Envisioning New Futures:

Portrait Photographs of Black Victorians in Montreal, 1861–1901

Sandra Evoughlian

Department of Art History and Communication Studies

McGill University, Montreal

August 2018

A thesis submitted to McGill University

in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the Degree of

Master of Arts

© Sandra Evoughlian, 2018

# **Table of Contents**

Abstract/Résumé	1
Acknowledgements	2
List of Figures	3
Introduction	6
Seeing and Being Seen: Photography, Race, and Self-Representation in Nineteenth-Century Montreal I. Introduction II. Migration and Mobility III. Picturing the Bourgeoisie IV. Barriers to Self-Representation V. Women (and Men) at Work: Images of Self-Possession under Servitude	<b>19</b> 19 21 26 30 34
VI. Conclusion	41
Cultivating Identities outside the Frame: Self-Fashioning and the Matter of Visibility I. Introduction II. The Studio as Theatre III. Light and the Limits of Visibility IV. Clothing and Fugitivity V. Challenging Racial Constructions of Gender through Fashion VI. Conclusion	<b>43</b> 43 44 50 56 60 70
Imagined Geographies: Parallel Visions of CanadaI. IntroductionII. The Production of Canadian IdentityIII. Problematizing the "Picturesque"IV. Reorienting the GazeV. Aesthetic NetworksVI. Conclusion	72 73 81 87 97 101
Conclusion	103
Appendix I. Map of Key Locations in Montreal (1861–1901) II. Photographers in Montreal (1861–1901)	<b>109</b> 109 110
Figures	117
Bibliography	139

### Abstract/Résumé

William Notman was the most renowned photographer in nineteenth-century Canada and was internationally recognized for his portraits of prominent Canadians. The catalogue of work produced at his Montreal studio has been immaculately preserved at the Notman Photographic Archives in Montreal, Canada. Among the collection are photographs of black subjects who for the first time in history had access to a democratized form of visual self-representation that was accessible across class lines, easily-disseminated, and more "truthful" than earlier forms of artistic production. Photography emerged alongside the wake of industrialization, the abolition of transatlantic slavery, and the formation of Canada as a nation. The photographs of black Victorians in Canada are grossly understudied despite their significance to the history of Canadian art and visual culture, and the longstanding study of black sitters in portrait photography in the United States. This thesis explores the ways in which black Canadians imagined, documented, and delineated their citizenship, belonging, personhood, and freedom through photography at the most eminent studio in early Canada. As a tool, photography had the potential to disrupt hegemonic representations, and materially concretize ambitions beyond the limitations of centuries of misrepresentation and contemporaneous opposition to racially marginalized citizens and immigrants. In conclusion, by examining photographs of black Victorians in Montreal, this thesis contributes to a greater understanding of the pluralism of black Canadian histories, the formation of a national imaginary, legacies of representation, and photography's function within the Americas.

William Notman était le photographe le plus renommé du Canada au XIXe siècle et était reconnu internationalement pour ses portraits de personnages canadiens d'importance historique. Le catalogue des œuvres produites à son studio de Montréal a été très bien conservé aux archives photographiques Notman à Montréal au Canada. La collection comprend des portraits de sujets noirs qui pour la première fois dans l'histoire avaient accès à une méthode démocratique de leur représentation visuelle. Ces photographies étaient accessibles à travers les différentes classes sociales, faciles à diffuser et plus «authentiques» que les formes d'art antérieures. La photographie a émergé dans le sillage de l'industrialisation, de l'abolition de la traite transatlantique des esclaves et de la formation du Canada en tant que nation. Les photographies de Victoriens noirs au Canada sont très peu étudiées, malgré leur importance pour l'histoire de l'art et de la culture visuelle canadienne et l'étude de longue date de la photographie noire aux États-Unis. Ce mémoire explore les façons dont les Canadiens noirs ont imaginé, documenté et délimité leur citoyenneté, leur appartenance, leur identité et leur liberté en utilisant la photographie dans le studio le plus éminent du Canada. En tant qu'outil, la photographie avait le potentiel de perturber les représentations hégémoniques en contestant la pratique antérieure et contemporaine de la fausse représentation visuelle des citoyens et immigrants racialement marginalisés. Pour conclure, en examinant des photographies de Victoriens noirs à Montréal, cette thèse contribue à une meilleure compréhension du pluralisme des histoires noires canadiennes, de la formation d'un imaginaire national, des héritages de la représentation et des pratiques photographiques à travers les Amériques.

#### Acknowledgements

Firstly, I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisor, Charmaine A. Nelson, for her continuous guidance and astute feedback. Although this research has been challenging at times, her comments have been an anchor. Furthermore, aspects of this thesis developed from a seminar course I took with Dr. Nelson, and the term paper I wrote for that class, which came to be one of my favourites. Secondly, I wish to thank my examiner, Will Straw, for his thorough review and from whom I have also enjoyed learning. By extension, I would like to convey my great appreciation to the department for their support of this work through the Bram Garber Fellowship in Art History.

As always, the backbone of museums and archives consists of those who meticulously oversee their collections and generously extend their expertise to the public. In this regard, I am grateful to Virginie Tricot and Heather McNabb, archivists at the McCord Museum. Special thanks must go to Heather whose extensive knowledge of the Notman Photographic Archives has been tremendously insightful. I would also like to thank Hélène Samson, Curator of Photography at the McCord. I had the fortune of beginning this thesis concurrent to a new exhibition on Notman, and her pithy remarks have added clarity in situations where the extant scholarship is ambiguous. I must also thank the staff and archivists at the Archives of Ontario, who have been a pleasure to work with on the numerous occasions I visited, and those at the Georgia Historical Society Research Center for delving into their records.

Finally, as with all research, the bulk of this project was made possible due to the university library. I made full use of (devoured) its books and resources. The librarians, archivists, staff and collections of the McLennan-Redpath Library may be what I will most sorely miss about McGill. Similar sentiments can be communicated for the staff at other research libraries in Quebec and Ontario, particularly Anna M. Grant, archivist at Bishop's University, who has fielded my queries about students of long ago.

### **List of Figures**

- 1.1 William Notman, *Picture Book No. 8, I-7320 to I-8363*. 1863, 40 x 27 cm, N-0000.1956.1.8. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.2 William Notman, *Mr. John Anderson*. 1861, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8 x 5 cm, I-0.55.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.3 Unknown artist, Yours Truly John Anderson. 1863, frontispiece from Harper Twelvetrees, ed., The Story of the Life of John Anderson, the Fugitive Slave (London: W. Tweedie, 1863). Image courtesy of the University Library, The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill.
- 1.4 William Notman, *Osborne Morton*. 1863, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen paper, 8 x 5 cm, I-9503.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.5 William Notman, *Joseph Craig, Plasterer*. 1862, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8 x 5 cm, I-3727.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.6 William Notman and Son, *Harry Sinker, Jockey*. 1892, silver salts on glass, gelatin dry plate process, 17 x 12 cm, II-98889. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.7 William Notman, *Robert S. Duncanson, Artist.* 1864, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-11978.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.8 William Notman, *Robert S. Duncanson, Artist.* 1864, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-11979.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.9 William Notman, *Dr. Davis.* 1875, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17 x 12 cm, II-18419.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.10 William Notman and Son, *Dr. Rohlehr*. 1897, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, 17 x 12 cm, II-121342.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.11 Notman and Sandham, *Miss Guilmartin*. 1877, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17.8 x 12.7 cm, II-45957.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.12 William Notman and Son, *Miss Guilmartin*. 1885, silver salts on glass, gelatin dry plate process, 17 x 12 cm, II-77923.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.13 William Notman, *Mrs. McWill and Mrs. Ringold's Servants*. 1873, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17 x 12 cm, I-89124.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.14 William Notman, *E. J. Samson, St. Alban's Militia.* 1873, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17 x 12 cm. I-89035.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.15 William Notman and Son, *Ransom Guards, St. Albans, Vermont, Composite.* 1873, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, composite photograph, N-0000.73.11. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.16 Unknown photographer, *Mrs. Farquharson, Copied in 1867.* 1867, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-28756.0.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.17 Unknown photographer, *Nurse and Baby, Copied for Mrs. Farquharson in 1868.* 1868, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-31290.0.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.18 William Notman and Son, *Baby Paikert and Nurse*. 1901, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, 8.5 x 5.6 cm. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.19 William H. Buckley, *Nanny with the Children in Her Care, Guysborough.* c. 1900, 1985-386/216. Buckley Family Fonds, Nova Scotia Archives, Halifax.

- 1.20 William Notman, *Mrs. Cowan's Nursemaid.* 1871, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8 x 5 cm, I-66067.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 1.21 William Notman, *Missie D. Cowan.* 1871, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17.8 x 12.7 cm, I-66066.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 2.1 Unknown artist, Untitled (Primary Operating Room in Notman's Studio). 1866, from The Philadelphia Photographer 3, no. 32, August 1866.
- 2.2 Unknown artist, Untitled (Secondary Operating Room in Notman's Studio). 1866, from The Philadelphia Photographer 3, no. 29, May 1866.
- 2.3 William Notman, *Thomas Waites*. 1862, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-3312.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 2.4 William Notman, *George E. Jones.* 1863, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8 x 5 cm, I-8338.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 2.5 Unknown photographer, *Mr. Jones, Copied in 1868.* 1868, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-33528.0.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 2.6 Unknown photographer, *Mr. Jones, Copied in 1868.* 1868, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-32559.0.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 2.7 William Notman, *H. Evans and Lady.* 1871, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 9 x 5.6 cm, I-66017.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 2.8 Notman and Sandham, *B. Harris*. 1880, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17.8 x 12.7 cm, II-56583.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 2.9 William Notman and Son, *Lincoln Marlin*. 1886, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17.8 x 12.7 cm, II-81978.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 2.10 H.Y.S., *Halifax. "Now That the Marquis's Come, Plaids Are All the Fashion."* 1878, from *The Canadian Illustrated News* 18, no. 24, December 14, 1878.
- 2.11 William Notman and Son, *Mr. Hickey, Blackface Theatre Performer.* 1896, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17.8 x 12.7 cm, II-115184.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 2.12 Edward Jump, "The Apple of My Eye" (The Burnt Cork Fraternity. Hogan and Mudge's Minstrels in Their Comicalities). 1872, from The Canadian Illustrated News 6, no. 17, October 26, 1872.
- 2.13 Edward Jump, Washing Up (The Burnt Cork Fraternity. Hogan and Mudge's Minstrels in Their Comicalities). 1872, from The Canadian Illustrated News 6, no. 17, October 26, 1872.
- 3.1 William Notman, "*Young Canada,*" *William McFarlane Notman.* 1867, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 14 x 10 cm, I-24436.1, McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 3.2 Unknown artist, *Old and Young Canada*. 1884, from *The Winter Carnival Illustrated* (Montreal: George Bishop and Co., 1884).
- 3.3 Thomas Worth for Currier and Ives, *A Team Fast on the Snow (Darktown Comics* series). 1883, chromolithograph, 57.300.316. Museum of the City of New York.
- 3.4 William Notman and Son, *G. Conway and Friends*. 1901, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, 17 x 12 cm, II-138423.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.
- 3.5 Rudolph Eickemeyer Jr., *The Peanut Field*. c. 1900, from *The Photographic Times* 32, no. 4, April 1900.
- 3.6 Jean-François Millet, *The Gleaners*. 1857, oil on canvas, 83.5 x 110 cm, RF 592. Musée d'Orsay, Paris.

- 3.7 H.Y.S., *Halifax Negroes Bringing in Evergreens for the Arches*. 1878, from *The Canadian Illustrated News* XVIII, no. 24, December 14, 1878.
- 3.8 William England, *A Wayside Scene, Canada*. 1859, albumen silver print with applied colour, 7.2 x 14.7 cm, 21655. National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa.
- Unknown photographer, *Two Women with Niagara Falls Backdrop*. c. 1880-1900,
   tintype, 6.4 × 5.1 cm, RG 63. Richard Bell Family Fonds, Brock University Archives,
   Brock University, St. Catharines. Image courtesy of the Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto.

### Introduction

There have been places where, and times when the black man of modern times has proven himself the *patriot*, the *statesman*, and the *warrior*. As such, then, let him be known to the world, that it may acknowledge it, and to our youth, that they may imitate their example and copy their virtues.

We suffer more perhaps, from false representation, than all other ills put together. Those amongst us who have acted the part of patriot, are represented to be vicious and ungovernable; and those whom the most direful and crushing prejudices have debarred from the opportunities for higher development are represented as submissive willing underlings. Generation after generation are stamped with the same false impressions, and learn to assume it on the one hand, and regard it as a fixed inevitable fact on the other.

—J. N. Still, Frederick Douglass' Paper, May 4, 1855<sup>1</sup>

In 1855, John N. Still of Brooklyn, Long Island, posted an advertisement, excerpted in the above epigraph, in *Frederick Douglass' Paper* to procure the interest of churches and societies in exhibiting a Diorama of Uncle Tom's Cabin throughout the northern United States and Canada. Reprinted in the *Provincial Freeman*, a black-owned newspaper in Toronto, Still's advertisement reveals the significance of self-representation to black people in the Americas.<sup>2</sup> He indicates that the painted scenes "are the production of an eminent French artist, and show as large as life."<sup>3</sup> However, John N. Still intended to add to this exhibition a story of his own: that of his parents' and brother's escape from slavery. Concerned with the inaccuracy of Harriet Beecher Stowe's novel *Uncle Tom's Cabin* (1852), Still sought to use his own experiences and knowledge as the brother of Peter Still – a man who purchased his own freedom – to correct the falsehoods in Stowe's narrative, including the "deplorable and humiliating aspect of the colored man's case, represented in that work."<sup>4</sup> In the same advertisement, Still indicates his aspiration to

<sup>1</sup> J.N. Still, "Exhibitions and Lectures," Frederick Douglass' Paper, May 4, 1855.

<sup>2</sup> J.N. Still, "Exhibitions and Lectures," *Provincial Freeman*, May 19, 1855, 43. A short notice about the diorama was also published in the *Provincial Freeman* on May 5, 1855 ("Diorama of Uncle Tom's Cabin," *Provincial Freeman*, May 5, 1855, 34).

<sup>3</sup> Still, "Exhibitions and Lectures," *Frederick Douglass' Paper*, May 4, 1855. The paintings are described as the work of "an eminent Parisian Artist" in "'Uncle Tom's Cabin': A Grand Exhibition of the Diorama of Uncle Tom's Cabin," *Newport Mercury*, July 28, 1855.

<sup>4</sup> John Nelson Still was also the brother of William Still, organizer of the Underground Railroad. See: John Stauffer, *The Works of James McCune Smith: Black Intellectual and Abolitionist* (Oxford: Oxford University Press,

create another presentation in the future, "representing not only an entirely original, but a far more hopeful aspect of the black man, than has ever been presented to the American public."<sup>5</sup> Specifically, he wished to create an exhibition illuminating "Distinguished Colored Men" who had played significant roles in the history of the Americas.<sup>6</sup>

It is unclear whether he was able to pursue this second undertaking, but the impetus behind both of these exhibitions is evident: an astute awareness of the need to counter narratives that distorted and overwrote the self-emancipation and humanity of black people. To assert a more truthful history and representation, he chose as his project the creation of images, specifically the Diorama, an art form that was wholly reflective of the period's convergence of public spheres, and the preoccupation with vision in a world whose social structures were being constantly negotiated in the wake of industrialism. John N. Still was an anti-slavery activist, the owner of a second-hand clothing and tailor shop, an elder of a Presbyterian church, and an elected delegate to the Colored National Convention.<sup>7</sup> Although his recognition of the significance of image production to understandings of the self and others is apparent in his exhibition plans, one could also extend this notion to the ways in which he used his political,

<sup>2006), 137</sup>n160; and William Still, *The Underground Rail Road: A Record of Facts, Authentic Narratives, Letters,* &c., *Narrating the Hardships, Hair-Breadth Escapes and Death Struggles of the Slaves in Their Efforts for Freedom, As Related by Themselves and Others, or Witnessed by the Author* (Philadelphia: Porter and Coates, 1872). Peter Still later published his account as a book: Kate E. R. Pickard, *The Kidnapped and the Ransomed: Being the Personal Recollections of Peter Still and His Wife Vina, After Forty Years of Slavery* (Syracuse: William T. Hamilton, 1856). Quote from J.N. Still, "Exhibitions and Lectures," *Frederick Douglass' Paper*, May 4, 1855. 5 Still, "Exhibitions and Lectures," *Frederick Douglass' Paper*, May 4, 1855.

<sup>6</sup> Still, "Exhibitions and Lectures," *Frederick Douglass' Paper*, May 4, 1855. John N. Stills identifies the following men for his new Diorama: Crispus Attucks who was the first American killed by British soldiers in the American Revolution, the black troops at the Battle of New Orleans, and those who led the Haitian Revolution.
7 For information on Still's advocacy for the investment of wages in black-owned banks and businesses, see Derrick R. Spires, "Black Theories of Citizenship in the Early United States, 1793-1860" (PhD diss., Vanderbilt University, 2012), 198n97. He is listed as a tailor in *Smith's Brooklyn Directory* (Brooklyn: William H. Smith, 1856), 297. For more on his business: John N. Still and Co., "Circular to Clothes Dealers and Barber-Shop Keepers," *Frederick Douglass' Paper*, August 21, 1851; J. N. Still and Co., "To Colored Men of Business," *Frederick Douglass' Paper*, April 14, 1854. Still was an elder of Siloam Presbyterian Church in Brooklyn (Stauffer, *The Works of James McCune Smith*, 134n98). On his election as a Brooklyn delegate, see Frederick Douglass, "Call for a National Colored Convention," *Frederick Douglass' Paper*, May 20, 1853.

social, and business activities (fashion and artifice were integral to affirming the freedoms of the wearer) to advocate for the dignity and citizenship of black Americans. Still's family was self-liberated, and he engaged in self-fashioning and self-representation throughout all aspects of his life. Like many of his contemporaries, he was not only participating in a project of aesthetic self-possession and individuation, but also one of using visual literacy to configure public spheres through a historical reclamation of one's likeness.

