2013; Hobbs & Sauer, 2005; Khandor, McDonald, Nyers & Wright, 2004; Lippert, 2005; Lowry & Nyers, 2003; McDonald, 2009; Meloni, 2013; Meloni, Rousseau, Montgomery & Measham, 2013; Miklavcic, 2011; Nyers, 2006; Pashang, 2011; Saad, 2013; Shantz, 2004; Sharma, 2003; Shea, 2012; Simich, 2006; Simich, Wu & Nerad, 2007; Wright, 2003, 2006; Young,

2005, 2013). A central criticism articulated in these studies has revolved around the concept of illegality; this concept obstructs an understanding of socio-economic inequalities within and between nation-states. A pattern of disparities is brought sharply into focus by Gilbert (2009) who argues that: "'Illegal' in the sense of 'unauthorized' simply and quite conveniently obfuscates hegemonic domination, economic dependence and civil rights in immigration policy" (p. 39). Other facets of injustice are articulated by McDonald (2009) who explains that: "Illegalization works to both socially exclude, through such practices as detention, deportation, and the closing of legal avenues for entry, and socially include under imposed conditions of exploitability and disposability" (p. 68).

The number of undocumented migrants in Canada is estimated to be between 50,000 and 200,000 (Basok, 2008). In 2007, it was estimated that there were between 200,000 and 500,000 undocumented workers in Canada, according to a report by the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP, 2007). One current of debate in studies of migration has sharply condemned the fiction of legal transgressions by precarious status migrants. I contend that policies are hammered out by governments, transnational corporations, and international financial institutions which result in precarious livelihoods. Neoliberal values inform and harden institutionalized inequity. The political activism of refugees and the violence targeting particular social groups is often obscured through political discourse in countries of reception. This political discourse functions to narrow pathways to legal migration. Gilbert (2005) explains that the tension between authority and vulnerability is accentuated through the demand for paper documents by immigration and police officers. What is often ignored, as Khosravi (2007) observes, is the reality that many refugees would not have identity documents since it is their very identity that places their lives at risk.

Recent research studies have shown how social rights are stratified according to immigration status (Bejan & Sidhu, 2010; Berinstein, McDonald, Nyers, Wright & Zarehi, 2008; Bhuyan, 2011; Choudry et al, 2009; Miklavcic, 2011; Oxman-Martinez, Hanley, Lach, Khanlou, Weerasinghe & Agnew, 2005; Pashang, 2011; Smith-Carrier & Bhuyan, 2010; Sharma, 2006, 2011; Sidhu, 2008; Saad, 2013; Villegas, 2010b, 2013).

Discriminatory patterns in education, employment and migration have limited equitable access to economic security/livelihoods.

Media Discourse and Migration Policy

Several theorists have examined contesting interpretations of social policy that are expressed in print journalism. As Falk (1994) asks: “What are the mechanisms that contribute to differential readings of the social practices revealed in policy reports?” (p. 1). He defines policy as “the written and legally documented intent of government” (p. 1). This definition, as Falk notes, is often incongruous with the ideal view of democracy that he turns to Gramsci (1971) to provide as an anchoring point. Such a view of democracy articulates the necessity of every person’s ability to govern society (Falk, 1994). Conversely, ideologies are created and reproduced through media discourses in order to support a specific constellation of interests, and Falk (1994) provides illustrative examples of journalistic writing which obscure the social and material exclusion of particular social groups. Journalistic writing is able to cloud power asymmetries by creating discourses of ‘rationality’ and ‘confusion’, the latter being applied to the dissonant views of excluded social groups. These two media discourses are often juxtaposed in order to legitimize the perspectives of social and political elites (Falk, 1994).

Objectives and Key Research Questions

The objective of this study is to analyze the ways in which media discourse provides ideological legitimacy to exclusionary immigration and refugee policies and the denial of social rights and, at the same time, to identify media support for immigration justice campaigns. Discourse, as understood in this study, is defined as:

> a set of meanings, metaphors, representations, images, stories, statements and so on that in some way together produce a particular version of events…Surrounding any one object, event, person etc., there may be a variety of different discourses, each with a different story to tell about the world, a different way of representing it to the world.” (Burr, 1995, p. 48)

I follow van Dijk's (2001) questions about the interplay of power, discourse and social inequality: 'How do (more) powerful groups control public discourse?', 'How does such discourse control the mind and action of (less) powerful groups, and what are the social consequences of such control, such as social inequality?' (p. 355). This study addresses the following questions:

Question 1: How are exclusionary immigration and refugee policies assigned legitimacy by dominant social groups through Canadian media discourses?

Question 2: How do conceptions of childhood influence perceptions of policy exclusions?

Question 3: What do Canadian media discourses reveal about children's experiences of educational inequality?

Overview of the Study

This study draws on sociological theories of education and the methodological frameworks of Critical Discourse Analysis and Frames Theory and Analysis in order to examine print media representations of new immigrant, refugee, and precarious status children in the three Canadian newspapers, the *Globe & Mail*, *National Post*, and *Toronto Star* in the historical period of 1989-2009. This historical period was chosen because it begins with the implementation of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in 1989, to which Canada became a signatory in 1991, and ends just before the recent changes to immigration and refugee law in 2012. During this period there have been significant political and economic changes that have shaped migration policy. These include: the collapse of the Soviet Union and the end of the Cold War, the signing of the North American Free Trade Agreement and proliferation of trade agreements, and 9/11 and its aftermath. These events have shifted geopolitical relationships and resulted in a sharp reduction in the number of people able to migrate and permanently settle in Canada (and other Western liberal democracies) through legal channels (Arat-Koç, 1998a; Basok, 1996; Bauder, 2013; Crépeau & Nakache, 2006; Dauvergne, 2008; Hyndman, 1996; Mountz, 2010; Wright, 2000, 2013).

This historical period also provides a context for the case study of the Toronto District School Board adopting a Don't Ask Don't Tell Policy in 2007 so that children without immigration status would be able to access schooling without the fear of being reported to immigration authorities (Bejan & Sidhu, 2010; Sidhu, 2008; Villegas, 2010b, 2013). This right to an education is consistent with rights articulated in the Education Act of Ontario as well as in international law (UN Convention on the Rights of the Child).

In my analysis, I have focused on reporting specifically in Toronto because it is the largest city in Canada and the one in which the majority of new immigrants and refugees will live. It is also the first Canadian city in which a school board adopted a policy in support of the rights of children with precarious legal status. Toronto is considered to be a significant world city (Sassen, 2012) with a constellation of global economic and political relationships. Social activists (including people with precarious legal status) in Toronto have also been active in campaigning for the social rights of migrants. Following the important work of Sanctuary City campaigns in the U.S. which have secured municipal ordinances (in over 30 cities including New York City, Washington D.C., Detroit, Chicago, Los Angeles, San Francisco, Seattle, Baltimore, and Miami) to prohibit denying services on the basis of immigration status, social activists in Toronto have advanced claims to municipal services, education and, health care for precarious status migrants. In 2013, city council officially declared Toronto as a Sanctuary City to people living with precarious legal status. Toronto is also located within Canada's most populated province and the trajectory of the Ontario provincial government has been shaped by neoliberal ascendancy during the historical period discussed in this study. Education falls under provincial jurisdiction while laws and policies related to immigration status are regulated at the federal level of government. The municipal government has been implicated in disclosing precarious legal status through police officers' and other city services employees' communication with immigration authorities signalling the importance of Sanctuary City status and the city as a site of struggle against policy exclusions (Bhuyan, 2011; Goldring & Landolt, 2013; Pashang, 2011; Nyers, 2010).

Situating myself as a researcher

> To set aside the sympathy we extend to others beset by war and murderous politics for a consideration of how our privileges are located on the same map as their suffering, and may - in ways that we prefer not to imagine - be linked to their suffering, as the wealth of some may imply the destitution of others, is a task for which the painful, stirring images supply only the initial spark. (Sontag, 2003, p. 76)

It is, as Sontag (2003) has written, painful to confront the implications of where we fall on a map. Historical relationships with place are complex and often associated with violence. My Belarussian grandfather and Polish grandmother moved to Canada as refugees following the Second World War, and were resettled in an area short of labour in Northern Ontario. In a different historical and political context, the border would have been closed to them. I was five the year they both died, and never had an opportunity to talk with them about historical parallels. They did not know the pain of racism and racialization as it is experienced in contemporary Canadian society. In trying to understand the connection between political violence and health, I am certain that my grandmother's struggles with a mood disorder once in Canada were a response to the calculus of cruelty she had known during the war and as a refugee. When my grandmother's struggles with psychosis became so severe that she was hospitalized for long periods of time, my grandfather raised my mother and her brothers by himself, supporting them as a blacksmith and millworker. The stigma of mental illness (Goffman, 1963; Hawke, Parikh & Michalak, 2013; Kleinman, & Hall-Clifford, 2009; Stuart, 2003; Stuart, Arboleda-Flórez & Sartorius, 2012; Link & Phelan, 1995, 2014; Phelan, Lucas, Ridgeway & Taylor, 2014) in conjunction with the debased status as refugees compounded everyone's suffering.

My grandparents never had the opportunity to study at university but spent their lives engaged with social theory. They built relationships with other immigrants and refugees and, when they were not busy working or struggling with illness, exchanged ideas about how Canadian society could be socially equitable and caring. Many universities lose the perspectives of people who are excluded from a formal education.

Returning to Susan Sontag's quotation, this thesis is written with the hope that it can be meaningful and connect with real life struggles alongside the painful confrontation of being implicated in someone else's suffering. It is essential to confront what can be done collectively to work towards concrete changes that can incrementally lead to social equity. What is sometimes neglected in pockets of political action is the importance of a person's character. In thinking through theoretical puzzles, it has helped to revisit encounters with children who are, among many things, honest. Honesty involves different degrees of risk from social rejection and derision to persecution and violence. Educators can be honest with themselves and with others in order to establish trust and authentic empathy. I feel strongly that authentic kindness cannot be peripheral to social justice education. This is a lesson often taught by children.

The importance of critical engagement with autobiography has been emphasized by many social justice researchers (Church, 1995; Fine, 2006; Stanley, 1990). Stanley's (1990) concept of 'intellectual autobiography' as "an analytic (not just descriptive) concern with the specifics of how we come to understand what we do, by locating acts of understanding in an explication of the grounded contexts these are located in and arise from" (p. 62) has resonance with critical questions that Fine (2006) asks in relation to what motivates researchers: "*what* in their own biography, curiosity or sense of responsibility spurs the questions asked; whose perspectives will be privileged, negotiated, and/or silenced in their work…" (p. 90). Moreover, Fine (2006) encourages graduate students "to explore their fears, anxiety, who-am-I-to-do-this-work, guilt, responsibility, privilege, terror and projections as they develop their theoretical frameworks and empirical designs" (p. 90). The questions in this study are informed by ten years of work with children and what I have learned from their social critiques and hope for a better world. This study also draws on elements of autobiography. I explore these different aspects of experience in the following vignettes.

1

It is winter and in an elementary school in Montreal, eleven-year-old Ruby[3] and I sit at a faded wooden table drawing with magenta and violet pencil crayons.

"I like the heart you've drawn", she says smiling.

She's already finished her grade six math homework that's due tomorrow, and now we are making Valentines.

"Can I go get a drink of water?" she asks me. The question seems absurd. But it has been many years since I was eleven and, having worked in caring early childhood education settings, I have already forgotten the power structure with children in schools.

"Absolutely, Ruby. I know you need your teachers' permission but when we're hanging out, please just feel comfortable to do whatever you need to do."

I feel awkward. She nods with a raised eyebrow and then walks down the hall which is decorated with children's paintings of winter landscapes, and hand-written essays on Martin Luther King Jr. She walks back and says flatly:

"I forgot that one's broken".

"Oh…do you want to go to another floor?"

"Um, that one's broken too. You mean my classroom floor, right? That one's broken too."

We set out to audit every floor until Ruby and I find a water fountain that works. Returning to the table where we were sitting, Ruby finishes her Valentines. She has made a card for everyone in her family and all of her friends.

"Can I make Valentines for your friends?" she asks smiling.

"That would be amazing, Ruby! Thanks; they're going to love that!"

She lines up the pencil crayons and begins to draw a huge, strong heart in patches of pink and red.

"Are you going to be here next week", Ruby asks.

"Definitely"

"You missed some weeks…." she says her eyes fixed on her drawing.

When I called the program coordinator three weeks ago, fighting back tears, I apologetically explained that my Mom was in the hospital and I needed to be in Ottawa.

"I'm so sorry, I'm really sorry. Please tell Ruby how sorry I am and how much

---

3 Name has been changed for anonymity

she will be missed”.

In the training workshops, what had reassured me about the coordinators was their sincere commitment and respect for the children who were involved in the program.

“If you miss two consecutive weeks, we will find someone else to be paired with that child. It isn’t fair or respectful if you are not reliable,” the coordinator told the room with a kind but firm tone of voice.

Trust is often precarious. It was reassuring to see that the coordinators knew this and understood the implications of careless actions. The coordinator replied to my phone call with kind words I had rarely heard:

“Lara, this is not your fault. Please don’t apologize for something that you have no control over”.

But that is just the thing: as the child of someone who lives with a mood disorder, the inference has often been quite the opposite. In both subtle and direct ways, children are assigned blame for their parent’s condition. This sense of responsibility and sharp sadness is something pinned to me and I had to ask myself if I had done something wrong in beginning a friendship with a child who had, in her eleven years, already experienced acute loss.

“I missed you a lot Ruby.”

“I heard your mom was in the hospital…” Ruby says quietly, glancing up, “I was sorry to hear that”.

“Ruby, thanks for saying that.” I feel strange and worried that I have, in some way, intruded into Ruby’s life with my own struggles. It doesn’t seem fair and I feel like I’ve made a mistake.

“Is she going to die”, Ruby asks, her voice steady and kind.

I reassure her and change the subject back to Ruby. She is quiet as she continues filling blank papers with patchwork hearts.

“I’m a bit hungry”, Ruby says.

I fumble around in my purse and find an orange and two granola bars. “Do you like oranges and granola bars?” I ask.

Ruby nods but looks worried: “Are you hungry?” she asks, “There are two…”

After insisting she take the small amount of food I could find, I am conscious of how hungry Ruby had been. She eats both granola bars and the orange and then says quietly,

"I'm still hungry." She searches through her backpack and pulls out a cheese sandwich.

"Oh, I forgot I had this!" she says and un-wraps the bread. She stops for a second and looks down, frowning at a large furry spot of mould. Then she carefully trims the mould from the bread and begins to eat.

There's a feeling like an implosion or a sharp piece of glass in my heart. Ruby looks at the sandwich, at me, back down at the sandwich and her glance rests there. Emotion is obscured on her intelligent face and her shoulders are stiff. She keeps eating, dignified, looking straight ahead.

2

In the mid-1990s, when I was in grade eleven, I couldn't tell my Mom that there was not enough money for groceries once the utilities were paid for by the third week of the month. I had watched her work hard my entire childhood as a professional, as a graduate student and, from my vantage point, as a superhero who took care of me on her own. When I was in elementary school and teachers had professional development days, I tagged along at her NGO office where I orbited my Mom and her colleagues feeling quite pleased when there were requests for my photocopying services. I admired her poise and confidence, but most of all I admired how she talked to people. If someone was going through a difficult period, she could think of some comment that would leave that person feeling respected and affirmed, rather than diminished. In the early 1990s, she lost her job in Montreal following a first experience of acute depression and we moved back to Ottawa.

For six consecutive months in 1995 (June-November), my Mom was hospitalized for clinical depression and the SSRIs prescribed compounded her condition. Despite her efforts, intellect, work experience and skills, she had been unable to find full-time employment for two years after we returned to Ottawa, and relied on part-time and short-

term contracts to support us. By the time I finished secondary school she would be hospitalized a dozen times for periods of several weeks and finally diagnosed with bipolar disorder. In the subsequent years, we would learn that mania can be triggered from the medication treating unipolar depression with the consequent life-long diagnosis of bipolar disorder leaving many lives in disarray with the cycles of mania and depression. Every day, sitting in classrooms, travelling to the hospital, part-time jobs, and returning home alone, I felt like I was the source of her suffering while we navigated the mental health system without information or resources. At the same time, my Mom lived with the fear of losing me to the child welfare system. We would sit drinking paper cups of orange juice when dinner was brought to all the patients. Sometimes we could hear the radio from the nursing station. The cacophony of the PA system and itinerant, shuffling footsteps were the usual soundscape, punctuated by the CBC jingle prefacing the six o'clock news. Most mornings I blinked away headlines, wishing I could shake words from newsprint. I used to wish they would turn the radio off on the ward. My Mom's hands would drop and pick up the paper cup from the folding tray by her bed, and drop again. I would try to contain my fear as I watched my Mom's hands fold and unfold into anxious shapes. The effects of the medication were uneven and uncertain. As she struggled to eclipse her sadness, she would gently push her dinner tray towards me. My Mom who, in those periods of anguish, could not shower, or change from her pajamas, was still thinking of me.

"You know, honey, I'm not very hungry. Please eat it or it will go to waste."

I had failed to suppress the thunderstorms of hunger in my stomach.

"Oh no, Mom, I'm ok, but thanks anyway. Please go ahead and eat your dinner. I can grab something later."

"Honestly, honey, I'm not very hungry", she would point to her half-eaten lunch tray. "Look at my lunch. Look, here's my muffin from breakfast and later we will have another snack."

On the bike rides home from the hospital, I fought back tears of shame for having sometimes accepted my Mom's hospital dinners.

3

Education professor Rochelle Skogen (2012) observes: “Putting ourselves and our work out there to be heard and judged by others can make even the most stoic and hardened academic feel vulnerable” (p.492). As an academic living with the diagnosis of bipolar disorder, Dr. Skogen decided to conceal her condition, worrying about inaccurate perceptions and negative judgements that would discount her knowledge. She recently published a journal article about stigma and social discrimination in the context of academia and wider society and, at the same time, disclosed her diagnosis to colleagues. Skogen’s (2012) article was a conceptual map for thinking through my own fears around judgement and indifference, and it contributes to a growing body of Canadian and international literature on initiatives to diminish the stigmatization of mental illness[4] and emotional distress within academia (Aubrecht, 2012; Baker, Brown & Fazey, 2006; Hanlon, 2012; Kearns, Joseph & Moon, 2010; Kiuhara & Huefner, 2008; Lewis, 2004; Martin, 2010; McKean, 2011).

Disclosure of painful experiences is always difficult but made much more difficult in a context of public scepticism. When I began my doctoral program 6 years ago, I had hoped to collaborate with children and together expand spaces for critique and political imagination. I hoped that we could conceptualize immigration and social justice and connect social theory with practice. I entered the program with hope. By the time I was working on the comprehensive examinations, the days were monochromatic and hegemony seemed like a permanent fixture of social architecture. Between 2007 and 2013, my mother was hospitalized 14 times in the psychiatric ward of the general hospital and at the Heart Institute. Disclosure of these painful experiences sharpened vulnerability because of the stigma and negative judgement of my role as a caregiver. I became peripheral to social activism, and violence on many geographic scales seemed

4 Terminology pertaining to mental health status is also sensitive and contested. I respectfully acknowledge that mental illness is not a term that resonates with everyone, particularly within the Psychiatric Survivor Movement due to painful historical and contemporary injustices that have derived from diagnoses. My mother identifies as living with a mood disorder (a diagnosed mental illness) and is open about her experiences and choice of medical intervention with the hope that she can help to advance the ethical conviction that the equitable treatment of people living with mental illness/psychiatric disability is also social justice issue. We have also been fortunate to meet social justice-oriented mental health social workers, psychiatrists and other practitioners (albeit small in number).

incomprehensible. “Who am I to do this work?” is a question Michelle Fine (2006) attributes to many graduate students. The social theorists who have taught me the most have typically been in elementary school. I cannot make sense of a world that is complacent when children spend summer months without breakfast programs or when they are pulled into the orbit of political violence. I cannot make sense of this world. But I can look for hope that informs political projects and learn from kids who regardless of how many times adults have let them down, still believe that we can do better.

Overview of the thesis

The thesis is divided into eight chapters. Chapter One is the Introduction and it sets the groundwork for key concepts and themes. In this chapter, I briefly introduce literature about children and migration, precarious legal status, media discourse and migration policy. I explain the objectives and key research questions and provide an overview of the study. This chapter includes a section on situating myself as a researcher, followed by an overview of the thesis. Chapter Two addresses the ways in which sociological theories of education relate to children’s experiences of migration in Canada. How do these theories address children’s varied and multifaceted experiences of migration (which have been shaped by historical processes and profound structural inequalities)? What are some of the ideological perspectives associated with new immigrant and refugee children, including children with precarious immigration status, and how do they inform schools’ official policies and teaching practices?

Chapter Three considers some of the ways in which previous studies have attempted to facilitate more equitable relations in research processes with new immigrants and refugees. What are some of the ethical concerns in research processes with children (particularly children who have experienced violence, displacement and discrimination) and how have they been addressed in other studies? How do children challenge and disrupt exclusionary practices in order to contribute to more equitable opportunities and outcomes of schooling (given the very serious risks facing children with precarious immigration status, how do community-based researchers, service providers, and activists collaborate in this work)?

Chapter Four explicates the methodological approach and research methods of the study used to analyze Canadian media discourses (especially newspapers) representing new immigrant and refugee children in Ontario in the historical period of 1989-2009. In doing so, I have drawn on van Dijk's (1988, 1991, 1992, 1993, 1996, 1997, 2006) approach to Critical Discourse Analysis in conjunction with Frames Theory and Analysis (Entman, 1993, 2003, 2004; Entman, & Rojecki, 1993; Goffman, 1974; Smolash, 2011). The chapter is divided into two sections: the first section addresses social policy, media and political discourse, and human rights reporting, followed by a review of methodological approaches to media discourse and migration. The second section describes the research methods, study design, as well as the strengths and limitations of this methodology.

In Chapter Five, "The end of the Cold War: The collision of children's rights discourses and neoliberal agendas (1989-1995)", I draw on the conceptual and methodological contributions of van Dijk's discourse analysis (1988, 1991, 1993), and Entman's frames theory (1993, 2003, 2004) in order to analyse representations of new immigrant and refugee children in the *Toronto Star* and *Globe and Mail* between 1989-1995. I begin the chapter with an historical overview of child policy frameworks in Canada during the first period discussed (1989-1995). Next, I discuss the ways in which immigration and refugee policy frameworks have been shaped by a climate of social austerity resulting from neoliberalism. In section two, I critique the three narratives identified in representations of new immigrant and refugee children:

1) Children and neoliberalism
2) Children and nationalism
3) New immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable' or 'threatening'

Chapter Six, "Children displaced and economically vulnerable: Conceptual tensions and political praxis (1996-2001)", follows the same structure as Chapter Five. I draw on the conceptual and methodological contributions of van Dijk's discourse analysis (1988, 1991, 1993), and Entman's frames theory (1993, 2003, 2004) in order to analyse representations of new immigrant and refugee children in the *Toronto Star,*

National Post and *Globe and Mail* between 1996-2001. I begin the chapter with an historical overview of child policy frameworks in Canada during the second period discussed (1996-2001). Next, I discuss the ways in which immigration and refugee policy frameworks have been shaped by a climate of social austerity resulting from neoliberalism. In section two, I critique the three narratives identified in representations of new immigrant and refugee children, drawing on sociological theories of education.

Chapter Seven, "Contesting illegality: Educational spaces, racialized exclusion and the struggle for im/migration justice (2002-2009)" begins with an overview of child policy frameworks followed by a discussion of struggles for social equity within Ontario schools, drawing on qualitative research and sociological theories of education. Changes to immigration and refugee policies and the narrowing of legal options for migrants are also discussed. The concept of precarious legal status is analysed alongside campaigns for social rights at the level of municipal governance. This chapter focuses on the right to education for children with precarious legal status and how this has been framed against the backdrop of neoliberal politics. The final media analysis section pays close attention to depictions of the events leading up to the Toronto District School Board's decision to adopt a policy protecting the social rights of children with precarious legal status.

Chapter Eight revisits the objectives of the study in the discussion, recommendations and conclusions sections. First, I connect the analysis of the three media narratives to exclusionary immigration policies and the denial of social rights in order to demonstrate the ways in which media discourse that is aligned with social and economic elites reproduces hegemony and political agendas. I summarize the analysis of media support for immigration justice campaigns such as Don't Ask Don't Tell in Toronto. I recommend further research that draws on participatory methodologies in order to engage with new immigrant and refugee children about their views on media and political discourse. I also point to the importance of empirical research that explores how public opinion is directly impacted by media and political discourse. In the final section of the conclusions chapter, I explore possibilities for collaboration between immigration justice and children's rights campaigns to engage print media in supporting social rights for all people with precarious legal status, not only children, in other contexts.

Chapter 2:
Theoretical framework: Migration and displacement through the prisms of sociological theories of education

Introduction

Sociological theories of education have posed critically important questions around the outcomes of schooling, why education has come to be associated with formal schooling, and theorizes ways in which schooling can provide equitable opportunities and outcomes to all social groups (Wotherspoon, 2009). Educational progressivism, Marxist educational theory/political economy, anti-racism education, feminist and anti-colonial theories all provide critical perspectives in the sociology of education allowing for a critique of social practices and structures, examining structural inequalities in order to contribute to social change. Many critical theorists have questioned how education, associated with formal schooling, facilitates or constrains socioeconomic opportunities and the life trajectories of students (Addams, 1961, 2009; Apple, 1990, 1996, 2005, 2009; Bernstein, 1975, 2006; Bourdieu, 1977, 2006; Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977; Bowles & Gintis, 1976; Curtis, Livingstone & Smaller, 1992; Dei, 1996, 2006; Dei & Calliste, 2000; Dei & Kempf, 2006; Dewey, 1916; hooks, 2003; McCarthy, Crichlow, Dimitriadis & Dolby, 2005; Ng, Staton & Scane, 1995; Sears, 2003; Simpson, James & Mack, 2011; Razack, 1999; Sleeter, 1996; Wotherspoon, 2009). Theorists such as Bourdieu and Passeron (1977) have argued that educational institutions maintain conditions and social relations that lead to the reproduction of structural inequalities that exist in wider society. The contribution of these various theories to how we look at new immigrant and refugee children's experiences of schooling in Canada and the ways in which official policy regulates the lives of children is a key concern of this chapter.

The chapter is divided into two main sections. In section one, I identify and expand on educational progressivism, Marxist educational theory/political economy, anti-racism education, feminist and anti-colonial theories, and in section two, I map out some

of the key literature on refugee and immigrant children's experiences in a Canadian context. In a final Conclusions section I summarize some of the key findings from this work and point to new directions.

Section One

Educational Progressivism

In the early twentieth century, sociologists and philosophers such as Jane Addams and John Dewey contributed to the architecture of educational thought and practice in North America, as well as in international contexts. Addams (1961) sought to integrate formal education with community-based practice, and her work with new immigrant children and adults in Chicago between 1889 and 1909 is well documented in her book *Twenty years at Hull-House*. The curriculum that Addams and her colleague, Helen Gates Starr, developed in collaboration with new immigrant and working-class families built on communication across generations and cultures, community organizing and education. "The ignorant teacher," Addams (2009) wrote, "cuts [immigrant children] off from their parents and their parents' traditions, while the cultivated teacher fastens them" (p. 26). That there was, and still is a disconnect between the lived experiences of many teachers and the children with whom they work runs the risk of patronizing implications in educational encounters, compounded by the chauvinism still manifest in curriculum reflecting the interests of dominant social groups.[5] Addams emphasized everyday knowledge in curriculum planning and developed more equitable relationships in her teaching practices. Hull-House was influential in the development of the field of social work and today the school of social work at the University of Illinois at Chicago is named

[5]Wotherspoon (2009) raises similar concerns regarding contemporary educational institutions: "How representative is the teaching workforce in relation to the social composition of Canada's population? What is the significance of this relationship to the education of diverse groups of learners?" (p. 178)

the Jane Addams College of Social Work; Hull-House is part of the university campus. Of critical importance to Addams was for social analysis to be grounded in community-based practice and not attributed to professional expertise.

Jane Addams was a friend and collaborator of John Dewey, both having associations with the University of Chicago. Dewey is probably the most well-known proponent of Educational Progressivism. That schooling could be a process for social change was a consistent theme in much of Dewey's work. Inherent in this theory was the belief that education could contribute to dispositions that would strengthen democracy, such as rationality, empathy, and solidarity. The experiences and interests of children would inform their learning and teachers would play an active role as facilitators and guides. The child-centred orientation of Dewey, emphasizing intellectual, physical and emotional growth, has had resonance with many successive educational reforms and practices. Dewey was also influenced by Marx (as well as by liberal theory) and argued that public education must attend to pervasive social and economic inequalities brought forth by a stratified society. As Dewey (1916) writes:

> It is not enough to see to it that education is not actively used as an instrument to make easier the exploitation of one class by another. School facilities must be secured of such amplitude and efficiency as will in fact and not simply in name discount the effects of economic inequalities, and secure to all the wards of the nation equality of equipment for their future careers. (p. 97)

In similar fashion, Marxist educational theory considers the wider political implications of schooling by focusing on the ways in which class and economic production lead to social inequalities.

Marxist Educational Theory

The political economy prism of educational theory takes the position that schooling contributes to social, ideological and labour-force reproduction. Of particular concern to educational theorists of Canadian political economy, many of whom published

seminal work in the 1970s, are the corporate control over post-secondary education and the subjugation of Indigenous peoples (Martell, 1974; Nelson & Nock, 1978; Wotherspoon, 2009). Much of this analysis has focused on the Canadian class structure, the development of Canada's resource-based economy, Canada's dependence on European and American capital, and the social and economic impact of these relationships (Wotherspoon, 2009).

In addition to contesting the ways in which social groups are ranked and classified on the basis of wealth and economic status, Bourdieu (2006) argued that it was also of paramount importance to consider what he referred to as *cultural capital*: knowledge of social expectations and the values of dominant groups; acquiring this knowledge is seen as a social relation within a system of exchange in a capitalist society - and necessary to navigate through educational and other institutions. Bourdieu also introduced the concept of *cultural reproduction,* explaining that cultural and social practices of dominant groups are transferred from one generation to the next through schooling resulting in particular social groups maintaining power and status. Through this process, as Bourdieu explains, schooling reproduces the existing social structure; education mirrors capitalism in a process of *social reproduction*.

Political discourses and ideologies must be properly contextualized. As Bourdieu (1991) states: we need "to take into account the social-historical conditions within which the object of analysis is produced, constructed and received" (p. 29). Bourdieu's work was strongly influenced by Marx in the connections drawn between the political economy (base) of individuals/groups and their language ideologies (superstructure) (Donkor, 2004). Social structures both distribute material resources as well as function as a system of classification.

The political economy approach to educational theory is useful in analysing the ascendancy of neo-liberal politics in the 1980s and 1990s. Wotherspoon (2009) identifies several significant trends resulting from neoliberal ideologies in the governance and financing of Canadian education: the downsizing and reorganization of institutions; the

amalgamation and centralization of educational administration and program delivery; the transfer of funding for education from the public to the private sector; a shift in focus on 'basic' or 'core' curriculum areas; specified learning standards to define and measure achievement (and which shape the placement of students in schools as well as their educational outcomes); and intensified measures to scrutinize and control the activities of educators and learners (p. 93-94). There are a number of key studies (Curtis, Livingstone & Smaller, 1992; Sears, 2003; Willis, 1977, 2006; Schugurensky, 2007) which have looked at differences in learning among the social classes and how this relates to the family, school and community context as well as the social division of labour. Willis' (1977) study with working-class boys in the context of schools is especially interesting to revisit when we consider that the expansion of neoliberal ideologies has arguably led to widening educational inequalities.

Michael Apple's (2005; 2009) work offers important analysis of the political economy of textbook production and the de-skilling/proletarianization of teachers. Speaking of Apple's work, Ball (2007) writes:

> Embedded in all of this is something of the scope and complexity of Apple's analysis: this is neither a simple-minded economic reductionism nor a narrow ideological analysis of the curriculum; it is joined-up sociology. It links education reform to the requirements of the state, to commercial interests, to global flows of information and capital, and to the sensibilities and insights of the fundamentalist Right and their ability to mobilize influence within the state. (p. 156)

Neoliberal policies have, of course, not only impacted on educational institutions and processes but also on the daily lives of children and families. The neoliberal emphasis on the individual can be seen in the interaction between social structures and educational processes. As Pulkingham and Ternowetsky (1997) point out, significant trends impacting on children and families include widening income inequality, and underemployment/unemployment regarded as unavoidable and acceptable. As Galabuzi (2014) has poignantly stated, in 2011 over 400,000 Ontario children and youth were

living below the poverty line as measured by Statistics Canada. In other words, one in six children live in poverty with the highest rates amongst people with disabilities, Aboriginal populations, single parents, racialized people and immigrants (Campaign 2000, 2013, cited in Galabuzi, 2014, p. 209). Pervasive economic and social inequalities are manifest in the egregious situation of children who struggle to pay attention in school because they have not had enough to eat. In Canada, policy debates around the eradication of poverty have shifted the focus from the redistributive policies of the welfare state to a specific concern with child poverty, thus reducing the state's responsibility in reproducing or alleviating social inequalities (Pulkingham & Ternowetsky, 1997; Wiegers, 2002; Stasiulis, 2004). In her critique of conceptions of children's rights within a neoliberal paradigm in North America, Ruddick (2007b) argues that the rights framework focuses on protections from harm, rather than access to resources and that, consistent with this thinking, parents are thought to be responsible for their circumstances and their decision to become parents, rather than supported when employment options with a living wage are elusive.

Dominant representations of child poverty are problematic on two counts: such representations obfuscate the structural barriers that reproduce precarious financial circumstances while simultaneously evoking images of passive child victims who must 'deserve' outside intervention from the state (Wiegers, 2002; Stasiulis, 2002, 2004). In this sense, children from low-income families are further marginalized and denied agency. The relationship between structure and agency is often taken up in educational theories and is a tension to be grappled with in studies of children and migration.

Conceptions of childhood are influenced by global processes, which determine differential access to power and resources. Historical conceptions of childhood are important to revisit in order to understand the social relations that led to modern capitalism and the nation-state. Political and economic systems have depended on constructed dichotomies of child/adult, female/male, consumption/production in order to maintain hierarchical relations (Boyden, 1990; Qvortrup 1985; Stephens, 1995). With the ascendency of neoliberal globalization, we continue to see hierarchical relations in labour market practices such as the deskilling and devaluation of new immigrants from the

‘Third World’ through the non-recognition of their skills and professional credentials (Thobani, 2000a; Choudry, Hanley, Jordan, Shragge & Stiegman, 2009; Galabuzi, 2006; Hanley & Shragge, 2009). Similarly, as Gilbert (2004) states: “Many immigrants not only face discrimination in the labour market but are also often denied the legitimacy of the very professional skills and education that gained them admittance in Canada in the first place” (p.254). Policy exclusions are similar in the UK context and Humphries (2004) denounces the term ‘economic migrant’ as unjust:

> Indeed this has become a term of abuse. The same justification is given, as expedient, to legitimate the recruitment of foreign workers. Moreover, many asylum seekers already in the UK have the skills and the qualifications needed to fill the jobs where there is a shortage of labour, yet they are excluded from work. Even when they are granted refugee status and entitled to work, somewhere between 75 per cent and 90 per cent are unemployed or underemployed. (p. 99)

These same contradictions exist in the Canadian context. Bias-free employment practices, credential assessment and training for new immigrants need to be supported by state intervention (Galabuzi, 2006). Economic exclusion is manifest in labour-market segregation, unequal access to employment, employment discrimination, disproportionate vulnerability to unemployment, and underemployment; all of these factors characterize and cause social exclusion (Galabuzi, 2006). The lack of recognition of the skills and credentials of many new immigrants and refugees not only affects the socioeconomic status of children and their families but can also impact on family dynamics (Adams & Kirova, 2006).

Additionally, there is a greater demand for formal learning as a result of a complex division of labour and highly specialized workplace skills and knowledge. As Mojab & McDonald (2008) observe:

> Understanding this relationship between learning and social and economic imperatives allows us to understand the policy implications of learning. This raises the issue of the role of the state and the market in the provision of training, the creation of skills, and the structuring of the job market, and the place of “informal” learning in this complex set of relations. (p. 51)

While Mojab and McDonald's analysis refers to adult education and informal learning, their insight has relevance for children's experiences of schooling, both in terms of the opportunities or barriers resulting from schooling as well the employment prospects for new immigrant and refugee parents. With the expansion and entrenchment of neoliberal policies and increasing social and income polarization, educators must be particularly attentive to the precarious financial circumstances in which many children and families live. In doing so, they can counter state rhetoric which deflects attention from structural causes of poverty.

Bannerji (2005) raises concerns about scientific or positive Marxism and the earlier compartmentalized way of thinking, separating spheres of "economic", "the political", and "the cultural", which can constrain social theory and action. As Bannerji (2005) notes: "Broadly speaking, "class" thus becomes an overarching economic category, gender/patriarchy a social one, while "race", "caste", or "ethnicity" are categories of the cultural" (p. 148). Dei and Asgharzadeh (2001) caution against prioritizing class struggle over other forms of inequality: "Any attempt to subordinate a social fact as significant and as pervasive as race to class struggle can be an intellectually limiting act with no concrete tactical or strategic aim for mobilization, solidarity, and collective action" (p. 310).

A significant contribution of Marxist educational theory is the attention to the reproduction of social-class inequalities through schooling (Bernstein, 1973, 1977, 1990; Bowles & Gintis 1976; Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977). Considering that schools are ideologically committed to increasing opportunities (Wotherspoon, 2009), discrepancies in the life trajectories of students are quite worrisome in terms of social exclusion, and can be revisited from the lens of Marxist political economy in conjunction with other sociological theories of education. The convergence of these theories is useful in order to grapple with the varied and multifaceted experiences of new immigrant and refugee children in Canadian schools.

From Multicultural to Anti-racism Education/Feminist Anti-racism education

> Tuyen had been drawn to her since the first day of high school. They were both intense bright girls who kept quiet in class but always had a quirky yet correct answer when asked a question. As when Carla blurted out in class that *To Kill a Mockingbird* was maudlin and embarrassing and why did people need to feel pity in order to act right. Or when Tuyen in a small voice from the back of history class during what she thought was a tedious intonement by the teacher about Normandy, said that she was sick of the Second World War and it wasn't the world anyway, it was Europe, and asked what had happened in the rest of the world, did anybody else die? Was anybody else heroic? (*What we all long for: A novel*, Brand, 2005, p. 18)

It is imperative to understand the ways in which 'Canadianness' is socially constructed in order to challenge school and social hierarchies. As Mackey (1999) argues, nationalism is built around narratives moving through a linear sequence that construct the past, present and future of a nation. These are "mythical stories", as Mackey explains (p. 23), and historical events are carefully selected in order to present the nation as 'fair' and 'just'.

A more rigorous tracing of socio-political processes/socio-historical conditions in Canada, not often seen in state-mandated curriculum, would need to consider the ongoing colonization of First Nations lands, the Indian Act, the legacies of transatlantic slavery and the underground railroad, Komagata Maru, the 1923 Chinese Exclusion Act, the internment of racialized Canadians during the First and Second World Wars as well as the selection and enlistment of racialized men to fight in the wars among many other events (Kazimi, 2012; Nelson & Nelson, 2004; Razack, 2002; Thobani, 2007). The cumulative effects of historical injustices continue to have resonance. In providing an historical context for the social construction of race in Canada, educators can afford children opportunities to interrogate and denounce contemporary manifestations of individualized, institutional and systemic racism, and specific processes of racialization. From this perspective, multiculturalism and multicultural education can be seen as

inextricably linked to the social and political narratives of Canadian nation-building (Bannerji, 2000; Dion, 2005; James & Wood, 2005; Macklin, 2011). As Henry, Tator, Mattis and Rees (1995) observe:

> Multiculturalism has different meanings. It is a description of the composition of Canada both historically and currently, referring to the cultural and racial diversity of Canadian society. It is an ideology that holds the racial, cultural, religious and linguistic diversity as an integral, beneficial, and necessary part of Canadian society and identity. It is a policy operating in various social institutions and levels of government, including the federal government. (p. 328)

In Canada, former Prime Minister Pierre Trudeau introduced the concept of multiculturalism in 1971 and the Multiculturalism Act was passed in 1988 shifting policy debates from assimilation to cultural diversity (Bannerji, 2000; Maiter, 2009). The ongoing colonization of Indigenous Peoples and the failure to acknowledge Indigenous land claims and self-determination are injustices that are not taken up in the rhetoric of multiculturalism. Some critics view this omission as a deplorable weakness of multiculturalism policy (Gilbert, 2007). Gilbert (2007) examines multicultural discourses and how they have been strategically employed in particular political and historical contexts from discussions around North American free trade and integration to representations of security risks after September 11, 2001. Widespread enthusiasm for multiculturalism policy in the 1980s can be seen in the context of late capitalism; multiculturalism was regarded as an economic resource, beneficial to big business (Mackey, 1999).

Multiculturalism and multicultural education have been problematized for neglecting “the relevance of power, the hierarchicalization of difference, and an insistence on life as a series of interactions among individuals unaffected by institutions” (Simpson, James & Mack, 2011, p. 290). As Mackey (1999) argues, multiculturalism was introduced by Canadian elites in the post-war period (in contrast with earlier immigration policies intending to maintain British cultural hegemony) as a way to institutionalize difference and still control access to power. This approach sought to push

the social and economic demands of racialized commmunities into the margins of politics by focusing instead on culturalism. Linguistic and political rights are only attributed to the two 'founding nations' within multiculturalism policy; racialized groups only have rights as individual citizens (Mackey, 1999; Haque, 2012). As Mackey (1999) observes: "As legally constituted cultural minorities, with rights as individuals only, they cannot authorise political changes to dominant culture, they can only request them" (p. 66).

Similarly, Gosine (2007) brings up the critical point that "[f]ollowing the logic of multiculturalism, maintenance of culture is viewed as the respite from Canadian racism, not the pursuit of political or social change" (p. 56). We need to contextualize issues in broader historical and socio-political contexts in order to move from a parochial focus on inaccurate attitudes/individualized racism, to a more rigorous interrogation of institutional and systemic racism. Henry and Tator (2006) argue that structures of power are reproduced through particular democratic discourses including: political correctness, denial, colour blindness, equal opportunity, blaming the victim, white victimization, reverse racism, binary polarizations, moral panic, multiculturalism, liberal values, and national identity.

In interrogating and denouncing individualized, institutional and systemic racism in a Canadian context, the definitions of race, racism and racialization employed in this study will coincide with those provided by Bannerji (2005), and Kobayashi and Johnson (2007). Bannerji (2005) defines race as "an active social organization, a constellation of practices motivated, consciously and unconsciously, by political or power imperatives with implied cultural forms—images, symbols, metaphors, and norms that range from the quotidian to the institutional" (p. 149). Furthermore, she argues that race is "a collection of discourses of colonialism and slavery, but firmly rooted in capitalism in its different aspects through time" (p. 149). As people are categorized based on socially constructed racial differences, *racialization* is understood as "a historical process constitutive of social life and as engrained in dominant ideologies" (Kobayashi & Johnson, 2007, p. 5) and *racism* is "a set of contingent processes through which the meanings and experiences of the racialized are not only constantly reinscribed and reinforced, but also

transformed. It is both a cause and result of racialization" (Kobayashi & Johnson, 2007, p. 4)

Anti-racism education addresses the impact of racism and how the interplay of racism with other forms of oppression, constrains opportunities and life trajectories for specific racialized groups. Moreover, anti-racism education works to develop strategies to counter these types of oppression manifest in institutions and social relations. Thus, conceptions of agency, equity and justice are central to anti-racism education theory and practice (Dei, 1996; Dei & Calliste, 2000). Conversely, the multicultural approach to education has been challenged because of its "stereotyping, essentializing or homogenizing effect" (James, 2007, p. 23) and for neglecting to address the ways in which educational institutions replicate inequalities that exist in wider society. Multiculturalism as a conceptual framework was also institutionalized in the field of social work, including child welfare and child protection (Maiter, 2009). Multiculturalism discourse also fails to confront injustices such as racialized poverty, prison populations or children taken into the child welfare system (Di Tomasso, 2012).

Feminist analysis, in conjunction with anti-racism education, provides an extension of concerns to how women are disproportionately impacted by global economic restructuring and state cutbacks as high numbers of women are employed in the public and non-unionized sectors. The ways in which women are affected by neoliberal globalization has significant implications for children in terms of the impact of economic uncertainty on the household and community (Burman, 2005, 2008; Lister, 2006; Pulkingham & Ternowetsky, 1997; Qvortrup, 1985, 1997; Swift & Callahan, 2009; Wiegers, 2002). As Grewal and Kaplan (1994) highlight, there is "an imperative need to address the concerns of women around the world in the historicized particularity of their relationship to multiple patriarchies as well as to international economic hegemonies…" (p. 17). In both Canadian and global contexts, it is necessary to examine, as Burman (1996) writes: "longstanding colonial interests in the regulation of children and mothers for the production of new able labour forces and market outlets" (p. 47). That a number of white feminists have neglected to confront issues of race, imperialism and colonialism requires continuous interrogation (Mohanty, 1998, 2002; Nelson & Nelson, 2004;

Razack, 1998). Akram (2000) cautions that some western feminist groups frame issues of concern to, and advocate on behalf of, women in the regions of the South through a discourse of “neo-orientalism”; a number of feminist human rights advocates consequently fail to address how patriarchy is locally anchored nor are they able to take significant action against manifest injustice – often the direct result of political intervention/imperialism – in other parts of the world. Similar concerns have also been raised by Razack (1999; 1996) who points to the danger of liberal/feminist discourses that, sometimes quite strategically, deflect attention from Western complicity in relations of oppression and violence against women. These types of discourses may also be seen in schooling contexts in which educators pathologize new immigrant and refugee children and their mothers.

Educators must understand how class, gender and race intersect (Anthias & Yuval Davis, 1992; hooks, 1994; 2003; Ng, Staton & Scane 1995) and how this relates to children’s experiences of migration. Ng’s (1996) study of immigrant women navigating class relations and community struggles ignites an increased sense of injustice. The politics of community services is complicated by policy implications for immigrant women. In Canada, the Advisory Council on the Status of Women was established in 1973 with a limited mandate since it was not able to either legislate or implement policies affecting women, nor did it take into account the concerns of immigrant women (Donkor, 2004) and this exclusion left a legacy of injustices within feminist movements in Canada which have been fought by racialized and Indigenous women (Bunjun, 2010, 2012). It was not until 1974 that women could apply for immigration as the principal applicants and thus be recognized as the economic providers for their families (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Donkor, 2004; Thobani, 2000a, 2000b). Thobani’s (2000a) social theorizing discusses globalization from the critical standpoint of immigrant women, from which “globalization can be dated back to the earliest beginnings of the capitalist system of relations: colonialism represented the first phase of capitalist globalization” (p. 311-312). The ways in which resources were extracted by colonial powers is now paralleled by the unequal relationships between multinational corporations and formerly colonized countries.

In a recent study, Mojab and McDonald (2008) examine the interplay between patriarchal, political, social and economic power structures of violence and the experiences of immigrant women's learning. Comprehensive discussions, around the exploitation of refugee and migrant women, point to a condemnation of discriminatory practices in relation to job security, training, wages, work conditions, and the right to unionize (Pittaway & Bartolomei, 2001). While experiences of immigration are varied, educators need to both acknowledge, as well as challenge, "a top-down, state-imposed operation of community, policy development and power that assume a race, class and gender equality that simply does not exist at this point" (Baines & Sharma, 2002, p. 98).

It is important to question why 'ethnic' and 'immigrant' are terms which are often conflated, contributing to exclusionary practices: particular social groups are seen as 'other' and peripheral to a dominant culture (Donkor, 2004; Mojab, 2006; Razack, 2002; Thobani, 2007, 2000a). Culture and religion "can also become symbolic markers of difference, inferiority and undesirability" (Chan, 2004, p. 112). The racialization of whiteness confronts the implications of whiteness as socially constructed (Chan, 2004). In analyzing racism in relation to capitalism, we can redirect attention towards inequitable resource distribution and power. It is not difficult to discern why race is politically contested and racism discounted by ideological perspectives and institutions upholding social inequalities.

Hage (2000) draws on Bourdieu's concept of *cultural capital* in order to conceptualize *practical nationality*. Cultural capital, as Bourdieu argued: "represents the sum of valued knowledge, styles, social and physical (bodily) characteristics and practical behavioural dispositions within a given field" while, similarly,

> practical nationality can be understood analytically as the sum of accumulated nationally sanctified and valued social and physical cultural styles and dispositions (national culture) adopted by individuals and groups, as well as valued characteristics (national types and national character) within a national field: looks, accent, demeanour, taste, nationally valued social and cultural

> preferences and behaviour, etc. For Bourdieu, the accumulated cultural capital within a given field is ultimately converted into symbolic capital, which is the recognition and legitimacy given to a person or group for the cultural capital they have accumulated. (Hage, 2000, p. 53)

Further, Hage (2000) emphasizes the injustice, in commenting that: "No matter how much national capital a 'Third World-looking' migrant accumulates, the fact that he or she has acquired it, rather than being born with it, devalues what he or she possesses compared to the 'essence' possessed by the national aristocracy" (p. 62). These concepts are important to a theoretical stance which problematizes and denounces a nationalist practice of exclusion carried out by agents who imagine that they are entitled to a privileged position within national space (Hage, 2000), as will be discussed in following chapters.

Social rights, such as access to education, health care and housing, are also inextricably linked to citizenship, which is defined by notions of colonialism, neocolonialism, gender, and nationalism (Baines & Sharma, 2002; Elabor-Idemudia, 2005; Hanley & Shragge, 2009). As Oxman-Martinez et al. (2006) observe: "While official policy cannot be equated with practice, policy is nevertheless the official statement of social rights, statements that can be used either to provide or deny access" (p. 250). Citizenship and immigration laws have, from the beginning, been organized around racial hierarchies and policies of exclusion (Baines & Sharma, 2002; Jakubowski, 1997; Macklin, 2011). It is essential to recognize that in spite of what must feel like insurmountable obstacles in the workplace and in wider society, immigrant workers have not been complacent, and have shown remarkable courage in the fight for dignity and justice (Choudry et al., 2009). Such courageous role models may inspire and politicize immigrant and refugee children in various contexts. We cannot consider the education of new immigrant and refugee children in isolation from other social rights; concerns pertaining to educational inequalities in the Canadian context must also denounce the deleterious consequences of exclusionary immigration and refugee policies from both historical and contemporary perspectives.

Canada, like other nation-states, has been constructed around a sovereignty story that seeks to conceal social hierarchies and unequal access to the country, as well as unequal access to jobs, social programs and political participation within the country (Baines & Sharma, 2002). The racialized, gendered structure of Canadian society and experiences of racism and racialization were rarely acknowledged in identity-oriented studies from the 1980s and 1990s which tended to focus on cultural issues of co-existance or conflict, acculturation and assimilation. However Jiwani, Janovicek, and Cameron (2001) state that this trend shifted more recently with studies that have looked more broadly at structural factors impacting on social groups. Writing about racialized relations in Canada, Chan (2004) states that heterogeneous groupings of racial and ethnic groups "can and will vary depending upon the social, economic, and political processes at work in a given context" (p. 111). Speaking of the Canadian educational context, Galabuzi (2014) reflects:

> It may well be the case that the impact of racialization is somewhat different in the education system because of the differing intensity of stigmas attached to different groups as well as the socially and psychologically disaffirming phenomena of the racialized experience the current Eurocentric curriculum. Because different histories of slavery and colonization have generated different stigmas and traumas, it is quite likely that different racialized identities draw different penalties in North American society. (p. 193)

Post-colonial and Anti-colonial Theories

Anti-colonial theories coincide with ant-racist theories in an analysis of inequalities produced and reproduced by institutions and societal structures; these theoretical frameworks examine the ways in which the ideological, material, and political interests of the state are cemented in institutional structures (Dei, 1996; 2006; Dei & Asgharzadeh, 2001; Dei & Kempf, 2006). Colonialism is understood as a set of relations, the "territorial ownership" of a place/space by an imperial power; it is manifested through a politics of domination, constructing images of the colonizer and the colonized (Memmi,

1969). As Mohanty (1988) observes: "colonization almost invariably implies a relation of structural domination, and a discursive or political suppression of the heterogeneity of the subject(s) in question" (p. 61). Imperialism is the governing ideology and the political/institutional structures that sustain the relations of domination (Dei & Asgharzadeh, 2001; Loomba, 1998).

The omission of Indigenous perspectives and histories in anti-racism theory and practice raises crucial questions regarding the complex interrelationships between different aspects of Canadian and global society (Amadahy & Lawrence, 2009; Lawrence & Dua, 2005); Canada's colonization of Indigenous peoples must be considered as both an historical process and a present reality (Choudry, 2010a; Dion, 2005) impacting on citizenship, immigration, family, work and trade unions (Lawrence & Dua, 2005). Critical to an anti-colonial framework is the notion of indigenousness, which Dei (2000) identifies as the consciousness, intellectual agency, and knowledge associated with long-term occupancy.

It cannot be disputed that colonization is still experienced by Indigenous Peoples in many parts of the world, and post-colonial theory has also been problematized for the same omission of Indigenous perspectives and histories. In addition to neglecting aboriginal and settler relations, some post-colonial theories and literatures have also arguably paid less attention to gender relations and gender ideologies (addressed by feminist post-colonial theories), the unequal division of resources in postcolonial societies, religious and ethnic conflicts, and precolonial history (Mukherjee, 1998). The 'post' in post-colonial has been widely contested (Smith, 1999, 2012); it "symbolizes an unrealistic rupture, a break, a move away from one condition to the next" (Dei & Asgharzadeh, 2001, p. 304). It has been associated with chauvinist conceptions of 'development', as a linear process in reference to European colonialism (Smith, 1999, 2012; Dei & Asgharzadeh, 2001). Contemporary social relations are not sufficiently represented through post-colonial theory.

The enactment of law has worked to render colonialism invisible (Villegas, 2010a) and to conceal violence inherent in processes of colonization and the reproduction of the nation-state (Thobani 2007). Violence is inherent in experiences of colonization

(Fanon, 1989a, 1989b). Drawing on Fanon's work, Coulthard (2011) theorizes the ways in which colonial power is reproduced over time and in the Canadian context. As Coulthard (2011) observes: "Fanon correctly situated colonial-capitalist exploitation and domination alongside misrecognition and alienation as foundational sources of colonial injustice" (p. 38). Of key concern are different manifestations of violence, both direct and psychological violence, which sustain relations of imperialism both with and without the use of force. While Canadian nationalism situates the history of our country as distinct from the United States and Britain, these claims can be challenged through literature that exposes the ways in which the Canadian state has been embedded in networks of international capital and colonialism (Mukherjee, 1998). Historically, capitalist nation-states pursued colonial projects in order to compete for control of global resources and markets (Duara, 2004). European subjects rendered themselves 'innocent' while asserting European hegemony (Smith, 1999, 2012; Pratt, 1992). The history of imperialism must be understood in terms of its role in forced displacement (Chimni, 1998, 2000). Similarly, we need to denounce the ways in which international institutions such as the IMF and World Bank manufacture economic disparity. Sharma (2006) also cautions against the danger of conflating processes of migration with colonialism; it is problematic and inaccurate to refer to people displaced by experiences of colonialism elsewhere or who were brought to Canada as slaves, indentured labourers, refugees, or contemporary migrant workers, as settler-colonizers. These processes will be discussed in greater detail in the following chapters.

Interrogations of colonialism and imperialism in the schooling context are also crucial in order for children to understand (and practice) equity and justice. As Canella (1997) writes:

> Charitable agencies advertise for donations to "guarantee" a childhood for children of the "Third World". This perspective uses younger human beings to deny the imperialism that leads to poverty, and perpetuates the notion that people in poverty are responsible for the condition. (p. 37)

Conversely, critically important studies have examined decolonizing the classroom through storytelling and literature, emphasizing the importance of teacher reflexivity. Strong-Wilson (2007, 2008) examines the political convictions and ideological positions adopted by teachers of differing views. In particular, she emphasizes "the place of stories in literacy formation and thus, in producing colonialism, as well as the role they can play in decolonizing formation; a story is understood to provide a perceptual horizon that influences how the teacher carries him/herself in the world" (Strong-Wilson, 2007, p. 114). Similarly, Vasquez (2004) emphasizes the importance of recognizing the ways in which the teacher's ideologies or beliefs will shape curriculum and, consequently, the knowledge production of children. As Vasquez (2004) notes: "The bottom line is children participate based on the discourses, the ways of being, that have been made available for them, many of these having been introduced at school" (p. 36).

Section Two

Literature on refugee and im/migrant children

> The struggle over the master-narrative is a pitched battle, not simply over how various groups and experiences – 'the Canadian experience' – are represented in elementary and high-school classroom textbooks and in the academic halls. It is also that these narratives have a direct bearing on who gains access to citizenship – loosely taken to mean the entitlements and benefits that the state bestows upon or declines members of a given society – and, ultimately, who wields, and feels entitled to wield, power. Uncovering the genealogy of these narratives involves both burying the master-narratives and unearthing narratives that have been buried, an arduous task that is not as simple as it might sound. (Austin, 2010, p. 29)

We need to critically examine the past in order to contextualize how knowledge has been produced and how this knowledge production has influenced schooling (Viruru, 2005). In doing so, we can work towards institutional and systemic change by examining

the context, goals, and purpose of education (Dei, 1996). There are dual paradigms of vulnerability and resilience evident in framing the experiences of refugee children (Watters, 2008). Two such different paradigms, informing teaching practices and educational experiences, will have very different impacts on children in schools, facilitating or constraining their capacity to "articulate their dreams" (Dei, 1996). The agency of children is always there, even when there are circumstances limiting their capacity to exercise that agency. Dei (1996) analyzes the ways in which social agency is shaped by institutional power and points to possibilities for social change.

That state policies and practices in Western contexts often isolate new immigrant and refugee children presents serious challenges for educators working towards social justice around statelessness/displacement (Boyden, 2009). As Boyden (2009) observes:

> The dilemma for teachers who do not engage with the political views of forced migrant pupils or the politics of their statelessness is that they run the risk of becoming complicit in the production and reproduction of injustices against stateless populations…Another challenge concerns how educators can use notions of social justice as applied to individual migrants to build a greater sense of collective responsibility in all pupils. The question is whether educators can countenance teaching children how they are (we all are) implicated in a world which continuously replicates forced migration. (p. 274)

Adult experiences of migration have been used to contextualize those of children. Historically, research on migration focused on the experiences of men. There was a shift in the 1960s at which time the experiences of women were studied, and subsequently more research has been focused specifically on children and migration (Chavez & Menjívar, 2010). New immigrant and refugee children are clearly not a homogenous group and experiences must be temporally and geographically contextualized, as well as attending to social location. As Adams and Kirova (2006) point out, the terms *immigrant* and *migrant* are often used interchangeably while in many studies, the terms distinguish between the experience of moving from one country to another and moving within national borders. The review of the literature on immigrant and refugee children in a Canadian context demonstrates that while experiences of migration are varied and

multifaceted, concerns pertaining to loss, socioeconomic status, resilience and injustice consistently arise in a significant number of studies. That refugee children have often endured experiences of violence in the context of war will compound their challenges and struggles.

Anderson, Hamilton, Moore, Loewen and Frater-Mathieson (2004) identify five broad categories in the international literature on refugee children: "mental health literature related to grief, loss and trauma; the literature on displacement, migration and acculturation; literature on needs of linguistic and cultural minorities; literature on resilience; and inclusive education and special needs literature" (p. 5). In the Canadian context, studies of the mental health of refugee children have raised concerns about the impact of separation from parents, family cohesion and conflict, parental depression, and the important role of social networks (Fantino & Colak 2001; Rousseau, Drapeau, Lacroix, Bagilishy & Heusch, 2005; Rousseau, Drapeau & Corin, 1998). Refugee children have endured multiple losses and trauma; traumatic events might have arisen in "a specific context of war or armed conflict (torture, execution, disappearance, imprisonment, forced labour and so on)" (Rousseau, Drapeau & Corin, 1998, p. 23). The literature has also pointed to therapeutic contexts, in particular arts-based therapies, in promoting resilience and to support refugee children in coping with grief, loss and trauma (Lacroix, Rousseau, Singh, Gauthier, Benoit, 2005; Rousseau & Heusch, 2000).

Orellana (2001, 2009) argues that immigrant children play a critical role as "language brokers" through their translation skills, communicating the information contained in documents for health care practitioners, social workers, lawyers, and in many other contexts. Children therefore have a critical role to play in the settlement process; however these contributions have received little recognition. This is a surprising oversight, especially if we consider Mukherjee's (1998) astute observation regarding "…the daily reality of non-native speakers of English who must have esoteric legal and medical texts translated for them by translators who are not always very good or reliable" (p. 102).

The educational experiences of new immigrant and refugee children are considered as issues of social justice in terms of the opportunities and outcomes of schooling (Adams and Kirova, 2006). Teachers, administrators, teacher educators, parents and children are all implicated in processes to affect change. The tension between structure and agency requires ongoing investigation. Peer relations and academic performance, language acquisition and communication with parents, and teachers' perceptions of students have all been identified as issues of concern (Dachyshyn, 2006; Kaprierian-Churchill & Churchill, 1994). Kirova has engaged children in numerous studies on childhood loneliness, peer interactions and acceptance of immigrant children, identity formation and language learning in ESL students, and the role of teachers in helping linguistically and culturally diverse students adjust to the school culture (Adams & Kirova, 2006). Adams and Kirova (2006) state that policy and practice would be strengthened by stories and perspectives from children as well as teachers. Igoa (1995) and Valencia's (2011) participatory research with immigrant children's narratives, and what they have to say in terms of schooling, community contexts and policy arenas, clearly supports this claim. A key concern is that children are not included in decision-making processes which impact on their lives.

In a study of refugee children in Toronto schools, Yau (1995) identified several barriers and setbacks impacting on experiences in educational institutions: little or no prior formal schooling; interrupted schooling; joining of school in the middle of the academic year; inclination to stay away from school out of fear of immigration authorities/deportation; language barriers; financial difficulties; anxiety and stress; and social isolation. In a more recent study of refugee high school students in Winnipeg, Stewart (2011) came to similar conclusions and advocated for more community and school partnerships with settlement workers and multi-agency partnering on projects (justice and education, non-government agencies, and immigration). Additionally, she argued for anti-racist educational initiatives in the school and wider community.

Other studies have examined culturally contested issues between new immigrant families and educators, focusing in particular on Latin American families in Toronto

(Bernhard & Freire, 1999; Bernhard, Torres, Nirdosh & Freire, 1997; Bernhard, 2009; Freire & Bernhard, 1999). These studies have concluded that miscommunication between immigrant parents and teachers can lead to significant conflicts, resulting in parents becoming disengaged from the school community. Bernhard and Freire (1999) call for a "critical interrogation of the structures of educational delivery" as well as "attention to the perception, beliefs, goals and knowledge" of immigrant parents (p. 72). There are discrepancies between discourses of diversity/inclusion among teachers and exclusionary practices in schools (Adams & Kirova, 2006). Henry and Tator (2005) argue that immigrant and racialized children are disproportionately impacted in negative ways by inaccurate assessment and placement processes. Racialization in school is a significant concern when discrimination, from both teachers and children, begins as early as preschool (Vasquez, 2004; Viruru, 2005; Dachyshyn, 2006).

The high levels of education of parents and their credentials are often not recognized; additionally, many immigrant parents send remittances to family members in their countries of origin (Adams & Kirova, 2006; Bose, 2008). As Adams and Kirova (2006) write: "Sending remittances adds to the financial strain on immigrant families, but teachers should not assume that the parents of newly arrived children who live at or near the poverty line have limited education or skills" (p. 3). The material and ideological conditions of immigrant and refugee families must be considered in conjunction with theoretical, pedagogical, and institutional issues in order to counter discourses of pathology. Refugee children have often been constructed as 'problems', deflecting attention from inherited power and entrenched attitudes of dominant social groups (Diab, 2009; Watters, 2008)

Paul Anisef and Kenise Murphy Kilbride, from the Joint Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Settlement in Toronto, have provided detailed descriptions and comprehensive discussions of some of the changes shaping the settlement experiences of children and youth in Canada. Some of the salient issues they have identified include English as Second Language programs and language proficiency; employment and language proficiency; discrimination, self-esteem, and language proficiency; pre-immigration situations; cultural tensions and integration; discrimination

in schools; teachers/counsellors and discrimination; violence, police harassment, and discrimination; and ideological representations: racism, the media and the police (Anisef & Kilbride, 2003). That settlement agencies have different goals and ideologies also merits further investigation (Anisef & Kilbride, 2003).

More recent studies have also analyzed the issue of precarious legal status in Canada (Bernhard, Goldring, Young, Berinstein & Wilson, 2007; Bernhard & Young, 2009; Burns, 2010; Fynn, 2009; Khandor, McDonald, Nyers, & Wright, 2004; Lowry & Nyers, 2003; Nyers, 2010; Oxman-Martinez, Hanley, Lach, Khanlou, Weerasinghe, & Agnew, 2005; Sidhu, 2008; Simich, 2006; Simich, Wu & Nerad, 2007; Smith-Carrier & Bhuyan, 2010; Villegas, 2010b; Wright, 2003; Young, 2010). As Kaprierian-Churchill and Churchill (1994) observe: "The impact of status uncertainty on the children cannot be overemphasized, especially with the possibility of deportation" (p. 69). Immigration status has significant implications in terms of access to social rights, including education, health care, and housing. As Orellana (2009) notes: "In the same family, some children may have citizenship rights…while others may have different kinds of legal status, differences that are now more consequential than ever, given the increasing surveillance over immigrants and changing laws stipulating their access to public services…" (p. 20-21). While Orellana is describing experiences in the U.S. context, the aforementioned studies point to the circumstances of children in Canada who are living with the fear and uncertainty imposed by aggressive state practices towards migrants.

There are also significant tensions between policy arenas with immigration and refugee policies falling under federal jurisdiction, while education and child welfare policies are under provincial jurisdiction. Immigration and refugee policies are tied to the priorities of governments and federal regulations have been applied inconsistently (Kaprierian-Churchill & Churchill, 1994). Provincial jurisdiction over education is shaped by the political priorities of different governments.

The political subjectivity of refugee children is often discounted in many contexts of reception; representations of vulnerability and victimization increases the likelihood of securing refugee status, as opposed to children who emphasized persecution deriving

from activism and political beliefs (Bhabha, 2001). In Ali's (2006) comparative analysis of international policies and practices affecting unaccompanied refugee children, she intimates that the Canadian child policy framework and migration policy framework function in tension, which is politically consequential. Referencing Jacqueline Bhabha's work, Ali recounts that inconsistencies in the treatment of refugee children arise from the tensions of "two opposing normative frameworks—immigration control preoccupations on the one hand—and welfare protection (including child's rights) concerns on the other" (Bhabha, 2001, p. 293). The Single Mothers without Legal Status in Canada research project also identifies tensions between policy frameworks, and immigration and family law as two incongruent systems (Burns, 2010). Conceptions of child welfare and the role of child protection services in relation to immigrant and refugee children will be further explored in this study.

Conclusion

Children's lives, in the Canadian and global context, are structured by neoliberal globalization, widening educational inequalities and social class divides, the expansion of market forces and the retrenchment of the public sector (Boyden, 1997; Burman, 1996, 2005, 2008; Cannella, 1997; Ennew & Morrow, 2002; Fine, 1995; Katz, 2004; Kvorjolt, 2007; Moosa-Mitha, 2005; Orellana, 2009; Orellana, Thorne, Chee & Lam, 2001; Qvortrup, 1985, 1997; Schissel, 2011; Sgritta, 1997; Stasiulis, 2002, 2004; Steffler, 2009; Stephens, 1994, 1995, 1997). As Wotherspoon (2009) notes: "Globally based patterns of economic development, colonial systems of rule, and the expansion of market forces have created some convergence among education systems, but substantial variations and inequalities in education remain both within and across nations" (p. 102).

The ways in which the educational system is related to the social division of labour has been analyzed through the prism of Marxist educational theory, and the following chapters draw from Bourdieu's theories of *cultural capital* order to interrogate how schools reproduce social inequalities. The conjunction of theories affords opportunities to contest the issue of 'deservingness' both in terms of state intervention around child poverty and welfare and also in discourses of legality/illegality around

migration. The fusion of theoretical frameworks including anti-racism education, feminist analysis, and anti-colonial theory allows for a more rigorous tracing of socio-political processes/socio-historical conditions. It is imperative to understand the ways in which 'Canadianness' is socially constructed in order to challenge school and social hierarchies. As Mackey (1999) argues: "In the Canadian context, the state did not seek to erase difference but rather attempted to institutionalise, constitute, shape, manage, and control difference" (p. 70).

The cumulative effects of historical injustices continue to have resonance. Conceptions of child welfare, education and law are impacted by ideas about race and colonization. The review of the literature on immigrant and refugee children in a Canadian context demonstrates that while experiences of migration are varied and multifaceted, concerns pertaining to loss, socioeconomic status, resilience and injustice consistently arise in a significant number of studies. The reference to discrepancies between discourses of diversity/inclusion among teachers and exclusionary practices in schools (Adams & Kirova, 2006) provides opportunities to short-circuit the argument that: "school acts as an instrument for fostering social mobility, economic stability, and general well-being" (Kaprierian-Churchill & Churchill, 1994, p. 101).

International and national obligations to children's rights and child welfare are embedded in an adverse migration context. The ascendancy of neoliberalism has had a profound impact on shaping migration policies, narrowing legal pathways to citizenship. The review of the aforementioned sociological theories of education has provided a solid foundation to explore experiences of displacement and conceptions of children's agency in the context of global inequalities created by neoliberal economic policies and experiences of colonization. The following chapters examine access to social rights for children with precarious legal status in Canada, children's educational futures and life trajectories, and the ways in which grassroots mobilizations by (and in collaboration with) children with precarious legal status have induced policy reforms.

Chapter 3:
Ethical concerns in social justice research with children

> The intellectual project of decolonizing has to set out ways to proceed through a colonizing world. It needs a radical compassion that reaches out, that seeks collaboration, and that is open to possibilities that can only be imagined as other things fall into place. (Smith, 2012, p. xii)

> …one must always remember, that the whole architecture and landscape of childhood may be left to others to design and implement – others who did not for one moment think of it from the point of view of children. (Qvortrup, 1997, p.19)

Introduction

This chapter is divided into 4 main sections, starting with ideas articulated about social justice research and reflexivity. The next section offers reflections on researching displacement. That the experiences of forced migrants are often represented by others, including humanitarian agencies, human rights organizations, and, as I explore in this thesis, media, is a contentious issue. Subsequently, I review the methodological and ethical implications of researching precarious legal status and how these concerns have been taken up in other studies. The third section grapples with the tensions inherent in research methodologies with children and youth in general, and more specifically, methodological approaches in studies of childhood and migration. The final section of this chapter addresses the challenges of engaging in immigration justice research in an adverse migration context. That there are grave risks for people whose immigration status is uncertain, and who fear increasingly aggressive state practices towards migrants (culminating in detention or deportation and the likelihood of death subsequent to a deportation order) presents many challenges. Additionally, there is also concern around psychological distress resulting from the harsh working and living conditions of parents and children in precarious circumstances.

This chapter links together disparate methodological approaches to researching displacement in order to examine the ethical dimensions of participatory research. The applicability of this analysis to the thesis is in the explication of the social processes of participatory research and the social locations of researchers. Social justice research ideally involves collaboration among researchers and local people who have a committed and sustained relationship over a period of time (Chambers & Balanoff, 2009; Ng & Mirchandani, 2008). The study I proposed to do when I began my doctoral program could not take shape when I was confronted with the reality that I did not have sufficient time to build trust and relationships, so crucial to participatory research. Other ethical concerns taken up in this chapter include the vulnerability of people living in harsh circumstances, and the importance of long-term relationships and collaboration. The political complexities of research relationships, and my commitment to solidarity, authentic empathy, and social equity, are also discussed in both the introduction and conclusion. This chapter fits cohesively within the structure of the thesis because it addresses a conceptual stance toward social justice research that should not be left unexplored. Chapter Four will explicate this study's methodological frameworks and the contribution of media discourse analysis to social movement settings. This thesis is written with the hope that it can offer a contribution to broader struggles for immigration justice by focusing on narrative frames and counter-frames (Entman 1993, 2003, 2004), and processes of hegemony and counter-hegemony (Gramsci, 1971) that shape the political and legal structures of Canadian society.

Social Justice Research and Reflexivity

Liamputtong (2007) emphasizes the importance of a fully collaborative process between researchers and participants/communities to attend to power relations and to ensure that the study is of use to everyone implicated in the research. Researchers need to be particularly reflexive in working with vulnerable groups in order to avoid research that "resembles a colonial economy when researchers enter the world of participants uninvited, extract a resource called data, process this resource into a product called theory, and use the product only toward their own ends" (Paradis, 2000, p. 840).

Linda Tuhiwai Smith's (1999, 2012) analysis of Indigenous research as both contesting imperialism and the effects of colonization as well as being a process for decolonization in itself resonates with many critical methodological approaches. The process of decolonizing research involves dismantling interconnected ideas about history (Smith, 2012), specifically, the idea: 1) that history is a totalizing discourse, 2) that there is a universal history, 3) that history is one large chronology, 4) that history is about development, 5) that history is about a self-actualizing human subject, 6) that the story of history can be told in one coherent narrative, 7) that history as a discipline is innocent, 8) that history is constructed around binary categories, 9) that history is patriarchal (pp. 30-35). As Smith (1999, 2012) argues, history is about power:

> There is a direct relationship between the expansion of knowledge, the expansion of trade and the expansion of empire. That relationship continues, although in the reframed discourse of globalization it is referred to as the relationship between the expansion of technology/information, the expansion of economic opportunities and the expansion of 'the market'. (2012, p. 92)

In addition to challenging dominant paradigms in academic institutions, Smith (1999) also calls for serious consideration of the role of media, official histories and school curricula in sustaining relations of imperialism, as she states: "…imperialism cannot be struggled over only at the level of text and literature. Imperialism still hurts, still destroys and is reforming itself constantly…" (p. 19)

Critical approaches to research have sought to denounce historical injustices attributable to imperialism, as well as to build alternative social relations and structures. Drawing on Mohanty (1991), Jones (2000), whose research involved interviews with 30 young people experiencing immigration controls, explains: "inequality can only be understood within an historical context of social relations" (p. 33). It is essential to recognize that there are many challenges to be addressed in critical methodologies resisting unjust societies, and constraints imposed on social justice research. As Chambers and Balanoff (2009) note:

> …participatory research occurs within a larger sociopolitical and institutional topography, one that does not provide the social conditions necessary for

> nurturing ideal modes of participation. In particular, the underlying assumptions, policies, and practices of the state, and its institutions for social science research, mitigate against socially just and locally appropriate modes of participation. (p. 78)

The transparency of a researcher's position cannot be taken for granted; political subjectivities and dissenting views have also been constrained by social relations and institutions in a global context. As Limbu (2009) explains: "This is the lesson that must be remembered in order to guard against the temptation of producing (in both senses of the world) the politically savvy subaltern speaking the easily digestible language of UN-style global institutions" (p. 271). Limbu is referring to representations of refugee experiences but his point is relevant in many other contexts as well.

Researching Displacement

Malkki (1996) cautions against homogenizing representations of the refugee experience that do not allow for political and social engagement, as she explains: "One of the most far-reaching, important consequences of these established representational practices is the systematic, even if unintended, silencing of persons who find themselves in the classificatory space of 'refugee'" (p. 386). Humanitarian discourse and practice of the 1990s have positioned migrants in certain ways, which Hyndman (2000) refers to as a "colonialism of compassion" (p. *xxi*). By this Hyndman means that humanitarian work, even with good intentions, can parallel the exclusions and power asymmetries of colonial relationships. Boyden (2009) also problematizes the concept of compassion from cultural and political economy perspectives, concluding that notions of power, equity, and rights must be critically analyzed. There is an urgent need for further research on the political economy of forced migration, on gender dimensions of forced migration, and on an organizational sociology of humanitarian and refugee agencies (Castles, 2003). There is also an urgent need to look at how the experiences of forced migrants are represented, as Limbu (2009) explains:

> These representational forms come into play not only in media reporting of refugees but also in the policy discourse of humanitarian agencies, national

governments, and nongovernmental organisations. Both discursively and transnationally mobile, these representations, by transmitting a certain idea of the refugee, have significant political and ethical repercussions. (p. 268)

The absence of refugee perspectives has an impact on policy and practice (Malkki, 1995, 1996; Limbu, 2009; O'Neill & Harindranath, 2006). O'Neill and Harindranath (2006) provide a compelling analysis of the media politics of asylum by exploring the relations between journalistic discourse, social imagination, and immigration policies. For example, simplistic depictions of refugees, which draw on stereotypes in order to construct refugees as a social threat, can serve as a justification for exclusionary and criminalizing practices towards migrants. Additionally, neoliberal thinking which attributes responsibility to individuals for their material circumstances can reinforce carrot and stick approaches to social service provision, including settlement services.

Structural inequalities have an impact on research and service development with refugees; consequently there may be disadvantages in participatory approaches to research as argued by Temple and Moran (2006). They point to a number of tensions in relation to research in collaboration with refugee communities summarized here: participatory approaches are both resource and labour-intensive - this can affect the objectives of the study, and it may be difficult to achieve consensus among all the participants. Academics and service providers/social workers may be more focused on the policy level while participation tends to remain focused on practice. Participatory studies are sometimes dismissed as not being as rigorous as other qualitative research, while qualitative research in general is also subjected to critique and contestation in some disciplines relying on quantifiable data. Conversely, as Temple and Moran (2006) have argued, traditional quantitative studies with refugees have sometimes been completely dictated by researcher-led agendas. Refugee communities are often homogenized and essentialized without any engagement between different sections within communities. There are also concerns with issues of accountability and representation, particularly when only formal community organizations are approached. The discourses, resources

and 'insider knowledge' of academics and service providers may also compound tensions and power imbalances in research relationships (Temple & Moran, 2006).

There may be internal divisions within communities and perspectives may be based on allegiances to multiple social categorizations; consequently, it may be difficult to reach consensus on future policy and service development (Temple & Moran, 2006). Some researchers may ascribe political motivations and bias to refugee participants while, at the same time, ignoring their own agendas and worldviews (Temple & Moran, 2006). While current national and international policies towards refugees will have a significant impact on their position within society – refugees are often mistakenly pathologized through the denial of their political agency – many researchers respect and acknowledge refugees as active agents (Mesteneos, 2006). Researchers may also identify as refugees and it is political and academic work that may have led to persecution and forced migration. There is a need for equality, in practice and not only in rhetoric, between academics, community-based researchers and community members (Moran, Mohamed & Lovel, 2006).

Many researchers are well-aware of the number of academics, community organizers and social workers within refugee communities who have had to endure the loss of professional opportunities (Mesteneos, 2006). Chambers and Balanoff (2009) contend that: "Institutional policies on funding arrangements for community-based research both assume and reinforce underlying class relations and a hierarchy of labor" (p. 84). While Chambers and Balanoff are speaking more generally about participatory methodologies, their statement is relevant to the specific experiences of immigration justice research.

The need for reliable and competent interpreters in working with refugee communities is essential (Hopkins, 2009). It is also important to consider the social location of the interpreter (Temple & Edwards, 2006). Language is an important part of conceptualization, incorporating values and beliefs, not just a tool or technical label for conveying concepts (Temple & Edwards, 2006). It carries particular social and political meanings and prepares the experience of its speakers. (Temple & Edwards, 2006)

Linguistic isolation often compounds physical isolation; consequently acute social isolation impacts negatively on health. As Moran, Mohamed and Lovel (2006) observe: “There is an enormous amount of rhetoric on equality, social inclusion and improved health outcomes and very little in the way of either mainstream or project-funded action” (p. 71). Kissoon (2010), whose work focuses on conceptions of home and experiences of homelessness among refugee communities, points out that she was not able to engage language facilitators or interpreters in extensive interviewing due to budgetary constraints. As she explains: “Instead, a sampling strategy was biased towards people who could read the posters and flyers; who felt their English was sufficient to discuss ideas of home, housing, and migration, or who could find their own interpreter; or for whom a volunteer was conveniently available” (p. 8). While Kissoon clearly responded to budgetary constraints with great experience, knowledge and resourcefulness, Mestheneos (2006) questions whether other types of studies done with small budgets in a short time frame can be useful.

Autobiographical narratives from people who have experienced displacement play a role in: “fostering ethical communication, producing counter hegemonic discourses and critical texts that may mobilize change” (O’Neill & Harindranath, 2006, p. 46). Similarly, Eastmond (2007) discusses the significance of biographical narratives and memory in research on displacement:

> Power may also work on memory and narration in more insidious ways: in the violation of individuals’ bodies and minds, traumatic experiences tend to fragment memory, undermine trust, and inhibit expression. Such political and existential dimensions of torture and trauma formed the basis of the ‘testimony method’ developed as a healing strategy by Chilean psychologists after the military coup in 1973. Thus, trauma narratives were at once documentation and denunciation of political violence and a therapeutic process. (p. 258)

In analyzing the circulation of refugee stories in different contexts, Szörényi (2009) problematizes the ways in which speech is “prohibited, demanded, circumscribed or appropriated” through national border protection regimes. Szörényi describes ‘refugee discourse’ as a “broad set of knowledges and practices devoted to the management of

displacement" (p. 174). The three discursive contexts that she identifies include 1) the international human rights regime; 2) 'refugee discourses' through agencies such as the United Nations High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR), international refugee law, international studies, development studies, and the field of refugee studies (Malkki, 2005); and 3) national discourses of immigration control and national identity. In border security regimes, refugees are objectified through a number of practices and through an inaccurate and problematic binary of legality/illegality. As Szörényi (2009) notes: "an 'illegal' – a slippage from adjective to noun that rather than legislating against an action, reduces an entire life to the status of 'prohibited', a sentence carried out thorough the practice of indefinite incarceration without trial or nominated end date" (p. 178). She continues her line of argumentation by pointing out that human rights discourses often similarly objectify and essentialize refugees even if that is not their intent. There is a risk, then, that refugee stories circulate as commodities.

Razack (1996) raises similar concerns in relation to the experiences of refugee women and how their stories are framed in particular ways so as to deflect attention from the structures of injustice. Galloway (2011) offers a critical analysis of the aggressive stance towards refugee applicants in Canada and how their stories are embedded in a context of criminalization, suspicion and exclusionary state practices.

Methodological and ethical implications of researching precarious legal status

Methodological concerns relating to research with people living with precarious legal status include deportation, memories and effects of torture and threats to families and relatives (Bloch, Sigona, & Zetter, 2009; Bloch, Zetter, Sigona, & Gamaledin-Ashami, 2007; Simich, Wu & Nerad, 2007; Temple & Moran, 2006). In their review of 'irregular' migration, research, Düvell, Triandafyllidou and Vollmer (2008) have identified the following designs/methods: face to face in-depth interviews with irregular immigrants; anonymized questionnaires with irregular immigrants; analysis of secondary data such as quantitative enforcement agencies' records; analysis of secondary data such as personalised police records; and qualitative interviews with anyone knowledgeable about irregular migration without being an irregular immigrant him or herself. They

emphasize the sensitive, personal nature of qualitative interviews and (participant observation) and the serious commitment to confidentiality. The issue of interrogative or intrusive research is raised as a concern, as Düvell et al. state: "It leads to the question if it is legitimately justified to make known life stories or private narrations accessible to the public for the purposes of research findings" (p. 6).

Additionally, Düvell et al. argue that it is important to reflect on the role of ideology and bureaucratic opportunism. This is particularly significant due to the ways in which state practices manipulate public discourse by stigmatizing and criminalizing migrants (Düvell et al., 2008). As Mesteneos (2006) notes: "…consideration must be given to the fact that the political and ideological context of any research influences answers" (p. 31). Similarly, when public opinion towards refugees shifts, this can result in new legislation and policy implications (Schuster, 2002). In terms of dissemination of research on precarious status, there is a power imbalance when decisions are ultimately left to the discretion of the researcher; this power imbalance is compounded by the fact that those living in a precarious legal situation will have little recourse to address a concern in the research process or in another facet of their experience (Düvell et al., 2008). Of critical importance, then, is the motivation of the principal investigator as someone who ultimately seeks to critique and expose injustice and to work towards redressing social inequalities. This motivation must also be continuously engaged with reflexively and even then is not necessarily sufficient to ensure that research processes are equitable.

Villegas (2010a) was involved with a migrant rights campus organization at a California university and through this involvement engaged in a study of the experiences of undocumented Latina/o students. Having established trust and equitable research relationships through his committed work, Villegas was able to ground his analysis in the experiences, struggles and resistances of people living without immigration status. Drawing from Fanon's social theories, Villegas makes comparisons between experiences of colonization from cumulative historical injustices and the present reality of fear, uncertainty and violence endured by many undocumented migrants.

In order to hear directly from people living with precarious immigration histories, Simich, Wu and Nerad (2007) collaborated with experienced researchers from a community health centre that already had established trust, after more than 15 years of experience in programming, with what is quite a vulnerable population, due to the fear and stress of living without status. Additionally, their study obtained ethics approval from the Centre for Addiction and Mental Health (affiliated with the University of Toronto). The study was also strengthened by the participation of Spanish-speaking research assistants who were either currently, or had been formerly, employed at the community health centre. Protecting confidentiality was of critical importance for ethical reasons and particularly due to the serious risks for people who live with the constant fear of detention or deportation. Semi-structured and open-ended interviews were centred on a few topics: pre-migration experiences, arrival and settlement in Canada; the immigration process; the impact of lack of status on work and family; social support; and health status and health care experiences. As Simich, Wu and Nerad (2007) observe:

> Living without regular status is often a result of limited immigration options and procedural barriers within a climate of state control, rather than immigrants' intent to circumvent the laws of Canada. Access to essential health care is often tied to illogical bureaucratic rules and is a distressingly complex matter for mixed-status families. Although irregular immigrants show resilience in maintaining a work ethic and moral self-image, emotional distress related to their insecure situation is significant. (p. 372)

It is important to consider the consequences of differential access to social rights when some members of the family have legal status and others do not (Bernhard, Goldring, Young, Berinstein & Wilson, 2007; Orellana, 2009; Simich, Wu & Nerad, 2007). Bernhard, Goldring, Young, Berinstein and Wilson (2007) conducted a qualitative study with fifteen interviews to examine the implications of precarious legal status on children and families. Methodological challenges in researching precarious status include the difficulty of establishing trust as well as ethical concerns in keeping contact information of people living with precarious status, as this could compound their

fear and vulnerability (Bernhard, Goldring, Young, Berinstein & Wilson, 2007; Young & Bernhard, 2013).

Bloch, Sigona and Zetter (2009) worked with a research team to conduct 75 in-depth interviews and testimonies with young adults from Brazil, China, Turkey (Kurdish young people), Ukraine and Zimbabwe living in London, the North West and the West Midlands, UK. The varied histories from each of these countries were taken into consideration, as were the colonial links between the UK and Zimbabwe. It was essential to recruit researchers who were fluent in the languages spoken by the young people engaged in the study. Establishing trust with 'gatekeepers' from organizations and faith groups was also crucial; many challenges arose in this process. The study adhered to the guidelines provided by the British Sociological Association and Refugee Studies Centre and research participants were not asked for written consent to protect their identities, given the serious risks facing them in terms of feeling afraid of detention or deportation practices. When any information was considered to be of concern to research participants, withdrawal requests and omissions were made. After 12 months, the recordings of the interviews and testimonies were destroyed.

It is not surprising that the stigma of criminalization of people living with precarious status tends to compound struggles with anxiety and depression, as recent studies have shown (Simich, 2006; Simich, Wu & Nerad, 2007). Community health centres are limited in their capacity to provide health care for people living in such distressing circumstances (Simich, Wu & Nerad, 2007).

A disproportionate number of women are living in an irregular migration situation (Pashang, 2011; Simich, Wu & Nerad, 2007). Burns' (2010) study with single mothers living with precarious legal status had two components: 1) writing and publishing an informational booklet for service providers who are in a position to support mothers without status and 2) preparing a report based on interviews with mothers without status, which recommends legislative and policy-changes. As Burns observes, many women were concerned about participating in the study out of fear that it would negatively impact on their already precarious legal status (resulting in a deportation), or of being reported to the child welfare system. Some women also expressed discomfort and

embarrassment over the dissemination of the research and exposure of their personal circumstances.

Burns (2010) also emphasises the importance of finding reliable translators for the interviews; 30 front-line workers and lawyers were interviewed in order to have a better understanding of the challenges encountered in terms of legal and policy frameworks. Pashang (2011) similarly interviewed community organizers and social workers, with whom she had a previous relationship (or who had been referred to her) based on her more than twenty years of experience as a social worker and activist in Toronto.

Issues of access and informed consent spark important questions. In Hopkins' (2009) work with unaccompanied children seeking asylum in Scotland, the children were understandably apprehensive about speaking with an adult researcher they did not know. They also had serious concerns about the implications of their signatures on a consent form and whether this would negatively impact the decision regarding their application for asylum (Hopkins, 2009). There also needs to be flexibility in involving children in dissemination processes as their involvement could evoke additional anxiety, particularly in a hostile political climate (Hopkins, 2009).

Children, youth and research methodologies

Contemporary debates around neoliberalism have prompted critical studies of the context of children's lives under economic and social transformation (Katz, 2004; Stephens, 1995). Researchers, policymakers, and practitioners working towards social inclusion and social justice must cultivate "a more nuanced, contextually grounded theorizing about children, childhood and children's participation" (Morrow, 2007, p. 7). There needs to be greater attention paid to the social, political, and historical construction of childhood. A paradigm shift in childhood studies—recognising children as social actors—has provided important, and often urgently needed, opportunities for consultations with children. In a welfarist/protectionist approach to work with children, teachers and social workers are ascribed responsibility for children's welfare without any requirement that they consult with children about their lives (Christensen & Prout, 2002). Conversely, the new sociology of childhood has prompted a significant shift in how

children are regarded as participants in research processes. Situated in this paradigm, children are seen as active participants in the co-production of research.

Mitchell's (2006) engagement in participatory methodologies with young people affected by HIV/AIDS in two townships in the Western Cape of South Africa points to the critical role that children and youth play as activists in many contexts, and in this case, specifically in regards to HIV education and prevention initiatives. A group of young writers produced 90 pieces of writing compiled in an anthology: *In my life: youth stories and poems on HIV/AIDS,* which was later circulated in other districts and provinces of South Africa. Their narratives are poignant and wise, eliciting empathy against the backdrop of social prejudice. The emotional resonance of these documented experiences undoubtedly contributes to diminishing the social isolation experienced by other young people undergoing similar difficulties. More broadly, this work has the potential to induce policy reforms responding to the varied needs and concerns articulated by those who are directly impacted by the pandemic. As Mitchell observes:

> The *In my life* stories demonstrate that there are new stories to be told for and by young people in South Africa today, ones that are almost beyond the imagination of many adults currently writing fiction for young adults who did not themselves grow up in the age of AIDS. (p. 362)

Other studies have explored the significant impact of visual and participatory methodologies with young people, particularly in response to gender-based violence, both in terms of respecting the capabilities and agency of children and youth, as well as wider policy implications and social change (Mitchell, Moletsane, Stuart, Buthelezi & de Lange, 2005; Mitchell, Walsh & Moletsane, 2006). While these studies are grounded in very specific social and political contexts, the insight and emotional resonance of such work by young people can strengthen grassroots mobilizations and induce policy reforms, inspiring work in other contexts.

Methodological approaches in studies of childhood and migration

The Ottawa Community Immigrant Services Organization recognized that the experiences of immigrant and refugee children, including asymmetrical power relations,

the nuances of cultural differences and curricular issues, were not adequately supported in schools (Beglari & Thai, 2000). The Multicultural Liaison Officer (MLO) program was launched in 1991, a partnership between OCISO and the Ottawa School Board, and aims to find resources for refugee children and families (Vargas, 1999; Irving and Vargas, 2000). Vargas (1999) so perceptively states: "As MLOs themselves endured anomie, a dramatic change in status or loss of prestige, or a loss of professional opportunities upon their arrival, they now reach out to others" (p. 36). There are many important components of the MLO program, but one that stands out is the recognition of children as capable teachers. Children volunteer to be teachers, and have developed language arts curriculum, teaching their first language in 20-minute lessons for 10-week sessions. Vargas (1999) describes how the children have built portfolios of their own educational materials in order to teach language in the context of storytelling.

Studies of child policy frameworks, migration policies, and community planning also need to consider the role that children play in their families' settlement processes as shown by Chavez and Menjívar (2010), Frater-Mathieson (2004), Hamilton and Moore (2004), Orellana (2009), Orellana, Thorne, Chee and Lam (2001), Suárez-Orozco and Suárez-Orozco (2001). In their comparative study of children of immigration through the Harvard Immigration Project, Suárez-Orozco and Suárez-Orozco (2001) employed the following methodologies: structured questionnaires of children, their parents, and teachers, ethnographic fieldwork in their schools and communities, and psychological and narrative techniques. As they note: "we advocate ethnographic work in conjunction with structured questionnaires…Ethnographic observations sensitize us to the power of social context in shaping the lives of immigrant children" (p. 11). Suárez-Orozco and Suárez-Orozco (2001) also raise questions around the extent to which generalizations can be made from a handful of children. However, they intended to highlight issues of children's agency, consciousness and empowerment in order to shift the thinking of practitioners working with children in school and health care settings and social agencies. Additionally, Suárez-Orozco and Suárez-Orozco (2001) intended to engage with scholars in immigration studies, cultural psychology and anthropology. Concerns pertaining to injustices around undocumented children, and their families, are also taken up in the

study by Suárez-Orozco and Suárez-Orozco (2001). As discussed in other studies, threats of deportation, and deplorable and exploitative work conditions for parents often result in contexts of distrust; undocumented children understandably remain cautious and guarded in the presence of teachers, medical practitioners and other authority figures. This ethical concern has been raised in research with adults and must be carefully considered in relation to children whose particular social locations can lead to intensified oppression and vulnerability.

Frater-Mathieson (2004) point out that adults who work with young children, who have recently experienced forced migration, are often under the mistaken impression that children are too young to understand the implications of migration, that their trauma will be short-lived and that children are inherently resilient. As Frater-Mathieson explains:

> If trauma and loss symptoms are therefore recorded without taking into account a more complete understanding of relevant cultural, mental and spiritual phenomena, then the assessment is divorced from the reality of the individual's or family's experience and its validity can be questionable. (p. 25)

In reviewing international literature on refugee studies, Hamilton and Moore (2004) identify a number of issues – social, medical, political, linguistic and educational – affecting adults but conclude that there is very little research specifically addressing the experiences of children and even less on the educational experiences of refugee children. Chavez and Menjívar (2010) analyze the many facets of children's migration, focusing on the experiences of unaccompanied Mexican and Central American children. They consider migration processes (initiation, transit, arrival and integration), institutions (shelters and detention centers) and the local, national and international laws impacting on unaccompanied children. An unaccompanied minor is defined as "a child under the age of 18 years who enters another country alone (and without a legal guardian) and who is undocumented or without proper documentation" (p. 73). There is a need for more research on children's actions, experiences, feelings and perceptions, particularly in terms of their role in settlement processes and participation in decision-making processes around migration (Orellana, 2009; Orellana, Thorne, Chee, & Lam, 2001).

Detention, deportation and criminalization: Research in an adverse migration context

In addition to the grave risks incurred by people whose immigration status is uncertain and who fear increasingly aggressive state practices towards migrants, there is also concern around psychological distress resulting from harsh working and living conditions (Düvell, Triandafyllidou, & Vollmer, 2008). In some cases, enforcement agencies shifted their priorities based on results from studies conducted on irregular migration (even when the researchers' intent was ideologically opposed to restrictive and aggressive state practices); additionally, university ethics committees feared that research records would be subpoenaed by immigration enforcement authorities (Bernhard & Young, 2009; Düvell, Triandafyllidou, & Vollmer, 2008). Thus, sensitivity, vulnerability and risks are serious concerns in irregular migration research.

Martin (2011) interrogates the criminalization of immigration in the U.S. context and how these narratives of 'national security' and practices of detention shape children's legal subjectivity. Her analysis of specific court cases in the U.S., and tensions between immigration and family law, draws on studies from feminist political geographers in critiquing institutional practices. She questions the construction of children's vulnerability, which contrasts with the criminalization of their parents in exclusionary immigration regimes. Inverted relations of dependency, imposed on families through practices of immigration detention, also cause parental depression, and anxiety in their children. As Martin (2010) observes: "Parents' narratives of frustrated care figured, therefore, a range of actors with variegated obligations under immigration law and a wider political economy of deferred responsibility…" (p. 488). There are tensions around depictions of adults and children's migratory experiences as Martin (2010) argues: "Their mobility defines their legal status, as child-objects are presumed to be apolitical, inert and silent, while migrant-subjects are highly politicized, self-conscious actors willfully choosing to violate legal boundaries" (p. 491). In problematizing the ways in which immigration law creates a dichotomy between 'child-objects' and 'migrant-subjects', Martin (2010) points to gaps and inconsistencies within legal frameworks in which injustices such as policing, detention and deportation practices can be contested and condemned.

Drawing on Bourdieu's theories on temporality and subjectivity, in a study of children's experiences in Danish asylum centres, Vitus (2010) engaged in five months of fieldwork. She met with the children at the asylum school located in the reception/detention centre and the accommodation centre for people with mental health struggles. The majority of the children had been living in asylum centres for 2-8 years; for many, this would be most of their 'childhood'. Since the children who participated in the study were all fluent in Danish they were able to articulate their thoughts and emotions regarding their experiences and daily life in the asylum centres. Understandably, there was some apprehension in terms of the role that Vitus had, as the children had ambivalent or difficult feelings towards asylum authorities, the police, journalists and political representatives. Establishing trust was essential and Vitus concludes on a bleak note as most of the children's futures are very much compromised, at best, and in peril, at worst. As she explains: "The future is fundamentally insecure… The future loses its role as a point of reference for what the children are and what they will become" (p. 40). She also notes that parental depression, induced by conditions in detention, contributed considerably to the anxiety or despair experienced by the children with whom she spoke. Speaking about the importance of participatory research with children in difficult circumstances, Pain (2010) similarly reflects on "young people's pivotal and complex position in relation to older people's emotional landscapes" (p. 223).

While the conditions of the political economy, security discourses, and criminalization of migration, are profoundly worrisome, Basok (2008; 2009) points to opportunities for contestation and resistance. Through several interviews with migrant rights activists in Canada, the United States, and Costa Rica, as well as media-based research on advocacy on migrants' rights, Basok (2008) argues that many mobilizations, comprising non-status migrants, union members, social workers and activists, are able to secure social rights for people living with precarious status, and that grassroots organizing could induce policy reforms. Similarly, Hanley and Shragge (2009) grapple with the tensions and opportunities that arise in sustained grassroots responses to policy exclusions.

In a comparative study of undocumented migrants and state authorities in Berlin,

Montreal and Paris, Monforte and Dufour (2011) analyze the different strategies and tactics of mobilizations, arguing that these will be shaped by particular forms of legal, economic, and social exclusion. Non-status migrants show courage, resilience and agency in their mobilizations and they do so in the context of fluctuating political climates. What is essential is to understand how these grassroots mobilizations induce policy reforms, as Monforte and Dufour (2011) observe:

> Paradoxically, this situation of legal exclusion is also a situation of great dependence on the state: the state alone has the power to legalize their situation and integrate them into the territory's political community or, conversely, to deport them. The question of citizenship is thus at the heart of the undocumented migrant's life. (p. 206)

Conclusion

> If methodologists insist that being "too close/involved/emotional" is a bias, but "too far/disengaged/rational" – in the face of injustice – is not, to what extent have we fundamentally clouded our theoretical and empirical insights? Is it not particularly problematic in the study of oppression that we have, in fact, widened the space between "expertise" and "experience?" (Fine, 2006, p. 95)

Fine (2006) articulates critically important questions in relation to what motivates researchers, particularly in their engagement in studies for social justice. Participatory approaches to research require commitment, trust, and the time necessary for both. The review of the literature on researching displacement demonstrates that participatory studies can be constrained by limited funding or time, as well as language barriers due to inadequate translations/lack of qualified interpreters. Researchers able to facilitate more equitable relations in studies with new immigrants, and refugees, drew from years of experience in social work, community organizing, and activism. It is also essential that all researchers respect the credentials and skills of people experiencing forced displacement who have also likely endured the loss of professional opportunities.

Simich, Wu and Nerad (2007) collaborated with experienced researchers from a community health centre that already had established trust with undocumented migrants, after more than 15 years of experience in programming (the community health center is also recognized for more collaborative approaches to decision-making). They were also able to engage community health workers who spoke the same language as the research participants. While the study was designed by the team of researchers, it seems clear that the motivation was to hear directly from people with precarious immigration histories in order to restore justice in access to social rights such as health care. Pashang (2011) also worked for twenty years as a front-line social worker and migrant justice activist before beginning her doctoral research on the resistance, struggles, and survival of non-status women in Toronto.

There are many ethical concerns in research processes with children (particularly children who have experienced violence, displacement, and discrimination). Many studies raised the concern of establishing trust with children who felt apprehensive around adults they did not know; this apprehension was likely attributable to negative experiences with immigration authorities and/or the fear of being unable to secure refugee status or of detention and deportation. Questions around informed consent are also important to address in terms of children being supported in withdrawing from studies or in requesting omissions in their research transcripts. The dissemination of research also requires sensitivity and equitable relations; it is rare that children are engaged at this stage of a study.

Given these ethical concerns, participatory research with refugee, immigrant, and precarious status children was not possible for this study. The periods of serious illness which coincided with doctoral research seemed like a weak foundation for participatory research and I worried about the possible outcomes for children struggling against social injustices who might be adversely affected by someone they could perceive to be unreliable. This conflicted stance on how to tackle questions regarding immigration injustice in the context of shifts towards neoliberalism over the past twenty years brought up different intersecting themes around conceptions of childhood, as discussed in Chapter One. Policy consensus across social and political structures has intensified social

inequality with particularly negative material consequences for children. These sociopolitical changes have paralleled ideological realignments reflected in patterns of news coverage. Media discourse is an important site of critique. Social perceptions of migration processes may be shaped by negative media depictions, inflected with notions of moral and legal transgressions. The contradictory reality of economic and social disparities is often obscured within the sphere of mainstream politics, including media discourse.

Chapter 4:

Methodological approaches to the analysis of media discourse, migration and social policy

> The intellectual's error consists in believing that one can know without understanding and even more without feeling and being impassioned. (Gramsci, 1971, p. 418)

Introduction

As discussed in Chapter Three, there are several important studies that have been built from the social agency of new immigrant and refugee children, and there is a sense of political urgency in this research as the violent displacement of more and more people is widely regarded with a steady indifference. A key question arising from the interplay of media and political discourse centres on representations of children. While children play an important role in contesting social injustices, their political subjectivity and views on social adversity are often on the margins of political discourse (Aitken, 2001; Alldred, 1998; Bosco, 2010; Boyden, 1997, 2009; Canella, 1997; Canella & Viruru, 2004; Emberly, 2009; Ennew, 2000; Gosine, 2007; Granados, 2010; Hurley, 2011; James & Prout, 1997; James, Jenks & Prout, 1998; Jeffrey, 2011; Katz, 2004; Liebel, 2008; Luttrell, 2013; Mitchell, Walsh & Moletsane, 2006; Stephens 1994, 1995, 1997). This exclusion is another source of ethical conflict linked with (sometimes) marginally informed newspaper readerships. The gap in the literature on refugee, immigrant and precarious status children and media discourse indicated a need for close analysis of media representations. This analysis can help render explicit processes of social exclusion, and the ways in which these processes are obscured in dominant narratives. The policy and practice implications distilled from this analysis can connect with future participatory research with refugee, immigrant, and precarious status children, as discussed in Chapter Eight.

In her cogent essay on Gramsci's contributions to methodology, Jubas (2010) refers to "the unavoidable implication of the researcher in the research" (p. 231) and the importance of "systematic, rigorous procedures, conceptual clarity, attention to the historical development of material relations and to the cultural ideologies which maintain and reflect those relations, and an appreciation of the limits of any methodology or study" (p. 236). Gramsci's (1971) concept of hegemony adds an important dimension to contemporary debates about educational theory and practice. Schools and media are ideological institutions and hegemony reproduced through processes of education and communication. Journalism is deeply embedded within ideology and hegemony (Carpentier & Cammaerts, 2006). Similarly, Linda Tuhiwai Smith (1999, 2012) has argued that the media, official histories, and school curricula all play a role in sustaining relations of imperialism. As Grace-Edward Galabuzi (2011) asserts: "An important aspect of Gramscian analysis is the need to historicize – to locate the process under review in its proper historical context" (p. 60).

This chapter will explicate the methodological approach and research methods of the study used to analyze Canadian media discourses (especially newspapers) representing new immigrant and refugee children in Ontario in the historical period of 1989-2009. In doing so, I have drawn on van Dijk's approach to Critical Discourse Analysis (1988, 1991, 1992, 1993, 1996, 1997, 2006) in conjunction with Frames Theory and Analysis (Entman, 1993, 2003, 2004; Entman, & Rojecki, 1993; Goffman, 1974; Smolash, 2011). The chapter is divided into two sections: the first section will address social policy, media and political discourse, and human rights reporting, followed by a review of methodological approaches to media discourse and migration. The second section will describe the research methods, study design, as well as the strengths and limitations of this methodology.

Section One:

Social Policy, Media and Political Discourse

Both historical and contemporary studies have analyzed points of concern in the interplay between print media and political discourse. Many of these studies have drawn

on disparate theories and methods in order to identify the social policy implications of media discourse (Brindle, 1999; Corrigan, Watson, Gracia, Slopen, Rasinski, Hall, 2005; Duncan, Edwards & Song, 1999; Evans & Swift, 2000; Falk, 1994; Franklin, 1999; Jeffs, 1999; Mirchandani & Chan, 2007; Olstead, 2002; Platt, 1999; Wahl, 2003; West, 1999). It has been argued that public opinion and policy prescriptions are shaped by media coverage (Franklin, 1999). As Franklin (1999) astutely states: it is essential to consider the "complex interrelationships between news media, news sources, the content of media coverage of social policy and its impact on audiences and policy makers" (p. 8). Structures of power have been critiqued by examining the relationship between journalists and politicians, and politicians as both news subjects and news sources (Taras, 1990).

Journalism is implicated in sustaining hegemony through the values of objectivity, neutrality, and detachment, which reflect the vantage points of powerful social groups (Carpentier & Cammaerts, 2006). As Knight (1998) observes: "The effects of political economy on news are always mediated by journalistic practices and ideologies, the logistics of source relations, and the modes of address by means of which audiences are inscribed into the news text" (p. 119). Counter-hegemonic processes can take shape through alternative journalistic projects such as peace journalism (Hackett, 1991, 2000, 2010), public journalism, new journalism and human-interest journalism (Carpentier & Cammaerts, 2006; Carpentier & De Cleen, 2007).

Gramsci's concept of hegemony, and how it is sustained by the state as Basok (1996) and others point out, is critical to an analysis of political and media discourse:

> As Gramsci argues, however, the state's maintenance of hegemony involves taking systematic account of popular interests and demands, shifting positions and making compromises on secondary issues to maintain support and alliances in an inherently unstable and fragile system of political relations. In all of this, however, the state does not sacrifice its essential interests, and organizes this support in order to attain national goals which serve the fundamental long-run interests of the dominant group. (p. 135)

The privileging of elite sources has historically been a central aspect of journalism (van Dijk, 1991; Hackett, 2010). Newspapers developed in Canada during the eighteenth century and were funded and controlled by colonial authorities (Taras, 1990). New infrastructure and technologies (e.g. the steam-powered rotary printing press) led to increasing urbanization and literacy for settlers in the period between 1812 and confederation, followed by the popular press and the daily newspaper (Taras, 1990). Newspapers had a strong partisan-orientation from confederation until the First World War (Taras, 1990; Hackett, 2010) and were the "principal vehicle of propaganda, communication, and campaigning" (Taras, 1990, p. 43). Revenue for print journalism shifted from readership sales and political subsidies to advertising over a century ago, and consequently the content of newspapers reflected these changes (Hackett, Gruneau, Gutstein, Gibson & News Watch Canada, 2000).

Thobani (2003) analyzes Benedict Anderson's (1983) argument that the "imagined community" of the nation was historically shaped by elites through their access to print media as the medium emerged and developed. In this way socio-political elites could define the "national interest". As Thobani (2003) powerfully articulates:

> If anything, the role of the media has become even more critical to processes of nation-building in the second half of the twentieth century, and most especially during times of war. Elite ideas are widely disseminated and popularized through the media, and during times of war, being able to hold onto the allegiances of populations can be crucial to the success of the global ambitions of national elites. The controversy regarding the speech [Thobani's speech of 2001 is discussed in Chapter Seven] became one such instance of elites seeking to forge a "national" consensus in support of the war. (p. 404)

Similarly, Cottle (2009) argues that global crises continue to be framed according to the continuing "pull of the national" interests and identities. The corporate hegemony model of media analysis advances the argument that dissenting views challenging the state or capitalism are typically characterized as "radical" or "fringe" elements (Gitlin 1980/2003, Herman & Chomsky 1988; Earl, Martin, McCarthy & Soule, 2004). While the messages of social movements are intended to generate action, these substantive

issues are often sidestepped by some journalists' narrow focus on confrontational aspects of dissent, such as the stereotypical window-smashing protestor (Cottle, 2008; Stoddart, Ramos & Tindall, 2013). At the same time, news media coverage of social issues may resonate with a wider audience who may not otherwise turn to social-movement produced materials (Stoddart, Ramos & Tindall, 2013).

Neoliberalism has had an immense impact on the global communications sector through processes of conglomeration and concentration, technological convergence, globalization and deregulation (Shade & Lithgrow, 2009). Drawing from the research of Herman and McChesney (1997), Hackett (2000, 2010) raises similar concerns about the convergence of media sectors, corporate consolidation, and concentration of media ownership manifest in the shrinking number and parallel expansion of transnational multi-media conglomerates.

While contemporary print journalism in Canada is aligned with readerships of differing political stripes, the accelerated concentration of media ownership has arguably lent strong ideological support to a neoliberal agenda (Hackett & Uzelman, 2003, Winter, 1997), and a "right-wing information infrastructure" (Taras, 2001, pp. 210-8, cited in Hackett & Uzelman, 2003, p.332). Newspaper ownership is more concentrated in Canada than it is in the U.S. (Taras, 1990; Shade & Lithgrow, 2009; 2010). Political influence is discernible in the role of corporate-funded policy institutes (such as the C.D. Howe and Fraser Institutes in Canada) as news sources as well as the ties of governments and political parties to corporate elites (Hackett & Uzelman, 2003; Shoemaker & Reese, 1996). As Knight (1998) argues, the New Right in Canada have supported their own "organic" intellectuals in think tanks such as the C.D. Howe Institute and the Fraser Institute. The Fraser Institute initiated its own media watchdog agency called the National Media Archive which publishes newsletters expressing concern over leftist bias in the media (Knight, 1998). They also access the media through spokespeople who represent the corporate-funded think tank's views and policy recommendations (Knight, 1998).

There is empirical research to support the argument that left-wing policy institutes such as the Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, Canadian Labour Congress,

Canadian Council on Social Development, Caledon Institute on Social Policy and North South Institute are cited as credible news sources disproportionately less than their right-wing counterparts (Hackett & Uzelman, 2003). There is certainly discord and fragmentation among the Left in Canada and one might argue that the position of Canadian left-wing policy institutes has not advanced migrant justice campaigns. The point I am making is that the disproportionate coverage of New Right policy recommendations does indicate that the wider public has less exposure to diverse viewpoints in the daily press. Newspaper content is influenced by advertising and pressure to sidestep any sustained critiques of industries on which media are dependent for their revenue, as Hackett and Uzelman (2003) observe: "advertising influences the very architecture of the paper" (p. 338). Consequently, the parameters for public debate may be disproportionately influenced by the interests of private capital (Hackett & Uzelman, 2003).

An observation by Bradimore and Bauder (2011) makes the connection between political and media discourse: "The media are inseparable from the political process. If media and political debates rely mostly on each other for information and knowledge, they then establish a closed discursive circle that silences dissent and stifles oppositional intervention" (p. 36). Persistent exposure to certain viewpoints can cement an established way of thinking. Neoconservative news media such as the *Toronto Sun* have successfully persuaded many working-class union members to elect conservative or liberal governments, governments that are not aligned with working-class and union interests (Winter, 1997).

Journalism in Western capitalist states, as Hackett (2010) points out, is currently facing "crises of legitimacy, institutional identity, and economic viability" (p. 179). Since the mid-1990s, the influence over editorial content has arguably shifted from editors to proprietors of newspapers (Franklin, 1999; Greenslade, 2005), and considering the concentration of media ownership in Canada, such a development can have alarming consequences for social policy. Both editors and proprietors of newspapers are driven by commercial imperatives while many editors and journalists divert attention to the media's public service ethic (Greenslade, 2005).

"World news ecology" is a framework describing changing communication structures which comprise traditional mainstream and alternative news media, as well as new technologies (such as electronic communication and internet sites) which disseminate news and allow for the public to generate content. As Cottle (2009) writes: "Its underpinning political economy, ownership structures, and leading news agencies and 24/7 global news services grant continuing dominance to Western media corporations, interests, and agendas, but today's world news ecology is complexly structured nonetheless" (p. 496). Mainstream journalism organizations and news outlets still hold considerable influence over the dissemination of news, setting the agenda and maintaining editorial control, although independent journalism is increasingly recognized and accessible through new technologies (Cottle, 2008, 2009). News organizations continue to influence the construction of social problems throught the selection of events to report and who to cite as sources to interpret these events; the final news product is pieced together and disseminated which these framings of social problems (Greenberg & Hier, 2001).

The comments section that follows online news sources (anonymous postings by readers) referred to as online reader commentary (Park, 2013), is increasingly regarded as an important source of data for media analysis. Playing a similar role as the traditional letter to the editor, online reader commentary sparks more immediate and interactive public debate. Both Park (2013) and Di Tomasso (2012) have examined the online reader commentary published on the Canadian Broadcasting Company (CBC) news website in order to analyse the construction of migration as a social problem. Interestingly, as Di Tomasso (2012) points out, the CBC claims to exclude hateful or offensive speech on its site and yet, as shown in these studies, many of the xenophobic and racist online reader comments attacking im/migrants can be precisely characterized as hateful and offensive. The Canadian media have also been sites of contestation in which ideologically-inflected stories unjustly misrepresent reality with offensive and recycled stereotypes of racialized Canadian-born citizens (Fleras & Kunz, 2001; Henry and Tator, 2002, 2005, 2006). These depictions have also been politically consequential

resulting in heightened xenophobia and racism, in addition to influencing public opinion and policy-making (Galabuzi, 2006).

Human Rights Reporting

A study of *New York Times* coverage of political terror and violence covers two periods (the years 1985 and 1995 but not the intervening years) and concludes that there was a decrease in reporting of human rights violations between these two periods (Caliendo, Gibney & Payne, 1999). In some cases there were significant discrepancies between human rights abuses documented by Amnesty International and the *New York Times* reporting on this political violence. The coverage in 1995 was often cursory and rarely appeared on the first page of the paper. The study's research findings supported the hypothesis that Cold War politics have shaped press coverage with geopolitically significant countries receiving more media attention in 1985 and decreasing coverage a few years after the end of the Cold War in 1995 (Caliendo, Gibney & Payne, 1999).

The depth and complexity of analysis has also been lacking. As Caliendo, Gibney and Payne (1999) observe: "if the media are apt to pick up on a "human-rights story," it will generally be in the form of X number of deaths from some discrete event. What this also means is that more systematic forms of human-rights abuses will be ignored" (p. 64). In addition to shifting geopolitics following the Cold War resulting in disinterest in previous strategic attention to conflicts, the "market model" of journalism has also been listed as a concern in terms of editorial decisions on human rights reporting resulting in fewer stories published even when journalists are consistently writing about human rights abuses (Caliendo et al., 1999).

Speaking about war and political violence reported in the news, Cottle (2009) raises concerns about the implications of characterizing military intervention as "military humanism" associated with altruistic/humanitarian motives. Such gross distortions seek to obscure military and state objectives as well as the unevenness of global power. Chimni (2000) also raises grave concerns over the discourse of humanitarianism concealing foreign policy objectives. As Cottle (2008) observes:

> The end of the Cold War and the beginning of a new one, the 'global war on terror', has also produced a new world order in which geo-political interests and outlooks have shifted and where news reporting of demonstrations taking place in different parts of the world may also have changed correspondingly – whether through patterns of news selection or editorial inflection. (p. 855)

A study of the country reporting on human rights by Amnesty International between 1986-2000 alongside interviews with Amnesty and Human Rights Watch staff addresses the question of whether reporting is influenced by considerations other than a transnational activist agenda (Ron, Ramos & Rodgers, 2005). The study concludes that Amnesty's reporting on human rights is influenced by state power, U.S. military aid, and a country's media profile. In order to further an advocacy agenda and shape international standards, and due to resource constraints in some cases, the organization chooses to report on some countries more than others. The background reports are influenced by U.S. military aid and their press releases are shaped by a relationship with major Northern media sources. Amnesty International and other transnational NGOs have a critical role in exposing horrific abuses such as torture, and have, in many cases, advanced claims for legal redress (Ron, Ramos & Rodgers, 2005). Additionally, the incorporation of social and economic rights into their mandate is significant and can connect with other campaigns for social and economic justice. But it is important to acknowledge the constraints and political compromises of transnational NGOs and their relationships with both Northern and Southern media sources (Ron et al., 2005).

Media exposure of human rights abuses is linked to refugee policies in countries of reception. A lack of reporting on human rights abuses may be connected with a lack of empathy for people displaced by political violence. Amnesty International consistently documented and contextualized years of civil war in Sri Lanka. Diasporic and activist communities have also brought significant attention to the fears and political violence endured by countless people, as well as the loss of lives. One would assume that the general public in Canada would have some awareness of a violent conflict which has taken place for many years (even if the complex global political and economic

relationships in an interdependent world are less fully understood) and yet the arrival of boats of Tamil migrants on Canadian shores elicited widespread hostility and resentment (Bradimore, & Bauder, 2011; Philipupillai, 2013). Additionally, rather than responding with empathy and solidarity to the exigent circumstances of people who have endured such suffering, politicians opportunistically turned to the media to characterize such claims as 'bogus' and 'taking advantage' of Canadian 'generosity' (Bradimore, & Bauder, 2011; Philipupillai, 2013).

Discourse analysis has been used to critically examine issues of framing, representation and identity in print media representations (in the *Vancouver Sun*, the *Toronto Star*, and the *National Post*) of the arrival of seventy-six Tamil refugees off the coast of Victoria, British Columbia on October 17, 2009 (Bradimore & Bauder, 2011). Tamil refugees were constructed as 'bogus claimants' who were 'abusing' the 'failing' immigration system. Such depictions set up a policy context in which the refugee reform Bill C-11 could be pushed through parliament; Bill C-11 would provide the scaffolding for even more exclusionary refugee policies soon after as more boats arrived in in the subsequent years (Bradimore & Bauder, 2011; Di Tomasso, 2012; Philipupillai, 2013).

Methodological approaches to media discourse and migration

Through an exploration of visual representations of refugees in Western media, Wright (2002) addresses several tensions between the ability to create new political discourses through the use of visual images, and the greater likelihood that visual representations reproduce simplistic notions of displacement because of institutional and social constraints to which journalists conform. He draws on research from visual anthropology as well as media and journalism studies to respond to the questions he raises regarding the concept of 'the refugee', media interventions, and public opinion. Specifically, his analysis is concerned with cultural traditions shaping media representations of forced migration, including historical archetypes rooted in Christian iconography (for instance, the "Madonna and Child" as an image to evoke sympathy). As Wright (2002) states, Malkki (1995a) also raises questions about visual representations of refugees and "the perennial resonance of the woman with her child.

This is not just any woman; she is composed as an almost madonnalike figure" (p. 11). Nyers (1999) also raises concerns about flattened, de-historicized representations of refugees and asks: "Why would a photograph chosen to illuminate the challenges of defending refugee rights present an anonymous, two-dimensional outline of a child's human form?" (p. 19). In responding to this question, Nyers (1999) references a perspective from Liisa Malkki (1996) who writes: "the visual prominence of women and children as embodiments of refugeeness has to do not just with the fact that most refugees are women and children, but with the institutional, international expectation of certain kind of *helplessness* as a refugee characteristic" (Malkki, cited in Nyers, 1999, p. 19).

The image of mother with child has also been an important feature of international aid campaigns, a feature requiring critical perspectives, as Burman (1994) argues. In order to critique the colonial paternalism expressed through disaster relief and other aid campaigning, Burman (1994) draws on Said's (1981, 1994) analysis of Orientalism (in particular media representations and the hegemony of the West). She addresses tensions in international organizations' campaigning which rely on a dynamic of 'Otherness' in order to elicit sympathy. Given global economic disparities in wealth and power, international organizations in need of funding are presented with ethical dilemmas: decontextualized media representations of children reproduce relations of paternalism between the North and South and reinforce cultural chauvinism. Yet, these campaigns generate important sources of funding for disaster relief and aid projects. As Burman (1994) argues, such relations of paternalism need to be dismantled and rebuilt according to principles of social equity.

A parallel emphasis on the narrative structures of fictional film genres, which depict refugee experiences, further illuminates tensions between emotional resonance, cultural values and norms, and political discourses (Wright, 2002). On the one hand, emotional responses to the suffering of people displaced may influence public opinion which can contribute to policy changes. On the other hand, there is also the risk (and strong tendency) of media representations simplifying complex processes and reinforcing dominant political and social agendas. Wright (2002) argues that the genre of the "migrant movie", which draws from the cultural traditions of other storytelling mediums,

may contextualize experiences of forced migration and generate empathy in ways that news reports and documentary film cannot because of aforementioned social and institutional constraints. Similarly, Gilbert (2005) analyzes three examples of immigration and refugee movies, political activism movies, and social critique movies (*El Norte,* 1983; *The City La Ciudad,* 1999; *Bread and Roses,* 2000; and *Tar Angel/L'Ange du goudron*, 2001), which offer perspectives on urban injustices deriving from neoliberalism and experiences of displacement. These are films in which the protagonists are people who have been displaced by political violence and economic precarity, and their social agency is exercised against enormous odds.

Emotional responses to media narratives are critiqued by Hurley (2011) who writes: "the mass media can have a decisive role in the ordering and valancing of public fears" (p. 198). Emotional resonance is critical to campaigns for immigration justice. Media and political discourse which draw a distinction between 'real refugees' and 'bogus refugees' ignite emotional responses such as fear and resentment, which obstruct an understanding of the causes of displacement as well as the suffering endured. The consensus among several studies is that shifts in public opinion can quickly result in and shape the implementation of new migration legislation (Chavez, 2001; Cook, 2010; Coutin, 2005; Schuster, 2002; Verkuyten, 2004). Cook (2010) points to the ways in which migration policy debates pivot around notions of legality, security, cultural and economic threat; these issues carry emotional resonance and are powerful in advancing political arguments. Anti-immigrant views (reflecting the economic interests of socio-political elites) disseminated through 'moral panics' in U.S. media have led to changes to immigration law (Chavez, 2001; Coutin, 2005). Key studies have also examined the relationship between representations of immigrants in Canadian print media and the shaping of public opinion (Mahtani & Mountz, 2002).

Another useful avenue of research has focused on narrative as a component of news-making (Greenberg, 2004; Knight, 2001; Smolash, 2009, 2011). As Greenberg (2004) notes: "journalists trade in both the assembling of facts and construction of stories" (p. 365). The construction of narratives involves piecing together particular events taken from a temporal sequence and putting them into a frame (Knight, 2001).

The structure of news narratives typically parallels elements of fictional narratives, for example: conflict and confrontation, suspense and curiosity, and pivotal turning points (Knight, 1998). Similarly, Greenberg and Hier (2001) argue that news articles have a stronger ideological impact when readers can connect with the emotional impact of a narrative. They point to the importance of critical media analysis in identifiying themes that are culturally and politically resonant in order to understand and challenge the implications of dominant constructions of social issues.

Hurley (2011) has innovatively analyzed media and literary narratives in relationship to a wider set of political practices. In particular, her work focuses on youth who have endured grave injustices, political and interpersonal violence, and whose perspectives are often pushed to the margins of political and media discourses. As she explains: "Because the representational and discursive impinge on and affect the subjectivities and experiences of those who are the objects of news reporting, my coupling of media and literary analysis with actual cases is ultimately a necessary one" (p. 149).

Similar innovative methodological approaches such as those employed by Smolash (2009, 2011) draw on literary analysis, approaching newspaper stories as narrative, to expose rhetorical patterns in both mediums which lend support to hegemonic political discourse. The fictional narratives of literary canons serve a similar ideological function as media narratives particularly in relation to nationalism and the reproduction of social hierarchies. A common thread in studies of media representations of war, displacement, and 'national security' points to the problematic use of Eurocentric literary references and cultural traditions (Jiwani, 2005a; Malkki, 1995a; Smolash, 2009, 2011; Wells, 2007; Wright, 2002). As will be discussed in greater detail in Chapter Seven, such references are problematic in the sense that they are often ideologically and racially-inflected and tend to eclipse critical analysis of Western complicity in manifestations of violence in a number of contexts.

Literature can contribute to the building blocks of people's beliefs by tapping into strong feelings. Gramsci's (1971) concept of *feeling-passion* is useful to understand knowledge production and hegemony. As Jubas (2010) observes: "[Gramsci] never loses

sight of the role of culture in both informal learning and the politics of social life; nor does he abandon an analysis of social and material structures" (p. 233).

Literature enters the political arena in powerful ways. When the former immigration minister introduced Bill C-86 in 1992, a measure which would pave the way for increasingly exclusionary immigration and refugee policies, he quoted from neo-conservative Neil Bissoondath, a writer of Indo-Trinidadian origin "for whom anti-racist initiatives such as employment equity or culturally specific strategies all lead to embracing narrow tribal and regressive identities" (Razack, 1999b, p. 179). As Razack argues, the Minister's choice of Bissoondath's writing to begin and end the presentation on Bill C-86 set the parameters for Canadian nationalism and defined the 'good immigrant', deflecting attention from the many injustices deriving from racism, colonialism and neoliberalism. The 'national story' is significant for policy-making. Razack's analysis draws on Toni Morrison's (1992) study of American literature and the ways in which national myths construct 'white heroes' and erase racialized violence and exclusion. Morrison's work also connects with Edward Said's (1993) reflections on the novel developing in relation to imperialism, as Razack argues, noting the relationship "between politicians and writers who share the same national dream" (Razack, 1999b, p.179). Further, as Razack (1999b) astutely states: "The law is a powerful place from which to articulate national dreams" (p. 173). Features of storytelling from literary texts are not only seen in print journalism but also in policy and law. As Sevenhuijsen (1998) eloquently states:

> Policy texts and legal texts are, after all, 'stories in themselves': they include patterns of dealing with things which are often the result of political compromises and discursive traditions. They often contain fixed patterns of speaking and judging, but they can also open up unexpected discursive spaces, where new forms of thinking and judging can start. (p. 30)

Another important implication of storytelling in media texts is that dominant narratives can be a blueprint for migration policy-making. Pratt and Valverde (2002) argue that analysis of news reports can facilitate an understanding of the ideological underpinnings of migration policy reforms. Their reference to opinion polls and surveys

is significant in terms of thinking about the interplay between media discourse and public opinion against the backdrop of economic and social disparities. While this thesis does not focus on reader responses to media discourse, the next section on studies of refugee discourses in the media within the discipline of social psychology points to the influence of media discourse on public opinion. In particular, theories from social psychology are relevant to my critique of media narratives pertaining to neoliberalism, nationalism and perceptions of threat discussed in the next three chapters. The theories summarized below also parallel Hage's (2000) analysis of *practical nationality* and *governmental belonging* drawing on Bourdieu's concept of *cultural capital*, as discussed in the theoretical framework outlined in Chapter Two.

<u>Social psychology and migration policy</u>

The *social dominance orientation* model within the discipline of social psychology identifies individuals' support for hierarchical rather than egalitarian societies (Louis, Duck, Terry, Schuller & Lalonde, 2007). Individuals aligned with *a social dominance orientation* are more likely to hold negative views in regards to immigration, and their perceptions of procedural and distributive fairness function to legitimize their own position of advantage (Louis, Duck, Terry, Schuller & Lalonde, 2007). A longitudinal study in Australia with a community sample of voters in an electoral context concluded that the majority of citizens from advantaged social groups (who participated in the study) supported restrictive refugee policies and harsh treatment when they perceived that their advantaged status was threatened; the hostility of citizens intensified when they perceived that social norms supported such hostility towards refugees (Louis, et al., 2007).

In the Dutch context, studies assessing citizens' emotional responses to refugees have contributed empirical research on the "psychological basis underpinning the support for immigrant policies" (Verkuyten, 2004, p.296), finding associations between these emotions and the degree of support for immigration and refugee policies as well as claims to social services/public assistance, opportunities and rights. A key concern of two studies completed in the Netherlands is on the implications of public definitions of

refugees which have drawn a sharp line between political and 'economic' refugees. *Sympathy* (rather than solidarity or empathy) has been shown by some citizens who view refugees as having no choice over leaving their country. Conversely, the ideological construction of 'economic' refugee (erroneously) attributes responsibility to those displaced. This ideological frame and definition of refugee status lends legitimacy to harsh policies, as Verkuyten (2004) explains: "People tend to react in an irritated and hostile manner to others when they perceive them as personally responsible for their plight" (p. 295). This study also found that people who had a stronger national identification, reacted with more negative emotions such as anger and hostility. In other words, these negative emotions were manifestations of xenophonic anxiety. Additionally, Verkuyten (2004) raises the argument from previous research that political framings of affirmative action programs have negatively shaped attitudes towards immigrants and refugees. A critical point addressed in this study is that framings of refugees as 'real' or 'fraudulent' by the media and political elites have significant implications for public opinion and, consequently, claims to public services, opportunities and rights.

Within the Canadian context, studies from the discipline of social psychology have demonstrated empirically how certain types of people are likely to dehumanize refugees, the implications of the ways in which refugees are routinely depicted by the media, and how emotions are associated with political thinking (Esses, Veenvliet, Hodson & Mihic, 2008; Esses, Medianu & Lawson, 2013). The *social dominance orientation* model (which identifies individuals and groups who support hierarchy and inequality in society) also discussed by Louis et al. (2007) was examined in conjunction with *right-wing authoritarianism* in order to predict the dehumanization of refugees (Esses et al., 2008; Esses et al., 2013). *Social dominance* oriented individuals view the world as a competitive place in which their privileged status is unquestioned, and the unequal distribution of resources and social discrimination can be legitimized (Esses et al., 2008; Esses et al., 2013). *Right-wing authoritarianism* is associated with deference to authority, traditional values (such as conformity for social relations), and aggression against individuals identified by the authorities as transgressing social norms (Esses et al.,

2008; Esses et al., 2013). Measures of *social dominance orientation*, *right-wing authoritarianism*, emotions, attitude and perceptions were consistent with the hypothesis that refugees are dehumanized through erroneous claims that they are violating principles of fairness and justice. For example, the consistent reference to 'bogus refugees' in political and media discourse has implications for the degree of support and respect shown people who have been displaced. One important component of this study involved analysis of participants' responses to a newspaper editorial from 2001, which associated refugees with perceptions of moral transgressions and violations of procedural fairness; this editorial illustrates the media's role in the dehumanization of refugees. The responses to the real editorial were assessed alongside responses to a control condition editorial (which did not dehumanize refugees). As predicted, participants who read the former were more likely to express contempt towards refugees as well as negative views of Canada's refugee policies. Dehumanizing media depictions of refugees that elicit strong emotions have been linked with public attitudes and support for (typically exclusionary) policies and procedures impacting on refugees (Esses et al., 2008).

The same people who are able to institute change in policies and programs that could improve the material and social circumstances of refugees are those most likely to be social dominance-oriented individuals, and the media intensifies the dehumanization of refugees by spotlighting alleged deceit and deception of 'fraudulent' refugee claimants (Esses, Veenvliet, Hodson & Mihic, 2008). While Esses et al. (2008) examined the moral dimension in processes of dehumanization (the ideological construction of moral transgressions which are equated with 'cheating the system') Esses et al. (2013) focus in particular on perceptions of threat. Specifically, their study interrogates media depictions which associate refugees with crisis and threat such as disease, deception/fraudulence, and terrorism, and points to how these depictions are dehumanizing. The assumptions embedded in the perspectives shaped by media depictions function to justify the status quo, particularly for members of dominant groups (Esses et al., 2013). The media plays a significant role in disseminating policy messages as well as eliciting public support for policies (Fleras & Kunz, 2001). Consequently, the emotional and attitudinal responses to negative media depictions of refugees can cement a foundation of support for harsh

policies. This theory was supported by empirical research that assessed participants' responses to fictitious newspaper editorials with dehumanizing depictions of refugees (Esses et al., 2013).

Processes of dehumanizing derail understanding of historical and political processes. As Esses et al. (2008) observe: through processes of dehumanizing other people and social groups "members of dominant groups may more easily convince themselves that they would never end up in the types of situations that these target groups have found themselves in" (p. 22). The kind of thinking which results from hegemonic news-making processes has generated dire outcomes for refugees and im/migrants.

Section Two:

Critical Discourse Analysis

Language is not apolitical or neutral (Fairclough, 2000, 2003, 2009; van Dijk, 1988, 1991, 1996, 1997, 2006; Park & Bhuyan, 2012). Discourse "refers both to the way language systematically organizes concepts, knowledge, and experience and to the ways in which it excludes alternative forms of organization. Thus, the boundaries between language, social action, knowledge and power are blurred" (Finlayson, 1999, p. 62, cited in Park & Bhuyan, 2012, p. 21).

This study draws on the methodological framework of Critical Discourse Analysis (Fairclough, 2000, 2003, 2009; van Dijk, 1988, 1991, 1996, 1997, 2006) with a particular emphasis on the much-cited questions of van Dijk (2001) introduced in Chapter One: "'How do (more) powerful groups control public discourse?', 'How does such discourse control the mind and action of (less) powerful groups, and what are the social consequences of such control, such as social inequality?'" (p. 355).

As observed by Rojo and van Dijk (1997), knowledge is produced by discourses and particular versions of reality are presented which function to shape ideologies and social values. It is important to analyze the relationship between cognition and action (van Dijk, 1992). Cohen (2002b) raises political questions pertaining to the relationship between ideas and action, asking how actions can be different when informed by different

ideas. A key question asks how ideas are shaped. Language is an important element in neoliberal politics (Fairclough, 2000; Bauder, 2008d). Discourse is a sociopolitical act which seeks to legitimize institutional actions and polices which are "typically described as beneficial for the group or society as a whole, whereas morally reprehensible or otherwise controversial actions are ignored, obfuscated or reinterpreted as being acceptable" (Rojo & van Dijk, 1997, p. 528). Critical Discourse Analysis is conceptual and methodological approach to analyzing processes of hegemony, which convince people that there is no other alternative to the status quo (Rojo & van Dijk, 1997).

The denial of racism plays a role in North-South relations, in which dominant groups deny neo-colonialism or imperialism and political self-interest in international aid, while asserting the 'leadership' of Western countries (van Dijk, 1992). The denial of racism by elites can be seen in everyday conversations, textbooks, news reports, and parliamentary debates, and is expressed in forms such as disclaimers, mitigation, euphemism, excuses, blaming the victim, reversal/moves of defense, face-keeping and positive self-presentation (van Dijk, 1992, 1993). Analysis of media discourse facilitates an understanding of the "interplay between elite and popular forms of racism" (van Dijk, 1992, p. 88)

In my analysis, I focus in particular on the main news components including background (context and history), verbal reactions (interviews with news sources), and comments (expectations and evaluations) (van Dijk, 1991). This analysis pays close attention to rhetorical devices in news texts such as alliterations and metaphors (van Dijk, 1991). Additionally, I focus on the ideological implications of headlines which as van Dijk (1991) observes:

> may bias the understanding process: they summarize what, according to the journalist, is the most important aspect, and such a summary necessarily implies an opinion or a specific perspective on the events…a subjective definition of the situation, which influences the interpretation made by the readers. (p. 51)

It is critical to pay close attention the functions of quotations in news reports which "allow the insertion of subjective interpretations, explanations, or opinions about current

news events, without breaking the ideological rule that requires the separation of facts from opinions" (van Dijk, 1991, p. 152).

Analyzing rhetorical structures can pinpoint the ways in which agency or responsibility for social outcomes is concealed (Rojo & van Dijk, 1997). Some of the rhetorical structures include: 1) *Figures of speech* such as irony, hyperboles, euphemisms, similes and metaphors, 2) *Moral legitimacy and the rhetoric of objectivity* manifest in attempts to delegitimize alternative or dissenting viewpoints. Socio-political elites often claim to be credible and trustworthy speakers in contrast to other actors characterized as biased or untruthful, 3) *Manufacturing ingroup consensus and solidarity* which is linked with Herman and Chomsky's (2002) seminal work on political processes that work to "manufacture consent" (Rojo & van Dijk, 1997).

As discussed by Baker and McEnery (2005) in their study of United Nations and newspaper texts' depictions of refugees, Fairclough's (2003) approach to critical discourse analysis has focused on features of texts such as metaphor, agency, nominalization and pronoun use, as well as modes of production and reception of texts. Baker and McEnery (2005) have sought to contribute to CDA by complementing small-scale analysis with a study of large bodies of texts (corpora) in order to identify language patterns which frame refugees in negative and dehumanizing ways, i.e. as packages, invaders, pests or water.

They chose to focus on British newspapers published in 2003 alongside articles on refugees produced by the office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) in order to identify mainstream/hegemonic discourses associated with refugees (Baker & McEnery, 2005). The political subjectivity of refugees is rarely seen in these texts, rather powerful spokespeople construct the identities and discourses pertaining to refugees (Baker & McEnery, 2005). Baker and McEnery (2005) look at the connotation of language and how consisting pairing of words evoke particular themes and associations. When words are frequently paired, for example 'illegal' and immigrant, this association can become naturalized in political and media discourse, and in the minds of newspaper readership (Baker & McEnery, 2005).

It is important to mention that in April 2013, the Associated Press announced that it would no longer sanction the use of the term ‘illegal immigrant’ in its Stylebook, although the act of immigrating to a country could still be referred to as ‘illegal’. In explaining the decision, Senior Vice President and Executive Editor Kathleen Carroll stated:

> …we had in other areas been ridding the Stylebook of labels. The new section on mental health issues argues for using credibly sourced diagnoses instead of labels. Saying someone was “diagnosed with schizophrenia” instead of schizophrenic, for example.
>
> And that discussion about labeling people, instead of behavior, led us back to “illegal immigrant” again.
>
> (http://blog.ap.org/2013/04/02/illegal-immigrant-no-more/)

Significantly, Kathleen Carroll also stated: “Do not describe people as violating immigration laws without attribution. Specify wherever possible how someone entered the country illegally and from where. Crossed the border? Overstayed a visa? What nationality?” and with reference to children, journalists were urged to contextualize their experiences and to not describe them as having immigrated ‘illegally’. (http://blog.ap.org/2013/04/02/illegal-immigrant-no-more/). The Associated Press’ decision indicates that such terminology is not innocuous but, rather, embedded within policy and practice, and the shaping of public opinion. What is rarely discussed when referring to the act of migration as illegal is that legal pathways for immigrants and refugees have been significantly narrowed (Crépeau & Nakache, 2006; Dauvergne, 2008).

Other types of rhetorical devices can be seen in media depictions of refugees. For example, quantification of refugees indicates alarm over increasing numbers and associates this quantification with danger (Baker & McEnery, 2005). Another rhetorical device, which is closely linked to the quantification of refugees, is the use of figures of speech such as hyperboles, similes, and metaphors (van Dijk, 1988, 1991, 1992, 1993; Rojo & van Dijk, 1997). For example, Baker and McEnery (2005) identify movement metaphors that compare refugees to water: “*swelling the numbers of refugees*, *the flood of*

refugees, *refugees are streaming home*, *refugees are streaming back to their homes*, *overflowing refugee camps* [italics in Baker & McEnery, 2005]" (p. 204). Of all the metaphors identified, the *refugees-as-water* metaphor was the one that appeared with the greatest frequency, and dehumanized refugees as a risk similar to a natural disaster (Baker & McEnery, 2005). Another way in which refugees have been depicted (and dehumanized) is in the comparison with the transportation of objects and goods, including illegal substances: "Refugees are *delivered, transported, carried, trafficked and smuggled*" (Baker & McEnery, 2005, p. 206).

There are a number of discourses framing refugees, one of which focuses on tragedy with language depicting powerlessness and victimization; closely linked with this depiction is the discourse of 'official attempts to help'. As Baker and McEnery (2005) observe:

> These involve phrases such as *refugee action*, *refugee service*, *refugee agency*, describe official bodies involved in running organisations, and discuss attempts to enable refugees to 'integrate into society', particularly by learning the language of their host country or by going to school. The grammatical pattern *X for refugees* is a relatively common example of this 'helping' discourse trace. (p. 207)

Rhetorical devices also function to negate responsibility or to conceal agency (van Dijk, 1992). As Baker and McEnery (2005) note: "*Displaced* is often used in agentless sentences, obscuring information about who or what has displaced the refugees" (p. 210). Similarly, in framing the issue of 'deserving' refugee claimants and those who have been 'rejected', texts rarely make explicit reference to who is responsible for this rejection, and 'forced returns'/deportations are also disassociated from any responsible agent (Baker & McEnery, 2005). Additionally, in reference to refugee legislation, texts have reported on "*fears over*, *outcry over*, *rebel over* and *expressed opposition to*" where the term fear has often been agentless (p. 218).

A related observation in the study by Baker and McEnery (2005), points to descriptions of legislation that obstructs access to refugee status. Terms such as 'curbs' and a 'crackdown' are used, while policy is described as more *stringent* (p. 219). Violence metaphors such as 'minefield', 'fight', and 'attack' are also associated with

refugee policy and legislation, for example: "*The sensitive issue of immigration — and asylum in particular — is proving to be a minefield for ministers to negotiate*" (Baker & McEnery, 2005, p. 220).

By comparing refugee discourses from newspaper texts with publications of the UNHCR, Baker and McEnery (2005) are able to identify similarities between hegemonic viewpoints and those of agencies mandated to support refugees, pointing to the ways in which negative metaphors become naturalized. It is important to consider the relationships between different types of texts, rather than thinking of them as separate spheres (Baker & McEnery, 2005). In this case, organizations such as the UNHCR seek to disseminate information and influence media discourse (through press releases and publications). However journalists will still include or discard certain information and chose particular framings (Baker & McEnery, 2005). It is also important not to underestimate the impact of refugee discourses on voting behaviour and government policy (Baker & McEnery, 2005).

Frames Theory and Analysis

> Certainly we cannot take for granted that the world depicted is simply the world that exists. Many things exist. At each moment the world is rife with events. Even within a given event there is an infinity of noticeable details. Frames are principles of selection, emphasis, and presentation composed of little tacit theories about what exists, what happens, and what matters. (Gitlin, 1980, p. 6)

In this study, the rhetorical foundations of texts that are brought into relief through Critical Discourse Analysis have been placed alongside the conceptual tools of Frames Theory and Analysis. With the stance that language is not neutral or apolitical, as argued in Critical Discourse Analysis, the concept of framing zooms out to see how the larger picture is constructed and allows for a better understanding of how everything is pieced together.

Frames Theory was first introduced by Erving Goffman (1974) drawing on paradigms of social constructionism and symbolic interactionism. Referencing Benford and Snow (2000), Cook (2010) states that the concept of "frames" and "framing" is "a

system of values and beliefs (i.e. of meaning) and the construction thereof, that resonates with members or constituents and motivates them to action (Benford & Snow, 2000)" (p. 147). Frames are used by political actors as well as journalists, and frame analysis is therefore useful in political communication research (Entman, 1993, 2003, 2004; Entman & Rojecki, 1993; Gamson, 1985; Caliendo, Gibney & Payne, 1999) and social movement research (Benford & Snow, 2000; Knight, 2001; Snow & Benford, 1998).

Entman (2003) defines the functions of framing as "selecting and highlighting some facets of events or issues, and making connections among them so as to promote a particular interpretation, evaluation and/or solution" (p. 417). The key components of framing processes are selection and salience; points of concern are emphasized in order to define problems, identify causes (in conjunction with making moral judgments) and to suggest remedies (Entman, 1993, 2003, 2004). The frames employed in political news texts can have significant implications for politics and policy-making (Entman, 1993, 2003, 2004). Neysmith (2000), in writing about political discourses and state practices, states that: "Framing is critical because it is both diagnostic and prognostic. In proposing new social ends as well as different means for arriving at them, actors draw upon and sometimes extend, rearrange, and transform the master frames extant in the broader political culture" (p. 17).

Drawing on the work of Gamson (1985) and Goffman (1974) on frame analysis, Benford and Snow (2000) examine the ways in which framing processes affect the trajectory of social movements through "the generation, diffusion, and functionality of mobilizing and countermobilizing ideas and meanings" (p. 612). Additionally, the concept of framing can be seen, as Knight (2001) writes, as:

> a metaphor that implies that the transformation of reality into representation is a spatializing and visualizing process…No representation can possibly be total or complete, and in this respect framing points to the perspectival character of meaning. On the other hand, framing also entails the arrangement of what is included in a way that is structured and differentiated in importance, meaning, and function. (p. 74)

Entman (2002) argues that political and economic elites influence media content but perceptions of public thinking also influence motivations, power and strategy feeding back into news-making processes. Discord among elites is essential in order to contest dominant frames and achieve frame parity in the media (Entman, 2003). Beginning with the role of communications in social movements, in terms of reframing political debate and influencing state policy, Hackett's (2000) line of argument explores possibilities for media activism and democratization. Falk (1994) urges educators working with both children and adults in schooling and other contexts to closely examine hegemony and policy discourses articulated in the media and that a key implication for Falk's paper relates to the area of teacher education.

The notion of objectivity is closely associated with the credibility as well as the professional status of journalism (Taras, 1990). Entman (1993) problematizes the notion of journalistic objectivity through frames analysis, pointing out that while journalists may adhere to professional values such as objectivity, they still tend to employ a dominant frame, which makes it more difficult for readers to accurately assess a situation. The notion of balance in journalism is similarly critiqued by Hackett (2010) who argues that complex issues can not be reduced to two sides, which are typically represented as polarized and prioritize the voices of official sources (such as politicians).

Methods

Located within this rich body of work on media discourse, this study draws on sociological theories of education and the methodological frameworks of Critical Discourse Analysis and Frames Theory and Analysis in order to examine print media representations of new immigrant, refugee and precarious status children in the three Canadian newspapers, the *Globe & Mail*, *National Post*, and *Toronto Star* in the historical period of 1989-2009. As Howarth (2012) observes, the analysis of print media narratives over a longer period can also tackle the discrepancy between short news cycles and long policy cycles. I followed this point, chosing to study a period from 1989 to 2009. In order to properly contextualize the media narratives through attention to the policy jurisdictions of federal, provincial, and municipal governments, and the level of

community organizing and activism, I have separated the historical periods into three chapters. As outlined in Chapter One, the first of the analysis chapters, Chapter Five covers the years 1989-1995, Chapter Six covers 1996-2001, and Chapter Seven covers 2002-2009.

The *Globe and Mail* and the *National Post* are Canada's two national dailies. The *Toronto Star* is the local daily with the largest circulation and is based in Toronto. Of the three papers, it can be characterized with a different political orientation, adopting a social-liberal editorial stance and its readership is economically diverse. The *Toronto Star*'s editorial stance has been critical of many aspects of New Right politics. The *Globe and Mail*'s readership are Canada's political and business elites, and in the period before the launch of the *National Post* by Conrad Black in 1998, the *Globe* was the most 'right-of-centre'. The *Globe* is still conservative in political orientation, supportive of neoliberalism although less so of neoconservative aspects of the New Right; it is published in Toronto and offers consistent coverage of Ontario news (Knight, 2001, Greenberg, 2004). The *National Post*'s editorial voice is right-wing catering to the corporate elite (Knight, 2001, Greenberg, 2004).

The Proquest Canadian Newsstand Complete database was used to search for articles with the keywords "refugee children", "immigrant children", Don't ask policy+Toronto (to distinguish from DADT in the U.S. context), "UN Convention on the Rights of the Child", "anti-racism education", "the education rights task force" (the Education Rights Task Force was instrumental in campaigning for children with precarious legal status' access to schooling), and "no one is illegal". I narrowed the search parameters to the years 1989-2009 and the three papers were searched individually. The sample of articles from this search amounted to over 500. In a second search of the Proquest database (to verify accuracy of the sample), I focused on the keyword search of the terms "refugee children" and "immigrant children". There was just one article and one letter to the editor produced from the keyword search of the term "non-status children". There were two results for the keyword search of "undocumented children" within these search parameters but the articles were discarded because the journalists reported on the U.S. context. The keyword search of the term "refugee

children" produced 63 articles from the *Globe and Mail*, 21 from the *National Post*, and 133 from the *Toronto Star*. The keyword search of the term "immigrant children" produced 128 articles from the *Globe and Mail*, 44 articles from the *National Post* and 225 articles from the *Toronto Star*.

I was interested in a broad range of news coverage in order to capture a full picture of news reporting on migration. This included all types of news: column, editorial, letters to the editor, and straight reporting. Initially, all articles that made reference to immigrant or refugee children within Ontario were considered relevant to the study but when the sample size became unmanageable, I followed Bauder's (2008d) example by excluding articles that only made peripheral mention of the issue. In his study, the term "immigration law" was a key issue and he excluded articles that included a peripheral reference to this term. In my study, the key issue that I focused on was the education of refugee and im/migrant children so any articles that only made peripheral mention of this issue were excluded. I focused instead on articles that contained a search term three times (as Bauder had done) and/or was very specific to the educational context.

Having reviewed the qualitative methodological approaches of Critical Discourse Analysis and Frames Theory, I approached preliminary data analysis with two concurrent objectives: to analyze the ways in which media discourse provides ideological legitimacy to exclusionary immigration and refugee policies and the denial of social rights, and to identify media support for immigration justice campaigns; and secondly, to identify possibilities for collaboration between immigration justice and children's rights campaigns to engage print media in supporting social rights for all precarious status migrants, not only children, in other provincial jurisdictions.

Having pared down the sample size, I began by recording technical information (date, page, column, length), the general topic of the news story and whether the journalist had a particular beat (health or education). I read each article and recorded the concepts and themes that emerged. Following Baines (2002) who draws on Strauss and Corbin (1990), I looked for concepts, and then labelled, sorted, and mapped out interconnecting concepts and themes.

Jones' (2000) insight helped me in thinking through this process. As she writes: "Grounded theorists differ in orientation, in adaptations and in applications of the method, but the principle of theory emanating from data as opposed to the logical testing of hypotheses has led to the generation of important knowledge" (p. 40). Further, her approach to a feminist reframing of grounded theory was also quite useful. She explains that theory is not just uncovered but rather a process of socially constructed meaning. While I could not engage in a grounded theory approach to participatory research as she had done, I thought about her insights and those from other studies built from the social agency of refugee and immigrant children such as the one facilitated by Jones (2000).

I also turned to case study research methods (Yin, 1984) in thinking about Li's (2001) argument that immigration discourse "uses public concerns of immigration as pretexts to justify policy changes" (p. 85) and Billig's (1987) observation that arguments are constructed in relation to counter-arguments. As Razack (2004) states: "The case-study approach provides an opportunity to examine up close how individuals perform national and international mythologies…We can begin to understand who people think they are and how this informs what they do" (p. 8).