Departing from traditional historiographies of Daguerre's Diorama that merely attend to its significance as a precursor to photography, Stephen C. Pinson analyses Daguerre's career in theatre as a stage designer and backdrop painter to situate his invention of the Diorama within a changing salon public – namely one with increased commercialization, a growing bourgeoisie, and greater access to leisure and spectacle by the working class.<sup>8</sup> Recognizing an opportunity to create a market positioned between popular entertainment and the highly regulated official theatre system, Daguerre conceived of the Diorama.<sup>9</sup> Promoted as a spectacle that appealed to "*toutes les classes*" and "*la bonne compagnie*," the Diorama was a space that signified "an awareness of social power shifting from the aristocracy to the bourgeoisie, and from property to capital."<sup>10</sup> Good taste and idleness were no longer the exclusive domain of the aristocrat.<sup>11</sup> Inspired by the private salon and theatre – both sites where members of fashionable society were concerned with "seeing and being seen" – the Diorama signalled a negotiation in definitions of the self between the aristocrat, bourgeoisie, and amateur.<sup>12</sup>

<sup>8</sup> Stephen C. Pinson, *Speculating Daguerre: Art and Enterprise in the Work of L. J. N. Daguerre* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012).

<sup>9</sup> Pinson, Speculating Daguerre, 31. The Diorama opened in July 1822.

<sup>10</sup> Pinson, Speculating Daguerre, 48.

<sup>11</sup> Pinson, Speculating Daguerre, 46.

<sup>12</sup> Pinson, Speculating Daguerre, 37, 48.

In an attempt to assess the influences behind Daguerre's creative endeavours, Pinson traces a line from the mirrored stage curtains at the *Panorama Dramatique* theatre in Paris that would prompt audiences to adjust their hair or attire as they saw their reflections between scenes, to Daguerre's implementation of translucency and ambient lighting in the Diorama, to the reflective surface of the daguerreotype. Pinson asserts that it was Daguerre's recognition of the desire for public visibility that caused him to address this social interest through the creation of liminal screens in the Diorama and, later, the mirror-like surface of the daguerreotype.<sup>13</sup> He surmises that Daguerre's

use of ambient lighting in the Diorama can be viewed as a response not only to aesthetic demands, but also to a specific problem in theatrical lighting: how to make the audience visible, while at the same time sufficiently darkening the theatre in order to illuminate the scene. The idea of a specular curtain as a liminal space between the reflection of the exterior world and the revelation of illusion carries over to the daguerreotype as well. In the theatre, the illusion lies in the representation of the dramatic scene, interpreted as a reflection of the social word. In the daguerreotype, spectators are able to view both themselves and the represented photographed image, so that "theatrical" viewing is compressed in both space [...] and time.<sup>14</sup>

The theatre, Diorama, and daguerreotype were considered reflections of society. By inciting the viewer to ponder their own occupation of space as a visible subject engaged in the act of looking through technologies that orchestrated light, these forms of display cultivated self-consciousness and inner reflection. It is in this liminal space that there is an opportunity to pause and consider one's presence. Although in later years, the daguerreotype would be replaced by the popularity of the paper-based *carte de visite*, the sentimental nature of photographs and the album culture around them emerged from and cultivated a reflection of the self in relation to the other. Public interest in light and visibility fostered conditioned viewership, whereby the photograph, recognized for its illusion of realism, prompted simultaneous inward and outward looking.

<sup>13</sup> Pinson, Speculating Daguerre, 37.

<sup>14</sup> Pinson, Speculating Daguerre, 37.

Like the Diorama and daguerreotype, literature was also considered a mirror of society through the processes of illumination and conditioned vision. As a form of mechanical imitation made manifest through sunlight (at once associated with divine and scientific authority), the daguerreotype was valued by the middle class for its "constancy and truth" in its portrayal of the physical and moral qualities of sitters.<sup>15</sup> Writers employed the widespread belief in the medium's ability to evince the interiority of the sitter by figuratively "daguerreotyping" subjects that they introduced within texts. Harriet Beecher Stowe, for instance, referred to her description of Uncle Tom as a "daguerreotype," thereby using the revelatory capacities of the medium to assure readers of "his goodness of character."<sup>16</sup> The emotional force of Stowe's novel garnered empathy for the anti-slavery movement, but the limitations of her imagery, as John N. Still lamented, is that it denied the full humanity of black people. Considering the political power of images, it is no coincidence that in December 1861, several months after the start of the Civil War, Frederick Douglass delivered his lecture "Pictures and Progress."<sup>17</sup> Echoing the words of John N. Still, Frederick Douglass, the most photographed American of the nineteenth century, understood the necessity of images in shaping the imagination.<sup>18</sup> Whereby Still considered his Dioramas to hold "the double merit of engaging those two most important faculties that man possesses - the mind and the sight at the same time, and making an ineffaceable impression" of the subject's "character," Douglass referred to photographs as appealing to the uniquely human "picture making faculty."<sup>19</sup>

<sup>15</sup> Susan S. Williams, *Confounding Images: Photography and Portraiture in Antebellum American Fiction* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), 46.

<sup>16</sup> Williams, Confounding Images, 47.

<sup>17</sup> Frederick Douglass, "Pictures and Progress: An Address Delivered in Boston, Massachusetts, on 3 December 1861," in *The Frederick Douglass Papers: Series One: Speeches, Debates, and Interviews Volume 3: 1855–1863*, ed. John W. Blassingame (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1985), 452.

<sup>18</sup> John Stauffer, Zoe Trodd, and Celeste-Marie Bernier, *Picturing Frederick Douglass: An Illustrated Biography of the Nineteenth Century's Most Photographed American* (New York: Liveright Publishing Corporation, 2015), ix. 19 Still, "Exhibitions and Lectures"; Frederick Douglass, "Pictures and Progress," 461.

Douglass believed that the arts, specifically music and images, possessed the same capability in shaping the social forces of a nation as legislation, reasoning that whoever shaped a nation's pictures and ballads held power equivalent to that of a law-maker.<sup>20</sup> Photography studios multiplied across the United States in response to the desire to have one's likeness taken -ademand that Douglass traced to the affective component of photography.<sup>21</sup> Every instance of producing or viewing an image was an opportunity to discover and construct an imagination of the world that would reaffirm certain beliefs and destabilize others.<sup>22</sup> To Douglass, the country's "material progress" could not continue without "moral progress," and the power of images to unify the nation's divided consciousness came together in the communicative power of photography in a highly networked world.<sup>23</sup> He likened the proliferation of photography studios across the Americas to advances made in global communication and travel.<sup>24</sup> Beyond increasing the dissemination of knowledge, industrialization had shaped vision, and with that, could alter or reify an individual's beliefs according to the media they consumed.<sup>25</sup> Photography, like other examples of industrial progress, had the capacity to remedy "moral stagnation" in the United States.<sup>26</sup> "Daguerre by the simple and all abounding sunlight has converted the planet into a picture gallery," claimed Douglass, and as a result, sight had become indelibly conditioned by visual technologies, such as the camera, its "thought pictures," and the people and institutions responsible for their creation and reception.<sup>27</sup>

<sup>20</sup> Douglass, "Pictures and Progress," 456.

<sup>21</sup> Douglass, "Pictures and Progress," 454.

<sup>22</sup> Douglass, "Pictures and Progress," 461.

<sup>23</sup> Douglass, "Pictures and Progress," 472.

<sup>24</sup> Douglass, "Pictures and Progress," 472.

<sup>25</sup> Douglass, "Pictures and Progress," 461.

<sup>26</sup> Laura Wexler, "A More Perfect Likeness': Frederick Douglass and the Image of the Nation," in *Pictures and Progress*, 24.

<sup>27</sup> Douglass, "Pictures and Progress," 459.

Not only did photography present a method of portraiture that for the first time was accessible across social classes, but also its popularity in late nineteenth-century America coincided with the changing legal statuses of a newly liberated people. Following a history of imposed misrepresentation, photography provided black people in America with a technology to represent themselves and a "political tool with which to claim a place in public and private spheres circumscribed by race and racialized sight lines."<sup>28</sup> The photograph delivered a method to disseminate portrayals of one's identity and intervene in socially, economically, and politically oppressive discourses. Several public figures, activists, and writers recognized this possibility – most notable being Frederick Douglass whose essays and lectures on pictures underscored the impact of photography on conceptions of race.<sup>29</sup> For Douglass, photography served as a way to revitalize the "socially dead," since it was considered closer to Nature and thus less subjective than drawing or painting.<sup>30</sup> Aside from its accessibility, photography democratized picture making because, unlike art created by the artist's hand, the depiction of the sitter was believed to have been more faithfully rendered by the camera. Thus, in using photography to self-represent, one was able to control perceptions of oneself and participate in and redirect systems and theories of visibility.<sup>31</sup>

While commonly overlooked as a slaveholding society, Canada was involved in the trade of human labour through the manufacture of British slave ships, and the legal enslavement of Indigenous, African, and African-diasporic people from 1628 until 1833.<sup>32</sup> Although there is

<sup>28</sup> Wallace and Smith, "Introduction," in Pictures and Progress, 5.

<sup>29</sup> Wallace and Smith, "Introduction," 5-7.

<sup>30</sup> Wexler, "A More Perfect Likeness',"19-21.

<sup>31</sup> Ginger Hill, "Rightly Viewed": Theorizations of Self in Frederick Douglass's Lectures on Pictures," in *Pictures and Progress*, 69-72.

<sup>32</sup> Afua Cooper, *The Hanging of Angélique: The Untold Story of Canadian Slavery and the Burning of Old Montréal* (Toronto: Harper Collins Canada, 2011), 68-70. However, the first documented person of African descent to arrive in Canada is Mathieu Da Costa, a free black man who likely worked as an interpreter between the French and the Mi'kmaq in Nova Scotia sometime between 1608 and 1619 (Harvey Amani Whitfield, *Blacks on the* 

evidence of slavery having occurred in Canada as early as 1501 when fifty Indigenous people were enslaved by Gaspar Corte-Real, the history of transatlantic slavery in the country can be definitively traced to 1628, since this is when the first recorded enslaved person from Africa, a boy known as Olivier Le Jeune, was transported from Madagascar to New France by the pirate David Kirke and sold for 50 écus.<sup>33</sup> He is estimated to have been between six or nine years old.<sup>34</sup> Despite attempts to increase the population of the colony, New France had a labour shortage. Rather than bring more French colonists, since this would have been too costly, the governor, Marquis de Denonville, and the intendant, Jean Bochart de Champigny, petitioned King Louis XIV for permission to introduce slaves from the West Indies and Africa.<sup>35</sup> Thus, slavery was legally established in Canada in 1689 – the year in which Louis XIV allowed the import of enslaved Africans into New France to support the colony's development.<sup>36</sup> Nonetheless, even with a population increase of 8,000 over 25 years, more workers were needed for the colony's economy to prosper, and in 1716, Michel Bégon, the new intendant, brought in enslaved black people from American colonies.<sup>37</sup> Through these efforts, Montreal held the largest number of enslaved people in New France.<sup>38</sup> After the Conquest of 1760 by the British, slavery only

*Border: The Black Refugees in British North America, 1815-1860* (Burlington: University of Vermont Press, 2006), 10-12). Other black people who visited or lived in seventeenth-century Nova Scotia are: an unnamed man who passed away on the journey to Port Royal in 1606, another who met the same fate in 1608, and a man identified as La Liberté who appeared in the census of 1686 as residing in Cape Sable. It is possible that La Liberté escaped from enslavement in the English colonies (Whitfield, *Blacks on the Border*, 12; Robin W. Winks, *The Blacks in Canada: A History* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1997), 27n9).

<sup>33</sup> Winks, *The Blacks in Canada*, 1-2; Cooper, *The Hanging of Angélique*, 70-71. Kirke sold the boy to a Quebec clerk who sold him again to another clerk named Guillaume Couillard. In 1633, the boy was baptized and re-named Olivier Le Jeune, and remained in New France until his death in 1654. His original name is unknown.

<sup>34</sup> Winks, *The Blacks in Canada*, 2; Cooper, *The Hanging of Angélique*, 71. Winks indicates that he may have been six years of age, whereas Cooper states nine.

<sup>35</sup> Cooper, The Hanging of Angélique, 72.

<sup>36</sup> Winks, The Blacks in Canada, 1-4; Cooper, The Hanging of Angélique, 72.

<sup>37</sup> Cooper, The Hanging of Angélique, 73.

<sup>38</sup> Cooper, *The Hanging of Angélique*, 75. To support a system of slavery in Canada, officials adopted the *Code Noir*, a set of legal guidelines used in France that regulated the conditions of slavery.

intensified as British-Americans migrated to Canada and brought with them slave labourers.<sup>39</sup> The history of slavery in Canada continued until 1833, when it was finally abolished throughout the British colonies.<sup>40</sup>

As Sharon Morgan Beckford points out, "in the dominant Canadian narrative, blackness is usually absent."<sup>41</sup> Beckford provides figures: 2000 enslaved people were recorded in Nova Scotia in 1776; 550 maroons were moved from Jamaica to Nova Scotia in 1796; after the War of 1812, 4000 black people immigrated to British North America from the United Sates; from 1815 onwards, around 80,000 fugitive slaves came to Canada through the Underground Railroad; in the 1850s, several hundred free blacks made their way from San Francisco to Victoria, British Columbia.<sup>42</sup> Although black people have lived in Canada for nearly four hundred years, there is a lingering perception of black Canadians as new immigrants, "thus rewriting their claims to legitimacy, belonging and full citizenship," and erasing their significance in the history of the country.<sup>43</sup>

Considering that the daguerreotype process was made public in 1839, and the Dominion of Canada formed in 1867, the proliferation of photography quite literally coincided with the birth of the nation.<sup>44</sup> Additionally, photography emerged soon after the end of the legal institution of slavery in the British Empire and bore witness to its abolition in the United States.

40 Winks, *The Blacks in Canada*, 111; Cooper, *The Hanging of Angélique*, 101-102. The gradual abolition of slavery in Canada began with the resistance of an enslaved black woman named Chloe Cooley in March of 1793. Lieutenant-Governor John Graves Simcoe used the incident of Chloe Cooley's public resistance against her owner, William Vrooman to introduce measures for the eventual abolition of slavery in British Canada.

<sup>39</sup> Cooper, The Hanging of Angélique, 81-83.

<sup>41</sup> Sharon Morgan Beckford, "(Up)Rooting Claims to Legitimacy: Blackness and the Canadian National Imaginary in Djanet Sears's Adventures of a Black Girl in Search of God and Afua Cooper's Negro Cemeteries," in *Ebony Roots, Northern Soil: Perspectives on Blackness in Canada*, ed. Charmaine A. Nelson (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars, 2010), 277.

<sup>42</sup> Beckford, "(Up)Rooting Claims to Legitimacy," 278.

<sup>43</sup> Beckford, "(Up)Rooting Claims to Legitimacy," 278.

<sup>44</sup> Ralph Greenhill and A. J. Birrell, *Canadian Photography*, 1839-1920 (Toronto: Coach House Press, 1979), 21. News of Louis Daguerre's and Henry Fox Talbot's photographic inventions reached Canadian Newspapers as early as April 15th, 1839 when the *Quebec Gazette* published an article about "The New Art of Sun Painting."

Andrea Kunard argues that, in Canada, the camera was a "powerful tool in the project of white settler colonization and nation building."<sup>45</sup> Supporting this statement are the numerous photographs taken to document a seemingly unoccupied Canadian landscape that could be cultivated and built upon, images of engineering projects, romanticized depictions of Indigenous people, and visual and literary snapshots intended for tourism.

Amid the early Canadian photographers essential to founding an idealized vision of Canada was William Notman. Claiming the title of "Photographer to the Queen" after his presentation of 600 stereoviews of Canada to the Prince of Whales in 1861, William Notman was to become the most renowned Canadian photographer of the century.<sup>46</sup> His fame surpassed contemporaries such as Montreal-based Alexander Henderson and Quebec's Ellisson and Company.<sup>47</sup> In spite of his popularity among a bourgeois clientele in the aggressive market of photography (or perhaps because of it), Notman's studio seemed to have also supported individuals whose visibility meant vulnerability.<sup>48</sup> Two examples are: Notman's sponsorship of African American landscape painter Robert S. Duncanson's first Canadian exhibition, and the photographing of a person in gender non-conforming attire known only as *Gent for Mrs. Austin* (1889).<sup>49</sup> Whether Notman's interests were monetary or otherwise are uncertain, however, as Boone suggests, these activities show a "willingness on Notman's part to engage" with the

46 Roger Hall, Gordon Dodds, and Stanley Triggs, *The World of William Notman: The Nineteenth Century Through a Master Lens* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1993), 38; Greenhill and Birrell, *Canadian Photography*, 48-50. Notman opened his first Montreal studio in 1856. In total, he had 26 studios in cities throughout Central and Eastern Canada, New England, New York and Pennsylvania: Montreal, Quebec; Ottawa, Ontario; Toronto, Ontario; Halifax, Nova Scotia; Albany, New York; Amherst, Massachusetts; Boston, Massachusetts; Cambridge, Massachusetts; Easton, Pennsylvania; New Haven, Connecticut; Newport, Rhode Island; and Saratoga, New York. 47 Greenhill and Birrell, *Canadian Photography*, 51.

<sup>45</sup> Andrea Kunard, "Canada," in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, ed. John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2008), 261.

<sup>48</sup> Stanley Triggs, William Notman: The Stamp of a Studio (Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario, 1985), 30.

<sup>49</sup> Emilie Boone, "The Likeness of Fugitivity: William Notman's Carte-De-Visite Portrait of John

Anderson," *History of Photography* 37, no. 2 (2013): 221-234; Hélène Samson and Suzanne Sauvage, *Notman: A Visionary Photographer* (Montréal: McCord Museum of Canadian History, 2016), 80.

imaginations of his clients.<sup>50</sup> Colleen Skidmore asserts, "By his death in 1891, Notman had built the most successful nineteenth-century photography enterprise in North America. At its peak in 1874, the Montreal studio alone, with a staff of thirty-seven men and eighteen women, produced fourteen thousand photographs."<sup>51</sup> Cheryl Thompson conveys that out of the thousands of images taken by William Notman, very few "were of non-white subjects."<sup>52</sup> While this is true, the Notman photographs provide rich insight into the histories of black Canadians, access to portrait photography across class, race, and gender, and the construction of a national imaginary.

Although there has been considerable scholarship on nineteenth-century black portrait photography in the United States, this area of research is largely understudied in Canada.<sup>53</sup> Two scholars who have specifically worked on the topic within Canada are Julie Crooks and Emilie Boone. Julie Crooks' research examines studio portraiture within southern Ontario, and Emilie Boone published a paper on a portrait of John Anderson, a fugitive slave, within the Notman collection.<sup>54</sup> Charmaine A. Nelson, Cheryl Thompson, and Colleen Marie Skidmore have also studied photographs of black subjects within the Notman archives. However, these analyses were

51 Colleen Skidmore, "Notman, Wiliam and Sons (1856-1935)," in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, 1011. Primarily known for portraiture, Notman's studios were also well regarded for Canadian landscapes, composite photographs, and winter sports or hunting scenes constructed within the studio.
52 Cheryl Thompson, "Race and Beauty in Canada: Print Culture, Retail, and the Transnational Flow of Products, Images and Ideologies, 1700s to Present" (PhD diss., McGill University, 2015), 100.
53 Some examples of pertinent scholarship on photography in the United States are: Valencia Hollins Coar, *A Century of Black Photographers: 1840-1960* (Providence: Rhode Island School of Design, 1983); Jeanne

Moutoussamy-Ashe, *Viewfinders: Black Women Photographers, 1839-1985* (New York: Dodd, Mead and Co., 1986); Deborah Willis, ed., *Picturing Us: African American Identity in Photography*, (New York: New Press, 1994); Deborah Willis, *Reflections in Black: A History of Black Photographers, 1840 to the Present* (New York: W.W. Norton, 2000); Deborah Willis and Carla Williams, *The Black Female Body: A Photographic History* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2002); Coco Fusco and Brian Wallis, eds., *Only Skin Deep: Changing Visions of the American Self* (New York: Abrams, 2003); Brian Wallis and Deborah Willis, *African American Vernacular Photography: Selections from the Daniel Cowin Collection* (New York: International Center of Photography, 2005); Maurice O. Wallace and Shawn Michelle Smith, eds., *Pictures and Progress: Early Photography and the Making of African American Identity*, (Durham: Duke University Press, 2012); Darcy Grimaldo Grigsby, *Enduring Truths: Sojourner's Shadows and Substance* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2015).

<sup>50</sup> Boone, "The Likeness of Fugitivity," 226.

<sup>54</sup> Julie Crooks, "The Bell-Sloman Collection at Brock University: A Fugitive Archive," *Photography and Culture* 10, no. 2 (2017): 173-174; Boone, "The Likeness of Fugitivity," 221-234. Julie Crooks also recently curated an exhibition on the subject: *Free Black North*. Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto. April 29–October 1, 2017.

part of broader discussions that did not exclusively focus on black subjects in Canadian photography.<sup>55</sup>

Photography, as it emerged alongside industrialization and abolition of the transatlantic slave trade, was an unprecedented tool that could be used to limit and expand notions of citizenship, belonging, and liberty. Through images, social and economic structures were contested, and new legal statuses and identities were celebrated. For black Canadians facing discrimination, photography could be used to visually and materially concretize aspirations, assert definitions of the self, and maintain relations with loved ones despite the boundaries placed by borders and distance. Sent to friends and relatives across the transatlantic, these pictures also reveal imaginations of Canada, and histories of migration and community-formation. Collectively, photographs of black subjects in the Americas reveal how access to and the use of photography varied across the region. Today, these images are realms of memory through which personal, familial, and national identities can be conferred.<sup>56</sup>

Primarily using understudied photographs and archival materials from the Notman Photographic Archives at the McCord Museum – in addition to select images and documents from the Alvin D. McCurdy Collection at Archives of Ontario, the Richard Bell Family Fonds at Brock University, and the Nova Scotia Archives and Records Management – this thesis explores the role of photography in the formation of personal, group, and national identities, and also in the navigation and resistance of limitations imposed on the body based on constructions of race,

<sup>55</sup> Charmaine A. Nelson, *Representing the Black Female Subject in Western Art* (New York: Routledge, 2010), 30-31, 51-52; Charmaine A. Nelson, "Innocence Curtailed: Reading Maternity and Sexuality as Labor in Canadian Representations of Black Girls," in *Sex, Power, and Slavery*, ed. Gwyn Campbell and Elizabeth Elbourne, (Athens: Ohio University Press, 2014), 434-468; Thompson, "Race and Beauty in Canada," 95-109; Colleen, Skidmore, "Women in Photography at the Notman Studio, Montreal, 1856-1881" (PhD diss., University of Alberta, 1999), 119-120.

<sup>56 &</sup>quot;Realms of memory" originates with Pierre Nora's use of the term. Pierre Nora, *Realms of Memory: Rethinking the French Past*, ed. Lawrence D. Kritzman, trans. Arthur Goldhammer (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996).

class, and gender. I seek to connect these photographs to black Canadian history and the ways in which photography could have operated to deny the colonial gaze, challenge centuries of racist misrepresentation, and how the sitters may have engaged with notions of "progress" in the context of industrial Canada to create better social, economic, and political futures for themselves and others. In order to do this, I will attempt to reconstruct the ways in which these photographs were commissioned, produced, viewed and disseminated by studying primary documents and published research on the practice of photography in the transatlantic world, with significant attention paid to performativity, and postcolonial and black feminist discourse.

Based upon the premise that photographs can serve as primary documents, Chapter One begins with an consideration of photography's relationship to biography, and the information that can be recovered about the lives of the sitters and the differing points of access they had to the creation of their own images, and by extension, negotiations of their citizenship. Expanding upon this notion, Chapter Two examines how visibility was constructed through the materiality of light, clothing, and the body, and connects this to the potential of the photographic studio as a theatrical space where lighting, set design, and studio props can be used as tools in the mechanisms of visibility and individuation. This chapter ultimately concludes with how selffashioning can serve as performative escape from visual capture. These ideas converge in the final chapter, which assesses how conceptions of nationhood are formed through aesthetic rhetorics of the landscape, and the networks through which images circulated.

### **Chapter One**

# Seeing and Being Seen: Photography, Race, and Self-Representation in Nineteenth-Century Montreal

# I. Introduction

Portraits have long been considered a form of biography, an association that deepened through the traditional placement of engraved frontispiece portraits of subjects in biographical texts. With its potential to self-reproduce and self-represent, photography became regarded as a form of *auto*biography.<sup>57</sup> For the first time, sitters could see indelible reflections of themselves, and for those who were denied cultural representation or the role of patrons of their own likenesses in more traditional portrait media, photography allowed them to narrate their own personhood as mediated by the camera. Historically, slaveholding societies sought to expunge the identities of the enslaved through a process known as "social death." <sup>58</sup> Orlando Patterson describes social death as beginning at the moment where a person is captured for enslavement. Stripped of their home, relationships, and name, an enslaved person is an "unborn being."<sup>59</sup> Their subjugation meant that they occupied a liminal space in society: never quite belonging yet always integral to its functioning.<sup>60</sup> Once liberated, the previously enslaved could establish new identities, negotiate new futures, and engage in new forms of self-possession. However, in Canada, it can be said that abolition signalled another form of erasure, since little is known about what happened to black people in Canada after 1834. Without terms such as "slave," the status of chattel, or categories on race and ethnicity to announce their existence in official documentation

<sup>57</sup> Linda Haverty Rugg, *Picturing Ourselves: Photography and Autobiography* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1997).

<sup>58</sup> The term "social death" in the context of slavery stems from Orlando Patterson, *Slavery and Social Death: A Comparative Study* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982), 35-76.

<sup>59</sup> Patterson, Slavery and Social Death, 38.

<sup>60</sup> Patterson, Slavery and Social Death, 46.

or census records, many free black Canadians disappeared from the archives after abolition.<sup>61</sup> What is unique about the Notman Photographic Collection are the records of its patrons. Beginning in 1861, in addition to storing negatives in chronological order, the studio catalogued its negatives by pasting prints of them into "picture books" (Fig. 1.1).<sup>62</sup> Under each print would be a short description (usually the full or partial name of the client) and the sequential number that corresponded to the negative. Considering that several collections of photographs from the period lack specific dates and identifications of their subjects, as photographs were typically intended for private spectatorship, the studios' picture books allow for the preservation of biographical information about their sitters. Thus, as a counterpart of sorts to the family album, Notman's picture books can be said to contain the narratives of several individuals who lived in or visited Montreal. These images further our understanding of the experiences of black Canadians by providing opportunities to reconstruct their biographies and study the ways in which their ability to narrate their own personhood through photography was impacted by varying positions of access to artistic production.

<sup>61</sup> Maureen Elgersman Lee, *Unyielding Spirits: Black Women and Slavery in Early Canada and Jamaica* (New York: Garland Pub, 1999), 157-158; For a discussion on how racial classification in census records can be used as a technology of surveillance and oppression, see Simone Browne, *Dark Matters: On the Surveillance of Blackness* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2015), 55-57.

<sup>62</sup> Jacqueline Beaudoin-Ross, *Form and Fashion: Nineteenth-Century Montreal Dress* (Montreal: McCord Museum of Canadian History, 1992), 57; Skidmore, "Women in Photography," 78-79, 89-91. The primary picture books contained prints in the *carte de visite* size, with up to sixteen images on a page. Whenever a proof was printed in a larger format, such as the cabinet card, the space typically reserved for the proof would instead be inscribed with the name of the format, such as "cabinet," prompting the reader to look for the proofs in the secondary picture books that were reserved for images larger than the *carte de visite* format. If a customer wanted to order more prints in the future, studio employees would easily be able to verify the catalogue number for the negative with the proof in the picture book. The patrons of these negatives were then also recorded in index books that listed the patrons' names and corresponding negative numbers across the years. In some cases, it is difficult to determine with certainty the identity of the sitter and/or patron, due to the use of initials. These names are recorded under the commissioned photographs in picture books that catalogue developed negatives in chronological order alongside their number and the title of the photo, which was often the client's name.

# **II. Migration and Mobility**

Since slavery ended in Canada, under the British Empire, three decades before its demise in the United States, many who escaped enslavement in the United States made their way north across the border in order to seek refuge and obtain legal freedom in the British colonies.<sup>63</sup> One such person is the fugitive slave John Anderson who escaped to Canada in 1853. No longer allowed to see his family, Anderson fled to Canada where he hoped he would be able to later bring his wife. Before reaching Canada however, a slaveholder by the name of Seneca Diggs had attempted to recapture him, and the confrontation resulted in Digg's death.<sup>64</sup> Anderson was arrested in Toronto in 1860 after Digg's son initiated a warrant for him. A year later, following a lengthy trial, Anderson was released; the Canadian courts decided that because slavery was illegal in Canada at the time of Digg's death, that Anderson had acted in self-defence, and granted him the ability to live as a free man.<sup>65</sup> His photograph was taken at William Notman's Montreal studio after the successful completion of his court hearings and before setting sail for England where he would tour as a speaker within abolitionist circles.<sup>66</sup> In his portrait (1861; Fig. 1.2), he leans against a table, his poised stance framed by drapery that simultaneously functions to disguise the headrest behind him and add a sumptuous element to the domestic parlour he seems to be situated in. Architectural elements within the painted backdrop heighten the grandeur of the setting, with expansive grounds visible through an artificial window. The frequency with which this fabricated environment was used by Notman's studio in 1861 suggests that the sitter's ability to more actively participate in the construction of their scene would have increased as the studio acquired a greater collection of backdrops and proprieties over the years.

<sup>63</sup> Winks, The Blacks in Canada, 142-146.

<sup>64</sup> Boone, "The Likeness of Fugitivity," 222. For more, see Harper Twelvetrees, ed., *The Story of the Life of John Anderson, the Fugitive Slave* (London: William Tweedie, 1863).

<sup>65</sup> Boone, "The Likeness of Fugitivity," 223.

<sup>66</sup> Boone, "The Likeness of Fugitivity," 226.

Like other cartes de visite, this image was a reflection of his personhood through the structures of "stability, class and respectability," and could move across borders, functioning differently according to national context (in this case, largely to further the abolitionist cause).<sup>67</sup> Emily Boone insists that it is the visual sameness among *cartes de visite* in their similar bourgeois-reading backdrops, compositions, and props that assisted in the public recognition and circulation of portraits of people of African descent.<sup>68</sup> For John Anderson, this photo not only asserted his humanity, but its sale through abolitionist audiences led to income as well.<sup>69</sup> The photograph of John Anderson also exemplifies Brian Wallis' claim that in the first hundred years of photography, many "images of African Americans reflect the ambiguities and precariousness of their social position."<sup>70</sup> Boone believes that the portrait in the frontispiece of Anderson's book (1863; Fig. 1.3) originated as a mirror image of the Notman portrait, except unlike the photograph, his frontispiece reveals the bias of the artist, since his forehead is more pronounced - an addition that would have aligned with phrenological ideologies.<sup>71</sup> Like the studio portrait forever upon the precipice of real and artificial, Anderson's carefully constructed public representations reveal the instability of his legal status, and how the circulation of his image and story functioned to expand his mobility as a person.

As Darby English has argued, black artistic subjectivity intervenes in cultural hegemony. Pointing to the formation of Jim Crow laws in 1877, English contends that the desire to classify and separate became integral to nineteenth-century Western thought, and that it was within this context that black Americans sought to claim representational space and "build support for

<sup>67</sup> Boone, "The Likeness of Fugitivity," 225.

<sup>68</sup> Boone, "The Likeness of Fugitivity," 225.

<sup>69</sup> Boone, "The Likeness of Fugitivity," 226.

<sup>70</sup> Brian Wallis, "The Dream Life of a People: African American Vernacular Photography," in *African American Vernacular Photography*, 10.

<sup>71</sup> Boone, "The Likeness of Fugitivity," 230.

collective investment in that space and the practice of its cultivation."<sup>72</sup> One can clearly see how English's statements have poignancy for John Anderson, who, not only documented his legal freedom through his portrait photograph, but also used it to support himself financially and emancipate others. English's conceptions of the significance of black artistic subjectivity to affirm personhood and claim space can also be read into the portraits of Osborne Morton.

Osborne Morton (1863; Fig. 1.4) was the proprietor of the Prince of Wales' Livery Stables, which he opened on Victoria Square in 1861.<sup>73</sup> At the time of the photo's production, however, the stable was located on Craig Street until its eventual move to St. Bonaventure Street in 1867 (Appendix I).<sup>74</sup> Originally, Morton arrived in Canada as a result of escaping bondage as a fugitive slave in the early 1850s.<sup>75</sup> He fled from Louisville, Kentucky, where he worked at the horseracing track, leaving behind his wife and child.<sup>76</sup> Shortly after his move to Montreal, he began working as a servant. In an attempt to trick him back into enslavement, the owners of the Louisville track, Campbell and Otts, sent an employee to find Morton in Montreal, and promised him payment for his labour as a free man, and more importantly, freedom for his wife and child.<sup>77</sup> Discovering that this had been a lie, and likely out of concern for his safety, Morton

74 In 1862, both his business and residence are listed at "Craig near Bleury" in Mackay's Montreal Directory. It is then listed at 82 Craig Street in 1863 and 1864, 660 Craig Street in 1865, 658 Craig Street in 1866, 38 St. Bonaventure Street in 1867, 1868, 1869 and 1870. See: *Mackay's Montreal Directory for 1862-1863* (Montreal: Owler and Stevenson, 1862), page 192; *Mackay's Montreal Directory for 1863-1864* (Montreal: John Lovell, 1863), 229; *Mackay's Montreal Directory for 1864-1865* (Montreal: John Lovell, 1864), 310; *Mackay's Montreal Directory for 1865-1866* (Montreal: John Lovell, 1865), 234; *Mackay's Montreal Directory for 1866-1867* (Montreal: John Lovell, 1866), 244; *Mackay's Montreal Directory for 1867-1868* (Montreal: John Lovell, 1867), 244; *Montreal Directory for 1868-1869* (Montreal: John Lovell, 1868), 268; *Montreal Directory for 1869-1870* (Montreal: John Lovell, 1869), 272; and, *Montreal Directory for 1870-1871* (Montreal: John Lovell, 1870), 380. 75 Frank Mackey, *Black Then: Blacks and Montreal, 1780-1880's* (Montreal'Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2004), 139-140. Although Mackey provides a thorough biography of Osborne Morton, he lacks transparency in his obfuscation of sources, and more troublingly, discusses Morton's life with a nonchalant humor that is at times vulgar. Additionally, his comparison of Morton to a centaur aligns closer with animalization than mythologization. 76 Mackey, *Black Then*, 139-140.

<sup>72</sup> English, How to See a Work of Art in Total Darkness, 45-46.

<sup>73</sup> The livery stables are listed at 10 Victoria Square. See Mackay's *Montreal Directory for 1861-1862* (Montreal: Owler and Stevenson, 1861), 163.

<sup>77</sup> Mackey, Black Then, 140-142.

temporarily moved to Scotland, where he married a white female servant named Catherine, before immigrating back to Montreal once more in 1858.<sup>78</sup> The selection of the name for the livery stables was likely due to the popular interest in the Prince of Wales who visited Montreal to inaugurate the Victoria Bridge in 1860.<sup>79</sup> Mackey indicates that the naming of the stable after the royal heir, and his decision to open the stable at a central location such as Victoria Square signified an entrepreneurial attitude that capitalized on the interest in the Prince of Wales' celebrity.<sup>80</sup> Morton ran the livery stables business for ten years until it closed in 1871 due to financial difficulties.<sup>81</sup> Afterwards, he worked as a farmer, groom, horse trainer, and jockey in Lachine.<sup>82</sup> Osborne Morton died on the racetrack in 1887, at almost sixty years of age as an accomplished jockey who was regarded as one of the best experts on horses in the province.<sup>83</sup>

Through his portrait, he positions himself as a member of the petite bourgeoisie. Unlike some other photos of people from the working class who are posed in the garb of their professions complete with uniform and props, such as that of *Joseph Craig, Plasterer* (1862; Fig. 1.5) or *Harry Sinker, Jockey* (1892; Fig. 1.6) – both of whom were white – Osborne Morton does not offer any signifiers of his livelihood. He presents himself wearing smart trousers and a jacket with his hand near some books (despite the fact that as a formerly enslaved person, he might not have known how to read), and his body framed by the drapery in the background. His selfpresentation could point to his social ascent or financial aspirations. Interestingly, there is no

<sup>78</sup> Mackey, Black Then, 144.