There are three dominant media frames/narratives I have identified in the review of newspaper articles, which I believe provide ideological legitimacy to exclusionary state practices:

1) Children in the neoliberal paradigm, as "investments"
2) Children and nationalism/national belonging
3) Immigrant, and refugee children as 'vulnerable'/'threatening'

These three narratives overlap in many of the articles and will be explicated in the analysis. These were the narratives I had found before reading Di Tomasso's (2012) article analyzing online reader commentary in response to CBC representations of migrant children and families. After reading her cogent article, I was convinced by her critique of similar frames and narratives that my approach to coding was an accurate assessment of the data. Di Tomasso's (2012) media discourse analysis focused on news stories and public responses to the arrival of Tamil migrant families on the coast of

British Columbia in 2010. She identified the following discursive constructions which she critiqued in her analysis: 'Tamil migrants pose a threat to Canada and Canadians'; 'Tamil migrants are fraudulent refugees'; 'Tamil migrants and neoliberalism'; 'Tamil migrants and benevolent multiculturalism'; 'Guilty parents, innocent children, and Canadian benevolence'; 'Migrant children and neoliberalism'; 'Racialized migrants as a threat to the Canadian imaginary'. Her analysis of discourses of racialization, multiculturalism, national security, and neoliberalism had the objective of resisting oppressive practices within child and youth care and is a powerful contribution to education in the human services. My thesis has been written with a shared commitment to resisting the reproduction of social inequalities and oppressive practices within educational contexts and wider society.

Limitations to the Methodological Approach

There were of course limitations to the methodological approach and methods of this study. One limitation is researcher subjectivity. I have attempted to address my own potential bias or inaccuracy in the coding and analytical process by reading widely about disparate theories and methods in approaches to media analysis. Due to time and resource constraints I was also unable to compare my qualitative analytical approach to texts with the views and insights of social activists involved in the case study who would have the important knowledge about media exposure of immigration justice campaigns. In contrast to a mixed methods approach such as the one found in a study of environmental activism and media discourse (Stodsdart, Ramos & Tindall, 2013), there is no activist-centred layer of analysis to accompany text-centred media analysis. This would have undoubtedly strengthened the study but is an area for future research, along with participatory studies with children whose views rarely appear in media discourse.

Humility and honesty are important in any research design. As Earl, Martin, McCarthy and Soule (2004) observe: "researchers must approach newspaper data with a humble understanding that although not without its flaws, it remains a useful data source. Thus, researchers should avoid both the unexamined use of newspaper data as well as blanket condemnations of its use" (p. 77). With these limitations in mind, I believe that

the chosen methods of analysis as explored in the next three chapters facilitate new insights into social policy outcomes and will find resonance with lived experiences and social theorizing in relation to new immigrant and refugee children.

Chapter 5:

The end of the Cold War: The collision of children's rights discourses and neoliberal agendas (1989-1995)

> It doesn't seem quite time yet to pronounce that the Cold War is over. Not if by the Cold War one means a densely woven web of relationships and attitudes that have sustained not only large and lethal militaries but also ideas about enemies, about rivalries. (Enloe, 1993, p. 7)

In this chapter, I will draw on the conceptual and methodological contributions of van Dijk's discourse analysis (1988, 1991, 1993), and Entman's frames theory (1993, 2003, 2004) in order to analyze representations of new immigrant and refugee children in the *Toronto Star* and *Globe and Mail* between 1989-1995[6]. I will begin the chapter with an historical overview of child policy frameworks in Canada during the first period discussed (1989-1995). Next, I will discuss the ways in which immigration and refugee policy frameworks have been shaped by a climate of social austerity resulting from neoliberalism. In section two, I will critique the three narratives identified in representations of new immigrant and refugee children:

1) Children and neoliberalism
2) Children and nationalism
3) New immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable' or 'threatening'

These critiques are informed by sociological theories of education with a particular emphasis on Bourdieu's (1991, 2006) concept of *habitus* as "cultural rules" (Apple, 1978, paraphrasing Bourdieu). Bourdieu's conceptual contributions facilitate a deeper understanding of the ways in which media narratives, representing new immigrant and refugee children in Canada, are implicated in the process of *cultural reproduction*: the cultural and social practices of dominant groups are transferred from one generation to the next through schooling. Schooling reproduces the existing social structure, and the

---

6 The 3rd paper reviewed, *The National Post*, was not established as Canada's second national daily broadsheet until 1998.

media as an ideological institution is implicated in the process of *social reproduction*. Through critical attention to media representations of new immigrant and refugee children's schooling experiences, I would like to disrupt conventional explanations for their social and material exclusion.

Section One:

Historical context: Child welfare frameworks in Canada

In the late 1980s and early 1990s, eradicating child poverty was taken up as an ethical imperative, against the backdrop of socio-economic crises, by organizations including the Canadian Council on Social Development (CCSD), the National Council on Welfare (a quasi-governmental organization), the National Anti-poverty Organization (NAPO), the Child Poverty Action Group (CPAG), Campaign 2000, the Caledon Institute of Social Policy, and the Vanier Institute of the Family (McKeen, 2004). In 1989, the Canadian parliament passed a unanimous resolution articulating a commitment to eradicating child poverty by the year 2000 (Jenson, 2004). In 1992, the federal government established a Children's Bureau, and announced a Child Development Initiative called "Brighter Futures" that would focus on the health and well-being of "at-risk" children (Jenson, 2004; McKeen, 2004). A large coalition comprising over 70 national, provincial and community organizations called Campaign 2000 mobilized in the early 1990s (beginning in 1991). This coalition emerged from a history of campaigning by the Child Poverty Action Group created in Toronto in 1983 (Jenson, 2004). Campaign 2000 seemed to predict that the state's increasingly narrow focus on children as 'investments' would intensify in the subsequent years; the main message of Campaign 2000's report on Children and Nationhood was "If we neglect the next generation, we're jeopardizing the future of our country", as reported in the *Globe and Mail*, in an article titled "Child poverty seen as a threat to Canada's future" (28 June 1994, A8) (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004; Jenson, 2004). 'The child' became a powerful symbol in political discourse when the welfare state was in disarray (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004; Jenson, 2004; Stasiulis, 2002, 2004; Wiegers, 2002). A pattern that can be identified in

many diminishing welfare states has been a narrow “focus on investment in children as worker/citizens of the future” (Miller, 2005, p. 27).

In Canadian domestic politics, neoconservative values were mapped onto neoliberal agendas, while groups of right-wing women, such as REAL, expressed vocal opposition to the allocation of public funding to feminist organizations. As Dobrowolsky and Jenson (2004) explain: “REAL stands for Real, Equal, and Active for Life. It is a group composed of women who support the traditional gender and family roles and of right-wing, indeed neoliberal women opposed to the notion that the state should support advocacy” (pp. 175-176). The political attack on the NAC by the far-right Reform Party led to a flurry of negative media depictions of Canadian women’s movements. It was through a congruence of interests of the New Right in Canada at this time that feminist claims to social citizenship, articulated throughout the previous decades, were sidelined by a narrow focus on ‘investing’ in children (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004; Jenson, 2004; McKeen, 2004, 2006; Stasiulis, 2002, 2004; Wiegers, 2002).

The notion of women’s social citizenship rights including publicly funded universal access to child care was abandoned by the Conservative federal government in the late 1980s and attention diverted to disadvantaged children (Dobrowolsky & Jenson, 2004). Social policy discussions began “the retreat from the key principles of universality and social solidarity, grounded in an appreciation of parenting as a social contribution” (McKeen, 2004, p. 100). This dimension of policy shifted from the notion of universality to the notion of targeting.[7] In other words, women’s claims to social rights were seen as disconnected from those of children, something Barrie Thorne (1987) has critiqued. As she observes, this is “a theme dear to the heart of the New Right – that the autonomy of women is necessarily gained at the expense of children” (p. 104). This theme was also inscribed within right-wing ideology in Canada in the late 1980s and early 1990s (and in the intervening years), the legacies of which are still felt. Many progressive social policy/child poverty groups were concerned with “the divisive impact

7 It is also important to confront how middle-class and affluent women have been able to enter the workforce as a result of the labour provided by working-class women, including racialized migrant workers who have been denied social citizenship rights (Aiken & Scott, 2000; Arat-Koç, 1992; McDonald, 2009; McDowell, 2008; Stasiulis & Bakan, 2003).

that targeting had on society, in creating social stigma and eating away the sense of social solidarity" (McKeen, 2004, p. 91). As Caragata (2003) reflects:

> …imagine the single mother whose 45 hours per week are in three different workplaces, perhaps ending with an evening shift far from home, perhaps having to stop – in transit – to pick up a now sleeping child from a carer. There is no one home to perform the 'shadowork' of having bought groceries, made lunches or cleared the breakfast table, nor extra money for the commodified supports of a taxi or an ordered-in dinner or children's recreational programmes. (p. 571)

Between 1980 and 1994 the rate of child poverty in Canada was very close to the rate of unemployment; however in 1994 and 1995, this relationship shifted with a growing disparity between dropping unemployment and an increased rate of child poverty (Caragata, 2003). This discrepancy can be explained by the changing conditions in the labour market to increasingly precarious work: part-time employment typically without benefits, the irregular hours of shift work, and competing pressures experienced by mothers, especially single mothers (Caragata, 2003, Galabuzi, 2006; Pulkingham & Ternowetsky, 1997). Additionally, there was a sharp decrease in employment rates for recent immigrants between 1986 and 1996 even though a higher percentage of all categories of immigrants had a university degree, compared to the percentage of Canadian-born citizens; immigrants experience greater poverty and dependence on social assistance due to lack of employment (Galabuzi, 2006).

The structural barriers and features that characterize poverty are more likely to be experienced by children of single mothers (compared to the wider population of children in Canada); however, single motherhood is not always associated with economic hardship (Miller, 2005). While problematizing the political rejection of single mothers, Adele Jones (2002) argues: "[i]ronically, within immigration practice many families are effectively reconstituted as single-parent families as a consequence of decisions made to deport or prevent entry to the UK of one or other parent" (p. 84). The same argument applies to the consequences of Canadian immigration policy.

Evans and Swift (2000) examine Canadian print media representations of single mothers over two historical periods: the early 1980s and the mid-1990s in order to show

how the construction of a particular social group as 'undeserving' legitimizes the retrenchment of the welfare state. Drawing upon Gramsci's concept of hegemony and its relationship to news-making, they also search for examples of counterhegemonic images of single mothers in the press. They argue that print media continues to be a relevant and important source of data for social analysis because of "social meanings embedded in news stories" (p. 76) and their ideological function. In the earlier period of media representations (the early 1980s), they recognize that single mothers were associated with a range of policy issues including government cutbacks to university grants offered to single mothers, tax changes, child-support issues and welfare investigations. However, in the mid-1990s child support, "a highly privatised and individualized source of income support" (p. 79), is the primary policy issue associated with single mothers. Additionally, the mid-1990s context differs from the early 1980s when there was a greater likelihood of recognizing structural factors impacting on the lives of single mothers (and their children).

Another difference in the newsprint articles from the later period is a greater reliance on 'experts' as sources speaking authoritatively about the experiences of single mothers, rather than single mothers themselves. Similar concerns were also raised in a UK study on media representations of single mothers and the social policy implications (Duncan, Edwards & Song, 1999). One of the ways in which single mothers have been negatively depicted has been through the use of anecdotes. Similarly, Mehan (1997) argues:

> As demonstrated when Ronald Reagan satirized welfare queens in his bid for the US Presidency and George Bush vilified Willie Horton in his Presidential campaign, anecdotes are powerful forces in public political discourse. They can trump arguments that appear to be more reasonable – including those that deploy statistical evidence. (p. 263)

Representations of single mothers as a homogenous and demonized group clearly do not allow for an understanding of intersectionality and the specific forms of social exclusion relating to class, race, gender, immigration status, dis/ability and other dimensions. As Evan and Swift (2000) observe: "The effect of these portrayals is to

strengthen hegemonic discourses posing the proper role of the state not as support but as control, reshaping and repositioning 'problematic' social groups" (p. 89). What is clear from Evan and Swift's analysis is that growing consensus throughout the 1990s around neoliberal perspectives on the deficit, and reinvigorated debate around 'family-values'/neoconservativism, contribute to media narratives which delegitimize the claims of single mothers (and other excluded social groups) to social rights and public resources. As argued by McRobbie and Thornton (1995): "Social meanings and social differences are inextricably tied up with representation" (p. 570). Understanding these processes can offer opportunities for contestation and resistance through counter-hegemonic media representations.

The political changes provoked by neoliberalism on a global scale were entrenched through the rhetoric of Ronald Reagan and Margaret Thatcher and neoliberal policy outcomes in national settings (Brenner & Theodore, 2002; Carpentier & Cammaerts, 2006; Pratt & Valverde, 2002). Class disparities within stratified societies were sharpened through the attribution of responsibility to those most adversely affected by economic restructuring. The political rhetoric of individualization and economic agency established a consensus around bases for disentitlement from social benefits. As the political context shifted, a sense of social responsibility and the concept of social entitlements/rights faded from the scene. The argument that there is still a clear and pernicious relationship between processes of racialization and socio-economic inequities was derided by those in power (across North America and Europe) and this derision consistently articulated in the media (Murray, 1986; van Dijk, 1991, 1992, 1993). As McRobbie and Thorton (1995) note:

> During the Thatcher years, the *Daily Mail* practised and perfected the characteristics of hegemony, in a way which was in uncanny harmony with Thatcherism. It was a daily process of reaching out to win consent through endlessly defining and redefining social questions and representing itself as the moral voice of the newly self-identified middle class as well as the old lower-middle class. (p. 569)

Material self-interest and complacent attitudes towards people who have been socially marginalized continued to shape Canadian politics, influenced by Thatcher and Reagan due to historical and contemporary economic relationships with the UK and US. At the federal level, pressure to harmonize Canadian social policies with those of US increased with the 1994 signing of the North American Free Trade Agreement (Caragata, 2003; Evans & Wekerle, 1997).

Neoliberalism in Ontario: The 'Commonsense Revolution'

> neoliberal doctrine represents states and markets as if they were diametrically opposed principles of social organization, rather than recognizing the politically constructed character of all economic relations. (Brenner & Theodore, 2002, p. 353)

The province of Ontario, Canada's most populated province, was also influenced by the political orientation of national and international arenas. The "taxpayer discourse" (Nadeau, 2002) underpinning nationalist arguments was significant to the campaigning of the provincial Conservative party in the mid-1990s as "taxpayer" replaced the term "citizen" (Knight, 1998). Knight (1998) identifies two main antagonisms within what he refers to as New Right Populism: the first antagonism is towards 'big government' and the second is between the 'people' and the 'social and moral margins'. As Knight explains: "[t]his is the element of NR populism that identifies social deviants and other troubling populations as a source of moral concern in a way that connects to and evokes established sentiments of stigma and prejudice" (p. 110).

Attention pinned on these antagonisms by the media throughout the election campaign was undoubtedly politically consequential; party leader Mike Harris was strategic in his use of photo-ops, the most impactful of which was orchestrated by him generating media coverage as he stood beside an altered road-sign which read "Welfare, Ontario, population 1.337, 617", to reflect the total number of Ontarians on social assistance (40 per cent of whom were children) (Lightman, 1997; Knight, 1998). The vilification of welfare-recipients became a central theme in the political campaign led by

Mike Harris, dusting off earlier neo-conservative claims about 'family values'. Additionally, his campaign flipped left-wing rhetoric on its head, through his political appropriation of the concept of "revolution" used in the title of the document outlining the party platform: "The Commonsense Revolution" (Morrison, 1997; Trickey, 1997). As Mackey (1999) observes:

> Whereas in traditional leftist thought 'the people' call up images of a politicised popular class struggling for freedom and equality against an exploitative ruling class and in state apparatus, in new-Right discourse 'the people' are constructed as a natural and non-political category of authentic citizens who resist 'the political correctness' of radicalised minorities and the meddlesome 'nanny state'. (pp. 107-8)

The campaign specifically targeted educational and social policy, drawing on the two antagonisms of New Right Populism identified by Knight (1998). As Greenberg (2004) argues: "…the government did not campaign in 1995 on anything more than populist promises of making the education system "more accountable" and curbing the role and influence of unions, which had been cast as "special interest groups"" (p. 366). At the same time, many unions were disillusioned by the decisions made by former Premier Bob Rae and the first New Democratic Party government (1990-1995) in Ontario's history, especially the imposition of a "social contract" of wage cuts, which overrode collective agreements (Knight, 1998; Ralph, 1997a).

Mike Harris' Ontario Progressive Conservative Party was elected in the summer of 1995 and the architecture of social policy toppled quickly with a reinvigorated right-wing political agenda. The Ontario legislature opened on September 27, 1995 in a context of resistance and demonstrations (Dare, 1997). The key actions of the Conservative Party included rescinding employment equity legislation, reinstating the "spouse-in-the-house" rule which cut single mothers off from receiving family benefits under allegations that they were living with a man (an action informed by an array of patriarchal assumptions), the elimination of child care subsidies, the restriction of youth social assistance, the cancellation of 390 co-op and non-profit housing projects (many were already under construction), a $1.5 billion cut to the Ministry of Health budget

(diminishing hospital budgets and resulting in closures), provincial funding cuts to municipal services such as public libraries and public transit, and establishing an anonymous provincial 'welfare fraud' line in order to stigmatize and police people struggling to make ends meet (Browne, 1997; Clarke, J., 1997; Clarke, T., 1997; Dare, 1997; Gilbert, 2004; Henry & Tator, 2005; Keil, 2002; Kitchen, 1997; Lalonde, 1997; Little, 2001; Mirchandani & Chan, 2007; Morrison, 1997; Mosher, 2000; Ralph, 1997a; Sears, 2003; Trickey, 1997; Weinroth, 1997). As Schissel (1997) argues: "history shows us how socio-economic systems that have discarded certain groups of people who do not control the means of production have commonly found moral scapegoats" (p. 115). The government pursued "a strategy of dividing those on social assistance into deserving and undeserving recipients" (Kitchen, 1997, p. 108).

In the fall of 1995, social assistance was cut by 21.6 % with deleterious consequences. These cuts were also directed at people living with disability, restricting eligibility for entitlement to benefits. Soon after the cuts, Minister of Social and Community Services, David Tsubouchi, suggested that people adversely affected by the welfare cuts could simply buy dented cans of tuna and negotiate better prices with store owners in order to save money (Lightman, 1997). Tsubouchi claimed that people would realistically be able to live on a food budget of $3 a day (Dare, 1997). The viciously antagonistic policies adversely impacted on social equity and strengthened patriarchal collaborations (Caragata, 2003; Kitchen, 1997; Lalonde, 1997; Little, 2001; McAdie, 1998; Mirchandani & Chan, 2007; Mosher, 2000; Sears, 2003; Swift & Birmingham, 2000; Trickey, 1997). A political crisis did not exist in an ideological vacuum: increasing numbers of people relied on food banks, increasing numbers of people faced eviction and homelessness (Clarke, J., 1997; Lalonde, 1997; Morrison, 1997; Trickey, 1997; Weinroth, 1997).

The first large-scale demonstration against the Harris government took place in July 1995 and was sparked by government threats to cut wage supplements (wages which are typically at the minimum level) of about 12,000 child care workers. The one-day walkout by daycare workers was supported by parents, toddlers, and preschoolers who demonstrated alongside more than 1000 workers (Dare, 1997; Kitchen, 1997). As

Kitchen (1997) observes: "Surprisingly, this government which has proved to be unmoveable on any issue, abandoned the idea of the cuts" (p. 106). The city of London, Ontario shut down on December 11, 1995 in the first of several Day(s) of Action initiated by the labour movement and social justice groups (Dare, 1997; Turk, 1997). Some people travelled for as long as eighteen hours to London in order to participate in this historic act of resistance (Turk, 1997).

Drawing on van Dijk's (1991) analysis of the function of newspaper editorials which define, explain, evaluate and offer moral commentary on a particular event or situation, Henry and Tator (2005) examine the editorial content of the *Globe & Mail* on the topic of employment equity in the 1990s. In 1995, Ontario Premier Mike Harris' Conservative government rescinded employment equity legislation two years subsequent to its introduction. Ontario was the first province in the country to have introduced affirmative action legislation to redress systemic discrimination in the workforce. Henry and Tator (2005) identify and problematize three central arguments in the *Globe and Mail* editorials from this period which rejected the concept of employment equity and arguably influenced the rescindment of the legislation: (1) "Employment equity is reverse discrimination" (2) "Employment equity is hiring by quotas and ignores the merit principle" (3) "Employment equity challenges the fundamental tenets of liberalism such as individual rights and equal opportunity" (pp.166-7). As Henry and Tator demonstrate, these arguments are presented through the rhetorical strategies (van Dijk, 1991) of hyperbole, exaggeration, mitigation, oversimplification, trivialization, and ridicule. The audience to which the editorials are addressed are the sociopolitical elites in Canadian society and those who closely orbit them. As Henry and Tator observe:

> …employment equity profoundly upsets the understood balance of relationships in society at the psychological, social, and economic levels. It threatens the infrastructure of white organizational space, as well as the sense of entitlement of those who have unrestricted access to employment and who have benefited from systemic discrimination. (p. 174)

Such analyses are important in order to understand how the ideological assumptions of dominant social groups are sustained and re-invoked in both political and

media discourses, and how one public sphere influences the other. For example, Henry and Tator point out how a Conservative MPP quoted from a *Globe and Mail* editorial during a debate in the Ontario Legislature on the Quotas Repeal Act 1995 in order to support his arguments rejecting the need for employment equity legislation and in putting forward the counter-argument that such legislation is socially divisive.

Neoliberalism, childhood, and schooling in Canada

The discriminatory consequences of neoliberal policy agendas and diminished material and social opportunities for particular children have been investigated in compelling studies from the early and mid-1990s (Curtis, Livingstone & Smaller, 1992; Kitchen, 1995, 1997; Manicom, 1995; Griffith, 1995). Ann Manicom (1995) considers the broader implications and consequences of elementary schooling in the Canadian context by analyzing two features of teachers' work: its elasticity and the ideology of the 'whole child'. This ideological frame of the 'whole child' focuses on cognitive, physical, social, emotional, and moral development of children, assessed with a lens of normativity. Manicom problematizes the normative assumptions about children and childhood underpinning developmental psychology, the paradigm in which the ideology of the 'whole child' is located. The notion of 'elasticity' refers to the expansion of teaching tasks to include administrative duties, health care provision, parental care and nurturing, in addition to the responsibility for pedagogy and curriculum. As Manicom, (1995) observes: "The official elementary school curriculum is not meant to address tired children, undernourished children, children with abscessed teeth, children with colds or chapped hands, or children living under conditions of stress caused by poverty and deprivation" (p. 135). Given these realities, there is a sense of political urgency in Manicom's arguments that have as much resonance today as they did twenty years ago. Her sustained discussion of these dimensions of teachers' work examines the relationship between children's health problems and in-class instructional time, and the implications for the reproduction of social class inequalities. As Manicom clearly articulates, children's health is adversely impacted by poverty and this poverty must be seen against the backdrop of widening social and economic disparities sharpening the lines of class

division. When parents/families are struggling to put food on the table, their agency is unquestionably restricted (although not extinguished). When children's health must be prioritized over instructional time, their educational opportunities are diminished. Taking children's material and social circumstances into account within professional practice places teachers at the starting point of activism. As Manicom (1995) asks: "How can the teaching work process be seen, not as merely responding to, but as *part of*, classing practices?" (p. 144). Theoretical and practical aspects of teachers' work bring into relief systems of inequality, and social realities within the school context that cannot be ignored, as Manicom goes on to explain: "Social relations are *immanent in* teachers' talk about their work *because their work is embedded in these relations*. The social relations are *in* their work, organizing it, and are brought continually into being as teachers' work coordinates with the work of others" (p. 146).

Alison Griffith (1995) similarly problematizes normative assumptions underpinning 'child development discourse' as well as its prescriptive nature. Constructed in wider political and policy discourse as a self-evident manifestation of human development, 'child development discourse' obscures the social relations in which children live. As Griffith (1995) notes:

> The texts of the child development discourse are interdependent: one set of texts (for example, developmental psychology) is the empirical and theoretical basis for another related but distinct set of texts (for example, primary level curriculum, or advice to mothers in popular magazines)…As a conceptual framework for understanding and managing children and their maturation, the child development discourse provides for the coordination of such disparate institutional sites as the school system, the social service system, the communications media, and the branches of government responsible for family policy development and administration. (p. 11)

'Child development discourse' is always an implicit assessment of motherhood, a concept and practice with its own attendant discourse (Griffith, 1995). Many teachers and social workers look askance at attitudes, beliefs or behaviour not aligned with the dominant 'mothering discourse,' a discourse which tunes out that equitable access to

resources is limited for many families. These parallel discourses of 'child development' and 'motherhood' involve some degree of direct (and indirect) judgement and scrutiny of mothering practices (Griffith, 1995). In theory, child-centred education has many positive aspects drawing from the work of Dewey and relating to the expansion of social opportunities. In reality, normative conceptions of childhood do not account for cultural chauvinism, economic and social disparities, and the conditions in which mothers live, work and care for their children; consequently 'child development discourse' and 'mothering discourse' fail to interrogate the ways in which formal education contributes to the reproduction of social inequalities (Griffith, 1995).

Critical perspectives on developmental psychology, childhood and normativity are echoed in the international arena where children's rights discourses invoke concepts derived from developmental psychology; both frameworks are strengthened and naturalized by their reference to the other, as Burman (1996) notes:

> From this complex interpenetration of adjacent legal, welfare and knowledge-producing practices, we see the emergence of globalized assumptions about children. Rather than subscribing to a western-defined polarization between 'normal' childhood and 'stolen' childhood, we should explore, first, what childhood means and the roles children play within particular moral and political economies… (p. 61)

It is important to analyze children's rights discourses against the backdrop of neoliberal policy outcomes; Canada's ratification of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in 1991 has been politically meaningful to varying degrees in schooling and refugee law, as will be argued in the critiques of media narratives.

In 1989, the Supreme Court of Canada case *Andrews v. Law Society of British Columbia*, concluded that a policy or practice which has a discriminatory effect must be legally redressed, regardless of the intent of the party responsible; discrimination is real and impacts (Aylward, 1999; Galabuzi, 2014). This shift towards social equity helped to shape government policies in Ontario in the early 1990s. At this time, the Ontario Anti-Racism Directorate was established, as well as an Antiracism office in the Ontario

Ministry of Education; the Education Act was amended to require Ontario school boards to develop and implement anti-racism and ethnocultural equity policies (Galabuzi, 2014).

Children's right to an education was articulated by the Minister of Education in 1989 (Kaprielian-Churchill & Churchill, 1994) and in 1993, the Ontario Education Act was amended to state that:

> A person who is otherwise entitled to be admitted to a school and who is less than eighteen years of age shall not be refused admission because the person or the person's parent or guardian is unlawfully in Canada. *Bill 4, 19.2 referring to Section 49.1 of The Education Act of Ontario.* (Kaprielian-Churchill & Churchill 1994, p. 71)

The Education Act of Ontario is consistent with the influential U.S. 1982 Supreme Court case, *Plyler v. Doe*, which guaranteed access to primary and secondary education as a basic right of undocumented students. Unfortunately, this basic social right is not upheld for undocumented students to pursue post-secondary education, an immigration justice issue taken up in campaigning for the DREAM Act (Development, Relief, and Education for Alien Minors) in the U.S. (Varsanyi, 2006).

Social austerity and shifting paradigms: Immigration and refugee policy frameworks

In 1973, the enactment of employment visa regulations/Non-Immigrant Employment Authorization Program (NIEAP) traced a blueprint for what would later become Canada's Temporary Foreign Worker Program, written into the 1976 Immigration Act (Arat-Koç, 1992; Stafford, 1992; Sharma, 2006, 2011). Historically, immigration policies have sustained the division between Canadian-born and immigrant workers (Arat-Koç, 1992, 1999a, 1999b, Choudry et al., 2009; Sharma, 2005, 2006; Walia, 2010). With the ascendancy of neoliberalism, professionals born outside of Canada had to contend with unjust employment practices long associated with low-cost labour and have been debased in legal, political, and social spheres (Bolaria, 1992). This phenomenon is encapsulated in the title of Bolaria's (1992) essay: "From immigrant settlers to migrant transients: Foreign professionals in Canada". The labour pool could be shaped according to the economic concerns of the Canadian state by relying on the

"cultural hegemony" of Western educational credentials (Bolaria, 1992; Choudry et al., 2009; Sharma, 2006). At the same time, the educational systems of many countries in the South are patterned after past histories of colonialism and the (often violent) imposition of Western hegemony (Bolaria, 1992; Boyden, 1997). Settlement services such as language training are critically important, as Arat-Koç (1999a) points out: "Even though the history of colonialism and existing imperialism imposes a "necessity" on many peoples of the world to learn the imperial languages, access to such knowledge is still largely governed by class and gender" (p. 46). The knowledge base and skills of professionals born outside of Canada are easily transferable to the Canadian context (Bolaria, 1992), yet immigration policies sustain a set of contradictions, which are shrugged off by those in power. These contradictions raise political and ethical questions. As Galabuzi (2011) notes: "Racialized immigrants are brought into the "mosaic" often with total disregard for the very skills and qualifications that are the basis for their selection in the immigration system that patently commodifies their labour as opposed to incorporating them as potential citizens" (p. 73).

The consequence of the Non-Immigrant Employment Authorization Program implemented in 1973 has been to deny (migrant) workers, including professionals, the legal status of immigrants and Canadian-born citizens (Bolaria, 1992; Sharma, 2006). Bolaria's (1992) conclusions provided a forecast of contemporary injustices experienced by temporary and transient workers born outside of Canada, as he explains: "It is becoming increasingly evident that like the manual low-cost labour, professional-technical high-cost labour is also rendered as a migratory, non-citizen and peripherized work force" (pp. 226-227). Reflecting on this development over ten years later, Galabuzi (2006) argues:

> From a historical standpoint, the changing racial composition of the immigration group in the 1980s coincided with a period during which the state and self-regulating professional and occupational bodies imposed strict administration of rules and regulations in the name of ensuring the public interest. (p. 132)

Immigration policies and practices are both classed and gendered (Arat-Koç, 1999a, 1999b; Bloch & Schuster, 2002; Bhuyan, 2011; Choudry et al., 2009; Kapur,

2003; Ng, 1996, 2000, 2006; Pashang, 2011; Saad, 2013; Stasiulis & Bakan, 2003; Thobani, 2000a, 2000b, 2007a). Women encounter gender bias in the refugee determination and immigration processes. Seen in the context of welfare retrenchment, shifts in political priorities have had disproportionately negative effects on women, both with and without Canadian citizenship, and the compounding nature of social exclusion maintains multiple injustices relating to race/racialization, class, gender, disability, sexual orientation, immigration status and other dimensions (Agnew, 1996; Anthias & Yuval-Davis, 1992; Bannerji, 2000; Bunjun, 2010, 2012; Caragata, 2003; Evans & Wekerle, 1997; Fellows & Razack, 1994; Hyndman, 2001; Johnson, & Enomoto, 2007; Kobayashi, 1995; Leah, 1991; Ng, Staton & Scane, 1995; Razack, 1999a, 2002; Stasiulis & Yuval-Davis, 1995).

In 1994 while Canada was in the middle of an economic recession, the Liberal government initiated a "public consultation" process on immigration, followed by a long-term immigration strategy for 1995-2000 (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Li, 2001, 2003; Thobani, 2000a, 2000b). Discussion points for the public consultation were identified in advance, although the process was allegedly 'democratic', and the pre-set agenda framed immigration as a 'problem'; oppositional views from a social justice and equity framework were not allowed into the consultation process (Thobani, 2000b). Additionally, Indigenous knowledge and perspectives were not included in the "public consultation" process on immigration (Thobani, 2000a). The national immigration strategy intended to reduce the percentage of family class immigrants (the majority of whom being women and children due to gender bias and social inequalities) and tighten eligibility criteria both for family-class immigration and for access to social citizenship rights within Canada (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Hyndman, 1996; Thobani, 2000b). In 1994, the government also introduced a "sponsorship bond" intended to shift the responsibility for the costs of settlement from the state (and "Canadian taxpayers") to the family, consistent with neo-liberal thinking (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Hyndman, 1996; Thobani, 2000a, 2000b). In March 1995, the government introduced a substantial landing fee (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Hyndman, 1996; Thobani, 2000b), in addition to processing and health-related fees, for every immigrant and refugee, bringing to mind the "head tax" imposed on Chinese

immigrants earlier in the twentieth century (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Thobani, 2000b). These policies undoubtedly compound the material struggles (and in some cases diminish hopes for family reunification) of new immigrants and refugees, many of whom are not only facing barriers to employment in Canada but are often arriving from less affluent countries with currencies that may suffer from poor exchange rates (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Hyndman, 1996; Thobani, 2000b). While the landing fees generated new revenue, settlement agencies continued to face severe funding cuts (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Hyndman, 1996).

Canada became a signatory to the 1951 UN Convention and 1967 Protocol on Refugees in 1969 but, while refugees were admitted on an ad hoc basis, there was no formal refugee policy in Canada until the 1976 immigration act (Basok, 1996). Media coverage of two events in the late 1980s – the arrival of 155 Tamil refugees off the coast of Newfoundland in 1986 and 174 Sikh refugees landing on the shores of Nova Scotia in 1987 – fueled social antagonism and set up a political climate in which new legislation could be drafted and implemented with greater public consensus (Creese, 1992; Bradimore & Bauder, 2011; Basok, 1996; Greenberg & Hier, 2001). Subsequent to the arrival of the Sikh refugees in Nova Scotia, the Conservative government claimed that the "abuse of the system had to stop" (Basok, 1996). Depictions of groups of people seeking refuge were relentlessly negative and relied on erroneous stereotypes, which associated refugees with criminality and deception. For the most part, journalists failed to consider the reasons behind large numbers of people placing their lives in precarious and dangerous circumstances, or the danger that would compel them to leave their homes. Such decontextualized depictions were strategic and some have argued that the government was complacent in the erosion of the refugee determination system, which wore down due to the increasing lack of resources (Creese, 1992).

At this time, the immigration legislation of 1976 applied to both immigrants and refugees (with refugees who were pre-selected from abroad judged by the same criteria as immigrants in terms of the state's perception of 'adaptability') and became more exclusionary with the passage of Bills C55 (the Refugee Reform Act) and C84 (the Refugee Deterrents and Detention Bill) in 1988; both came into effect in 1989 (Creese,

1992; Basok, 1996). Similar policy shifts in the international community assembled barriers against migrants and refugees which coincided with the end of Cold War politics (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Bhabha, 2004; Bloch & Schuster, 2002; Chimni, 1998, 2000; Cohen, 2002a, 2002b; Düvell & Jordan, 2002; Greenslade, 2005; Haytor, 2000; Humphries, 2002a, 2002b; Hyndman, 1996; Jones, 2000, 2002; Joshi, 2002; Malkki, 1995a, 1995b, 1996; Mynott, 2002b; Ong, 2003; Richmond, 1994; Rojo & van Dijk, 1997; Sassen, 1999a, 1999b; Schuster, 2002; van Dijk, 1991, 1992) and also contributed to the Canadian government's ability to obstruct refugees from safely settling here (Arat-Koç, 1999a). In 1989, the Immigration and Refugee Board was created with politically-appointed members, tending to reflect the political views of the government in power, mandated to decide on the validity of refugee applications (Basok, 1996).[8]

The consequences of the Refugee Reform Act and the Refugee Deterrents and Detention Bill are disturbing: by 1992 deportations had increased to more than double the number prior to the new law (Basok, 1996). These events and policy changes in Canada were paralleled in the international context. The term 'economic refugee' began to circulate around 1985 and was used in describing Tamil refugees arriving in Europe (van Dijk, 1997a). This term and its connotations, as van Dijk suggests, was a component of political rhetoric underpinning immigration controls. Describing the historical context of the mid-1980s in which political crises in Africa and Asia led to the violent displacement of more and more people seeking refugee status in Europe, Rojo & van Dijk (1997) reflect on a paradigm shift in refugee law and policy:

> Soon redefining such refugees as 'economic' refugees, most western-European governments, supported by intensifying popular resentment (which was partly orchestrated by official discourses and exclusionary policies), started to close

8 A 1994 report by Osgoode Hall Law Professor James Hathaway concluded that many IRB members were hostile towards refugees (Basok, 1996). In my encounters with IRB members as a young graduate student in 2003, I was profoundly disturbed by the widespread and open hostility, contempt and callousness expressed when they recounted stories of refugee claimants. The IRB members made consistent references to 'fraudulent claims' accompanied by smirks and rolling eyes, and in some cases even mocking accents. Given that only one IRB member (as opposed to just two IRB members prior to the 2002 IRPA) holds discretionary power over what are literally life-and-death decisions, such expressions of hostility and ridicule are immensely worrisome.

their borders, to reduce services or to take other measures to dissuade potential migrants. (pp. 525-526)

This stance in relation to refugees and migrants is a central feature of ideological arguments underpinning changes to refugee law and policy. Through the mobilization of these arguments in the media, socio-political elites have been able to assign social legitimacy to the withdrawal of protective legal structures for refugees, in addition to the curtailment of social rights. The blanket characterization of refugees and migrants as 'bogus', making fraudulent claims, became so entrenched in political discourse that this characterization was expanded into the criminalization of migratory status. Bill C-86 was introduced in 1992 to amend the immigration act and included security measures such as provisions pertaining to identity documents and fingerprinting of all refugees, as well as a safe country provision to deny refugees the right to claim status in Canada if they passed through a "safe country" first; this bill associated immigrants with welfare fraud and criminality, and refugees as suspect (Razack, 1999b, 2000b; Jakubowski, 1997). C-86 sought to limit the number of admissions of refugee claimants during a period coinciding with escalating violence in Somalia, Sri Lanka and Afghanistan; this bill provided a forecast of exclusionary policies to follow (Razack, 1999b).

As Arat-Koç (1999a) argues: "[t]he tendency to associate immigrants and refugees with crime became so blatant in the early 1990s, that for a short time in 1993, towards the end of the Progressive Conservatives term in office, immigration was placed under a Public Security portfolio" (p. 52). While independent and business class immigrants were welcomed into Canada, refugees and family-class immigrants (particularly from the South) were unjustly depicted in negative ways in the media, legislation, policies, and state documents (Arat-Koç, 1999a). As previously discussed, in 1994, the Liberal government drew on these manufactured political anxieties to introduce a "public consultation" on immigration in a period of economic recession (Arat-Koç, 1999a).

Within this context of political hostility towards migrants, some campaigns generated important changes. As a result of the NAC mobilizing against the deportation of women fearing gender-based violence, the Immigration and Refugee Board published

Guidelines on Women Refugee Claimants Fearing Gender-Related Persecution (Basok, 1997). Legal theory and legal practice are not always congruent, though, and many racialized women in the refugee determination process have had to endure insensitivity, racism, discrimination, paternalism and hostility on the part of immigration authorities (Razack, 1996, 1999a). The 1951 UN Convention and 1967 Protocol on Refugees functioned within an adult male paradigm; gender-specific and age-specific forms of persecution have historically been excluded from the definition of refugee (Bhabha, 2004). Bhabha (2004) raises concerns about this exclusion because of "the growing autonomy of child casualties of war and the devastation of structural adjustment policies, pushing children to seek out survival opportunities abroad" (p. 235). Although Canada has outlined gender-specific forms of persecution to be considered in the refugee determination process, there are, to date, still no child-specific forms of persecution recognized in Canadian refugee law (Grover, 2007).

The Canadian nation-state and international politics

In 1984, Western media campaigns soliciting aid to alleviate famine in Ethiopia employed the slogan "a hungry child has no politics" (Burman, 1994; Wells, 2007). Such statements are "illustrative of the notion that children live outside the nexus of political calculation" (Wells, 2007, p. 60). If children are to be regarded as apolitical, then adults are the ones with the ascription of culpability; the implication in this decontextualized aid campaign is that it is Southern governments and communities that have failed to provide for children (Burman, 1994). There are parallels between the political aspects of reporting on the South, which draw on imagery of children, and a similar attribution of responsibility to people experiencing displacement, including illegalized families. In the latter case, media depictions have focused on notions of 'culpable parents'/'innocent' children. In both examples, the depictions of children as 'apolitical' and 'innocent' function to obscure, what Burman (1994) describes as a: "complex range of socio-political and global economic factors that give rise to poverty and emergencies" (p. 245).

Peacekeeping has been a source of national pride communicated by Canadian political elites and having gained significance subsequent to the crumbling of Communist

regimes. In 1992, former Prime Minister Brian Mulroney announced that the Canadian military would focus on UN service as its second priority after self-defence (Enloe, 1993). In the early 1990s, Somali adults, children and youth were encircled by the brutal violence of Canadian soldiers deployed in Somalia (Razack, 2000a, 2004). On March 16th, 1993, Shidane Abukar Arone, a Somali prisoner, died as a result of the torture he suffered at the hands of two Canadian soldiers. Shidane Abukar Arone was sixteen, and his torture was witnessed by numerous Canadian soldiers (Razack, 2004). The acts of brutal violence that were exposed at this time were not an aberration, a fact confirmed as more atrocities were reported, and led to military trials and a public inquiry. What came to be known as the Somalia Affair was a horrific manifestation of colonial violence so often seen in historical relationships between the North and South, as argued in Razack's (2004) powerful book which documents and critiques:

> the ways in which peacekeeping violence is largely forgiven and ultimately forgotten, both erased and de-raced, when the story of the violence travels from the South to the North and enters legal arenas such as military trials and a national inquiry. Race disappears from public memory through a variety of tricks, and incidents of racial violence become transformed into something else, something we can live with. (p. 7)

Just prior to media exposure of the Somalia Affair, in January 1993, the province of Ontario established a 5-month investigation project called Welfare and Refugee Fraud (WARP) vilifying Somali refugees, claiming that they were implicated in purchasing arms (with money received through welfare payments) to be used in Somalia. These racist and erroneous claims were put forward in a document produced by the investigation team (Basok, 1997). As a consequence, many refugees from Somalia experienced harassment and racist discrimination in the communities in which they lived. Pratt and Valverde (2002) wrote that the: "identity of Somalis became indelibly tainted by allegations of welfare abuse, criminality, and 'asylum-shopping'" (p. 154). They provide a cogent critique of the early to mid-1990s exploitation of Somali refugees in Toronto who were targeted by the media, politicians, and law enforcement agencies to deflect attention from the deleterious consequences of Canadian neoliberal policy-making

at this time. As the legal protections for refugees diminished and more and more people endured the consequences of precarious employment and the neoliberal retreat from social welfare provision, racialized immigrants and refugees were targeted as the cause of these policy outcomes (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Basok, 1997; Pratt & Valverde, 2002; Gilbert, 2005). In spite of the multitude of injustices endured, refugees and new immigrants have mobilized to resist this treatment; for example, protests in Queen's Park in 1992 by Somalis responded to offensive and insensitive comments from then-immigration minister Bernard Valcourt, as well as demonstrations in July 1993 by hundreds of Somalis against the discriminatory treatment they experienced from the building management and private security staff of the Dixon Road high-rise apartments in Toronto (Pratt & Valverde, 2002).

The concept of *empowered spatiality* is critical to the practice of 'tolerance', which sustains social inequities (Hage, 2000). As Hage (2000) argues, tolerance is not just acceptance but rather involves the power to position the other within limits:

> It is this discourse of limits that makes clear that those who tolerate imagine themselves to be in a position of spatial power. Likewise, the tolerated others are imagined by definition to be present within 'our sphere of influence'. They are part of 'our' nation, but only in so far as 'we' accept them. Their belonging to the national environment in which they come to exist always a precarious one, for they never exist, they are allowed to exist. That is, the tolerated are never just present, they are positioned. (pp. 89-90)

The inequitable ways in which racialized refugee and im/migrant communities have been treated are painted over by Canadian nationalism. Through a combination of content and discourse analysis methods, Mirchandani and Tastsoglou (2000) critically examine the notion of 'tolerance' as it relates to Canadian national identity and circulates in media and public discourses. The authors' analysis of one hundred and twenty-five articles from eleven major Canadian newspapers and magazines (*The Calgary Herald, The Financial Post, The Financial Times, The Globe and Mail, The Halifax Chronicle Herald, Maclean's, The Montreal Gazette, Policy Options, The Toronto Star, The Vancouver Sun and The Winnipeg Free Press*) published between 1988 and 1996,

demonstrates how notions of tolerance underpin the discourse of multiculturalism, reinforce the paternalism of dominant social groups, and obscure social injustice. The assumption is that the 'Canadian self' is entitled to set the boundaries and the extent to which the 'Other' will be tolerated and that tolerance is unidirectional (Mirchandani & Tastsoglou, 2000). Drawing on the work of Leo R. Chavez (2001), Gilbert and Viswanathan (2007) raise similar concerns in their analysis of magazine representations of immigration and multiculturalism at various historical junctures throughout the history of the publications *Maclean's* (1960-2006) and *L'Actualité* (1976-2006). Newspaper reporting on opinion polls regarding racialized relations and immigration – polls which are often problematic in their methodology and support sociopolitical elites – present the results as representative of public opinion and therefore useful for policy development (Li, 2001; Mahtani & Mountz, 2002; Mirchandani & Tastsoglou, 2000). As Entman (1993) cautions, "[i]f by shaping frames elites can determine the major manifestations of "true" public opinion that are available to government (via polls or voting), what can true public opinion be?" (p. 57). By contrast, Mirchandani and Tastsoglou point to integrative anti-racism as a political and intellectual project that contributes to concrete social change at a systemic level, and draw on examples of anti-racist journalistic writing from the progressive alternative press.

International human rights law has, to varying degrees, advanced legal-political claims of oppressed or marginalized social groups, contributing to important conceptual shifts; however, political rhetoric is not adequate to redress injustices caused by historically uneven economic and political relationships (Aiken & Clarke, 1994; Basok, 2009; Blackstock, 2009; Chouinard, 1994; Crépeau & Nakache, 2006; Goulet, 1994; Grover, 2007; Mamdani, 2000; McClennen & Slaughter, 2009; Minow, 1986; Reynaert, Bouverne-de-Bie & Vandevelde, 2009; Ribet, 2011; Roche, 1999; Ruiz-Casares, Rousseau, Derluyn, Watters & Crépeau, 2010). Given the undemocratic nature of international financial institutions and transnational corporations, claims to promoting participatory/civil and political rights of children seem increasingly threadbare (Burman, 1996; Stasiulis, 2002, 2004). As argued by Dobrowolsky and Jenson (2004): "when children do not exercise even the most basic civil and political rights, access to even the

most conventional routes to representation, whether these include political parties, the state or social movements, is closed to them" (p. 174).

Substantive social change attributable to human rights law is also questionable in domestic politics when the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms does not consider social welfare provision to be a fundamental human right (Jackman, 1988, 1994). As argued by Schissel (1997): "given the individual-rights orientation of law, the collective needs of youth are difficult to ensure, especially under the Charter of Rights and Freedoms" (p. 127). Stark disparities in the application of the Canadian Charter are also evident with migrant workers denied the most basic rights and freedoms delineated in this legal framework (Arat-Koç, 1992; Sharma, 2006). Additionally, the 1989 Convention on the Rights of the Child has been applied inconsistently in Canadian immigration and refugee law with violent consequences (Stasiulis, 2002; 2004).

Section Two

Critique of media narratives: Children and nationalism; children and neoliberalism; new immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable'/'threatening'

As discussed in Chapter Four, Entman (2003) defines the functions of framing as: "selecting and highlighting some facets of events or issues, and making connections among them so as to promote a particular interpretation, evaluation and/or solution" (p. 417). The key components of framing processes are selection and salience; points of concern are emphasized in order to define problems, identify causes (in conjunction with making moral judgments) and to suggest remedies (Entman, 1993, 2003, 2004). The frames employed in political news texts can have significant implications for politics and policy-making (Entman, 1993, 2003, 2004). In critiquing media narratives of new immigrant and refugee children, I also pay close attention to van Dijk's (1988) analysis of media texts: "the description of argumentative structures; the explication of presupposed (tacit) assumptions, norms and values; and an analysis of style and rhetorical features" (p. 126).

Jiwani's (2005) important critical insights regarding "the centrality of the news media as purveyors of hegemonic ideals, and as unifying forces in solidifying a sense of an imagined collective, one based on a shared adherence to national mythologies" (p. 50) shape this analysis of media narratives. Media organizations are "key disseminators of political information" (Page, 1996, p. 20). Page asks us to pay attention to the techniques used by journalists including framing, manipulation of salience, selective quotation, value-laden language, evidence and argumentation, striking anecdotes, and false or misleading assertions.

I have separated the analysis of each article by including the headline in quotation marks, and have organized the articles according to the temporal sequence they were published, rather than separating the coverage by newspaper or frames and narratives. This allows for a fuller picture of the types of refugee and immigration discourses circulating in the three newspapers, especially when, in some cases, reporters cover the same events, choosing similar or contrasting frames. Due to space limitations in the thesis, I could not include every article reviewed in the sample with a close textual reading, and so I looked for ones which were representative of dominant themes repeated in other articles, as well as articles which were pulled from a broad section of news genres, in order to capture a full picture of the stories depicting the educational experiences of immigrant and refugee children.

The narrative of immigrant and refugee children as 'threatening' can be identified in several articles in which they are associated with health risks and exposure to communicable diseases. The narrative of neoliberalism is also present in these articles reporting on associated costs in screening and treatment (Boyle, 1992, January 9; Brent & Bill, 1992, July 14; Hurst, 1992, November 8; Kyvrikosaios, 1993, May 10; McLaren, 1991, February 27).

"York Region public schools bar children of refugees"

Contenta (1989, January 11), writing for the *Toronto Star*, reported on the issue of 100 refugee children having been barred from attending public schools in the York

Region. The problem is defined by the area superintendent as a question of insufficient funding:

> "We're facing horrendous overcrowding problems," MacKillican said, adding the ban would be lifted once room is found.
>
> Education Minister Chris Ward said last night that the board is violating the law. He vowed to reopen the schools to refugees.
>
> "To try and use refugee claimants, who are already in a difficult situation, as a lever to get more capital (funding) is entirely inappropriate and, frankly, I don't think it's going to work," Ward said. (p. A1)

On the one hand, the Education Minister is expressing the ethical conviction that schools should be accessible to refugee children and he is assuming responsibility to ensure that this will happen. On the other hand, he assigns blame to the school board level by suggesting that they are viewing the issue opportunistically in order to secure more funding. The article proceeds with the statement: "[l]ast year, the ministry gave $110 million in capital funds to the public and separate boards in York Region" and the superintendent attempts to distance himself from the school board's decision by invoking democratic values, drawing a distinction between board administrators vs. elected trustees:

> MacKillican said board administrators - not elected trustees - imposed the ban which applies to refugees, refugee claimants and foreign students who pay tuition fees to attend public schools. (p. A1)

While the problem is framed/defined (Entman, 1993, 2003, 2004) by political elites and bureaucrats, the journalist includes a direct quote from someone who was a refugee claimant:

> An Iranian refugee claimant interviewed by *The Star* said his children have been

> without schooling since the York Region board refused to accept them a couple of weeks ago.
>
> "I left everything behind and I came here because I thought this was a country where my children could get an education in peace," he said. (p. A1)

Of note in this example of journalistic writing is the recognition of socioeconomic barriers facing refugee families:

> The Iranian parent, who asked that his name not be used, said his family lives in two rooms of a friend. High rents make it impossible for him to move his family to a Metro-area school board where children from refugee parents are accepted. (p. A1)

The article concludes with a paraphrased statement from a well-known (to this day) refugee advocate, invoking the children's rights discourse to emphasis the deplorable situation of denying refugee children access to schooling:

> Tom Clark, co-ordinator of the Inter-Church Committee for Refugees, said the York Region board is violating the universal right of children to an education, which is recognized in several international treaties. (p. A1)

This same situation is covered by a second article in the *Toronto Star* published on the same day by Maychak, (1989, January 11), with a headline that is more explicitly condemnatory: "Stop turning away kids of refugees, York schools told." This article reports on the same circumstances: the Education Minister's commitment to reversing the decision made by the school board, and the latter's reasoning for the decision being overcrowding and lack of funding. Interestingly, the situation is framed by emphasizing the notion of illegality, in terms of children's legal rights, with the Education Minister reporting that: "his officials would advise them they were breaking the law and that he expected them to stop." Additionally, the journalist reports on the moral and ethical convictions articulated by political elites including the Premier of Ontario:

> [The Education Minister] was strongly backed by Premier David Peterson, who told reporters before a cabinet meeting: "I think it's unconscionable, refugee or non-refugee, to deny a little child schooling, denying them the single most important tool to have any kind of opportunity in life. (p. A1)

Unfortunately, the dichotomy of 'innocent, helpless children' vs. 'culpable parents' is invoked in the following quotation from the Premier:

> "It's something I personally feel very strongly about. You don't punish little children for whatever transgressions their parents have made.
>
> "Good Lord, this is our future and these little children deserve an opportunity." (p. A1)

The inference in this direct quotation from the former Premier is the alleged likelihood that refugee parents are responsible for "transgressions". Such a statement can raise doubts among the newspaper readership as to the validity of claims to refugee status. And, as sanctuary activists in the U.S. have argued: "fleeing political persecution is not morally reprehensible" (Coutin, 2005, p. 23). While David Peterson's following statements have a sympathetic tone, and draw attention to social and economic barriers resulting from not having work permit, they also reflect a sense of paternalism and pathology:

> Peterson said his government has long been troubled by the treatment of refugees. "In a sense they come here and they become non-persons. They sit there, not allowed to do anything in the absence of a work permit. (Their) children are not allowed into schools. They just go backward.
>
> "These new Canadians should be invited to participate in all of our institutions. We have to work with kids, teach them English and get them into the system." (p. A1)

Barriers to employment and the dependency imposed upon people displaced by political violence are concerns, as discussed in this chapter and Chapter Two. Missing from Maychak's article are any perspectives from the children themselves.

"Immigrants let schools raise kids forum told"

Writing for the *Toronto Star*, DeMara, (1989, Jan 18) frames her article with a moral judgment of immigrant parents (also encapsulated in the headline). She states:

> Immigrant parents are relying too much on schools to raise their children, an organizer of a conference on youth and multiculturalism says.
>
> "I think it's a question of benign abdication to the school system because parents are usually busy holding down two jobs," said Lynne Mitchell. "New immigrants generally work 14 hours a day." (p. A20)

While it is important to recognize the economic pressures and long hours of many immigrant parents, these concerns are addressed at a surface level. The familiar cliché of intergenerational conflict between immigrant parents and children is included in this frame. This narrative is problematized by Haque (2010) who writes about a different context in the mid-2000s. Haque (2010) points to the dangers of this narrative (of intergenerational conflict/culture clash) in sidestepping the impact of systemic and institutional racism alongside other experiences of social exclusion. DeMara states that:

> Parents want their children to become integrated at school but resist their children's efforts to be more Canadian at home, she said.
>
> Eighty social workers, guidance counsellors and police officers attended a workshop yesterday focusing on better ways to deal with ethnic differences, especially among new immigrants. (p. A20)

There are several assumptions embedded in this depiction in terms of what it means to be 'Canadian' vs. 'immigrant', according to this frame, and why it is that members of social

services communities and the criminal justice system feel entitled to determine “ways to deal with ethnic differences”. The article concludes with the narrative of immigrant children as ‘threatening’, assigning blame to parents for the perceived risk of negative outcomes:

> Often, parents will then become too permissive, allowing their children, who are caught between two cultures, to get into trouble with drugs. (p. A20)

<u>“Only a dream”</u>

Dunphy (1989, Jan 27), writing in the *Toronto Star*, reports on the experiences of social and material exclusion experienced by many poor children, bringing to mind Bourdieu’s concepts of *habitus* and *cultural capital*.

> For many poor kids the fun doesn't start when school's out at 4 o'clock. It stops.
>
> No computer clubs. No ballet classes. No figure skating lessons. No hockey practices.
>
> They all cost money. Money which society calls disposable income. Money their parents don't have, even though they may be working long and hard. (p. B1)

This article includes perspectives from children and indicates wishes for extracurricular activities, and the pressures felt in a culture of consumerism, in stark contrast with the acute loss and terrible violence endured by many children:

> "I would like to know what it feels like to skate," says Roberto.
>
> He is 13 and lives with his brother, grandmother and two friends, plus another three, in the basement in one house. His parents were killed in El Salvador.
>
> "Sometimes I really want something I can't have - like expensive running shoes," says his cousin Ernesto, 14.

> He lives in "a bad area," in a shabby highrise on Jameson Ave. His mother works in a day-care centre; his father studies. Their once middle-class world - along with living near friends and playing with the soapbox car his father once built for him - is just a memory.
>
> If it were summer, 11-year-old Manuel, from Nicaragua, would ride his bike around and around his block in Toronto's east end. But during the school year he must pick up his younger brothers from day care and look after them until his parents come home from work. (p. B1)

The article is a poignant, yet bleak, portrayal of the everyday lives of people struggling for economic survival against enormous odds.

<u>"Help the children of new Canadians"</u>

The situation of refugee children barred from schools is followed up in a *Toronto Star* editorial one month later (Help the children of new Canadians, 1989, Feb 13). The issue of inadequate funding is mentioned again, referring to the school board's decision, and the importance of language acquisition is emphasized. The central narrative of this editorial is that of children in the neoliberal paradigm "as investments." This narrative is expressed by representatives of The Canadian School Trustees Association, as seen in the excerpt below:

> "Our objective," says Lorraine Flaherty, executive director of the trustees association, "is to convince the (federal) government that because it has responsibility for immigration, it has a responsibility to look at the educational and language needs of these children."
> It makes sense. What doesn't make sense is a potential generation of illiterate young people.
>
> Ottawa has to share the responsibility along with the municipalities, and Queen's Park must increase it share. The investment now will create savings later. (p. A12)

Ontario teachers reject standard tests for the 3 Rs.

Writing for the *Toronto Star* on the topic of standardized tests, Contenta (1989, February 23) indicates non-acceptance of some views quoted in her article. She does so with the use of quotation marks and verbs such as “charged” rather than “stated” or “observed”:

> Standardized tests are "culturally biased" and would harm immigrant children Helen Penfold, head of the Federation of Women Teachers Associations of Ontario. (p. A7)

Contenta draws on the professional expertise of Professor Mark Holmes from the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education whom she quotes to support an implicit criticism of teachers’ unions (the inference being that teachers would not wish to be accountable for their pedagogy):

> Teachers' unions have fiercely opposed standardized tests because it would make individual teachers more accountable, Holmes said. (p. A7)

Contenta aims to further delegitimize the arguments raised about the negative impact of standardized testing on immigrant students by quoting Holmes again: “He scoffed at charges that the tests would be "culturally biased."”

Holmes does raise the point, corroborated in many studies (Galabuzi, 2014; Wotherspoon, 2009), that:

> Biases are found in teachers who sometimes have lower expectations of immigrant or working-class children, he said. (p. A7)

These biases must be condemned in school settings in order to address the ideological underpinnings of social exclusion and to ensure that educational spaces are safe and equitable.

“School officials assail immigration policies”

Writing for *The Globe and Mail*, Gay Abbate (1989, Apr 22) reports that the “federal government’s immigration policy is dumping thousands of students into Metro Toronto schools, which lack the financial resources to help them adjust, school officials across metro say” (p. A11). The frame (Entman, 1993, 2003) defines the problem with a dehumanizing metaphor “dumping” which objectifies immigrant and refugee children, and the source of the problem is attributed to the federal government’s immigration policy. The ‘taxpayer’ discourse consistent with the neoliberal narrative is invoked here through a direct quote:

> “It’s high time the federal government started assuming responsibility for providing services to immigrant and refugee students instead of putting the burden on property taxpayers,” Dianne Williams, chairman of the Scarborough Board of Education, said. (p. A11)

The education of refugee and immigrant children is constructed as a ‘burden’ assumed by ‘taxpayers’. The article proceeds to quantify the number of children indicating, as Baker and McEnery (2005) have argued, a sense of alarm. The children are also described with a metaphor associated with animals (birds) (Santa Ana, 1999, 2002) when they are reported to be “flocking” to Metro Toronto and “straining” school boards. The use of metaphor is another rhetorical device with ideological underpinnings (van Dijk, 1988, 1991, 1992, 1993; Rojo & van Dijk, 1997; Santa Ana, 1999, 2002) signifying that particular children are dehumanized in order to assign political legitimacy to exclusionary practices.

Dianne Williams is quoted again stating that the federal government “creates the problem by allowing the immigrants in.” Hage’s (2000) concept of *empowered spatiality*, discussed earlier, is useful in critiquing this frame. This would imply dismantling the notion that dominant social groups are entitled to set parameters for inclusion and exclusion. Hage’s (2000) theoretical insights can expose the thought processes of dominant groups, which function to legitimize exclusion. This thinking can be dismantled and rebuilt according to principles of social justice and equity.

"Refugee children suffer in schools, teachers are told"

Tensions between concern for children's wellbeing and the social antagonism directed at adult refugees in Canadian political discourse in the late 1980s can be seen in Tyler's (1989, April 23) article published in the *Toronto Star*. Metaphor and hyperbole are two important rhetorical features of journalistic writing (van Dijk, 1993). Immigrants and refugees have often been associated with the metaphor of natural disasters (Baker & McEnery, 2005; Esses, Veenvliet, Hodson & Mihic, 2008; Esses, Medianu & Lawson, 2013; Santa Ana, 1999, 2002). Philo & Beattie (1999) problematize the metaphor of flood in relation to immigration: "The frequent repetition of images such as this constructs a very specific view of the migration process. It is presented in the terminology of a natural disaster, in persistent reported statements that go unchallenged by journalists" (p. 183, cited in Wright, 2002, p. 55). The first line Tyler's article describes the "flood" of refugee and immigrant children:

> Metro school boards are ill-equipped to handle the integration of a flood of refugee and immigrant youngsters, a teachers' conference has been told.
>
> As a result, many of these children suffer from headaches, nausea and fatigue for up to two years after they arrive, Inez Elliston, race-relations co-ordinator for the Scarborough board said yesterday.
>
> Classrooms in Scarborough, in particular, are becoming overloaded with newcomers, placing extra strain on teachers trying to smooth the transition, Elliston told a Federation of Women Teachers' Association workshop at the Constellation Hotel. (p. A3)

There is tension in this narrative of refugee and new immigrant children as both 'vulnerable' as a result of the suffering they have endured, and 'threatening' due to the perception of large numbers of children who are "overloading" classrooms and "placing extra strain on teachers". The perception of threat is consistent with media depictions of

adult refugees and the concern about scarcity of resources. There is some ambiguity in the connection drawn between “ill-equipped schools” and the poor health of children in the first two paragraphs, which is expanded on later in the article by emphasizing the need for English language tutors, interpreters, and social workers. The narrative of vulnerable children is encapsulated in quotations from Inez Elliston, race-relations co-ordinator for the Scarborough board:

> "We're seeing an increasing number of kids coming out of areas with disrupted schooling, who have had traumatic experiences and broken homes. It's much more the general experience now rather than the exception." (p. A3)

The next section of the article describes a “buddy system” which pairs children of “similar linguistic background” concluding that the program is “insufficient for the growing crop of refugee youngsters in Metro, where nearly half of all newcomers settle, [Elliston] said”. It would have been interesting to have heard directly from the children about their views on this program and the potential for exercising social agency within the school system. However, the journalist was reporting on a teachers’ conference where children would not have been present. In the final section of the article, Elliston comments on children’s experiences of settlement which are interpreted through the lens of school principals, rather than the children:

> Through interviews with elementary school principals, Elliston has found immigrant children typically go through six anxiety-producing stages, lasting at least two years, before they feel they have adapted to their new home.
>
> In the first stage, the "tourist-spectator stage," a child is euphoric, but it usually passes after a few days. After that, the "rare-specimen stage" is marked by a feeling of awkwardness that can last for weeks.
>
> A child then follows the "withdrawl [sic] pattern," plagued by a sense of isolation and self doubt that can linger for months.

> The "adaptive stage," when the novelty of being a newcomer wears off, can last just as long, Elliston said.
>
> "Assimilation" eventually happens, but the child is often ashamed of his [sic, use of male pronouns] racial differences, causing further stress. (p. A3)

This is how the article ends. Absent from this article is any analysis of anti-racist education theory and practice or the social reality of racism in Canada. Rather, the circumstances are individualized, re-invoking normative assumptions about child development. Normative conceptions of childhood, as Griffith (1995) and Manicom (1995) have argued, do not account for cultural chauvinism, economic and social disparities. The experiences of the children discussed in this article are inadequately framed through the narrative of vulnerability as well as 'children and nationalism'. The taken-for-granted assumptions in the concept of "assimilation" are not able to confront the injustice of racial and social hierarchies within Canadian society and institutions such as schools.

"Racial harmony depends on equal opportunities, citizenship winner says"

A very different frame is used in an article published the next month, which also makes reference to Inez Elliston's work with immigrant and refugee children. Daly (1989, May 2), reporting for the *Toronto Star*, advances the argument that educational outcomes for immigrant children are closely linked with social equity and points to concerns over a lack of affordable housing and a polarized society. The first person directly quoted is Elliston who states: "Education can't exist outside of how a community develops." Ellison is recognized for her work in the areas of educational and social equity and reference is made to her immigration from Jamaica in 1969, as well as the number of roles she has: "educator, multicultural consultant, guidance counsellor, writer and volunteer". Additionally this article reports on the citizenship award Ellison received. This article was written at a time when government policies in Ontario were shifting towards social equity. As discussed earlier, in the early 1990s the Ontario Anti-

Racism Directorate was established, as well as an Anti-racism office in the Ontario Ministry of Education; the Education Act was amended to require Ontario school boards to develop and implement anti-racism and ethnocultural equity policies (Galabuzi, 2014). All of these structures would be dismantled by the New Right politics of the Harris government. Daly (1989, May 2) reports:

> [Ellison] joined the Scarborough school board in 1975, and last year became the board's first multicultural and race relations co-ordinator. Her job is to ensure that 14 major policy recommendations, including multicultural training for staff and improved assessment of immigrant schoolchildren, are implemented in the school system.
>
> But Elliston says her biggest worry these days is seeing more and more low-income people left behind in the housing boom as planners and developers cater to middle class demands. (p. E3)

Elliston is quoted expressing concerns over affordable housing and a polarized society and Daly (1989, May 2) comments:

> Meanwhile, children will be educated in poor-area schools and rich-area schools whose needs and quality of education could grow apart.
>
> In the integrated neighborhood - effectively lobbied for by community groups in the '60s and '70s - services for all students are equal. The result is refugee and immigrant youngsters, in particular, are given greater opportunity to learn English and socially adapt to their new environment, she says. (p. E3)

This article is significant in its reference to the social agency and community organizing of immigrants. Additionally, the article includes counter-hegemonic (Gramsci, 1971) arguments forecasting the acceleration of social injustices that would derive from neoliberalism.

“Schools are swamped by immigrants who can't speak English, study says”

The association between refugees and the metaphor of natural disasters is taken up again in an article written by Vienneau (1989, June 7) in the *Toronto Star.* The headline alerts the reader to the “swamp” of immigrants (dropping the word children) while the first line is alarmist in tone, describing the “flood” of immigrant and refugee children. In both cases, the negative metaphor is backed up with a reference to some form of professional expertise suggested by “a new study says”. The narrative of children as ‘investments’ is invoked to alert the public to the consequences of children unable to obtain language proficiency while at the same time maintaining an alarmist tone used when reporting on perceived danger/risk. Both narratives *children and neoliberalism/children-as- investments* and *new immigrant and refugee children as ‘threatening’* are consistent throughout the article.

> The study of 27 school boards across the country warns that failing to address this problem could produce a generation of illiterate young people.
>
> "The situation has developed into one of desperation for some boards as the enrolment of immigrant and refugee children in schools climbs higher by the month," the study says.
>
> The long-term implications of failing to provide funding to teach English and French to these children "will be a generation of young people who lack the ability to integrate successfully into and contribute to their adopted country." (p. A1)

The article mentions that the study received funding from a federal government grant of $17,775 and concludes with the statement:

> The study was given to Secretary of State Gerry Weiner's office last week along with recommendations that the government accept some financial responsibility for teaching English and French to these young people.

> Constitutionally, immigration is a federal responsibility while education is provincial. (p. A1)

In the intervening years, tensions between federal and provincial jurisdictions have continued to compound the challenges encountered by new immigrant and refugee children. Citing from House of Commons documents, Stafford (1992) reports that the Toronto School Board did not receive any government grants for its English as a Second Language Program as a result of the policy disjuncture between provincial and federal jurisdictions; each level claimed that the responsibility fell within the other's mandate.

<u>"New kids in town; Unique school prepares immigrant children for regular schools"</u>

Crawford (1989, Jun 09), reporting for the *Toronto Star*, begins her article with reference to immigrant children answering the question of who won the Stanley Cup, thus beginning with the narrative of *immigrant and refugee children and nationalism.* The narrative of 'vulnerability' is invoked in her observation that "[t]he students are uncertain, shy in their answers" (p. C1). Again, the narrative of nationalism can be discerned in the following observation: "On the blackboard are the first English words the students will learn: Hockey, puck, ice."

> "These are the greatest kids. They are so motivated," says Oliver [teacher]. "I have taught in regular schools and there is no comparison. The kids are such eager beavers. They really want to learn, unlike kids in other schools."
>
> …In what has been a most unusual and long-lasting experiment, the east-end Toronto high school has operated for almost 25 years with one purpose only - to prepare immigrant teenagers for regular schools.
>
> …Unique as it is, Greenwood's [school] days may be numbered. (p. C1)

The narrative of 'vulnerability' can be discerned in the following statements: "Many of Greenwood's students started in other high schools, but were unable to cope" (p. C1).

What is unique about this article is that there are direct quotes from the teenagers, and references to the injustices of racism and violence are alluded to:

> Reynald Jeilell, 16, from Guyana, says he was beaten up in the first school he attended.
>
> "I spoke little English. I couldn't do the work. White kids were picking on me. I wanted to go to a school where Guyanese kids go. I like it here," says Jeilell who has been in Canada two years and is almost ready to attend regular classes. (p. C1)

Crawford emphasizes the students' intelligence and capabilities, advancing the argument that ESL support is essential (an important argument given the number of other newspaper articles expressing frustration over the costs of these programs). The acute loss and violence experienced by refugee children and the stress of precarious status is also recognized:

> "We have children of war. We have students who have witnessed torture," says principal Emmanuel Dick.
>
> Right now there are 414 students in the school designed for 330 because the ministry of education's recent decision to accept children of refugee claimants has resulted in an unexpected surge in enrolments. Dick, himself an immigrant from Trinidad, says some of these kids had been living underground.
>
> Some have never formally attended school, but have worked, fought or hidden in their homelands and refugee camps until they came to Canada. (p. C1)

Again, Crawford signals the importance of ESL support, with a quote from the principal:

> Once here, their desire to learn English eclipses all other dreams, says Dick, because it is the ticket to society. They need it for jobs, for surviving in their new country and - most important of all - for communicating with other teens. (p. C1)

The socioeconomic circumstances of many immigrant and refugee youth and the necessity of part-time work are also discussed:

> Although their English is still pretty basic, many of the students in Goodman's class hold down jobs in factories and restaurants.
>
> Nadia Paiwand, 13, from Afganistan, works at a McDonald's restaurant as counter help. She will be attending Jarvis Collegiate Institute next year and is expected to attend university where she plans to study law. A good student, she is one of 10 children. (p. C1)

“How Ottawa fails migrant children”

An editorial in the *Toronto Star* (1989, June 11) responds to the concerns brought up in Vienneau’s (1989, June 7) article. The problem is framed as an issue of inadequate funding, and blame is clearly assigned to the federal government. The narrative of ‘vulnerable’ children is invoked in order to place this issue squarely on the agenda of political elites. Unfortunately, this language is problematic and pathologizing:

> What will become of [migrant children]? Unless something is done quickly, many will muddle through for a few years, then end up as school dropouts, misfits or illiterates.
>
> The problem here gets worse with each passing month because the majority of newcomers are continuing to choose the Metro region to put down roots.
>
> Both the fault and the solution lie with the federal government.
>
> While Ottawa quite properly welcomes people of all nationalities, the government can't be allowed to wash its hands of them once they're here. In fact, Ottawa doesn't even tell school boards how many children to expect. (p. B2)

New immigrant and refugee children are constructed as a burden through the statement that the federal government "can't be allowed to wash its hands of them once they're here" (p. B2). The editorial continues this line of argument by asserting that "[t]he major cost falls on local taxpayers" thus invoking a 'taxpayers discourse' which is underpinned by nationalism and racism, the (erroneous) assumption being that new immigrants and refugees do not pay taxes (Nadeau, 2002). Tensions between federal and provincial jurisdictions are brought up again:

> Ottawa has weaseled its way out of contributing anything to ESL programs by arguing that the provinces hold constitutional responsibility for education. But that won't wash any more.
>
> If Ottawa has the responsibility for immigration, it must also take at least some responsibility for the educational and language needs of children who cannot speak either official language.
>
> Surely, the government doesn't intend to open the doors to failure for these children. New policies and money are both required. (p. B2)

<u>"School new world for immigrant children"</u>

Josey (1989, Dec 28) reporting for the *Toronto Star* points to the important role played by Enid Lee as the board's supervisor of race and ethnic relations. Lee is directly quoted:

> "We have made great strides since our department was set up in 1985," Lee says. Her department's mandate is to ensure equitable treatment of individuals of all religious, linguistic, cultural and racial backgrounds.
>
> In doing this, she provides information and advice to students, teachers administrators parents and the community in general.

> This could involve matters of discrimination, employment equity, career counselling, affirmative action or curriculum. (p. N5)

This is one of the few articles clearly discussing social equity. Unfortunately, the article concludes on a condescending note:

> North York educators are excited about a colorful new poster and accompanying teaching kit that can be used to explain the Canada Food Guide to students from other cultures. (p. N5)

<u>"Metro schools say lack of funding is hurting their ability to teach immigrant children; who pays the price?"</u>

Black (1990, Jan 08), writing in the *Toronto Star* reports on the importance of ESL support for immigrant children against the backdrop of inadequate funding, estimating the costs to be close to $11 million in 1988. The school boards are described as 'burdened' by "the thousands of immigrants pouring into their classrooms". The dehumanizing refugees-as-water metaphor (Baker & McEnery, 2005) is seen here along with the 'taxpayer discourse' articulated in the next statement: "Schools have been relying on taxpayers to pay for the costs because the school boards don't receive any provincial funding. And school board officials here say it's time Ottawa kicked in money" (p. C1).

The paternalism and condescension expressed by some educators, along with capitalist-oriented values, can be seen in the following excerpt:

> In her classroom at Gateway, Back leads a young girl from Iraq to a table with piles of boxes, deco- [1000] rated with pictures of presents. It's supposed to be a play department store.
>
> Back asks the youngster what she would like to buy for her parents.

> The girl stares straight ahead - as if she doesn't quite understand. Then she points to a picture of a wallet.
>
> The girl says almost inaudibly: "Wallet." As she speaks the consonants and vowels roll unfamiliarly around her tongue.
>
> "Good girl," says Back, praising this small accomplishment on the long road to English fluency. (p. C1)

Executive director of the Canadian School Trustees' Association, Lorraine Flaherty, is directly quoted, stating: "There are whole groups of kids falling through the cracks in the school system because the school system doesn't have the resources to help these kids out" followed by the oft-repeated observation about tensions between government jurisdictions: "Federal officials argue education of immigrants and their children is a provincial matter" (p. C1). The article concludes with another refugees-as-water metaphor: "Queen's Park officials say that English as a Second Language classes for *the flood* of young and old immigrants are Ottawa's responsibility" (p. C1).

> What's needed is more money - not just for more teachers but for supplies, textbooks, library books, resources and teacher aids.
>
> Even such simple things as teaching students the names of vegetables requires money to buy fresh vegetables, teachers and principals say.
>
> After all, the children need to be able to feel, touch and smell a turnip, especially if they've never heard of it before, so they can understand it. (p. C1)

The narrative of immigrant and refugee children as vulnerable can be discerned in the following paragraph. It is important to note the embedded assumptions in this representation such as the framing of "psychological and emotional problems" brought with the "youngsters" but not deriving from injustices within Canadian society:

> But teachers also worry about the psychological and emotional problems these immigrant youngsters bring with them to Canada. Not only must they cope with learning English and the culture of a new country, but they often bear scars from life in war-torn countries. (p. C1)

In following paragraphs, concern is expressed that "without the proper resources and staffing, immigrant students may become a generation of dropouts" (p. C1). While superintendents of schoolboards, teachers and other educational professionals are cited, there are no perspectives from immigrant and refugee children.