<sup>79</sup> Mackey, Black Then, 145-146.

<sup>80</sup> Mackey, Black Then, 146.

<sup>81</sup> Mackey, Black Then, 146.

<sup>82</sup> He is listed as a: farmer on Upper St. Joseph in Lachine in 1881, farmer on Upper Lachine Road in 1882 and 1883, groom on Upper Lachine Road in 1884, and horse trainer at Blue Bonnets in Lachine in 1887. See: *Lovell's Montreal Directory for 1881-1882* (Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1881), 696; *Lovell's Montreal Directory for 1882-1883* (Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1882), 577; *Lovell's Montreal Directory for 1883-1884* (Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1882), 577; *Lovell's Montreal Directory for 1883-1884* (Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1883), 584; *Lovell's Montreal Directory for 1884-1885* (Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1884), 648; and *Lovell's Montreal Directory for 1887-1888* (Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1887), 636. 83 Mackey, *Black Then*, 147.

known photo of his second wife, or of them together as a pair. This could be due to attitudes towards cross-racial unions commonly known as miscegenation. However, it could also reflect a desire to present himself as an astute businessman. For context, the average price of a horse in Quebec in 1901 was \$75.35.<sup>84</sup> As a result, their possession was considered a luxury and a symbol of wealth and modernity.<sup>85</sup> His photograph seemed to indicate his firm determination towards a better life.

Contrasting with the other full-length portraits, which depict the sitters in a domestic interior, Robert S. Duncanson (1864; Figs. 1.7 and 1.8) is photographed with rustic outdoor furniture, leaved branches and a painted backdrop possessing a luminous sky typical of English landscape paintings. All of these elements work together to give the effect of being in an airy garden, and remind the viewer of Duncanson's style as an eminent romantic landscape artist in the style of the Hudson River School. Duncanson was photographed by Notman's studio in the same year as his first of two exhibitions in Montreal.<sup>86</sup> Originally from Cincinnati, Duncanson arrived in Montreal in 1863 on his journey to Britain where he planned to advance his career, but he remained in Canada for two years due to the success he found in Montreal.<sup>87</sup> Notman took interest in Duncanson's work and published photos of two of his paintings in his book *Photographic Selections* (1863), which was intended to promote knowledge of Canadian artists.<sup>88</sup> At this time, Canadian art was dominated by the style of the Düsseldorf school of painting, but Duncanson's work was so well received that it influenced other Canadian artists

<sup>84</sup> R.W. Sandwell, *Powering Up Canada: A History of Power, Fuel, and Energy from 1600* (Montreal/Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2016.), 75.

<sup>85</sup> Charmaine A. Nelson, Slavery, Geography and Empire in Nineteenth-Century Marine Landscapes of Montreal and Jamaica (London: Routledge, 2017), 320.

<sup>86</sup> Joseph D. Ketner, *The Emergence of the African-American Artist Robert S. Duncanson, 1821-1872* (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1994), 76, 145. The second exhibition was in 1865.

<sup>87</sup> Joseph D. Ketner, The Emergence of the African-American Artist Robert S. Duncanson, 134-138.

<sup>88</sup> Joseph D. Ketner, The Emergence of the African-American Artist Robert S. Duncanson, 138.

towards romanticism in subsequent exhibitions.<sup>89</sup> Despite his short stay in Canada, Notman's inclusion of Duncanson as a Canadian artist in his *Photographic Selections* and the enthusiastic reception of his work in Montreal, cemented his impact on Canadian landscape painting. Interestingly, the shifting of Duncanson's perceived national identity from American to Canadian also signifies the instability of what it meant to be Canadian in a period of high migration and mobility.

### **III.** Picturing the Bourgeoisie

At least two black physicians are also represented in the collection: *Dr. Davis* (1875; Fig. 1.9) and *Dr. Rohlehr* (1897; Fig. 1.10). A Dr. John T. Davis graduated with a Master of Surgery and Doctor of Medicine and (C.M., M.D.) from the Medical Faculty of Bishop's College in Montreal in 1875, and had secured prizes for highest marks in the primary and final examinations.<sup>90</sup> Originating from Barbados, he moved to Buxton, Guyana following graduation.<sup>91</sup> Since the newly formed four-year program greeted their first round of students in 1871, Dr. Davis could have been one of the first students to attend the College.<sup>92</sup> There is uncertainty as to how many students of colour studied medicine in Montreal, as John Monteith Rohlehr was the only student mentioned as such in the faculty minutes due to the fact that he brought forth concerns of racism to the attention of faculty.<sup>93</sup> In February 1884, John Monteith informed faculty that students caused him "considerable annoyance" due to their racism, to

<sup>89</sup> Joseph D. Ketner, *The Emergence of the African-American Artist Robert S. Duncanson*, 145-147.
90 Elizabeth H. Milner, *Bishop's Medical Faculty, Montreal, 1871-1905: Including the Affiliated Dental College, 1896-1905* (Sherbrooke, QC: René Prince, 1985), 80, 493.

<sup>91</sup> University of Bishop's College: Sixth Annual Announcement of the Faculty of Medicine, Montreal (Montreal: Lovell Printing and Publishing Co., 1876), 28; This is indicated as "Buxton, East Coast, Demerara, West Indies" in "Personal," in *The Canada Medical Record: A Monthly Journal of Medicine and Surgery* 4, no. 3 (December 1875): 71. He is also indicated as being from Barbados in "Medical Faculty, Bishop's College," *The Canada Medical Record: A Monthly Journal of Medicine and Surgery* 3, no. 9 (April 1875): 521.

<sup>92</sup> Christopher Nicholl, *Bishop's University*, 1843-1970 (Montreal/Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1994), 324-325, 341. At this time, the degree would have required students to complete four sessions that were six months long each with a six-month summer beak in between. However, students with prior medical training could graduate early. As a result, 1875 saw the fourth graduating class since the College's inception.

<sup>93</sup> Milner, Bishop's Medical Faculty, 466-467. His hometown can be further specified as New Amsterdam, Guyana.

which professors decided that they would "individually protect and encourage Mr. Rohlehr as far as possible."<sup>94</sup> Akin to Dr. Davis, Dr. Rohlehr (Fig. 1.10), came to Montreal to study medicine so that he could practice back home in Guyana, where as a British colony, the degree would be recognized. He was born in 1859 in Berbice Country, Guyana, and obtained his Doctor of Medicine and Master of Surgery at Bishop's University in Montreal in 1887.<sup>95</sup> After graduating, Dr. Rohlehr moved back to Guyana with the desire to practice there. However, because the Medical Ordinance of 1886 decreed that medical practitioners were required to have received their training in the United Kingdom and be registered with the British Medical Association, Dr. Rohlehr was unable to practice in Guyana until this was appealed. Upon his return to Guyana, he became recognized for his political advocacy towards ensuring adequate healthcare for miners who had received insufficient treatment due to class and racial discrimination.<sup>96</sup> Considering the twenty-two-year difference between the photos of Dr. Davis and Dr. Rohlehr, it is possible that other non-white students attended the college but that their presence is obfuscated in the textual records. If so, this is another instance in which photographs have the potential to supplement or stand in where the absence of textual documents impede our ability to recuperate individual and community histories. It is probable that their photographs were taken to commemorate their graduations. Dr. Davis' use of a book emphasizes his literary distinction, and the graduation robe marks his educational achievements. Both men gaze outwardly to the future with assurance.

<sup>94</sup> Minutes of the Faculty of Medicine, University of Bishop's College, February 28, 1884. Bishop's University Archives.

<sup>95</sup> Barbara P. Josiah, Migration, Mining, and the African Diaspora: Guyana in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 86; "Ordinance No. 7 of 1890: An Ordinance to Enable Dr. John Monteith Rohlehr to Be Registered as a Medical Practitioner in This Colony," in Ordinance No. 9 of 1884 to Ordinance No. 17 of 1891, vol. 3, The Laws of British Guiana (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1895) 479-480. 96 Josiah, Migration, Mining, and the African Diaspora, 86.

Unlike the men in these photographs, Miss Guilmartin (Figs. 1.11 and 1.12) is one of two women who are represented as individuals and members of the bourgeoisie.<sup>97</sup> Other elite-looking women are shown with male companions, as can be seen in *H. Evans and Lady* (1871; Fig. 2.7) and G. Conway and Friends (1901; Fig. 3.4).<sup>98</sup> The portraits of Miss Guilmartin likely depict Mary Ann Law Guilmartin who married the white politician Onésiphore Ernest Talbot in Quebec City in 1887.<sup>99</sup> It is possible that Miss Guilmartin was previously enslaved by her adoptive mother, since a Frances M. Guilmartin of Savannah, Georgia is recorded as having two slaves, a 26 year old black woman and a two year old "mulatto" girl in the Slave Schedule of the 1860 Federal Census.<sup>100</sup> Mary is also listed as the adopted daughter of Laurence and Frances J. Guilmartin on the 1880 Census, and her age corresponds to what was now indicated as twentytwo.<sup>101</sup> Laurence and Frances Guilmartin married in 1854.<sup>102</sup> There are a few speculations that can be derived from the available documentation. Namely, it is conceivable that Mary Ann is Mr. Guilmartin's child and that the 26-year-old woman who appeared in their records was her birth mother, but it is unclear what happened to her since she disappeared from the family's census records after 1860.

<sup>97</sup> The other portrait of a bourgeois woman is Mrs. Coburn (1887). See Nelson, *Representing the Black Female Subject*, 30.

<sup>98</sup> G. Conway could refer to a woman, but this is unlikely, as the name is not prefixed with a female-identifying personal title.

<sup>99</sup> Marriage Record, Onésiphore Ernest Talbot to Marie Anne Law Guilmartin, September 7, 1887, Marriage record number 34, Notre-Dame Basilica, Quebec City, Quebec. Register photocopied at the Registry of Quebec, Institut Généalogique Drouin; Montreal, Quebec, Canada; The Canadian Parliament: Biographical Sketches and Photo-Engravures of the Senators and Members of the House of Commons of Canada (Montreal: Perrault Printing Co., 1906), 237. Her name is spelled as "Marie Anne" Law Guilmartin on the marriage record.

<sup>100 1860</sup> United States Census (Slave Schedule), Savannah, Chatham County, Georgia; p. 43, lines 32-33; August 7, 1860; National Archives Microfilm M-653, Roll 143.

<sup>101 1880</sup> United States Census, Savannah, Chatham County, Georgia; p. 34, family 208, dwelling 190, lines 1-3; June 10, 1880; National Archives Microfilm T-9, Roll 138. Laurence is listed as a cotton merchant under occupation.

<sup>102</sup> Marriage License, Laurence J. Guilmartin to Frances J. Lloyd, January 7, 1854, St. Johns, Florida. Florida, County Marriage Records, 1823-1982 [database on-line]. Lehi, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations, Inc., 2016.

Laurence J. Guilmartin of L.J. Guilmartin and Company is listed as a cotton factor and merchant in the 1882 Savannah City Directory.<sup>103</sup> He entered the business of cotton commission in 1856, and became one of the oldest and well-known merchants in the area, and was also responsible for "an important line" of steamships that travelled from Charleston, South Carolina to Palatka, Florida through Savannah.<sup>104</sup> Laurence Guilmartin moved to Quebec in 1886, and he and his wife are documented in the 1891 Census as residing in Quebec City's Montcalm West Ward.<sup>105</sup> It is not clear when Miss Guilmartin moved to Canada, or why she was in Montreal in 1877 and 1885, the dates of her photographs. Since she was registered as living at home in the United States Federal Census of 1880, she could have travelled with her father on trips to Montreal, and eventually moved to Canada with her parents. Mary Ann Law's adoptive mother, Francis Jane Mary Lloyd Guilmartin, bequeathed her estate to Mary, according to her will, written in 1905.<sup>106</sup> After the death of the last of the will's annuitants, the estate was to be given to the Saint Joseph Seminary in Baltimore, Maryland, to be put towards the education of black "youths" entering priesthood. However, because Mary's son, Lawrence Ernest Talbot, who was to receive annuities, was only 18 years old at the time of Francis Jane Mary Lloyd's passing in 1906, Mary Ann Law agreed to pay \$25,000 to the Seminary so that they could receive funding immediately, and remained in possession of the rest of the inheritance.

104 The Industries of Savannah. Chief Cotton Port of the South Atlantic Coast and the Principal Shipping Point of the World for Naval Stores: Her Trade, Commerce, Manufactures and Representative Establishments (Savannah, GA: J.M. Elstner and Co., 1886), 63; The National Cyclopaedia of American Biography: Being the History of the United States as Illustrated in the Lives of the Founders, Builders, and Defenders of the Republic, and of the Men and Women who are Doing the Work and Moulding the Thought of the Present Time, vol. 3 (New York: J. T. White and Co., 1893), 270.

1891 Census of Canada, Montcalm West Ward, Quebec City, Quebec; p. 23, family 62, lines 22-23; April 14, 1891; Library and Archives Canada Microfilm RG 31, Roll T-6414.

<sup>103</sup> Shole's Directory of the City of Savannah, 1882 (Savannah, GA: Morning News Steam Printing House, 1882), 274.

<sup>105 &</sup>quot;Obituary. Mr. L. J. Guilmartin," Savannah Morning News, May 18, 1902.

<sup>106</sup> Loi concernant la succession de dame Francis Jane Mary Lloyd, SC 1914, c 129.

Charmaine A. Nelson posits that the decor and attire of *Miss Guilmartin* (1877) and *Mrs. Coburn* (1887) situate the women as educated and wealthy ladies, and illustrates "their knowledge of and investment in a disruption of the colonial conflation of blackness with poverty and economic marginalization."<sup>107</sup> This is only furthered by their assertive and thoughtful poses and facial expressions.<sup>108</sup> Nelson indicates that as patrons, they would have had greater power over their photographic representation. Considering Miss Guilmartin's social mobility as an affluent daughter of cotton merchant who later held onto her wealth as an heiress and divorcée, it is likely that she was able to leverage her status in order to provide input for her photograph.<sup>109</sup> Both *H. Evans and Lady* and *Miss Guilmartin* stand out among the other images for their comparative opulence. As a result, it seems that the studio matched the perceived wealth of the setting according to the perceived wealth of the patron.

### **IV. Barriers to Self-Representation**

From research conducted the United States, Susan S. Williams indicates that the typical cost of a daguerreotype portrait in 1840 was \$4.00, but by the 1850s, this was lowered to one or two dollars. However, city-based photographers that catered to wealthier clientele were more expensive.<sup>110</sup> Part of their desirability was that they were known for their abilities in directing the client's pose and expression to create an effect of austere gentility. This was meant to produce an image that was a sincere reflection of the sitter's temperament. Nonetheless, as Williams points out, all of this posing ultimately meant that the photographer's mastery of directing the sitter led to a contrived and staged depiction.<sup>111</sup> Opposite of photography studios were picture factories:

<sup>107</sup> Nelson, Representing the Black Female Subject, 30.

<sup>108</sup> Nelson, Representing the Black Female Subject, 31.

<sup>109</sup> On the retention of her estate following her divorce from Onésiphore Ernest Talbot, see *Quebec Official Gazette* 50, vol. 50 (December 14, 1918): 2440.

<sup>110</sup> Williams, Confounding Images, 39.

<sup>111</sup> Williams, Confounding Images, 39.

studios that produced low-quality and small daguerreotypes in rapid succession at a few cents apiece. Williams notes that the hurried creation of these images likely captured a more immediate and genuine image of the sitter than those manufactured by the more costly galleries that advertised an intimate experience.<sup>112</sup>

Prices of photos at the Notman studio in 1866 were as follows: *cartes de visite* singlefigure portraits were sold at a price of three for \$1.50, six for \$2.50, twelve for \$4.00 and forty for \$10.00; cabinet card portraits cost three for \$3.00, six for \$5.00, twelve for \$8.00, and forty for \$20.00. Additional charges were added for supplementary figures.<sup>113</sup> Notman's studio, as the premier place to have one's photo taken in Quebec, reflected the cost of his prestige in his prices. By comparison, in 1867, the photography studio of J.H. Noverre and Company in Toronto – remarked as having "a reputation second to none in the Province [of Ontario]" charged \$5.00 for a dozen cabinet cards, "executed in superior style, and guaranteed to be a correct likeness."<sup>114</sup> As "Photographer to the Queen", however, Notman was able to charge almost double the price of a seemingly comparable studio.

Although photographs by less-acclaimed studios were cheaper, for the labouring class, the prices of Notman's studio would have constituted significant portions of their wages. Blacks were disproportionately working in low-paying jobs compared to their white counterparts. For example, census data from Toronto in 1881 indicates that 13.1% of blacks were employed as labourers versus 7.9% of the entire population, 13.5% worked as barbers and hairstylists versus 0.4% of the whole population, and 9.1% were laundresses versus 0.6% of general population.<sup>115</sup>

<sup>112</sup> Williams, Confounding Images, 41.

<sup>113</sup> William Notman, *Photography: Things You Ought to Know* (Montreal: Louis Perrault and Co., 1866), 12-13. 114 *Toronto Business Sketches: Being Descriptive Notices of the Principal Business Establishments in this City* (Toronto: Daily Telegraph Printing House, 1867), 91.

<sup>115</sup> Colin McFarquhar, "The Black Occupational Structure in Late-Nineteenth-Century Ontario: Evidence from the Census," in *Racism, Eh?: A Critical Inter-Disciplinary Anthology of Race and Racism in Canada*, eds. Charmaine A. Nelson and Camille A. Nelson. (Concord: Captus Press, 2004), 54.