"Important immigrant reports due soon"

Tensions over mandates for education and immigration falling under different levels of jurisdiction are discussed by Valpy (1990, Sep 27), writing for *The Globe and Mail*, who also points to the level of municipal government: "Municipal governments in the cities most affected by immigration and refugee claimants are raising their voices to point out the increase in costs - without assistance from the federal government which decides on immigration policy - for their schools and social services" (p. A9). Valpy quotes the position of the Conservative-dominated Commons committee on labour, employment and immigration who advocate for immigration controls under the pretext that "this time would give our settlement services an opportunity to try to catch up with demand, our schools a chance to upgrade their teaching of English and French to the many immigrant children who know neither, and our large cities a chance to ensure successful integration of their many recent arrivals" (p. A9). Valpy includes the dissenting views of an NDP politician and academics expressing views against immigration controls.

"Immigrant service faces axe"

Against the backdrop of a recession, journalists such as Wright (1990, Nov 26), from the *Toronto Star*, report on the impact of funding cuts on programming for immigrant children.

> The province has never given funding because it relies on the existing education system in Ontario to provide adequate services to new Canadian children, [a community organizer] said.
>
> "But the school system isn't really sensitive to the needs of the immigrant students. They're not prepared for the large influx of refugees that we've been seeing lately," Morowei said. (p. A7)

The narrative of vulnerable children is invoked to address the implications of losing this educational program:

> The demise of the much-needed service means some kids will just "give up" and drop out of school because they won't get the attention and extra help they need, said administrative co- ordinator Pearl Toppin. (p. A7)

<u>"English class"</u>

A *Toronto Star* editorial (1991, Sep 25) reports that "foreign-born workers" are essential to the Canadian economy and predicts that 240,000 immigrant and refugee children (out of a total 1.2 million adults and children) will be "accepted" by Canada over the next five years. The issue of funding for educational programs is defined as a problem within this frame and the cause of the problem associated with the federal government's lack of support for ESL. Again, a 'taxpayer discourse' is invoked with a moral judgement that Ottawa must "foot the bill" for these programs. While immigration is constructed as "beneficial" to Canadian society, it is the question of funding that is defined as a problem. The narrative of *neoliberalism* framing the experiences of immigrant and refugee children can be seen in the last sentence stating that the children "represent a potentially vast resource of talent for our economic future in a global economy. It's time for Ottawa to invest in them" (p. A24).

<u>"Budget cuts belie tough talk on racism if our politicians are serious about racial harmony, they would create true equality"</u>

Cardozo (1992, Jun 09), writing for the *Toronto Star*, discusses the consequences of the federal cuts in transfer payments to the provinces resulting in diminished funding to school boards and ESL programs, as well as race relations and multiculturalism officers.

> Provincial programs to address anti-racism issues and employment equity were announced over a year ago but are still largely in preparation. (p. A13)

Additionally, Cardozo raises concerns about the ways in which immigration is framed by political discourse and the implications for policy and legal exclusions:

> Beyond the budget announcements, the trend against minorities is evident elsewhere. New immigration policies are portraying immigrants as a problem - additional restrictions on families and foreign domestic workers, and a highly publicized crackdown on a supposed crisis of crime by illegals. An even more restrictive immigration act will be announced later this month. (p. A13)

Cardozo inserts important critiques into media discourse by drawing attention to the importance of anti-racism policies and practices, and by denouncing the ways in which im/migrant families are adversely impacted by immigration controls and the criminization of migration.

“The high costs of our refugee system”

Toronto magazine writer Daniel Stoffman (1992, September 21) was awarded an Atkinson Fellowship in Public Policy, which he used to study Canada's immigration system. His article in the *Toronto Star* opens with the statement:

> Either Canada is right and the rest of the world is wrong or the rest of the world is right and Canada is wrong. (p. A19)

The problem is defined as such: Canada is allegedly out of step with “the rest of the world” with regards to its refugee determination system. He argues that the mass media are responsible for inaccurately representing this “national issue”.

> Listening to the statements of immigration lawyers and refugee advocates, one would think the treatment of refugee claimants in Canada was unusually harsh. Yet, in fact, no other country comes even close to Canada's *willingness to believe* the stories of people who say they are refugees. [italics my own] (p. A19)

Hage’s (2000) concepts of *governmental belonging* and *empowered spatiality* are useful in critiquing this narrative. Stoffman is advancing “the belief that one has a right over the nation…the belief in one’s possession of the right to contribute (even if only by having a *legitimate* opinion with regard to the internal and external politics of the nation) to its management such that it remains ‘one’s home’” (Hage, 2000, p. 46). Here we see the construction of ‘fraudulence’ and ‘deception’ routinely associated with refugees as the paradigm of political refugee shifted in the 1980s.

The narrative of neoliberalism can be seen in Stoffman’s calculation that it “costs Canada $50,000 to process and take care of each refugee claimant who arrives here. Meanwhile, refugee children from Somalia are starving to death in camps in Kenya. The United Nations has only $40 per person per year to care for the refugees in such camps” (p. A19). Thus, condemnation of Canada’s refugee system, indicating a wish for immigration controls, is presented under the guise of ‘humanitarian’ and ‘altruistic’ principles. Further references to “asylum-shopping”, a “porous system” that is “exploited” and “abused” also associate refugees with deception and the acceptance rate is described as “abnormal”.

“English, then jobs, immigrants learn”

This headline sets the tone for condescension and paternalism in depictions of immigrants. Daly (1992, Oct 14), writing for the *Toronto Star*, makes reference to “a burden on cash-strapped colleges and school boards, eager to offer English-language training but in dire need of more space and money” (p. A1). Professor Jim Cummins

from the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education is quoted as an expert on the issue of ESL, emphasizing its critical importance in the lives of immigrant children. Again we see the neoliberal paradigm in the following quotes:

> "The federal government is giving their money to programs that help the heads of families, but not the needs of children," says Dianne Williams, chairperson of the Scarborough Board of Education.
>
> "We want to welcome all these children, but our resources are being taxed to the limit." (p. A1)

There are more references to tensions between provincial and federal jurisdictions, references to "staggering costs" of language classes, which are paid by "property taxpayers", again invoking a 'taxpayer discourse'.

<u>"A strong parallel with the failed constitutional compromise can be drawn. There is no consensus on what Canadians expect from schools"</u>

Education Reporter Jennifer Lewington (1992, Dec 28), writing in the *Globe and Mail*, raises philosophical questions over the purpose of education encapsulating the three narratives of neoliberalism ("a tool of economic renewal"), nationalism ("shared Canadian values"), and 'vulnerability' ("reading and writing difficulties long after special funding ends for language classes")/'threat' ("do not want to be in class and are disruptive") in these two paragraphs below:

> Some people believe schools are *a tool of economic renewal*, best serving the country by teaching essential skills and subjects. Others believe schools are agents of social change, especially in a multicultural society, that impart *shared Canadian values*. Still others see schools as environments that encourage individual self-esteem to enable students to become life-long learners…
>
> … While schools are more inclusive institutions than before, teachers say budget cuts erode their ability to deliver excellence. Some students *do not want to be in*

> *class and are disruptive.* Immigrant children have *reading and writing difficulties long after special funding ends for language classes.* (p. A2)

Lewington reinforces conventional explanations for the disparate educational outcomes of students drawing on notions of multiculturalism (and implicitly suggests that Canada is meritocratic) and inclusion. It is worth noting that immediately after stating that schools are inclusive, Lewington writes that "some students do not want to be in class…" followed by a reference to the educational difficulties of immigrant children. This seems to indicate that she is constructing particular children as comprising problematic groups rather than tackling the inequitable distribution of resources.

"What happens when you get out of streaming strait-jacket"

Crawford (1993, Feb 12), reporting for the *Toronto Star* outlines the negative educational outcomes that result from the processes of streaming children in schools, concerns that have been identified in several studies (Curtis, 2014; Curtis, Livingstone & Smaller, 1992; Sears, 2003; Wotherspoon, 2009). Similarly, Crawford writes: "But what has disturbed educators in North America, and spurred reform from Ontario to Kentucky, is that these academic distinctions seem overwhelmingly based on class and race, not brains or aptitude. Poor. Native. Black. Immigrant. These are the faces missing in advanced level courses" (p. A27). Additionally, social and economic disparities are understood as an educational outcome of streaming practices. Children in advanced programs also benefit disproportionately from field trips, guest speakers and other opportunities. Significantly, Crawford writes:

> Destreaming was originally announced by a Liberal government in 1989 in response to a 1987 report that found immigrant children tended to be herded into general and basic programs, where the dropout level was radically higher than in the advanced programs. (p. A27)

Crawford also shares a poignant example of a woman who overcame the negative impacts of streaming through pursuing a B.Ed. during night school as a mature student

and ended up becoming a high school teacher in order to mentor and support students experiencing similar social injustices, encouraging them to think of pursuing a university education.

Also discussed, is the psychological harm caused by the streaming process:

> These are students whose self-esteem has taken a beating, [educator] says. After students were selected for the pilot which began last fall, many came to him begging to be taken off the class list because they just didn't think they could handle it.
>
> Only one has dropped out so far. "There's no doubt we've changed their expectations," Longworth says. (p. A27)

The pernicious effects of racism are also confronted as connected with streaming practices.

“A failing grade for our schools”

An editorial (1993, June 12) in the *Toronto Star* reports that immigrant children have been constructed as problems: “educators distort reality in scapegoating immigrants for the ills of the classroom”. While expressing disapproval of this stance, the editorial still represents immigrant children as an economic threat:

> Teachers do face the increasing burden of coping with kids who don't speak English or who have never before seen the inside of a school. And school boards are forced to fund ESL classes out of shrinking budgets.
>
> But that's only part of the story.
>
> The immigrant student phenomenon is largely confined to Metro- area schools. It does not explain away the problems and lack of public confidence plaguing the system across the province. (p. D2)

While the economic costs are seen as a burden, the editorial stance quickly returns to a positive assessment of immigrant children's educational achievements:

> At the same time, many immigrant students are performing brilliantly. Coming from cultures that value academic excellence, they're a credit to the public school system, not the other way around. (p. D2)

<u>"If the ESL students are failing, then the entire system is failing"</u>

McInnes (1993, May 03), writing for the *Globe and Mail*, reports on Albert Campbell Collegiate Institute in Scarborough beginning the article with the stated educational ambitions of new immigrant teenagers: "Prakesh wants to work with computers. So does Rahim. Channie and David want to become lawyers. Sohe wants to go into journalism, "but my parents want me to be a doctor"" (p. A1). He places these ambitions within the neoliberal paradigm of individual ambition and "stiff competition". The neoliberal rhetoric can also be seen in the statement "*Precious time and money* are being spent teaching English as a second language - ESL in the jargon - along with all other aspects of the curriculum" [italics are my own] (p. A1). McInnes states that: "from 1987 through 1991 alone, nearly 270,000 school-aged children (up to 19 years old) arrived in Canada. Almost half spoke neither English nor French" and then he directly quotes Carole Olsen, superintendent of educational services for the Metropolitan Toronto School Board who states: "There are many more ESL students than French-immersion students" (p. A1). The inference seems to be that educators situating "multiculturalism within a bilingual framework" (Haque, 2012) should prioritize language instruction in the "two official languages" rather than the educational rights (including second language facility) of new immigrant students. This inference is linked with the narrative of nationalism. In the following statement, some students are mentioned by name for no apparent reason other than to list the countries from which they immigrated: "Prakesh Ratnam is from Sri Lanka, Channie Mak is from Hong Kong, Sohe Riad is from Egypt, David Tsai is from Taiwan and Rahim Hasson is from Somalia" (p. A1).

The neoliberal narrative can be seen again in the following statement: "The transformation has put *tremendous strains* on board of *education budgets* and has created a new social and educational dynamic within the schools" [italics are my own] (p. A1). The narrative of immigrant children and nationalism/national belonging is invoked in the following statement: "The educators at Albert Campbell, like those at other schools across the country, *have no control over* the mix of students they greet every September. Immigration policy is set by the federal government, and immigrants *are free to settle* anywhere they wish" [italics are my own] (p. A1). Hage's concept of (2000) empowered spatiality is useful in critiquing this narrative of national belonging. As quoted earlier, Hage points to exclusionary nationalist stances that need to be unravelled and contested: "They are part of 'our' nation, but only in so far as 'we' accept them. Their belonging to the national environment in which they come to exist is always a precarious one, for they never exist, they are allowed to exist. That is, the tolerated are never just present, they are positioned" (p.89-90).

McInnes attributes a strong work ethic to immigrant students and describes its impact on the school, quoting from the principal who states: "it's been a bit of an eye-opener how much some of these kids study" (p. A1). The narrative of immigrant children as economically 'threatening' can be seen in the next statement: "Initially, many parents and children raised in the Canadian culture feared they would be unable to compete with immigrants, but the confluence of cultures and a change in the nature of immigrant students have closed the perceived performance gap somewhat" (p. A1). Racist cultural stereotypes follow: "The early immigrants from Hong Kong tended to be consistently top students. Now the students run the gamut from genius to dunce, teachers say" (p. A1).

The condescension of the head of guidance services rings some alarm bells. He is directly quoted as stating: "We have to get across the idea that in this country you get lots of students with good marks," said Bob Meir, head of guidance services. "We have to emphasize that they need to slow down a bit" (p. A1).

The narrative of immigrant children and neoliberalism surfaces again when McInnes explains that immigration and education are under jurisdictions of different levels of government. Without attributing the statistic to any source, McInnes calculates that: "In Metro Toronto, more than 99 per cent of the money spent on schools comes from the local property-tax base", concluding: "This means that money for ESL training in the schools "comes straight out of the Metro taxpayers' pockets; not a nickel comes from anywhere else," said Robert Heath, superintendent of student and community services for the Scarborough Board of Education" (p. A1).

Finally, the costs for ESL training in Metro Toronto are estimated to be $90-million, while the Ontario province allegedly spends millions more on ESL training outside of Toronto (again, these figures are not attributed to any source, they are simply "estimated costs").

The next paragraphs report that due to these costs and inability to successfully lobby for more funding from Ottawa, the Peel Board of Education covering Metro Toronto's western border decided to cut back on ESL programming [these municipal and school board structures were in place before the amalgamation of Toronto into the Greater Toronto Area and the reduction of school boards/reconfiguration into the Toronto District School Board, changes which took place in the late 1990s (Keil, 2002; Clandfield, 2014)]. Following Falk's (1994) astute observation that journalistic writing creates discourses of 'rationality' (associated with hegemonic views) and 'confusion' (associated with marginalized views) in juxtaposition in order legitimize the perspectives of social and political elites, the following paragraphs bring to surface the narratives of national belonging/exclusion and neoliberalism.

> The Ontario Council of Sikhs has complained to the Ontario Human Rights Commission about Peel's cuts, arguing that they are a form of systemic discrimination. But Mr. Kent says the board is not abandoning ESL students, just looking for other ways to provide the same training within the school without maintaining extra staff just for English-language instruction.

> "We think, too, that the students and the parents have a responsibility in this area, and they'll have to build on what we are providing as a school system."
>
> Just as there are no firm numbers on the cost of ESL training in Canada, there is no solid information on how successful ESL students are once they leave the school system. (p. A1)

There are several constructions to unpack here. The concerns presented by the Ontario Council of Sikhs are referred to as "systemic discrimination" but not systemic racism. And, consistent with neoliberal thinking, which ascribes responsibility to individuals for the consequences of inequitable distribution of resources, and power, parents are assigned responsibility for "this area" of ESL. Further, doubts are elicited within the neoliberal paradigm as to whether or not immigrant children are a 'good investment' since they may not be 'successful' anyway. The knowledge, skills, and capabilities of immigrant children are devalued in this construction in order to prioritize educational funding in other areas: areas which benefit children of dominant groups. Bourdieu's theories of social reproduction can also be applied to these framings in the sense that the cultural and social practices of dominant groups are transferred from one generation to the next through schooling resulting in particular social groups maintaining power and status.

Ontario Institute for Studies in Education professor Jim Cummins is quoted for his expertise on ESL training and his statements also fit within a neoliberal paradigm. He states: "If the ESL students are failing, then the entire system is failing, and it has implications for Canadian *competitiveness*. We have *a vested interest* in society in helping all children learn." [italics are my own] (p. A1).

"Knitting our country together MULTICULTURAL VOICES A woman who came to Canada from Austria in the 1930s wonders whether racism today isn't more a clash of cultures than a question of colour."

In a guest column, Cumberland (1993, May 27), writing in the *Globe and Mail*, explicitly discounts the social reality of racism in Canadian society, described as 'colour prejudice', by referring to the politics of cultural difference, a 'clash of cultures' in schools. Through her references to earlier patterns of immigration (including her own experiences arriving as a child from Austria during the Depression of the 1930s) she minimizes the injustices experienced by recent racialized immigrants by stating that each wave has experienced injustice. While the stories she recounts of her childhood experiences are replete with social discrimination, her take on "assimilation" is problematic. The narrative being that by the time she began high school, she had "completely assimilated", referring to her status as an immigrant as her "dark secret". She describes the ways in which her family was targeted, criminalized, and policed during the Second World War: "although my parents and I were by now officially Canadian citizens, we were deemed to be enemy aliens. We had to register, be fingerprinted and report monthly to the local police station" (p. A30). While acknowledging the pain of xenophobia and social discrimination, Cumberland is critical of multiculturalism, not from an anti-racism stance, but rather because she draws on a discourse of social divisiveness, similar to nationalistic rhetoric (van Dijk, 1992) and nationalist arguments critiqued by Mackey (1999). Cumberland writes:

> Thanks to multiculturalism, the new immigrant is told that he [use of male pronouns] does not need to adapt to his new country. Instead, he is encouraged to retain the baggage of his former home. Not only does this imply that he will never be a real Canadian and should not even attempt to make the effort, but it is also poses a grave danger to Canadian culture. Instead of fitting the newcomer into the Canadian picture, we are erecting a series of cultural ghettos, diminishing the newcomer and diluting the Canadian way of life. (p. A30)

Canadian nationalism is perceived to be threatened, in this frame, and multiculturalism is identified as the cause of social division. This simplifies the complexity of factors leading to processes of social exclusion, and her arguments do not confront injustices within Canadian society. Historical parallels are important but should serve as lessons for mapping out what needs to change.

“Are immigrant students moving ahead too quickly?”

David Shoalts (1993, Nov 25) writing in *The Globe and Mail*, reports a conflict between teachers and school principals, school boards and ESL consultants over the placement of immigrant children into mainstream classes. In this article, we see the narrative of immigrant and refugee children as vulnerable expressed in the following statement: “The teachers say this approach overlooks the fact that among the immigrants are a significant number who come to the schools carrying the baggage of learning disabilities, abuse and other problems which means they need special attention” (p. C7). Further, Shoalts reports:

> "Refugee children come to us with a host of debilitating experiences and trauma," an ESL teacher said. "There's long-term malnutrition, infectious diseases, torture, murder, political or religious harrassment, and their own parents’ inability to provide the normal security and protection to the child." (p. C7)

While Shoalts quotes directly from teachers, ESL teachers and consultants on the issue of integration into mainstream classes, not once do we hear the perspectives of refugee children and their parents. The concluding statement of the article ends with the narrative of refugee children as ‘vulnerable’/‘threatening’:

> "In the end, we'll force some of these kids into accumulated failures. And these are going to be the first ones to drop out, get involved with drugs or alcohol. Then it will be society's problem." (p. C7)

“Students bloom for hired help LEARNING CURVE / the use of a counselling agency for children with special needs has paid off”

Sarick’s (1994, Jun 13) article published in the *Globe and Mail* discusses the role of school-based therapeutic interventions in the lives of racialized and new immigrant children, with specific reference to a small group of children from Jamaica who she profiles and mentions by first name. The counsellor interviewed in this article talks to

children teased in the schoolyard about the non-violent strategies of Martin Luther King Jr. The article reports on miscommunication between educators and parents, in particular the misapprehension that immigrant parents are not interested in the educational experiences of their children. Unfortunately, the dominant frame constructs children as vulnerable and individualizes the problems they face, rather than offering insights in relation to educators' roles and responsibilities in dismantling institutional racism.

<u>"Pupil achievement linked to income race found to play lesser role"</u>

Globe and Mail Education Reporter Jennifer Lewington (1994, Dec 27) writes: "Income and a student's school can play a more significant role in achievement than either race or language, according to one Ontario school board, whose findings raises important policy questions for schools, provinces and the federal government" (p.A1). This conclusion was drawn from analysis of the school board's math test results of Grade 8 students in 1993 and 1994. It seems surprising that an article would be published extrapolating from the results of this one test from one school board. Lewington reports that: "those who identified themselves as from Africa, the Caribbean and Central and South America are somewhat overrepresented among low achievers in light of their numbers among all Grade 8 students. Income proves to be a stronger characteristic of low achievers than either race or length of time in Canada" (p. A1). There are no precise figures provided to corroborate this assessment of the influence of social background.

The neoliberalism paradigm can be seen in the following statement: "It's by understanding where the system is going off the tracks and by applying your resources to that spot that you're really going to get *value for money*," said North York's education director, Veronica Lacey." [italics my own] (p.A1).

The conclusions from the school board study are used to delegitimize campaigns for Africentric schools:

> However, the board study found that income - not race - was more influential in accounting for low achievement.

> That finding flies in the face of demands by some members of the black community who want schools catering exclusively to black students. (p. A1)

The inference in these statements is that anti-racism education is ‘unreasonable’, and is another example of the rhetorical strategies employed in the denial of racism: reversal/moves of defense, face-keeping and positive self-presentation (van Dijk, 1992, 1993). Ms. Lacey is quoted once more, advancing a neoliberal (and racist) argument: “special schools for blacks or other minority groups” is not going to be the philosophy that *drives the way we do business*."”[italics my own] (p. A1).

<u>“Adapting to Canada ... and racism: An anthropology professor links problems experienced by the Caribbean community with pervasive racism in Canadian society”</u>

In a book review of Anthropology professor Frances Henry’s *The Caribbean Diaspora in Toronto: Learning to Live With Racism,* Erna Paris (1995, Mar 04), writing for the *Globe and Mail,* expresses doubt, distance and non-acceptance of the arguments about racism (van Dijk, 1992) in Canadian society that are discussed in the book. As van Dijk (1992) observes:

> …the very notion of ‘racism’ usually appears between quotation marks, especially also in the headlines. Such scare quotes are not merely a journalistic device of reporting opinions or controversial points of view…Rather, apart from signalling journalistic doubt and distance, the quotes also connote ‘unfounded accusation’. (p. 106)

Paris consistently places racism within quotation marks throughout the article. She concludes that it is “disturbing…that the second generation of Afro-Caribbeans is less well adapted than their immigrant parents” and rather than tackling the injustices deriving from racism, Paris states: “Since Canadian society is considered "white," such youngsters identify themselves in opposition to the very society they live in. This sets up a Catch-22 situation for those who want to succeed. They may be accused of selling out” (p. C24). There are a number of assumptions and forms of mitigation embedded within these statements. How is Canadian nationalism defined and how is success measured? As van Dijk (1992) points out, these forms of mitigation argue that: “instead of inequality or

racism, race relations are assumed to be 'fragile', whereas 'misunderstanding and distrust' is also characteristic of these relations" (p. 106). Paris again indicates non-acceptance and distance from Henry's arguments in her statement, drawing on rhetorical features such as hyperbole in order to delegitimize statements about racism. Paris writes: "the word "racism" is used so often and so broadly that in places it dissolves into meaninglessness." The narrative of *immigrant children and nationalism* can be seen in the following paragraph:

> Take the school system for example. Although Henry tells us that many Caribbeans migrated to Canada because of our excellent schools, and that students arriving after 1971 did not come with high levels of education, she proceeds to label as "racist" the placing of immigrant children behind their age levels. The fact that the curriculum is "Eurocentric" is called racist, although Canada has been a "European" country since its colonial beginnings centuries ago and developed with a particular optic. That most teachers are white is also "racist" although Canadians are overwhelmingly white-skinned demographically, and the recent nature of Caribbean immigration, which is mostly working class in origin, means that few would have entered the profession to date. In addition, there is the racism of the "hidden curriculum," which consists of "cues and messages" sent by teachers and the affront of past graduation pictures on school walls that show only white faces. (p. C24).

Paris' persistent use of quotation marks indicates a rejection of the concerns raised in Henry's book. Throughout Paris' book review, we can see the rhetorical features leading to the denial of racism: excuses, blaming the victim, reversal/moves of defence, face-keeping and positive self-presentation (van Dijk, 1992, 1993). An example of reversal/moves of defence can be seen in the concluding paragraph: "But the other problem we face - one that Henry exposes and unwittingly exacerbates throughout this otherwise informative work - is just as serious. Increased racialization breeds distrust and mutual rejection. And that, it seems to me, is truly dangerous" (p. C24). In this concluding statement, the very concept of racialization is appropriated in a reversal/move

of defence to suggest that there is somehow parity between the injustices experienced by racialized groups and the experiences of dominant white social groups. This is indicated, for example, with the reference to "mutual rejection".

"Helping hands for homeless: Agencies create parallel universe to get youths off the streets"

Trish Crawford (1995, March 5), reporting for the *Toronto Star*, outlines a patchwork of initiatives to provide support to an estimated 10,000 youth living on the street against the backdrop of social welfare retrenchment. She writes about seasoned teachers with a Toronto Board of Education's alternative school who fight hard to secure funding for clothing and food for students who are experiencing homelessness, living on welfare or existing hand-to-mouth. The alternative school is the only one in Toronto that provides housing, and the youth are also involved in organizing through a community kitchen and other forms of peer support. She also reports on an increasing number of immigrant or refugee children who are experiencing homelessness after losing or fleeing a sponsorship situation.

"Redirect language funding to ESL: MP"

Writing for the *Toronto Star,* Funston (1995, Sep 29) advocates for funding to be redirected to ESL programming drawing on the narrative of neoliberalism by emphasizing costs covered by tax dollars. The key argument is that money should be taken from heritage language programs and redirected to ESL classes. Concerns are articulated over how "the pace of classroom instruction slows to the detriment of all students" (p. M1). This quote is attributed to a Liberal MP. An ominous statement from this same politician endorses exclusionary immigration policies: "Changes to federal immigration policy will help ease the demand for ESL programs" (p. M1).

Further, exclusionary policies are unapologetically endorsed: "The revised points system for immigration eligibility places more emphasis on candidates who have proficiency in English, the MP said" (p. M1).

Conclusion

The historical context of this chapter provided an overview of child welfare frameworks in Canada in the period 1989-1995. I traced the development of campaigns for publicly funded child care which emerged from Canadian woman's movements, and were framed as a social right but subsequently faded from the scene when the political context shifted. The notion of universality was replaced by the notion of targeting, and programs for children within the neoliberal paradigm focused on 'investing' in children. The implications of political discourse in terms of compounding social and economic exclusion were also discussed. The next section of this chapter focused on neoliberal ascendancy in Ontario with the election of Mike Harris' Conservative government. The social policy implications of New Right politics, as discussed in this section, had deleterious consequences for many Ontarians struggling to live with dignity in spite of the social policy outcomes of austerity. Additionally, I discussed critiques of childhood and normativity, and the importance of teachers' roles in advancing social justice principles through their interactions with children and families. This chapter also discussed social austerity in relation to migratory processes and the ways in which immigration and refugee policy frameworks were embedded in shifting paradigms.

Several points have been brought out in the media analysis. To begin with, in the late 1980s, the Education Minister and Premier of Ontario indicated a moral indictment of denying refugee children access to schools, although this was in some cases framed as an issue of 'innocent children' vs. 'culpable' parents who have allegedly transgressed a boundary. The UN Convention on the Rights of the Child was also invoked to support campaigns for educational justice. Bourdieu's concept of cultural capital can be discerned in media representations of child poverty when journalists point to the class discrepancies experienced by children, and how economic and social exclusion, and exposure to different opportunities and privileges, can position children at a different starting point in their lives. Cultural chauvinism and recycled stereotypes can also be identified in depictions of intergenerational conflict and in the tone of condescension adopted by some journalists. The denial of racism can also be seen in many examples of print journalism. The issue of ESL funding is framed in different ways ranging from an

emphasis on educational justice to concerns over the 'burden' on taxpayers. Both frames will carry over into subsequent historical periods.

Chapter 6:
Children displaced and economically vulnerable: Conceptual tensions and political praxis (1996-2001)

> "humanitarianism is the ideology of hegemonic states in the era of globalization marked by the end of the Cold War and a growing North-South divide."
> (Chimni, 2000, p. 243)

Section One:

This chapter follows the same structure as Chapter Five, this time focusing on the period 1996-2001. I will begin the chapter with an historical overview of child policy frameworks in Canada during the second period discussed (1996-2001). Next, I will analyze the ways in which immigration and refugee policy frameworks have been shaped by a climate of social austerity resulting from neoliberalism. In section two, I will critique the three narratives identified in representations of new immigrant and refugee children, drawing on sociological theories of education. The narratives are:

1) Children and neoliberalism
2) Children and nationalism
3) New immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable' or 'threatening'

<u>Child Welfare Frameworks and Children's Rights Discourses</u>

> In times of profound social change, state-controlled socialization of the young becomes especially important—and contested. Concerns about improperly socialized and educated children legitimize new state-supported interventions into families and new state-controlled programs in schools… (Stephens, 1995, p. 27)

Jenson (2004) traces the development of child policy paradigm shifts from the notion of *family responsibility* to *social investment*. In order to map out social change

and the ideas that inform each paradigm, she asks the following questions: "Who has responsibility for child well-being? What are the conditions for access to income transfers and benefits for families with children? What assumptions about the labour force participation of parents shape this thinking? Which services and supports exist for non-parental child care and child development programs?" (p. 173).

The costs for child care, social assistance, legal aid, and other social services were shared by the federal and provincial governments under the Canada Assistance Plan between 1967 and 1996 (Jenson, 2004; Little, 2001; Morrison, 1997). Embedded in the Canada Assistance Plan was the legal right to social assistance (Mosher, 2000). On April 1st, 1996, the federal government replaced the Canada Assistance Plan (CAP) with the Canada Health and Social Transfer (CHST) reducing funding for health care, social welfare, and post-secondary education by billions of dollars (Dare, 1997; Morrison, 1997; McKeen, 2007; Swift & Parada, 2004). The revocation of the CAP took away the legal basis of the right to social assistance without conditions imposed (such as workfare) (Mosher, 2000; Little, 2001).

Although the federal government placed the issue of child poverty in the spotlight in its 1989 House of Commons resolution, by the mid-1990s, children's material circumstances were even bleaker than they were in the late 1980s. Between 1989 and 1997, the percentage of families living in poverty rose: 56 percent of female single parent families and 12 percent of two-parent families lived below Statistics Canada's measure of low-income families in 1997 (Jenson, 2004). Even with employment, many families were not earning enough in the market to move above Statistics Canada's measurement of poverty (Jenson, 2004). Children from racialized communities constituted 67 percent of children living in low-income households in 1995 and by 2000 this number had increased to 75 percent (Shakir, 2011). The discussion in Chapter 5 points to some of the factors contributing to family poverty: changing conditions in the labour market to increasingly precarious work, part-time employment typically without benefits, the irregular hours of shift work, and competing pressures experienced by mothers, especially single mothers (Caragata, 2003, Galabuzi, 2006; Pulkingham & Ternowetsky,

1997), as well as the decrease in employment rates for recent immigrants between 1986 and 1996 (Galabuzi, 2006).

In the mid-1990s, social policy priorities were shifting as the National Child Benefit (NCB) took shape between 1996 and 1998 (Jenson, 2004; McKeen, 2004, 2007). While the federal government had previously promoted a tax system that aimed to redistribute income and wealth, the (neoliberal) shift to a narrow focus on *targeting* funding/programming for 'at-risk' children and families reflected "individualized and privatized views on social problems and solutions" (McKeen, 2007, p. 154). The federal government had two principal goals set out in the NCB: "to reduce the depth of child poverty and to promote attachment to the labour force by ensuring that parents are always better off by working" (Jenson, 2004, p. 178). While unemployment had decreased since 1989, child poverty rates had worsened (Caragata, 2003; McKeen, 2007). The NCB is closely aligned with the agendas of provincial social assistance programs; "the [NCB] program assumes the inevitability of low-paid jobs and expects individuals to adapt to these conditions" (McKeen, 2007, p. 160). Social assistance programs zero in on the objective of deterrence, as Shragge (1997) points out: "Social assistance should always appear as an option that is less desirable than the worst conditions of wage labour" (p. 30).

The Caledon Institute of Social Policy helped to design the National Child Benefit in 1998. While acknowledging that compromises were struck against the backdrop of social austerity in order to advance the goal of eradicating child poverty, McKeen (2004) reflects:

> …even within the progressive social policy community, social justice has become a weaker concept, more ambiguous, and more likely to obscure broader social and political objectives. It appears that the progressive social policy/child poverty sector has been turning away from addressing questions about "what kind of society we want," and thus are engaged in a process of de-linking "social" policy from social questions. (p. 99)

In 1999, hearings of the Human Resources Development Canada (HRDC) Sub-Committee on Children and Youth at Risk helped to shape the National Children's

Agenda (NCA). The NCA is an umbrella concept covering the Canada Child Tax Benefit/National Child Benefit (CCTB/NCB) and early childhood development initiatives (Jenson, 2004; McKeen, 2004, 2006, 2007). The HRDC Sub-Committee members built their arguments around the views of health and social service professionals drawing from studies on child development and neuroscience, as well as population health research (Jenson, 2004; McKeen, 2004, 2006, 2007). The perspectives of many health and social service professionals converged with neoconservative groups who were participating in the debates (McKeen, 2004, 2006, 2007). While expressing concern over poverty and homelessness, neoconservative actors attributed these social problems to individual pathology/deficits including parenting practices and family 'dysfunction' (McKeen, 2007). As Sgritta (1997) argues: "[t]he misconception that poverty is the result of individual inadequacy and not of the distributional mechanisms of the economic market is still widespread" (p. 402).

The social policy debates of the late 1990s and early 2000s, and the intergovernmental National Children's Agenda of 1999, papered over the theme of child poverty with the theme of child health and well-being/population health (McKeen, 2004, 2006, 2007). The neoliberal "investing in children" paradigm, which emerged in the late 1980s, in which children are viewed as "commodities or human resources", has gained strength (McKeen, 2004, p. 93). NCA agreements were initiated at the federal level and implemented under provincial or territorial jurisdiction. At the local level of 'at risk' programming, priority populations listed are typically single mothers, teenage mothers, First Nations mothers, and families of "ethnic and racial minorities" (McKeen, 2007). McKeen (2007) draws parallels between social inequities reproduced through at-risk programming such as Nova Scotia's Healthy Beginnings and similar conclusions from Vosko's (2006) research on Ontario's Early Years Centres. Although at-risk programming has claimed to build upon strengths (strength- or asset-based approach) and emphasizes "the importance of not appearing judgemental", such claims do not engage with the root causes of social disparities (McKeen, 2007). The charity or residual model of social policy from past eras is re-invoked through current paternalistic and controlling practices in the social services sector which draw on 'scientific' criteria conceptualizing

‘risk’ as linked to parenting skills, mental health status and addictions, generational patterns etcetera, rather than historical exclusion and inequities (McKeen, 2007). As McKeen (2007) goes on to observe:

> Clearly, we should be concerned about the potential such approaches have for reinforcing inequitable social relations. On the programmatic level, these ideas reflect the false notion that we are all isolated actors, and that we will succeed if only we try hard enough and adopt the right ideas and attitudes. They construct a version of the social that is harshly individualistic, and that can serve only to fuel a blame-the-victim mentality and legitimize new concepts of deserving and undeserving within the social policy community and society at large. (p. 169)

What has also been neglected in the National Children’s Agenda is the need for a universal, public, accessible child care system (McKeen, 2007). The devolution of social welfare and public services to lower levels of government (with reduced funding) has led to a frayed patchwork, unable to cover the needs of families adversely impacted by economic restructuring. In the early 2000s, the Children’s Aid Society of Toronto reported that children had to be taken into care because their families could not find affordable housing (Caragata, 2003); this may be attributable to the 21.6% cuts to social assistance in Ontario in 1995, along with state retreat from social housing support.

Many children’s agencies continue to be adversely impacted by the withdrawal of public funding; non-profit board membership often pulls from the private sector, encouraging corporate donors (as well as accountants, lawyers and psychiatrists) to sit on boards (Baines, 2000). Some board memberships are reflective of social and political privilege and not always sensitive to the political subjectivity of communities they represent. Children all over the world are disproportionately impacted by the capriciousness of the market and the unequal distribution of resources (Sgritta, 1997). As Sgritta (1997) asserts, “child poverty is family poverty” (p. 389), stating: “The child’s social condition is, in other words, subordinated to the social and political distribution of resources, positions and opportunities within the category of the adult parents” (p. 396).

Paternalistic attitudes about poverty take shape as one piece of a jigsaw of what Neysmith (2000) refers to as the *restructuring-caring labour nexus*. Caring labour expands into the empty shapes left by school restructuring, hospital closures, barriers to/loss of employment, and elusive child care options (Bondi, 2008; Lawson, 2007; Neysmith, 2000; Storelli, 2010; Swift & Birmingham, 2000; Torjman, 2011). As Swift and Birmingham (2000) observe: "[t]he labour involved in determining and meeting the needs of children is considerably more immediate, complex, contradictory, 'messy', and painful than suggested by most contemporary ideology and discourse" (p. 101). The strength of families stretching tiny home budgets across countless days can also be seen in an array of actions such as crisscrossing the city by bus in order to access food-banks and social service agencies, organizing community suppers, exchanging child care with neighbours, providing friendship and support, and still somehow finding time for political activism to reduce the hardships endured not only for oneself/one's family but for increasing numbers of people (Swift & Birmingham, 2000).

There are contradictory elements within Canadian child policy frameworks and government thinking on the concept of 'at-risk' children. Similarly, within the UK social work context, a paradigm shift from 'child welfare' to 'child protection' took place in the 1990s (Otway, 1996; Humphries, 2002a), bringing to mind Stephens' (1995) argument that state intervention into children's lives intensifies during periods of social change. We can see different types of state intervention into children's lives coinciding with neoliberal ascendancy. State intervention has not generated improved material conditions for the working poor or people pushed out of decent employment, but rather it has led to attributions of responsibility to those adversely impacted by economic restructuring.

Burman (1996) exposes tensions within children's rights discourses supported by the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and the "conceptual objects and political subjects produced through legislation and dispensed through its associated professions and policies" (p. 54). Structural adjustment programs imposed on countries of the South, as well as economic restructuring in the global North, do not readily sit with the concept of children's rights when austerity measures result in increased poverty and decreased access to health care and education. These negative outcomes of austerity policies bring

into sharp relief the contradiction between the rhetoric of globalized childhood (with claims to advancing the rights of children) and the reality of diminishing or non-existent child welfare policies in all parts of the world (Niewenhuys, 1998).

Neoliberalism in Ontario

> Remarks on the low price of tuna fish in the face of cuts to welfare, propagating the value of a warm breakfast cooked by stay-at-home mothers in reaction to cuts to school funding, expounding the virtues of home-ownership in an age of nonexistent funding for rental or social housing—these tropes have characterized the government's tenacity in making their policy reforms stick in the minds and practices of people in Ontario. The Harris government continues to cement neoliberal hegemony over Ontarians' everyday lives. (Keil, 2002, p. 596)

> "When governments define the rules and regulations for social programs, they also define the parameters of conflict" (Shragge, 1997, p. 32).

Unsurprisingly, Mike Harris's political-economic agenda was strongly endorsed by corporate associations and think tanks such as the Business Council on National Issues, the Canadian Federation of Independent Business, the Fraser Institute, and the C.D. Howe Institute (Turk, 1997). The reduced federal transfer payments to provincial governments (Trickey, 1997; Ralph, 1997a) intensified the Ontario Conservative government's arguments promoting the "intensification of market-dominated social services" (Weinroth, 1997, p. 64). Given the close ties of right-wing think tanks to Canadian media (with increasingly concentrated ownership), (Hackett & Uzelman, 2003; Shoemaker & Reese, 1996), it was not difficult to establish public consensus on deficit-reduction. As Neysmith (2000) observes: "policy priorities for eliminating the deficit are presented as necessary responses to the pressures of globalization rather than as one response, the results of which will not fall equally on all segments of the population. Debate is effectively foreclosed rather than stimulated" (p. 11).

The first legal strike in the history of the Ontario Public Service began in February of 1996, soon after the election of Mike Harris' Conservative party (Knight, 1998, 2001). After negotiations with the government broke down, the Ontario Public Service Employees Union embarked on what would be a five-week strike (Knight, 2001). In early winter of 1996, Ontario judges struck down a court challenge to social assistance cuts by recipients, social welfare advocates, and community legal aid workers; the judges' ruling confirmed that social and economic rights, including the right to the most basic level of subsistence, would not be protected by law (Dare, 1997; Kitchen, 1997). In February, 1996 the Ontario legislature was disrupted by students protesting cuts to post-secondary education (Dare, 1997). The first Ontario Day of Action, which took place in London on December 11, 1995, was followed by what was the largest social justice protest rally in Canadian history. On a winter day in February, 1996, between 100,000 and 120,000 people took to the streets in Hamilton, Ontario as the Days of Action continued with protests, workshops and community organizing (Dare, 1997, Clarke, J., 1997). The cities of Kitchener-Waterloo and Peterborough organized their own Days of Action later that spring and summer. The Women's March for Bread and Roses was launched at the Canadian Labour Congress (CLC) convention in May 1996; the march was a political collaboration of communities from across Canada, and arrived in Ottawa on June 14th, 1996 (Dare, 1997).

Social austerity manifested in increasingly precarious circumstances for many socially and economically vulnerable people. Anti-poverty activist Linda Lalonde (1997) spoke out against the demeaning aspects of medical care and social services for people living with psychiatric disabilities and the suicides induced by cuts to social assistance. The government had manufactured anguish with indifference, and these trends could be identified in all parts of the province: interviews conducted with single mothers who were workfare/welfare[9] recipients in Kenora, North Bay, Kingston and the Greater Metro

9 A workfare program (Ontario Works) was launched in June of 1996: that same month, Ottawa and Kingston passed resolutions preventing the implementation of this program in these cities (Dare, 1997; Lightman, 1997). There have been a number of important critiques of workfare programs outlining the ways in which economically vulnerable people are coerced into accepting abysmal 'work' conditions (essentially pushed into voluntary labour for social assistance cheques) with narrowed opportunities to live lives without poverty (Morrison, 1998; Lightman, 1997, Little, 2001; Shragge, 1997).

Toronto area between May 1998 and May 1999 exposed these circumstances. As Little (2001) writes: "Single mothers I have interviewed told me that they have attempted suicide, reduced their food consumption to one meal a day, sold almost all their household furniture and moved in with abusive ex-partners all in an attempt to survive the welfare rate cuts" (p. 16).

Changes to the Ontario child welfare system during the late 1990s obscured the social consequences of economic restructuring by focusing instead on parenting practices and the perception of the individual shortcomings of parents (Baines, 2000; Parada, Barnoff & Coleman, 2007; Swift & Callahan, 2009; Swift & Parada, 2004). More emphasis was placed on the professional agency and accountability of social workers to report cases of abuse (Baines, 2000; Parada, Barnoff & Coleman, 2007). This ideology has been communicated through the Child and Family Services Act in Ontario (1999), which accentuates state intervention into the lives of socially excluded children and families. Exposing child abuse and neglect is the central focus of the Act, rather than providing supportive services to families (Baines, 2000). While child abuse and neglect are clearly unacceptable, the context for these hardships is often overlooked. For example, Kitchen (1997) refers to a study following nine Toronto residents, including media persons and politicians, who embarked on an experiment of living on the reduced amount of social assistance for one week. East York Mayor Michael Prue stated that the experience left him "not only physically hungry but lethargic and even a little aggressive" (cited in Kitchen, 1997, p. 108). As Kitchen (1997) argues, when parents are exhausted and hungry there is a risk of triggering aggression which can lead to physical and emotional neglect and even abusive behaviour towards their children. What is also overlooked is that economic vulnerability leaves many women with no other option but to return with their children to live with abusive ex-partners. The critical point is that the cuts to social assistance run the risk of grave social/ethical and moral costs to Ontario society (Kitchen, 1997).

Another study with single mothers living on social assistance in Ottawa engaged with the perspectives and insights of a group of women born in Somalia who arrived in Canada as refugees, as well as two groups of Canadian-born women (Swift &

Birmingham, 2000). The cuts to Ontario social assistance had sharp, adverse impacts on their lives. As Swift and Birmingham (2000) explain: "[u]nlike assumptions buried in the work ethic, which suggest that financial rewards will increase in tandem with 'productivity', these mothers operate on an inverse equation: their labour increases as their income decreases" (p. 104). More time and labour is spent scrambling to meet the most basic levels of subsistence. A consistent theme in the interviews was the stigma attached to welfare and the profound concern that children would be shamed and marginalized because of their family's status as recipients of social assistance (Swift & Birmingham, 2000). These concerns were amplified by the daily humiliations with banks, telephone companies and some social services staff, consistent with the experiences of social assistance recipients interviewed by Mirchandani and Chan (2007). As Weinroth (1997) articulated: "the premier has instilled guilt into the hearts of those who have been unable to secure gainful employment" (p. 62).

In August 2001, under the new 'welfare fraud' rules, a young woman named Kimberly Rogers was placed under house arrest when she was eight months pregnant. Ms. Rogers was a straight-A student in social work and trying desperately to get off welfare and to find work to support her baby. Her student loans for four years amounted to $49,000 which would have rendered her ineligible for welfare, had she reported them. She was charged with welfare fraud, cut off from her welfare cheques, sentenced to six months house arrest during a summer replete with record-high heat waves, and told she could never receive welfare again. She and her eight-month unborn baby died in a rented apartment in Sudbury while placed under house arrest that summer (Little, 2002; Keil, 2002).

The embedded discriminations encountered in social service provision have been sharpened by racism (Caragata, 2003; Mirchandani & Chan; Morrison, 1998b). The majority of new immigrants and refugees are racialized. As Trickey (1997) writes, Mike Harris relied on flawed logic in rhetoric, which claimed that immigrants were "taking all the jobs" and that they were also emptying the public purse by their reliance on welfare. As Thobani (2000b) observes:

> The important point here is not whether immigrants do or do not use social services. After all, the very basis for the creation of social programmes, especially social assistance, was the recognition that individuals are not personally responsible for the labour market conditions which create unemployment and poverty, and that they need protection from economic cycles by having access to social programmes. What matters is that defining immigrants as outsiders to the nation legitimises their unequal access to these programmes… (p. 59)

It is a well-established fact that the injustices experienced by racialized immigrants and refugees have also been endured and resisted by racialized Canadian-born citizens in historical and contemporary social relations. Under the Harris administration, the Anti-racism Secretariat (ARS) of the Ministry of Citizenship and Culture was eliminated; the ARS functioned to promote anti-racism research, knowledge exchange, and programming (Trickey, 1997). The Toronto Coalition Against Racism articulated the following concerns in their factsheet released in 1996: reduced funding for programs specific to immigrants and refugees, funding cuts for projects and services of Indigenous organizations, and funding cuts to artists and organizations in Indigenous and racialized communities (Trickey, 1997). These political decisions to reduce funding in particular areas have clear implications in terms of defining who belongs and who is excluded from 'the nation'.

Given the disproportionate number of racialized people in the criminal justice system (Aylward, 1999), the criminalization of social service recipients compounds many facets of social exclusion. As Mirchandani and Chan (2007) articulate, these processes manifest in the *criminalization of race* intersecting with the *criminalization of poverty*. The Harris government introduced biometric fingerscanning as a measure to deter alleged welfare fraud, in addition to publicizing an anonymous provincial 'welfare fraud' line to report suspected cases (however tenuous the basis of those allegations may have been) (Little, 2001; Mirchandani & Chan). The intrusiveness and humiliation of these practices have also been seen in the criminalization of migration, which intensified during the 1990s (Mountz, 2004, 2010; Pratt, 2005; Pratt & Valverde, 2002).

Neoliberalism, childhood, and schooling in Canada

The Harris government was also implicated in splintering Ontario's educational infrastructure (Greenberg, 2004; Keil, 2002; Knight, 1998; Sears, 2003; Weinroth, 1997). Soon after the Conservative party was elected in 1995, the education system was systematically underfunded and, as a result of the *Fewer School Boards Act* (Bill 104), many school boards were denied the opportunity to function in their role as elected representatives and decision-makers (Greenberg, 2004; Keil, 2002; Sears, 2003). The number of school boards was reduced from 129 to 66 and school trustees were cut from 1900 to 700. Additionally, powers were transferred from democratically elected school board trustees to the Ontario Conservative government's Education Improvement Commission (Greenberg, 2004; Sears, 2003). It is important to point out that school boards have not necessarily played a role in advancing social equity throughout the history of public education in Ontario, and there are historical examples of the ways in which school boards have hindered educational equality and social justice. For instance, the demeaning treatment of working-class, racialized and immigrant students in Toronto's vocational schools of the 1960s and 1970s sparked student protests in 1968 and led to the mobilization of working-class mothers in the Trefann Court area (an inner-city neighbourhood of Toronto). The Trefann Court mothers articulated their concerns over the treatment of their children, and the diminished educational opportunities attributable to streaming into these schools, in briefs sent to the school board in 1970 and 1971; these concerns were dismissed by the Toronto School Board (Curtis, 2014). The Trefann Court mothers and their children remained strong in their convictions and activism even though the Toronto School Board continued to dismiss them, or responded by implementing token changes. Exposure of the often deplorable treatment of students in the vocational schools was documented by a social worker assigned to write a report on the schools in 1972, and later leaked to the local media. This media exposure generated action by the school board and further media coverage, which was not entirely successful in dismantling stereotypes or the condescension of those in power (Curtis, 2014). However, the committed social activism of Treffan Court mothers, children, and concerned teachers

played a critical role in advancing educational equity and in ensuring that school board trustees were held accountable for the implications of their decisions as public representatives (Curtis, 2014; Smaller, 2014).

Jumping back from the 1970s to the 1990s, Gramsci's (1971) concept of feeling-power facilitates understanding of historical social relations. As discussed in earlier chapters, schools and media are ideological institutions implicated in processes of hegemony and counter-hegemony. Emotional resonance is just as important as other aspects of knowing. Knight (1998) draws on Gramsci's concept of feeling-passion, fused with knowledge and understanding, all of which are significant to processes hegemony and counter-hegemony. As Knight (1998) explains:

> What comes into play here are the ambivalent effects of the way in which the narrative structure of news can displace or efface agency, particularly on the part of the powerful. It is common for the media to use the passive voice to represent events and issues, and this is usually the case where the actions of those with status and authority have adverse consequences for others. (p. 122)

The needs and interests of children, framed in very different ways, were significant to the conflict over educational restructuring between the Harris government and teachers' unions in the fall of 1997 (Greenberg, 2004; Knight, 1998; Sears, 2003). Both sides were sharply polarized and assigned blame to the other for acting on the basis of political and material self-interest (Knight, 1998; Sears, 2003). Additionally, parent groups of differing political stripes chimed in on the debate and their perspectives gained media exposure (Knight, 1998).

In the late fall of 1997, 126,000 members of the Ontario Teachers Federation participated in a two-week strike. It was the largest collective action by teachers in North American history (Knight, 1998; Greenberg, 2004). The teachers' strike was sparked primarily as a protest against the ways in which the Harris government was mapping out neoliberal agendas in the *Education Quality Improvement Act* (Bill 160) (Greenberg, 2004). Bill 160 was preceded by the *Fewer School Boards Act* (Bill 104) introduced in January of 1997. The *Education Quality Improvement Act* (Bill 160) was a neoliberal template for education reform "in a lean state" (Sears, 2003), pushing aside the

consensus-model shaping educational policy of the Canadian welfare state. The consensus-model involved collaboration (as well as disagreement) between unions and locally elected school boards (Greenberg, 2004). Some of the key aspects of the 1997 Ontario teachers' strike's significance as a news story include the effects as a public sector strike (as opposed to other labour strikes which do not have the same impact on wider society), its impact on children, and the agency of the government as directly implicated in the process (Greenberg, 2004). The Harris government responded with a law-and-order discourse, emphasizing the alleged illegality of the teachers' collective action. Its condemnation of the strike was represented in the media with politically partisan radio, print and television advertisements costing $3.8 million (with funding from "taxpayers"). Another angle of the Harris government was its emphasis on perceptions of social harm caused by the teachers' collective action (Greenberg, 2004). Greenberg's (2004) analysis of print media representations of the strike points to the ways in which competing frames gain or displace legitimacy, as well as the events which can be the tipping point in a conflict.

While "the best interests" of children/students was invoked as the key moral argument around which the legislation and strike pivoted, students' perspectives were almost never included in media narratives (Greenberg, 2004). This brings to mind Hurley's (2011) reflections on adult-child relationships: "School boards, politicians, religious organizations, and parents vie for the moral high ground, claiming theirs is the truly pro-child agenda far above competing versions of what is "best for the children""(p. 32). Educational restructuring imposed by the Harris government has had many consequences, including: "the quotidian effects of changing workloads, stagnating salaries, increased class sizes, shifting curricula, altered governance, and reduced budgets" (Keil, 2002, p. 588).

Immigration and Refugee Policy Frameworks in a Climate of Austerity

Canadian media discourse has provided legitimacy to temporary foreign worker programs by arguing for the economic necessity of 'foreign' labour to sustain key sectors of the Canadian economy such as agriculture, as well as presenting the programs as a

form of aid to the global South (Bauder, 2005, 2008b). Additionally, Mexican and Caribbean seasonal workers have been represented as a cultural threat to rural communities that have a history of right-wing populism and are thus more receptive to negative portrayals of migrant workers (Bauder, 2005, 2008b). These media narratives obfuscate the labour exploitation inherent in temporary foreign worker programs and the injustice of barriers to mobility and citizenship rights (Bauder, 2005, 2008b). Bauder's (2008b) study concentrates on Ontario daily newspapers covering a 5-year period between 1997 and 2002, a period which coincides with legislation denying agricultural workers, including migrant workers, the right to organize or join a trade union. In 2001, Mexican farmworkers in Leamington, Ontario participated in unauthorised strike actions, which resulted in the dismissal and deportation of some workers. One hopeful consequence of the strikes was the development of a clinic offering legal support and social services in 2002. Media discourse deflects attention from labour exploitation (including exposure to harsh pesticides, inadequate accommodation, and dissuasion from political activism out of fear of dismissal or deportation) through co-existing narratives identified in Bauder's (2008b) study. In presenting the seasonal agricultural workers' program as a form of aid to the South, journalists have highlighted the educational opportunities afforded to the children of migrant workers by the income generated through employment in Canada. Depictions which emphasize the role of migrant workers as fathers and husbands also provide a justification for the temporary nature of their employment, while denying mobility and citizenship rights (Bauder, 2008b).

A concurrent study (Bauder, 2005) of representations of seasonal agricultural workers in Ontario print media, between 1996 and 2002, draws on geographic scholarship and focuses on the geographic scales from which narratives of displacement are framed. The geographic scales include workplace/living place, farm/community, Canada/homeland. In his analysis of print media representations, Bauder (2005) discerns how migrant workers are valued as consumers and labour power but not as members of the communities in which they are employed, and he pinpoints examples of journalistic writing which conceal class divisions and racialized inequalities. A key objective of his study is to expose the ideological assumptions underpinning employment practices,

which have been condemned by many researchers as exploitative. Such critiques are rarely articulated in Canadian print media, as Bauder argues in his study of cultural representations of 'foreign' workers. Earlier versions of the seasonal agricultural workers program, which were introduced and expanded in the 1960s employed immigration officers who racialized non-European workers, describing Caribbean men as "childlike, indolent, lazy and stupid" (Bauder, 2005, p. 42). Associating such negative attributes with children also raises questions and concerns. Bauder (2005) concludes with a degree of optimism in proposing the potential of media counter-narratives to subvert and publicly contest the ideological arguments, which continue to provide legitimacy to exploitative labour practices.

The recession of the early 1990s and shifting Cold War politics set the scene for small but significant changes to immigration and refugee law, as well as proposed immigration reform. As briefly discussed in Chapter Five, in the mid-1990s, the Canadian federal government introduced its Immigration Policy Review (IPR) (Arat-Koç, 1999a, 1999b; Li, 2001, 2003; Thobani, 2000a, 2000b, 2007a) and public consultations which included a narrow segment of Canadian society. These public consultations were approached with pre-determined themes in order to set boundaries around Canadian national space and a sense of entitlement to jobs and resources. Citizenship and Immigration Canada's *Immigration Consultation Report* included the following statements (with a number of problematic and offensive inferences) associating migration with moral transgressions in contrast to 'Canadian values':

> Canadians value honesty and fairness. They respect hard work and people with integrity. And they are willing to give people a second or even third chance. But Canadians also expect their fellow Canadians to respect the system that is in place, and to not take advantage of their generosity. (cited in Thobani, 2000a, p. 305)

The immigration consultation documents are replete with "the rhetoric that immigrants must respect core Canadian values" (Li, 2001, p. 84) and similar themes which create a sharp dividing line between *Canadians* (implicitly defined as members of the two 'founding races' listed in Canadian multiculturalism policy) vs. *immigrants and*

refugees (racialized and from the South) (Thobani, 2000a, 2000b, 2007a). Immigration policy changes were justified by claiming that social problems were immigrant-induced (Li, 2001). This approach obstructs recognition of the ways in which the Canadian nation-state is implicated in political-economic relationships that induce displacement (Thobani, 2000a, 2000b, 2007a). The process of immigration reform in Canada brings to mind Hage's (2000) analysis of *governmental belonging* in the context of immigration debates in Australia, which positioned "the White Australian in the role of the worried national manager and in relegating the 'migrant' to the role of national object" (p. 244). Public consultations on immigration in the Canadian context followed the same *nationalist practice of exclusion* as described by Hage (2000) who writes: "A nationalist practice of exclusion is a practice emanating from agents imagining themselves to occupy a privileged position within national space such as they perceive themselves to be the enactors of the national will within the nation" (p. 47).

One of the tensions raised in the immigration debate focused on the inability of the school system to accommodate increasing numbers of immigrant and refugee children who do not speak English or French (Li, 2001; Thobani, 2000a). This line of argument obstructs recognition that political decisions have been made regarding which children are included or excluded (in both symbolic and practical terms) from the nation-state. The taken-for-granted assumption in these narratives is that the educational opportunities of *particular* children will be compromised and that these children from dominant groups, along with their parents, "occupy a privileged position within national space" (Hage, 2000, p. 47). This line of argument also represents Canada as isolated from the political and economic relationships that have led to increasing numbers of children compelled to migrate with their families (or unaccompanied).

The media coverage of the public consultations on immigration in Canada had an immense impact on public opinion and facilitated the process of gaining public support for future immigration restructuring (Thobani, 2000a, 2000b, 2007a). Returning to Hage's (2000) analysis, Canadians from dominant social groups were engaged in exercising *governmental belonging* in the immigration consultations. As Hage (2000) explains: "It is governmental belonging which gives one not only the position of cultural

dominance within the field, but also, as we have seen, the power to position others within it" (p. 55).

In the late 1990s, the Immigration Legislative Review Advisory Group (1997) released its report "Not Just Numbers: A Canadian Framework for the Future of Immigration" listing 172 recommendations for a new immigration act (Arat-Koç, 1999a, 1999b; Macklin, 2001b; Thobani, 2000a, 2000b, 2007a). The "Not Just Numbers" report applied private market norms to Canadian migration policy (Macklin, 2001b), cementing a neoliberal approach to immigration (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Macklin, 2001b). As Arat-Koç (1999a) astutely states: "Rather than framing the nature of changes in Canadian immigration in simplistic dichotomies of pro- or anti-immigration, I find it analytically more useful to focus on how different categories of immigrants are treated and how the state approaches rights and entitlements of immigrants" (p. 41). Immigrants who have had capital to invest in Canada have been warmly welcomed while fewer family class immigrants or refugees have obtained citizenship (the reduction in the numbers of family class immigrants or refugees accepted pushes many people into precarious status). The family class category is inflected by assumptions about gender and racialized women from the global South (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Donkor, 2004; Thobani, 2000a, 2000b, 2007a). As discussed in Chapter Two, until 1974 women were not even considered as the principal immigration applicant (they were automatically denied this option, with the assumption that the husband would be the applicant) (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Donkor, 2004). Additionally, immigrants from the "economic class" continue to face barriers to employment.

The devolution of settlement services to the voluntary sector and the erosion of basic social rights and support (such as language training) provided under the welfare state have intensified relations of dependence (especially dependence on the family). This manufactured dependence is ironic, exposing the contradictions of neoliberal rhetoric emphasizing individual autonomy (Arat-Koç, 1999a).

The increasing suspicion and hostility towards refugees that intensified over the 1990s has also, ironically, cemented relations of dependence since barriers to employment (including lack of accreditation) constrain the possibility to secure a

livelihood. Colonial storylines are invoked in representations of refugees as 'deceptive' and 'abusers of Canadian generosity' (Razack, 1999a, 1999b, 2000b). These storylines pivot around national myths of 'civilized white people' authorized to set parameters around national resources, and who risk being deceived (Razack, 2000b). Such myths underpin increasingly exclusionary refugee policies that have introduced identity documents and other measures to deter and punish allegedly fraudulent claims. Identity documents provisions can be seen as: "a pedagogy of citizenship, one that is required in the building of an unequal *structure* of citizenship" (Razack, 2000b). Nationalist storylines informing these policies obfuscate analysis of the unlikelihood of fraud, the contexts from which people are forced to migrate and seek refugee status, as well as the injustice and difficulties imposed mostly on women and children who have had to wait three years for equal citizenship (Razack, 2000b).

<u>Baker v. Canada</u>

Baker v. Canada, [1999] 2 S.C.R. 817 set an important legal precedent by incorporating principles of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child into Canadian law (Aiken & Scott, 2000; Crépeau & Nakache, 2006). As Aiken and Scott (2000) explain: "The Supreme Court's decision in *Baker* was a step forward in terms of taking children's rights seriously in the immigration context, an area in which notions of privilege and national interest, rather than rights, permeate both legal and political discourse" (p. 253).

Ms. Mavis Baker moved to Canada from Jamaica in 1981 and was employed as a live-in domestic worker (with precarious legal status after overstaying a visa) to support her children, four of whom were born in Canada between 1985 and 1992. After her last child was born, Ms. Baker experienced an attack of post-partum psychosis. When her application for Humanitarian & Compassionate consideration (to prevent her deportation and thus avoid separation from her children) was refused without explanation, Ms. Baker's counsel requested clarification from the immigration officers reviewing the case and received the following notes (quoted in Aiken, & Scott, 2000, p. 218):

This case is a catastrophy *[sic]*...

> The **PC** is a paranoid schizophrenic and on welfare. She has no qualifications other than as a domestic. She has FOUR CHILDREN **IN** JAMAICA **AND** ANOTHER FOUR BORN HERE. She will, of course, be a tremendous strain on our social welfare systems for (probably) the rest of her life. There are no **H&C** factors other than her FOUR CANADIAN-BORN CHILDREN. Do we let her stay because of that? I am of the opinion that Canada can no longer afford this type of generosity.

The case was brought to the Federal Court of Appeal where it was dismissed, and then appealed to the Supreme Court of Canada where it was supported by The Canadian Council of Churches, the Charter Committee on Poverty Issues, and a coalition comprising the Canadian Foundation for Children, Youth and the Law, the Defence for Children International-Canada, and the Canadian Council for Refugees. However, the court refused leave to intervene to Ms. Baker's children as well as a coalition comprising the African Canadian Legal Clinic, the Congress of Black Women of Canada, and the Jamaican Canadian Association. This coalition sought to assist the court in confronting the injustice of racial bias in immigration law and policy (Aiken, & Scott, 2000).

The Charter Committee on Poverty Issues contributed to arguments that the decision had violated the UNCRC and sections 7 and 15 of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, pointing to "intersecting stereotypes reflected in the immigration officer's notes concerning Ms. Baker's identity and attributed status as a Black woman, single mother, social assistance recipient, psychiatric survivor and immigrant" (Aiken, & Scott, 2000, p. 221). The Charter Committee also pointed to the discriminatory treatment of Ms. Baker's children, and the hardships endured, resulting from the biased view of their mother and the family's economic vulnerability (Aiken, & Scott, 2000). That Ms. Baker was a social assistance recipient was clearly viewed by the immigration officers as a basis for exclusion. This brings to mind Jennifer Hyndman's (1996) critique of neoliberal politics and displacement: "a neo-liberal argument might use an econometric

assessment of the average contribution of such a person as the basis for deciding whether such immigration is a good investment" (p. 7).

The litigation team for Ms. Baker and her children had collaboratively decided that the African Canadian Legal Clinic would address the historic and contemporary injustice of systemic racism in Canadian immigration law but they were denied the opportunity to do so by the court (Aiken, & Scott, 2000). The Canadian Council of Churches argued against "'legal apartheid' whereby Canada's human rights protections are applied in such a manner as to confine non-citizens to a legal space inferior to that enjoyed by citizens" (cited in Aiken, & Scott, 2000, p. 225). The seven Supreme Court Justices voted unanimously in favour of Ms. Baker's appeal, with the majority basing their conclusions partly on articles of the UNCRC, specifically the principle of "the best interests of the child". While this case has set an important legal precedent, the limitations rest in the discretionary power of immigration officials and the reality that many H & C applicants do not have access to legal counsel, particularly with cuts to legal aid programs under provincial jurisdiction. Additionally, the issues of systemic racism and social discrimination encountered by welfare recipients (as well as antipathy towards single mothers and people living with psychiatric disabilities) were not addressed by the Supreme Court Justices. And, although the principle of "the best interests of the child" was invoked in this decision, it is still not clear what kind of meaningful input children will be able to have in legal processes since the Baker children were not given the opportunity to do so by the Canadian courts (Aiken, & Scott, 2000). The Supreme Court's decision also included this caveat: "... [t]hat is not to say that the children's best interests must always outweigh other considerations, or that there will not be other reasons for denying an H & C claim even when the children's interests are given this consideration" (cited in Aiken, & Scott, 2000, p. 238). Aiken and Scott raise the critical question: "In what circumstances would countervailing state interests outweigh the best interests of children?"

Carr (2009) provides a politically influential critique of the "best interests of the child" approach in U.S. immigration law and procedure. Given the closer alignment of

U.S. and Canadian migration law, comparative analysis needs urgent and ongoing attention.

Media and displacement in the 1990s

In an astute essay on the political economy of children affected by war, Hick (2001) examines three critical factors: free trade and direct foreign transnational corporation investment/incursion, forced structural adjustment programs, and diverging per capita incomes between countries. Additionally, he raises concerns about the stockpiles of weapons from the Cold War being sold internationally to contexts of political violence and armed conflict. These stockpiles of weapons have intensified violent wars.

Robins' (2003) study focuses on U.S. newspaper coverage of the resettlement of the 'Lost Boys' of Sudan in the early 2000s. The phrase 'Lost Boys' to describe the displacement of young men from Sudan was first used by aid workers alluding to the parentless children of Neverland in *Peter Pan.* Journalists subsequently took up this phrase without any attribution or reflection on its significance, for instance, the paternalism inherent in referring to young, racialized, refugee men as "boys". The narratives problematized in her study were constructed around dichotomies of 'primitive'/'civilized', poverty/wealth, and ignorance/knowledge, and the ideological assumptions underpinning them preclude a serious discussion of the causes of displacement. Similarly, Humphries (2002b) critiques racially marked binaries (such as civilized/uncivilized, cultured/primitive, rational/emotional etc.) that are implicated in "the management of identities and cultures in inclusionary and exclusionary ways" (p. 212). Concepts of democracy and capitalism are often conflated in U.S. media discourses, sidestepping any critical analysis of neoliberal globalization and forced migration (Robins, 2003).

Proposition 187

Santa Ana's (1999) study focuses on the ways in which prose metaphor in print media informs public discourse on immigration and ignites public opposition to social

rights for both documented and undocumented immigrants. His case study centres on the political debate leading up to the anti-immigrant referendum Proposition 187 which would have denied access to health care and education for undocumented immigrants in California (state courts determined that it was unconstitutional subsequent to the vote in favour of the proposition). The news articles reviewed in his study are taken from the *Los Angeles Times* since it has the widest circulation of any newspaper in the state.

He draws from cognitive science and earlier research on figurative language in order to understand the ways in which metaphors structure thought and action and "the potential for conceptual change of our political world views" (p. 195). The most dominant set of metaphors Santa Ana problematizes in his study equate immigrants with animals, attempting to justify social inequity. Santa Ana also points out how economic arguments are presented through anecdotes by proponents of Proposition 187, which are then reported in the media, redirecting public outrage toward those who are most adversely impacted by neoliberal globalization.

Section Two

Critique of media narratives: Children and nationalism; children and neoliberalism; new immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable'/'threatening'

"City's strength linked to schools' health"

John Barber (1996, Jan 19), writing for the *Globe and Mail*, reports on the issue of educational funding within a neoliberal paradigm. He takes the interests of middle class and affluent residents as the starting point for his arguments:

> Middle-class city residents may or may not flee to outer suburbia in search of a tax break, according to Prof. Bossons [University of Toronto economics professor]. But if the quality of their public schools decline, they'll be gone like yesterday's dinner.

> This is already an issue throughout Metro Toronto, where schools that once served nice homogenous neighbourhoods are strained to the breaking point by influxes of non-English-speaking immigrant and refugee children as well as the children of poverty and of broken homes. As the report notes, it costs more to educate such students well. (p. A8)

While immigrant and refugee children are only mentioned peripherally in this article, they are constructed as an economic threat and 'burden'; this frame is emphasized through hyperbole with expressions such as "strained to the breaking point". Subtle racism and class discrimination is expressed in the description of "nice homogenous neighbourhoods".

<u>"School opens door to 'motel kids' programs tailored for students who live in temporary housing alleviate the stigma of being homeless"</u>

Social Policy Reporter Margaret Philp (1996, Feb 21), writing in the *Globe and Mail*, charts out the relationship between child poverty and educational outcomes, beginning her article with a stark snapshot of social injustice:

> At West Hill Public School in Scarborough, the social consequences of Toronto's homelessness crisis are sitting in the classrooms and eating sandwiches in the school lunchroom.
>
> About a third of the school's population of 250 children live in motels along the Scarborough strip. But with students registered at the school for only a matter of months, sometimes weeks, there were 690 children who passed in and out of West Hill's classrooms over the course of last year. (p. A8)

Increasing numbers of children had been experiencing homelessness and temporary accommodation, and the article recounts teachers' efforts to support both their material and educational needs. This article was published only a few months after the Ontario provincial government cut social assistance by over 20% in conjunction with other social

policy changes (including the abandonment of social housing). This point is made more acute when considering the impact of disrupted education on children's lives. This article also places a spotlight on the inadequately acknowledged issue of immigrant children experiencing homelessness:

> "Many of the kids who come in here are behind, there's no question about that," said Anita DesRosiers, the teacher of a special classroom of immigrant children living in the motels who arrive at West Hill with little command of English.
>
> "Their lives have been disrupted so often, moving from school to school. If you're constantly moving, it's hard to catch up. This instability is a real problem for children. Sometimes they can't sleep at night. I've seen children fall asleep on the floor." (p. A8)

Astonishingly, there are parents who are utterly devoid of empathy, as Philp states in her description of the administrative aspects of supporting children: "And evening meetings have been held to assuage the parents of *regular* students worried about the constant disruption in the classroom" (p. A8) [italics my own. The adjective 'regular' brings to mind critiques of childhood and normativity, in terms of Eurocentric views, cultural chauvinism, and middle class assumptions embedded within conceptions of 'normal' and 'good' childhoods]. Concerns are expressed by educational administrators over social cuts and funding against the backdrop of neoliberal ascendancy.

"Education funding facing turf war crisis gaps between rich, poor boards could stir Tory schools takeover"

Gerard (1996, May 11), reporting for the *Toronto Star*, describes a political conflict over education financing and the economic disparities between school boards in different regions. Former Education Minister John Snobelen is quoted stating: "we're not getting good value (despite $400 million in cuts this year) for the taxpayer dollar". Gerard raises concerns over provincial funding cuts to education and the lack of funding

for immigrant children, children with special needs, and children who suffer from social and economic exclusion, and calls for equitable redistribution of tax revenue. Gerard points out:

> It's unlikely, however, that a tax-fighting Harris government would accept a sharp rise in the provincial income tax on the heels of a tax cut. (p. A19)

Gerard then goes on to propose:

> A second possibility is provincial pooling of industrial and commercial taxes. They would be pooled into one pot and redistributed on a per pupil basis. (p. A19)

<u>"Freedom, justice are lessons students take to heart"</u>

Writing for the *Toronto* Star, Mary Curran (1997, January 21), who is a high school teacher in North York, recounts anecdotes about her students. She begins with a description of her students who rise to sing "O Canada" and, as she writes: "face a large map of the world placed beside the blackboard. Countries of origin, carefully plotted in September, lie scattered in all directions across that map. And often, while we stand in silence, I think of the distances that we have travelled to meet together in this room" (p. A13). The narrative of children and nationalism is invoked when she writes:

> Many of us have found a home here, free from bombs and bullets delivered in daylight and justice dispatched by "security" forces in the dark. During the anthem, there are moments when I remember relatives beyond the seas, accustomed to bloodshed in the name of politics, who marvel at my adopted country where people peacefully protest, debate and vote on questions as grave as political partition. (p. A13)

This description seems to gloss over social disparity and violence experienced in Canada (which can be just as oppressive for Indigenous and racialized communities as in other

parts of the world), often overlooked by people who have never experienced it. However, this passionate teacher, who indicates that she is also an immigrant ("my adopted country"), is clearly striving for social justice-oriented curricula, built from the interests and lived experiences of students:

> At the back of the room, the students have written, in large print, the freedoms they think are the most important from their study of the 1989 United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child - freedom of expression, of thought and conscience, freedom from abuse and neglect, and from discrimination. As the year progresses other posters will replace these signs, after detailed, thorough work on communities in different places and in different time periods.
>
> Already that research has begun. Work in class has focused on the lives of Hebrew children in Egypt in the time of Moses, African American children in the United States in Martin Luther King's time and First Nations children in Canada today. It is not difficult to recognize from this work that the words "freedom" and "justice" are important when any people struggle to create and maintain a sense of identity and community. (p. A13)

"Of tortured children and tax cuts"

Writing for the *Toronto Star*, Cameron Smith's (1997, April 19) exposure of how children are pulled into the orbit of political violence should have been consequential for how readers think about displacement. He writes:

> In the realm of the unspeakable, brutalizing children has no rival. In many parts of the world, they are tortured. Or they are victims of war or have seen parents killed or have lived in terror, hiding for their lives. Or they are left disoriented and rootless after too long in refugee camps.

> They come to Toronto as refugees and here we have no language to sketch their pain. (p. C6)

He then describes the degree of anguish experienced by refugee children once in Canada and the different ways that can be manifested. Speaking about the psychological impact of exposure to, and direct experience of, torture, he quotes from Dr. Marlinda Freire:

> About 10 per cent of the children in Toronto's public schools, upwards of 7,000 students, have entered Canada as refugees, and more than three-quarters of them have needed help - or "intervention," as it is called by Dr. Marlinda Freire, chief of psychiatric services for the Toronto Board of Education. (p. C6)

A heart-puncturing anecdote of one girl's experience of torture emphasizes the degree of suffering endured and points to the cruelty of withdrawing mental health and educational supports. Unfortunately, the article ends on an odd note, with the narrative of children and neoliberalism, although the critical point of the article is to ensure that supports are there for refugee children:

> This is but one of the special services offered by the Toronto board. It's essential to sustainability. The equation is simple: teach people to learn so they can compete in the information economy that's emerging; otherwise they'll be left hewing more wood and drawing more water. (p. C6)

"Alone in the cold, cold city"

Writing for the *Toronto Star*, Muldoon (1997, September 6) reviews a children's book on the subject of immigration: *A Turtle Called Friendly* (Rubicon, ages 4 to 8), by Oshawa's Jean Sangwine, which she describes as: "a clear-eyed little chronicle of what happens to 8-year-old Chinese immigrant Ming, when he moves to what could be any burb in the GTA, to live with his grandmother and father, who's pulling the night shift in

a factory" (p. M20). Sangwine, the author, is an ESL teacher, and the illustrator is Bernadette Lau, who moved to Thunder Bay from Hong Kong as a teenager and studied art at the Ontario College of Art and Design. Muldoon's children's book review on the theme of immigration is directed primarily at an audience of educators. Literary publications and book review sections of newspapers can be strengthened by including articles on social justice themed children's literature, for instance the children's books published by Groundwood Books. These stories can have a pedagogical function in terms of expanding children's literature canons and contesting dominant representations of Canadian nationalism and national belonging (Bradford, 2008, 2011; Reimer, 2008a, 2008b).