Very few black people were listed as commercial clerks, accountants and bookkeepers, or engineers and mechanics. A study of London, Ontario by Tracey Adams indicates that black men were disproportionately concentrated into a narrower range of occupations (30 versus 129 possible jobs) than men altogether.<sup>116</sup> Also, although the category of labourer was the most common among white and black men, only 12% of all male Londoners were in this category versus 43% of black men. For black women in London, laundress and servant were the most frequently listed occupations in the census. Both white and black women were most frequently employed as servants or laundresses, but there was a greater range of available occupations for white women:

the 1901 census shows many London women employed as clerks, stenographers, nurses, and teachers. No woman of colour reported an occupation in one of these fields in 1901. As with men, many new jobs that were opening to women during this time period appear to have been closed to African Canadian women, who continued to predominate in the same jobs they had worked in for decades, with the exception of cigar making.<sup>117</sup>

Similar trends were found across other cities in what is now known as Ontario, and this pattern remained consistent from 1871 to 1901.<sup>118</sup> It is important to note, however, that census data can underrepresent the labour of an individual, since it only lists a single occupation, when in reality, they could be working several jobs.<sup>119</sup> Advertisements indicate that some black women were self-employed as seamstresses in addition to doing (underpaid) waged labour. Since many jobs were temporary and did not pay well, holding multiple positions was one method to earn enough

<sup>116</sup> Tracey Adams, "Making a Living: African Canadian Workers in London, Ontario, 1861–1901," *Labour/Le Travail* 67 (Spring 2011): 30.

<sup>117</sup> Adams, "Making a Living," 39.

<sup>118</sup> Adams, "Making a Living," 56.

<sup>119</sup> Peggy Bristow, "Whatever you raise in the ground you can sell it in Chatham," in *We're Rooted Here and They Can't Pull Us Up: Essays in African Canadian Women's History*, ed. Peggy Bristow (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1994), 98-104. In instances where a person worked several jobs to survive, it is likely that these were lower paying than the occupation they chose to list on the census.

income and also continue to have some financial stability in times of job loss.<sup>120</sup> Finally, a few women did not list occupations on the census, but ran boarding houses as a source of income.<sup>121</sup> Dorothy Williams writes that black Montrealers had to compete for jobs with "the Irish, scots, and the French," and as a result, "held the lowest positions on the occupational scale, those of barber, shoeshiner, domestic, elevator boy, busboy, waterboy, and porter."<sup>122</sup>

Census data did not include information on earnings until 1901, but a survey of 7671 Montreal families that was conducted in 1897 reveals that there were, on average, 1.4 people who contributed to a household's income, and that 74% of the population – what the surveyor, Herbert Brown Ames, termed "the real industrial class" – earned an average income of \$10.00 to \$10.25 per week.<sup>123</sup> Outside of this 74%, were the 15% of households who earned above \$20.00 per week, and the bottom 11% who, largely due to unemployment, had to survive on less than \$5.00 each week. Ames further broke down the weekly wage of that 74% into a picture of incomes from: men at \$8.25, women at \$4.50, and boys at \$3.00. Since unstable employment was prevalent, one cannot simply multiply these weekly earnings by 52 in order to determine the average yearly income of a household. These values merely reflect the averages earned on a working week. Ames specified that only 23% of the 74% had irregular incomes, and then concluded that the minimum yearly income required to live just above impoverishment was \$260. On the whole, Quebec men primarily employed in the "domestic and personal class"

<sup>120</sup> Mélanie Knight, "Black Self-Employed Women in the Twenty-First Century: A Critical Approach," *Canadian Woman Studies* 23 (2004): 106.

<sup>121</sup> Adams, "Making a Living," 38.

<sup>122</sup> Dorothy W. Williams, *Blacks in Montreal, 1628-1986: An Urban Demography* (Cowansville: Éditions Yvon Blais, 1989), 19, 19n15. Williams also notes that the between 1861 and 1871, young Irish Catholics composed two thirds of domestic servants in Montreal.

<sup>123</sup> Terry J. Copp, "The Condition of the Working Class in Montreal 1897-1929," *Canadian Historical Association, Historical Papers* 7, no. 1 (1972): 160-161.

averaged an annual income of \$195, and \$144 for women.<sup>124</sup> Nationally, female launderers made approximately \$193, housekeepers \$178, and servants \$120.<sup>125</sup> Female workers engaged in domestic work as secondary earnings made an additional estimated \$57 per annum.<sup>126</sup> Using the annual average income for Quebec residents in the domestic class in 1901 census, the cheapest option available at Notman's – three *cartes de visite* for \$1.50 – would have cost a female domestic servant, earning \$144 per annum, 15% of her average monthly wage. However, it is important to note that these figures reflect women as an averaged whole, and that the waged earnings of women of colour could have been lower than that of white women.

### V. Women (and Men) at Work: Images of Self-Possession under Servitude

Frederick Douglass expressed the significance of self-representation through photography, which he felt was largely accessible and valued across classes, and more importantly, unlike painting and drawing, the depiction of the sitter was more likely to be faithfully rendered by the camera. He indicated, "What was once the exclusive luxury of the rich and great is now within *reach of all*. The humbled servant girl, whose income is but a few shillings per week, may now possess a more perfect likeness of herself than noble ladies and court royalty, with all its precious treasures, could purchase fifty years ago."<sup>127</sup> However, after examining the income and occupational opportunities available to black women in Canada, it becomes clear that a photographic portrait was still a luxury for some.

This becomes evident when one notices the large number of black women in the Notman photographic archives who were photographed as nursemaids, and whose portraits were likely

<sup>124</sup> Canada Census and Statistics Office, "Wage-Earners by Occupations," Table I: Earnings of Employees by Classes for the Provinces, 1901 (Ottawa: S.E. Dawson, 1907), 6. The data for this bulletin was collected from the 1901 Census.

<sup>125</sup> Canada Census and Statistics Office, "Wage-Earners by Occupations," Table II: Earnings of Employees by Classes and Kinds of Occupations for the Dominion. 1901 (Ottawa: S.E. Dawson, 1907), 10.

<sup>126</sup> Canada Census and Statistics Office, "Wage-Earners by Occupations," Table IV: Extra Earnings of Employees by Occupations for the Dominion (Ottawa: S.E. Dawson, 1907), 94.

<sup>127 &</sup>quot;Douglass, "Pictures and Progress, 454. Italics are my own.
commissioned by their white employers. In the same vein is the photograph Mrs. McWill and Mrs. Ringold's Servants (1873; Fig. 1.13). The two men in the image wear the same outfit, perhaps a uniform, and sit atop a crate branded with "Ransom Guards." The Ransom Guards were a volunteer militia unit stationed in St. Albans, and were photographed for a composite created by William Notman's Montreal studio.<sup>128</sup> Unlike other individuals whose likenesses were captured for the composite, such as E. J. Samson (1873, Fig. 1.14), the servants lack names aside from those of their employers. One can see the two servants behind the drummer towards the left of the resulting composite image (Fig. 1.15).<sup>129</sup> Enslaved blacks in livery signified the affluence and colonial reach of elite whites, positioning them as objects of "conspicuous consumption."<sup>130</sup> Although they held privileges due to their proximity to aristocratic or otherwise wealthy households, liveried slaves were seldom permitted to have their lives consist of anything "beyond survival."<sup>131</sup> As likely underpaid servants wearing matching outfits and identified only through the names of their employers, Mrs. McWill and Mrs. Ringold were engaging in a tradition of using visual representation to signify the limitations placed on liveried slaves' identities and lives. Tamara J. Walker postulates that in Lima, livery signified the enslaved as not only "property but tools" in the fabrication of "their owners' retinues, pageants, and performative

<sup>128</sup> Richard F. Miller, *States at War. A Reference Guide for Connecticut, Maine, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, Rhode Island, and Vermont in the Civil War*, vol. 1 (Hanover: University Press of New England, 2013), 634. It is unclear where the photographs were taken. In Hall, Dodds, and Triggs, *The World of William Notman*, 82-83, the text suggests that the infantry travelled to Notman's studio in Montreal. However, a source published a year later indicates that William Notman took their photographs when he travelled to Vermont; see Stanley G. Triggs, *The Composite Photographs of William Notman* (Montreal: McCord Museum of Canadian History, 1994), 85. 129 For a similar composite photograph of another militia, see plate of "William Notman, *Albany Zouave Cadets, Albany, New York*. 1879, original albumen copy, 26 x 41.3 cm, Albany Institute of History and Art, Albany, New York," in Triggs, *The Composite Photographs of William Notman*, 53. As with the composite photograph of the Ransom Guards, one can discern a black servant sitting atop a crate or chest branded with the name of the infantry and located behind a drum in the left plane. Akin to the figure at right in *Mrs. McWill and Mrs. Ringold's Servants*, his body faces away from the camera as he looks over his shoulder.

<sup>130</sup> Monica L. Miller, *Slaves to Fashion: Black Dandyism and the Styling of Black Diasporic Identity* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2009), 49.

<sup>131</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 56.

traditions."<sup>132</sup> As ornamental extensions of their owner's power, the enslaved were not meant to communicate any of their own socioeconomic desires or aesthetic preferences. Thus, the ineffaceable otherness through which the enslaved were perceived ensured that: "male and female slaves could dress identically to their owners without ever taking on any aspects of their owner' identities. In fact, the act of dressing in identical livery, silks, laces, or veiled costumes was the ultimate statement and sign of alterity."<sup>133</sup> Rebecca Earle's research divulges that the practice of dressing the enslaved as an extension of the owner's body can also be found in Brazil where wealthy women in particular dressed female attendants in finery.<sup>134</sup> As with Brazil and Peru, the use of livery in Canada was a tradition that had been in place since the Dominion's period of slavery.<sup>135</sup> Returning to the photograph of *Mrs. McWill and Mrs. Ringold's Servants* – and, as will be discussed below, portraits of nursemaids – as echoes of the pageantry of livery in prior decades, the servants' immaculate attire was not an expression of their own wealth and social statuses, but that of their employers.

Oral histories of black women in Canada reveal that their income was necessary to the family's financial well-being, and that they primarily worked in domestic service due to race and class-based structural limitations.<sup>136</sup> Nineteenth-century census records show that black women were employed in a range of professions, such as "dressmaker, shopkeeper, basket-maker,

<sup>132</sup> Tamara J. Walker, *Exquisite Slaves: Race, Clothing, and Status in Colonial Lima* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017), 38.

<sup>133</sup> Walker, Exquisite Slaves, 38.

<sup>134</sup> Rebecca Earle, "'Two Pairs of Pink Satin Shoes!': Race, Clothing and Identity in The Americas (17th-19th Centuries)," *History Workshop Journal*, no. 52 (August 2001): 183.

<sup>135</sup> A slave sale advertisement posted in the Quebec Gazette on February 23, 1769, by a Quebec City tavern keeper referred to as Miles Prenties, highlights that one of the domestic servants, an unnamed man of 23 years old, "looks well in Livery." For the full advertisement, see Frank Mackey, *Done with Slavery: The Black Fact in Montreal, 1760-1840* (McGill-Queen's University Press, 2010), 316.

<sup>136</sup> Sherry Edmunds-Flett, "'Abundant faith': Nineteenth-Century African-Canadian Women on Vancouver Island," in *Telling Tales: Essays in Western Women's History*, eds. Catherine Anne Cavanaugh and R. R. Warne (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2000), 276.

private teacher, weaver, farmer, and washerwoman."<sup>137</sup> Linda Carty communicates that their "economic role means that they have occupied a central and not merely a supporting position" in their families, communities, and in history.<sup>138</sup> Carty traces the development of domestic labour in Canada to slavery where the sexual division of work meant that black men had more opportunities to obtain specialized skillsets as craftsmen.<sup>139</sup> Thus, when they moved to Canada, black women found domestic jobs. Even though it was typical for women to engage in domestic labour due to their gender, black women were doubly implicated by their race and gender, which "placed them in a position where they could not depend on their husbands' waged work to maintain their families. And though many working-class white women also had to work outside the home – because most labouring men did not earn a 'family wage' – segregation shut Black women out of most working-class jobs."<sup>140</sup>

In an examination of representations of black female caregivers in Canadian art produced shortly after slavery's demise, Charmaine A. Nelson explores how these images reveal the limitations in self-representation, and access to educational and occupational opportunities faced by black women in the nineteenth century.<sup>141</sup> Victorian-era photographs of black nannies in United States and Canada make apparent the profession's "proximity to slavery."<sup>142</sup> These photographs point to the issues in rearing white children of "the people who daily humiliated, controlled, abused, and demeaned you" only to possibly experience the same treatment from the

139 Carty, "African Canadian Women," 208. It is important to note that this division of labour also existed in other sites, like the Caribbean, where enslaved Creole (colony-born) males tended to be trained as artisans such as carpenters, coopers, and blacksmiths, and enslaved females comprised a larger percentage of the field labourers than their male counterparts. See: Lucille Mathurin Mair, "Women Field Workers in Jamaica During Slavery," *Caribbean Slavery in the Atlantic World: A Student Reader*, eds. Verene Shepherd and Hilary McD. Beckles (Kingston, Jamaica: Ian Randle, 2000), 390; and Nelson, *Slavery, Geography and Empire*, 281. 140 Carty, "African Canadian Women," 208.

<sup>137</sup> Sylvia Hamilton, "Naming Names, Naming Ourselves," in We're Rooted Here, 33-34.

<sup>138</sup> Linda Carty, "African Canadian Women and the State," in We're Rooted Here, 205.

<sup>141</sup> Nelson, Representing the Black Female Subject, 45-52.

<sup>142</sup> Nelson, Representing the Black Female Subject, 45.

child once they grow into adulthood.<sup>143</sup> As Nelson contends, images such as Nanny with the *Children in Her Care, Guysborough* (c. 1900; Fig. 1.19), which shows a black woman taking two white children for a stroll along a waterfront trail, point to a desire to "naturalize these problematic cross-racial and cross-class relationships."<sup>144</sup> What is common among these photos – Nanny with Children in Her Care, Mrs. Cowan's Nursemaid, Baby Paikert and Nurse (1901; Fig. 1.18) and as mentioned earlier, Mrs. McWill and Mrs. Ringold's Servants - is the simultaneous erasure of the servant's name and their association with their employer. Nelson compares this anonymization with the exclusion of the nursemaid from the family unit: white children's "education into white supremacy," even if they were loved and cared for by their black nursery maids, was "an integral part of how whites reproduced their social power."<sup>145</sup> The nurse in Nanny with the Children in Her Care, Guysborough is also immaculately dressed, suggesting that she worked for a wealthy family and by extension, likely lived with them to the detriment of her own personal life. Her care of white children means time taken away from attending to her own kin, if she had any. Even in instances where the nursery maid is depicted as a single-figure portrait, such as Mrs. Cowan's Nursemaid (1871; Fig. 1.20), she is still often anonymized, likely because the employer commissioned the photograph.<sup>146</sup> Nelson concludes that the images such as Nanny with the Children in Her Care, Guysborough and Mrs. Cowan's Nursemaid

remind us that black women continued to raise white children and care for white adults well after the end of slavery. This domestic servitude was in part due to the lack of educational opportunity fostered by racial segregation that ensured a lack of access to other employment, exacerbated by other forms of social exclusion and strategic institutional racism.<sup>147</sup>

<sup>143</sup> Nelson, Representing the Black Female Subject, 45.

<sup>144</sup> Nelson, Representing the Black Female Subject, 45.

<sup>145</sup> Nelson, Representing the Black Female Subject, 46.

<sup>146</sup> Nelson, Representing the Black Female Subject, 51.

<sup>147</sup> Nelson, Representing the Black Female Subject, 52.

Nelson deduces that even though *Mrs. Cowan's Nursemaid* is photographed alone, "white power and authority is mapped onto the image through the process of naming that displaced the black nurse's name and replaced it with that of the white female employer."<sup>148</sup> The asymmetries of power in these photographs are akin to the ones in the oil portraits that predate them: "that of the white owner/master/mistress/employer as the initiator of the commissioned portrait, and the black female slave/nurse as a considerably restricted agent in her own representation."<sup>149</sup> According to the images' index numbers, the nursemaid was photographed directly after her charge, *Missie D. Cowan* (Fig. 1.21), and both images used the same photographic process. What is pointedly different between them is their size and framing. Unlike the nurse whose photo is a modest *carte de visite*, Missie D. Cowan's stands quite larger as a cabinet card and her image is ensconced in a glowing halo. Considering that both of their portraits are ovals, it seems that they would have been mounted or housed in oval frames. Thus, even though these images were taken separately, one can infer that they were intended to be displayed together.

This desire to visually dissociate the family from "the body that labours," meant that servants were usually excluded from studio photographs, thus omitting them from images of the domestic unit.<sup>150</sup> Photos of black nursemaids, slaves, or servants were not typical, but when they occurred, they often functioned to signify the family's domestic wealth and "property."<sup>151</sup> Inherent to these photos is the power relation between the black domestic worker and white family, and a conspicuous absence of the nursemaid's own personal and family life. Although domestic work offered women income, it is crucial to recognize that this was a way to continue

<sup>148</sup> Nelson, Representing the Black Female Subject, 52.

<sup>149</sup> Nelson, Representing the Black Female Subject, 52.

<sup>150</sup> Laura Wexler, *Tender Violence: Domestic Visions in an Age of U.S. Imperialism* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2000), 67-68.

<sup>151</sup> Wexler, Tender Violence, 68-72.

the association between "master" and "slave" post slavery – what Tamara J. Walker refers to as an "aesthetic of mastery."<sup>152</sup>

Wexler argues that photographs of black caregivers with their white charges highlight the social barriers experienced by black women and emphasize the sanctity of white womanhood.<sup>153</sup> In removing the name of the nursemaid, and instead replacing it with her job title and the name of her employer, the photograph affirms that the "iconographical space" of motherhood was reserved for white women.<sup>154</sup> Mrs. Farguharson, Copied in 1867 (Fig. 1.16) epitomizes this. She appears in silk jacket with bell sleeves and wears an empire bonnet. By all accounts, she looks like an elegant middle-class woman. It is the image of her with the white child that makes clear what her position is, and that Mrs. Farquharson is not her identity but that of the woman for whom she works. Although it may appear that black domestic servants were "one of the family," their presence within the white home was marked by simultaneous hyper- and in-visibility. In order to appear "readily manageable and nonthreatening," domestic servants blended into the workings of the home, their bodies only appearing as evidence of labour and white prosperity. Visual culture reified the demarcations of domestic labourers as second-class citizens in stereotyped figure of the "mammy," which functioned to validate restrictions on their earning potential, fields of work, and social conduct.<sup>155</sup> Despite these labour conditions, many black women maintained loving families of their own, even refusing to live with the white families they worked for.<sup>156</sup>

<sup>152</sup> Walker, Exquisite Slaves, 21.