"Immigrant kids better adjusted, study says"

Carey (1998, October 27), demographics reporter for the *Toronto Star*, writes about the findings of a study from the Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Settlement at Toronto's three universities. This article provides a positive snapshot of the strengths, knowledge, and resilience of immigrant and refugee children as well as their parents who are strong role models.

> Immigrant and refugee children are doing better emotionally and academically than their Canadian-born peers, even though far more of them are poor, according to a new study.
>
> And, the study suggests, they may do better because of their family's hope for the future…
>
> …They also "consistently outperform native-born children in school and are more likely to be class valedictorians," says the study, based on a Statistics Canada survey of 23,000 children, their parents, teachers and principals. (p. A1)

The article oversimplifies the adverse circumstances of Canadian-born children living in poverty:

> The findings "suggest that poverty among the native-born has a different meaning than it has for newly arrived immigrants," the study says. "The immigrant context of hope for a better future lessens poverty's blows; the hopelessness of majority-culture poverty accentuates its potency."
>
> Poor Canadian-born families are more likely to be headed by a single, often-depressed parent, the study says. Fifty-nine per cent of the Canadian-born families in poverty are led by a single parent, compared to a third of immigrant ones.
>
> Most of the mental health problems of poor Canadian-born children are explained by their family circumstances rather than poverty itself, it says. (p. A1)

This simplistic and problematic assessment of complex issues recycles many stereotypes. Although there is a mental health legacy deriving from poverty, what is less fully understood is the social discrimination faced by people living with mental illness, resulting in barriers to employment and, consequently, poverty. Additionally, there is no context provided which might point to the discrepancies between declining unemployment rates (more people employed with precarious, contingent work) and increasing rates of child poverty, as discussed in this chapter and Chapter Five. Hope informs political action and is linked with a sense of purpose. Hope as an isolated element will not be able to dissolve the problems associated with class disparities, systemic racism, unrecognized credentials, and workplace injustices. That can only be accomplished by sustained collective action such as the development of Immigrant Workers' Centres, which can challenge workplace injustices through legal action and social justice campaigns (Choudry et al.; Choudry & Henaway, 2012; Choudry & Thomas, 2013).

The news article continues with the following arguments:

> In contrast, poor immigrant families seem to be able to provide emotional stability, and the mental health effects of poverty in these families are more likely due to material deprivation.

> "It is almost as if for many new settlers, unemployment and poverty are part of the process of becoming a Canadian, but that the promise of better things to come sustains people during an initial period of adversity," it says.
>
> But for native-born Canadians, "poverty is not part of an unfolding process that holds out the hope of better things to come."
>
> Instead, poverty tends to be part of a cycle of family dysfunction, single parenthood, poor parenting, alcohol abuse and mental illness, "each of which jeopardizes the mental health of children," it says. (p. A1)

These individualistic framings are consistent with neoliberal thinking.

<u>"Working mothers have smart kids too, study finds: Contradicts other research"</u>

Evenson (1998, Oct 29) writing for the *National Post*, reports the results from the National Longitudinal Survey of Children and Youth which offers empirical support to the argument that children are not adversely affected by working mothers. This article was not published in the post-war era of pastel appliances when there were more narrow expectations about the role of mothers confined to the private sphere of the home, but rather in 1998. Neoconservative family values are embedded within structures like asbestos.

> However, these findings contradict many long-term studies, said Mark Genuis, executive director of the National Foundation for Family research and Education, which has examined such studies going back to the late 1950s. "The data are very clear," Mr. Genuis said. (p. A6)

Negative depictions of single mothers resonate politically with this journalist:

> Perhaps not surprisingly, the children of single parents do not fare as well in school as children with two parents.
>
> They are more likely to repeat grades, possess poorer language skills and are in poorer health than other children. (p. A6)

While there are a number of assumptions about single mothers that can be unpacked such as alleged deficit parenting skills and individualized framings of social problems, the journalist does provide a positive snapshot of immigrant children:

> The study found that immigrant children grow and develop at least as well as Canadian-born children and often do better in school, even though 30% of new immigrant families are poor compared with 13% of all Canadian families. (p. A6)

"School boards prepare for refugee students"

Chamberlain (1999, April, 8) writing for the, *Toronto Star*, begins with the narrative of refugee children as 'vulnerable':

> School boards are preparing for an onslaught of thousands of traumatized young refugees from Kosovo. (p. A1)

The next few statements quote from the president Ontario Public School Boards' Association about the educational, health, and mental health needs of refugee children from Kosovo, followed by an explanation of previously articulated tensions (in earlier print journalism) over funding jurisdictions with education within Ontario's mandate and the federal government regulating immigration and refugee policy.

> In the past, Ontario boards had the flexibility to raise taxes to provide such services but that power has been taken away by the Tory government.
>
> Under the current system, boards are financed based on their enrolment March 31, so no money would be available for the refugees this year. (p. A1)

Former Ontario Premier Mike Harris is directly quoted and his comments infer that supporting refugees is a 'burden':

> "We have notified the federal government that we're prepared to once again do our share, more than our share, to accommodate these refugees," said Premier Mike Harris. (p. A1)

The following quotations from the chair of the Toronto District School Board frame refugees as 'threatening' by "causing problems for the board" through conflicts and violence:

> Eventually, many of the refugee children are likely to wind up in Toronto schools if their families stay permanently and move here seeking work, said Gail Nyberg, chair of the Toronto District School Board.
>
> The conflict has already caused problems for the board, she said.
>
> In one adult education class, anger management counsellors stepped in when a disagreement arose between students of Serbian and Albanian background.
>
> Nyber said she hopes the situation will be calmer in a few months when the refugees are likely to wind up in Toronto.
>
> The board faced similar problems during the Persian Gulf War when Iraqi students clashed with others, she said. (p. A1)

The last sentence assigns blame to Iraqi students who "clashed with others". There is no mention of the likelihood that Iraqi students had to endure discrimination and racism in North America against the backdrop of the Persian Gulf War.

"Ontario funds project for refugee children"

Boyle (1999, July 31) writing for the *Toronto Star,* reports on two programs to reduce homelessness and to support immigrant and refugee children, funded by the Ontario Trillium Foundation which, as Boyle reports, is operated by the Ministry of Citizenship, Culture and Recreation with a mandate to disperse funds that will "enrich or protect the quality of life in Ontario". It has existed since 1982. The word count for this article is low (213) so little context is provided apart from reporting that the money allocated was: "$375,700 over two years for the Building Bridges program offered by the International Children's Institute to help refugee and immigrant children develop coping skills" (p. A1). We can discern the narrative of vulnerability. There are no perspectives from immigrant and refugee children on any matters impacting on their lives or how they feel about perceptions of their "coping skills".

<u>"These refugees and immigrants can be deadly: Adequate medical screening process doesn't exist"</u>

Several articles have associated immigration with health risks such as exposure to communicable diseases. The narrative of neoliberalism is also present in these articles reporting on associated costs in screening and treatment (Boyle, 1992, January 9; Brent & Bill, 1992, July 14; Kyvrikosaios, 1993, May 10; McLaren, 1991, February 27). Francis' (1999, Aug 21) writing for the *National Post* adds to the pile, attributing blame for health crises to immigrants and refugees. In this article, we can see the rhetorical features identified by Page (1996): manipulation of salience, selective quotation, value-laden language, striking anecdotes, and false or misleading assertions (p. 20). To begin with:

> Ottawa's immigration and refugee incompetence is killing Canadians. (p. D3)

The dehumanization of refugees can be seen through the use of animal metaphors (Baker & McEnery, 2005; Santa Ana, 1999, 2002; Santa Ana, Morán & Sánchez, 1998). In the following statement, the journalist constructs an association between refugees and social threat through expressions such as "get in here" and "lets them loose" (expressions typically used to describe animals and criminals):

> The refugees get in here, as Dr. Hugi points out, because Canada's the only country that doesn't examine or quarantine refugees but automatically lets them loose. (p. D3)

The journalist proceeds with another dehumanizing metaphor associating immigrants with water:

> Then there are the 200,000 immigrants a year who have been pouring in since the mid-1980s. They are supposed to pass medical examinations. (p. D3)

The journalist has a litany of anecdotes, alarmist in tone, indicating various communicable diseases brought to Canada by immigrants and refugees. He also makes reference to health care for refugees and immigrants supported by 'taxpayer' dollars. Hyperbole is a common feature of this journalists' reporting style, along with false or misleading assertions:

> Somalian refugee children have spread TB throughout schools in the Etobicoke and Mississauga areas where thousands live mostly in public-supported housing and on welfare. (p. D3)

The reference to particular countries of origin and racialized groups throughout the article suggests racist underpinnings of arguments made about health crises in Canada. Refugee children are constructed as a social and economic 'threat' by assigning blame to them for communicable diseases and inferring that their families are 'undeserving' of social housing and social assistance.

"Canada's historical evolution: Research abroad and in Canada has questioned the existence of a common public memory"

Writing for the *National Post*, Granatstein (1999, Aug 28), as director general of the Canadian War Museum, ponders the issue of nationalism in Canadian history and

implores the reader to scrutinize history curriculum in schools. The political orientation of the *National Post* is quite discernible in the views expressed: unapologetic cultural chauvinism and aggression, and the rhetorical features of ridicule and irony all function to sidestep serious consideration of social inequities and the lopsidedness of economic and political power, not to mention the violence that derives from imperial and colonial relations.

> History has a social utility in a nation like ours. Canada is a magnet for millions from all over the world. People choose to immigrate here because this is a land of opportunity, a nation with Western values and ideals and a past that is attractive. Integrating the children of immigrants from Russia, Bolivia, Hong Kong, Somalia and Albania into our society ought to be an overriding object of Canadian policy. The values and traditions of Canadian life should be *force-fed to them*; history should be explained in ways that demonstrate how and why we have regularly settled our disputes without force, how our political system has functioned, and why we have on many occasions gone to war or joined alliances, not for aggressive reasons, but to protect our democratic ideals. Those are the reasons immigrants come here, after all. [italics are my own]
>
> But do we teach this past to our newcomers? Not a chance. Our schools are value-free or, at least, value-neutral. Our system is but one of many, and heaven forfend that we should *pronounce Western culture superior* to any other. Moreover, lest our history upset anyone, we ensure that anything offensive to any group or nation is deleted. Instead, the history that is taught focuses on Canada's many sins: Canadian racism, Canadian sexism, Canadian abuses of human and civil rights -- these are all studied at length in a well- intentioned, but misguided attempt to educate children about the need for tolerance. [italics my own] (p. B5)

This set of assumptions reveals ideological knowledge-production, which seeks to delegitimize theory such as anti-racist and anti-bias education. Granatstein derides arguments and action that resist the ways in which structures of power generate

inequalities. The hubris of dominant groups is presented as 'reasonable' and 'natural' and associated with Canadian nationalism with statements such as: "The values and traditions of Canadian life should be *force-fed to them*" [italics my own].

"Canada violates children's rights: Report; Nation fails the young in 7 areas, group says"

Carey, (1999, November 18), demographics reporter for the *Toronto Star*, writes about a report from the Canadian Coalition for the Rights of Children "a monitoring group drawn from 34 non-governmental organizations including UNICEF, the United Church, Canadian Teachers Federation, Canadian Public Health Association and World Vision Canada" stating that Canada is systematically violating children's rights articulated in international law (p. A1). The following areas are cited: negative social policy outcomes (due to cutbacks) are disproportionately impacting in negative ways on children with disabilities, Aboriginal children and children in the child welfare system. There is a very brief statement about refugee children: "Refugee children do not have adequate rights in Canada" (p. A1). While this statement is accurate, there is no context provided. The role of human rights education (referred to simply as "rights education") is given some attention:

> Rights education is not part of most school curriculums, and children's rights have not been widely promoted in Canada, the report says. The coalition calls for legislation, particularly in education, to recognize their rights and freedoms.
>
> But just how children's rights are protected is difficult to document because there is "a critical lack of accessible and reliable information," the report says. (p. A1)

Carey also draws attention to the lack of research in certain key areas. She reports that: "there are no national statistics on child abuse and neglect in Canada or on the number of child refugees held in detention. The most recent national study on children with disabilities was conducted nine years ago" (p. A1). Carey also draws attention to education cutbacks and school closures: "The report is particularly critical of education

cutbacks and school closings, which, it says, have had adverse effects on student- teacher ratios, transportation, junior kindergarten, special education, language programs for immigrants and fine arts courses" (p. A1).

"Lack of funding undermines ESL courses; teachers fear immigrant children are being programmed for failure"

Life section reporter Black (1999, Nov 20), writing for the *Toronto Star*, sets the scene for her reflections on educational inequalities in Ontario:

> It's late afternoon in Tracy Petepiece's Grade 1 class at Kensington Community School. A chain of multi-coloured butterflies hangs from the ceiling. Chippy, a big stuffed squirrel, sits in a chair overlooking the classroom.
>
> Sixteen kids, many of them just learning English, sit cross-legged around a long piece of construction paper with pictures of three different kinds of shoes: with buckles, laces and Velcro straps. (p. A1)

This teaching story is meant to illustrate the innovative ways in which teachers are approaching English as a Second Language instruction, without ESL training. In the following paragraph, the journalist quotes the views of educators and school administrators on the lack of funding for ESL instruction. She also reports on the moral indictment of depriving children of language education although the use of quotation marks around "immoral" indicates some distance from the position (aligned with the journalistic principle of "objectivity").

> Other educators go even further, saying that what is happening to ESL in Toronto and suburban schools in York Region or Peel is "immoral." They suggest that students without sufficient support and resources won't have the same advantages as children who are native English speakers. (p. A1)

She continues her article with quotations from the president of the Teachers of English as a Second Language Association of Ontario, a curriculum consultant for the York Region District School Board, and "top officials in education" all of whom express similar concerns about negative educational outcomes for immigrant children. Concerns are raised over the allocation of education funding to school boards and, as the journalist reports: "When money is tight, ESL programs may be the first to go" (p. A1). The narrative of immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable' is reflected in the views of one school principal, which employ the problematic adjective "needy" to refer to the children:

> "My number of kids has increased," says principal Nancy Spencer. "I'm not serving as many as I would like to. The teachers have remained the same. But we are feeling the crunch because the kids coming are extremely needy - more so than in the past. (p. A1)

It is important to acknowledge that Black (1990, Jan 08) reported on this very same issue in the article "Metro schools say lack of funding is hurting their ability to teach immigrant children Who pays the price?" published in the *Toronto Star* 9 years prior to writing this article, indicating that the lack of funding for ESL is a systemic injustice persisting over a period of time.

<u>"Not enough action in fight for kids' rights"</u>

Staff Reporter for the *Toronto Star*, Brian Dexter (1999, December 23) writes in recognition of the anniversary of the UN ratification of the Convention on the Rights of the Child. Dexter notes the marginal success of the UNCRC in improving the lives of children in the Canadian and global contexts.

It is interesting to note that while Dexter interviews a research director at Carleton University and a board member of the Canadian Coalition for the Rights of Children, the president of the UN General Assembly, a woman active in the labour movement, and two

women caring for children who have been orphaned, there is not one child interviewed in this article.

However, the article draws attention to many areas of grave concern, including: "insufficient supports for families of children with disabilities, "generally poor or non-existent" services for Aboriginal communities and lack of detention standards for refugee children" (p. A1). Media exposure of injustices experienced by Indigenous Peoples and immigrant and refugee groups may strengthen acts of solidarity, and social movement campaigns can mobilize around struggles impacting on both adults and children.

"Cutting our economic lifeline"

A *Toronto Star* editorial "Cutting our economic lifeline" (2000, Apr 29) denounces many of the social policy outcomes of neoliberalism, drawing on historical examples of achievements (i.e. Medicare), the consequences of cuts to health care and education and municipal infrastructure, and then zeroes in on the injustice of cutting funding to ESL programs.

> Most Ontarians don't know it yet. Immigrant parents, many of whom are struggling to survive in Canada, aren't in a position to speak out. They may not even know what's happening.
>
> Teachers do, but they're coping with so many cutbacks that ESL is only one of their worries. School board trustees do, but Premier Mike Harris has stripped them of the power to act.
>
> …What this means is that we have thousands of immigrant children in our schools who aren't ever likely to catch up to their classmates. They'll sit at their desks feeling inadequate and frustrated. They'll go home feeling like failures.
>
> The resilient ones will overcome these disadvantages and succeed. But many will fall by the wayside.

> The Caledon Institute of Social Policy paints a bleak picture of the future these youngsters face in a newly-released study. "An ESL learner who is unable to understand and master the language of instruction at school is at risk of becoming a marginalized member of Canadian society," it says.

The editorial stance draws attention to this injustice while also presenting these cuts as short-sighted in terms of the social outcomes to broader Canadian society: “We are an aging society. We can't afford to waste the talent of any of our young people”.

> Some of these children are traumatized by memories of ethnic killings, nightly air raids, forced migrations and refugee camps. Some arrive with large gaps in their education.
>
> They are coping with a new country, a new culture and a tough new provincial curriculum. They don't want to burden their parents with their problems. They are afraid to reach out to other kids.
>
> For many of these youngsters, ESL training is a lifeline. It allows them to open up, gives them a sense of belonging and builds their confidence.
>
> Language instruction isn't cheap. Even in its weakened state, ESL training costs the Toronto District School Board close to $60 million. And the price is sure to rise as Ottawa admits more immigrants.
>
> But the cost of skimping - in wasted talent, adjustment problems and social cleavages - is incalculable.
>
> It may not be apparent yet.
>
> But if we keep dismantling what we've built, we'll wake one day to find that the prosperous, tolerant Toronto we know is gone.

While expressing a sympathetic tone and addressing the acute pain and loss deriving from displacement, the editorial unfortunately falls back on the concept of 'tolerance' in the closing sentence, bringing to mind critiques of 'tolerance' as a conceptual framework, as discussed in this thesis (Hage, 2000; Mirchandani & Tastsoglou, 2000). Additionally, the last section prioritizes a particular conception of 'prosperity', which seems to assign blame to immigrant and refugee children for threatened economic well-being. There are no perspectives from refugee and immigrant children included in this article.

"Young immigrants cite racism; Study says many newcomers lack services to help ease transition."

Demographics Reporter, Carey (2000, Jun 20), writing for the *Toronto Star,* carefully brings out the point that many immigrant children experience racism at school, even from teachers and staff, drawing on research from a report by the Canadian Council on Social Development.

> The study, described by its authors as the first of its kind to look at the immigrant experience from a young person's perspective, was based on focus groups conducted by Ekos Research Associates with 50 young people in Toronto, Montreal and Vancouver. The young people were chosen to reflect the country's immigrant mix. (p. A03)

Unlike most articles reporting on the subject of immigration and education Carey quotes directly from some of the immigrant children and youth:

> One young girl recounted how a teacher deducted 20 points from an oral presentation because of her accent.
>
> "She said that she marked everyone on their diction and she was going to treat me just like the others because it was the only way I was ever going to learn," the report quotes her as saying.

> "If a white kid does something and I do the same, there is no question that I'm going to get into worse trouble," said another.
>
> "In fact, teachers don't even bother with me. I go to the principal's office for the slightest offence."
>
> Many said they would never talk to a school guidance counsellor about their problems because they didn't trust them. (p. A03)

The report also concludes that many of the young people are struggling with superficiality and capitalist-oriented values of consumerism in North America, all the more challenging since their families experience economic hardships. Carey also points out the concerns raised by this study were also forecasted two years prior by the Toronto District School Board, concerned about the consequences of cuts to ESL programs. Her article continues with the following statements:

> Between 1996 and 1998, an estimated 230,000 immigrant children and youth arrived in Canada, half of them in Ontario. Seven out of 10 of those under 15 arriving in Toronto spoke neither English or French when they arrived.
>
> More than a third live in homes where family income is under $20,000 a year, compared to only 17 per cent of Canadian-born children.
>
> School is the centre of their lives, they say, but most don't see it as a refuge. Most say they cope by ignoring the racism or strengthening friendships with kids from the same background. (p. A03)

“Classrooms can't afford more cuts”

Writing for the *Toronto Star*, Columnist Ellie Tesher (2000, Oct 31) reports the concerns articulated by teachers over “three years of provincially-imposed amalgamation, funding constraints and curriculum changes” stating flatly “What the kids feel is less known since no one has time to listen to them”. Tesher brings attention to the fact that

ESL classes were the first to be cancelled. Many children are constructed as 'burdensome':

> Toronto has added needs because so many students come from disparate backgrounds and so many are hard to teach, says Lancelyn Watters, an art teacher. Many young kids have attention disorders or emotional problems but the teachers have no time to give them extra help. (p. A23)

<u>"Apology is demanded from McCallion; Mayor says remarks about immigration distorted in print"</u>

Funston (2001, May 24), writing for the *Toronto Star*, reports on the racist remarks made by Mississauga Mayor Hazel McCallion who claims that her remarks were "taken out of context or distorted." She was quoted in the *National Post*, and paraphrased by Funston, as stating that "non-English- speaking immigrant children [were] being a disruption to teachers and students and suggested too many unproductive people are let into the country when skilled workers are needed." This article also reports on the activism of racialized and immigrant groups, quoting Sarbjit Jagpal, an editor for the English-language South Asian newspaper *The Weekly Voice*, and referring to the demonstrations to draw attention to the issue of systemic racism in Canadian society.

<u>"Searching for a home --- Concerns being raised concerning plight of child refugees without their parents"</u>

Lowes and Stawicki (2001, October 28), writing for the *Toronto Star*, provide a clear and poignant description of the injustices encountered by unaccompanied children seeking refugee status in Canada. They include direct quotes from refugee advocate and former president of the Canadian Council for Refugees, Francisco Martinez, who runs a shelter for refugees out of his home. The article briefly contextualizes years of civil war in Angola. They report on the increasing numbers of children arriving in Canada without

legal guardians, figures sourced from the Immigration and Refugee Board. The article states that increasing numbers of unaccompanied refugee children are turning to local shelters and drop-in centres for survival. There are several quotes from three children describing the horrific violence they experienced, including the brutal murder of their mother, and the multitude of injustices endured in Canada. The journalists also report that officials from the Immigration and Refugee Board concluded in a written statement that they did not believe the children's accounts of events nor did they believe that returning to Angola would place the children's lives at risk. Francisco Martinez and his wife, Loly, were able to gain legal custody of the children to prevent them from being separated (Ontario law has different policies/supports for children under 16. Older children are not under the mandate of child welfare services and legal protections). This article also quotes a lawyer representing teenage refugee claimants held in detention centres, pointing to the violation of their rights under the UNCRC. This lawyer points to the additional injustice of being deprived of an education and the indignities of life in detention:

> "The children weren't getting an education. They were kept indoors nearly all day.
>
> "They were given no soap, toothpaste and other personal hygiene products - I had to bring them some," says Silcoff. (p. O6)

The journalists make specific reference to the UNCRC:

> In article 22, the convention demands the Canadian government look out for "the child's best interests," stating that all children have the right to an education and that, if children are detained, it must be for "the shortest period and under specific circumstances." (p. O6)

By 2002, more than 1,800 unaccompanied children and youth (under the age of seventeen) were estimated to be arriving in Canada as refugee claimants with more than half of this group of young people in Ontario (Grover, 2007). While this article addresses the many injustices experienced by refugee children, the caption accompanying a photo

of the girls unfortunately makes reference to the concept of illegality: "Aisha arrived in Canada illegally with her older sisters" (p. O6).

"A real Toronto welcome"

Writing for the *Toronto Star*, Irish (2001, November 23) reports on projects funded by the United Way:

> One project, led by Big Sisters of Toronto, will recruit 25 newcomer Caribbean students to mentor immigrant children. The program will take a self-help approach to issues that affect Caribbean teenagers and children, especially isolation, culture shock, family reunification, peer pressure, violence and racism.
>
> Another program, through the South Asian Women's Centre, will assist women who face intergenerational issues and the challenge of their daughters integrating into the larger youth culture. The project will create a support network for mothers to discuss issues they face as parents in Canada. (p. B4)

While programs built from the social agency and knowledge of racialized immigrants are critical to advance social justice, the term "self-help approach" is problematic. Individualistic framings of issues are an inaccurate depiction of the social reality of racism and class disparities. "Self-help" has the paternalistic overtones and does not capture peer-support and social agency, as well as sustained collective action against structural inequalities.

Conclusion:

This chapter began with an historical overview of child policy frameworks in the 1990s and the implications of the decision to replace the Canada Assistance Plan with Canada Health and Social Transfer (CHST). This decision drastically reduced funding and removed the legal (and social/'moral') basis of the right to social assistance. I also discussed the development of the Children's Agenda and the shift in focus from principles of social solidarity to targeted programming for 'at-risk' children. The impacts

of Mike Harris' New Right populism were discussed in greater detail, including the resistance to neoliberal ascendancy through the Ontario Days of Action, the Ontario Public Service strike and the Ontario teachers' strike. The implications of educational reform were also brought out in this chapter. The section on immigration and refugee policy frameworks in a climate of austerity included historical analysis and critical perspectives on the immigration reform process that took place in the 1990s. The important Supreme Court case *Baker v. Canada* was also discussed as it set a legal precedent for consideration of "the best interests of the child" within Canadian immigration law. Drawing on research from legal scholars, I also echo critiques of missed opportunities and the inadequate attention given to racism and class disparities within the court system.

The media analysis brought out several points. Tensions between provincial and federal jurisdictions and concerns over inadequate funding for ESL programs were communicated by teachers, school administrators, educational policy-makers, and in rare cases, children themselves. The conflict over whose responsibility it is to provide educational support was accentuated during this period given the degree to which Mike Harris aggressively pursued social welfare retrenchment. There were several depictions of immigrant and refugee children as both vulnerable as well as social and economic 'threats'. Racism, paternalism, and cultural chauvinism were expressed in some articles, particularly in the *National Post.* In many articles, children's educational needs (which are social rights) were perceived to be a burden shouldered by 'tax-payers', consistent with neoliberal thinking and earlier representations of this issue. The deplorable and unjust circumstances of children experiencing homelessness, many of the children were immigrants and refugees, were also confronted by some journalists. The views of immigrant and refugee children were rarely included in this sample of articles, consistent with the findings from the media analysis in Chapter Five.

Chapter 7:
Contesting illegality: Educational spaces, racialized exclusion and the struggle for im/migration justice (2002-2009)

> First, we must avoid viewing young people's grievances as isolated or located only in a past experience (of abuse or discrimination, for example). As is the case with other situations in which reparations are due, we must acknowledge that the problem is not only a historical one. The violations of the past and the finite periods we might associate with childhood or slavery, for example, are still with us, every day. (Hurley, 2011, p. 216)

> A population is evicted from political community when the abandonment, violence, torture, displacement, terror, and mass death it faces can be celebrated as the safety, security, stability, and success of the modern nation-state. (Philipupillai, 2013, p. 69)

This chapter begins with an overview of child policy frameworks followed by a discussion of struggles for social equity within Ontario schools, drawing on qualitative research and sociological theories of education. Changes to immigration and refugee policies and the narrowing of legal options for migrants are also discussed. The concept of precarious legal status is analyzed alongside campaigns for social rights at the level of municipal governance. This chapter focuses on the right to education for children with precarious legal status and how this has been framed against the backdrop of neoliberal politics. The final media analysis section pays close attention to depictions of the events leading up to the Toronto District School Board's decision to adopt a policy protecting the social rights of children with precarious legal status.

Section One:

Child Welfare Frameworks and Children's Rights Discourses

The British charity for children and young people, Barnardos, introduced a campaign in the early 2000s in which poster images of children were substituted for those of adults in contexts associated with criminality and social marginalization, with accompanying text stating "neglected as a child" or "battered as a child". As Burman (2005) argues: "Here exoneration from the moral discourse of being undeserving of support or as responsible for one's current circumstances (or unhelpful habits) comes at the cost of the attribution of a traumatized past" (p. 360). These images of children (replacing images of adults) experiencing homelessness, in prison, or consuming drugs and alcohol functioned to elicit sympathy, more likely to be given to children than adults in these circumstances, while a narrow focus on the potential consequences of familial neglect and violence obscured structural explanations for material and social deprivation (Burman, 2005). Additionally, as Burman points out, the controversy sparked by the campaign failed to take up the fact that many children do experience such injustices/social marginalization *as children*.

As Barrie Thorne (2009) asserts: "Institutionally, childhoods take shape at the nexus of states, markets, and families…" (p. 20) and the previous chapters have traced the development of sociopolitical ideology pertaining to children since 1989. This discussion has reflected on "the historical duality of childhood interventions (the '*at risk–as risk'; protection–punishment paradigms*) and the inherent conflicts in the ways in which children and young people are conceptualised and represented" (Aldridge & Cross, 2008, p. 213). The critical point is that these framings of childhood adversity fail to address the causes and implications of social disparity.

While many youth (and adults) experiencing homelessness in Canada and other diminished welfare states were raised in contexts of family violence, this violence must be seen against the backdrop of political and economic conditions and social discrimination (Klodawsky, Aubry & Farrell, 2006). For example, barriers to economic autonomy for many women have compelled some mothers to return to abusive and violent intimate partners so that their children will have food and shelter (Bhuyan, 2011; Caragata, 2003; Klodawsky, Aubry & Farrell, 2006; Neysmith, 2000; Mosher, 2000; Pashang, 2011). A recent study with youth experiencing homelessness in Ottawa sparks

important questions about "the links between abstract social policy and its embedded social service and shelter implications" (Klodawsky, Aubry & Farrell, 2006, p. 433). Drawing from the insights of youth who participated in the study (some of whom were new immigrants or refugees), the authors urge us to rethink assumptions informing senior government policy-making that focuses on youth as potential workers (consistent with the theme of children as investments in the neoliberal paradigm). This paradigm obscures practices of racialization, gender discrimination, and all facets of social exclusion shaping experiences of youth homelessness (Klodawsky, Aubry & Farrell, 2006).

Arts-based projects initiated with youth experiencing homelessness in Toronto draw neon-bright lines around the demeaning aspects of accessing shelters and social services (Crath, 2012). This study disrupts conventional explanations for homelessness, showing how youth can be savvy about the economic and social asymmetries shaping their lives, and how many young people are keen to provoke change. The visual images created by racialized and economically marginalized youth in video productions are juxtaposed with print advertisements, displayed around the city of Toronto, by the social service agency the Salvation Army. This study has resonance with Burman's (2005) critique of Barnardo's poster campaign depicting experiences of homelessness, as well as Caragata's (1999) point that Canadian community services funding agency, The United Way, has strong ties to the corporate sector and therefore examines social problems and community development through a particular lens. The young filmmakers involved with arts-based projects (Crath, 2012) cultivated a political stance in relation to inequalities that derive from neoliberalism, colonial histories and racialization, inequalities that are often excluded in the campaigns of social service agencies (Crath, 2012). This community arts project brings up compelling issues for policy-makers and radical social work practice.

Within this political climate, the daily humiliations of socially excluded children and youth in Canada reveal the inadequacy of legal protections accorded to children under international law (in particular, the UNCRC). While such legal protections are necessary, we must interrogate the discrepancy between legal theory and practice.

Recognizing children as social actors is an important step but their political subjectivity must also be taken seriously in rethinking social agency. As Jeffrey (2011) argues, "Young people in many contexts equate agency with the cultivation of interdependencies rather than individual action and autonomy" (p. 6). The contradictory relationship between international human rights law (including ethical commitments to children's rights) and the reality of social disparities in health and education for many children in Canada is conceptually problematic. There are still a disproportionate number of Indigenous children in the child welfare system in provinces across Canada, which can be seen as a paternalistic and colonizing practice extending the devastating losses previously imposed by the residential school system (MacDonald & MacDonald, 2007; Pacini-Ketchabaw, White & Armstrong de Almeida, 2006; Strega & Esquao, 2009). The racialized nature of poverty has inequitable implications for children and is a key area of concern for social justice (Access Alliance Multicultural Community Health Centre, 2007; Galabuzi, 2006, 2014; Schissel, 2011; Shakir, 2011; Swift & Callahan, 2009). We cannot realize meaningful equity in Canadian society when the context for these economic and social disparities is examined at a surface level. We cannot say that we are a society committed to children's rights.

In Chapter Five, we have seen how the issue of publicly funded universal access to child care was better positioned on the political field in the 1980s but faded into the background with the ascendancy of neoliberalism in Canada in the late 1980s and 1990s. This is an issue of critical importance and needs attention from different levels of government. As Galabuzi (2006) notes:

> A national child care program with national standards has been publicly debated for the past decade. Yet jurisdictional wrangling and bureaucratic inertia have been cited as impediments to delivering child care to the many who need it. Addressing the demand for child care is a key element in dealing with the low levels of earnings, especially among racialized women, and the resulting disproportionate level of poverty. (p. 230)

Many recent studies have critically examined the ideological aspects of the social policy tools shaping children's lives. In their critical discourse analysis of documents

produced by British Columbia Ministry of Child and Family Development (MCFD) on early childhood development in 2004, Veronica Pacini-Ketchabaw, Jan White and Ana-Elisa Armstrong de Almeida (2006) draw on principles of anti-bias education to address racialized discourses informing Ministry policies (and childhood services practice). Noting the prevalence of the population health model framing early childhood policies as well as existing critiques of the universality of child development theories, Pacini-Ketchabaw, White and Armstrong de Almeida (2006) explain: "The inherent assumption and logic of the population health model creates racialized minorities as 'others.' The pathologies are attributed to the racialized minorities themselves but not to the structures in which the population health model is embedded" (p. 105). The critiques brought up in this study resonate with critical perspectives on developmental psychology, childhood and normativity discussed in Chapter Five (Griffith, 1995; Manicom, 1995; Burman, 1996) as well as the discussion of child policy paradigm shifts in the 1990s (Jenson, 2004; McKeen, 2004, 2006, 2007).

Neoliberalism, Childhood, and Schooling in Canada

Educational inequalities have been legitimized in a climate of social austerity by conservative political forces across North America (Apple, 2005; Sears, 2003). The injuries of social discrimination based on axes of race, class, gender, disability, immigration and LGBT status are swept (further) under the rug through a narrow focus on individuated learning. Attributing change in educational policy and practice in Ontario (and more broadly) to neoliberal ascendancy, Sears (2003) asserts: "The neo-liberal agenda for education reform seeks to reorient schooling so that the individual develops a self in relation to the market rather than the state" (p. 11). Curricula have been influenced by neoliberal notions of entrepreneurship (Jeffrey, 2010). Livingston (2014) who also writes about the Ontario context argues that "discrimination in our schools has come about not randomly, but mainly as the cumulative effect of decisions made by those who have power over school systems, at the provincial, federal, school board and individual school levels. Teacher expectations also play a part" (p. 14).

The latter point resonates with other educational researchers who share concerns about teacher expectations as a determinant of students' educational achievement in school (Bernhard, 2009; Clandfield, 2014; Galabuzi, 2014; Livingston; 2014; Schugurensky, 2007; Smaller, 2014). There are entrenched biases shaping professional consensus around social deficit theories and parental influence/aspiration; these biases are a constant feature of schooling from the elementary level all the way up to post-secondary education (Clandfield, 2014; Galabuzi, 2014; Livingston 2014; Smaller, 2014). As Harry Smaller (2014) points out: "The differential outcomes [elementary school students] experience are a direct result of differential treatment in school. In many cases, such differential treatment is unintended, even unrecognized by classroom teachers. In other cases, however, it is quite explicit" (p. 79). This argument about the negative treatment of working-class and racialized students is consistent with recent interviews (which took place in 2013) between educational researchers, teachers and school administrators in the Greater Toronto Area; Smaller (2014) includes an excerpt from a teacher expressing concern about the views of some of her colleagues:

> Those who view families in a certain way, the ways many talk about parents and families who live in low-income areas, [these] judgements of parents transfer to the child. They [the teachers] don't articulate it necessarily, but in the back of their minds, it affects the ways they work in the classrooms, what programs students get put into. [There is] no understanding [of] the impacts of systemic discrimination. When a kid acts out in a certain way, that kid is behavioural, has a behaviour problem. But, maybe they have an issue with the instructional power that's confronting them. (p. 93)

Views which pin the blame on individual children (or adults) are consistent with neoliberal thinking which furthers the "displacement of social problems to the individual" (Clandfield, 2014, p. 123). Similarly, Roy and Roxas (2011) raise concerns about deficit discourses which were pervasive among teachers who participated in two studies alongside Somali Bantu refugee families in South Texas and Michigan (most of the Somali Bantu refugees arrived in various cities in the U.S. in 2004 and had spent up 12 years in refugee camps in Kenya which limited experiences of formal

education/schooling). Deficit discourses, as Roy and Roxas (2011) explain, manifest in microaggressions against students through perceptions that they lack motivation or hold poor attitudes in school. As they explain:

> Even highly qualified, skilled educators can perpetuate deficit beliefs about students. The use of the term *tolerance* in many teacher training programs may contribute to this problem. Although, *tolerance* has been used to promote pluralistic ideals, the term itself embodies a microagressive stance on difference. That is, *tolerance* implies an allowance of something at the most minimal level rather than a dialogic perspective that promotes meaningful discussion. (pp. 537-538)

Hage's (2000) critiques of the notion of tolerance in multicultural discourse bring theoretical insights to teacher education programs. These insights can strengthen arguments tackling the injustice of dominant groups' sense of entitlement to power and resources.

To this day, students are often grouped according to 'low' vs. 'high' skill level, and negative assessments of students' educational capabilities (assessments which are often misguided and ascribed by teachers who are biased or too preoccupied to take time to know each student) can be internalized contributing to poor self-image (Smaller, 2014). A detailed consensus on the ways in which teachers view particular students (especially those who are racialized and working-class) as intellectually or socially deficient is provided by several scholars drawing from their own research and extensive quantitative and qualitative data from secondary sources (Clandfield, 2014; Galabuzi, 2014; Livingston, 2014; Smaller, 2014). As Galabuzi (2014) articulates: "Children learn about their social devaluation differently depending on the stigma or stereotype attached to their identity. As such, students are likely to perform in a manner consistent with the stereotype" (p. 195).

The '*at risk–as risk'; protection–punishment paradigms* (Aldridge & Cross, 2008) shaping adult-child/youth relations contribute to an individualistic focus in educational practice. Adults are ambivalently positioned in relation to children and youth with the social perception of particular youth being 'at-risk' (Galabuzi, 2014; Fine, 1995; Roman,

1996; Wotherspoon & Schissel, 2001). The ways in which neoliberal policies are being configured to compound economic disparities are legitimized through the social construction of 'at-risk' youth (Galabuzi, 2014; Fine, 1995; Roman, 1996; Wotherspoon & Schissel, 2001). Pejorative stereotypes ascribed to 'as risk'/'threatening' youth assign a devalued status to particular young people, as Schissel (1997) notes: "The xenophobia collectively felt towards young people, when unpacked, reveals an ideological orientation that associates immorality with marginal social groups, which are identifiable by race, class and gender" (p. 31). A strong antipathy towards youth is generated through moral panics in the media (Schissel, 1997). Zero tolerance policies initiated through the Ontario Safe Schools Act also draw on "moral panics about education, security, and the national project" (Galabuzi, 2014, p. 200). These policies have been so intrusive and destructive in the policing of students that the Ontario Human Rights Commission has registered concern about the disproportionate targeting of racialized students and students with disability (Galabuzi, 2014).

Contentious aspects of schooling in Canada are still discounted by many educational policymakers. There have been a number of flashpoints in the Ontario context, which have sparked campaigns for policy shifts within a social justice framework. As Haque (2010) notes:

> The assumption that Canadian schools are neutral places of learning leaves out the ongoing racist realities of public schooling for young Canadians of colour; a reality which only becomes visible when occasional hot button issues such as Africentric schooling and the now defunct zero tolerance policies, among others, flare up in the media. (p. 96)

The systemic injustices reproducing racialized poverty (outlined in earlier chapters) continue to be linked with differential access to education. This is of critical importance to immigrant students since over 75% of new immigrants in Canada are racialized (Galabuzi, 2014). Writing in 2006, Galabuzi stated that over 25% of the students in the Toronto school system had arrived in Canada in the last ten years (Galabuzi, 2006). Canadian policies, such as professional accreditation, have blocked attempts for new immigrants and refugees to secure employment; these barriers to

adequate employment result in material deprivation and attendant impacts. While there are significant injustices inherent in these policies and social outcomes, this has often not obstructed the educational achievement of many immigrant children whose accomplishments parallel those of children of Canadian-born parents, and sometimes exceed them in terms of test scores, high school completion and post-secondary education (Galabuzi, 2014).

Immigrant parents have also mobilized to raise concerns with the Toronto District School Board about the differential treatment of their children. For example, the Somali community in Toronto's Rexdale has advocated on behalf of children who have been placed within Special Education programs, which often do not facilitate the same learning opportunities as other streams (Clandfield, 2014). Somali parents groups such as "Positive Change Women for Change," and the Somali Liaison Coalition at the Toronto District School Board, have been set up more recently (Smaller, 2014).

Immigration and Refugee Policy Frameworks in a Climate of Austerity

Ideological presumptions underpinning discriminatory patterns of schooling have also been linked to *hierarchies of social welfare provision* (Bloch & Schuster, 2002), which share features across contexts. Prevailing public attitudes inaccurately associate refugees and new immigrants with the economic vulnerability of non-immigrant citizens, while many politicians and journalists draw red circles around these concerns in order to deflect attention from the political decisions which lead to a diminishing tax-base and cuts to public expenditures (Sales, 2002). This social discrimination is also linked to a history of a racialized division of labour in many national contexts (Joshi, 2002; Mynott, 2002a). Presuming to speak in defence of a national interest reinforces a racialized nationalism, as Mynott (2002a) argues: "The very conception of a national interest assumes that different classes within the same territory share the same fundamental interests, despite their disparities of wealth and power and their conflicting experiences of exploitation…" (p. 13).

Media frames of the debate on immigration (Kaye, 1998) draw from notions of 'deserving'/'undeserving' poor in political discourse to construct 'deserving'/'undeserving' immigrants and refugees (Arat-Koç, 1999a; Alldred, 2003; Bloch & Schuster, 2002; Chan, 2005; Gilbert, 2009; Park & Bhuyan, 2012; Van Hook & Balisteri, 2006; Vukov, 2003), a trend which has intensified since the end of Cold War politics, as discussed in previous chapters. There is no empirical evidence to support the claim that social welfare is a magnet for refugees (Bloch & Schuster, 2002). Social rights are diminishing or non-existent for many undocumented workers and refugees. As Bloch and Schuster (2002) note: "This regression is possible because of the way asylum seekers (and undocumented migrants) are constructed only as those who take, not as real or potential contributors to the public wealth" (p. 404).

New immigrants and refugees face multiple barriers to securing full-time employment commensurate with their level of education and are subject to discrimination in a number of contexts (Bauder, 2003b; Choudry et al., 2009; Choudry & Henaway, 2012; Choudry & Thomas, 2013; Humphries, 2004; Ng, 2006). The retreat from social welfare provision has uneven effects on different groups of people. The public purse is snapped shut more forcefully when immigrant and refugee-serving agencies are in need of funding. These agencies provide essential services such as language-training, and can be both sites of empowerment and disempowerment (Dyck & McLaren, 2004; Elabor-Idemudia, 2005). Social workers may also hold disempowering views of immigrants, which unjustly circulate in the public arena (Park, Bhuyan, Richards & Rundle, 2011; Park & Bhuyan, 2012; Humphries, 2004).

Patterns of immigrant employment are constrained by neoliberal paradigms and exclusionary policies supported by the media (Bauder, 2003a; 2008c; 2008d). The expansion of temporary foreign worker programs in Canada has accelerated and in 2008, the number of people moving to Canada as temporary workers began to exceed the number of people obtaining permanent residency (Choudry & Henaway, 2012). According to Cititizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC) Facts and Figure 2010, the number of temporary foreign workers has increased by 31 per cent between 2006 and 2010, while the number of permanent immigrants has increased by 11 per cent over the

same period (Walton-Roberts, 2011). As Sharma (2011) argues: "Restrictive immigration policies, therefore, are less about restricting access to Canadian territory than about differentiating amongst those within it – all the while obfuscating the source of the differential inclusion of those workers legally classified as "foreigners"" (p. 95). Drawing on research produced by *Justicia for Migrant Workers* (on the Seasonal Agricultural Workers Program), Oka and Ayers (2010) state that many of the farm-workers participating in the program had no other choice but to migrate when World Bank and IMF-sponsored structural adjustment programs and multilateral trade agreements displaced their livelihoods. The economic marginality of migrant workers advances neoliberalism and the interests of profit-driven corporations while shutting migrant workers out of access to social citizenship rights (Choudry et al., 2009; Choudry & Henaway, 2012; Choudry & Thomas, 2013; Sharma, 2005, 2006; Walia, 2010). Policies and laws which induce political abuse and which compound the vulnerability of migrant workers have been deeply contested by immigration justice activists who have taken critical steps towards equitable legislation and practice, as daunting as the challenges may be (Choudry et al., 2009; Choudry & Henaway, 2012; Choudry & Thomas, 2013; Walia, 2010).

The Canadian Nation-state and International Politics

Contesting media interpretations of 9/11 led to the obscuring of historical injuries by political elites in the U.S. (Entman, 2003, 2004; Rojecki, 2005). As Winter (2002) observes: "[t]o the media, like the U.S. administration, there was no precipitating act. It was unimaginable that there was any discontent with U.S. foreign policy" (p. xiv). Dissenting views on the implications of 9/11 and U.S. military intervention were met with suspicion and hostility (Arat-Koç, 2005, Nadeau, 2002; Thobani, 2003). Tracing the links between neoliberal globalization and 9/11, Rojecki (2005) examines media frames which shaped aspects of intervention and legislation subsequent to these events, asking three critical questions: (a) How do media discourses link the 9/11 terror attacks to globalization? (b) What do these links suggest about the proper response by the United

States to the attacks? and (c) What are the consequences of these responses for public support of United States economic and foreign policy and therefore for globalization itself? (p. 63)

These questions are important to examine in the Canadian context, given the close economic and political relationships with the U.S. Subsequent to the events of 9/11, both the *National Post* and *The Globe and Mail* published editorials in September, 2001, explicitly linking threats of terrorism with immigration and refugee policies, and calling for a reform of immigration legislation (Winter, 2002). As Arat-Koç (2005) writes: “Within hours after September 11, right-wing Canadian columnists were busy naturalizing the dependent relationship and preparing Canadians for what they viewed as justified and inevitable U.S. demands for border and security integration and cooperation” (p. 35). She observes that there was rarely any sorrow expressed in the media or by political elites over the many racialized people and undocumented people who worked and died in the twin towers.

Susan Sontag encountered political attacks subsequent to the publication of her article in *The New Yorker*, which candidly critiqued the pernicious effects of U.S. political and economic interventions in other parts of the world. These interventions compounded violence in other countries, and Sontag connected the dots with the events of 9/11. However, racialized intellectuals in North America, expressing similar critiques, faced much more vicious reactions (Arat-Koç, 2005; Nadeau, 2002; Razack, 2005; Thobani, 2003). This discrepancy can be attributed to *white nationalism* and the *precarious belonging* of racialized Canadians (Arat-Koç, 2005). *White nationalism* has been manifested in a number of practices including the media and political attacks on UBC professor (and former president of the National Action Committee on the Status of Women) Dr. Sunera Thobani subsequent to her keynote speech articulating critiques of violence attributable to imperialism at a conference titled "Women's Resistance: From Victimization to Criminalization," organized by the Canadian Association of Elizabeth Fry Societies and the Canadian Association of Sexual Assault Centres (Arat-Koç, 2005; Mojab & El-Kassem, 2011; Nadeau, 2002; Thobani, 2003).

Within this political climate, malign hostility towards racialized Canadians has been particularly acute for Muslim, Arab, and South Asian citizens (and non-citizens) manifested in disturbing and sometimes violent practices, bringing to surface historical parallels such as the internment of racialized Japanese Canadians under the guise of 'national security' (Miki, 2005; Smolash, 2009, 2011). The dismantling of "orientalist conceptions of national security and community safety" (Galabuzi, 2011, p. 77) is a critical political project in educational contexts and wider society.

The Bush Administration used the concept of gender equality as a pretext for waging war in Afghanistan, prompting questions around the interplay of feminism and imperialism (Thobani, 2007b). As Arat-Koç (2002) notes: "Many wars historically have been fought to defend a "motherland," or the women and children of a country" (p. 60). Such framings obscure the impact of policies and legislation on women in Western countries, as Arat-Koç (2002) notes: "one hardly finds human rights discourse used in the analysis of immigration laws and policies in Western Europe nor North America, nor on the effects of legislation such as the US federal *Personal Responsibility Act* of 1996[10] on single mothers on social assistance" (p. 57). The discussion in Chapters Four and Five of converging neoconservative and neoliberal agendas in Canadian politics has shown the social consequences of these agendas for women and children. Additionally, gender equality as a pretext for war conceals pervasive violence against women of all socioeconomic backgrounds in Western contexts (Razack, 2005). Depictions of violence against racialized women in Western contexts often attribute this violence to cultural pathology rather than systemic injustices (Haque, 2010; Jiwani, Janovicek, & Cameron, 2001; Jiwani & Young, 2006; Mojab & El-Kassem, 2011; Mojab & McDonald, 2008; Razack, 1999a, 2005). Writing about the Canadian context, Haque (2010) asserts: "Addressing violence against women as a problem merely of community and culture misses, for example, how the ongoing disappearance of so many Aboriginal women could continue for so long even as we hold the nation as an exemplar for the rights of women" (p. 97).

---

10 Sidel (2000) provides a powerful analysis of the U.S. *Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act of 1996* and its impact on women and children.

Jiwani's (2005a) textual analysis of the *Globe and Mail*'s coverage of events following 9/11 utilizes informal discourse analysis (van Dijk, 1991) to expose ideological arguments supporting Canada's decision to go to war. In her analysis of Canadian print media representations of Afghan women, specifically in the *Globe and Mail,* over a seven year period, that coincides with Canadian military involvement in Afghanistan subsequent to 9/11, Jiwani (2009) problematizes the construction of 'worthy' and 'unworthy' victims of rescue. An emphasis on Afghan women (and children) as 'worthy victims' in journalistic writing draws on a history of colonial and Orientalist discourses (Said, 1994), and serves contemporary political agendas which aim to secure support for Canadian military involvement in Afghanistan (Jiwani, 2005a, 2009). Jiwani (2009) examines the ways in which discourses of 'compassion' and 'rescue' aim to legitimize practices of profiling, injustices inherent in the use of security certificates in Canada and other forms of political violence in both national and international contexts. Representations of Afghan women as 'worthy victims' disavows both their agency and resistance to the Taliban and Western imperialism, as well as the violence experienced by women in Canada (Jiwani, 2009).

Accounts of the political and social agency of Afghan women were replaced by notions of victimization, raising serious concerns about "the ways in which these images are used to manipulate public, including feminist, opinion and justify new relations of ultra-imperialism" (Arat-Koç, 2002, p. 54). These narratives echo perspectives from earlier manifestations of colonial rule and imperial missions, and deflect attention from Western complicity in events that brought the Taliban to power. As Arat-Koç (2002) notes: "In the days following the fall of Taliban, the media summarized the mood of the Afghani people with references to children flying kites, music in the streets and women with the veils of the burqas lifted" (p. 54). Journalistic writing consistently constructs Afghan women and children as passive victims, clearly demonstrated in the examples critiqued by Arat-Koç and Jiwani, while in other cases vilifying Muslim women as "callous, militant, and fanatical mothers of terrorists" (especially in representations of Palestinian women) (Jiwani, 2005a, p. 62). Similar concerns are taken up in another essay by Jiwani (2005c), where she addresses examples of "this confusing and sometimes

contradictory conflation of woman as helpless victim and manipulative activist" (p. 186). Jiwani and Dakroury (2009) also draw connections between critiques of recent representations of Muslims in Canadian media and aspects of Islamophobia expressed through "benevolence, demonization, trivialization and/or ejection" (p. 2).

In her analysis of visual representations of Iraqi children in British print media during the 2003 UK/US invasion of Iraq, Wells (2007) explores two narratives framing the war and its outcomes: a narrative of liberation, in which the invasion was both "legally compromised and yet ethically defensible" (p. 60) and a second narrative of innocent and suffering children. The narrative of liberation is constructed through images of children in settings devoid of violence, families and communities, focusing instead on the 'protection' provided by British and U.S. soldiers. Wells' analysis problematizes the iconicity of children in Western imagery. In contrast to the "Madonna and Child" image depicting women and child refugees (Wright, 2002; Malkki, 1995a) discussed in Chapter Four, visual representations of Iraqi children were removed from a familial context, the children positioned instead beside British soldiers in order to support a narrative of liberation, justifying military intervention/violence. The second narrative of the innocent child emphasized the illegality of the war. The attribution of blame for violence, terror and death was on military interventions and the culpability of British and U.S. governments (and other political actors implicated in the invasion). In this narrative, images of Iraqi children with their parents exposed the terror and devastating impacts of violence caused by the war.

Jiwani (2005a) points to literary references that journalists, writing for the *Globe and Mail,* draw upon in order to justify imperialism and its consequences. One such reference is Rudyard Kipling's novel *Kim*. Kipling is, of course, well-known as an author of children's literature. Western children's literary canons still comprise numerous texts published during what has been called the "Golden Age" of children's literature, a period coinciding with the last years of British imperialism (Randall, 2009). Edward Said's (1993) influential arguments regarding the relationship between culture and imperialism can also be applied to analysis of the pedagogical function of children's literature (Randall, 2009). When such texts are presented to children in contemporary

social contexts without a critical perspective there are significant pedagogical implications. The majority of very young children are arguably not readers of print journalism and rely on literature and storytelling in schooling, familial, and community contexts to shape their worldviews. Santa Ana's (2002) critique of American social studies curricula is also of concern in the Canadian context. As he observes: "The textbooks say the United States is a nation of immigrants. However, while schoolchildren are steeped in the pageantry of American history, they seldom learn to appreciate the depth of its reprehensible acts and persistent inequities" (p. 65). van Dijk (1991, 1992) has also pointed to attacks in right-wing media which attempt to delegitimize anti-racism activism by ridiculing the idea of children's books as racist. Racism in children's books clearly needs to be denounced, an important political argument of anti-racism. Ridiculing this argument raises many ethical and moral concerns at the level of micro-aggressions directed at racialized people and more broadly as a contributing factor to systemic racism.

The fictional narratives of literary canons serve a similar ideological function as media narratives particularly in relation to nationalism and the reproduction of social hierarchies (Smolash, 2009, 2011). Razack's (2007) essay insightfully interrogates Canadian media and cultural productions from 2004 commemorating ten years since the Rwandan genocide, in particular the contemplation of violence from the vantage point of peacekeepers and other members of the Canadian military. Tapping into these emotions and their dissociation from colonial history, the cultural and media narratives, for the most part, were able to sidestep Western complicity in continued violence and inequalities in many parts of the South. The unquestioned presumptions of powerful social groups, which are central to the framing of these narratives, draw from and reproduce colonial paternalism, also seen in literary texts that have been contested by intellectuals and authors such as Chinua Achebe, as Razack (2007) notes:

> It is perhaps no accident that so many writers of Dallaire's [retired Lieutenant General and appointed in the 1990s as Force Commander for the United Nations Assistance Mission for Rwanda (UNAMIR)] story compare Rwanda to Joseph Conrad's Congo in *Heart of Darkness* (1901), and Dallaire to Marlowe, the

> narrator of Conrad's novel. Edward Said, in discussing Conrad's understanding of imperialism in *Heart of Darkness*, points out that Conrad is largely unable to think outside of imperialism. For him there are no subjects who inhabit Africa. Chinua Achebe put it more forcefully: Africa, for Conrad, ''is a metaphysical battlefield devoid of all recognizable humanity, into which the wandering European enters at his peril. (p. 380)

It has now been twenty years since the Rwandan genocide and if there is to be further contemplation of violence, it must replicate Razack's carefully constructed analysis built from the political subjectivity of people who have struggled against imperial-colonial relations, and this analysis must, as Razack urges, contribute to action against manifest injustice.

An innovative use of literary analysis sparks critically important questions in Smolash's (2009) study of recent media stories representing Muslim, Arab and South Asian citizens and non-citizens. She focuses on the media coverage in the *Globe and Mail* and the *National Post* of two 'anti-terrorism' cases: Project Thread (2003)[11] and the Toronto 18 (2006)[12]. Her key arguments problematize the ways in which media narratives render state violence as acceptable in relation to particular social groups. This is accomplished by drawing on national security discourses and processes of criminalization and racialization. Particular myths around Canadian nationalism and multiculturalism inform beliefs about contemporary social relations (Mackey, 1999; Bannerji, 2000, 2011; Coulthard, 2011; Galabuzi, 2011; Thobani, 2007a; Sharma, 2006, 2011; Walton-Roberts, 2011). Novelist Margaret Atwood, as Mackey (1999) points out, argues that Canadians build an identity in the shadow of British colonialism or American

---

11 Project Thread was instigated by a federal security task force which forcefully arrested and detained over twenty young adults from India and Pakistan who were studying in the Greater Toronto Area (GTA) in 2003, based on the later-discredited argument that the students were part of an *Al-Qaeda* sleeper cell. Community organizers mobilized around a Threadbare campaign to counter the allegations in public discourse and to expose the grave injustices which underpinned them (Odartey-Wellington, 2009; Smolash, 2009, 2011).

12 In regards to Toronto 18, almost all of the Muslim men accused were teenagers or in their early twenties, and were referred to as the "jihad generation" by media commentators sharpening the edges of racialized exclusion/broader social injustices, and reinforcing negative views of youth from particular social groups (Gosine, 2007).

cultural imperialism, and that the theme of wilderness which surfaces in Canadian literature canons is significant for what it represents: "The notion of being lost in wilderness – in an undefined and unknown territory – is extremely paradoxical when mobilised in a discourse of victimisation to colonialism or imperialism, since it is itself a perspective of a coloniser, a settler, not one who is colonised" (Mackey, 1999, p. 48).

Smolash (2009, 2011) examines the role of cultural workers, such as fiction writers, in sustaining nationalist beliefs. For example, she problematizes representations of Canadian history and the nation in fiction by novelist Anne Michaels, who writes in *Fugitive Pieces*, that Canada "is a crayon, when everything [elsewhere] had been written in blood" (Michaels, 1997, p. 248, cited in Smolash, 2009, p. 749). Such representations eclipse colonial violence in Canada, and exclusionary refugee policies implicated in political violence directed at people who are deported to the contexts they fear. The narratives of fiction writers can work in concert with media narratives in public rhetorical strategies that support criminalizing, aggressive, and sometimes violent practices towards racialized citizens and non-citizens. Media producers are described as "narrative agents" (Smolash, 2011) producing a type of literary text that can be analyzed with similar tools as those offered by literary analysis.

While the Canadian literary canon advances nationalism and particular ideological views, Smolash (2011) highlights the role of cultural workers such as fiction writers in opening spaces for critique which can challenge dominant narratives in both print media and literature, in addition to the wider realm of cultural production. Some of the authors Smolash (2009) mentions include Dionne Brand, David Chariandy, Wayde Compton and Roy Miki, all of whom expand important spaces of critique in their fiction. From this perspective, there can be optimism found in the role of textual interventions as a site of resistance to unjust im/migration and refugee policies. Similarly, Hackett (2010) describes journalism as "a culturally central form of storytelling" in relation to "movements for and against social justice" (p. 179). Drawing from critical literature, throughout this study, I have argued that dominant narratives have had, and continue to have, grave consequences for particular social groups. Smolash's analysis of Canadian

media representations of alleged threats of terrorism (which were subsequently exposed in the media as erroneous claims based on tenuous evidence at best[13], and racially-inflected fabrications at worst) renders explicit the ideological assumptions that underpin many examples of journalistic writing on the subject of national security and state practices.

The imprint of power in these encounters is deeply troubling: we have seen the circulation of factually inaccurate news stories used to sustain the narrative of 'national security' leading to the public vilification and targeting of racialized citizens and non-citizens. These events and practices have historical parallels, and aspects of deep-seated institutional racism spill over into other contexts such as schools, as Galabuzi (2014) notes:

> While Black youth have historically been constructed as fearsome, deviant, socially dysfunctional, nonconformist and a threat to the safety and smooth running of the schools in the post-September 11, 2001 period, Muslim and Muslim-identified students have increasingly been subjected to the same "at risk" descriptions (Solomon and Palmer, 2004; Ferber, 2007). (p. 218)

We are also seeing the social construction and targeting of a second/'homegrown' generation (Gosine, 2007; Haque, 2010). In this socio-political climate, the unevenness of treatment of both racialized citizens and non-citizens is deeply troubling, although certainly not new. As Roberts and Mahtani (2010) argue:

> Thus, in trying to understand the connection between race and neoliberalism, it is important to examine not just the momentary eruptions of race or racism that seemingly result from neoliberal policy reforms, and instead consider race as an organizing principle of society that neoliberalism reinforces and modifies. (p. 254)

Suaad Hagi Mohamud, a 31-year-old woman of Somali origin who immigrated to Canada in 1999 was unable to return home to Canada from Kenya ten years later due to

---

13 The young students accused in Project Thread were arrested without a warrant and no charges were ever pressed (Crépeau & Nakache, 2006), yet the grave injustices (and attendant losses) that had been endured were not adequately taken up in most subsequent news coverage (Smolash, 2011).

immigration authorities claiming that there was a discrepancy between her physical features (the size of her lips) and the photograph in her passport (Oka & Ayers, 2010; Odartey-Wellington, 2011). After turning to the Canadian High Commissioner in Nairobi for support and providing several other pieces of identification (including an Ontario drivers' licence), Mohamud's passport was confiscated; she was incarcerated for 8 days, subjected to a thorough investigation and stranded in Kenya for three months before having to undergo DNA testing mandated by the Canadian federal government (Odartey-Wellington, 2011). Suaad Hagi Mohamud is a single mother and her son who had been left behind in Canada also had to undergo DNA testing. Felix Odartey-Wellington (2011) applies a critical race theoretical approach to analysis of news discourse, in particular the representation of these events in the *Globe and Mail*, *National Post*, and *Toronto Star*, concluding that: "From a critical race perspective, it is obvious that given Canada's history of conquest and colonialism, and given the nuances of the post-9/11 environment, there is every possibility that Mohamud's ethnicity resulted in the loss of rights and privileges ordinarily available to Canadian passport holders" (p. 408). However *The Globe and Mail* and *National Post* sidestepped this analysis while keeping the issue on the public agenda; only the *Toronto Star* confronted this event as an act of racialized exclusion. Further, Odartey-Wellington (2011) argues that: "[s]ignificantly, none of the three newspapers considered in my article made an intertextual reference to the juridical findings of systemic racism in Canada and the relevance of these findings to Mohamud's experience" (p. 409).

<u>Immigration and Refugee Law Post-9/11</u>

Through an analysis of Canadian newspaper articles on immigration relating to the 2002 Immigration and Refugee Protection Act (IRPA), Bauder (2008a) delineates patterns shaping public opinion, policy debate and immigration law. In reviewing existing studies on media discourse and migration, Bauder identifies several vantage points from which journalists' narratives are framed including arguments relating to economic imperatives, humanitarianism and aspects of danger such as criminality and national security. In his study, Bauder (2008a) analyzed articles published in five daily

Canadian newspapers between 1996 and 2004, which coincided with the timeline of immigration reform in Canada. In 1996, the Legislative Review Advisory Group published a report of recommendations for immigration reform, which provided the scaffolding for a new legislative framework (Bauder, 2008a; Thobani, 2000a, 2000b). In 2002, the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act came into force, replacing the 1976 Immigration Act. Although IRPA had been conceptualized prior to the events of 9/11, intensified political rhetoric led to changes and adjustments before it came into force in 2002 coinciding with the Anti-terrorism Act and the Smart Border Declaration between Canada and the US. The revised IRPA expanded the function of security certificates[14] resulting in secret trials, indefinite detention and deportation of both non-citizens and permanent residents (Bauder, 2008a; Bell, 2006; Smolash, 2011). Maher Arar's return to Canada in October 2004 exposed state violence manifested in Canada's role in deportation and complicity in torture (Bauder, 2008a; Crépeau & Nakache, 2006; Hobuti-Fard, 2006; Oka & Ayers, 2010; Sharma, 2011; Thobani, 2007a). In December 2004, Canada signed the Safe Third Country Agreement with the US, closing the border to people fearing violence and death; Canada is recycling state violence and grave injustice as the Continuous Journey[15] regulation of the early 20th century is an historical parallel to the Safe Third Country agreement of 2004 (Kazimi, 2012; Macklin, 2011; Smolash 2011).

Events such as the arrival of boats from China on the west coast of Canada in 1999 contributed to anti-immigration discourse (Bauder, 2008a; Mountz, 2004, 2010; Stasiulis, 2002, 2004; Vukov, 2003) and Bauder (2008a) states that "danger and fear of immigration are not ad hoc responses to September 11 but rather more consistently and systematically engrained in Canadian immigration discourse" (p. 306); he urges that policy initiatives counter the discursive link between immigration and fear/danger. He also states that qualitative research may elucidate causal links between media discourse and immigration law.

14 Security certificates were incorporated into Canadian immigration law in 1991 (Crépeau & Nakache, 2006).

15 The media spectacles around Komagata Maru in 1914 functioned to legitimize the politically discriminatory actions of the Canadian state and the terrible injustices that followed (Vukov, 2003).

The multiple dimensions of immigration and refugee policy articulated in the 2002 IRPA have expanded the scope of state powers for detention and deportation so that the anti-terrorism legislation introduced after 9/11 is rarely used (Wright, 2006). As Macklin (2001) notes: "immigration law has long done to non-citizens what the Anti-terrorism Act proposes to do to citizens – without public outcry and with judicial blessing" (p. 394). In 2005, the UN Committee against Torture (UNCAT) expressed concerns regarding the worrisome implications of several aspects of Canada's immigration and 'anti-terrorism' policies (Crépeau & Nakache, 2006). The flawed logic which links immigration with criminality has legitimized practices of detention and deportation (Chan, 2005; Pratt, 2005), and the Canada-US Safe Third Country Agreement has blocked access to legal protections for countless people facing political violence (Macklin, 2003) due to deeply embedded biases of the *security-migration nexus* (Cook, 2010).

In March 2003, the U.S. Immigration and Naturalization Service (INS) was reconfigured into the U.S. Department of Homeland Security, conflating immigration with border enforcement (Cook, 2010; Coutin, 2005). These shifts in immigration policy have been seen at different historical moments, as Dikeç and Gilbert (2002) point out, immigration policy in Canada and the U.S. has historically been associated with corporate interests, labour and employment departments. We have witnessed "the rise of the fortress continent" (Klein, 2003) cemented in the North American security perimeter (Vukov, 2003; Oka & Ayers, 2010). The political activism of refugees has been framed as a basis for exclusion from refugee status, as political dissent is increasingly criminalized (Kaushal & Dauvergne, 2011). As Humphries (2002b) notes: "who is to arbitrate on what is 'crime' and what is say, 'liberation struggle'? The actions of hegemonic, racist and imperialist states signal caution about an uncritical acceptance of definitions of criminality as unproblematic" (p. 218).

Exclusionary immigration and refugee policies compound the political, economic and social vulnerability of women, constrained in their capacity to exercise agency within such power-inflected encounters (Dauvergne, 2009; Macklin, 2009; Preston, 2003). This adverse migration context also has implications for displaced children (Ali, 2006;

Bhabha, 2004, 2009a, 2009b, 2011; Martin, 2011). The increasing criminalization of migration is intrusive for children who, like many family-class refugee claimants in Canada, are subjected to DNA testing (Vukov, 2003). Criminalization of children's migration can also be seen in the practice of child deportations.

The 2002 Immigration and Refugee Protection Act (IRPA) does not ensure that "the best interests of the child" (as articulated in international law) are legally binding, only that they will be "taken into account" (Canadian Council for Refugees, 2004; Grover, 2007). Similarly, Burman (2008) cautions against "arbitrary or discretionary allocation of rights" accorded to refugee children in the UK context stating that British immigration tribunals are not bound by the 'best interests of the child' principle and that the state can take the children of rejected refugee claimants into care (p. 186). In the UK context, politicians have drawn on myths and tropes to gain political legitimacy for the implementation of new legislation; for instance, Home Secretary David Blunkett spoke of the 'swamping' of schools by refugee children in April 2002, just prior to the implementation of the Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Bill, which intended to contain and segregate refugees (Vukov, 2003). The 2002 IRPA does provide legal protection for children's right to an education while they are refugee claimants, consistent with article 28 of the UNCRC (Grover, 2007), but this is insufficient for the increasing number of children living with precarious legal status.

Precarious Legal Status in a Global Context

Prior studies in national contexts including the UK, US, Australia, Austria, Belgium, France, Germany, Hungary, Italy, the Netherlands, Portugal, Spain, Sweden, and Switzerland have examined concepts of 'legality' and 'illegality' in relation to migratory status drawing from disparate disciplines including anthropology (De Genova, 2002; Khosravi, 2007; Sigona, 2012), criminology (Coutin, 2005), geography (Varsanyi, 2008), law (Ansley, 2010; Cook, 2010; Dauvergne, 2008; Ruiz-Casares, Rousseau, Derluyn, Watters & Crepeau, 2010); philosophy (Krause, 2008), political economy (Samers, 2003), political science/citizenship studies (Laubenthal, 2007; Levinson, 2005;

Monforte & Dufour, 2011; McNevin, 2006, 2009; Varsanyi, 2006), social work (Park & Bhuyan), and sociology (Bloch & Chimienti, 2011). The consensus among these studies is that 'legality' is a social construction that can be contested on many counts, as Park and Bhuyan (2012) observe: "To accept the illegality of the undocumented at face value is also to accept without critique the indisputable justice of immigration law and the structures of society that enable and uphold existing policies" (p. 25). Ansley (2010) similarly asserts: "As many have argued, in a just legal order the shape of both rights and duties would be determined with pointed reference to power relations and would be designed to reduce and repair illegitimate disparities" (p. 175). Transgressions of the law are politically contentious and we must tackle the ethical aspects of diminished legal protections for refugees and migrants. However, contesting the contingent nature of the law involves, as Cook (2010) points out: "complex and difficult arguments, hard to make and harder to diffuse as a popular message" (p. 158).

Human rights law provides an inadequate framework for immigration justice, although legal protections are necessary (Aiken & Clark, 1994; Aiken & Scott, 2000; Cook, 2010; Crépeau & Nakache, 2006). The discretionary powers of nation-states in enforcing international law, and the limited legal protections for non-status migrants, lead to a heightened sense of insecurity and vulnerability for people forced to migrate in order to survive. Even organizations that are mandated to ensure that there are legal protections for refugees can compound the vulnerability of people fearing political violence. In an auto-ethnographic study of irregular migration, Khosravi (2007) powerfully articulates the ways in which international human rights workers differ sharply on what their role should be, as noted in this excerpt: "My fear of being killed in a horrible war was not 'well-grounded' enough in the view of the UNHCR officer" (p. 325). Human rights frameworks have also been unable to resonate with citizens whose perspectives are shaped by "the emotional power of competing, *national* frames for viewing migration" (Cook, 2010, p.149). These national frames presume that citizens are threatened in their "rightful place of legitimate inhabitants of that space. Such a calculus of inclusion is predicated upon a legalistic construction of belonging…" (Park & Bhuyan, 2012, p.28).

The moral and ethical problems inherent in immigration and refugee law tip over into the arena of child welfare/children's rights. The social rejection of children and young people living with precarious legal status, and with and without families, and the multiple difficulties they face as they struggle against all odds to live with dignity, are examined in several studies (Bloch, Sigona & Zetter, 2009; Bloch, Zetter, Sigona & Gamaledin-Ashami, 2007; Giner, 2010; Gonzales, 2009; Sigona & Hughes, 2010). The harsh conditions in which children and young people with precarious legal status live do not readily sit with the concept of children's rights. The spotlighting of social injustices encountered by children and youth, as opposed to adults, has in many cases evoked moral outrage among citizens who may not have otherwise aligned themselves with the cause of anti-detention and anti-deportation campaigns (Giner, 2010).

Social Work and Professional Ethics

The profession of social work in North America has historically been linked with immigration; its inception as a profession coincided with large-scale immigration and many clients (to use social work terminology) were recent immigrants living in urban poor communities, as seen in the work of Jane Addams and Hull House (Park, 2008). The distinction drawn between refugees vs. migration to escape poverty has existed in social work discourse from the beginning (Park, 2008). The profession of social work in Canada has indicated a conflicted stance on the issue of precarious legal status and social service provision (Bhuyan, 2011; Pashang, 2011). Within a context of social austerity, social workers face concerns about scarce resources leading to differing perspectives on what their role should be. Social workers who view their role as charitable intervention into the lives of socially vulnerable people are less likely to question state welfare mechanisms that draw boundaries around access to services. Yoosun Park (2008) examines the shifting construction of refugees between 1900-1957 through an historical discourse analysis of social service and social welfare publications. As she astutely observes:

> Refugee identity is not an inherent characteristic, but a status granted by international and national legal codes and shaped by domestic social policies and practices. As such, it is deeply consequential—an identification that invokes a critical set of material practices, from international protection to domestic social services. (p. 772)

In many contexts, social workers have been told to report the lack of legal status to immigration authorities (Humphries, 2002a, 2004; Bhuyan, 2011; Pashang, 2011), and those who follow through on these instructions generate fear and distrust among refugees (Okitikpi & Aymer, 2003). In such a political climate, practices of racialization are re-inscribed in policy-making circles, a regression to an era when racist aspects of immigration policy were clearly articulated and widely accepted (Jakubowski, 1997). Yet as prior studies have shown, many social workers do recognize the ethical responsibilities (to ensure equitable access to supports and services) of their profession and also hold the ethical conviction of solidarity as they are working against the backdrop of socio-economic inequities within and between nation-states (Park & Bhuyan, 2012; Pashang, 2011). Forms of subversion against unjust exclusions that compound the suffering of many people should be uncontroversial.

In exposing the injustices inherent within UK immigration controls over ten years ago, Cohen (2002b) raises the question: “Within the continuum of opposition there remains the core issue of what resistance, if any, has been conducted by welfare workers within the workplace?” (p.227). He recognizes that social workers are also legally and economically vulnerable (to a much lesser degree) if engaging in workplace non-compliance, and persuasively argues that this option must be backed by unions. Cohen’s points powerfully resonate with arguments raised by Canadian social workers and social work scholars committed to social equity and justice (Bhuyan, 2011; Pashang, 2011). The critical point is that workplace non-compliance (in disclosure of precarious status) is the only ethical option for health care and social workers, particularly in cases of intimate partner violence when mothers with precarious legal status and their children are especially vulnerable (Bhuyan, 2011; Pashang, 2011).

Precarious legal status in Canada

The particular issues impacting on the lives of children and youth living with precarious status in Canada have been discussed in a number of recent studies (Bejan & Sidhu, 2010; Meloni, 2013; Meloni, Rousseau, Montgomery & Measham, 2013; Ruiz-Casares, Rousseau, Derluyn, Watters & Crepeau, 2010; Saad, 2013; Sidhu, 2008; Villegas, 2010b, 2013; Young, 2005, 2011, 2013). We have seen how children's political subjectivity and social agency have, historically, been pushed to the periphery of academic debates. Research with children in sites of social conflict has widened avenues of protest and new avenues of thinking about patterns of inequality. The emotional resonance of campaigns for children's rights, and campaigns to confront educational disparities in migration contexts can facilitate exposure to the conditions in which children *and adults* with precarious legal status live (Villegas, 2010b, 2013). In many cities, families live without access to health care and social services (despite working long hours) and with the persistent fear of disclosed precarious status and risks of children and parents being separated through deportation to contexts of violence. State-initiated changes have led to hierarchies of citizenship provoking highly charged questions about social accountability. The analysis of children can contribute theoretical toolboxes to activist research including makeshift kaleidoscopes to examine historical and social patterns.

Research on affective processes shaping immigration debates in the media (Vukov, 2003; Bradimore & Bauder, 2011) point to the importance of emotionally resonant arguments for legal activism and other facets of immigration justice campaigns (Cook, 2010).

Regularization Programs in Canada

The most recent regularization programs in Canada include the Deferred Removal Orders Class: 1994-1998 and the Special Regularization Procedure for Algerians Residing in Quebec: 2002 (Bou-Zeid, 2005). The first program resulted in the

regularization of approximately 3000 people whose refugee claims had been rejected but who were left in legal limbo since the Canadian government had stopped deportations to their countries of origin due to political instability. In order to be eligible for this regularization program, applicants who had not been deported for 3 years were required to have been employed for at least 6 months, could not have a criminal record or *serious medical condition* and could not have sought *social assistance*. A fee of $500 for each adult and $100 for each child were required with the application form (Bou-Zeid, 2005).

The Special Regularization Procedure for Algerians Residing in Quebec came about as the result of sustained mobilization from Algerians through the Comité d'action des sans-statut algériens/Action Committee of Non-Status Algerians (CASSA) and their allies in Quebec following the 2002 decision of the Canadian government to end a moratorium on deportations to Algeria (instated in 1997) even though the political situation would still imperil the lives of those whose refugee claims had been rejected (Bou-Zeid, 2005; Wright, 2003, 2006). The campaign was strengthened by the ability of Algerians facing deportation to represent themselves to the Quebec francophone media and to government officials; unfortunately many non-status people would not be as articulate in French or English as they would be in their first language and are unable to represent themselves in the same way (Bou-Zeid, 2005; Wright, 2006, 2003). Another strategy that CASSA took up was to emphasize their condition as *refugees* (Bou-Zeid, 2005; Wright, 2003, 2006).

Bou-Zeid (2005) cautions that regularization programs can compound the vulnerability of those who do not qualify, or whose application for regularization is rejected, and increase the threat of detention or deportation. Additionally, the government's receptiveness to more recent regularization campaigns has been tied to labour shortages and such campaigns could be eclipsed by the expansion of temporary foreign worker programs (Bou-Zeid, 2005). It is the Canadian refugee system that often leaves people with no other recourse but to live without legal status, and regularization programs have historically been introduced just prior to introducing more restrictive immigration and refugee procedures and controls (Bou-Zeid, 2005). Regularization programs have not generated much media and public debate, when compared with other

political contexts such as the U.S., until recently. While the numbers of migrants with precarious legal status are significantly smaller in Canada, another factor contributing to more recent public attention to this issue is the intensification of concern over Canada's 'border security' following events such as the 1999 arrival of four boats from the Fujian Province of China as well border panics invoked after 9/11 (Bou-Zeid, 2005; Mountz, 2010). In 2003, Canada's former Auditor-General, Sheila Fraser, announced that an estimated thirty-six thousand 'illegal' immigrants have not been accounted for or deported, and the media quickly framed this announcement from a security angle (Bou-Zeid, 2005).

In 2001, a coalition called STATUS was formed following the initiative of a group of undocumented Latin American men working in the construction sector in Toronto. The coalition organized a national conference with the objective to connect non-status migrants and their allies, and to strategize for regularization campaigns as well as access to social rights (Bou-Zeid, 2005; Wright, 2003). Regularization campaigns in Canada are turning to the level of municipal government because of exclusionary federal immigration policies, a strategy inspired by U.S. municipalities' adoption of 'local citizenship' policies for non-status migrants (Nyers, 2010). Immigration law and enforcement remains under federal jurisdiction and so there are limitations to social rights secured at the municipal level (Nyers, 2010).

<u>Sanctuary in the Canadian Context</u>

While journalism has often been implicated in anti-immigrant discourse, local media have historically played an important role in the Canadian sanctuary movement, eliciting support for migrants with no other legal recourse and the fear of deportation (Lippert, 2005). Media exposure of the fear and threat of returning to economic insecurity, violence, imprisonment or death resulted in stays in deportation and, in the case of CASSA in Montreal, a regularization program. In most cases, the act of sanctuary provision and sustained media coverage prevented the police or immigration officials from arresting migrants, although in 1998 police entered a church that did not

have a city permit in order to arrest several Chileans (Lippert, 2005). This action coincided with the Canadian government's negotiation of a bilateral free trade agreement with Chile in the late 1990s (Lippert, 2005). Sanctuary incidents sometimes required media support for months following the promise of legal status from immigration officials since migrants were left vulnerable after exiting the protection of sanctuary (Lippert, 2005). As Basok (1996) points out: "it is important to point out that this institution [the Sanctuary movement] does not exist independently of the state but in defiance of the state" (p. 155).

Political and Social Activism of People Displaced

> individuals can draw on resemblances or interconnections between law and illegality to suggest that laws themselves are illegitimate. For instance, during the 1940s and 1950s, civil rights advocates violated Jim Crow laws, largely by engaging in practices (e.g. sitting at lunch counters) that mirrored 'acceptable' actions. (Coutin, 2005, p. 11)

Drawing inspiration from the Civil Rights Movement's freedom riders of the 1960s, migrant rights and labour organizations initiated the "Immigrant Workers Freedom Ride" in 2003, bringing together undocumented workers and allies from across the U.S. for a large rally in Washington, D.C. (Basok, 2008). Dikeç and Gilbert (2002) also draw on resonances between the Civil Rights Movement and immigration justice movements: "The civil rights movements of the 1960s demanded equality and recognition of difference by national minority groups. The recent struggles of urban citizenship are also based on claiming a just access to resources, but this time by people who are not necessarily national citizens" (p. 64).

In response to proposed anti-immigration legislation, more than 1 million people participated in political protests in support of immigrant and worker rights in the U.S. on May 1st, 2006, following earlier large-scale protests in cities across the country (McNevin, 2009; Pulido, 2007). Soon after these protests, over 100 immigration-related

municipal ordinances (both pro and anti-immigration) were introduced or considered in 31 states (Gilbert, 2009) while civil, political, and social rights for undocumented migrants (to vote, to access post-secondary education) have being written into law at local and state scales (Varsanyi, 2006). Exclusionary municipal ordinances have been challenged by civil liberties organizations and pro-immigration advocates (Gilbert, 2009).

The formidable barriers to achieving immigration justice and the ways in which politically vulnerable activists have been thwarted in these attempts call for ongoing contestations. A fourteen-year-old boy, Anthony Soltero, from De Anza Middle School in Ontario, California had been politically active in demonstrations in support of immigrant rights and in organizing a walk-out at his school in March 2006 (Hurley, 2011). He was subsequently threatened with four years in prison by the vice-principal of his school and told that his parents would be fined. After leaving the vice-principal's office and calling his mother to tell her about the meeting, Anthony shot himself at home and died several days later (Hurley, 2011). As Hurley sensitively asserts:

> The last moments in the life of any young person who commits suicide may be unbearably painful for us truly to imagine, but only by lingering for a while in even the most uncomfortable and awful speculations can we begin to identify the messages (about "personal responsibility," for example) we send that make some youth want to die. If we do imagine what their desperation might feel like, we can better appreciate the urgent need to let young people know that what ails them is not something unique to them or indicative of individual "badness." It is, rather, symptomatic of the societies in which we live, societies that all too often insist that certain victims author their own suffering or are too much like garbage to warrant our concern. (p. 220)

Similarly, politicians expressed confounding indifference to the suffering of migrant children in Australian detention centres when the children wounded their own bodies in January, 2002. The children between the ages of 6 and 12 were protesting their incarceration alongside their parents in the painful act of sewing their lips together (Parr, 2005). Such an act of suffering prompted further threats from politicians and hardened their resolve to spatially and socially exclude people seeking asylum and other migrants.

The mayor of Port Augusta, Australia spoke out against refugee children attending public schools in the community and with steady indifference stated: “They walk up and down in the detention centre slashing their arms with razor blades emulating their parents. Their ways are not our ways” (quoted in Parr, 2005, p. 386). How is it that manifestations of acute anguish can be sharply reversed in representations to assign blame to those so unjustly treated? Equally disturbing is the notion put forward by political elites that they are the ones victimized/manipulated by the responses to their own harsh and egregious practices. Within the Canadian context, Saad (2013) eloquently argues that immigration status is a social determinant of health, and outlines how fear over precarious status and workplace injustices compound psycho-social distress. Saad’s analysis connects with other work in the Canadian context (Galabuzi, 2004, 2006) and U.S. context (Williams, 1996), which discusses the importance of context for health status, including mental health, and the ways in which social exclusion can result in poor health outcomes.

Grassroots organizing and media campaigns on the subject of immigration have been initiated by groups of all political stripes, including, for instance, nativists in the U.S. who have pushed the immigration debate in a conservative direction (Cook, 2010). Conservative groups funnel their arguments into ‘acceptable’ forms of protest including campaign strategies of petitions and street protest that, when taken up on the Left, are characterized within neoliberal discourse as ‘urban disorder’, ‘illegal actions’, and sometimes ‘terrorist acts’ (Gilbert, 2005).

Greater exposure of the deportation and detention of migrants and refugees has sparked growing critiques (Nyers, 2003; Lowry & Nyers, 2003). The “politicization of deportation” has been accomplished through the campaigns of migrant justice organizations such as No One is Illegal (Chan, 2005). Chan (2005) points to “how deportation is about the desire to control difference, whether it is through enforced assimilation or differential exclusion” (p.177). This point is brought out carefully in her analysis of Canadian immigration officers’ assessments and court decisions to stay or enforce deportation orders. Condemnation of state practices that are complicit in violence (state authorities can make life or death decisions about who is excluded from the nation-state) brings into sharp relief the fear, material deprivation and the deprivation

of dignity endured by many people pushed to the sidelines of legal pathways to citizenship.

This sets the context for political dissent, which takes shape in a climate of distrust and power asymmetries. People most directly affected by injustice have not always been able to articulate political priorities on their own terms due to legal and social vulnerability. But many do, against all odds. Gutierrez Rodriguez (2004) urges activists and other allies with status to be sensitive and reflexive about their roles. If not, “[t]he old colonial relationship of recognition of the one who knows and the one that is known risks being reactivated” (p. 155). She further states that: “The question 'who is being represented' in public and 'why this person becomes a public speaker', is tidily linked to access to public space, the embodiment of a dominant habitus and culture of speech developed in specific local political scenes” (p.154).

Artist, writer, and social activist Francisco-Fernando Granados was politicized at an early age alongside a group of refugee teenage activists in Vancouver. Reflecting on his experiences speaking at conferences and youth gatherings post-9/11, he states:

> Talking to the Vancouver Sun, Global News and documentary crews became increasingly frustrating as it became obvious that their interest in our stories had less to do with creating some kind of discussion around our work in the community and more to do with repeating an idealized version of Canadian multiculturalism where everyone, even racialized young people, had a chance to speak. The frameworks for representation these outlets provided were too rigid, too predetermined, too small. Refugees are meant to be grateful, and talking about the struggles of institutionalized discrimination or the brutalizing refugee certification process would not fit into these frames. (Granados, 2010, cited in Dawson, 2011, p.68)

Francisco-Fernando Granados conveys key social critiques through his art and as an essayist. Through the public contestation of such issues as institutionalized racism and exclusionary refugee policies, he has been able to destabilize claims of altruism in Canadian refugee policies, of social equality in Canadian multiculturalism and, in doing so, has opened up windows of insight that can inform social change.

The City as a Site of Struggle for Social and Immigration Justice

The municipal government was a significant component of the post-war welfare state, assuming the functions of policing, education, hospitals, prisons, welfare and housing, and providing public transportation and social services (Isin, 1998). A focus on cities has once again become a central aspect of an analysis of the politics of space; cities are repositioned in policy arenas and in social movements working on campaigns claiming rights to the city (Bhuyan, 2011; Dikeç & Gilbert, 2002; Gilbert, 2004, 2005, 2009; Khosla, 2003; McNevin, 2009; Miklavcic, 2011; Nyers, 2006, 2010; Sassen, 2012; Squire, 2010; Sidhu, 2008; Teelucksingh, 2006; Varsanyi, 2006, 2008; Wood & Gilbert, 2005; Young, 2011). McNevin (2009) asserts that: "global cities attract and dispel flows of finance, trade, culture, and ideology" (p.168). Relationships between national, regional and local scales have been reconfigured (Gilbert, 2004). Neoliberal policies have led to the devolution of social welfare provision and public services to provincial and municipal levels of government, the private sector (through the privatization of services and public-private partnerships) and to the private sphere of homes (Bhuyan, 2011; Brenner & Theodore, 2002; Gilbert, 2004; Ilcan & Basok, 2004). This trend can be recognized as a manifestation of the "urbanization of neoliberalism" intensifying "sociospatial polarization" (Brenner & Theodore, 2002, p.371) as pockets of cities become gentrified. Ecological disparities within cities are also accentuated by neoliberalism (Gilbert, 2004; Teelucksingh, 2002, 2006). Socio-spatial disparities in Toronto have been mapped out with gentrification at the centre and poverty sprawling to the periphery (Gilbert, 2004). Toronto (and other cities) must redress the injustice of "racialized spatial concentration of poverty in key neighbourhoods" (Galabuzi, 2006, p.183). David Harvey (2008) cautions that "the metropolis is now the point of massive collision—dare we call it class struggle?—over the accumulation by dispossession visited upon the least well-off and the developmental drive that seeks to colonize space for the affluent" (p. 39).

The voluntary sector has become more important to refugees and new immigrants as the state continues to retreat from the provision of public services and social welfare (Bloch & Schuster, 2002), and as systemic inequities persist in employment and housing. As Gilbert (2004) observes: “immigration funding to cities will require some creative legal juggling since immigration is a federal responsibility that has so far only entered in some federal–provincial agreements because the Canadian constitution does not allow for federal–municipal agreements” (pp. 254-255). In a study of refugees’ experiences of housing and homelessness in Toronto, Canada and London, UK, Priya Kissoon (2010) examines immigration, legislative, and housing contexts. In 1996, the responsibility for the provision of social housing in Canada was downloaded from the federal to the provincial government, and then to the municipal government in 2004 (Keil, 2002; Kissoon, 2010; Gilbert, 2004). Multiple barriers in access to housing are shaped by different levels of jurisdiction and the city is an important scale for analysis (Kissoon, 2010). Housing-related discrimination is a critical social justice issue (Galabuzi, 2006; Gilbert, 2004; Kissoon, 2010).

Given the analysis of youth homelessness in affluent countries such as Canada, discussed in section one, and the backdrop of neoliberal policies compounding social disparity, this patchwork of legislation and policies can be seen as inadequate for dismantling structures of racialization, gender, and class (and other axes of discrimination) which leave many people counting dimes at the end of the month as rent cheques loom. In many cases, there are just not enough hours of work (with a living wage) or affordable housing to prevent people from being pushed out of their homes and onto the streets. For this reason, Galabuzi (2006) writes: “It is imperative that a national affordable housing program be re-established and that its elements address specifically the segregationist nature of the housing market in Canada’s urban centres” (p. 229)

Migrant workers provide the labour that allows cities to function according to the blueprint of capitalism, in both the private realm of affluent families and the public realm of economic activity (Sassen, 2012). While they are most impacted by urban social inequality, especially undocumented workers, they also contribute capacities for political action to the labour movement in addition to cultural practices that strengthen cities

(Sassen, 2012). However, political agency is more difficult to exercise when city police officers collaborate with the Canadian Border Services Agency, strengthening the "deportation apparatus" (Nyers, 2010).

Multiple forms of mobilization have taken shape in im/migrant communities including collaboration with urban justice movements (Gilbert, 2004), legal activism (Committee for Accessible AIDS Treatment, 2001; Parkdale Community Legal Clinic, 2005), campaigns for educational justice (Bejan & Sidhu, 2010; Sidhu, 2008; Villegas, 2010b, 2013), and "strategic spatial essentialism" (Veronis, 2007). "Strategic spatial essentialism" has engaged with Canadian multiculturalism through spatial strategies to create a Latin American neighbourhood in Toronto[16] and to access resources (inequitably distributed in society due to power asymmetries) to create a community centre, as Veronis (2007) observes:

> Latin Americans' choice to construct a place that grounds and essentializes their identity locally disrupts the power structures of Canadian multiculturalism. The creation of a *barrio latino* is a political act through which Latin Americans appropriate the category 'Latin American' and produce their own Subjectivity. (p. 464)

Recent academic studies have also engaged with youth perspectives on urban development projects, for example with youth living in Toronto's Regent Park neighbourhood (the majority of whom are racialized and/or new immigrants or refugees) (Laughlin & Johnson, 2011). The perspectives of children and youth are often pushed to the periphery of academic and political debates, or included in small, token changes (Stasiulis, 2002, 2004). There is a need for more youth-initiated community development projects such as Regent Park Focus (catchdaflava.com), a youth media collective that engages in community arts and mixed-media collaborations for social action (Crath, 2012).

The city has also been the site for anti-immigration/right-wing populist movements (Gilbert, 2009; Cook, 2010). Concerns about policy disjunctures between

16 The first city councillor of Latin American origin to be elected in Canada was Cesar Palacio (from Ecuador); he was elected in Toronto's 2003 municipal elections and played a supportive role in these initiatives (Veronis, 2007).

federal jurisdiction over immigration, and the devolution of public services and social welfare provision to Canadian provinces/U.S. states and cities, have been articulated, in quite different ways, by both pro- and anti-immigration groups (Gilbert, 2009). Taking a cue from nativist rhetoric in the U.S., immigration debates have been sparked in small municipalities within Canada. In January 2007, the Municipality of Hérouxville, Quebec (located between Montreal and Quebec City) adopted a declaration of 'standards of life' (*normes de vie*) to function as a code of conduct for im/migrants (Gilbert, 2009; Mojab & El-Kassem, 2011). This event led to a flurry of media coverage and the development of the Bouchard-Taylor Commission, led by philosopher Charles Taylor and historian Gérard Bouchard, on intercultural practices and 'reasonable accommodation' (Gilbert, 2009). Similar debates have been sparked in Ontario and other Canadian provinces (Haque, 2010, 2012; Mojab & El-Kassem, 2011). As Gilbert (2009) writes: "In tapping into a discourse of excess of tolerance and accommodation of newcomers' presence and practices, municipal immigration policies invoke the protection of local and national culture through what they defend as an unabashed non-racist discourse of assimilation" (p. 38). These events bring to mind Hage's (2000) theorization of *governmental belonging* discussed in earlier chapters. Hage's analysis of *governmental belonging* adds an additional dimension to interpreting the debate on 'reasonable accommodation' in Quebec. As Hage (2000) notes: "The fascinating thing is to see how the White Nation fantasy can give stage to a governmental nationalist capable of believing that their 'feeling uneasy' is something that ought to worry the nation" (p. 126). The events in the Municipality of Hérouxville, Quebec also demonstrate how nationalist discourses (claiming to be devoid of racist underpinnings) can be quickly disseminated in the media to affect scales beyond the local and regional.

Given the ways in which *governmental belonging* (Hage, 2000) continue to shape social and political relationships within nation-states, and the fact that increasing numbers of people are being excluded from legal pathways to citizenship (Crépeau & Nakache, 2006; Dauvergne, 2008) reflections on citizenship continue to be politically consequential, as Varsanyi (2006) notes:

> at least while citizenship is still a status and identity which has real power

> over people's lives, it is important that the processes of critiquing citizenship not only deconstruct it, but that the ways in which citizenship is being challenged at the margins also come back to influence the structure of the formal and legal institution. (p. 238)

While the decision to engage with state structures has raised many concerns in anti-colonial struggles (Fortier, 2013), legal changes have been critical to redressing injustices derived from systemic racism in Canada (Aylward, 1999); legal changes are critical to restoring justice and dignity in the lives of many people at the margins of power. Legal activism is part of a wide spectrum of political projects.

Access to Social Rights for Children with Precarious Legal Status/Don't Ask Don't Tell Policy

In 2006, Canadian Border Services Agency officials entered Toronto schools in pursuit of children whose parents had precarious legal status. The objective was clear: detain children and youth in order to locate and deport their parents. This act outraged many people of differing political stripes who became aware of these events reported by journalists in both regional and national papers. What drew public attention to this cause was the fact that young people, as opposed to adults, had been the targets of immigration enforcement and that the CBSA officials had entered the institutional space of the school. These events were not unique to the Canadian context. In the UK, for example, child deportations are a frequent occurrence prompting action against removal by school teachers, community members, journalists, and local politicians; journalists have played a key role in community-based mobilizations, as Giner (2007) observes: "All such [media] stories criticise the state for disrupting children's lives and sending them back to places considered unsafe" (p. 255).

The actions of CBSA officials in 2006 created a flashpoint in a longer trajectory of migrant justice activism. Initiatives such as the STATUS coalition in Toronto (launched in 2001) had shone a spotlight on injustices faced by people living with precarious status in terms of barriers to accessing health care and other basic social rights. Efforts to establish a city-wide *Don't Ask Don't Tell* policy, which were launched in

2004, accelerated, as Nyers (2010) notes: “Such a policy would ensure that municipal funds, resources, and workers would not be used to enforce federal or provincial immigration laws” (p.137). Simply put, social services, education and health care workers would agree that disclosure of immigration status was irrelevant to professional practice and actually contrary to professional ethics in these sectors. People would not be asked for documentation of their immigration status nor would they be expected to disclose lack of status.

Toronto's DADT campaign, which brought together over 40 community organizations[17] drew inspiration from the fifty-plus municipalities in the U.S. that have adopted similar policies (Nyers, 2010). Critical to the success of Toronto's DADT campaign was the media attention and support of city councillors as well as the wider public. Events in 2006 undoubtedly accelerated the longstanding and committed efforts of DADT campaigners.

While the adoption of a DADT policy in 2007 and the more recent declaration of Toronto as a Sanctuary City in 2013 have been powerful and politically consequential gains in the struggle for dignity and justice (in terms of articulating entitlement to social rights and mobilizing change), these gains must be seen as partial and incomplete. As Nyers (2010) argues, the policy prescribes anonymity and does not address workplace exploitation experienced by so many precarious status migrants. Immigration officials in Ontario have replicated the mass workplace raids seen in the U.S.; the raids in Ontario resulted in the deportation of more than 100 undocumented workers from the Caribbean, China, Mexico, the Philippines and Thailand in early summer of 2009 (Oka & Ayers, 2010).

Women with precarious legal status often struggle against further layers of exploitation including sexual and physical violence, as well as barriers to employment and workplace injustices (Bhuyan, 2011; Burns, 2010; Hobbs & Sauer, 2005; Pashang, 2011). Many women endure incomprehensible violence and hardship, as a consequence

17 Important studies on access to social rights for people with precarious status were initiated by community organizations in the early 2000s (Bannerman, Hoa & Male, 2003; Committee for Accessible AIDS Treatment, 2001).

of the sharp edges of exclusionary policies, in order to provide for their children. In contexts of fear, violence, and economic vulnerability, many women survive unfathomable injustices; against all odds, they survive (Pashang, 2011). No one should ever be forced to endure such injustices.

Additionally, Nyers (2010) raises the following critical questions concerning the DADT policy: "Does this not reproduce the logic of silence, subterfuge, and secrecy that already determines much of the daily existence of non-status people?" (p. 141). He also raises the argument that the border must be viewed with a critical lens that would take into account the political decisions that have excluded particular groups in a number of historical contexts.

Section Two:

Critique of media narratives: Children and nationalism; children and neoliberalism; new immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable'/'threatening'

> "Unlike issues, events are contingencies that can tip the outcome in one way or the other in terms of public perceptions and opinions." (Greenberg, 2004, p. 368)

The three narratives identified in representations of new immigrant and refugee children will be critiqued drawing on sociological theories of education. This section focuses on the right to education for children with precarious legal status, and how this has been framed against the backdrop of neoliberal politics. The final media analysis section pays close attention to depictions of the events leading up to the Toronto District School Board's decision to adopt a policy protecting the social rights of children with precarious legal status.

<u>"Locked out of the classroom --- The children of illegal immigrants are being denied the right to education and the surprising part is that it's happening here in Ontario."</u>

The narrative of Canadian nationalism is used to frame arguments raised by Koehl (2002, May 10), writing for the *Toronto Star*, who believes that the readership would be surprised to learn that the right to education is denied to some children in Ontario. Both the headline and opening paragraph suggest a distinction between Canada (the inference being that Canada is known as a country that respects human rights) and, as Koehl writes, “places in the world where a child's right to an education is still not respected.” While advocating for the educational rights of children with precarious status, Koehl reinforces the notion of legal transgressions by ‘culpable parents’ and the dichotomy of ‘culpable’ parents /‘innocent’ children:

> Many argue that people should not be in Canada illegally, should not jump the queue to share in our wealth, and should not expect a warm welcome. But whatever the merit of these arguments, they apply to parents, not children. (p. A25)

I contend that this is a dangerous line of argumentation as it ignites social antagonisms and sidesteps the reality that legal pathways to citizenship have been narrowed. Additionally, it obscures colonial histories, ideological manifestations of racism and inequalities endemic in capitalism, which are implicated in migratory patterns. This dichotomy of ‘culpable’ parents /‘innocent’ children is framed with the narrative of new immigrant and refugee children as ‘vulnerable’:

> These children are among the most vulnerable and innocent in our province. They are innocent because they are children and cannot be blamed for tagging along with their parents; they are the most vulnerable because their parents are often poor with limited language skills and their illegal status makes getting needed services difficult. (p. A25)

The tone of Koehl’s article is paternalistic and he simplifies the complexity of precarious status by identifying two groups:

> In the first group are children whose parents are in Canada illegally. Ontario's Education Act, which makes school attendance compulsory between age 6 and

> 16, specifically says such children have a right to go to school. Unfortunately, the law has not made much of an impression on education officials…
>
> In the second group are children whose parents' status is unclear or not yet determined. This includes people who come to Canada as "visitors" but intend to stay. (p. A25)

The implication in this simplified assessment of migratory status is that many people who migrate are deliberately transgressing the law. There is no analysis of the reasons compelling people to migrate, and the hardships people endure in both countries of origin and countries of reception. The U.S. 1982 Supreme Court case, *Plyler v. Doe,* is mentioned although not named:

> Even in the United States, schools are forbidden from asking about immigration status. Almost 20 years ago, its Supreme Court struck down a Texas law that tried to keep children illegally in the country out of school. The court wondered what the state hoped to achieve by "promoting the creation and perpetuation of a subclass of illiterates," which would only add to unemployment, welfare and crime. The court concluded that any savings were insignificant "in light of the costs involved to these children, the state and the nation." (p. A25)

Here the notion of individual pathology and social deficit theories are employed rather than the acknowledgement of systemic injustices and social disparities within and between countries. The narrative of children and neoliberalism frames children's right to an education in terms of costs saved for children as well as *the nation-state*. Interestingly, Koehl begins this paragraph by stating that *even in the United States…*education cannot be denied to children with precarious status. The implication seems to be that U.S. policies are typically not as 'compassionate' as Canadian ones. He proceeds with a statement from former Canadian immigration minister Elinor Caplan who states: "I firmly believe that no child should be denied an education"; her stance is consistent with the Ontario Education Act. Tensions between different levels of government and jurisdiction are discussed in the next two paragraphs concluding that

children's right to an education is guaranteed under the UNCRC, to which Canada is a signatory. The three narratives of *new immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable'/'threatening'*, *children and neoliberalism*, and *children and nationalism* can be seen in the concluding paragraphs of the article:

> The children are here anyway - keeping them out of school simply means they may be unsupervised and unaccounted for. It means that if they ultimately get legal status, our schools have to provide costly programs to help them catch up. And without an education they are more likely to become a burden to our community.
>
> Using children as pawns to enforce Canada's immigration laws diminishes us as a people. Provincial educators acting like immigration officers or anxious bureaucrats impoverishes Ontario's proud heritage in public education. Our tradition is to strive for a place where a child's basic rights are respected. (p. A25)

Concerns raised include "using children as pawns", children being "unsupervised and unaccounted for" *('vulnerable'/'threatening')*, "schools having to provide costly programs" and the risk of children as "a burden to our community" (*children and neoliberalism*), and actions which "diminish us as a people" and which "impoverishes Ontario's proud heritage in public education" (*children and nationalism*). The latter narrative is invoked again in the statement: "Our tradition is to strive for a place where a child's basic rights are respected", linking Canadian identity with a tradition of human rights and democracy.

This article was written by Albert Koehl who is identified in the byline "as a founding member of The Education Rights Task Force, an advocacy group for children." The Education Rights Task Force was established in 1999 with the majority of members from Toronto's legal community, many of them had lobbied to change the Ontario Education Act in 1993 in order to guarantee access to education for children with precarious status (Section 49.1, discussed in Chapter Five) (Villegas, 2013). The Education Rights Task Force has focused its campaigns on the legal rights of children,

particularly children with precarious legal status, drawing on the UNCRC, rather than the rights of adults with precarious status or a broader migrant justice framework pursuing immigration reform (Villegas, 2010b, 2013).

"Canada criticized over minorities --- U.N. committee points to treatment of aboriginals, others."

A few months after Koehl's article appeared in the *Toronto Star*, the concerns of the U.N. Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination were reported by the Canadian Press (2002, August 7).

> While praising Canada's overall human rights record, a United Nations committee has reminded Ottawa of the inequalities encountered by aboriginal peoples, African-Canadians and other minorities.
>
> And the committee heard that immigrants and refugees in Canada face the risk of being unfairly branded as criminals and terrorists in the wake of the Sept. 11 attacks last year. (p. A9)

Arguably, the diplomatic language employed by the UN does not really capture the scale of social disparities and systemic injustices. It is interesting to note that the article consistently mentions inequalities but not inequities. The two sources quoted in the article are Kurt Herndl: "the Austrian expert on the committee who served as country rapporteur to the reports of Canada, [who] pointed to problems affecting aboriginals, African-Canadian and immigrant communities in the country" and Norman Moyer, head of the Canadian delegation and an assistant deputy minister at the Canadian Heritage department (p. A9). Herndl raises concerns about continuing land claims, deaths of people in custody (especially of aboriginal people), and access to the justice system. Herndl also states: "It is recognized that there is an unreasonably high proportion of African-Canadians in detention" (p. A9). The article mentions migrant children in the next paragraph:

> Noting the "wage gaps" between citizens and immigrants, Herndl said the poverty rate among migrants is higher than the rest of the population and that migrant children have fewer educational opportunities than Canadians. (p. A9)

The UN committee comments on some of the troubling social inequities manifesting in racialized poverty and their impact on children's lives, although it is not clear why the term "wage gaps" is placed in quotation marks. Nathan Moyer is directly quoted stating that the UN committee observations were made "in a sensitive and sensible way. These are issues that are already being worked on in Canada" (p. A9). He further states: "They are not drawing to our attention areas that we haven't already thought of and begun to work on. It's at best a process of reminding and pushing (us) to go further" (p. A9).

It is not clear, since there is no mention of, what steps the Canadian delegation will take, and with whom it will collaborate, in order to redress the injustices outlined by the UN Committee. This lack of clarity relates to a general weakness of international law in terms of enforcement mostly left to the discretion of nation-states. Unsurprisingly,

> The official delegation defended Canada's record and told the U.N. committee that the Canadian government is "deeply committed to the eradication of racial discrimination." (p. A9)

This article makes a contribution to public debate by framing the rights of migrant children within a broader framework of injustices relating to racial discrimination.

<u>"Canada's schools fail immigrants"</u>

This article written in the *Toronto Star* (Canadian Press, 2002, August 7) begins with a counter-frame (Entman, 1993, 2003, 2004) to dominant narratives/frames by destabilizing stereotypes of new immigrant, and refugee children and youth. The article's introduction also confirms Galabuzi's (2014) point that the educational accomplishments of many immigrant children parallel those of the children of Canadian-born parents.

> No need to worry about Sear Qaher. The 16-year-old arrived in Hamilton a year ago from his native Afghanistan, with barely three years of schooling, but has

> already breezed through Grade 9 and 10 math classes. Nothing will stop him from realizing his dream of being a computer engineer.
>
> Kadijo Afrah is also determined to defy the odds and become a doctor or pharmacist. In her Regent Park neighbourhood, one of the poorest areas in Canada, overwhelming numbers of students are dropping out of high school. But Kadijo, a Somali native, is getting A's at Jarvis Collegiate. (p. H06)

The article draws on research from journalist Andrew Duffy who spent a year studying the relationship between education and immigration, as a 2003 recipient of the Atkinson Fellowship in Public Policy. Noting that there is little research on the subject of the educational achievement of immigrant students in Canada, Duffy raises concerns about high school dropout rates, stating that refugee children are "particularly at risk". Duffy also confronts the argument that children of post-World War II immigrants "were able to make it" without English-as-a-Second-Language programs.

> Part of the answer is economics. Earlier immigrant children likely also had high dropout rates, although statistics were never kept. But they could still make a decent living. A generation ago, they and their parents did not need a high school diploma to find well-paying jobs in factories.
>
> Today, those high-paying, low-skilled jobs are gone. Now, a high school diploma is an absolute minimum to get even the lowest-paid job. (p. H06)

Absent from this analysis is the social reality of racism in Canada which has compounded the struggles faced by later groups of new immigrants and refugees, in addition to the multiple injustices (such as austerity policies through economic restructuring, the uneven distribution of power and resources, a changing workforce with increasingly precarious employment, diminished access, or no access, to health care and education etcetera) resulting from neoliberal globalization. The first source to be quoted (paraphrased) in the article is Paula Markus, the Toronto District School Board's ESL co-ordinator who attributes the "success or failure" of ESL students to "family and economic

pressures", concluding that "The fear is that immigrant children won't break out of their family's cycle of poverty if they fail in school." This line of argumentation does not properly contextualize the circumstances and structures that reproduce poverty. The article provides some concrete statistics, highlighting barriers to language acquisition.

> In the last 15 years, some 3.3 million immigrants have settled in Canada. They are less likely to speak English than previous waves of newcomers. The 2001 census found 40 per cent of Greater Toronto Area residents spoke a first language other than English. Some 14 per cent of students in the GTA alone are in ESL programs. Yet, even as demand for ESL instruction has soared, school boards are cutting ESL teachers and training. (p. H06)

The article concludes with recommendations for the federal and provincial government in four key areas: 1) to increase funding from the federal government with the argument that "because Ottawa decides what type and how many immigrants are accepted each year, it should shoulder more of the costs of ESL and other programs that help newcomers" (we can see here the narrative of *children and neoliberalism* as well as ongoing tensions between levels of government and jurisdictions). How and why the federal government makes decisions about immigrants is not discussed. 2) It is recommended that student progress be tracked to provide "education officials" with data to evaluate the success of ESL programs and areas for improvement. 3) It is recommended that ESL support be extended/expanded:

> Experts say it takes students five to seven years to acquire the English skills needed to succeed in high school. But Ontario only pays for four years of ESL training. Extending it to five years or more would cost roughly $100 million a year but it would be money well spent because it would result in a better educated immigrant community, with more chance of success in the workplace. (p. H06)

The final recommendation focuses on the role of teachers:

> Give teachers more training. A recent survey by the lobby group Parents for Education found that 76 per cent of urban elementary schools in Ontario had ESL students, but only 26 per cent had ESL teachers. Ontario teachers - even if their subject is history, art or science - stand a good chance of facing students struggling with English. Teachers' colleges should provide training, even if it only means a few classes during a term, for all prospective teachers on ways to help such students. (p. H06)

The article concludes with the warning that "Canada is in danger of creating an immigrant underclass. Young people who fail at school face a dim future of poorly paid jobs, or no jobs at all. As a nation, we must focus on preventing this waste of human potential." This article makes no mention at all of the injustices encountered by racialized students or of anti-racism education. Speaking about the Toronto context, Galabuzi (2006) brings into focus these injustices: "The relationship between educational institutions and racialized parents and communities has also been described as dysfunctional, as some educators routinely disparage the role and contributions of racialized parents in the schools" (p.191). This article parallels the actions of some educational institutions by missing the opportunity to respectfully engage with the knowledge and the multitude of perspectives of racialized immigrant and refugee parents and children. This article raises important concerns about the need for ESL program but does so with the narratives of neoliberalism and vulnerability/threat, which does not capture the importance of educational rights as a component of social justice.

<u>"ESL students shortchanged; 40% of GTA schools with ESL students lack teachers new study by People for Education to be released today"</u>

Kalinowski (2006, Mar 08), reporting for the *Toronto Star*, brings attention to an issue that has consistently been in the spotlight since the beginning of the period analyzed in this study.

> More than 40 per cent of Greater Toronto schools with English as a Second Language students do not have ESL teachers, according to new research. (p. B1)

What is unique about this article is that the journalist quotes directly from a mother from Somalia. While there were language barriers, the journalist could understand through a translator, which indicates that other journalists could do the same (although this option is challenging with budget cutbacks); that way, stories about immigrant and refugee children would include perspectives from immigrant and refugee children. The mother interviewed expresses concern for her children over the implications of inadequate language proficiency. She also expresses heartbreak:

> Speaking through a translator in her native Somali, Nur said her heart breaks when her children ask to return to Cairo, the city where they lived as refugees and were too poor to attend school…
>
> …"I had a dream that my children will learn something, be something important. Now my dream is gone. I see they don't have knowledge to go to work," said Nur. (p. B1)

The narrative of nationalism is invoked when the executive director of the Atkinson Charitable Foundation is directly quoted stating that the situation was "un-Canadian". In another quote attributed to him, the narrative of immigrant and refugee children as 'threatening' can be discerned: "It makes them more susceptible to a pathway of frustration and maybe something more dangerous than that," he said" (p. B1). What is unique about this article is that the costs associated with ESL programming are not constructed as a 'burden to tax-payers'.

<u>"Pupils held in asylum case spark review"</u>

An article by Jiménez and Alphonso (2006, May 2), from *The Globe and Mail*, indicates ambivalence in condemning immigration authorities from entering schools in order to deport children and youth with precarious legal status. The opening sentence of the article paraphrases Minister of Public Safety Stockwell Day, stating that: "it is not

government policy to use children as bait to lure out of hiding parents who are facing deportation orders" (p. A1). The problem has thus been defined by a powerful political actor who: "promised to investigate two incidents at Toronto schools involving the apprehension of children of undocumented workers who failed to appear for removal" (p. A1). In this second sentence of the article, he characterizes the parents of the children as "undocumented workers", thereby emphasizing their identity as *workers* as well as *undocumented*; the latter adjective infers that they have also transgressed the law. There is no mention of the fact that they were refugee claimants, a fact introduced in the fourth paragraph:

> Officers with the Canada Border Services Agency arrived Friday at St. Jude Catholic school in Toronto and threatened to take away two young sisters, 7 and 14, if their parents, illegal immigrants, did not turn themselves in within 30 minutes. The mother, Denia Araya, came to the school, and she and her daughters, Lisbeth and Hacel, were taken to a detention centre on Friday, but later released into a friend's care.
>
> Their family was ordered removed last year after their asylum case failed and was supposed to appear for an appointment with CBSA yesterday. The border services agency would not comment yesterday whether the family kept the appointment. (p. A1)

The family is defined as 'illegal immigrants' and their status as refugee claimants is briefly described by stating that "their asylum case failed". However, the credibility of their asylum claim is rendered suspect with the inference that the family perhaps did not keep the appointment with CBSA. These paragraphs sidestep the reasons why the family would be seeking asylum and also deflect attention from the increasing criminalization of migratory movements through the use of detention centres. The harsh measures of detaining refugee claimants are rendered less so by the statement that the family was released into a friend's care.

> Also last week, at Dante Alighieri Academy in Toronto, CBSA officials removed Kimberly Lizano-Sossa, 15, and her brother, Gerald Lizano-Sossa, 14, from their school. They were taken to a van where their mother was waiting for them with another sibling. CBSA officials had picked them up earlier. The family were failed refugee claimants from Costa Rica who had failed to show up for their removal on Feb. 16. A warrant had been issued for their arrest. (p. A1)

Here again, we see the criminalization of families seeking refugee status and the characterization of their claim as 'failed' along with their 'failure' to show up for their 'removal'. 'Removal' is a tidy euphemism for forced deportations to contexts that can potentially imperil the lives of those who have been 'removed'. Agency, responsibility, and blame have been assigned to the family for 'transgressing the law' rather than a refugee determination system which makes it increasingly difficult to seek safety through legal channels (Crépeau & Nakache, 2006).

We can see a counter-frame in the next paragraph, with a quotation from 15-year-old Kimberly Lizano-Sossa who describes the detention centre "as a jail". However, in this sentence the previously employed term *detention centre* is now referred to by the journalists as "the immigration holding centre" which sounds more innocuous, thereby providing a contrast to Kimberly's assertion of injustice:

> Yesterday in Ottawa, Kimberley described the immigration holding centre as a jail and said she was sad to have to leave Canada: "Some of my friends went straight to the detention centre, and the teachers arranged to go and have a vigil, pray the rosary and the next day they were protesting with a group called 'No one is illegal in Canada.' " (p. A1)

The following statement presents a conflicting ideological viewpoint from the previous reference to migrant justice group No One is Illegal. Here, a CBSA spokeswoman obliquely addresses the ethical concerns relating to immigration authorities entering schools in order to deport families:

> CBSA spokeswoman Anna Pape said: “We do not as a first point of investigation attend schools in order to determine the whereabouts of parents under immigration enforcement. Once claimants have exhausted all legal avenues to stay, CBSA enforces the Immigration Act.” (p. A1)

The ethical concerns resurface in the next paragraph, drawing attention to groups advocating on behalf of refugees, rather than hearing directly from people who sought refugee status and who consequently fear threats of deportation.

> But the incidents have caused alarm among refugee-advocacy groups, immigration lawyers, opposition politicians and school boards, who see a change in climate and say never in the past have students been targeted to find parents who have been ordered removed.
>
> “In my mind, children aren't criminals,” Oliver Carroll, chair of the Toronto Catholic District School Board, said yesterday. “They're in a very unfortunate situation. It may well be as a result of something their parents did.” (p. A1)

A common narrative surfaces here, one which represents children as ‘innocent’ and devoid of political subjectivity while condemning their parents as ‘culpable’ of transgressing the law (Martin, 2011; Villegas, 2010b, 2013). Conjecture which assigns blame to parents is not substantiated by evidence, again sidestepping the issue of the inability of more and more families to find refuge in Canada.

> Judy Sgro, a former immigration minister in the Liberal government, called the actions “unconscionable” and a breach of CBSA protocols.
>
> More than 4,000 Costa Ricans sought asylum from 2002 to 2004, a migratory trend that ended after the imposition of a visa requirement in 2003. The acceptance rate for Costa Ricans has been between 2 and 4 per cent, and last year, 687 of the total 11,845 people removed from Canada were Costa Ricans. Failed claimants who file

> humanitarian appeals are not automatically permitted to stay in Canada while their cases are being processed.
>
> However, immigration lawyers wonder why CBSA is aggressively targeting these "low-level" removals — instead of criminals facing deportation who are evading the law. (p. A1)

In the previous paragraphs, an opposition politician's condemnation of CBSA protocols segues to a brief overview of recent trends impacting on refugee claimants from Costa Rica. It would have been helpful to provide more of a context around humanitarian and compassionate grounds of appeal as the final recourse. A brief mention of humanitarianism is then contrasted with notions of 'illegality' and 'criminality'.

The key frame that can be distilled from the articles on children with precarious status and schooling is of child migrants' 'innocence' vs. parental 'culpability'. Children are typically represented as not being responsible for decisions over migration while their parents are assigned blame for 'legal transgressions'. Rarely is any context provided over the political decisions of governments, which make it difficult to migrate through legal channels. It is even more unlikely to find any discussion in these newspapers of the social and economic disparities as well as the political violence, which compel people to migrate in order to survive.

Conclusion

This chapter began with an overview of child policy frameworks followed by a discussion of struggles for social equity within Ontario schools, drawing on qualitative research and sociological theories of education. Changes to immigration and refugee policies and the narrowing of legal options for migrants were also discussed. The concept of precarious legal status was analysed alongside campaigns for social rights at the level of municipal governance. This chapter focused on the right to education for children with precarious legal status, and how this has been framed against the backdrop of neoliberal politics.

The final media analysis section brought out several points. One of the most essential elements of an education involves cultivating communication skills. Cutbacks to funding ESL programs have persisted throughout the twenty year period analyzed in this study. When education budgets are diminished, this is the first area to be cut. Provincial and federal governments have been able to assign blame to different levels of jurisdiction without taking any steps to resolve the problem. Additionally, the persistent reference to 'taxpayers' is meant to draw on emotions such as resentment among readers who would be more concerned about the financial implications for themselves, rather than a sense of social solidarity. As neoliberal policies have dominated politics, ESL funding has continued to be inadequate. This has clear consequences for children and youth who have been denied support for the most basic component of any education, the key to solving theoretical puzzles, reading textbooks, and giving shape to ideas that can be articulated in words.

The analysis of events leading up to the Toronto District School Board's decision to adopt a policy protecting the social rights of children with precarious legal status has shown that the dominant frame emphasizes the innocence of children. It does so with the consequence of assuming culpability of parents for 'moral and legal transgressions'. This frame will not be able to capture aspects of the Canadian and global political contexts that reproduce illegality and exclusion for both children and adults.

Chapter 8:
Summary, Conclusion and Implications for Further Research

Introduction

In this final chapter, I connect the analysis of the three media narratives to exclusionary immigration policies and the denial of social rights in order to demonstrate the ways in which media discourse that is aligned with social and economic elites reproduces hegemony. As I have argued throughout this thesis, Gramsci's (1971) concept of hegemony adds an important dimension to contemporary debates about educational theory and practice, which has informed the media analysis in this thesis. Schools and media are ideological institutions and hegemony reproduced through processes of education and communication. Journalism is deeply embedded within ideology and hegemony (Carpentier & Cammaerts, 2006). As Linda Tuhiwai Smith (1999, 2012) has argued, the media, official histories, and school curricula all play a role in sustaining relations of imperialism.

The educational experiences of new immigrant and refugee children have been considered from the lens of social justice research paradigms in terms of the opportunities and outcomes of schooling (Adams & Kirova, 2006). Teachers, administrators, teacher educators, parents and children are all implicated in processes to affect change. Peer relations and academic performance, language acquisition and communication with parents, and teachers' perceptions of students have all been identified as issues of concern in the literature discussed in Chapter Two, and throughout the media analysis chapters. This thesis has drawn on the conceptual resources of Marxist educational theory, anti-racism education, anti-racist feminist theory, and anti-colonial theory. As a study which engages questions of migration, immigration status, and the rights of migrant children in a society claimed to be multicultural, this thesis has also been strengthened by the insights of Hage (2000) who draws on Bourdieu's concept of *cultural capital* in order to conceptualize *practical nationality*.

In this chapter, I first revisit the research questions outlined in Chapter One. This will be followed by reflections on the study's contributions to new knowledge. I recommend further research that draws on participatory methodologies in order to engage migrant children about their views on media and political discourse. I also point to the importance of empirical research that explores how public opinion is directly impacted by media and political discourse. In the final section of this chapter, I explore possibilities for collaboration between immigration justice and children's rights campaigns to engage print media in supporting social rights for all people with precarious legal status, not only children, in other contexts.

Summary of the thesis

I return here to the much-cited questions of van Dijk (2001) introduced in Chapter One and as discussed in Chapter Four: "'How do (more) powerful groups control public discourse?', 'How does such discourse control the mind and action of (less) powerful groups, and what are the social consequences of such control, such as social inequality?'" (p.355). Critical Discourse Analysis as a conceptual and methodological approach has been useful in analyzing processes of hegemony which convince people that there is no other alternative to the status quo (Rojo & van Dijk, 1997). Analysis of language is an important element in understanding neoliberal politics (Fairclough, 2000; Bauder, 2008d). Additionally, Critical Discourse Analysis facilitated a deeper understanding of the ways in which rhetorical structures conceal agency or responsibility for social outcomes (Rojo & van Dijk, 1997).

With the stance that language is not neutral or apolitical, as argued in Critical Discourse Analysis, the concept of framing 'zooms out' to see how the larger picture is constructed and allows for a better understanding of how everything is pieced together. The media analysis chapters of this thesis have been strengthened by Frames Theory and Analysis which focuses on the construction of news stories and their key components: selection and salience; definition of problems, identification of causes (in conjunction with making moral judgments) and the suggestion of remedies (Entman, 1993, 2003, 2004). As Gitlin (1980) observes: "Frames are principles of selection, emphasis, and

presentation composed of little tacit theories about what exists, what happens, and what matters" (p. 6).

The starting points of this study were the three following questions, which I respond to with the conclusions drawn from the media analysis. I have sought to understand the ways in which Canadian media discourses frame migrant children's access to social rights and their experiences of education and migration.

Question 1: How are exclusionary immigration and refugee policies assigned legitimacy by dominant social groups through Canadian media discourses? Question 2: How do conceptions of childhood influence perceptions of policy exclusions?

In other studies, van Dijk's (1992) approach to Critical Discourse Analysis has been used to analyze everyday conversations, textbooks, news reports and parliamentary debates in order to examine the denial of racism by elites. This study has focused on print journalism. The denial of racism by elites, as van Dijk (1992) argues, plays a role in North-South relations, in which dominant groups deny neo-colonialism or imperialism and political self-interest in international aid, while asserting the 'leadership' of western countries. The media analysis in this thesis has drawn on critical perspectives which have shown how colonial histories, ideological manifestations of racism and inequalities endemic in capitalism (Fanon, 1989a, 1989b) are all significant factors implicated in forced migration (Arat-Koç, 1992, 1999a; Basok, 1996, 2002; Chimni, 1998, 2000; Choudry, Hanley, Jordan, Shragge & Stiegman, 2009; Cohen, 2002a, 2002b; Haytor, 2000; Kapur, 2003; Mynott, 2002a; Sassen, 1998, 1999a, 1999b, 2002; Thobani, 2000a, 2000b). Hick (2001) examines three critical factors in the political economy of war and the violence experienced by children: free trade and direct foreign transnational corporation investment/incursion, forced structural adjustment programs, and diverging per capita incomes between countries. These critical factors are also implicated in the displacement of adults and children who may seek refugee status in countries such as Canada. It is important to my analysis to mention these factors, and the connection that Hick draws between them and children affected by war. This is significant because in

Canadian journalists' accounts of displacement over a twenty year period, analyzed in this thesis, these factors have never been foregrounded.

Canadian media discourse has been closely monitored by immigration bureaucrats (particularly during periods of perceived crisis such as the arrival of migrants by boat) with material consequences for migrants, for instance in differential access to the refugee determination system (Mountz, 2004, 2010). Writing about the arrival of Chinese migrants by boat in 1999, Mountz (2004) notes: "the media – a key venue for communications from the federal government to the public – contributed to the stereotyping, regulation, and surveillance of migrant bodies and therefore must also be incorporated into geographies of the nation-state" (p. 341). This point is critical in order to reflect on the interplay between media discourse and policy-making, and the implications for different geographic scales and levels of government.

Other studies have shown how Canadian journalists have been implicated in creating a climate of hostility toward immigrants and refugees (Bauder, 2005, 2000a, 2000b, 2000c; Bradimore & Bauder, 2011; Esses, Medianu & Lawson, 2013; Esses, Veenvliet, Hodson & Mihic, 2008; Greenberg & Hier, 2001; Li, 2001; Mahtani & Mountz, 2002). The media analysis in my thesis is unique in its focus on journalists' representations of migrant children.[18]

Changes to immigration policy frameworks have drawn a sharp line around temporary residency, excluding legal pathways to citizenship, while placing a wall before access to social rights such as health care. The circulation of the term 'illegal' with reference to migration has obstructed an understanding of the many facets of social and economic exclusion which lead to forced displacement. While in my preliminary key word search, I uncovered countless references to 'illegal immigrants', there were very few associations of 'illegality' with the migration of children, as discussed in Chapter Four. One facet of the media analysis has rendered explicit the deep ambivalence

18 Di Tomasso's (2012) study which critiques online reader commentary responses to news stories about migrant children has made an important contribution to scholarship and practice, as discussed in Chapter Four.

towards children of the Canadian neoliberal state. As Miller (2005) has argued, political discourse has often focused on ‘investing’ in children as workers and citizens of the future. The socioeconomic interests of elite groups are aligned with the conventional view of children as the future of the nation. As Wells (2007) observes: “Just as the nation is often imagined as the family and talked about in familial metaphors (the mother land), the fate of the child, a role that is central to the production of the family, is collapsed into the fate of the nation” (p. 60). At the same time, this conventional view does not illustrate the processes at work within institutional spaces such as schools and families, which are deeply embedded within inequitable social relations and material circumstances. Different political standpoints, including neoconservative and neoliberal arguments, indicate concern for child welfare and yet this concern is disingenuous if it is without condemnations of inequality. There are ideological implications to individualistic framings of child poverty by state officials and other political actors. The structural conditions for poverty both within and between nation-states are eclipsed in media and political discourse with the neoliberal theme of individualism. This also has implications for migrant children due to the racialized nature of poverty in Canada and the fact that many immigrant and refugee parents are racialized, and encounter workplace injustices and barriers to employment such as non-recognition of professional skills and credentials (Choudry et al., 2009; Galabuzi, 2006, 2014; Shakir, 2011).

The media analysis in this thesis has shown that the injustices experienced by refugee and immigrant parents that would result in child poverty are rarely addressed with any depth. However there were frequent inferences to the ‘culpability’ of migrant parents with references to “transgressions”, indicating that journalists ascribed responsibility to adult migrants for the necessity of migration and the difficulties they encounter in their immigration processes, while children are portrayed as innocent victims devoid of political consciousness and agency. This finding from the Canadian media analysis is consistent with critiques of the binary of ‘culpable’ adult migrant/‘innocent’ child migrant constructed in political discourse in the UK (Giner, 2007, 2010) and the US (Martin, 2010). This has implications for collective action and policy-making on behalf of children. As discussed in this study, children’s rights

discourses have been able to secure social rights for children. The legal vulnerability of children is also significant since there are few institutional spaces in which they can claim rights. However, there are tensions between broader immigration justice movements and the use of a sentimentalized image of the child (as passive victim) as a rhetorical strategy (Giner, 2007, 2010; Villegas, 2010b, 2013). Both adults and children with precarious legal status experience the injustice of legal vulnerability.

As Verkuyten (2004) observes: "An important part of the public debate on asylum seekers and immigrants turns on issues of deservingness and entitlement. This debate is rooted at the ideological level" (p. 310). Over the past twenty years, immigration policies have been linked with the welfare state, with an ideological shift from conceptions of political refugees to 'bogus economic refugees'/'economic migrants' and political rhetoric has ascribed blame to immigrants and refugees for government cutbacks. The media analysis in my study has also brought out an ambivalence towards migrant children who have been represented through the use of dehumanizing metaphors, associating children with water (floods, flooded) and birds (flocked), indicating a sense of alarm over the numbers of children migrating to Canada. In some cases, this alarm has been implicit and in other cases very explicit, with references to "losing control of the border" (McLaren, 1991, February 27).

Question 3: What do Canadian media discourses reveal about children's experiences of educational inequality?

The media analysis has also brought out the point that educational rights have been articulated within a nationalist paradigm. Various news sources directly quoted by journalists have emphasized the Canadian tradition of public education. What has been neglected in the narrative of nationalism is the inequitable distribution of public education resources. Individualistic framings of achievement and competition place the blame for student failure squarely on the shoulders of children, and sustain the myth of meritocracy, as has also been shown in Santa Ana's (2002) media analysis of representations of bilingual education in California during debates around Proposition

187. Individualistic framings of educational achievement have been a consistent neoliberal theme in the representation of migrant children in Canada.

Bourdieu's concept of cultural capital can be discerned in media representations of child poverty when journalists point to the class discrepancies experienced by children, and how exposure to different opportunities and privileges can position children at a different starting point in their lives. One of the most essential elements of an education, which also relates to cultural capital, involves cultivating communication skills. Cutbacks to funding English-as-a-Second-Language programs have persisted throughout the twenty-year period analyzed in this study. When education budgets are diminished, this is the first area to be cut. The issue of ESL funding is framed in different ways in media discourse ranging from an emphasis on educational justice to concerns over the 'burden' on taxpayers. Tensions between provincial and federal jurisdictions and concerns over inadequate funding for ESL programs were communicated by teachers, school administrators, educational policy-makers, and in rare cases, children themselves. The conflict over whose responsibility it is to provide educational support was accentuated during the mid to late-1990s because of the degree to which Mike Harris aggressively pursued social welfare retrenchment. Provincial and federal governments have been able to assign blame to different levels of jurisdiction without taking any steps to resolve the problem. Additionally, the persistent reference to 'taxpayers' is meant to draw on emotions such as resentment among self-involved readers who would be more concerned about the financial implications for themselves, rather than a sense of social solidarity. As neoliberal agendas have dominated in politics, ESL funding has continued to be inadequate.

When ESL program funding is not considered to be an educational priority we must ask questions about nationalism and national belonging. The media narrative of immigrant and refugee children and nationalism/national belonging surfaces in many depictions, drawing boundaries around whose education matters. Hage's (2000) theorization of *governmental belonging* discussed in earlier chapters is useful in critiquing this analysis. As we have seen, *governmental belonging* is "the belief that one has a right over the nation, [and] involves the belief in one's possession of the right to

contribute (even if only by having a *legitimate* opinion with regard to the internal and external politics of the nation) to its management such that it remains 'one's home'" (p. 46).

The media analysis has identified some of the ways in which *cultural reproduction* (Bourdieu) and *practical nationality* (Hage, 2000) are shaped through, for example, the expression of scepticism, denial and even, in some cases, contempt for individuals and social groups who critique hegemonic history curriculum in schools (Granatstein, 1999, Aug 28; Ibbitson, 2007, Jun 30) or in the rejection of arguments pointing to the social reality of racism in Canada (Lewington, 1994, Dec 27; Paris, 1995, Mar 04). When journalists consistently refer to the costs of ESL programs and invoke a 'tax-payers' discourse to imply that the costs are peripheral to education budgets, we must ask why. We must denounce these types of exclusions. This argument connects with the critique of the media narrative of children and neoliberalism.

In the late 1980s, the Education Minister and Premier of Ontario indicated a moral indictment of denying refugee children access to schools, although this was, in some cases, framed as an issue of 'innocent children' vs. 'culpable' parents who have allegedly transgressed a boundary. The UN Convention on the Rights of the Child was sometimes invoked to support campaigns for educational justice, especially in the early 1990s, soon after Canada became a signatory. For the most part, the coverage of journalists seemed sympathetic and political actors were keen to distance themselves from the perception that they had violated children's rights. With the economic recession of the early 1990s, and shifting refugee paradigms following the end of the Cold War, media and political discourse shifted. Dehumanizing metaphors were invoked more frequently, a conclusion also brought out in studies discussed in Chapter Four. With social welfare retrenchment and cuts to education budgets, immigrant and refugee children's educational experiences were easy targets for politicians.

This relates to the third narrative of immigrant and refugee children as 'vulnerable' or 'threatening'. Even when educators, school administrators, and journalists sought to advance the argument that ESL funding should be prioritized, this argument was often framed with a sense of risk. For example, there were frequent

references to the likelihood of immigrant and refugee youth being associated criminality and danger later in life should their educational needs not be met. Other frames contradicted this theme with references to parents as role models who held high aspirations for their children. Interestingly, this latter frame set up a comparison between the poverty of Canadian-born children and the poverty of immigrant and refugee children, constructed through individualized framings, rather than serious examination of structural inequalities.

The analysis of events leading up to the Toronto District School Board's decision to adopt a policy protecting the social rights of children with precarious legal status has critiqued the polarizing dichotomy of adult vs. child migrants. This dichotomy is inaccurate and assumes the culpability of parents for 'moral and legal transgressions'. This frame will not be able to capture aspects of the Canadian and global political contexts that reproduce illegality and exclusion for both children and adults (Villegas, 2010b, 2013). What is needed is a complete paradigm shift (and a political economic system not driven by profit). In order to address the urgent need for immigration justice work, children's rights campaigns which pivot around particular assumptions about childhood must be re-thought. Framing children as 'innocent' and devoid of agency will not be able to advance social justice, although such framings do secure social rights. Children and adults both endure the grave injustice of social exclusion in conjunction with fears around precarious existence and violence. As Villegas has stated, what is most required is immigration reform and, as Cohen (2002a, 2000b), Haytor (2000), Mynott (2002), Sharma (2006) and many other theorists have argued, immigration controls are inherently unjust.

Neoliberal framings of immigrant and refugee children devalue their knowledge, skills and capabilities. As the analysis has brought out, some journalists and the educational administrators and policy-makers they cite, expressed deficit discourses in describing immigrant and refugee students. Deficit discourses are often manifested in microaggressions against students, as shown in a study by Roy and Roxas (2011). Similar concerns about teacher expectations as a determinant of students' educational achievement have been articulated in the Ontario context (Bernhard, 2009; Bernhard &

Freire, 1999; Clandfield, 2014; Galabuzi, 2014; Haque, 2010; Henry & Tator, 2005; Livingston 2014; Schugurensky, 2007; Smaller, 2014). Teachers often express the misapprehension that immigrant parents are not interested in the educational experiences of their children, as has been argued in studies discussed in Chapter Two. The media analysis has confirmed conclusions from these studies in that the struggles of immigrant and refugee children are individualized, and journalists rarely articulate insights or ideas in relation to educators' roles and responsibilities in dismantling institutional racism. There have been a few hopeful exceptions in stories that do tackle social injustice and racism (Cardozo, 1992, August 21).

Counter-hegemonic arguments also enter into the debate on policy exclusions through direct quotations from social activists (Cullen, 2005, April 27), although typically only in newspapers with a particular political orientation (Cardozo, 1992, June 9; Cardozo, 1992, August 21). Moments in which political space is expanded to engage with the views of social activists are significant, pointing to new frames that will find emotional resonance, as argued in other studies (Smolash, 2009, 2011).

Contributions to New Knowledge

This study offers contributions to new knowledge in the sociology of education, childhood studies, studies in social justice, and refugee and migration studies. Within the sociology of education, this study fuses together a number of theoretical insights from the political economy of education, anti-racism education, feminist anti-racist theory, and anti-colonial theories in order to examine representations of the educational experiences of migrant children and the implications of these representations for children exercising social agency. The educational research in this thesis contributes to critiques of childhood and normativity (Burman, 1996, 2005; Canella, 1997; Canella & Viruru; Manicom, 1995; Griffith, 1995; Viruru, 2005) and similarly draws attention to the importance of teachers' roles in advancing social justice principles through their interactions with children and families. Hage's (2000) critiques of the notion of tolerance in multicultural discourse, informing my analysis, bring theoretical insights to teacher education programs within the Canadian context. These insights can strengthen

arguments tackling the injustice of dominant groups' sense of entitlement to power and resources. Writing about the Ontario context, Livingston (2014) argues that:

> discrimination in our schools has come about not randomly, but mainly as the cumulative effect of decisions made by those who have power over school systems, at the provincial, federal, school board and individual school levels. Teacher expectations also play a part. (p. 14)

Within childhood studies, the research from this thesis contributes to a growing body of scholarship on childhood and migration, with a focus on Canadian child policy frameworks, and the legal and political structures of Canadian society, as well as institutional spaces such as schools. This study has drawn a connection between paradigm shifts in Canadian child welfare and refugee policy frameworks through historical analysis of the period 1989-2009. Neoliberal policies have negatively impacted on immigrant and refugee children, as well as Canadian-born children, and the historical context in each media analysis chapter has traced the trajectory of these policy shifts and the attendant impacts on children and families. The narrowing of legal pathways to citizenship, seen in the paradigm shift in refugee policy frameworks, has compounded injustices experienced by migrant children and families.

The knowledge from this thesis contributes to studies in social justice by disrupting conventional explanations for the social and material exclusion of migrant children. I have provided an historical outline of institutional practices shaping children's lives in the Canadian context over a period of twenty years. Michael Apple (1982) explains the importance of examining the relationships between institutional spaces:

> the educational apparatus of a society is also an important set of agencies in the cultural reproduction of class relationships. In order to understand this we need to respond to the role of the arts and mass media outside the school, to the actual social relations and the knowledge within the school, and finally, to the way people respond to the ideological and cultural messages these institutions are presenting. (p. 4)

The interdisciplinary nature of this study has allowed for a close examination of the perpetuating dynamics of social exclusion within educational settings and broader Canadian society. A focus on the interaction between institutional spaces also looks at possibilities for articulating new political realities in which children's perspectives and social theorizing are taken seriously by journalists and policy-makers, and as a starting point for developing curriculum. These ideas will be discussed in the section on implications for further research.

Limitations of the Study

Smolash (2011) raises the critically important question: "within this paradigm and under these social conditions, what are the ways academic work can be accountable to communities and to community organizers, particularly those organizers who themselves are the targets of the immigration bureaucracy, or whose lives have been governed and constrained by the daily violence of immigration laws?" (p. 226). This is a concern that has been carried with me throughout the writing process. For a number of reasons, I have been peripheral to the organizing that emerges from within activist communities. I had hoped that this study would be built through participatory methodologies and the social agency of refugee and immigrant children. Chapters One and Two sought to reflect on research ethics with honesty. In order to think through the responsibility that academia and academics have to contributing research that is meaningful and relevant to the lives of people implicated in research questions, I am hopeful about discussing this work with social activists, including children, to see how it can connect with movement-produced materials. I am also looking at opportunities to connect aspects of this research with my lived experience of injustice as a family caregiver within the health care system, in pursuit of practices and policies aligned with social equity and justice.

Another limitation of this study is researcher subjectivity. I have attempted to address my own potential bias or inaccuracy in the coding and analytical process by reading widely about disparate theories and methods in approaches to media analysis. Due to time and resource constraints I was unable to compare my qualitative analytical approach to texts with the views and insights of social activists involved in the case

study. In contrast to a mixed methods approach such as the one found in a study of environmental activism and media discourse (Stodsdart, Ramos & Tindall, 2013), there is no activist-centred layer of analysis to accompany text-centred media analysis. This would have undoubtedly strengthened the study but is an area for future research, along with participatory studies with children whose views rarely appear in media discourse.

Implications for Further Research

Lynn and Lea (2003) identify discursive strategies and rhetorical devices employed by writers of letters to the editor on the subject of people seeking asylum in Britain. The study shows the tendency to characterize refugees as 'duplicitous', echoing the political rhetoric around the 'bogus' 'economic migrant' constructed in contrast with the 'genuine' political refugee. Many letter writers expressed their grievances and resentment of 'bogus' migrants by drawing on examples of other socially marginalized groups such as people with disabilities and people experiencing homelessness. The argument presented was that scarce resources were being diverted from people in 'genuine' need who were 'authentic' Britons. The letter writers did not find it problematic to be speaking with paternalistic language on behalf of social groups in order to legitimize exclusionary policies. In the letters to the editor analyzed by Lynn and Lea, (2003), race and racism were never explicitly communicated while social hierarchies were implicitly endorsed.

Due to space limitations, I was unable to explore the news genre of the letter to the editor (Bharat, 2004, October 7; De Haynal, 1989, July 10; Horne, 2006, March 24; Nangwaya, 2008, October 3; Waese, 1990, November 19). This would be an important area for further research in order to better understand the responses of newpaper readership to political and media discourses, connecting with recent studies on online reader commentary (Di Tomasso, 2012; Park, 2013). In terms of practice, the conclusions from my study can be adapted into a report for children and could engage with elementary school media literacy courses. It is important to encourage children in critical analysis of media representations, and teachers could set aside class time in which

children could compose their own letters to the editor. This idea connects with the conclusions of a study by Jiwani, Janovicek, and Cameron (2001) who recommend:

> That media literacy courses be made a mandatory part of school curricula and that initiatives toward this end be encouraged and funded within the non-profit sector, especially with regard to equipping young women from racialized communities to tell their own stories. (2001, p. 36)

Further research can also interrogate the concept of the 'illegality' of migration through social justice curricula. For example, social studies teachers could collaborate with children to develop curriculum with draws connections between the Civil Rights Movement and Immigration Justice Movements. Jim Crow laws were once legal, pointing to the inadequacy of conceptualizing justice around frameworks of legality or illegality (Coutin, 2005). The connection between these movements has been brought out in other studies. Drawing inspiration from the Civil Rights Movement's freedom riders of the 1960s, migrant rights and labour organizations initiated the "Immigrant Workers Freedom Ride" in 2003, bringing together undocumented workers and allies from across the U.S. for a large rally in Washington, D.C. (Basok, 2008). Historical research and curriculum development can contribute to a confluence of efforts responding to policy exclusions.

Galabuzi (2006) emphasizes the importance of "community-based research as a basis for policy formulation" (p. 228). There is an urgent need for participatory research with immigrant, refugee, and precarious status children within a Canadian context. Young (2005, 2011, 2013) and Meloni's (2013) collaborative work with youth living with precarious legal status in Toronto and Montreal points to the importance of engaging directly with young people who live with the sharp edges of fear and exclusion every day. The concept of illegality must be interrogated in media discourse, which is a formidable challenge, although the APA's decision not to employ the term 'illegal immigrant' is an important step to a realignment of thinking. One avenue for further research would involve collaboration with children and youth who are social justice-oriented journalists and media artists in order to critique the implications of the media narratives identified in

this study. The Regent Park Focus Youth Media Arts Centre is a powerful example of the impact of participatory media practices.

> Operating since 1990, Regent Park Focus Youth Media Arts Centre (Regent Park Focus) is a community driven, not-for-profit organization located in Regent Park, Toronto. The organization is motivated by the belief that participatory media practices can play a vital role in building and sustaining healthy communities.
>
> Regent Park Focus serves as a Community New Media, and Radio, and Television Arts Broadcasting Centre dedicated to best practices in training and mentorship of youth in radio and television broadcasting and digital arts. (http://www.regentparkfocus.com/content/aboutus.html, accessed 15 July, 2014)

Within the U.S. context, there is another powerful example of social justice-oriented child journalists whose work can also be brought into Canadian classroom contexts and engaged with in student-run social justice clubs. The name of this organization is IndyKids and a brief history of their work is provided here:

> IndyKids was formed in 2005 by a group of independent journalists, students, parents, teachers and activists who saw the need for a progressive, ad-free news media to be presented in a way that would interest and engage young kids. Since publishing its first black and white issue in the fall of 2005, IndyKids has grown into a vital, multi-platform current events and social justice news source that is produced by kids, for kids. (http://indykids.org, accessed 5 August, 2014)

Public education, as Santa Ana (2002) argues, is associated with the fate of the nation. He promotes a constellation of metaphors to conceptualize public education including Education as Cultivation and Education as Architecture. These metaphors emphasize the important role of educators and resources that build upon the strengths of children. These metaphors and conceptions of education may subvert the myth of meritocracy, learning as mechanical, or the view that the inequitable distribution of resources is inconsequential to educational achievement (Santa Ana, 2002). Within the

U.S. context, political debates around the provision of bilingual education in the 1990s, represented in media discourse, sometimes included counter-hegemonic statements which sharply condemned the denial of language education on the grounds that such a denial thrwarted the development of a child's intellect. Thus, the deprivation of this component of education was characterized as criminal (Santa Ana, 2002). Building on Santa Ana's (2002) reseach on the use of metaphor in political and media discourse, children can also be engaged in analysing his work explained in age-appropriate language, and encouraged to think about their own use of metaphors in conceptualizing social equity and justice in education. As Santa Ana (2002) argues, political metaphors are not fixed and I contend that children's social theorizing can offer new political metaphors within educational settings and broader society. These ideas connect with research stating the importance of counter-storytelling in the school context in order to resist migroaggressions against refugee children (Roy & Roxas, 2011)

It has been argued that journalists are reluctant to interview children because they do not have the necessary skills, nor do they respect the views of children (Aldridge & Cross, 2008). I recommend that schools of journalism include a training component that would emphasize the importance of consulting children on matters affecting their lives, and in relation to events portrayed in news stories. This would expand beyond the sentimental and tokenist attempts to children's participation in the political arena, attempts which have been critiqued as insufficient for advancing a social agenda articulated by children (Stasiulis, 2002, 2004). Professors of journalism could draw on the literature from the sociology of childhood in order to rethink assumptions about children as social and political actors, and to generate ideas about realistic opportunities to include children as news sources.

This brings us back to the importance of journalists to immigration justice struggles. As Entman (2003, 2004) argues, discord among elites is necessary in order to challenge the frames used by journalists to define, interpret and judge events.
Media research organizations on both sides of the political spectrum have followed media and political discourse on an array of policy areas (Entman, 2003, 2004; Hackett,

Gruneau, Gutstein, Gibson & News Watch Canada, 2000; Hackett & Uzelman, 2003; Knight, 1998). This research can be useful to social activists, including children who are social activists, in thinking about which media frames have been politically resonant, and in creating counter-frames to advance social equity and immigration justice campaigns. Within the UK context, anti-deportation activists built relationships with sympathetic local journalists in order to gain media exposure of impending child deportations, and to pressure political actors to reverse this decision (Giner, 2010). Writing about different issues and campaigns, environmental activists had positive interaction with local journalists (but less contact with national journalists) (Stoddart, Ramos & Tindall, 2013). A further layer of analysis to complement this study and contribute to broader struggles would engage with immigration justice activists' media work and their views on media exposure of social injustice/social movement issues. This activist-layer of analysis that informed Stoddart et al.'s (2013) study would strengthen the contributions of my study by learning from the insights of people who were directly involved with campaigning for a Don't Ask Don't Tell Policy. Counter-hegemonic processes can take shape through alternative journalistic projects such as peace journalism (Hackett, 1991, 2000, 2010), public journalism, new journalism and human-interest journalism (Carpentier & Cammaerts, 2006; Carpentier & De Cleen, 2007), which can engage with social movement-produced materials. News media coverage of social issues may resonate with a wider audience who may not otherwise turn to social-movement produced materials (Stoddart, Ramos & Tindall, 2013). Another useful area of research would focus on the role of university print journalism, which does not face the same constraints as corporate media and are arguably well-positioned to publish social critiques articulated by social activists.

Finally, and returning to Linda Tuhiwai Smith's (1999, 2012) point that the media, official histories, and school curricula all play a role in sustaining relations of imperialism, this study has been written with the sincere hope that it can inform further investigation into the institutional structures, historical processes, and ongoing practices that perpetuate social, economic and educational inequalities, and that it can contribute to opportunities for resistance within a number of contexts.

References

Access Alliance Multicultural Community Health Centre (2007). *Racialization and health inequalities: Focus on children.* Retrieved from: http://accessalliance.ca/sites/accessalliance/files/documents/RacializationandHealthInequalities.pdf.

Adams, L., & Kirova, A. (2007). Global migration and the education of children. In L. Adams & Kirova (Eds.), *Global migration and education: Schools, children and families* (pp.1-12). New York & London: Routledge.

Addams, J. (2009). The public school and the immigrant child. In DJ Flinders & SJ Thornton (Eds.), *The Curriculum Studies Reader* (pp.25-36). London and New York: Routledge.

Addams, J. (1961). *Twenty years at Hull-House*. New York: Signet Classics.

Agnew, V. (1996). *Resisting discrimination: Women from Asia, Africa, and the Caribbean and the women's movement in Canada.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Aiken, S., & Clark, T. (1994). International procedures for protecting the human rights of non-citizens. *Journal of Law and Social Policy, 10*, 182-216.

Aiken, S., & Scott, S. (2000). Baker v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) and the rights of children. *Journal of Law and Social Policy, 15*, 211-254.

Aitken, S.C. (2001). Global crises of childhood: Rights, justice and the unchildlike child. *Area, 33*(2), 119-127.

Akram, S.M. (2000). Orientalism revisited in asylum and refugee claims. *International Journal of Refugee Law, 12* (1), 7-40.