<sup>153</sup> Wexler, Tender Violence, 65.

<sup>154</sup> Wexler, Tender Violence, 65.

<sup>155</sup> Browne, Dark Matters, 57.

<sup>156</sup> Browne, Dark Matters, 58.

# **VI.** Conclusion

This chapter set out to look at studio portraits within the Notman archives as a form of biography through which erasure of black Canadians from the nation's history can be countered. In doing so, these photographs facilitate not only the research of specific individuals, particularly those who have been identified by name, but also the plurality of lived experiences in Montreal, and the differing levels of access to picture-making. On the significance of photographs as primary documents, Douglas Henry Daniels has noted:

Occupation, income, education, and similar variables are important for assessing accomplishments and status, but I would also emphasize the public image or self-image that is presented. Scholars can use photographs to study historically "inarticulate" segments of our population. Since most ordinary Americans leave few, if any, written records – diaries, autobiographical memoirs, or letters – historians and others must start taking seriously such seeming inconsequential materials as family photographs, snapshots, and albums.<sup>157</sup>

Black Americans and Canadians began creating photographic portraits of and for loved ones as soon as the daguerreotype process was made available.<sup>158</sup> Incorporating romanticism and classicism using backdrops and studio props, these early photographs were reminiscent of eighteenth-century paintings. In her research on black photographers in the United States, Deborah Willis asserts, "most of their African-American clients wanted to celebrate their achievements and establish a counterimage that conveyed a sense of self and self-worth."<sup>159</sup> Willis observes that often, photographs were taken to celebrate an important event in the subject's life, such as "birth, confirmation, graduation, courtship, marriage, military service, anniversaries, death, or some social or political success."<sup>160</sup> While some photographs were taken for the purposes of public circulation, such as abolitionist literature, most photographs were

<sup>157</sup> Douglas Henry Daniels, *Pioneer Urbanites: A Social and Cultural History of Black San Francisco* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990), 9-10.

<sup>158</sup> Willis, Reflections in Black, 3.

<sup>159</sup> Willis, Reflections in Black, xvii.

<sup>160</sup> Willis, Reflections in Black, 3.

created as private family keepsakes. What is important to consider at this point, are the ways in which subjects used approaches to visuality to exert greater control as agents of their own image.

## **Chapter Two**

# Cultivating Identities outside the Frame: Self-Fashioning and the Matter of Visibility

# I. Introduction

In looking at the photographic practices of contemporary African diasporic artists, Krista Thompson discusses the notion of the "bixel" - the word being a combination of "black" and "pixel" – to highlight an "unsettled" blackness, one that is "suspended in the representational possibilities of bits and bytes."<sup>161</sup> Similarly, the term connotes the circulation of African diasporic cultures through media that highlight the materiality and technological praxis of sight. By using photography as a representational tool, the artist/subject merges with technology to the extent that their visibility and subjectivity remain unfixed. Photography's several lenses, technological processes, and attention to light and surface allow the artist/subject an "act of escape, of slipping into and out of surfaces that might overdetermine, hypervisualize, and visually consume blackness and obscure any sense of an interior life."<sup>162</sup> Using these theoretical propositions, I suggest that the transcendental and transformative possibilities of photography were used as an act of performance within the studio complete with costumes and artificial settings. I will also consider the importance of clothing and self-fashioning to enslaved and free black people in what is now North and South America, and examine the attempts of whites to control the visibility and perception of black people through blackface minstrelsy, and in turn, maintain fixed definitions of whiteness. I will also explore the ways in which the photographs were constructed through performance, clothing and artifice.

<sup>161</sup> Krista A. Thompson, *Shine: The Visual Economy of Light in African Diasporic Aesthetic Practice* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2015), 36-37. 162 Thompson, *Shine*, 37.

Several of the images in the Notman collection are full-length portraits. While this allows for a full view of one's outfit and the imagining of an environment created within the studio, it also implies, as Krista Thompson surmises in her study of contemporary street photography, that "subjectivity and status are rendered through the whole person, not just the face."<sup>163</sup> Thompson indicates that the significance of bodily presence within an image lies with the fact that there is a long-standing notion that one's inner self can be determined through outward appearance.<sup>164</sup> Thompson also conveys that in instances where the assembly of the backdrop is made clear, there is seepage between what is real and unreal. Just as the photograph escapes the confines of the frame, one can posit that so too does the subject. Their lives and their futures extend beyond what is captured by the camera. In dressing up and occupying a space of performance, black Victorian subjects can be said to not only have been in some instances engaged in literal acts of escape as runaways, but also, move beyond the social confinements imposed by colonial class structures and beauty standards in lieu of legal oppression. Through narrating their own personhoods, and occupying both real (the studio) and artificial (the backdrop) spaces of patrician society, the subjects explored liminal sites of possibility whereby they could elude hegemonic structures that sought to restrict and efface their own definitions of themselves. Using tools such as props and painted backgrounds, patrons could performatively escape visual capture by composing their own images, as mediated by the photographer.

#### **II.** The Studio as Theatre

After surveying the available literature and photographs of Notman's staff, it seems that all of Notman's staff were visibly white.<sup>165</sup> Furthermore, in an analysis of female employees, Colleen Marie Skidmore concluded that there were no Indigenous, Asian, eastern European,

<sup>163</sup> Thompson, Shine, 63.

<sup>164</sup> Thompson, Shine, 63.

<sup>165</sup> This includes photographers, editors, and print room employees.

French-Canadian, or black women employed by Notman.<sup>166</sup> Colleen Skidmore suggests that in favouring British employees, Notman would have reinforced the hierarchy of the Montreal bourgeoisie, and prioritized British patrons as well. Knowing this, why would black Montrealers choose Notman's studio to have their portraits taken? In using Wallace and Smith's proposition that authorship can be read through the choices of the subject, we can look for ways in which Notman's studio may have offered patrons greater leverage in the making of their image, both through the experience of the sitting and the reception of the photo as tied to the reputation of the studio.<sup>167</sup> Skidmore, focusing on French-Canadian patrons writes:

Acquiring a portrait from the most prestigious studio in the city and one of the very best on the continent was no small measure of a family's financial success and social acumen. Overstepping boundaries of national origin or language may be perceived as a refusal to be segregated or confined to less prestigious commercial sites. It signals a determination to claim a social identity and status of the highest nature and a portrait from Notman's carried just such a cache. The finest photographic portrait was acquired to display this attainment and claim it on an equal basis with bourgeoisie of British origin.<sup>168</sup>

This passage becomes especially poignant when one considers the hostility towards black residents by white Quebec society compared to that of Ontario. Mary Ann Shadd stressed this in *A Plea for Emigration* (1852) – a guide for black Americans who considered moving to Canada. She warned immigrants planning to settle in Quebec that although the French were "not averse to truth" they also were "pre-disposed [...] to deal roughly" with black people due to the French's fondness for white Americans who also sought to displace the British.<sup>169</sup> Blacks would have faced racism at the many establishments they visited in Montreal. However, it is possible that as

<sup>166</sup> Skidmore, "Women in Photography," 209.

<sup>167</sup> It is also possible that established black photographers did not yet exist in Montreal, as will be explored further in Chapter Three.

<sup>168</sup> Skidmore, "Women in Photography," 210.

<sup>169</sup> Mary A. Shadd, A Plea for Emigration or Notes on Canada West in Its Moral, Social and Political Aspect: Suggestions Respecting Mexico, West Indies and Vancouver's Island for the Information of Colored Emigrants (Detroit: George W. Pattison, 1852), 35.

a photographer known for his diplomatic integrity, Notman would have maintained his professionalism with black patrons as well.

Frederick Douglass chose to be photographed at a Notman branch when visiting Boston, and received several images gratis. <sup>170</sup> We also know that Notman was supportive of the African American artist Robert S. Duncanson and helped to establish his presence in the Canadian art scene.<sup>171</sup> Although black sitters would surely have experienced a degree of racism from some of Notman's employees, the lack of their own first-hand accounts of their visits makes it difficult to fully comprehend the entirety of their experiences in Notman's studio. However, at least part of their motivation would have been Notman's reputation and the deficit of other studios from which to choose, which will be discussed further in Chapter Three. Indeed, the studio's prestige, as both "Photographer to the Queen" and a studio that photographed eminent black men, must have been a significant deciding factor.

Daguerreotypy was brought to North America in 1839, amid the emergence of minstrelsy.<sup>172</sup> Blackface minstrelsy pervaded the public and private spheres, through the immense popularity of minstrel music, its renditions within the parlour using sheet music that

<sup>170</sup> Denis Bourdon, principal photographer and manager of the Notman Photographic Company's Boston location, took pictures of Frederick Douglass and his grandson during a sitting on May 10, 1894. Douglass was visiting Boston to give a speech at the People's Church, located three blocks away from the gallery, and his grandson, Joseph, performed violin solos before and after his lecture. A letter written to Douglass from the Notman Photographic Company indicates that aside from including the three-quarter portrait that was ordered, the studio also sent a dozen gratis copies. Denis Bourdon had apprenticed and worked for William Notman from 1868 to 1877, at which point he left for the studio in Boston, becoming the lead photographer in 1880, manager in 1884, and president of the company's American operations in 1918. See: Stauffer, Trodd, and Bernier, *Picturing Frederick Douglass*, 70-71; and Hall, Dodds, and Triggs, *The World of William Notman*, 59-60.

<sup>171</sup> William Notman financed an exhibition of Duncanson's paintings at his studio in 1863, for which the artist received great acclaim by the public. Notman also included photographs of his landscapes in a portfolio of works by local and visiting artists to serve as inspiration for Canadian artists. See Allan Pringle, "Robert S. Duncanson in Montreal, 1863-1865," *American Art Journal* 17, no. 4 (Autumn 1985): 30-33.

<sup>172</sup> Miller, *Slaves to Fashion*, 237. There is evidence of this practice occurring as early as the 1820s; see Stephanie Dunson, "Black Misrepresentation in Nineteenth-Century Sheet Music Illustration," in *Beyond Blackface: African Americans and the Creation of American Popular Culture, 1890-1930*, ed. W. Fitzhugh Brundage (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2011), 45. Eric Lott dates the emergence of minstrelsy to the early 1830s; see *Eric Lott, Love and Theft: Blackface Minstrelsy and the American Working Class*, 20th anniv. ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), 6.

featured grotesque caricatures, travelling minstrel performers, and the circulation of illustrations within popular visual culture.<sup>173</sup> Countering the pervasiveness of this practice were photographs by black patrons and photographers who constructed their own images.<sup>174</sup> Developments in printing press technology, such as the halftone, allowed for the easy reproduction of photographs in newspapers, magazines and other printed mediums. With this change, "black-authored images proliferated," and individuals across the United States were able to witness the "ordinary folk eager to capture their big city lives as well as the black intellectual and artistic community hard at the work of the uplift."<sup>175</sup> Authorship is crucial to the reading of these images, where control over their making shifts from white to black authorial power using a medium that traverses high and vernacular art. White artists were likely to imprint their biases onto the photographs they took of black subjects, even if unconsciously. Frederick Douglass, discussed the matter in an article published in his newspaper, *The North Star*, in which he outlined that black people "can never have impartial portraits at the hands of white artists," since prevailing notions regarding phrenology and racial difference made it "next to impossible for white men to take likenesses of black men, without most grossly exaggerating their distinctive features."<sup>176</sup> So how then, does this affect the reading of photographs taken by Notman and his white employees? For this, we can turn to Maurice O. Wallace and Shawn Michelle Smith's belief that visual culture includes those who "think, write about, and use images in ways that transform their possible purpose and meaning," indicating that the production of photography occurred through the acts of sitting for, commissioning, and taking of photos, as well as through their surrounding literature and

<sup>173</sup> See: Stephanie Dunson, "The Minstrel in the Parlor: Nineteenth-Century Sheet Music and the Domestication of Blackface Minstrelsy," *ATQ* 16, no. 4 (December 2002): 241-256; and Dunson, "Black Misrepresentation in Nineteenth-Century Sheet Music Illustration," 45-65.

<sup>174</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 238.

<sup>175</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 238.

<sup>176</sup> Douglass, "A Tribute to the Negro," The North Star, April 7, 1849, 2.

usage.<sup>177</sup> This perspective supports a way in which authorship can be viewed not only through the position of the photographer and their employees, but also through the patron's influences on the creation and presentation of their likeness.

The reputation of the studio was reflected in the quality it offered. For one thing, the name of the studio, medals and other advertisements would be printed onto the photographic mount – connecting the image and subject to the "Photographer to the Queen." Even if the mounts were not visible, the photos were "normally identifiable by the distinctiveness of the Notman house style."<sup>178</sup> Secondly, the studio advertised its attentiveness to the client's experience. To prepare clients for their sessions, Notman distributed a pamphlet titled *Photography: Things You Ought to Know*, which provided visitors to the studio with suggestions on how to get their best likeness taken.<sup>179</sup> Under the heading entitled "Dress," Notman recommended rich fabrics, particularly "silks, satins, reps and winceys" in dark neutral colours.<sup>180</sup> He also indicated that people could have their clothes sent to the studio ahead of their visit, so that they may change into them using the dressing rooms.<sup>181</sup> In addition to capturing the care paid to the sitter through these pamphlets, clients would get a sense of the environment offered by the studio through the creation of a gallery in the reception room, featuring framed artworks, examples of the studio's work, the picture books, and their accomplishments:

On entering, the visitor is shown into the reception rooms, a suite of four, the walls of which are completely covered with the finest specimens of the art, comprising portraits of celebrities, foreign and local, many of which are exquisitely finished in water colors and oil; here will also be found some very fine paintings by Vicat, Cole, Deerman, Jacobi, Way, &c., with many choice proof engravings, which give diversity and add to the interest of the whole. There is also an interesting relic of the visit of the Prince of Wales

<sup>177</sup> Wallace and Smith, "Introduction," 1.

<sup>178</sup> Hall, Dodds, and Triggs, The World of William Notman, 61.

<sup>179</sup> Stanley Triggs, *William Notman's Studio: The Canadian Picture* (Montreal: McCord Museum of Canadian History, 1992), 51.

<sup>180</sup> Notman, Photography, 6-7.

<sup>181</sup> Notman, Photography, 8.

to this Province, in a duplicate set of the Photographs presented by the Government to H. R. H., comprising views of the most noted points of interest in Canada, from the Saguenay to Niagara.<sup>182</sup>

The proprietaries file at the Notman archives includes more than one hundred objects, including: books, bookstands, toy alphabet blocks, a jump rope, boxes and chests, a bureau, pedestals, an easel, a croquet set, a birdcage, mirrors, chairs and tables, drapes, backdrops, baskets, ornate screens, table cloths, a teas set, vases, a fishing rod, a sewing basket, sleights, sofas, stools and footstools, fences, a stuffed dog, bottles, books, such as indoor and outdoor furniture, curtains, mirrors, household décor items, books, a fence, and plants.<sup>183</sup> On the whole, the purpose of these accessories was to simulate real outdoor and domestic environments, and recreate a "home feeling" for sitters in the operating rooms (Figs. 2.1 and 2.2).<sup>184</sup> As this file was created by the archivist Nora Hague, based on the props she noticed in photographs, the only two articles of clothing listed in the file were a *ceinture fléchée* (arrow sash) and a fur coat – both of which were used by Montreal photographers to create winter scenes.<sup>185</sup> However, by comparing photographs taken at Notman's Montreal studio, Jana Bara discovered that certain articles of fur clothing were repeated across sitters and images, suggesting that the studio possessed a collection of fur clothes for photos.<sup>186</sup> In order to determine whether the studio kept a collection of regular attire,

<sup>182</sup> Canada Railway Advertising Company, *Montreal business sketches with a description of the city of Montreal: its public buildings and places of interest, and the Grand Trunk works at Point St. Charles, Victoria Bridge &c., &c.* (Montreal: M. Longmore and Co., Gazette Job Office, 1864), 25-26.

<sup>183</sup> Prop File, Notman Photographic Archives, McCord Museum of Canadian History, Montreal; Jana Bara, "Through the Frosty Lens: William Notman and His Studio Props, 1861-1876," *History of Photography* 12, no. 1 (1988), 26-27.

<sup>184 &</sup>quot;Our Picture," The Philadelphia Photographer 4, no. 48 (December 1867): 399.

<sup>185 &</sup>quot;Cabinet Photographs, Best Finish," advertisement, *Montreal Winter Carnival Souvenir*, (Montreal: Canada Railway News Co, 1889). The studio of G.C. Arless and Company advertised that it could outfit sitters with "Snow-Shoe Costumes" which typically consisted of a blanket coat and *ceinture fléchée*. For more on the blanket coat and *ceinture fléchée*, see Eileen Stack, "Very Picturesque and Very Canadian': The Blanket Coat and Anglo-Canadian Identity in the Second Half of the Nineteenth Century," in *Fashion: A Canadian Perspective*, ed. Alexandra Palmer (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004), 17-40.

<sup>186</sup> Jana Bara, "Cradled in Furs Winter Fashions in Montreal in the 1860s," Dress 16, no. 1 (1990): 39-47.

a more extensive study looking for repetition of identical clothing across portraits would need to be completed.

## III. Light and the Limits of Visibility

Aside from the lengthy exposure time of ten to thirty minutes, early daguerreotypists' greatest challenge was skin, as it did not reflect light well enough for photographic capture.<sup>187</sup> Daguerre's camera could not take portraits lest the subject apply white paint to their face and powder to their hair. Modifications were made to the design in subsequent years by other photographers, most notably, Alexander S. Wolcott's addition of mirrors to allow more light to reach the plate, and the application of bromine and chorine to increase its sensitivity.<sup>188</sup> Richard Dyer postulates that photography, like other technologies of light, privileges and facilitates whiteness.<sup>189</sup> Dyer defines the lighting of a subject in photography and film as "controlled visibility," since lighting is used to draw attention to key elements within a frame.<sup>190</sup> At its most essential level, proper lighting ensures that the subject is clearly differentiated from their environment. However, this is complicated by the fact that as photographs began to replace the popularity of painted portraits from the mid-nineteenth century onwards, photographic technology was developed according to the chief patron: the white person.<sup>191</sup> Thus, the camera's standard usage and development considered white people to be the universal subject, "to the extent that they come to seem to have a special relationship to light."<sup>192</sup> Cameras do not merely capture an image of reality; they also reproduce certain ideals about race and beauty.

<sup>187</sup> Greenhill and Birrell, Canadian Photography, 24.

<sup>188</sup> Greenhill and Birrell, Canadian Photography, 24.

<sup>189</sup> Richard Dyer, White (London: Routledge, 1997), 84-85.

<sup>190</sup> Dyer, White, 86.

<sup>191</sup> Dyer, White, 90.

<sup>192</sup> Dyer, White, 103.

There are no consistent patterns to suggest that the photographers of Notman's studio structured their patrons according to light, however, this does not mean that white patrons did not seek paler countenances, as this was normative for the period.<sup>193</sup> Additionally, any differences in lighting could be due to the preferences of the photographer or patron, variations in the preparation or exposure of plates, or changes in natural lighting as the studio relied on sunlight to take portraits. Despite this acknowledgement, the considerable attention paid to light by Notman, which will be discussed later in the chapter, and the historical analysis by Dyer make the discussion of light and translucency in relation to Notman's photographs worth pursuing, especially for photographs that include subjects with both dark and light skin. Dark skin reflects less light than pale skin, which poses a challenge for photographing people of contrasting skin tones within the same frame especially when one considers that whiteness has historically been used as a universal reference point in establishing lighting and photographic design.<sup>194</sup>

*Nurse and Baby, Copied for Mrs. Farquharson in 1868* (Fig. 1.17), replicates the iconography of Madonna and Child in the figure's poses and their sumptuous skirts and sleeves recall classical drapery. The nursemaid's loose sleeves, a style that would have allowed a greater range of movement when caring for children, add to the effect. Laura Wexler compares the imagery of the black nursemaid and white child with the iconography of the Madonna and Child. She articulates that similar visual rhetoric can be discerned in the expressions of the maternal figures in photographs of nursemaids with their charges and in paintings of the Madonna and Child:

the attentive "truthlikeness" to the materiality of the figure being depicted often blends into some other unidentifiable expression, one that is "unrepresentable" or disengaged. Painted Madonnas are often holding the baby Jesus but looking away. In this averted

<sup>193</sup> Grigsby, Enduring Truths, 97.

<sup>194</sup> Dyer, White, 89.

gaze, Kristeva notes, "the maternal body slips away from the discursive hold" to become "a sacred beyond." <sup>195</sup>

Despite shared visual cues, the photograph of the nanny and infant departs from this iconography precisely through the materiality evoked by the photograph. While both Madonna and nursemaid solemnly gaze as they take on the responsibility of caring for a child who is their superior, the nursemaid is bound by her corporeality, since "working for someone else's transcendence, she is not allowed to signify her own."<sup>196</sup> What the "culture of light" meant for photography is that varying levels of light and translucency were used to class subjects according to their social status, such as their race, gender, and affluence with bourgeois white women as most pale and translucent.<sup>197</sup> This "translucence" occurred through soft illumination that emphasized the intangible essence of the person. Techniques such as chiaroscuro in painting, and later, threepoint lighting in film were used to direct the palpability of the subject through controlling demarcations between light and shadow and the extent to which surface textures and contours were made visible. Chiaroscuro delineates between light and dark, spirit and body, and "selectively, lets light through. It allows the spiritual to be manifest in the material," since it is this "combination of translucence and substance – not translucence alone – which really defines white representation."<sup>198</sup> As mentioned earlier, Notman's studio used natural lighting, and while this would have posed a challenge for people who worked long days and had leisure time reduced to evenings (an issue that some studios sought to address with electric lighting), natural light also held symbolic connotations of enlightenment and racial superiority.<sup>199</sup>

<sup>195</sup> Wexler, Tender Violence, 61-62.

<sup>196</sup> Wexler, Tender Violence, 64-65.

<sup>197</sup> Dyer, White, 112-113.

<sup>198</sup> Dyer, White, 116.

<sup>199</sup> Frederick William Terrill, "J.G. Parks: Photographer," in *A Chronology of Montreal and of Canada from A.D. 1752 to A.D. 1893* (Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1893), 257; "The Electric Light in Photographic Studios," *Anthony's Photographic Bulletin* 25, no. 6 (June 1894), 184. Montreal photographer J.G. Parks used an electric light to photograph clients in the evening: "Mr. Parks, opened business, in Montreal, on Saturday, the 19th of October,

In his pamphlet, Notman proclaimed that although several photographers did not enjoy producing portraits of children due to the difficulty of having them sit still for the photograph, he believed that "they are so often easy and graceful, and their pure complexions give such delicate half tones, that some of the finest pictures are those of children. [...] For very young children it is necessary to choose a fine day, and the best light which is generally in the forenoon"<sup>200</sup> While this excerpt likely only applied to white children, it indicates the photographers' concern with rendering accurate skin tones through ideal lighting. It is worthwhile to consider how this may have had an impact on the photographic process of images in which he photographed a black nursemaid and white baby, and the extent to which the patron would have been able to have influence over the rendering of skin tone(s) in the photographs they commissioned – whether that be lightening, darkening, or favouring the representation of one subject over another. For the most part, Notman's studio was able to produce highly detailed photographs across a range of subjects. Baby Paikert and Nurse (1901; Fig. 1.18) reveals the limitations in the development and usage of photographic technology, and perhaps also the notion of controlled visibility. In this image, the light prioritizes baby Paikert's white face. Meanwhile, the caregiver's features are barely legible and her downward (likely adoring) gaze furthers this effect. All of the focus is brought to baby Paikert who is shown against crisp white cotton. Notman discouraged sitters from wearing white clothing, and one can see the effect it had on the white balance in the image as baby Paikert, whose features are legible, appears quite dark. This photograph presents an interesting consideration: was the resulting obfuscation of the nanny coincidental due to

<sup>1864,</sup> and has been, successively, on St. Lawrence Main, St. James, and finally, St. Catherine street, where the absence of factory-smoke favors good and clear pictures. [...] At night, he turns on the electric light, and goes on photographing." An electric photo lamp is advertised in an article in *Anthony's Photographic Bulletin* in 1894: "We believe that the time is not far distant when such an arrangement will be an indispensable part of a professional's outfit. There is a vast proportion of our population who, not being able to afford the time during the day, would gladly avail themselves of the opportunity to visit the photographer after business hours." 200 Notman, *Photography*, 10.

limitations in technology, or did the patron and studio make choices in dress and lighting to prioritize whiteness in the image?

A similar effect can be seen with Mrs. Cowan's Nursemaid (1871; Fig. 1.20). Although the nurse is pictured by herself, she was photographed directly after her charge, Missie D. Cowan (1871; Fig. 1.21), and both images used the same photographic process. These two factors allow for a comparison of lighting and "translucency" between two pictures, in instances when one is not confined by the limitations of needing to account for lighting dark and light skin within the same frame. At first glance, Mrs. Cowan seems to be lit so that all of her features are visible, an aspect that is furthered in a second, more exposed, photo of her in the picture book. When one looks at Missie Cowan, however, there is a clear attention to the translucency of the child, to the extent that she seems to be ensconced in a glowing halo along the border of the image. Furthermore, the patterns and texture of her dress are barely discernable, making the images of the nanny seem significantly more attentive to the material. It is possible that these differences are the unintentional consequences of limitations in technology, but, considering Dyer's argument, they could also be emblematic of privileging the perceived immaterial purity of white children. Additional photos of interest are B. Harris (1880; Fig. 2.8) and Lincoln Marlin (1886; Fig. 2.9). These portraits recall the image of Missie D. Cowan since they both possess the effect of being framed within a halo, and they both evoke translucency. Whether this was the result of the restrictions of the technologies in being able to accurately render skin tones or a desire of the patron to evade the fleshiness (and materiality) of the body as an intentional redirection of the technology's dominant use and function is unclear.

Other opportunities to adjust the vibrancy of skin occurred after the image was captured through retouching. Gaining popularity in the 1870s, retouching (frequently referred to as

"doctoring" due to its association with reconstructive surgery) of photographs was typically achieved through manipulating the surface of the negative with abrasives, sharp tools, pencils, and brushes.<sup>201</sup> In her examination of black Brazilian women who used photography to mark their rising social statuses, Margrit Prussat observes that the negatives of some of these portraits reveal retouching with graphite to lighten dark areas of skin.<sup>202</sup> This desire to lighten one's skin in the resulting print was a response to *blanqueamiento*, government policies that sought to whiten populations in South America and Africa and afforded social and legal privileges to those who were closer to the ideal of whiteness.<sup>203</sup>

Of the surviving negatives of black sitters available in the Notman archives, none show evidence of using retouching to lighten skin. Any retouching that occurred was a general blending of the skin done on the glass plate negative by the studio's art department, which was common even among white patrons as it removed uneven skin tones or textures that were either originally present on the sitters or emerged as aberrations in the photographic process.<sup>204</sup> For instance, where light colours possessed a tendency to overexpose, the insensitivity of the emulsion to the colour red resulted in it appearing black and pronounced ruddy complexions on those who had redness in the face. To counteract this, Notman offered white powder for the face and makeup to darken male facial hair, which the patron could either apply themselves or seek

<sup>201</sup> Tanya Sheehan, *Doctored: The Medicine of Photography in Nineteenth-Century America* (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2011), 68-69. In prior decades, photography studios would apply pigment directly onto prints, tintypes, and daguerreotypes to paint over imperfections or add colour, such as tinting the cheeks red to add life to the image of the sitter. Kathy Peiss' scholarship on the use of cosmetics and retouching techniques in photography reveals that patrons' aspirations to perfect their likenesses drove the demand for the heavy application of makeup to the sitter or pigment to the photograph, much to the chagrin of photographers who found these artificial-looking outcomes to be gauche. See: Kathy Peiss, *Hope in a Jar: The Making of America's Beauty Culture* (New York: Metropolitan Books, 1998), 47.

<sup>202</sup> Prussat, "Icons of Slavery," 213.

<sup>203</sup> Prussat, "Icons of Slavery," 214.

<sup>204</sup> Conversation with archivist Heather McNabb, Archivist at the Notman Photographic Archives, upon viewing extant negatives at the McCord Museum, August 24, 2017.

assistance from a staff member.<sup>205</sup> It is possible that the female employee who aided female clients with changes of attire and hairstyling was also the designated makeup artist – a service that would be limited when one considers that a white female attendant would likely not know how to style black hair or makeup.<sup>206</sup> Additionally, one could explore the use of retouching as an attempt to capture translucence, and de-emphasize the corporeality of the body. Despite the lack of evidence akin to Prussat's discovery within the Notman collection, this does not mean that patrons could not partake in technical or cosmetic manipulations of their appearance. Aside from the potential of makeup and retouching to alter the resulting photo, Notman was renowned for his ability to skilfully capture sitters with clarity and detail, and his lighting practices were discussed in forums such as the journal *The Philadelphia Photographer*.<sup>207</sup>

#### **IV. Clothing and Fugitivity**

It is important to revisit the broader cultural context in which the studio portraits were produced – what Marcus Wood would describe as the visual and literary culture celebrating "the horrible gift of freedom."<sup>208</sup> Marcus Wood paraphrases Frantz Fanon's assessment that "the rhetorical heart of the white emancipation propaganda was its assumption that freedom remain the gift of the white," when he relates that with this perspective, the division between abolitionist and proslavery imagery becomes murky as they both purport a colonial imagery in which black freedom is purported as a "Euro-American phenomenon."<sup>209</sup> Leading up to and after the Emancipation Proclamation in the United States, white Americans both in favour and against slavery propagated imagery that distorted the identities and attempted to erase the agency and

<sup>205</sup> Notman, Photography, 9.

<sup>206</sup> Stanley Triggs, William Notman, 53.

<sup>207 &</sup>quot;Outdoor Photographs Taken Indoors," *The Philadelphia Photographer* 3, no. 29 (May 1866): 129-131; "Further Remarks on Lights and Lighting," *The Philadelphia Photographer* 3, no. 32 (August 1866): 229-232. 208 Marcus Wood, *The Horrible Gift of Freedom: Atlantic Slavery and the Representation of Emancipation* (Athens: The University of Georgia Press, 2010), 1-34. 209 Wood, *The Horrible Gift of Freedom*, 61.

self-liberation of the enslaved people. Abolitionists manufactured propaganda that depicted the enslaved as being in need of, or receiving, what Wood terms "the gift of freedom" from the white patriarch.<sup>210</sup> However, this distortion of liberty was also pervasive in instances when self-emancipation was undeniable. The most poignant examples that Marcus Wood provides are his discussion of fugitive slave narratives and runway advertisements.<sup>211</sup>

When one considers "the repossession of the self through the act of running away," this became an opportunity for liberty to be made synonymous with control.<sup>212</sup> Wood indicates that for those who escaped slavery, their identities and stories were rewritten into "micronarratives" through the fugitive slave advertisement.<sup>213</sup> These advertisements conveyed aspects of the "fugitive's" individuality, for the sole purpose of their identification and return to their "owner". However, in doing so, these advertisements revealed histories of resistance and punishment as they exposed the scars, branding marks, and other vestiges of bodily injury made by the slavers.<sup>214</sup> It is within this context – the distortion of experiences, traumas, histories, acts of resistance, victories, freedom, and ultimately, humanity – that black portrait photography emerged. Such representations could be read as fundamentally oppositional, in which the subjects could use, as bell hooks has argued, their "history as counter-memory, using it as a way to know the present and invent the future."<sup>215</sup> However, this is not to say that fugitive slaves did not utilize representations of themselves in abolitionist literature and elsewhere to their advantage, as one can see in the case of *Mr. John Anderson* (1861; Fig. 1.2).

<sup>210</sup> Wood, The Horrible Gift of Freedom, 101.

<sup>211</sup> Wood, The Horrible Gift of Freedom, 127-135.

<sup>212</sup> Wood, The Horrible Gift of Freedom, 132.

<sup>213</sup> Wood, The Horrible Gift of Freedom, 133.

<sup>214</sup> For more on corporeal punishment and the marking of the bodies of the enslaved, see Graham White and Shane White, "Slave Hair and African American Culture in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries," *The Journal of Southern History* 61, no. 1 (February 1995): 45-76.

<sup>215</sup> bell hooks, Black Looks: Race and Representation (Boston: South End Press, 1992), 131.

Taken as a whole, the cumulative impact of singular acts of running away threatened systems of slavery in the northern United States, and over a large period of time, was similar in magnitude to the slave rebellions in the South.<sup>216</sup> Identity is mutable, unfixed, and formed in relation to context and the people with whom one engages.<sup>217</sup> These acts of running away necessitated adaptations to one's identity and offer insights into the ways in which personhood is viewed and composed by those outside of oneself. Whiteness does not exist in a vacuum. Its formation and definition are in relation to those who are decidedly not white. David Waldstreicher writes, "black identities, like most identities in multiracial, multicultural America, were often made in interactions with the other, where whites and blacks tried out poses, and surprisingly often, played and imitated each other."<sup>218</sup> Fugitive slave advertisements reveal the production and hardening of racial identity. In this sense, identity is performative, and fugitivity, in its shifting between different social positions, contested the demarcations between socially-reinforced roles, revealing their assembly in the process.<sup>219</sup>

Among the several identifying characteristics described in these advertisements are: race or ethnicity, language, and skills or trades.<sup>220</sup> The most significant of these attributes was clothing, since it possessed the greatest potential for one to assume different identities. Its expense made it so that most people had a limited wardrobe, and "describing the clothes was as good as describing the man or woman."<sup>221</sup> Those who fled enslavement would take clothing from those who enslaved them when running away, and if they could, change their outfits multiple times during their escape in order to pass among the different environments and people

<sup>216</sup> David Waldstreicher, "Reading the Runaways: Self-Fashioning, Print Culture, and Confidence in Slavery in the Eighteenth-Century Mid-Atlantic," *The William and Mary Quarterly* 56, no. 2 (1999): 245.

<sup>217</sup> Waldstreicher, "Reading the Runaways," 248.

<sup>218</sup> Waldstreicher, "Reading the Runaways," 248.

<sup>219</sup> Waldstreicher, "Reading the Runaways," 248.

<sup>220</sup> Waldstreicher, "Reading the Runaways," 248.

<sup>221</sup> Waldstreicher, "Reading the Runaways," 252.

they found themselves in.<sup>222</sup> Hair was also made mutable through hairstyling and wigs, both of which were noted in advertisements.<sup>223</sup> Simone Browne asserts that slave owner's attempts to describe in runway advertisements the personalities, skills, physical appearances, and clothing, wigs, instruments, or other objects that one might possess – the different identities that one might assume – functioned as a surveillance technology that was "put to use to make the already hypervisible racial subject legible, borrowing again from John Fiske here, as 'out of place.'"<sup>224</sup> The ability to alter one's appearance demonstrated that surveillance could be used against those who sought to define and categorize others based on racial difference – a practice that Browne terms "sousveillance".<sup>225</sup> Whiteness was also considered mutable by those who could pass as white. Browne points to a woman, who called herself Sall, whose

ability to evade surveillance through makeup, wicked tricks, and hiding in plain sight exposes the one-drop rule as a social construction that, for some, could be subverted by performing whiteness. Seth's, or sometimes Sall's, hiding in plain sight – by identifying as white and using an alias – was a freedom practice to evade surveillance, and in so being a form of dark sousveillance."<sup>226</sup>

Runaway advertisements can be seen as portraits, and in doing so, highlight the theatricality of social relations and formation of identities.<sup>227</sup> It is the instability of identity that allows for counter-performance and ultimately, sousveillance. John Stauffer argues that for Frederick Douglass art and performance were integral to processing the trauma of enslavement.<sup>228</sup> In fashioning representations of himself and African Americans through his speeches, writings, photographs and other forms of participation within the public sphere, Douglass configured

<sup>222</sup> Waldstreicher, "Reading the Runaways," 253.