Albanese, P. (2009). The missing child in Canadian sociology: Is it time for change? *Jeunesse: Young People, Texts, Cultures, 1*(2), 136-146.

Alcoff, L. (1991). The problem of speaking for others. *Cultural Critique, 20,* 5-32.

Aldridge, J. (2008). All work and no play? Understanding the needs of children with caring responsibilities. *Children & Society*, *22*, 253-264.

Aldridge, J. & Cross, S. (2008). Young people today: News media, policy and youth justice. *Journal of Children and Media, 2*(3), 203-218.

Alegria, M., Atkins, M., Farmer, E., Slaton, E., & Stelk, W. (2010). One size does not fit all: Taking diversity, culture and context seriously. *Administration and Policy in Mental Health and Mental Health Services Research*, 37(1-2), 48-60.

Ali, M.A. (2006). Children alone, seeking refuge in Canada. *Refuge, 23* (2), 68-80.

Alldred, P. (1998). Ethnography and discourse analysis: Dilemmas in representing the voices of children. In J. Ribbens and R. Edwards (Eds.) *Feminist dilemmas in qualitative research*. London: Sage.

Alldred, P. (2003). No borders, no nations, no deportations. *Feminist Review, 73*, 152-157.

Amnesty International, Ireland. [n.d.] http://www.amnesty.ie/mentalhealth

Amnesty International. (2003). *Mental illness: The neglected quarter.* Dublin: Amnesty International, Irish Section. Retrieved from: http://amnesty.ie/reports/mental-health

Amnesty International. (2006). *Briefing paper, Mental health, let's make it happen.* Dublin: Irish Section. Retrieved from http://amnesty.ie/reports/mental-health.

Anderson, A. (2004). Resilience. In R. Hamilton & D. Moore (Eds.), *Educational interventions for refugee children: theoretical perspectives and implementing best practice* (p.53-63). London and New York: Routledge.

Anderson, B. (1983). *Imagined communities: Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism.* London, UK: Verso.

Anderson, A., Hamilton, R., Moore, D., Loewen, S., & Frater-Mathieson, K. (2004). Education of refugee children: Theoretical perspectives and best practice. In R. Hamilton & D. Moore (Eds.), *Educational interventions for refugee children: theoretical perspectives and implementing best practice* (pp.1-11). London and New York: Routledge.

Angod, L. (2006). From post-colonial to anti-colonial politics: Difference, knowledge and R. v. R.D.S. In G.J.S Dei & A. Kempf (Eds.), *Anti-colonialism and education: The politics of resistance* (pp.159-173). Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

Anisef, P., & Kilbride, K. (2003a). Introduction. In P. Anisef & K.M. Kilbride (Eds.), *Managing two worlds: The experiences & concerns of immigrant youth in Ontario* (pp.1-36). Toronto, ON: Canadian Scholars' Press.

Anisef, P., & Kilbride, K. (2003b). Overview and implications of the research. In P.

Anisef & K.M. Kilbride (Eds.), *Managing two worlds: The experiences & concerns of immigrant youth in Ontario* (pp.235-272). Toronto, ON: Canadian Scholars' Press.

Ansley, F. (2010). Constructing citizenship without a licence: The struggle of undocumented immigrants in the USA for livelihoods and recognition. *Studies in Social Justice, 4*(2), 165-178.

Anthias, F., & Yuval-Davis, N. (1992). *Racialized boundaries: Race, nation, gender, colour and class and the anti-racist struggle*. London, UK: Routledge.

Apple, M. (1978). Ideology, reproduction, and educational reform. *Comparative Education Review, 22(*3), 367-387.

Apple, M. (1982). Reproduction and contradiction in education: An introduction. In M. Apple (Ed.), *Cultural and economic reproduction in education: Essays on class, ideology and the state* (pp.1-31). London & Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Apple, M. (1988). *Teachers & texts: A political economy of class & gender relations in education.* London and New York: Routledge.

Apple, M. (1996). *Cultural politics and education*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Apple, M. (2005). Doing things the 'right' way: Legitimating educational inequalities in conservative times. *Educational Review, 57* (3), 271-293.

Apple, M. (2009). Controlling the work of teachers. In D.J. Flinders & S.J. Thornton (Eds.), *The curriculum studies reader* (3rd ed., pp. 199-213). New York, NY: Routledge.

Arat-Koç, S. (1992). Immigration policies, migrant domestic workers and the definition of citizenship in Canada. In V. Satzewich (Ed.), *Deconstructing a nation: Immigration, multiculturalism & racism in '90s Canada* (pp.229-241). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Arat-Koç, S. (1999a). Neo-liberalism, state restructuring and immigration: Changes in Canadian policies in the 1990s. *Journal of Canadian Studies*, *34* (2), 31-56.

Arat-Koç, S. (1999b). NAC's response to the immigration legislative review report: Not just number: A Canadian framework for future immigration. *Canadian Woman Studies, 19*(3), 18-23.

Arat-Koç, S. (2002). Hot potato: Imperial wars or benevolent interventions? Reflections on "global feminism" post September 11th. *Atlantis*, 26(2), 433-44.

Arat-Koç, S. (2005). The disciplinary boundaries of Canadian identity after September 11: Civilizational identity, multiculturalism, and the challenge of anti-imperialist feminism. *Social Justice, 32*(4), 32-49.

Archer, L. (2007) Diversity, equality and higher education: a critical reflection on the ab/uses of equity discourse within widening participation, *Teaching in Higher Education, 12*(5-6), 635-653.

Aubrecht, K. (2012). The new vocabulary of resilience and the governance of university student life. *Studies in Social Justice, 6*(1), 67-83

Austin, D. (2007). All roads led to Montreal: Black power, the Caribbean, and the Black Radical Tradition in Canada. *Journal of African American History, 92*, 516-39.

Austin, D. (2010). Narratives of power: Historical mythologies in contemporary Québec and Canada. *Race & Class, 52* (1), 19-32.

Aylward, C.A. (1999). *Canadian critical race theory: Racism and the law*. Halifax, N.S.: Fernwood.

Baines, C.T. (2000). Restructuring services for children: Lessons from the past. In S.M. Neysmith (Ed.), *Restructuring caring labour: Discourses, state practice, and everyday life* (pp.164-184). Don Mills, ON: Oxford University Press.

Baines, D. (2002). Storylines in racialized times: Racism and anti-racism in Toronto's social services. *British Journal of Social Work*, 32, 185-99.

Baines, D., & Sharma, N. (2002). Migrant workers as non-citizens: The case against citizenship as a social policy concept. *Studies in Political Economy, 69,* 75-107.

Baker, S., Brown, B. J., & Fazey, J.A. (2006). Mental health and higher education: Mapping field, consciousness and legitimation. *Critical Social Policy, 26*(1), 31–56.

Baker, J., Lynch, K., Cantillon, S., & Walsh, J. (2004). *Equality: From theory to action.* Palgrave Macmillan: New York.

Baker, P., & McEnery, T. (2005). A corpus-based approach to discourses of refugees and asylum seekers in UN and newspaper texts. *Journal of Language and Politics, 4*(2), 97-226.

Balagopalan, S. (2002). Constructing Indigenous childhoods: Colonialism, vocational education and the working child, *Childhood, 9*(1), 19-34.

Balibar, E., & Wallerstein, E. (Ed.) (1991). *Race, nation, class: Ambiguous identities.*

London, UK: Verso.

Ball, S. (2007). Reading Michael Apple—the sociological imagination at work. *Theory and Research in Education, 5 (2),* 153-159.

Bannerji, H. (2000). *The dark side of the nation: Essays on multiculturalism, nationalism and gender.* Toronto: Scholars' Press.

Bannerji, H. (2005). Building from Marx: Reflections on class and race. *Social Justice, 32*(4), 145-160.

Bannerji, H. (2011). *Demography and democracy: Essays on nationalism, gender and ideology*. Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press.

Bannerman, M., Hoa, P., & Male, R. (2003). *South Riverdale Community Health Centre's exploration of services for non-insured people in East Toronto.* Toronto: South Riverdale Community Health Centre.

Bartlett, P. (2012). The United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and mental health law. *Modern Law Review, 75*(5), 752–778.

Basok, T. (1996). Refugee policy: Globalization, radical challenge, or state control? *Studies in Political Economy, 50*, 133-166.

Basok, T. (2008). Constructing grassroots citizenship for non-citizens. *Peace Review*, *20* (3), 265-272.

Basok, T. (2009). Counter-hegemonic human rights discourses and migrant rights activism in the US and Canada. *International Journal of Comparative Sociology*, *50*(2), 183–205.

Bauder, H. (2003a). Equality, justice and the problem of international borders: the case of Canadian immigration regulation. *ACME: An International E-Journal for Critical Geographies, 2*(2), 167-182.

Bauder, H. (2003b). "Brain abuse" or the devaluation of immigrant labour in Canada. *Antipode, 35*(4), 699-717.

Bauder, H. (2005). Landscape and scale in media representations: The construction of offshore farm labour in Ontario, Canada. *Cultural Geographies, 12(*1), 41-58.

Bauder, H. (2008a). Immigration debate in Canada: How newspapers reported, 1996–2004. *Journal of International Migration & Integration*, 9, 289–310.

Bauder, H. (2008b). Foreign farm workers in Ontario (Canada): Exclusionary discourse

in the newsprint media, *The Journal of Peasant Studies, 35*(1),100-118.

Bauder, H. (2008c). The economic case for immigration: Neoliberal and regulatory paradigms in Canada's press. *Studies in Political Economy, 82,* 131-152.

Bauder, H. (2008d). Neoliberalism and the economic utility of immigration: Media perspectives of Germany's immigration law. *Antipode, 40*(1), 55-78.

Bauder, H. (2013). Why we should use the term illegalized immigrant. *Ryerson Centre for Immigration and Settlement Research Brief, No. 2013/1*, August 2013.

Beglari, A., & Thai, H. (2000). The Multicultural Liaison Officers' perspective in assessing refugee children in the schools. *Refuge, 18(*6), 46-49.

Bejan, R., & Sidhu, N. (2010). *Policy without practice: Barriers to enrollment for non-status immigrant students in Toronto's Catholic Schools*: Social Planning Council of Toronto.

Bell, C. (2006). Subject to exception: Security certificates, national security and Canada's role in the "war on terror". *Canadian Journal of Law and Society / Revue Canadienne Droit et Société*, *21*(1), 63-83.

Bell, L.A. (2003). Telling tales: What stories can teach us about racism. *Race, Ethnicity and Education*, *6*(1), 1-18.

Benford, R.D., & Snow, D.A. (2000). Framing processes and social movements: An overview and assessment. *Annual Review of Sociology, 26*, 611-39.

Bennett, L.W. (2009). *News: The politics of illusion*. (8th ed.) New York, NY: Pearson/Longman.

Berg, M.L., & Sigona, N. (2013). Ethnography, diversity and urban space. *Identities, 20*(4), 347-360.

Berinstein, C., McDonald, J., Nyers, P., Wright, C., & Zarehi, S. (February 2008). *Access not fear: Non-status immigrants and city services.* The Community Social Planning Council of Toronto and Davenport Perth Neighbourhood Centre, in partnership with the 'Don't Ask, Don't Tell' Campaign, Toronto.

Bernhard, J., & Freire, M. (1999). What is my child learning at elementary school? Culturally contested issues between teachers and Latin American families. *Early Childhood Education Publications and Research.* Paper 9. http://digitalcommons.ryerson.ca/ece/9

Bernhard, J.K, Goldring, L., Young, J., Berinstein, C., & Wilson, B. (2007). Living with

precarious legal status in Canada: Implications for the well-being of children and families. *Refuge, 24*(2), 101-114.

Bernhard, J., Torres, F., Nirdosh, S., & Freire, M. (1997). Latin Americans in a Canadian primary school: Perspectives of parents, teachers and children on cultural identity and academic achievement. *Early Childhood Education Publications and Research*, Paper 11.

Bernhard, J., & Young, J. (2009). Gaining institutional permission: Researching precarious legal status in Canada. *Journal of Academic Ethics, 7*(3), 175-191.

Bernhard, J. (2009). Latin American students in the TDSB: Research findings and recommendations. In D. Shugurensky, D. Mantilla & J. Serrando (Eds.), *Four in Ten* (pp. 22-25). Toronto: Latin American Research Education and Development Network, Transformative Learning Centre and Ontario Institute for Studies in Education.

Bhabha, J. (2001). Minors or aliens? Inconsistent state intervention and separated child asylum-seekers. *European Journal of Migration and Law*, *3*, 283-314.

Bhabha, J. (2004). Demography and rights: Women, children and access to asylum. *International Journal of Refugee Law*, 16, 227-243.

Bhabha, J. (2009a). Arendt's children: Do today's migrant children have a right to have rights? *Human Rights Quarterly* 31, 410–451.

Bhabha, J. (2009b). The "mere fortunity of birth"? Children, mothers, borders, and the making of citizenship. In S. Benhabib & Resnik, J. (Eds.), *Migrations and mobilities: Citizenship, borders, gender* New York: New York University Press.

Bhabha, J. (2011). (Ed.) *Children without a state: A global human rights challenge.* Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press.

Bhuyan, R. (2011). Negotiating social rights and social membership on the frontlines of service delivery to migrants with precarious status, CERIS Final Report.

Bigo, D. (2002). Security and immigration: Toward a critique of the governmentality of unease. *Alternatives* 27, 63-92.

Billig, M. (1987). *Arguing and thinking: A rhetorical approach to social psychology.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Blackstock, C. (2009). *General comment No. 11: Indigenous children and their rights*

under the convention. Office of the High Commission for Human Rights. Retrieved from: http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/crc/docs/CRC.GC.C.11.pdf

Bloch, A., & Chimienti, M. (2011). Irregular migration in a globalizing world. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, *34*(8), 1271-1285, DOI:10.1080/01419870.2011.560277

Bloch, A., & Schuster, L. (2002). Asylum and welfare: contemporary debates. *Critical Social Policy*, 22, 3.

Bloch, A., & Schuster, L. (2005). At the extremes of exclusion: Deportation, detention and dispersal. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, *28*(3), 491-512.

Bloch, A., Sigona, N., & Zetter, R. (2009) *No right to dream: The social and economic lives of young undocumented migrants in Britain*. London, Paul Hamlyn Foundation.

Bloch, A., Zetter, R., Sigona, N., & Gamaledin-Ashami, M. (2007). *Research into young undocumented migrants*. London, Paul Hamlyn Foundation Social Justice Programme.

Bolaria, B.S. (1992). From immigrant settlers to migrant transients: Foreign professionals in Canada. In V. Satzewich (Ed.), *Deconstructing a nation: Immigration, multiculturalism & racism in '90s Canada* (pp.211-227). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Bondi, L. (2008). On the relational dynamics of caring: a psychotherapeutic approach to emotional and power dimensions of women's care work, *Gender, Place & Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography, 15*(3), 249-265.

Bosco, F.J. (2010) Play, work or activism? Broadening the connections between political and children's geographies, *Children's Geographies, 8*(4), 381-390.

Bose, P.S. (2008). Home and away: Diasporas, developments and displacements in a globalising world *, Journal of Intercultural Studies, 29*(1),111-131.

Bourdieu, P. (1977). *Outline of a theory of practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1991). *Language and symbolic power.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (2006). The forms of capital. In H. Lauder, P. Brown, J. Dillabough & A.H. Halsey (Eds.), *Education, globalization & social change* (pp.105-118). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Bourdieu, P., & Passeron, J.C. (1977). *Reproduction in education, society, and culture*. London: Sage.

Bou-Zeid, Z. (2005). Non-status migrants in Canada: Is another regularization program the answer? Conference paper at the Third Annual Forced Migration Student Conference, Oxford Brookes University, May 13-14, 2005. Retrieved from: http://www.brookes.ac.uk/schools/planning/dfm/FMSC/P&A/bouzeid.pdf.

Bowles, S., & Gintis, H. (1976.) *Schooling in capitalist America: Educational reform and the contradictions of economic life.* New York: Basic Books.

Bowles, S., & Gintis, H. (2000). Social capital and community governance. *Economic Journal, 112*, 1-24.

Boyden, J. (1997). Childhood and policy makers: A comparative perspective on the globalization of childhood. In A. James & A. Prout (Eds.), *Constructing and reconstructing childhood: Contemporary issues in the sociological study of childhood* (pp.190-229). London, England: Falmer Press.

Boyden, J. (2009). What place the politics of compassion in education surrounding non-citizen children? *Educational Review*, *61* (3), 265-276.

Boyden, J., & Hart, J. (2007). The statelessness of the world's children. *Children & Society, 21*(4), 237-248.

Bradford, C. (2008). The homely imaginary: Fantasies of nationhood in Australian and Canadian texts. In M. Reimer (Ed.), *Home worlds: Discourses of children's literature in Canada* (pp.177-193). Waterloo, ON: Wilfred Laurier University Press.

Bradimore, A., & Bauder, H. (2011). Mystery ships and risky boat people: Tamil refugee migration in the newsprint media. *Metropolis British Columbia Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Diversity Working Paper Series.*

Brand, D. (2005). *What we all long for: A novel*. Toronto: Vintage Canada.

Brenner, N., & Theodore, N. (2002). Cities and the geographies of 'actually existing neoliberalism', *Antipode, 34*(3), 349-79.

Brindle, D. (1999). Media coverage of social policy: A journalist's perspective. In B. Franklin (Ed.) *Social policy, the media and misrepresentation* (pp.39-50). London and New York: Routledge.

Brouwer, A. (2003). *Statelessness in Canadian context: A discussion paper*. United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. Retrieved from:

http://www.unhcr.ch/cgibin/texis/vtx/protect/opendoc.pdf?tbl=PROTECTION&id=40629ffc7

Browne, P.L. (1997). Déjà vu: Thatcherism in Ontario. In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.37-45). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Brysk, A. (2004). Children across borders: Patrimony, property, or persons? In A. Brysk & G. Shafir (Eds.), *People out of place*. Routledge: London.

Bunjun, B. (2010). Feminist organizations and intersectionality: Contesting hegemonic feminism. *Atlantis 34*(2), 115-126.

Bunjun, B. (2012). *The (un)making of home, entitlement, and nation: An intersectional organizational study of power relations in Vancouver Status of Women, 1971-2008*. University of British Columbia (unpublished PhD thesis).

Burman, E. (1994). Innocents abroad: Western fantasies of childhood and the iconography of emergencies. *Disasters, the Journal of Disaster Studies and Management, 18*(3), 238-253.

Burman, E. (1996). Local, global or globalized? : Child development and international child rights legislation. *Childhood*, 3, 45-66.

Burman, E. (2005). Childhood, neo-liberalism and the feminization of education, *Gender and Education*, 17(4), 351-367.

Burman, E. (2008). Beyond 'women vs. children' or 'womenandchildren': Engendering childhood and reformulating motherhood, *International Journal of Children's Rights, 16*, 177-194.

Burns, S. (2010). Single mothers without legal status in Canada: Caught in the intersection between immigration law and family law. YWCA Vancouver. Retrieved from: http://www.ywcavan.org/sandbox/UserFiles/files/Women%20and%20Their%20Families/Legal%20Educator/MWLS%20Report_2010_web.pdf

Burr, V. (1995). *An introduction to social constructionism.* London: Routledge.

Burridge, A. (2010). Youth on the line and the No Borders movement. *Children's Geographies*, *8*(4), 401-411.

Burstyn, V., & Smith, D.E. (1985). *Women, class, family and the state*. Toronto: Garamond Press.

Caliendo, S.M., Gibney, M.P., & Payne, A. (1999). All the news that's fit to print? *New York Times* coverage of human-rights violations. *The Harvard International Journal of Press Politics* 4(4), 48-69.

Campbell, M. (2006). Research for activism: Understanding social organization from inside it. In C. Frampton, Kinsman, G., Thompson, AK & Tilleczek, K. (Eds.), *Sociology for changing the world: Social movements/social research* (pp.87-96). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Canada. Ministerial Council on Social Policy Renewal (1999). *National Children's Agenda – Backgrounder,* www.scics.gc.ca/cinfo99/83064905_e.html

Canadian Civil Liberties Association. (2011). *Seeking refuge: Then and now.* Retrieved from: http://ccla.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2011/11/CCLET-Lesson-Plan-Seeking-Refuge.pdf

Canadian Council for Refugees. (2004). Impacts on children of the *Immigration and Refugee Protection Act,* Retrieved from: http://ccrweb.ca/children.pdf

Canella, G.S. (1997). *Deconstructing early childhood education: Social justice and revolution.* New York: Peter Lang.

Canella, G.S., & Viruru, R. (2004). *Childhood and (post)colonization: Power, education and contemporary practice.* New York: Routledge.

Caragata, L. (1999). The privileged public: Who is permitted citizenship? *Community Development Journal, 34*(4), 270-286.

Caragata, L. (2003). Neoconservative realities: The social and economic marginalization of Canadian women. *International Sociology, 18*(3), 559-580.

Caragata, L., & Liegghio, M. (2013). Mental health, welfare reliance, and lone motherhood. *Canadian Journal of Community Mental Health, 32*(1), 95-107.

Carpentier, N., & Cammaerts, B. (2006). Hegemony, democracy, agonism and journalism. *Journalism Studies, 7*(6), 964-975.

Carpentier, N., & De Cleen, B. (2007). Bringing discourse theory into Media Studies: The applicability of Discourse Theoretical Analysis (DTA) for the study of media practices and discourses. *Journal of Language and Politics, 6*(2), 265-293.

Carr, B.A. (2009). Incorporating a "Best Interests of the Child" approach into immigration law and procedure. *Yale Journal of Human Rights and Development Law*, 12, 120-160.

Castagna, M., & Dei, G.J.S. (2000). An historical overview of the application of the race concept in social practice. In A. Calliste & G.J.S. Dei (Eds.), *Anti-racist feminism: Critical race and gender studies* (pp. 19-38). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Castles, S. (2003). Towards a sociology of forced migration and social transformation. *Sociology, 37*(1), 13-34.

Chambers, C.M. & Balanoff, H. (2009). Translating "participation" from North to South: A case against intellectual imperialism in social science research. In D. Kapoor & S. Jordan (Eds.), *Education, participatory action research, and social change: International perspectives* (pp.73-88). New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

Chan, W. (2004). Criminological research on 'race' in Canada. In C. Nelson & C. Nelson (Eds.), *Racism, eh?: A critical interdisciplinary anthology of race and racism in Canada.* (pp. 103-117). Concord, ON: Captis Press.

Chan, W. (2006). Crime, deportation and the regulation of immigrants in Canada. *Crime, Law & Social Change*, 44, 153–180.

Chariandy, D.J. (2007). "The fiction of belonging": On second-generation Black writing in Canada. *Callaloo, 30*(3), 818-829.

Chavez, L. (2001). *Covering immigration: Popular images and the politics of the nation.* Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Chavez, L. & Menjívar, C. (2010). Children without borders: A mapping of the literature on unaccompanied migrant children to the United States. *Migraciones Internacionales, 5*(3), 71-111.

Cheek, J. (2004). At the margins? Discourse Analysis and Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Health Research, 14*(8), 1140-1150.

Chimni, B.S. (1998). The geopolitics of refugee studies: a view from the south. *Journal of Refugee Studies, 11*(4), 350-374.

Chimni, B.S. (2000). Globalization, humanitarianism and the erosion of refugee protection. *Journal of Refugee Studies*, *13*(3), 243-263.

Choudry, A. (2010a). What's left? Canada's 'global justice' movement and colonial amnesia. *Race and Class*, *52*(1), 97-102.

Choudry, A. (2010b). Troubling the proletarianization of Mexican immigrant students in an era of neoliberal immigration. *Cultural Studies of Science Education, 5*(2), 423-434.

Choudry, A., Hanley, J., Jordan, S., Shragge, E., & Stiegman, M. (2009). *Fight back: Workplace justice for immigrants.* Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Choudry, A., & Henaway, M. (2012). Agents of misfortune: Contextualizing migrant and immigrant workers' struggles against temporary labour recruitment agencies. *LABOUR, Capital and Society 45*(1), 36-65.

Choudry, A., & Thomas, M. (2013). Labour struggles for workplace justice: Migrant and immigrant worker organizing in Canada. *Journal of Industrial Relations, 55*(2), 212-226.

Chouinard, V. (1994). Geography, law and legal struggles: Which way ahead? *Progress in Human Geography, 18*(4), 415-440.

Christensen, P., & Prout, A. (2002). Working with ethical symmetry in social research with children. *Childhood, 9*(3), 477-497.

Church, K. (1995). *Forbidden narratives: Critical autobiography as social science*. Luxembourg: Gordon and Breach.

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (1999). *Building a strong foundation for the 21st century: New directions for immigration and refugee policy and legislation.* Ottawa: Ministry of Public Works and Government Services Canada.

Clandfield, D. (2014). Special education and streaming. In D. Clandfield, B. Curtis, G-E. Galabuzi, A.Gaymes San Vicente, D. W. Livingstone & H. Smaller (Eds). *Re-stacking the deck: Streaming by class, race and gender in Ontario schools* (pp. 113-184). Ottawa, ON: Our Schools/Our Selves Special Issue.

Clarke, J. (1997). Fighting to win. In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.157-164). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Clarke, T. (1997). The transnational corporate agenda behind the Harris regime. In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.28-36). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Cohen, S. (2002a). *No one is illegal: Asylum and immigration controls past and present*. London: Trentham Books

Cohen, S. (2002b). In and against the state of immigration controls: strategies for resistance. In S. Cohen, B. Humphries & E. Mynott (Eds.), *From immigration controls to welfare controls* (pp. 220-234). London and New York: Routledge.

Committee for Accessible AIDS Treatment (2001). *Improving access to legal services*

and health care for people living with HIV/AIDS who are immigrants, refugees or without status. Action Research Report. Toronto: Regent Park Community Health Centre.

Cook, M.L. (2010). The advocate's dilemma: Framing migrant rights in national settings. *Studies in Social Justice, 4*(2), 145-164.

Corrigan, P.W., Watson, A.C., Gracia G, Slopen, N., Rasinski, K., Hall, L.L. (2005). Newspaper stories as measures of structural stigma. *Psychiatric Services, 56*, 551–556.

Cottle, S. (2008). Reporting demonstrations: The changing media politics of dissent. *Media, Culture & Society, 30*(6), 853-872.

Cottle, S. (2009). Global crises in the news: Staging wars, disasters and climate change. *International Journal of Communication, 3*, 494-516.

Coulthard, G.S. (2011). Subjects of empire: Indigenous peoples and the "politics of recognition" in Canada. In M. Chazan, L. Helps., A. Stanley, & S. Thakkar (Eds.), *Home and native land: Unsettling multiculturalism in Canada* (pp. 31-50). Toronto, ON: Between the Lines.

Coutin, S.B. (2005). Contesting criminality: Illegal immigration and the spatialization of legality. *Theoretical Criminology, 9*(10), 5-33.

Crath, R. (2012). Belonging as a mode of interpretive in-between: Image, place and space in the video works of racialised and homeless youth. *British Journal of Social Work, 42*, 42–57.

Creese, G. (1992). The politics of refugees in Canada. In V. Satzewich (Ed.), *Deconstructing a nation: Immigration, multiculturalism & racism in '90s Canada* (pp.123-143). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Crépeau, F., & Nakache, D. (2006). Controlling irregular migration in Canada: Reconciling security concerns with human rights protection. Immigration and Refugee Policy (IRPP). *Choices*, *12*(1), 1-42.

Curran, W.J. (1969). Policies and practices concerning confidentiality in college mental health services in the United States and Canada. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, *125*(11), 1520-1530.

Curtis, B. (2014). The origins of education inequality in Ontario. In D. Clandfield, B. Curtis, G-E. Galabuzi, A. Gaymes San Vicente, D. W. Livingstone & H. Smaller (Eds). *Re-stacking the deck: Streaming by class, race and gender in Ontario schools* (pp. 41-76). Ottawa, ON: Our Schools/Our Selves Special Issue.

Curtis, B., Livingstone, D.W., & Smaller, H. (1992). *Stacking the deck: The streaming of working-class kids in Ontario schools.* Toronto: Our Stories/Our Selves.

Dachyshyn, D. (2006). Refugee families with preschool children: Adjustment to life in Canada. In L. Adams & A. Kirova (Eds.), *Global migration and education: Schools, children and families* (pp.251-262). New York & London: Routledge.

Dare, B. (1997). Harris's first year: Attacks and resistance, In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.20-26). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Dauvergne, C. (2008). *Making people illegal: What globalization means for migration and law*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.

Dauvergne, C. (2009). Globalizing fragmentation: New pressures on women caught in the immigration law-citizenship law dichotomy. In S. Benhabib & Resnik, J. (Eds.), *Migrations and mobilities: Citizenship, borders, gender* (pp. numbers to check). New York: New York University Press.

Dawson, C. (2011). On thinking like a state and reading (about) refugees. *Journal of Canadian Studies/Revue d'études canadiennes, 45*(2), 58-75.

Dawson, C. (2012).The refugee's body of knowledge: Storytelling and silence in the work of Francisco-Fernando Granados, *Topia, 29,* 55-72.

De Genova, N.P. (2002). Migrant 'illegality' and deportability in everyday life. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 31(1), 419-47.

Dei, G.J.S. (1996). Basic principles of anti-racism education. In G.J.S. Dei (Ed.), *Anti-racism education: Theory and practice* (pp. 25-39). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Dei, G.J.S. (2006). Mapping the terrain – Towards a new politics of resistance. In G.J.S Dei and A. Kempf (Eds.), *Anti-colonialism and education: The politics of resistance* (pp.1-23). Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

Dei, G.J.S. (2010). Rereading Fanon for his pedagogy and implications for schooling and education. In G.J.S. Dei & Simmons, M. (Eds.), *Fanon & education: Thinking through pedagogical possibilitie*s (pp.1-27). New York, NY: Peter Lang.

Dei, G.J.S. & Asgharzadeh, A. (2001). The power of social theory: The anti-colonial discursive framework. *Journal of Educational Thought*, *35* (3), 297-323.

Dei, G.J.S., & Calliste, A. (Eds.). (2000). *Power, knowledge and anti-racism education: a critical reader*. Halifax, N.S.: Fernwood.

Dei, G.J.S. & Kempf, A. (2006). Looking forward – The pedagogical implications of anti-colonialism. In G.J.S Dei & A. Kempf (Eds.), *Anti-colonialism and education: The politics of resistance* (pp.xiii-xxv). Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

Dei, G.J.S, & Simmons, M. (2010). The pedagogy of Fanon: An introduction. In G.J.S. Dei & Simmons, M. (Eds.), *Fanon & education: Thinking through pedagogical possibilitie*s (pp.147-170). New York, NY: Peter Lang.

Delpit, L. (1988). The silenced dialogue: Power and pedagogy in educating other people's children. *Harvard Educational Review*, *58*(3), 280-297.

Dewey, J. (1916). *Democracy and education: An introduction to the philosophy of education.* New York: Macmillan.

Diab, S. (2009). *Beyond borders: Unaccompanied refugee minors and access to refugee protection.* School of Social Work, McGill University, Montreal (unpublished master's thesis).

Dikeç, M., & Gilbert, L. (2002). Right to the city: Homage or a new societal ethics. *Capitalism Nature Socialism, 13*(2), 58-74.

Dickinson, H., & Wotherspoon, T. (1992). From assimilation to self-government: Towards a political economy of Canada's Aboriginal policies. V. Satzewich (Ed.), *Deconstructing a nation: Immigration, multiculturalism & racism in '90s Canada* (pp.405-421). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Dion, S. (2005). Aboriginal people and stories of Canadian history: Investigating barriers to transforming relationships. In C. James (Ed.), *Possibilities and limitations: Multicultural policies and programs in Canada* (pp. 34-57). Halifax: Fernwood Books.

Di Tomasso, L. (2012). More equal than others: The discursive construction of migrant children and families in Canada. *International Journal of Child, Youth and Family Studies, 2 & 3*, 331-348.

Dobrowolsky, A., & Jenson, J. (2004). Shifting representations of citizenship: Canadian politics of "women" and "children". *Social Politics, 11*(2), 154-80.

Donkor, M. (2004). Education and training options for immigrant women in Canada. In R.B. Folson (Ed.), *Calculated kindness: Global restructuring, immigration and settlement in Canada* (pp.44-60). Halifax: Fernwood.

Doty, R.L. (1996). The double-writing of statecraft: Exploring state responses to illegal immigration. *Alternatives,* 21, 171-189.

Dreier, P. (2005). How the media compound urban problems. *Journal of Urban Affairs*, 27, 2.

Dua, E., Razack, N., & Warner, J.N. (2005). Race, racism, and empire: Reflections on Canada. *Social Justice, 32*(4), 1-10.

Duara, P. (Ed.). (2004). *Decolonization perspectives from now and then: Rewriting histories.* London and New York: Routledge.

Duncan, S., Edwards, R., & Song, M. (1999). Social threat or social problem? Media representations of lone mothers and policy implications. In B. Franklin (Ed.) *Social policy, the media and misrepresentation* (pp.238-252). London and New York: Routledge.

Düvell, F., & Jordan, B. (2002). Immigration, asylum and welfare: the European context. *Critical Social Policy, 22*(3), 498-517.

Düvell, F., Triandafyllidou, A., & Vollmer, B. (2008). Ethical issues in irregular migration research. *Clandestino.* European Commission.

Dyck, I. (2000). Disability, geography and ethics. *Philosophy & Geography, 3*(1), 80-87.

Dyck, I., & McLaren, A.T. (2004). Telling it like it is? Constructing accounts of settlement with immigrant and refugee women in Canada, *Gender, Place & Culture, 11*(4), 513-534.

Earl, J., Martin, A., McCarthy, J.D., & Soule, S.A. (2004). The use of newspaper data in the study of collective action. *Annual Review of Sociology*, *30*, 65–80.

Eastmond, M. (2007). Stories as lived experience: Narratives in forced migration research. *Journal of Refugee Studies*, *20*(2), 248-264.

Edelman, M. (1998). Language, myths and rhetoric. *Society*, 35, 2.

Eder, D., & Corsaro, W. (1999). Ethnographic studies of children and youth: Theoretical and ethical issues. *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography, 28*(5), 520-531.

Elabor-Idemudia, P. (2000). Challenges confronting African immigrant women in the Canadian workforce. In A. Calliste & G.J.S. Dei (Eds.), *Anti-racist feminism: Critical race and gender studies* (pp. 91-110). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Elabor-Idemudia, P. (2005). Immigrant integration in Canada: Policies, programs and challenges. In C. James (Ed.), *Possibilities and limitations: Multicultural policies and programs in Canada* (pp. 58-75). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Emberly, J. (2009) Can the child testify? On childhood, testimony, and the cultural construction of the child as political subject. *Jeunesse: Young People, Texts, Cultures, 1*(2), 159-165.

Enloe, C. (1990). *Bananas, beaches and bases: Making feminist sense of international politics.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Enloe, C. (1993). *The morning after: Sexual politics at the end of the Cold War*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Enloe, C. (2004). *The curious feminist: Searching for women in the new age of empire.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Ennew, J. (2000). The history of children's rights: Whose story? *Cultural Survival, 24*(2). Retrieved from http://www.culturalsurvival.org.

Ennew, J., & Morrow, V. (2002). Releasing the energy: Celebrating the inspiration of Sharon Stephens. *Childhood*, *9,* 5-17.

Entman, R.M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication,* 43(3), 51-8.

Entman, R.M. (2003). Cascading activation: Contesting the White House's frame after 9/11. *Political Communication,* 20, 413-432.

Entman, R.M. (2004). *Projections of power: Framing news, public opinion, and U.S. foreign policy*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Entman, R.M., & Rojecki, A. (1993). Freezing out the public: Elite and media framing of the U.S. anti-nuclear movement. *Political Communication, 10*, 155-173.

Esses, V.M., Medianu, S., & Lawson, A.S. (2013). Uncertainty, threat, and the role of the media in promoting the dehumanization of immigrants and refugees. *Journal of Social Issues, 69(3), 518—536.*

Esses, V.M., Veenvliet, S., Hodson, G., & Mihic, L. (2008). Justice, morality, and the dehumanization of refugees. *Social Justice Research*, *21*, 4-25.

Evans, P.M., & Swift, K.J. (2000). Single mothers and the press: Rising tides, moral panic, and restructuring discourses. In S.M. Neysmith (Ed.), *Restructuring caring labour: Discourses, state practice, and everyday life* (pp.73-92). Don Mills, ON: Oxford University Press.

Evans, P.M., & Wekerle, G. (1997). The shifting terrain of women's welfare: Theory,

discourse and activism. In P.M. Evans & G. Wekerle (Eds.), *Women and the Canadian welfare state* (pp.3-27). Toronto, University of Toronto Press.

Fairclough, N. (2000). Language and neoliberalism. *Discourse and Society, 11*(2), 147–148.

Fairclough, N. (2003). *Analysing discourse: Textual analysis for social research.* London, UK: Routledge.

Fairclough, N. (2009). A dialectical-relational approach to critical discourse analysis in social research. In M. Meyer, R. Rodok (Eds), *Methods in Critical Discourse Analysis* (2nd ed) (pp.162-187) London: Sage.

Falk, I. (1994). The making of policy: Media discourse of conversations. *Discourse*, 15, 2.

Fanon, F. (1989a). *Studies in a dying colonialism*. London, UK: Earthscan Publications.

Fanon, F. (1989b). *The wretched of the earth*. New York: Grove Press.

Fantino, A., & Colak, A. (2001). Refugee children in Canada: Searching for identity. *Child Welfare*, 53 (5), 587-596.

Fellows, M., & Razack, S. (1994). Seeking relations: Law and feminism roundtables. *Signs*: *Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, *19*(4), 1048-83.

Fine, M. (1995). The politics of who's "at risk". In B.B. Swadener & S. Lubeck (Eds.), *Children and families "at promise": Deconstructing the discourse of risk* (pp.76-94). New York: State University of New York Press.

Fine, M. (2006) Bearing witness: Methods for researching oppression and resistance—A textbook for critical research. *Social Justice Research, 19*(1), 83-108.

Fine, M., Jaffe-Walter, R., Pedraza, P., Futch, V., & Stoudt, B. (2007). Swimming: On oxygen, resistance, and possibility for immigrant youth under siege. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly, 38*(1), 76–96.

Finlayson, A. (1999). Language. In F. Ashe, A. Finlayson, M. Lloyd, I. MacKenzie, J. Martin, & S. O'Neill (Eds), *Contemporary social and political theory: An introduction.* London, UK: Open University Press.

Fjone, H.H., Ytterhus, B., & Almvik, A. (2009). How children with parents suffering from mental health distress search for 'normality' and avoid stigma: To be or not to be . . . is not the question. *Childhood, 16*(4), 461–477.

Fleras, A., & Kunz, J.L. (2001). *Media and minorities: Representing diversity in a multicultural Canada.* Toronto: Thompson Educational Publishing.

Folsen, R.B. (Ed.). (2004). *Calculated kindness: Global restructuring, immigration and settlement in Canada.* Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Fortier, C. (2013). No One is Illegal movements in Canada and the negotiation of counter-national and anti-colonial struggles from within the nation-state. In L. Goldring & P. Landolt (Eds), *Producing and negotiating non-citizenship: Precarious legal status in Canada* (274-290). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Franklin, B. (1999). Misleading messages: The media and social policy. In B. Franklin (Ed.) *Social policy, the media and misrepresentation* (pp.1-13). London and New York: Routledge.

Frater-Mathieson, K. (2004). Refugee trauma, loss and grief: Implications for intervention. In R. Hamilton & D. Moore (Eds.), *Educational interventions for refugee children: theoretical perspectives and implementing best practice* (p.12-34). London and New York: Routledge.

Freire, M. and Bernhard, J. (1999). What is my child learning in elementary school? Culturally contested issues between teachers and Latin American families. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, *31*(3), 72-94.

Fynn, V.P. (Ed.). (2009). Proceedings from Centre for Refugee Studies Annual Conference: *Documenting the undocumented: redefining refugee status*. Toronto, ON.

Gabrielatos, C., & Baker, P. (2008). Fleeing, sneaking, flooding: A corpus analysis of discursive constructions of refugees and asylum seekers in the UK press, 1996-2005. *Journal of English Linguistics, 36*(1), 5-38.

Galabuzi, G. (2004). Social exclusion. In D. Raphael (Ed.) *Social determinants of health: Canadian perspectives* (pp.233-252) Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press.

Galabuzi, G.E. (2006). *Canada's economic apartheid: The social exclusion of racialized groups in the new century.* Toronto, ON: Canadian Scholars' Press.

Galabuzi, G.E. (2011). Hegemonies, continuities, and discontinuities of multiculturalism and the Anglo-Franco conformity order. In M. Chazan, L. Helps., A. Stanley, & S. Thakkar (Eds.), *Home and native land: Unsettling multiculturalism in Canada* (pp.58-82). Toronto, ON: Between the Lines.

Galabuzi, G.E. (2014). Race and the streaming of Ontario's children and youth. In D.

Clandfield, B. Curtis, G-E. Galabuzi, A.G. San Vicente, D. W. Livingstone & H. Smaller (Eds). *Re-stacking the deck: Streaming by class, race and gender in Ontario schools* (pp. 185-226). Ottawa, ON: Our Schools/Our Selves Special Issue.

Galloway, D. (2011). Proof and narrative: "Reproducing the facts" in refugee claims. In H. Lessard, R. Johnson & J. Webber (Eds.), *Storied communities: Narratives of contact and arrival in constituting political community* (pp.308-329). Vancouver and Toronto: UBC Press.

Gamson, W.A. (1985). Goffman's legacy to political sociology. *Theory & Society 14*(5), 605-22.

George, U. (2000). Toward anti-racism in social work in the Canadian context. In A. Calliste & G.J.S. Dei (Eds.), *Anti-racist feminism: Critical race and gender studies* (pp. 111-122). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Gibbs, G. (2007). *Analyzing qualitative data.* London: Sage.

Gilbert, L. (2004). At the core and on the edge: Justice discourses in metropolitan Toronto, *Space and Polity, 8*(2), 245-260.

Gilbert, L. (2005). Resistance in the neoliberal city. *City: analysis of urban trends, culture, theory, policy, action, 9*(1), 23-32.

Gilbert, L. (2007). Legitimizing neoliberalism rather than equality: Canadian multiculturalism in the current reality of North America. *NORTEAMÉRICA*, *2*(1), 11-35.

Gilbert, L. (2009). Immigration as local politics: Re-bordering immigration and multiculturalism through deterrence and incapacitation. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research, 33*(1), 26-42.

Gilbert, L., & Viswanathan, L. (2007). Covering multiculturalism: Popular images and the politics of a nation as reflected on the covers of *Maclean's* and *L'Actualité*. *Canadian Ethnic Studies, 39*(3), 189-205.

Giner, C. (2007). The politics of childhood and asylum in the UK. *Children & Society, 21*, 249–260.

Giner, C. (2010). *The contentious politics of childhood and migration: Grassroots mobilisations in support of 'non-status' children.* University of Warwick, Coventry, UK (unpublished PhD thesis).

Gitlin, T. (1980, 2003). *The whole world is watching: Mass media in the making &*

unmaking of the New Left. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Gladstone, B.M., Boydell, K.M., & McKeever, P. (2006). Recasting research into children's experiences of parental mental illness: Beyond risk and resilience. *Social Science & Medicine*, 62, 2540–2550.

Gladstone, B.M., Boydell, K.M., Seeman, M.V., & McKeever, P. (2011). Children's experiences of parental mental illness**:** a literature review. *Early Intervention in Psychiatry,* 5, 271–289.

Godlewska, A. (2011). Juxtaposing contact stories in Canada. In H. Lessard, R. Johnson & J. Webber (Eds.), *Storied communities: Narratives of contact and arrival in constituting political community* (pp.145-166). Vancouver and Toronto: UBC Press.

Goffman, E. (1963). *Stigma: Notes on the management of a spoiled identity.* Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.

Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame analysis.* Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Goldberg, D.T. (2002). *The racial state.* Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing

Goldring, L., Berinstein, C., & Bernhard, J.K. (2009). Institutionalizing precarious migratory status in Canada, *Citizenship Studies,13*(3), 239-65.

Goldring, L. & Landolt, P. (2013). The conditionality of legal status and rights: Conceptualizing precarious non-citizenship in Canada. In L. Goldring & P. Landolt (Eds), *Producing and negotiating non-citizenship: Precarious legal status in Canada* (pp. 3-27). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Gonzales, R. (2009). On the rights of undocumented children. *Society, 46*(5), 419-422.

Gosine, A. (2007). Youth make nations: Three Toronto stories. *Topia, 17,* 51-65.

Gramsci, A. (1971). *Selections from the prison notebooks*. New York, NY: International Publishers.

Granados, F. (2010). Reciprocal gazing: Reflections of an ungrateful refugee. *Fuse Magazine, 33*(1), 30-32.

Greenberg, J. (2004). Tories, teachers and the media politics of education reform: News discourse and the 1997 Ontario teachers' strike. *Journalism Studies, 5*(3), 353-371.

Greenberg, J., & Hier, S. (2001). Crisis, mobilization and collective problematization:

“Illegal” Chinese migrants and the Canadian news media. *Journalism Studies, 2*(4), 563-583.

Greenslade, R. (2005). *Seeking scapegoats: The coverage of asylum in the UK press Asylum and Migration Working Paper 5.* IPPR: London. Retrieved from: http://www.ippr.org.uk/ecomm/files/wp5_scapegoats.pdf

Greer, C., & Jewkes, Y. (2005). Extremes of otherness: Media images of social exclusion. *Social Justice, 32*(1), 20-32.

Greer, C., & McLaughlin, E. (2010). We predict a riot? Public order policing, new media environments and the rise of the citizen journalist, *British Journal of Criminology, 50*(6), 1041-1059.

Grewal, I., & Kaplan, C. (1994).Transnational feminist practices and questions of postmodernity. In I. Grewal & C. Kaplan (Eds.) *Scattered hegemonies: Postmodernity and transnational feminist practices.* (pp.1-33). Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Griffith, A. I. (1995). Mothering, schooling, and children’s development. In M. Campbell & A. Manicom (Eds.) *Knowledge, experience, and ruling relations: Studies in the social organization of knowledge* (pp.108-121). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Grover, S.C. (2007). On the rights of refugee children and child asylum-seekers. In K. Covell & B. Howe (Eds), *A question of commitment: Children’s rights in Canada* (pp.469-512). Waterloo: Wilfred Laurier Press.

Guruge, S. & Khanlou, N. (2004). Intersectionalities of influence: Researching the health of immigrant and refugee women. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, 36(3), 32-47.

Gutierrez Rodriguez, E. (2004). “We need your support, but the struggle is primarily ours”: On representation, migration and the Sans Papiers movement, ESF Paris, 12-15 November 2003. *Feminist Review*, 77, 152-156.

Habashi, J. (2005). Freedom speaks. In LD. Soto & B.B. Swadender (Eds.), *Power & voice in research with children* (pp. 21-34). New York, NY: Peter Lang.

Hackett, R.A., (1991). *News and dissent: The press and politics of peace in Canada.* Norwood, NJ: Ablex Publishing Corporation.

Hackett, R.A. (2000). Taking back the media: Notes on the potential for a communicative democracy movement. *Studies in Political Economy 63*, 61-86.

Hackett, R.A. (2010). Journalism for peace and justice: Towards a comparative analysis of media paradigms. *Studies in Social Justice, 4*(2), 179-198.

Hackett, R.A., Gruneau, R., Gutstein, D., Gibson, T.A., & News Watch Canada. (2000). *The missing news: Filters and blind spots in Canada's press.* Ottawa: Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives/Garamond Press.

Hackett, R.A., & Uzelman, S. (2003). Tracing corporate influences on press content: A summary of recent NewsWatch Canada research. *Journalism Studies, 4*(3), 331–346.

Hage, G. (2000). *White nation: Fantasies of white supremacy in a multicultural society*. New York, and Annandale, NSW, Australia: Routledge and Pluto Press.

Hales, J. (2006). An anti-colonial critique of research methodology. In G.J.S Dei and A. Kempf (Eds.). *Anti-colonialism and education: The politics of resistance* (pp.243-256). Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

Hall, S. (1990). The whites of their eyes: Racist ideologies and the media. In M. Alvarado & J.O. Thompson (Eds.), *The media reader* (pp.7-23). London: British Film Institute.

Hanley, J., & Shragge, E. (2009). Organizing for immigrant rights: Policy barriers and community campaigns, *Journal of Community Practice*, *17*(1), 184 –206.

Hanlon, C. (2012). State of mind: Addressing mental health issues on university campuses. *University Manager.* Retrieved from: http://www.aucc.ca/wp-content/uploads/2012/06/mental-health-state-of-mind-university-manager-article-summer-2012.pdf

Haque, E. (2010). Homegrown, Muslim and other: Tolerance, secularism and the limits of multiculturalism. *Social Identities, 16*(1), 79-101.

Haque, E. (2012). *Multiculturalism within a bilingual framework: Language, race and belonging in Canada.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Harker, R., & May, A. (1993). Code and habitus: comparing the accounts of Bernstein and Bourdieu. *British journal of the sociology of education, 14*(2), 169–78.

Harvey, D. (1973). *Social justice and the city.* London: Arnold.

Harvey, D. (2000). *Spaces of hope.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Harvey, D. (2003). *The new imperialism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Harvey, D. (2008). The right to the city. *New Left Review, 53*, 23-40.

Hayes, D. (2000). Outsiders within: The role of welfare in the internal control of immigration. In J. Batsleer & B. Humphries (Eds.), *Welfare, exclusion and political agency*. London: Routledge.

Haytor, T. (2000). *Open borders: The case against immigration controls*. London: Pluto.

Hawke, L.D., Parikh, S.V., Michalak, E.E. (2013). Stigma and bipolar disorder: A review of the literature. *Journal of Affective Disorders, 150*, 181–191.

Henry, F., & Tator, C. (2002). *Discourses of domination: Racial bias in the English Canadian press*. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Henry, F., & Tator, C. (2005). A critical discourse analysis of the *Globe and Mail* editorials on employment equity. In J.A. Lee & J. Lutz (Eds.), *Situating 'race' and racisms in space, time and theory: Critical essays for activists and scholars* (pp.161-177). Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Henry, F. & Tator, C. (2006). *The colour of democracy: Racism in Canadian society* (Third edition). Toronto, ON: Thomas Nelson.

Herman, E.S., & Chomsky, N. (2002). *Manufacturing consent: The political economy of mass media.* New York: Pantheon.

Herman, E.S., & McChesney, R.W. (1997). *The global media: The new missionaries of global capitalism.* London: Cassell.

Hernández-Truyol, B.E. (Ed.). (2002). *Moral imperialism: A critical anthology.* New York: New York University Press.

Hick, S. (2001). The political economy of war affected children. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 575, 106-121.

Hobbs, S. & Sauer, A. (2005). Immigration status as a gender issue in the Toronto Don't Ask Don't Tell Campaign. *Women and Environments International Magazine*, 68/69, 41-43.

Hobuti-Fard, T.E. (2006). *Citizenship, nation, and identity: A study of the framing of the Maher Arar case in Canada's two national newspapers, 2002-2004.* The University of British Columbia (unpublished MA thesis).

Holloway, S.L., & Pimlott-Wilson, H. (2011). The politics of aspiration: neo-liberal

education policy, 'low' parental aspirations, and primary school: Extended Services in disadvantaged communities, *Children's Geographies, 9*(1), 79-94.

Holloway, S.L. & Valentine, G. (2000). Children's geographies and the new social studies of childhood. In S.L. Holloway & G. Valentine (Eds.), *Children's geographies: Playing, living, learning* (pp. 1-23). New York, NY: Routledge.

hooks, b. (1994). *Teaching to transgress: Education as the practice of freedom*. New York, NY: Routledge.

hooks, b. (2003). *Teaching community: A pedagogy of hope.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Hopkins, P. (2008). Ethical issues in research with unaccompanied asylum-seeking children. *Children's Geographies, 6*(1), 37-48.

Howarth, A. (2012). *Discursive intersections of newspapers and policy elites: A case study of genetically modified food in Britain*, 1996-2000. London School of Economics and Political Science (unpublished PhD thesis).

Humphries, B. (2002a). From welfare to authoritarianism: the role of social work in immigration controls. Introduction: locating the debate. In S. Cohen, B. Humphries & E. Mynott (Eds.), *From immigration controls to welfare controls* (pp. 126-140). London and New York: Routledge.

Humphries, B. (2002b). Fair immigration controls – or none at all? In S. Cohen, B. Humphries & E. Mynott (Eds.), *From immigration controls to welfare controls* (pp. 203-219). London and New York: Routledge.

Humphries, B. (2004). An unacceptable role for social work: implementing immigration policy. *British Journal of Social Work*, *34*, 93-107.

Humphries, B., & Martin, M. (2000). Disrupting ethics in social research. In B. Humphries (Ed.) *Research in social care and social welfare: Issues and debates for practice* (pp.69-85). London and Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

Hunter, P. (2001). *The National Post* on immigrants and refugees: A review. *Canadian Race Relations Foundation Perspectives* (Autumn-Winter), 4.

Hurley, A.C. (2011). *Revolutionary suicide and other desperate measures: Narratives of youth and violence from Japan and the United States*. Durham & London: Duke University Press.

Hyndman, J. (1996). International responses to human displacement: Neo-liberalism and post-Cold War geopolitics. *Refuge, 15*(3), 5-9.

Hyndman, J. (2000). *Managing displacement: refugees and the politics of humanitarianism*. Minneapolis: The University of Minnesota Press.

Hyndman, J. (2001). Towards a feminist geopolitics. *The Canadian Geographer, 45*(2), 210-222.

Igoa, C. (1995). *The inner world of the immigrant child*. New York, NY: St. Martin's Press.

Ilcan, S., & Basok, T. (2004). Community government: Voluntary agencies, social justice, and the responsibilization of citizens. *Citizenship Studies*, 8(2), 129-144.

Immigration Legislative Review Advisory Group (1997). *Not just numbers: A Canadian framework for future immigration.* Ottawa: Ministry of Public Works and Government Services Canada.

Ingram, R., Wasik, A., Cormier, R., & Morrow, M. (2013). Social inequities and mental health: A scoping review. Vancouver: Centre for the Study of Gender, Social Inequities and Mental Health.

Irving, P., & Vargas, C. (2000). Creating a "community of learners" through cultural mediation: A school's perspective. *Refuge, 18*(6), 27-33.

Isin, E. (1998). Governing Toronto without government: Liberalism and neoliberalism. *Studies in Political Economy*, 56, 169-191.

Jackman, M. (1988). The protection of welfare rights under the Charter. *Ottawa Law Review, 20*, 257.

Jackman, M. (1994). Constitutional contact with the disparities in the world: Poverty as a prohibited ground of discrimination under the Canadian Charter and Human Rights Law. *Review of Constitutional Studies, 2*(1), 77-122.

Jacobson, N., Oliver, V., & Koch, A. (2009). An urban geography of dignity. *Health & Place, 15*, 725–731.

Jakubowski, L.M. (1997). *Immigration and the legalization of racism.* Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

James, A. and Prout, A. (Eds.). (1997). *Constructing and reconstructing childhood: Contemporary issues in the sociological study of childhood*, 2nd edn. London: Falmer Press.

James, A., Jenks, C., & Prout, A. (1998). *Theorizing childhood.* Cambridge, England: Polity Press.

James, C. (2007). Negotiating school: Marginalized students' participation in their education process. In G.F. Johnson & R. Enomoto (Eds.), *Race, racialization and antiracism in Canada and beyond* (p.17-36). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

James, C., & Wood, M. (2005). Multicultural education in Canada: Opportunities, limitations and contradictions. In C. James (Ed.), *Possibilities and limitations: Multicultural policies and programs in Canada* (pp. 154-162). Halifax, NS: Fernwood Books.

Jeffrey, C. (2010). Geographies of children and youth I: Eroding maps of life. *Progress in Human Geography*, *34*(4), 496-505.

Jeffrey, C. (2011). Geographies of children and youth II: Global youth agency. *Progress in Human Geography*, *35*(4), 1-9.

Jeffs, T. (1999). Are you paying attention? Education and the media. In B. Franklin (Ed.) *Social policy, the media and misrepresentation* (pp.157-173). London and New York: Routledge.

Jenson, J. (2004). Changing the paradigm: Family responsibility or investing in children. *Canadian Journal of Sociology, 29*(2), 169-92.

Jiwani, Y. (2005a). The great white north encounters September 11: Race, gender, and nation in Canada's national daily, *The Globe and Mail*. *Social Justice, 32*(4), 50-68.

Jiwani, Y. (2005b). War talk – Engendering terror: Race, gender & representation in Canadian print media. *International Journal of Media and Cultural Politics,* 1(1), 50-68.

Jiwani, Y. (2005c). Orientalizing "war talk": Representations of the gendered Muslim body post-9/11 in *The Montreal Gazette*. In J.A. Lee & J. Lutz (Eds.), *Situating 'race' and racisms in space, time and theory: Critical essays for activists and scholars* (pp.178-203). Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Jiwani, Y. (2005d). Walking a tightrope: The many faces of violence in the lives of racialized immigrant girls and young women. *Violence against women, 11*, 846-875.

Jiwani, Y. (2009). Helpless maidens and chivalrous knights: Afghan women in the Canadian press. *University of Toronto Quarterly, 78*(2), 728-744.

Jiwani, Y., & Dakroury, A. (2009). Veiling differences: Mediating race, gender, and

nation. *Global Media Journal/Canadian Edition, 2*(2), 1-6.

Jiwani, Y., Janovicek, N., & Cameron, A. (2001). Erased realities: The violence of racism in the lives of immigrant and refugee girls of colour. Vancouver: FREDA Centre for Research on Violence against Women and Children, 54 p

Jiwani, Y., Steenbergen, C., & Mitchell, C. (2006). *Girlhood: Redefining the limits.* Montreal; New York: Black Rose Books.

Jiwani, Y., & Young, M. (2006). Missing and murdered women: Reproducing marginality in news discourse. *Canadian Journal of Communication, 31,* 895-917.

Johnson, G.F. & Enomoto, R. (Eds.). (2007). *Race, racialization and antiracism in Canada and beyond.* Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Jones, A. (2000). Exploring young people's experience of immigration controls: The search for an appropriate methodology. In B. Humphries (Ed.) *Research in social care and social welfare: Issues and debates for practice* (pp.31-47). London and Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

Jones, A. (2002). Family life and the pursuit of immigration controls. In S. Cohen, B. Humphries & E. Mynott (Eds.), *From immigration controls to welfare controls* (pp. 83-105). London and New York: Routledge.

Joshi, S. (2002). Immigration controls and class. In S. Cohen, B. Humphries & E. Mynott (Eds.), *From immigration controls to welfare controls* (pp. 47-58). London and New York: Routledge.

Jubas, K. (2010). Reading Antonio Gramsci as a methodologist. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, *9*(2), 224-239.

Kaplan, C. (1990). Reconfigurations of geography and historical narrative: A review essay. *Public Culture, 3*(1), 25-32.

Kaprielian-Churchill, I., & Churchill, S. (1994). *The pulse of the world: refugees in our schools.* Toronto: Ontario Institute for Studies in Education Press.

Kapur, R. (2003). The "other" side of globalization: The legal regulation of cross border movements. *Canadian Women's Studies*, *22*(3/4), 6-15.

Katz, C. (2001). Vagabond capitalism and the necessity of social reproduction. *Antipode, 33*(4), 709-728.

Katz, C. (2004). *Growing up global: Economic restructuring and children's everyday*

lives. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Kaushal, A., & Dauvergne, C. (2011). The growing culture of exclusion: Trends in Canadian refugee exclusions. *International Journal of Refugee Law*, *23*(1), 54–92.

Kaye, R. (1998). Redefining the refugee: The media portrayal of asylum seekers. In K. Koser & H. Lutz (Eds), *The new migration in Europe: Social constructions and social realities* (pp.163-82). New York: St. Martin's Press.

Kazimi, A. (2012). *Undesirables: White Canada and the Komagata Maru*. Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre.

Kearns, R., Joseph, A.E., Moon, G. (2010). Memorialisation and remembrance: on strategic forgetting and the metamorphosis of psychiatric asylums into sites for tertiary educational provision. *Social & Cultural Geography, 11*(8), 731-749.

Keil, R. (2002). "Common-sense" neoliberalism: Progressive conservative urbanism in Toronto, Canada, *Antipode, 34*(3), 579-601.

Kempf, A. (2006). Anti-colonial historiography: Interrogating colonial education. In G.J.S Dei and A. Kempf (Eds.), *Anti-colonialism and education: The politics of resistance* (pp.129-158). Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

Khandor, E., McDonald, J., Nyers, P. & Wright, C. (2004). The regularization of non-status immigrants in Canada 1960-2004. Retrieved from: http://www.ocasi.org/status/Regularization_booklet.pdf

Khosla, P. (2003). *If low income women of colour counted in Toronto: Final report of the action-research project "Breaking isolation, getting involved"* Retrieved from: http://www.oaith.ca/assets/files/Publications/Low_Income_Women_of_Colour.pdf

Khosravi, S. (2007). The 'illegal' traveller: An auto-ethnography of borders. *Social Anthropology, 15*(3), 321–334.

Kilbride, K. (2000). A review of the literature on the human, social, and cultural capital of immigrant children and their families with implications for teacher education. Toronto: Joint Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Settlement. No.13, 3-16.

Kirova, A. and Emme, M. (2007) Critical issues in conducting research with immigrant children, *Diaspora, Indigenous, and Minority Education,1*(2), 83-107.

Kissoon, P. (2006). Home/lessness as an indicator of integration: interviewing refugees

about the meaning of home and accommodation. In B. Temble & R. Moran (Eds.), *Doing research with refugees: Issues and guidelines* (pp.74-96). Bristol, UK The Policy Press, University of Bristol.

Kissoon, P. (2010). From persecution to destitution: A snapshot of asylum seekers' housing and settlement experiences in Canada and the United Kingdom, *Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies,* 8 (1), 4-31.

Kitchen, B. (1995). The case for distributive justice for children. *Child Welfare: Journal of Policy, Practice, and Program*, *74*(3), 430-456.

Kitchen, B. (1997). "Common sense" assaults on families. In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.103-111). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Kitzinger, J. (1999). Researching risk and the media. *Health, Risk & Society, 1*(1), 55-69.

Kitzinger, J. (2000). Media templates: Patterns of association and the (re)construction of meaning over time. *Media, Culture & Society, 22*(1), 61-84.

Kiuhara, S.A., & Huefner, D.S (2008). Students with psychiatric disabilities in higher education settings: The Americans with Disabilities Act and beyond. *Journal of Disability Policy Studies, 19*(2), 103-113.

Klein, N. (2003). The rise of the fortress continent, *The Nation*, www.thenation.com

Kleinman, A. (2012). The art of medicine: Culture, bereavement, and psychiatry. *The Lancet, 379,* 608-609.

Kleinman, A. (2012). The art of medicine: Caregiving as moral experience. *The Lancet, 380* 1550-1551.

Kleinman, A., & Hall-Clifford, R. (2009). Stigma: A social, cultural and moral process. *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health, 63*(6), 418-9.

Klodawsky, F., Aubry, T., & Farrell, S. (2006). Care and the lives of homeless youth in neoliberal times in Canada. *Gender, Place & Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography*, 13(4), 419-436.

Knight, G. (1998). Hegemony, the media, and New Right politics: Ontario in the late 1990s. *Critical Sociology, 24*(1-2), 105-129.

Knight, G. (2001). Prospective news: Press pre-framing of the 1996 Ontario public service strike. *Journalism Studies, 2*(1), 73-92.

Kobayashi, A. (1995). Challenging the national dream: Gender persecution and Canadian immigration law. In P. Fitzpatrick (Ed.), *Nationalism, racism and the rule of law* Aldershot: Dartmouth.

Kobayashi, A. (2005). Employment equity in Canada: The paradox of tolerance and denial. In C. James (Ed.), *Possibilities and limitations: Multicultural policies and programs in Canada* (pp. 154-162). Halifax, NS: Fernwood Books.

Kobayashi, A. & Johnson, G.F. (2007). Introduction. In G.F. Johnson & R. Enomoto (Eds.), *Race, racialization and antiracism in Canada and beyond* (pp.3-16). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Kohli, R. & Mitchell, F. (Eds.) (2007). *Working with unaccompanied asylum seeking children: Issues for policy and practice*. Basingstoke, UK and New York, USA: Palgrave Macmillan.

Komulainen, S. (2007). The ambiguity of the child's 'voice' in social research. *Childhood*, *14*(1), 11–28.

Konadu-Agyemang, K. (1998). Structural adjustment programs and the perpetuating of poverty and underdevelopment in Africa: Ghana's experience. *Scandinavian Journal of Development Alternatives and Area Studies, 17*(2 and 3), 127-144.

Konadu-Agyemang, K. (1999). Characteristics and migration experience of Africans in Canada with specific reference to Ghanaians in Greater Toronto. *The Canadian Geographer, 43*(4), 400-414.

Kowalchuk, L., & McLaughlin, N (2009). Mapping the social space of opinion: Public sociology in the op-ed in Canada. *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, *34*(3), 697-728.

Krause, M. (2008). Undocumented migrants**:** An Arendtian perspective**.** *European Journal of Political Theory, 7*(3), 331–348.

Kuhn, A., & Wolpe, A.M. (1978). *Feminism and materialism: Women and modes of production.* London, Boston and Henley: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Kvorjolt, A.T. (2007). Childhood as a symbolic space: Searching for authentic voices in the era of globalisation. *Children's Geographies, 5*(1 & 2), 29-42.

Lacroix, L., Rousseau, C., Singh, A., Gauthier, F., & Benoit, M. (2005). Creative expression workshops in school: Prevention programs for immigrant and refugee children. *The Canadian Child and Adolescent Psychiatry Review*, *14*(3), 77-80.

Lakoff, G., & Johnson, M. (1980). *Metaphors we live by*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Lalonde, L. (1997). Tory welfare policies: A view from the inside. In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.92-102). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Laubenthal, B. (2007). The emergence of pro-regularization movements in Western Europe. *International Migration*, *45*(3), 101-133.

Laughlin, D.L., & Johnson, L.C. (2011). Defining and exploring public space: perspectives of young people from Regent Park, Toronto, *Children's Geographies, 9*(3-4), 439-456.

Lawrence, B., & Dua, E. (2005). Decolonizing Antiracism. *Social Justice*, *32*(4), 120–143.

Lawson, V. (2007). Geographies of care and responsibility. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers, 97*(1), 1-11.

Lenk, H. (2000). The case of Émilie Ouimet: News discourse on hijab and the construction of Québécois national identity. In A. Calliste & G.J.S. Dei (Eds.), *Anti-racist feminism: Critical race and gender studies* (pp. 73-90). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Lessard, H., Johnson, R., & Webber, J. (2011). Stories, communities and their contested meanings. In H. Lessard; R. Johnson & J. Webber (Eds.), *Storied communities: Narratives of contact and arrival in constituting political community* (pp.1-25). Vancouver and Toronto: UBC Press.

Leudar, I., Hayes, J., Nekvapil, J., & Baker, J. (2008). Hostility themes in media, community and refugee narratives. *Discourse & Society, 19*, 187-221.

Levinson, A. (2005). *The regularisation of unauthorized migrants: Literature survey and country case studies*. Oxford: COMPAS.

Lewis, M. (2004). Developing a sociological perspective on mental illness through reading narratives and active learning: A "book club" strategy. *Teaching Sociology, 32*(4), 391-400.

Li, P.S. (2001). The racial subtext in Canada's immigration discourse. *Journal of International Migration and Integration, 2*(1), 77-97.

Li, P.S (2003). *Destination Canada: Immigration debates and issues.* Don Mills: Oxford University Press.

Liamputtong, P. (2007). *Researching the vulnerable: A guide to sensitive research*

methods. London and Thousand Oaks, Ca, New Delhi: SAGE Publications.

Liebel, M. (2008). Citizenship from below: Children's rights and social movements. In A. Invernizzi & J. Williams (Eds.), *Children and citizenship* (pp.32-43). London and New Delhi: Sage Publications.

Liggins, J., Kearns, R.A., & Adams, P.J. (2013). Using autoethnography to reclaim the 'place of healing' in mental health care. *Social Science & Medicine*, *91*, 105-109. Lightman, E.S. (1997). "It's not a walk in the park": Workfare in Ontario. In E. Shragge (Ed.), *Workfare: Ideology for a new under-class* (pp.85-108). Toronto: Garamond Press.

Limbu, B. (2009). Illegible humanity: The refugee, human rights and the question of representation. *Journal of Refugee Studies, 22*(3), 257-282.

Link, B., & Phelan, J. (1995). Social conditions as fundamental causes of disease. *Journal of Health and Social Behaviour*, 80-95.

Link, B., & Phelan, J. (2014). Stigma power. *Social Science & Medicine, 103*, 24-32.

Lippert, R. (2005) Rethinking sanctuary: The Canadian context, 1983-2003. *International Migration Review, 39*(2), 381-406.

Lister, R. (2006). Children (but not women) first: New Labour, child welfare and gender. *Critical Social Policy, 26*(2), 315–33.

Lister, R. (2008). Unpacking children's citizenship. In A. Invernizzi & J. Williams (Eds.), *Children and citizenship* (pp.9-19). London and New Delhi: Sage Publications.

Little, M. (2001). A litmus test for democracy: The impact of Ontario welfare changes on single mothers. *Studies in Political Economy*, 66.

Livingston, D.W. (2014). Class, race and gender differences in schooling. In D. Clandfield, B. Curtis, G-E. Galabuzi, A.Gaymes San Vicente, D. W. Livingstone & H. Smaller (Eds). *Re-stacking the deck: Streaming by class, race and gender in Ontario schools* (pp. 9-40). Ottawa, ON: Our Schools/Our Selves Special Issue.

Loomba, A. (1998). *Colonialism/postcolonialism.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Lopez, G.R; Guajardo, M.A., & Scheurich, J.J. (1998). Windows/ventanas: A postmodern re-presentation of children in migrancy. *Educational Administration Quarterly, 34*(3), 397-426.

Lord, J.E., & Brown, R. (2011). The role of Reasonable Accommodation in securing

substantive equality for persons with disabilities: The UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. In M. Rioux, L.A. Basser, and M. Jones (Eds), *Critical perspectives on human rights and disability law* (pp.273-307). Boston: Martinus Nijhoff.

Lord, J.E. , Suozzi, D., & Taylor, A.L. (2010). Global health governance: Lessons from the experience of the U.N. Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities: Addressing the democratic deficit in Global Health Governance. *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics*, *38*(3), 564-579.

Louis, W.R., Duck, J.M., Terry, D.J., Schuller, R.A., & Lalonde, R.N. (2007). Why do citizens want to keep refugees out? Threats, fairness and hostile norms in the treatment of asylum seekers. *European Journal of Social Psychology, 37*, 53–73. DOI: 10.1002/ejsp.329

Lowry, M., & Nyers, P. (2003). Roundtable report: No One is Illegal: The fight for refugee and migrant rights in Canada. *Refuge, 21*(3), 66-72.

Lynch, K. (2007). Love labour as a distinct and non-commodifiable form of care labour. *The Sociological Review, 55*, 550-570.

Lynch, K., & Baker, J. (2005). Equality in education: The importance of equality of condition. *Theory and Research in Education, 3*, 131-164.

Lynch, K., Baker, J., & Lyons, M. (2009). *Affective equality: Love, care and solidarity work*. Palgrave Macmillan: New York.

Lynn, N., & Lea, S. (2003). ‘A phantom menace and the new apartheid': The social construction of asylum-seekers in the United Kingdom. *Discourse & Society, 14*(4), 425–452.

Luttrell, W. (2013). Children’s counter-narratives of care: Towards educational justice. *Children & Society, 27*, 295–308.

MacDonald, N., & MacDonald, J. (2007). Reflections of a Mi’kmaq social worker on a quarter of a century work in First Nations child welfare. *First Peoples Child and Family Review, 3*(1), 34-45.

MacGregor, S. (1999). Welfare, neo-liberalism and new paternalism: Three ways for social policy in late capitalist societies, *Capital and Class, 67*, 91-118.

Mackenzie, C; McDowell, C. & Pittaway, E. (2007). Beyond ‘Do no harm’: The challenge of constructing ethical relationships in refugee research. *Journal of Refugee Studies, 20* (2):
299-319.

Mackey, E. (1999). *The house of difference: Cultural politics and national identity in Canada.* London and New York: Routledge.

Macklin, A. (2001a). Borderline security. In R.J. Daniels, Macklem, P. & Roach, K. (Eds.), *The security of freedom: Essays on Canada's anti-terrorism bill* (pp. 383-404). Eds. Daniels, Ronald Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Macklin, A. (2001b). New directions for refugee policy: Of curtains, doors and locks (Guest Editor Introduction). *Refuge,* 19(4), 1-4.

Macklin, A. (2003). *The values of the Canada-US Safe Third Country Agreement.* Ottawa: Caledon Institute of Social Policy.

Macklin, A. (2009). Particularized citizenship: Encultured women and the public sphere. In S. Benhabib & Resnik, J. (Eds.), *Migrations and mobilities: Citizenship, borders, gender*. New York: New York University Press.

Macklin, A. (2011). Historicizing narratives of arrival: The other Indian Other. In H. Lessard; R. Johnson & J. Webber (Eds.), *Storied communities: Narratives of contact and arrival in constituting political community* (pp.40-67). Vancouver and Toronto: UBC Press.

Mahtani, M., & Mountz, A. (2002). Immigration to British Columbia: Media representations and public opinion. *Research on immigration and integration in the metropolis working paper series*. No. 02-15.

Maioni, A. (1994). Ideology and process in the politics of social reform. In K. Banting & K. Battle (Eds.), *A new social vision for Canada? Perspectives on the federal discussion paper on social policy reform*. Kingston and Ottawa: School of Policy Studies, Queen's University, and Caledon Institute of Social Policy.

Maiter, S. (2009). Race matters: Social justice not assimilation or cultural competence. In S. Strega & S.A. Esquao (Eds.), *Walking this path together: Anti-racist and anti-oppressive child welfare practice* (pp. 62-77). Halifax: Fernwood Publishing.

Malkki, L. (1995a). *Purity and exile: Violence, memory and national cosmology among Hutu refugees in Tanzania.* Chicago: Chicago University Press.

Malkki, L. (1995b). Refugees and exile: From "Refugee Studies" to the national order of things. *Annual Review of Anthropology, 24,* 495-523.

Malkki, L.H. (1996). Speechless emissaries: Refugees, humanitarianism, and dehistoricization. *Cultural Anthropology, 11*(3), 377–404.

Mamdani, M. (Ed.) (2000). *Beyond rights talk and culture talk: Comparative essays on the politics of rights and culture.* London: Palgrave MacMillan.

Manicom, A. (1995). What's health got to do with it? Class, gender, and teacher's work. In M. Campbell & A. Manicom (Eds.) *Knowledge, experience, and ruling relations: Studies in the social organization of knowledge* (pp.135-148). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Marshall, T.H. (1992). *Citizenship and social class.* London: Pluto.

Marston, G. (2004). Possibilities and limitations of discourse analysis for policy studies. In G. Marston (Ed.) *Social policy and discourse analysis: Policy change in public housing.* Basingstoke: Ashgate.

Martell, G. (Ed.). (1974). *The politics of the Canadian public school*. Toronto: James Lorimer & Company.

Martin, J.M. (2010). Stigma and student mental health in higher education. *Higher Education Research & Development*, *29*(3), 259-274.

Martin, L. (2011). The geopolitics of vulnerability: children's legal subjectivity, immigrant family detention and US immigration law and enforcement policy. *Gender, Place & Culture*, *18*(4), 477-498.

Martinot, S. (2003). *The rule of racialization: Class, identity, governance*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

McAdie, P. (1998). The abandonment of the pursuit of equity. *Canadian Women's Studies, 17*(4), 5-14.

McCarthy, C., Crichlow, W., Dimitriadis, G., & Dolby, N. (Eds). (2005). *Race, identity and representation in education.* (2nd Edition) London and New York: Routledge.

McClennen, S.A., & Slaughter, J.R. (2009). Introducing human rights and literary forms; or, the vehicles and vocabularies of human rights. *Comparative Literature Studies, 46*(1), 1-20.

McDonald, J. (2009). Migrant illegality, nation-building, and the politics of regularization in Canada. *Refuge: Canada's Periodical on Refugees, 26*(2), 65-77.

McDowell, L. (2008). The new economy, class condescension and caring labour: Changing formations of class and gender. *NORA - Nordic Journal of Feminist and Gender Research, 16*(3), 150-165.

McKean, G. (2011). Mental health and well-being in post-secondary education settings: A literature and environmental scan to support planning and action in Canada. Prepared for the June 2011 CACUSS pre-conference workshop on mental health, Toronto, ON, Retrieved from:http://www.tgao.ca/assets/pdfs/CACUSS.MHCC-Student-Mental-Health-Jun19.2.pdf

McKeen, W. (2004). The shifting discourses of the progressive social policy/child poverty advocacy community: Whither social justice? *Canadian Review of Social Policy, 52*, 88-107.

McKeen, W. (2006). Diminishing the concept of social policy: The shifting conceptual ground of social policy debate in Canada. *Critical Social Policy, 26*(4), 865–887.

McKeen, W. (2007). The National Children's Agenda: A neoliberal wolf in lamb's clothing. *Studies in Political Economy 80*, 151-173.

McNevin, A. (2006). Political belonging in a neoliberal era: The struggle of the Sans-Papiers. *Citizenship Studies*, *10*(2), 135-151.

McNevin, A. (2009). Contesting citizenship: Irregular migrants and strategic possibilities for political belonging. *New Political Science, 31*(2), 163-181.

McRobbie, A., & Thornton, S.L. (1995). Rethinking 'moral panic' for multi-mediated social worlds. *British Journal of Sociology, 46*(4), 559-74.

Meadus, R.J., & Johnson, B. (2000). The experience of being an adolescent child of a parent who has a mood disorder. *Journal of Psychiatric and Mental Health Nursing, 7,* 383-390.

Mehan, H. (1997). The discourse of the illegal immigration debate: A case study in the politics of representation. *Discourse & Society, 8*(2), 249-270.

Meloni, F. (2013). *Living with uncertainty: An ethnographic study on the agency and belonging of undocumented youth in Canada.* Department of Psychiatry, Division of Social and Cultural Psychiatry, McGill University (unpublished PhD thesis).

Meloni, F., Rousseau, C., Montgomery, & Measham, T. (2013). Children of exception: Redefining categories of illegality and citizenship in Canada. *Children & Society*, DOI:10.1111/chso.12006

Memmi, A. (1965). *The colonizer and the colonized*. New York: The Orion Press.

Memmi, A. (2006). *Decolonization and the decolonized.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Menzies, R. (1998). Governing mentalities: The deportation of 'insane' and 'feebleminded' immigrants out of British Columbia from Confederation to World War II," *Canadian Journal of Law and Society*, *13*(2), 135–172.

Mestheneo, E. (2006). Refugees as researchers: Experiences from the project Bridges and fences: Paths to refugee integration in the EU. In B. Temble & R. Moran (Eds.), *Doing research with refugees: Issues and guidelines* (pp.21-36). Bristol, UK: The Policy Press, University of Bristol.

Michaels, A. (1996). *Fugitive pieces.* Toronto: McClelland & Stewart.

Miki, R. (2005). Turning in, turning out: The shifting formations of "Japanese Canadian" from uprooting to redress. In J.A. Lee & J. Lutz (Eds.), *Situating 'race' and racisms in space, time and theory: Critical essays for activists and scholars* (pp.94-113). Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Miklavcic, A. (2011). Canada's non-status immigrants: Negotiating access to health care and citizenship. *Medical Anthropology, 30*(5), 496-517.

Miller, J. (1998). *Yesterday's news: Why Canada's daily newspapers are failing us.* Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Miller, P. (2005). Useful and priceless children in contemporary welfare states, *Social Politics*, *12*(1), 3-41.

Minow, M. (1986). Rights for the next generation: A feminist approach to children's rights. *Harvard Women's Law Journal, 9*, 1-24.

Mirchandani, K. and Chan, W. (2007). *Criminalizing race, criminalizing poverty: Welfare fraud enforcement in Canada*. Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Mirchandani, K., & Tastsoglou, E. (2000). Towards a diversity beyond tolerance. *Studies in Political Economy*, 61, 49-78.

Mitchell, C. (2006). In my life: Youth stories and poems on HIV/AIDS: Towards a new literacy in the age of AIDS. *Changing English*, *13*(3), 355-368.

Mitchell, C., Moletsane, R., Stuart, J., Buthelezi, T. & de Lange, N. (2005). Taking pictures/taking action! Using photovoice techniques with children. *Children First*, *9,* 27-31.

Mitchell, C. & Reid-Walsh, J. (2002). *Researching children's popular culture: The cultural spaces of childhood.* New York and London: Routledge.

Mitchell, C., & Smith, A. (1996). Reading production: Investigating social change as

inscribed into South African young adult literature. *South African Journal of Library & Information Science*, 64(2)

Mitchell, C., Walsh, S., & Moletsane, R. (2006). 'Speaking for ourselves': Visual arts-based and participatory methodologies for working with young people. In F. Leach & C. Mitchell (Eds.), *Combating gender violence in and around schools* (pp. 103-111). Stoke on Trent, UK and Sterling, USA: Trentham Books.

Mitchell, C., & Weber, S. (1999). *Reinventing ourselves as teachers: Beyond nostalgia*. London: Falmer.

Mohanty, C.T. (1988). Under western eyes: Feminist scholarship and colonial discourses. *Feminist Review*, 30, 61-88.

Mohanty, C. (1991). Cartographies of struggle: Third World women and the politics of feminism. In C.T. Mohanty, A. Russo and L. Torres (Eds.) *Third World women and the politics of feminism*. Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

Mohanty, C.T. (2002). Under western eyes: Feminist scholarship and colonial discourses. In N. Visvanathan, L. Duggan, L. Nisonoff & N. Wiegersma (Eds.), *The women, gender and development reader* (pp. 79-84). London and New Jersey: Zed Books.

Mohanty, C.T. (2003). *Feminism without borders: Decolonizing theory, practicing solidarity*. London: Duke University Press.

Mojab, S. (2006a). In the quagmires of ethnicity: A Marxist critique of Liberal 'exit strategies', *Ethnicities, 6*(3), 341-361.

Mojab, S. (2006b). War and diaspora as lifelong learning contexts for immigrant women. In C. Leathwood & B. Francis (Eds.), *Gender and lifelong learning: Critical feminist engagements* (pp.164-175). London and New York: Routledge.

Mojab, S., & El-Kassem, N. (2011). Cultural Relativism: Theoretical, political and ideological debates. *Dossiers: Journal of Women Living Under Muslim Laws*, 30-31(2), 191-210.

Mojab, S., & McDonald, S. (2008). Women, violence and informal learning. In K. Church, N. Bascia & E. Shragge (Eds.), *Learning through community: Exploring participatory practices* (pp.37-53). Toronto: Springer Science and Business Media, B.V.

Monforte, P. & Dufour, P. (2011). Mobilizing in borderline citizenship regimes: A comparative analysis of undocumented migrants' collective actions. *Politics & Society, 39* (203), 203-232.

Moosa-Mitha, M. (2005). A difference-centred alternative to theorization of children's citizenship rights. *Citizenship Studies*, *9*(4), 369–388.

Moran, R., Mohamed, Z., & Lovel, H. (2006). Breaking the silence: participatory research process about health with Somali refugee people seeking asylum. In B. Temble & R. Moran (Eds.), *Doing research with refugees: Issues and guidelines* (pp.55-74). Bristol, UK The Policy Press, University of Bristol.

Morgan, S. (2000). Documentary and text analysis: Uncovering meaning in a worked example. In B. Humphries (Ed.) *Research in social care and social welfare: Issues and debates for practice* (pp.119-131). London and Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

Morrison, I. (1997). Rights and the right: Ending social citizenship in Tory Ontario. In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.68-78). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Morrison, I. (1998a). Ontario works: A preliminary assessment. *Journal of Law and Social Policy*, 13.

Morrison, I. (1998b). Welfare reform & immigrants. Toronto: Ontario Social Safety Network.

Morrison, T. (1992). *Playing in the dark: Whiteness and the literary imagination*. Cambridge, MA.: Harvard University Press.

Morrow, M., & Weisser, J. (2012). Towards a social justice framework of mental health recovery. *Studies in Social Justice*, *6*(1), 27-43.

Morrow, V. (2007). Editorial: At the crossroads. *Childhood, 14*(1), 5–10.

Morrow, V. & Richards, M. (1996). The ethics of social research with children: an overview. *Children & Society, 10,* 90-105.

Mosher, J.E. (2000). Managing the disentitlement of women: Glorified markets, the idealized family, and the undeserving Other. In S.M. Neysmith (Ed.), *Restructuring caring labour: Discourses, state practice, and everyday life* (pp.30-51). Don Mills, ON: Oxford University Press.

Moulin, C., & Nyers, P. (2007). ''We live in a country of UNHCR''- Refugee protests and global political society. *International Political Sociology, 1,* 356-372.

Mountz, A. (2002). Feminist politics, immigration, and academic identities. *Gender, Place & Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography*, *9*(2), 187-19.

Mountz, A. (2004). Embodying the nation-state: Canada's response to human smuggling. *Political Geography*, *23*, 323–345.

Mountz, A. (2010). *Seeking asylum: Human smuggling and bureaucracy at the border*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Mountz, A., & Hyndman, J. (2006). Feminist approaches to the global intimate. *Women's Studies Quarterly, 34*(1-2), 446-463.

Mountz, A., Miyares, I.M., Wright, R. & Bailey, A.J. (2003). Methodologically becoming: Power, knowledge and team research. *Gender, Place & Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography*, 10(1), 29-46.

Mukherjee, A. (1998). *Postcolonialism: My living*. Toronto: TSAR Publications.

Mulder, M. (2009). *After peaches*. Victoria, BC: Orca Young Readers.

Murray, N. (1986). Anti-racists and other demons – The press and ideology in Thatcher's Britain. *Race & Class, 27*, 1-19.

Mynott, E. (2002a). Nationalism, racism and immigration control: From anti-racism to anti-capitalism. In S. Cohen, B. Humphries & E. Mynott (Eds.), *From immigration controls to welfare controls* (pp. 11-29). London and New York: Routledge.

Mynott, E. (2002b). From a shambles to a new apartheid: Local authorities, dispersal and the struggle to defend asylum seekers. In S. Cohen, B. Humphries & E. Mynott (Eds.), *From immigration controls to welfare controls* (pp. 106-125). London and New York: Routledge.

Nadeau, M. (2002). Who is Canadian now? Feminism and the politics of nation after September 11. *Atlantis, 27*(1), 14-24.

Nelson, C. & Nelson, C. (Eds.) (2004). *Racism, eh? A critical interdisciplinary anthology of race and racism in Canada.* Concord, ON: Captis Press.

Nelson, R., & Nock, D. (Eds.). (1978). *Reading, writing, and riches: Education and the socio-economic order in North America.* Kitchener, ON: Between the Lines Press.

Neysmith, S.M. (2000). Networking across difference: Connecting restructuring and caring labour. In S.M. Neysmith (Ed.), *Restructuring caring labour: Discourses, state practice, and everyday life* (pp.1-28). Don Mills, ON: Oxford University Press.

Niewenhuys, O. (1998). Global childhood and the politics of contempt, *Alternatives, 23*(3), 267-89.

Ng, R. (1995). Multiculturalism as ideology: A textual analysis. In M. Campbell & A. Manicom (Eds.) *Knowledge, experience, and ruling relations: Studies in the social organization of knowledge* (pp.35-48) Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Ng, R. (1996). *The politics of community services: Immigrant women, class and state.* Halifax, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Ng, R. (2000). Restructuring gender, race, and class relations: The case of garment workers and labour adjustment. In S.M. Neysmith (Ed.), *Restructuring caring labour: Discourses, state practice, and everyday life* (pp.226-245). Don Mills, ON: Oxford University Press.

Ng, R. (2006). Exploring the globalized regime of ruling from the standpoint of immigrant workers. In Frampton, C., Kingsman, G., Thompson, A.K., and Tilleczek, K. (Eds.) *Sociology for changing the world: Social movements/social research* (pp. 174-188). Blackpoint, NS: Fernwood.

Ng, R., & Mirchandani, K. (2008). Linking global trends and local lives: Mapping the methodological dilemmas. In K. Gallagher (Ed.), *The methodological dilemma: Creative, critical and collaborative approaches to qualitative research* (pp.34-45). London: Routledge.

Ng, R., Staton, P., & Scane, J. (Eds.). (1995). *Anti-racism, feminism, and critical approaches to education.* Toronto, ON: OISE Press.

Nourpanah, S. (2011). The ethics of refugee aid. *Éthique et économique/Ethics and Economics, 8*(1), http://ethique-economique.net/, 133-142.

Nyers, P. (1998). Refugees, humanitarian emergencies, and the politicization of life. *Refuge,17*(6), 16-21.

Nyers. P. (1999). Emergency or emerging identities? Refugees and transformations in world order. *Millennium: Journal of International Studies*, *28*(1), 1-26.

Nyers, P. (2003). Abject Cosmopolitanism: The politics of protection in the anti-deportation movement. *Third World Quarterly*, *24*(6), 1069-1093.

Nyers, P. (2006). *Access not fear: When non-status people make claims on city services.* Joint Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Settlement Conference, Toronto, ON.

Nyers, P. (2010). No one is illegal between city and nation. *Studies in Social Justice, 4*(2), 127-143.

Odartey-Wellington, F. (2009). Racial profiling and moral panic: Operation Thread and the Al Qaeda sleeper cell that never was. *Global Media Journal – Canadian Edition* 2(2), 25-40.

Odartey-Wellington, F. (2011). Erasing race in the Canadian media: The case of Suaad Hagi Mohamud. *Canadian Journal of Communication, 36*, 395-414.

O'Dell, L. Crafter, S., de Abreu, G. & Cline, T. (2010). Constructing 'normal childhoods': Young people talk about young carers. *Disability & Society*, *(25)*6, 643-655.

Oka, C.D., & Ayers, A.J. (2010). At the gates of fortress North America: Race-ing the SPP and its political subject. *Studies in Political Economy 86*, 24-53.

Okitikpi, T., & Aymer, C. (2003). Social work with African refugee children and their families. *Child and Family Social Work, 8*, 213–222.

O'Neill, M., & Harindranath, R. (2006). Theorising narratives of exile and belonging: The importance of biography and ethno-mimesis in 'understanding' asylum. *Qualitative Sociology Review, 2*(1), 39–53. Retrieved from: http://www.qualitativesociologyreview.org

Otway, O. (1996). Social work with children and their families: From child welfare to child protection. In N. Parton (Ed.), *Social theory, social change and social work* (pp.152-171). London: Routledge.

Olsen, R. (2000). Families under the microscope: Parallels between the young carers debate of the 1990s and the transformation of childhood in the late nineteenth century. *Children and Society,* 14(5), 384 –94.

Olstead, R. (2002). Contesting the text: Canadian media depictions of the conflation of mental illness and criminality. *Sociology of Health & Illness, 24(*5), 621-643.

O'Neill, M., & Harindranath, R. (2006). Theorising narratives of exile and belonging: The importance of biography and ethno-mimesis in 'understanding' asylum. *Qualitative Sociology Review, 2*(1), 39–53. Retrieved from: http://www.qualitativesociologyreview.org

Ong, A. (2003). *Buddha is hiding: Refugees, citizenship, the new America.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Orellana, M. (2001). The work kids do: Mexican and Central American immigrant children's contributions to households and schools in California. *Harvard Educational Review, 71* (3), 366-389.

Orellana, M. (2009). *Translating childhoods: Immigrant youth, language, and culture*. Piscataway: Rutgers University Press.

Orellana, M.F., Thorne, B., Chee, A., & Lam, W.S.E. (2001). Transnational childhoods: The participation of children in processes of family migration. *Social Problems, 48*(4), 572-91.

Oxman-Martinez, J.; Hanley, J.; Lach, L.; Khanlou, N.; Weerasinghe, S., & Agnew, V. (2005). Intersection of Canadian policy parameters affecting women with precarious immigration status: A baseline for understanding barriers to health. *Journal of Immigrant Health*, *7*(4), 247-258.

Pacini-Ketchabaw, V., White, J., & Armstrong de Almeida, A-E. (2006). Racialization in early childhood: A critical analysis of discourses in policies. *International Journal of Educational Policy, Research, and Practice: Reconceptualizing Childhood Studies, 7*(1), 95-113.

Page, B.I. (1996). The mass media as political actors. *Political Science & Politics, 29*, 20-24.

Pain, R. (2010). Ways beyond disciplinarity, *Children's Geographies, 8*(2), 223 – 225.

Parada, H., Barnoff, L., & Coleman, B. (2007). Negotiating 'professional agency': social work and decision-making within the Ontario child welfare system. *Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare*, 32 (4), 35-56.

Paradis, E.K. (2000). Feminist and community psychology ethics in research with homeless women. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, *28*(6), 839-58.

Park, A.S.J. (2013). Racial nationalism and representations of citizenship: The recalcitrant alien, the citizen of convenience, and the fraudulent citizen. *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, *38*(4), 579-600.

Park, A.S.J. (2014). Constituting Omar Khadr: Cultural racism, Childhood and citizenship. *International Political Sociology*, *8*(1), 43-62.

Park, Y. (2008). Making refugees: A historical discourse analysis of the construction of the "refugee" in U.S. social work, 1900-1957. *British Journal of Social Work, 38*, 771-787.

Park, Y. & Bhuyan, R. (2012). Whom should we serve? A discourse analysis of social

workers' commentary on undocumented immigrants. *Journal of Progressive Human Services, 23*(1), 18-40, DOI: 10.1080/10428232.2011.605745

Park, Y., Bhuyan, R., Richards, C., & Rundle, A. (2011). U.S. social work practitioners' attitudes towards immigrants and immigration: Results from an online survey, *Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies, 9*(4), 367-392.

Parkdale Community Legal Clinic (2005). *Guide to social membership entitlements.* Toronto, ON: Parkdale Community Legal Clinic.

Parr, A. (2005). The deterritorializing language of child detainees: Self-harm or embodied graffiti? *Childhood, 12*(3), 281-299.

Pashang, S. (2011). *Non-status women: Invisible residents and underground resilience*. Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, University of Toronto (unpublished PhD thesis).

Peck, J. (2001). Neoliberalising states: Thin policies/hard outcomes. *Progress in Human Geography, 25*, 445-455.

Peera, R. (2003). Employment needs of newcomer youth in west end Ottawa. In P. Anisef & K.M. Kilbride (Eds.), *Managing two worlds: The experiences & concerns of immigrant youth in Ontario* (pp.69-95). Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press.

Phelan, J.C., Lucas, J.W., Ridgeway, C.L., & Taylor, C.J. (2014). Stigma, status, and population health. *Social Science & Medicine, 103*, 15-23.

Philipupillai, G.G. (2013). *The marking of Tamil youth as terrorists and the making of Canada as a white settler society.* Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, University of Toronto (unpublished Master of Arts thesis).

Philo, C. (2005). The geographies that wound. *Population, Space and Place, 11*, 441–454.

Philo, G., & Beattie, L. (1999). Race, migration and media. In G. Philo (Ed.) *Message received: Glasgow Media Group research 1993-1998* (pp.171-196). Harlow: Longman.

Pickett, K., & Wilkinson, G. (2010). Inequality: An underacknowledged source of mental illness and distress. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, *197*(6), 426-428.

Pittaway, E., & Bartolomei, L. (2001). Refugees, race, and gender: The multiple discrimination against refugee women. *Refuge: Canada's Periodical on Refugees*, *19*(6), 21-32.

Platt, S. (1999). Home truths: Media representations of homelessness. In B. Franklin (Ed.) *Social policy, the media and misrepresentation* (pp.104-117). London and New York: Routledge.

Potter, J., & Wetherell, M. (1987). *Discourse and social psychology: Beyond attitudes and behaviour.* London: Sage.

Pratt, A., & Valverde, M. (2002). From deserving victims to 'masters of confusion': Redefining refugees in the 1990s. *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, 39, 4

Pratt, A. (2005). *Securing borders: Detention and deportation in Canada*. Vancouver: UBC Press.

Pratt, M.L. (1992). *Imperial eyes: Travel writing and transculturation*. New York, NY: Routledge.

Pratt, M.L. (2004). The Anticolonial Past, *Modern Language Quarterly, 65*(3) 443–56.

Preston, V. (2003). Gender, inequality and borders. *ACME: An International E-Journal for Critical Geographies, 2*(2), 183-187.

Prince, M., Patel, V., Saxena, S., Maj, M., Maselko, J., Phillips, M.R., & Rahman, A. (2007). No health without mental health. *The Lancet*, *370*(9590), 859-877.

Prior, L. (2004). *Using documents in social research.* London: Sage Publications.

Pulido, L. (2007). A day without immigrants: The racial and class politics of immigrant exclusion. *Antipode. 39*(1), 1-8.

Pulkingham, J. & Ternowetsky, G. (1997). The changing context of child and family policies. In J. Pulkingham & Ternowetsky, G. (Eds.), *Child and family policies: Struggles, strategies and options* (pp.14-38). Halifax: Fernwood Publishing.

Qvortrup, J. (1985). Placing children in the division of labour. In P. Close & R. Collins (Eds.), *Family and economy in modern society*, (pp.129-45). London, England: Macmillan.

Qvortrup, J. (1997). Childhood and societal macrostructures. Paper presented to programme meeting, ESRC Children 5-16 Programme, Keele University.

Qvortrup, J. (2005). Varieties of childhood. In J. Qvortrup (Ed.) *Studies in modern childhood: Society, agency, culture* (pp.1-20) Houndsmills, Basingstoke: Palgrave.

Raghuram, P. (2012). Global care, local configurations – challenges to conceptualizations of care. *Global Networks, 12*(2), 155–174.

Ralph, D.S. (1997a). Introduction. In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.13-19). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Ralph, D.S. (1997b). Strategies for the post-Harris era. In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.177-185). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Ramírez, A., & Domi (2006). *Napí goes to the mountain*. Toronto: Groundwood Books/House of Anansi Press.

Randall, D. (2009). Empire and children's literature: Changing patterns of cross-cultural perspective. *Children's Literature in Education, 41*, 28–39.

Razack, S. (1996). The perils of storytelling for refugee women. In W. Giles, H. Moussa & P. Van Esterik (Eds.), *Development and diaspora: Gender and the refugee experience* (pp. 164-175). Dundas, ON: Artemis Enterprises.

Razack, S (1999a). *Looking white people in the eye: Gender, race, and culture in courtrooms and classrooms* (2nd ed.). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Razack, S. (1999b). Making Canada white: Law and the policing of bodies of colour in the 1990s. *Canadian Journal of Law & Society*, *14*(1), 159-184.

Razack, S. (2000a). From the "clean snows of Petawawa": The violence of Canadian peacekeepers in Somalia. *Cultural Anthropology, 15*(1), 127-163.

Razack, S. (2000b). Simple logic: Race, the identity documents rule and the story of a nation besieged and betrayed. *Journal of Law and Social Policy.* 15

Razack, S. (2002). Introduction: When place becomes race. In S. Razack (Ed.), *Race, space and the law: Unmapping a white settler society* (pp.1-20). Toronto, ON: Between the Lines.

Razack, S. (2004). *Dark threats and white knights: The Somalia affair, peacekeeping and the new imperialism*. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Razack, S. (2005). Geopolitics, culture clash, and gender after September 11. *Social Justice*, *32*(4), 50-68.

Razack, S. (2007). Stealing the pain of others: Reflections on Canadian humanitarian

responses. *The Review of Education, Pedagogy, and Cultural Studies, 29,* 375-394.

Razack, S. (2008). *Casting out: The eviction of Muslims from western law and politics.* Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Razack, S. (2012). The manufacture of torture as public truth: The case of Omar Khadr. *Paper presented at the annual meeting of The Law and Society Association, Hilton Hawaiian Village Resort, Honolulu, HI*. Retrieved from http://citation.allacademic.com/meta/p557290_index.html

Reimer, M. (2008a). Discourses of home in Canadian children's literature. In M. Reimer (Ed.), *Home worlds: Discourses of children's literature in Canada* (pp.xi-xx). Waterloo, ON: Wilfred Laurier University Press.

Reimer, M. (2008b). Homing and unhoming: The ideological work of Canadian children's literature. In M. Reimer (Ed.), *Home worlds: Discourses of children's literature in Canada* (pp.1-25). Waterloo, ON: Wilfred Laurier University Press.

Reynaert, D., Bouverne-de-Bie, & Vandevelde, S. (2009). A review of children's rights literature since the adoption of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. *Childhood, 16,* 518-534.

Ribet, B. (2011). Emergent disability and the limits of equality: A critical reading of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. *Yale Human Rights and Development Law Journal, 14*(1), 155-203.

Riebschleger, J. (2004). Good days and bad days: The experiences of children of a parent with a psychiatric disability. *Psychiatric Rehabilitation Journal, 28*(1), 25-31.

Ritchie, G. B. (2013). *Consciousness and praxis: Informal learning in social movements.* Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, University of Toronto (unpublished MA thesis).

Richmond, A. (1994). *Global apartheid: Refugees, racism and the new world order*. Toronto: Oxford.

Roberts, D.J., & Mahtani, M. (2010). Neo-liberalizing race, racing neo-liberalism: Placing "race" in neo-liberal discourses. *Antipode, 42*(2), 248-257.

Robins, M.B. (2003). 'Lost Boys' and the promised land: US newspaper coverage of Sudanese refugees. *Journalism*, 4, 29-49.

Roche, J. (1999). Children's rights, participation, and citizenship. *Childhood, 6*, 475-493.

Rojecki, A. (2002). Modernism, state sovereignty and dissent: Media and the new post-Cold War movements. *Critical Studies in Media Communication, 19*(2), 152-171.

Rojecki, A. (2005). Media discourse on globalization and terror. *Political Communication, 22*, 63-81.

Rojo, L.M., & van Dijk, T. (1997). "There is a problem, and it was solved!": Legitimating the expulsion of "illegal" migrants in Spanish parliamentary discourse. *Discourse & Society, 8*, 423-566.

Roman, L. G. (1996). Spectacle in the dark: Youth as transgression, display, and repression. *Educational Theory*, *46*(1), 1-22.

Ron, J., Ramos, H., & Rodgers, K. (2005). Transnational information politics: NGO human rights reporting, 1986–2000. *International Studies Quarterly, 49*, 557–587.

Rousseau, C., Drapeau, A., Lacroix, L., Bagilishya, D., & Heusch, N. (2005). Evaluation of a classroom program of creative expression workshops for refugee and immigrant children. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*, *46*(2), 180-185.

Rousseau, C., Drapeau, A., & Corin, E. (1998). Risk and protective factors in Central American and Southeast Asian refugee children. *Journal of Refugee Studies*, *11*(1), 20-37.

Rousseau, C., & Heusch, N. (2000). The trip: A creative expression project for refugee and immigrant children. *Art Therapy: Journal of the American Art Therapy Association*, *17*(1), 31-40.

Roy, L.A., & Roxas, K.C. (2011). Whose deficit is this anyhow? Exploring counter-stories of Somali Bantu refugees' experiences in "doing school" *Harvard Educational Review*, *81*(3), p.521-543.

Ruddick, S. (2007a). At the horizons of the subject: Neo-liberalism, neo-conservatism and the rights of the child. Part one: from 'knowing' fetus to 'confused' child. *Gender, Place and Culture 14* (5), 513-526.

Ruddick, S. (2007b). At the horizons of the subject: Neo-liberalism, neo-conservatism and the rights of the child. Part two: Parent, caregiver, state. *Gender, Place, and Culture 14*(6), 627-640.

Ruiz-Casares, M., Rousseau, C., Derluyn, I., Watters, C., & Crepeau, F. (2010). Right and access to healthcare for undocumented children: Addressing the gap between international conventions and disparate implementations in North America and Europe. *Social Science & Medicine,*70*,*329-336.

Saad, S. (2013). The cost of invisibility: The psychosocial impact of falling out of status. In L. Goldring & P. Landolt (Eds), *Producing and negotiating non-citizenship: Precarious legal status in Canada* (137-153). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Said, E. (1981). *Covering Islam: How the media and experts determine how we see the rest of the world.* New York: Pantheon Books.

Said, E. (1993). *Culture and imperialism*. New York: Vintage Books.

Said, E. (1994). *Orientalism.* New York: Vintage Books.

Said, E. (2006). Orientalism now. In H. Lauder, P. Brown, J. Dillabough & A.H. Halsey (Eds.), *Education, globalization & social change* (pp.138-142). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Saldanha, L. (2008). White picket fences: At home with multicultural children's literature in Canada? In M. Reimer (Ed.), *Home worlds: Discourses of children's literature in Canada* (pp.129-143). Waterloo, ON: Wilfred Laurier University Press.

Sales, R. (2002). The deserving and the undeserving? Refugees, asylum seekers and welfare in Britain*. Critical Social Policy*, 22, 3.

Samers, M. (2003). Invisible capitalism: Political economy and the regulation of undocumented immigration in France. *Economy and Society, 32*(4), 555-583.

Sanchez, G., & Romero, M. (2010). Critical Race Theory in the US sociology of immigration. *Sociology Compass 4/9*, 779–788.

Santa Ana, O. (1999). 'Like an animal I was treated': anti-immigrant metaphor in US public discourse. *Discourse & Society, 10*(2), 191–224.

Santa Ana, O. (2002). *Brown tide rising: Metaphors of Latinos in contemporary American public discourse.* Austin: University of Texas Press.

Santa Ana, O., Morán, J., & Sánchez, C. (1998). Awash under a brown tide: Immigration metaphors and print media discourse. *Aztlán,* 23(2), 137–76.

Sassen, S. (1998). *Globalization and its discontents: Essays on the new mobility of people and money.* New York, NY: New Press.

Sassen, S. (1999a). *Guests and aliens*. New York, NY: The New Press.

Sassen, S. (1999b). Beyond sovereignty: Immigration policy-making today. In S. Jonas

& S.D. Thomas (Eds.), *Immigration: A civil rights issue for the Americas* (pp.15-26). Wilmington, Delaware: SR Books.

Sassen, S. (2002). The formation of new political subjects under globalization. Public lecture at the Institute for Women's Studies and Gender Studies, University of Toronto, November 29.

Sassen, S. (2012). *Cities in a world economy* (Fourth Edition). London: Sage.

Saucedo, R. (2006). INS raids and how immigrant women are fighting back. In INCITE! Women of Color Against Violence (Ed.), *Color of violence: The INCITE! anthology* (pp.135-137). Cambridge, MA: South End Press.

Schissel, B. (1997). *Blaming children: Youth crime, moral panics and the politics of hate.* Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Schissel, B. (2011). *Children & youth.* Halifax, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Schrøder, K.C. (2007). Media discourse analysis: Researching cultural meanings from inception to reception. *Textual Cultures, 2*(2), 77-99.

Schugurensky, D. (2007). Does education equalize opportunities? The implications of the TDSB cohort analysis for democracy and meritocracy. *Diversity in Education Parents' Forum.* Toronto: Ethnocultural Community Network of the Toronto District School Board.

Schuster, L. (2002). Asylum and the lessons of history. *Race & Class, 44*(2), 40-56.

Sears, A. (2003). *Retooling the mind factory: Education in a lean state*. Aurora, ON: Garamond Press.

Sevenhuijsen, S. (1998). *Citizenship and the ethics of care: Feminist considerations on justice, morality and politics* (L. Savage, Trans.). London and New York: Routledge.

Sévigny, C.A. (2012). Starting from refugees themselves: Towards an institutional ethnography of resettlement. *UNHCR New Issues in Refugee Research: Research Paper No. 247*, Accessed from: http://www.refworld.org/docid/5142dbc42.htm

Sgritta, G.B. (1997). Inconsistencies : Childhood on the economic and political agenda. *Childhood,* 4, 375-404.

Shade, L.R., & Lithgrow, M. (2010). The cultures of democracy: How ownership and

public participation shape Canada's media systems. In L.R. Shade (Ed.) *Mediascapes: New patterns in Canadian communication* (pp.200-220). Toronto, ON: Nelson.

Shakir, U. (2011). The colour of poverty. In M. Chazan, L. Helps., A. Stanley, & S. Thakkar (Eds.), *Home and native land: Unsettling multiculturalism in Canada* (pp.184-191). Toronto, ON: Between the Lines.

Shantz, J. (2004). No One Is Illegal: Direct action in defence of immigrants and refugees in Ontario. *Canadian Review of Social Policy; 53*, 157-163.

Sharma, N. (2003). No borders, movements and the rejection of left nationalism. *Canadian Dimension, 37*(3), 37-39.

Sharma, N. (2005). Canadian nationalism and the making of a global apartheid. *Women and Environment*, 68-69, 9-13.

Sharma, N. (2006). *Home economics: Nationalism and the making of 'migrant workers' in Canada.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Sharma, N. (2011). Canadian multiculturalism and its nationalism. In M. Chazan, L. Helps., A. Stanley, & S. Thakkar (Eds.), *Home and native land: Unsettling multiculturalism in Canada* (pp.85-101). Toronto, ON: Between the Lines

Shea, A. (2012). Perilous territory: Non-status people in Canada. *Oxford Monitor of Forced Migration, 2*(1), 91-105.

Shoemaker, P.J., & Reese, S.D. (1996). *Mediating the message: Theories of influences on mass media content* (2nd edition). White Plains, NY: Longman.

Shragge, E. (1997). Workfare: An overview. In E. Shragge (Ed.), *Workfare: Ideology for a new under-class* (pp.17-34). Toronto: Garamond Press.

Sidel, R. (2000). The enemy within: The demonization of poor women. *Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare*, 27, 1.

Sidhu, N. (2008). The right to learn: Access to public education for non-status immigrants. Social Planning Council of Toronto Retrieved from: http://socialplanningtoronto.org/wp-content/uploads/2009/02/right_to_learn.pdf.

Siemiatycki, M., & Isin, E. (1997). Immigration, diversity and urban citizenship in Toronto. *Canadian Journal of Regional Science, 20*(1-2), 73-102.

Sigona, N. (2012). 'I've too much baggage': The impact of legal status on the social

worlds of irregular migrants. *Social Anthropology / Anthropologie Sociale 20*(1), 50-65.

Sigona, N. & Hughes, V. (2010). *Being children and undocumented in the UK: A background paper*. ESRC Centre on Migration, Policy and Society, University of Oxford.

Simich, L. (2006). Hidden meanings of health security: Migration experiences and systemic barriers to mental well-being among non-status migrants in Canada. *International Journal of Migration, Health and Social Care*, *2*(3/4), 16-27.

Simich, L., Wu, F., & Nerad, S. (2007). Status and health security: An exploratory study of irregular immigrants in Toronto. *Canadian Journal of Public Health*, *98*(5), 369-373.

Simpson, J.S., James, C.E., & Mack, J. (2011). Multiculturalism, colonialism, and racialization:Conceptual starting points. *The Review of Education, Pedagogy and Cultural Studies, 33*(4), 285-305.

Skogen, R. (2012). "Coming into presence" as mentally ill in academia: A new logic of emancipation. *Harvard Educational Review*, *82*(4), 491-512.

Sleeter, C. E. (1996). *Multicultural education as social activism*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.

Smaller, H. (2014). Streaming in Ontario schools. In D. Clandfield, B. Curtis, G-E. Galabuzi, A. Gaymes San Vicente, D. W. Livingstone & H. Smaller (Eds). *Re-stacking the deck: Streaming by class, race and gender in Ontario schools* (pp. 77-112). Ottawa, ON: Our Schools/Our Selves Special Issue.

Smith, A. (2006). Heteropatriarchy and the three pillars of white supremacy: Rethinking women of color organizing. In INCITE! Women of Color Against Violence (Ed.), *Color of violence: The INCITE! anthology* (pp.66-73). Cambridge, MA: South End Press.

Smith, D. (1999). *Writing the social.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Smith, L.T. (1999). *Decolonizing methodologies: Researching Indigenous peoples*. London & New York: Zed Books.

Smith, L.T. (2012). *Decolonizing methodologies: Researching Indigenous peoples* (2nd ed.). London & New York: Zed Books.

Smith-Carrier, T., & Bhuyan, R. (2010). Assessing the impact of neoliberalism on

citizenship: The stratification of social rights by immigration status in Toronto, Ontario. Presented at the workshop on "Producing and Negotiating Precarious Migratory Status in Canada." York University, Toronto: Research Alliance on Precarious Status (September 16). http://www.yorku.ca/raps1/

Smolash, W.N. (2009). Mark of Cain(ada): Racialized security discourse in Canada's national newspapers. *University of Toronto Quarterly, 78*(2), 745-763.

Smolash,W.N. (2011). *Citizenship, race, and nationalism in contemporary English-Canadian newspaper representations of Muslims, Arabs, and South Asians*, Simon Fraser University, Vancouver (unpublished PhD thesis).

Snow, D.A., & Benford, R.D. (1988). Ideology, frame resonance, and participation mobilization. *International Social Movement Research, 1*, 197-217.

Sontag, S. (2003). *Regarding the pain of others*. New York, NY: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.

Spivak, G. (1995) Teaching for the times. In J.N. Petierse & B. Parekh (Eds.) *The decolonization of imagination* (pp.177-195). London, UK: Zed Books.

Srivastava, S. (2006). Tears, fears and careers: Anti-racism and emotion in social movement organizations. *The Canadian Journal of Sociology / Cahiers canadiens de sociologie, 31*(1), 55-90.

Stachel, M. (2009). The political power of definitions and labels: The impact on refugees in Fynn, V.P. (Ed.), *Documenting the undocumented: redefining refugee status* (pp.15-26). Centre for Refugee Studies 2009 annual conference proceedings.

Stafford, J. (1992). The impact of the new immigration policy on racism in Canada. In V. Satzewich (Ed.), *Deconstructing a nation: Immigration, multiculturalism & racism in '90s Canada* (pp.69-91). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Stanley, L. (1990). Moments of writing: Is there a feminist auto/biography? *Gender and History*, *2*, 58-67.

Stasiulis, D. (2002). The active citizen: Lessons from Canadian policy and the children's movement. *Citizenship Studies, 6,* 507-538.

Stasiulis, D. (2004). The active child citizen: Lessons from Canadian policy and the children's movement. Polis Revue Camerounaise De Science Politique, 12, http://www.polis.sciencespobordeaux. fr/vol12ns/stasiulis.pdf

Stasiulis, S. (1997). International migration, rights, and the decline of 'actually existing liberal democracy'. *New Community, 23*(2), 197-214.

Stasiulis, D., & Bakan, A. (2003). *Negotiating citizenship: migrant women in Canada and the global system.* New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

Stasiulis, D., & Jhappan, R. (1995). The fractious politics of a settler society: Canada. In D. Stasiulis & N. Yuval-Davis (Eds.), *Unsettling settler societies: Articulations of gender, race, ethnicity and class* (pp.95-131). London: Sage.

Stasiulis, D., & Yuval-Davis, N. (1995). Beyond dichotomies – Gender, race, ethnicity and class in settler societies. In D. Stasiulis & N. Yuval-Davis (Eds.), *Unsettling settler societies: Articulations of gender, race, ethnicity and class* (pp. 1-38). London: Sage.

Steedman, C. (2000). The watercress seller. In T. Spargo (Ed.), *Reading the past: Literature and history* (pp.18-25). New York: Palgrave.

Steffler, M. (2009). The production and use of the globalized child: Canadian literary and political contexts. *Jeunesse: Young People, Texts, Cultures, 1*(2), 109-124.

Stephens, S. (1994). Children and environment: local worlds and global connections. *Childhood*, *2;* 1-21.

Stephens, S. (1995). Children and the politics of culture in "late capitalism". In S. Stephens (Ed.), *Children and the politics of culture* (pp.3-48). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Stephens, S. (1997). Editorial introduction: Children and nationalism, *Childhood, 4*(1), 5-17.

Stewart, J. (2011). *Supporting refugee children: Strategies for educators*. Toronto, ON, University of Toronto Press.

Stewart, M. J., Neufeld, A., Harrison, M.J., Spitzer, D., Hughes, K., & Makwarimba, E. (2006). Immigrant women family caregivers in Canada: implications for policies and programmes in health and social sectors. *Health and Social Care in the Community, 14* (4), 329–340.

Stoddart, M., Ramos, H., & Tindall, D.B. (2013). Environmentalists' mediawork for Jumbo Pass and the Tobeatic Wilderness, Canada: Combining text-centred and activist-centred approaches to news media and social movements, *Social Movement Studies: Journal of Social, Cultural and Political Protest*, DOI:10.1080/14742837.2013.831344

Storelli, E. (2010). Aging in place: Smith, media texts and the invisible gendered

caregiver. *Thinking Gender Papers*, UCLA Center for the Study of Women, UCLA, http://escholarship.org/uc/item/7p36d41m

Strauss, A. (1987). *Qualitative analysis for social scientists.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research.* Newbury Park: Sage.

Strega, S., & Esquao, S.A. (Eds.). (2009). *Walking this path together: Anti-racist and anti-oppressive child welfare practice.* Halifax, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Stuart, H. (2003). Stigma and the daily news: Evaluation of a newspaper intervention. *Canadian Journal of Psychiatry, 48*(10), 651-656.

Stuart, H., Arboleda-Flórez, & Sartorius, N. (2012). *Paradigms lost: Fighting stigma and the lessons learned.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Strong-Wilson, T. (2007). Moving horizons: Exploring the role of stories in decolonizing the literacy education of white teachers, *International Education, 37*(1), 114-131.

Strong-Wilson, T. (2008). *Bringing memory forward: Storied remembrance in social justice education with teachers.* New York, NY: Peter Lang.

Suárez-Orozco, C., & Suárez-Orozco, M. (2001). *Children of immigration*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Suárez-Orozco, C.; Yoshikawa, H.; Teranishi, R.T. & Suárez-Orozco, M.M. (2011). Growing up in the shadows: The developmental implications of unauthorized status. *Harvard Educational Review, 81*(3), 438-472.

Swadener, B.B. and Lubeck, S. (1995). The social construction of children and families "at risk": An introduction. In Swadener, B.B. & Lubeck, S. (Eds.), *Children and families "at promise": Deconstructing the discourse of risk* (pp1-14). New York: State University of New York Press.

Swift, K.J., & Birmingham, M. (2000). Location, location, location: Restructuring and the everyday lives of 'welfare moms'. In S.M. Neysmith (Ed.), *Restructuring caring labour: Discourses, state practice, and everyday life* (pp.93-115). Don Mills, ON: Oxford University Press.

Swift, K.J. & Callahan, M. (2009). *At risk: Social justice in child welfare and other human services.* Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Swift, K.J. & Parada, H. (2004). Child welfare reform: Protecting children or policing the poor? *Journal of Law and Social Policy*, *19*, 1-17.

Szörényi, A. (2006). The images speak for themselves? Reading refugee coffee-table books. *Visual Studies*, *21*(1), 24–41.

Szörényi, A. (2009). Till human voices wake us: Responding to refugee testimony. *Life Writing*, *6*(2), 173-191.

Taras, D. (1990). *The newsmakers: The media's influence on Canadian politics*. Scarborough: Nelson Canada.

Taras, D. (2001). *Power and betrayal in the Canadian media*. Peterborough, Ont: Broadview Press.

Tator, C., Henry, F., & Mattis, W. (1997). *Challenging racism in the arts*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Teelucksingh, C. (2002). Spatiality and environmental justice in Parkdale (Toronto). *Ethnologies, 24*(1), 119-141.

Teelucksingh, C. (Ed.) (2006). *Claiming space: Racialization in Canadian cities*. Waterloo, ON: Wilfrid Laurier University Press.

Temple, B. & Edwards, R. (2006). Limited exchanges: Approaches to involving people who do not speak English in research and service development. In B. Temble & R. Moran (Eds.), *Doing research with refugees: Issues and guidelines* (pp.37-54). Bristol, UK: The Policy Press, University of Bristol.

Temple, B., & Moran, R. (2006). Introduction. In B. Temble & R. Moran (Eds.), *Doing research with refugees: Issues and guidelines* (pp.1-20). Bristol, UK: The Policy Press, University of Bristol.

Thobani, S. (2000a). Nationalizing Canadians: Bordering immigrant women in the late Twentieth century. *Canadian Journal of Women & Law*, *12,* 279-312.

Thobani, S. (2000b). Closing ranks: Racism and sexism in Canada's immigration policy. *Race & Class*, *42*(1), 35-55.

Thobani, S. (2003). War and the politics of truth-making in Canada. *Qualitative Studies in Education*, *16*(3), 399–414.

Thobani, S. (2007a). *Exalted subjects: Studies in the making of race and nation in Canada.* Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Thobani, S. (2007b).White wars: Western feminisms and the 'war on terror'. *Feminist Theory, 8*(2), 169-185.

Thomas, N., Stainton, T., Jackson, S., Cheung, W.Y., Doubtfire, S., & Webb, A. (2003). 'Your friends don't understand': Invisibility and unmet need in the lives of 'young carers'. *Child and Family Social Work, 8*, 35–46.

Thompson, A. (2003). Tiffany, friend of people of color: White investments in antiracism. *Qualitative Studies in Education, 16*, 7-29.

Thorne, B. (1987). Re-visioning women and social change: Where are the children? *Gender & Society, 1(*1), 85-109.

Thorne, B. (2009). "Childhood": Changing and dissonant meanings. *International Journal of Learning and Media, 1*(1), 19-27.

Thornicroft, G., Rose, D., Kassam, A. & Sartorius, N. (2007). Stigma: Ignorance, prejudice or discrimination? *British Journal of Psychiatry,* 190, 192–3.

Torjman, S. (2011). *Policy challenges: The caregiver/care receiver relationship.* Ottawa, Ontario: Caledon Institute of Social Policy. Retrieved from http://www.caledoninst.org/Publications/Detail/?ID=952&IsBack=0

Trickey, J. (1997). The racist face of "Common Sense", In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.113-121). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Tupper, J. A., & Cappello, M. (2008). Teaching Treaties as (un)usual narratives: Disrupting the curricular commonsense. *Curriculum Inquiry*, *38*, 559–578

Turk, J. (1997). Days of Action: Challenging the Harris corporate agenda. In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.165-175). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Twum-Danso, A. (2009). Situating participatory methodologies in context: The impact of culture on adult-child interactions in research and other projects. *Children's Geographies, 7*(4), 379–389.

United Nations (1989). *Convention on the rights of the child*. New York: United Nations. Retrieved from: http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/crc.htm

United Nations (2002). *A world fit for children.* New York: United Nations. Retrieved from: http://www.unicef.org/specialsession/docs_new/documents/A-RES-S27-2E.pdf

United Nations (2007). *Declaration on the rights of Indigenous Peoples. New York:*

United Nations. Retrieved from: http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/DRIPS_en.pdf

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. (1998). *Comments on Not just numbers: A Canadian framework for future immigration.* Report of the Immigration Legislative Review Advisory Group. Retrieved from: www.web.net/~ccr/hcrlegr.htm.

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. (2005). The protection of refugee and asylum-seeking children, the Convention on the Rights of the Child, and the work of the Committee on the Rights of the Child. Retrieved from: http:www.unhcr.ch.

Valencia, M. (2011). *Yo cuento: Latin American immigrant children tell their stories.* Immigration and Settlement Studies, Ryerson University, Toronto (unpublished master's thesis).

van Dijk, T. (1988). *News as discourse*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

van Dijk, T. (1991). *Racism and the press.* London and New York: Routledge.

van Dijk, T. (1992). Discourse and the denial of racism. *Discourse & Society, 3*(1), 87-118.

van Dijk, T. (1993). *Elite discouse as racism*. London: Sage Publications.

van Dijk, T. (1996). Illegal aliens. *Discourse & Society, 7,* 291-2.

van Dijk, T. (1997). Applied discourse studies. *Discourse & Society, 8*, 451-2.

van Dijk, T. (2006). Ideology and discourse analysis. *Journal of Political Ideologies, 11*(2), 115-140.

Van Hook, J., & Balisteri, K.S. (2006). Ineligible parents, eligible children: Food stamps, allotments, and food insecurity among children of immigrants. *Social Science Research, 35*, 228-251.

Vargas, C. (1999). Cultural interpretation for refugee children: The multicultural liaison program, Ottawa, Canada. *Refuge: Canada's Periodical on Refugees*, *18*(2), 32-42.

Varsanyi, M. (2006). Interrogating 'urban citizenship' vis-à-vis undocumented migration. *Citizenship Studies, 10*(2), 229-249.

Varsanyi, M. (2008). Immigration policing through the backdoor: City Ordinances, the

"Right to the City," and the exclusion of undocumented day laborers. *Urban Geography, 29*(1), 29-52.

Vasquez, V.M. (2004). *Negotiating critical literacies with young children*. Mahwah, NJ; Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Venkatesh, S.A., & Kassimir, R. (2007). Youth and legal institutions: Thinking globally and comparatively. In S.A. Venkatesh & R. Kassimir (Eds.), *Youth, globalization, and the law* (pp.3-16). Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Verkuyten, M. (2004). Emotional reactions to and support for immigrant policies: Attributed responsibilities to categories of asylum seekers. *Social Justice Research, 17*, 293-314.

Veronis, L. (2007). Strategic spatial essentialism: Latin Americans' real and imagined geographies of belonging in Toronto. *Social & Cultural Geography, 8*(3), 455-473.

Villegas, F.J. (2010a). Strategic in/visibility and undocumented migrants, In G.J.S. Dei Simmons, M. (Eds.), *Fanon & education: Thinking through pedagogical possibilitie*s (pp.147-170). New York, NY: Peter Lang.

Villegas, F. (2010b). Getting to DADT at the TDSB: Mapping the competing discourses of rights and membership of institutional stakeholders. Presented at the workshop on "Producing and Negotiating Precarious Migratory Status in Canada." York University, Toronto: Research Alliance on Precarious Status (September 16). http://www.yorku.ca/raps1/

Villegas, F. (2013). Getting to "Don't Ask Don't Tell" at the Toronto District School Board: Mapping the competing discourses of rights and membership. In L. Goldring & P. Landolt (Eds), *Producing and negotiating non-citizenship: Precarious legal status in Canada* (258-273). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Viruru, R. (2005). The impact of postcolonial theory on early childhood education, *Journal of Education*, *35,* 7-29

Vitus, K. (2010). Waiting time: The de-subjectification of children in Danish asylum centres. *Childhood*, *17*(1), 26-41.

Vosko, L. (2006). Crisis tendencies in social reproduction: The case of Ontario's Early Years Plan, In K. Bezanson and Luxton, M. (Eds.), *Social reproduction: Feminist political economy challenges neoliberalism* (pp. 145–172). Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Vukov, T. (2003). Imagining communities through immigration policies. *International Journal of Cultural Studies, 6*(3), 335-353.

Wahl, O.F. (2003). New media portrayal of mental illness: Implications for public policy. *American Behavioral Scientist, 46*, 1594-1600.

Walia, H. (2010). Transient servitude: migrant labour in Canada and the apartheid of citizenship, *Race & Class,* 52(1), 71-84.

Walton-Roberts, M. (2011). Multiculturalism already unbound. In M. Chazan, L. Helps., A. Stanley, & S. Thakkar (Eds.), *Home and native land: Unsettling multiculturalism in Canada* (pp.102-120). Toronto, ON: Between the Lines.

Watters, C. (2008). *Refugee children: Towards the next horizon?* London, England: Routledge.

Weinroth, M. (1997). Deficitism and neo-conservatism in Ontario. In D.S. Ralph, A. Régimbald & N. St-Amand (Eds.), *Open for business, closed to people: Mike Harris's Ontario* (pp.54-67). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Wells, K. (2007). Narratives of liberation and narratives of innocent suffering: The rhetorical uses of images of Iraqi children in the British press. *Visual Communication, 6*(1), 55–71.

West, A. (1999). They make us out to be monsters: Images of children and young people in care. In B. Franklin (Ed.) *Social policy, the media and misrepresentation* (pp.253-267). London and New York: Routledge.

Wiegers, W. (2002). *The framing of poverty as 'child poverty' and its implications for women*. Status of Women Canada.

Wildeman, S. (2013). Protecting rights and building capacities: Challenges to global mental health policy in light of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. *The Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics*, *41*(1), 48-73.

Williams, R. (1983). *Keywords: A vocabulary of culture and society*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Willis, P. (1977). *Learning to labour: How working-class kids get working class jobs.* Farnborough: Saxon House.

Willis, P. (2006). Foot soldiers of modernity: The dialectics of cultural consumption and the twenty-first century school. In H. Lauder, P. Brown, J. Dillabough & A.H. Halsey (Eds.), *Education, globalization & social change* (pp.507-523). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Winter, J. (1997). *Democracy's oxygen: How corporations control the news*. Montreal: Black Rose.

Winter, J. (2002). *Media Think*. Montreal, London and New York: Black Rose Books.

Wood, P.K., & Gilbert, L. (2005). Multiculturalism in Canada: Accidental discourse, alternative vision, urban practice. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research, 29*(3), 679–91.

Wotherspoon, T. (2009). *The sociology of education in Canada: Critical perspectives* (3rd ed.). Don Mills, ON: Oxford University Press.

Wotherspoon, T. and Schissel, B. (2000). Risky business? "At-risk" designations and culturally diverse schooling. A discussion paper submitted to the Council of Ministers of Education Canada Pan-Canadian Education Research Agenda.

Wright, C. (2000). Nowhere at home: Gender, race and the making of anti-immigrant discourse in Canada. *Atlantis*, 24, 2.

Wright, C. (2003). Moments of emergence: Organizing by and with undocumented and non-citizen people in Canada after September 11. *Refuge, 21*(3), 5-15.

Wright, C. (2006). Against illegality: New directions in organizing by and with non-status people in Canada. In C. Frampton, Kinsman, G., Thompson, AK & Tilleczek, K. (Eds.), *Sociology for changing the world: Social movements/social research* (pp.189-208). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Wright, C. (2013). The museum of illegal immigration: Historical perspectives on the production of non-citizens and challenges to immigration controls. In L. Goldring & P. Landolt (Eds), *Producing and negotiating non-citizenship: Precarious legal status in Canada* (pp. 32-54). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Wright, S., & Shore, C. (1995). Towards an anthropology of policy: Morality, power and the art of government. *Anthropology in Action*, 2(2), 27-31.

Wright, T. (2002). Moving images: the media representation of refugees, *Visual Studies, 17*(1), 53-66.

Yau, M. (1995). Refugee students in Toronto schools: An exploratory study (report, Research Department, Toronto Board of Education, Toronto).

Yegenoglu, M. (1998). *Colonial fantasies: Towards a feminist reading of Orientalism.* Cambridge and Melbourne. Cambridge University Press.

Yin, R.K. (1984). *Case study research: Design and methods.* London and New Delhi: Sage.

Young, J. E. E. (2005). 'This is my life': Questions of agency and belonging among youth living with less than full status. Ryerson University, Toronto: Unpublished master's major research paper.

Young, J. E. E. (2011). 'A new politics of the city': Locating the limits of hospitality and practicing the city-as-refuge. *ACME: An International E-Journal for Critical Geographies. 10*(3), 534-563.

Young, J. (2013). "This is my life': Youth negotiating legality and belonging in Toronto. In L. Goldring & P. Landolt (Eds), *Producing and negotiating non-citizenship: Precarious legal status in Canada* (99-117). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Young, J., & Bernhard, J.K. (2013). Confidentiality and "risky" research: Negotiating competing notions of risk in a Canadian university context. In L. Goldring & P. Landolt (Eds), *Producing and negotiating non-citizenship: Precarious legal status in Canada* (305-316). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

List of News Articles

Abbate, G. (1989, Apr 22). School officials assail immigration policies. *The Globe and Mail*, A11.

A failing grade for our schools. (1993, June 12). [Editorial]. *Toronto Star,* D2.

Armstrong, J. (1990, October 28). Minister will push employment equity. *Toronto Star*, A11.

Ballon, D. (1993, March 25). Somali students struggle to adapt to an alien world. *Toronto Star*, D1.

Barber, J. (1995, June 28). Toronto school for refugee children a 'nightmare'. [Column]. *The Globe and Mail,* A2.

Barber, J. (1996, Jan 19). TORONTO city's strength linked to schools' health. *The Globe and Mail*, A8.

Bharat, W. (2004, October 7). Indo-Caribbeans have distinct needs [Letter to the editor]. *Toronto Star*, A25.

Black, D. (1990, Jan 08). Metro schools say lack of funding is hurting their ability to teach immigrant children Who pays the price? *Toronto Star,* C1.

Black, D. (1999, Nov 20). Lack of funding undermines ESL courses; teachers fear immigrant children are being programmed for failure. *Toronto Star*, A1.

Black, D. (2006, April 30). Rally for family set to be deported; Schoolmates come out in force for arrested teens. *Toronto Star*, A04.

Blackwell, T. (2004, May 21). Immigrant children inclined to vote Tory: Breakdown of poll results yields several surprises. *National Post*, A1.

Boyle, T. (1992, January 9). Scarborough tests for spread of TB. *Toronto Star*

Boyle, T. (1999, July 31). Ontario funds project for refugee children. *Toronto Star*, A1.

Boyle, T. (2007, April 19). No-status pupils on agenda; Trustees frustrated no policy to protect children of illegal immigrants, suggest 'sanctuary zones'. *Toronto Star*

Brent, B., & Bill, D. (1992, July 14). Medical tests urged for refugee students. *Toronto Star*, A2.

Brown, L. (2005, Sep 14). Black-only school proposed; All-black school touted for Toronto Race- based classes touted for teens New equity boss says it could work. *Toronto Star,* A1.

Brown, L. (2008, April 02). Keeping immigrant kids in school; researchers suggest new teaching approach will engage those new to English language. *Toronto Star,* A3.

Brown, L. (2008, Aug 21). School board wins prestigious award; Bertelsmann prize honours TDSB for programs with at-risk kids and planned Africentric school. *Toronto Star,* A12.

Canada's fairness a work in progress. (2002, Aug 11). [Editorial]. *Toronto Star*, A12.

Canada's schools fail immigrants. (2004, October 2) [National Report]. *Toronto Star*, H06

Canadian Press. (2002, August 7). Canada criticized over minorities --- U.N. committee points to treatment of aboriginals, others. *Toronto Star*, A09.

Cardozo, A. (1992, June 09). Budget cuts belie tough talk on racism if our politicians are serious about racial harmony, they would create true equality. [Opinion]. *Toronto Star*, A13.

Cardozo, A. (1992, August 21). Anti-racism education pays off in the future. [Opinion]. *Toronto Star*, A27.

Carey, E. (1998, October 27). Immigrant kids better adjusted, study says. *Toronto Star*, A1.

Carey, E. (1999, November 18). Canada violates children's rights: Report; Nation fails the young in 7 areas, group says. *Toronto Star*, A1.

Carey, E. (2000, Jun 20). Young immigrants cite racism; Study says many newcomers lack services to help ease transition. *Toronto Star,* A03.

Carey, E. (2003, Jan 22). Toronto is leading the way; 905 regions increasingly home to immigrants Toronto still has world's highest rate of newcomers. *Toronto Star*, A1.

Carey, E. (2003, Jun 30). Child poverty spreading fast in GTA: Report; Durham, Peel up an 'alarming' 27% minimum wage, immigration cited. *Toronto Star,* A1.

Chamberlain, A. (1999, April, 8). School boards prepare for refugee students. *Toronto Star*, A1.

Children of immigrant mothers more likely to have immunization vaccinations. (2008, May 21). *National Post*, A10.

Contenta, S. (1989, January 11). York Region public schools bar children of refugees. *Toronto Star*, A1.

Contenta, S. (1989, February 23). Ontario teachers reject standard tests for the 3 Rs. *Toronto Star*, A7.

Crawford, T. (1989, Jun 09). New kids in town; Unique school prepares immigrant children for regular schools. *Toronto Star*, C1.

Crawford, T. (1993, Feb 12). What happens when you get out of streaming strait-jacket. *Toronto Star* A27.

Crawford, T. (1995, March 5). Helping hands for homeless: Agencies create parallel universe to get youths off the streets. *Toronto Star*, A14

Cullen, C. (2005, April 27). Refugee advocates plan 200-kilometre march to Ottawa. *The Globe and Mail.* A9.

Cumberland, I. (1993, May 27). Knitting our country together MULTICULTURAL VOICES A woman who came to Canada from Austria in the 1930s wonders whether racism today isn't more a clash of cultures than a question of colour. *The Globe and Mail*, A30.

Cutting our economic lifeline. (2000, Apr 29). [Editorial], *Toronto Star* Retrieved from http://search.proquest.com/docview/438103094?accountid=12339

Curran, M. (1997, January 21). Freedom, justice are lessons students take to heart. *Toronto Star*, A13.

Daly, R. (1989, May 2). Racial harmony depends on equal opportunities, citizenship winner says. *Toronto Star*, E3.

Daly, R. (1992, Oct 14). English, then jobs, immigrants learn. *Toronto Star*, A1.

Daly, R. (1992, November 11). North York students talk peace, not war. *Toronto Star*, A2.

De Haynal, S.K. (1989, July 10). Immigrants' kids can learn language fast [Letter to the editor]. *Toronto Star,* A14.

DeMara, B. (1989, Jan 18). Immigrants let schools raise kids forum told. *Toronto Star,* A20.

Dexter, B. (1999, December 23). Not enough action in fight for kids' rights. *Toronto Star,* 1.

De Souza, R. (2008, Oct 09). The Asian immigrant work ethic. *National Post*, A19.

Dimanno, R. (2004, Mar 15). Immigrants isolated? Tell that to their children. *Toronto Star,* A02.

Duffy, A. (1993, Jun 04). Seventh in a ten-part series. *Toronto Star* A1.

Duffy, A. (1993, Jul 07). Do gifted students need a special high school? Taxpayers are helping to keep Darrell Tan, a doctor's son, at UTS. The education minister's decision to eliminate the $1.3 million grant to the school has prompted a debate about excellence, fairness, and elitism. *Toronto Star*, A23.

Duffy, A. (2004, Sep 27). Needs are vast in ethnic enclaves; most pressure in Toronto, Vancouver sky-rocketing demand for ESL classes. *Toronto Star*, A01.

Duffy, A. (2004, Sep 30). Paving the way to success; communities, schools offer newcomers help three innovative programs give students support, *Toronto Star*, A06.

Duffy, A. (2004, Oct 02). Boards should make immigrant students priority little research is being done into their unique needs. *Toronto Star,* A26.

Dunphy, C. (1989, Jan 27). Only a dream. *Toronto Star*, B1.

English class. (1991, Sep 25). [Editorial]. *Toronto Star,* A24.

Evenson, B. (1998, Oct 29). Working mothers have smart kids too, study finds: Contradicts other research. *National Post*, A6.

Ferenc, L. (2006, May 9). Facing deportation, family hopes to win stay until school year ends; Agreement proposes that detained mother be released today Parents, children would have to return to Costa Rica in July. *Toronto Star*, A02.

Francis, D. (1999, Aug 21). These refugees and immigrants can be deadly: Adequate medical screening process doesn't exist. *National Post*, D3.

Friesen, J. (2009, Nov 23). Ending child poverty: A promise unfulfilled. *The Globe and Mail*, A3.

Funston, M. (1995, Sep 29). Redirect language funding to ESL: MP. *Toronto Star,* MS1

Funston, M. (2001, May 24). Apology is demanded from McCallion; Mayor says remarks about immigration distorted in print. *Toronto Star*, B05.

Galt, V. (1993, Aug 24). Teachers fear thin classroom fare social-contract basics don't make an education, school officials say. *The Globe and Mail*, A1.

Galt, V. (1998, March 3). Schools fear for immigrant students. Cuts could hurt services, board says. *The Globe and Mail*, A9

Galt, V. (1999, June 29). Education: Is it really as bad as we think? Canadians are deeply divided over the state of their schools. Many pine for the good old days. Should they? [Column]. *The Globe and Mail*, A1.

Gerard, W. (1996, May 11). Education funding facing turf war crisis gaps between rich, poor boards could stir Tory schools takeover. *Toronto Star*, A19.

Gershon, G. (2005, October 17). Schools need funds to help immigrants. [Opinion] *Toronto Star*, A23.

Goar, C. (2005, Jun 20). Back to the future in education. [Column]. *Toronto Star,* A18.

Gombu, P. (2006, November 28). 'Don't ask' policy on illegals under fire; Public's safety is being 'compromised,' border official warns Toronto police. *Toronto Star* With files from Canadian Press.

Granatstein, J. L. (1999, Aug 28). Canada's historical evolution: Research abroad and in Canada has questioned the existence of a common public memory. Is this a new trend? Does it matter in an increasingly technologically oriented present? And if something is to be done, what dangers and challenges lie in invigorating a common history?: A politically correct history leads to a distorted past and a bleak future. *National Post*, B5.

Hanes, A. (2008, November 21). Immigration policy gets gut by police chief; 'Don't Tell'; Officers can't turn blind eye to suspected violations: Blair. *National Post*, A15.

Help the children of new Canadians (1989, Feb 13). [Editorial] *Toronto Star*, A12.

Horne, L. (2006, March 24). Many born here. [Letter to the editor] *Toronto Star*, A27

How Ottawa fails migrant children (1989, June 11). [Editorial] *Toronto Star*, B2.

Hurst, L. (1992, November 8). Deadly tuberculosis makes a quiet return. *Toronto Star*, A1

Ibbitson, J. (2007, Jun 30). Should we can Canadian history? *The Globe and Mail*, F7.

Immigrants' education challenge. (2008, May 06). [Editorial]. *Toronto Star*, A6.

Immigrant kids a gift to Canada, teacher says. (1990, Jul 05). *Toronto Star,* N4.

Including immigrants (1993, June 30). [Editorial] *Toronto Star*, A22.

Irish, P. (2001, November 23). A real Toronto welcome. *Toronto Star*, B04.

Jiménez, M. (2006, Jul 11). Canada not welcoming to immigrants, study finds. *The Globe and Mail*, A6.

Jiménez, M. (2006, October 25). Refugees to press Ottawa on $550 landing fee; Financial burden often means delays in reuniting families. *The Globe and Mail,* A4.

Jiménez, M., & Alphonso, C. (2006, May 2). Pupils held in asylum case spark review. *The Globe and Mail*, A1.

Johnson, R. (2005, Oct 13). Thwarting great expectations. [Opinion]. *Toronto Star,* A25.

Josey, S. (1989, Dec 28). School new world for immigrant children. *Toronto Star*, N5.

Kalinowski, T. (2003, Sep 26). Urban kids need ESL study$2.1B for schools; immigrants seen struggling without language support students falling behind in studies, educators say. *Toronto Star,* B01.

Kalinowski, T. (2006, Mar 08). ESL students shortchanged; 40% of GTA schools with ESL students lack teachers new study by people for education to be released today. *Toronto Star,* B01.

Keung, N. (2004, Aug 19). Immigrants put strain on city services. *Toronto Star*, A14.

Keung, N. (2005, Apr 22). Governor-general's job? Students say 'no thanks'; downtown school included in tour 'you are Canada' Clarkson tells kids. *Toronto Star,* F07.

Keung, N. (2005, Apr 28). ESL teachers return to classroom; conference offers new approaches called 'advocates' for newcomers. *Toronto Star,* B02.

Keung, N. (2005, September 5). School a first for refugee, 9; Girl counting down the hours to her first classes ever She can't read or write, but begins education in Grade 3. *Toronto Star*, A02

Keung, N. (2006, Jan 19). Speech therapist. *Toronto Star,* A03.

Keung, N. (2006, May 26). Board endorses 'don't ask, don't tell'. *Toronto Star*, F02.

Keung, N. (2006, July 25). Refugees fight to keep status; Abuse victim won case in 2004 Government in new bid to deport them. *Toronto Star*, B02.

Keung, N. (2007, April 12). Students left in fear of deportation; Immigration issues in schools prompt group to push for 'don't ask, don't tell' policy. *Toronto Star*

Keung, N. (2008, May 05). Former 'brown kid' writes book to aid newcomers; Toronto author's experiences help her in quest to prepare young immigrants for life here. *Toronto Star,* L1.

Keung, N. (2009, May 3). Marchers protest migrants' roundup; Advocates decry raids that led to deportation of foreign workers. *Toronto Star*, A03.

Keung, N. (2009, November 24). A voice for kids too afraid to go to school. *Toronto Star*, GT08.

Koehl, A. (2002, May 10). Locked out of the classroom --- The children of illegal immigrants are being denied the right to education and the surprising part is that it's happening here in Ontario. [Opinion]. *Toronto Star*, A25.

Kopun, F. (2006, Apr 06). Ambition strongest among teen immigrants; majority want at least one degree More drive than Canadian-born Study. *Toronto Star,* A08.

Kuitenbrouwer, P. (2006, Mar 04). Head of the class: *National Post*, TO8.

Kyvrikosaios, D. (1993, May 10). Return of routine school TB tests weighed increased risk of tuberculosis for students, staff linked to high immigration. *The Globe and Mail*, A3.

Last year alone, property taxpayers in Metro paid about $86...(1992, April 15). [Editorial] *Toronto Star*, A22.

Lewington, J. (1992, Dec 28). EDUCATION ON TRIAL Conflict over the classroom leads to politics of blame THE VERDICT A strong parallel with the failed constitutional compromise can be drawn. There is no consensus on what Canadians expect from schools. *The Globe and Mail*, A2.

Lewington, J. (1994, Dec 27). Pupil achievement linked to income race found to play lesser role. *The Globe and Mail*, A1.

Lowes, C., & Stawicki, A. (2001, October 28). Searching for a home --- Concerns being raised concerning plight of child refugees without their parents. *Toronto Star*, O6.

Mahoney, J. (2007, Dec 06). Leaping over educational adversity. *The Globe and Mail*, A17.

Marlow, I. (2007, Jul 02). Crimes by kids go unreported principal; new immigrant parents deal with problems within community, not through police. *Toronto Star*, A6.

Maychak, M. (1989, January 11). Stop turning away kids of refugees, York schools told. *Toronto Star*, A1

McInnes, C. (1993, May 03). First you have to learn English URBAN STRUGGLE "If the ESL students are failing, then the entire system is failing" THE CULTURAL JIGSAW: Putting the pieces together One of a series. *The Globe and Mail*, A1.

McLaren, C. (1991, February 27). JAMMED AT THE DOOR: Refugees in Canada: Big-city schools and other services are clamouring for more resources to serve the special needs of newcomers 'We've lost control of our border,' critics say. *The Globe and Mail*, A4.

Mick, H., & O'Reilly, N. (2006, November 29). Probe drug squad, Ontario urged; Police board asks Attorney-General to approve public inquiry into allegation. *The Globe and Mail.*

Mojab, S., & Pashang, S. (2006, May 5). Amnesty not right policy for country: A response to the article; "Clampdown on illegals shames Canada [Opinion]". *Toronto Star*, A19.

Moore, O. (2006, May 9). Facing deportation, teens ask for more time. *The Globe and Mail,* A11.

Money can't end poverty; to really help the poor, abolish excessive taxes and regulations. (2009, Nov 26). [Editorial], *National Post* A22.

Muldoon, K. (1997, September 6). Alone in the cold, cold city. *Toronto Star,* M.20.

Nangwaya, A. (2008, October 3). Immigration reform needed. [Letter to the editor]. *Toronto Star,* A05.

Paraskevas, J. (2003, Nov 25). One in six kids lives in poverty, group says, *National Post* A4.

Paris, E. (1995, Mar 04). Adapting to Canada ... and racism An anthropology professor links problems experienced by the Caribbean community with pervasive racism in Canadian society THE CARIBBEAN DIASPORA IN TORONTO: Learning to live with racism. *The Globe and Mail*, C24.

Philp, M. (1996, Feb 21). School opens door to 'motel kids' programs tailored for students who live in temporary housing alleviate the stigma of being homeless. *The Globe and Mail*, A8.

Picard, A. (2007, January 5). Immigrants often need vaccinations, tests show; One-half to one-quarter not protected against infectious childhood diseases. *The Globe and Mail*

Picard, A. (2007, August 14). Governments failing native children with severe medical problems, report says. *The Globe and Mail*

Roberts, B. (2006, Apr 17). We must not fail our children again. [Opinion]. *Toronto Star*, A15.

Roche, D. (1990, August 2). A 'peace dividend' for world's young? *Toronto Star*, A23.

Sallot, J. (1994, July 1). World view: What July 1 means in Rwanda. *The Globe and Mail*, A15.

Sarick, L. (1994, Jun 13). Students bloom for hired help LEARNING CURVE / the use of a counselling agency for children with special needs has paid off. *The Globe and Mail*, A7.

Sarick, L. (1999, April 15). Immigrant children's ills outlined. New guide for health-care workers offers advice on special problems of young newcomers. *The Globe and* Mail, A10.

Schmidt, S. (2003, Jun 16). Spelling bee cuts through class, culture: *National Post*, A2.

Scrivener, L. (1994, June 12). Teachers bring creative solutions to classroom. *Toronto Star*, A11.

Siddiqui, H. (2002, March 14). Let's stop immigrant-bashing; Census data shows this is a good time to call on Hazel McCallion, Mike Harris and immigrant-baiters in the ranks of the Canadian Alliance and elsewhere to stop whining about newcomers. *Toronto Star*, A27.

Shakir, U. (2009, June 27). Immigration's tough new face. [Editorial]. *Toronto Star*, IN06.

Shoalts, D. (1993, Nov 25). GUIDE TO EDUCATION FAST FORWARD Are immigrant students moving ahead too quickly? *The Globe and Mail*, C7.

Shimko, L. (1989, Apr 24). Fight bias, Ontario teachers urged. *The Globe and Mail*, A12.

Shimo, A. (2006, June 29). Tearful family ordered back to Costa Rica. *The Globe and Mail*, A10.

Smith, C. (1997, April 19). Of tortured children and tax cuts. *Toronto Star*, C6.

Sokoloff, H. (2002, Nov 05). Number of hungry children rises 33%: 'These children are still desperately poor,' Louise Hanvey, author of child poverty report says (Toronto/early edition headline); Report points to rise in child hunger: 'These children are still desperately poor,' Louise Hanvey, author of child poverty report, says (all but Toronto/early headline). *National Post*, A6.

Srikanthan, T. (2006, May 28). 'Afraid every morning I wake up'; Illegal immigrants take to the streets. *Toronto Star*, A04.

Stoffman, D. (1992, September 21). The high costs of our refugee system. *Toronto Star*, A19.

Taylor, L.C. (2008, October 3). Protest highlights the plight of Mexican refugee claimants; Ottawa must stop deportation orders against women who fled violence, rally told. *Toronto Star*, A19.

Taylor, P. (1989, Jun 08). Racial gaps documented in report on schools. *The Globe and Mail*, A1.

Tesher, E. (1995, July 21). Let's open doors for child refugees. *Toronto Star*, A2.

Tesher, E. (2000, Oct 31). Classrooms can't afford more cuts. *Toronto Star*, A23.

The challenges of integration. (2008, Jan 15). [Editorial]. *Toronto Star,* AA4.

The language of immigration. (1998, Mar 05). [Editorial] *The Globe and Mail*, A18.

Toronto needs money to fight tuberculosis now. (2002, Jan 11). *Toronto Star*, F02.

Trustees can still make a difference. (2003, Nov 03). [Editorial]. *Toronto Star,* A22.

Tyler, T. (1989, April 23). Refugee children suffer in schools, teachers are told. *Toronto Star*, A3

Valpy, M. (1990, Sep 27). CITYSTATE important immigrant reports due soon. *The Globe and Mail*, A9.

Valpy, M. (1995, November 30). Ontario's fiscal psychology [column]. *The Globe and Mail*, A21.

Vienneau, D. (1989, June 7). Schools are swamped by immigrants who can't speak English, study says. *Toronto Star*, A1.

Vienneau, D. (1989, June 7). Kids without English swamp schools: Study. *Toronto Star*, A30.

Vienneau, D. (1990, October 24). Racist backlash may be on way, trustees warn. *Toronto Star*, A19.

Waese, M. (1990, November 19). Metro schools can’t meet the needs of immigrants. [Letter to the editor]. Toronto Star, A18.

Watson, P. (1991, September 22). Schools try to teach kids from 7 lands. *Toronto Star*, A1.

Wright, L. (1990, Nov 26). Immigrant service faces axe. *Toronto Star,* A7.