<sup>223</sup> Waldstreicher, "Reading the Runaways," 254.

<sup>224</sup> Browne, Dark Matters, 54.

<sup>225</sup> Browne, Dark Matters, 54.

<sup>226</sup> Browne, Dark Matters, 54.

<sup>227</sup> Charmaine A. Nelson, "From African to Creole: Examining Creolization through the Art and Fugitive Slave Advertisements of Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Canada and Jamaica" (presentation, McCready Lecture on Canadian Art, The Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto, ON, Canada, January 20, 2016).

<sup>228</sup> John Stauffer, "Frederick Douglass and the Aesthetics of Freedom," Raritan. 25, no. 1 (2005): 114-115.

visualizations of black people that were free from distortion, and as a result, mobilized an aesthetics of freedom.<sup>229</sup>

### V. Challenging Racial Constructions of Gender through Fashion

For the fugitive slave, using "a gentleman's clothing and attitude to derail the societal expectations of black slaves and the white men who own them" is a performance of dandyism.<sup>230</sup> The significance of clothing is described in Harriet Jacob's Incidents in the Life of a Slave Girl (1861).<sup>231</sup> Linda Brent is given men's clothes, specifically those of a sailor, since coding herself male was considered essential to travel to Philadelphia safely.<sup>232</sup> As Virginia Cope surmises, freedom to Linda Brent was figured in the possibilities for social mobility within an economy that rewarded effort and intelligence with monetary gain; accordingly, she encountered prejudice in situations that were presumed to be open and equitable market exchanges.<sup>233</sup> Of note in Jacob's story is the uncertainty of living under the Fugitive Slave Law – people would frequently be forced to leave their belongings and relations behind when attempting to escape capture.<sup>234</sup> The extreme prejudice that Linda experienced and the threat of the Fugitive Slave Act meant that Linda's dream of liberty did not exist in the North.<sup>235</sup> Linda's belief in the possibility of freedom was also challenged in the limited time for leisure activities while working as a nursemaid - time that she had used to partake in education and "self-improvement" activities. One can also turn to the Civil War diary of Mary Boykin Chestnut, Confederate author and wife of James Chestnut, Jr., United States Senator from South Carolina, in which she records a conversation between two white women discussing the provision of clothing for the enslaved. The first woman expressed

<sup>229</sup> Stauffer, "Frederick Douglass and the Aesthetics of Freedom," 115.

<sup>230</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 113.

<sup>231</sup> Virginia Cope, "'I Verily Believed Myself to Be a Free Woman': Harriet Jacobs's Journey into Capitalism," *African American Review* 38, no. 1 (2004): 5-20.

<sup>232</sup> Cope, "'I Verily Believed Myself to Be a Free Woman'," 12-13.

<sup>233</sup> Cope, "'I Verily Believed Myself to Be a Free Woman'," 16.

<sup>234</sup> Cope, "I Verily Believed Myself to Be a Free Woman'," 17.

<sup>235</sup> Cope, "I Verily Believed Myself to Be a Free Woman'," 17.

that she dresses slaves well because she "could not bear to see them in dirt and rags; it would be unpleasant." <sup>236</sup> To which the second responded, that she did too, but "not fine clothes [...] I feel – now – it was one of our sins as a nation, the way we indulged them in sinful finery. We will be punished for it."<sup>237</sup> This diary entry was from 1862, one year before the Emancipation Proclamation, and highlights the threat felt by white pro-slavery advocates who recognized the radical potential of clothing to achieving social progress. The act of fugitivity overthrows the white slave owner's projections of the runaway's identity and appearance, ultimately outwitting expectations of how the runaway will escape. It involves dressing and performing above one's social class, and as Monica L. Miller indicates, makes visible and invisible their "natural aristocracy" as "intelligent, educated, [and] well-mannered."<sup>238</sup>

Julie Crooks describes nineteenth-century photographs of anonymous black subjects in southern Ontario as instances of "fugitivity". As documents of black subjectivity, the photos reveal "meticulously crafted portraits of well-dressed men, women and children who posed with self-possession and dignity. Having one's photograph taken was a deliberate act of 'fugitivity'; a symbolic attempt to evade 'capture' through wilful refusal of objectification."<sup>239</sup> By taking control over their images, the subjects were transgressing prescribed social roles and histories of misrepresentation. Furthermore, as people who had escaped slavery in the United States or descendants of individuals who migrated to Canada, the sitters were also documenting their liberty. Dressing up was an act of resistance, survival, and celebration that marked black Victorians' newly acquired social status and affected how they moved in public – oftentimes quite literally, as appropriate attire was needed to pass as "free." The significance of clothing is

<sup>236</sup> Mary Boykin Chestnut, "March 20, 1862," in *A Diary from Dixie, As Written by Mary Boykin Chestnut* (New York: D. Appleton and Co., 1905), 149. Quoted in Miller, *Slaves to Fashion*, 77.

<sup>237</sup> Chestnut, "March 20, 1862," 149. Quoted in Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 77.

<sup>238</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 113.

<sup>239</sup> Julie Crooks, "The Bell-Sloman Collection at Brock University," 173-174.

made extremely clear in situations where white men attacked black dandies for dressing extravagantly. Of particular concern is the abuse directed towards black men in the United States, in which case, verbal harassment on the basis of looking fashionable could lead to physical assault and lynching.<sup>240</sup> In contrast, white European dandies were largely accepted and sometimes celebrated. Richard J. Powell conveys that these attacks were the result of

a racially motivated fear of black male agency and, by inference, black enfranchisement. For black men *and* women into the mid-twentieth century the accusation of "not knowing your place" referred not only to transgressed spatial demarcations but to violations of restrictions on how a black person should appear in the presence of whites. In the context of American racism the black dandy is metaphorically dressed in an even bolder array of signifiers than his European counterpart: a wardrobe that speaks of modernity, freedom, oppositionality, and power.<sup>241</sup>

Such an example can be found in Edward W. Clay's *Life in Philadelphia* series (1828-1830), wherein he caricatures the behaviours and dress of black people who sought to convey their freedom and autonomy through attire worn on the street and at balls. Grotesquely exaggerated social "mishaps" were seen as an inability to assimilate into American society. <sup>242</sup>

Several instances of burlesqued caricatures of the urban dandy existed within the Canadian visual repertoire as well. For instance, *Halifax. "Now That the Marquis's Come, Plaids Are All the Fashion."* (1878; Fig. 2.10), published in *The Canadian Illustrated News*, is accompanied by a text that describes the illustration as a "bevy of coloured hucksters arraying their fair proportions in all the bravery of plaids" on a day when "all the high world was agog" due to the public reception of the new Governor General and Princess Louise at Halifax. <sup>243</sup> Here, attention is paid to the "outlandish" pattern of their attire, and their perceived disjointedness with

242 Radiclani Clytus, "At Home in England: Black Imagery across the Atlantic," in *Black Victorians: Black People in British Art, 1800-1900*, ed. Jan Marsh (Aldershot, Hampshire: Lund Humphries, 2005), 26 243 "The Vice-Regal Reception," *The Canadian Illustrated News*, December 14, 1878, 370.

<sup>240</sup> Richard J. Powell, *Cutting a Figure: Fashioning Black Portraiture* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008), 70.

<sup>241</sup> Powell, Cutting a Figure, 70-71.

patrician society. At the far left, one can see a sharply dress man in an S-curve pose; this exaggerated posture registers the man as a dandy, de-masculinizes him, and juxtaposes him with the women who are engaged in work. The black dandy as a figure within the register of popular culture reflected white anxieties about miscegenation, and race and class-based animosity about black success.<sup>244</sup> Their middle class status was coded in their attire, and this attention to artifice can be seen in images such as *Mr. Hickey, Blackface Theatre Performer* (1896; Fig. 2.11), in which the white minstrel performer is photographed in a cartoonish costume in front of a folding room screen, prompting the viewer to associate his theatrical stance and wardrobe with the act of dressing up. Illustrations such as *"The Apple of My Eye"* (1872; Fig. 2.12) and *Washing Up* (1872; Fig. 2.13) depict this genteel costuming quite literally, wherein the blackface performers are first seen in an aristocratic court setting, and then in the second drawing, shown to be removing the costumes that coded them as city-dwelling, upper-class characters. Whatever wealth, success, and education black people accumulated, mainstream visual culture sought to discredit it as nothing more than flashy pretence – the opposite of British self-restraint.

There is a sense of the importance of clothing in the portraits found within the Notman Photographic Archives. *Osborne Morton* (1863; Fig. 1.4) is photographed in front of the same plain backdrop, and with the same table and drapery as *George E. Jones* (1863; Fig. 2.4), although the curtain and books are positioned differently. His sack coat and trousers seem to be made of the same small-checked fabric. His shoes are also creased but in good condition. *Thomas Waites* (1862; Fig. 2.3), like *Mr. John Anderson* (1861; Fig. 1.2) wears a sack suit, however the lapels of his coat are much smaller, and the jacket does not match his vest or

<sup>63</sup> 

<sup>244</sup> Lott, Love and Theft, 138.

trousers – which was a common aesthetic preference.<sup>245</sup> Underneath the vest, we see a white shirt with a high turndown collar and a narrow bowtie. Although his shoes appear quite worn and need polishing, his shortly-shaven sideburns and small felt bowler hat are both in keeping with the fashions of the time.<sup>246</sup> Leaning against a pedestal on top of which are a couple of books, Thomas Waites poses in front of a background that is comparatively more plain than the other photos, suggesting an effort to maintain congruency between attire of sitter and their setting. George E. Jones wears a long frock coat possibly made of high-quality wool, pale pinstriped pants, and a vest with a check pattern. Peeking out from between the lapels of his frock coat is a watch chain hanging across his vest. His shirt features a turndown collar wrapped with a narrow bowtie. While one hand rests atop an ornate claw foot side table decorated with books, his other hand rests by his leg and holds a black felt bowler hat with a wide ribbon. His square toe ankle boots are polished and in good condition. As with Thomas Waites, he has trimmed his sideburns so that they are short, in keeping with contemporary fashion.<sup>247</sup> His clothes are neat and lack wrinkles or crease marks. Positioned between the table and cushioned chair, the viewer is given the sense of someone who could be reading in a study or parlour. Two other portraits, both copied from an original in 1868, feature sitters by the name of Jones. There is a clear resemblance between the Mr. Jones in Figure 2.5 and the photo from 1863: the corresponding garments, watch chain, and hairstyle suggest that he took this photo in 1863 as well, perhaps on the same day. Possessing similar facial features to the Mr. Jones in Figure 2.6, it is possible that they are related, and are perhaps brothers; or that it is an older image of him, indicating his financial ascent with age.

246 Severa, Dressed for the Photographer, 210, 214.

<sup>245</sup> Joan L. Severa, Dressed for the Photographer: Ordinary Americans and Fashion, 1840-1900 (Kent, Ohio: Kent State Univ. Press, 1995), 214.

<sup>247</sup> Severa, Dressed for the Photographer, 210.

More than just a symptom of middle class decadence, for the black dandy, clothing or artifice that deviated from conservative demureness was a way to signify one's affluence in a system that disfavoured it. Dressing conservatively presented an image of the self in line with genteel respectability, thus disproving stereotypes about intelligence and propensity for success. For those on the upper end of the middle class, dandyism usually occurred in the form of "subtle ostentation" such as through "fine fabrics."<sup>248</sup> However, other black dandies, particularly those of the lower classes, ventured far outside mainstream conventions to wear unique and extravagant outfits to emphasize originality, often in outdoor "runways" such as parks and the street, and more jovial public spaces like balls.<sup>249</sup> For dandies of varying economic means, clothing and artifice were used to subvert homogenous ideas about the collective, navigating assimilation, as well as self- and group representation.

In response to this fashioning of the self, white artists caricaturized the social mobility of black cosmopolitans. Evidence of this are the *Life in Philadelphia* (1828-1830) and *Life in New York* series (1820s): "in prints depicting blacks in elaborate costumes and bourgeois social situations the artist ridiculed again and again black pretentions, intellectual capacity, and aspirations."<sup>250</sup> The black dandy was anxiety producing for whites, since the black figure draped in elegance and affluence brought forth a new definition for middle class gentility, and as a result, subverted white authority.<sup>251</sup> Monica L. Miller suggests, "as a depiction of free blacks, the dandy image encapsulated a fight for and against stereotyping. The figure embraced ambivalence and manipulated it into black style, a self-conscious process of endless re-signification."<sup>252</sup> Thus, the black dandy can transcend social boundaries, intertwining aspects of white American,

<sup>248</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 103.

<sup>249</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 103.

<sup>250</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 104.

<sup>251</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 105.

<sup>252</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 105.

African, and black American cultures. Even before abolition, whites saw the power of selffashioning and used blackface minstrelsy to limit its social power by claiming an "authoritative" source of knowledge about black people.<sup>253</sup> Minstrelsy's dominance as a form of popular cultural made the need to self-fashion, and self-represent that much more urgent in shaping how black people were regarded in dominant culture.

The dandy, as a figure that eschews binaries, is a symbol of modernism.<sup>254</sup> Using this definition loosely, we can extend it to black women who also employed fashion and beauty to engage in practices of social mobility, especially when we consider images of genteel ladies, such as Mrs. Coburn (1887) and Miss Guilmartin (1877 and 1885; Figs. 1.11 and 1.12). The attire in these images is at the height of fashion. One could even argue that there is a selfawareness of this. Miss Guilmartin and H. Evans and Lady (1871; Fig. 2.7) are full-length portraits, which shows the entire dress. The choices of Miss Guilmartin's accessories and hairstyles in her earlier photograph – the long necklace, drop earrings, bun on top of her head held in place with a comb, and the creation of short frizzed "bangs" around her face - speak to her awareness of the latest European fashions.<sup>255</sup> The likely silk dress indicates her perceived wealth. In her later image, she wears more slender earrings, a long and delicate watch rope, and holds a fan. This attention to details can be seen in *H. Evans and Lady* as well, since this image presents an environment that very much looks like a cosy sitting room, complete with a panelled wood backdrop, small footstool, and fur rug. On her lap is a book opened to a page featuring a print of what looks like a Renaissance painting of white female figure, and a small hat with flowers. As such, the pair is not simply laying claim to literacy and cultural capital, but more specifically to the knowledge of European "high" art. Their portrait then, is an assertion of their

<sup>253</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 97-107

<sup>254</sup> Miller, Slaves to Fashion, 179.

<sup>255</sup> Severa, Dressed for the Photographer, 311.

(and black Victorians more generally) belonging within Western society. The viewer is also met with a sense of French fashion in the popularization of the late-eighteenth century French court style of wearing decorative hats worn high on the head.<sup>256</sup> Her hair also speaks to her status, since it is reminiscent of upswept wide-temple hairstyles made popular by Empress Eugenie of France.<sup>257</sup> At the end of the 1860s and into the 1870s, fashionable women wore ornate hairstyles, such as frizzettes and puffs.<sup>258</sup> Compared to the nursery maids who wear their hair in practical and quick styles suitable to their jobs – such as Mrs. Cowan's Nursemaid (1871; Fig. 1.20), whose pulled back hair seems to be gathered in a hairnet and possibly decorated with a bow, or Nurse and Baby, Copied for Mrs. Farguharson in 1868 (Fig. 1.17), whose hair was likely held together with a comb in the back (a simple style worn by "ordinary women") – the women in Miss Guilmartin and H. Evans and Lady indicate that they had the time and lifestyles that allowed them to craft more ornate hairstyles.<sup>259</sup> Furthermore, the time-consuming styling of waves in Miss Guilmartin (1885) compared to her earlier portrait, minimizes her hair texture - an important consideration when read within the context of the deliberate stigmatization and denigration of black hair in the period.<sup>260</sup> Returning to *H. Evans and Lady*, the book, opened to what appears to be a print of a Renaissance painting depicting the epitome of white female beauty, the designation of the sitter as a "lady," and the highly decorated domestic setting all work to position the subject as a highly feminine member of the bourgeoisie.

<sup>256</sup> Severa, Dressed for the Photographer, 311.

<sup>257</sup> Severa, Dressed for the Photographer, 277.

<sup>258</sup> Severa, Dressed for the Photographer, 311.

<sup>259</sup> For an overview of common hairstyles in the 1860s, see Severa, Dressed for the Photographer, 206.

<sup>260</sup> See White and White, "Slave Hair and African American Culture in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries," 45-76. Although, no comparison images exist (unlike *Miss Guilmartin*), the styling of waves can also be read in *H. Evans and Lady* as well as the portraits of the nursery maid employed by Mrs. Farquharson.

Cheryl Thompson examines the significance of print culture towards the establishment of female beauty norms in Canada.<sup>261</sup> She asserts that "by the nineteenth century, print culture played an active role in the cultivation of a beauty ideal that was geared toward white, mostly middle-class women."<sup>262</sup> Newspapers and journals held articles with illustrations of the latest designs and practical advice on the wear and care of clothing for women and men. Inhabitants of Montreal would have had access to journals such as the local Montreal Museum or Journal of Literature and Arts (also known as the Ladies' Museum), the American-based Godey's Lady's *Book*, and several imported publications from France and Britain.<sup>263</sup> One can also see this attention to European beauty standards in black-owned Canadian newspapers such as Mary Ann Shadd Carey's the *Provincial Freeman*. In an article republished from *English Magazine*, Mrs. Adams – identified as a dress- and hat-making instructor as well as a pattern distributor based in London, England – outlines her suggestions for lightweight materials suitable for petticoats in different seasons, as well as the optimal width of dresses.<sup>264</sup> While to some extent, the article is focused on providing advice on how to avoid ill health and bodily pain brought about by heavy garments, it is also concerned with defining ideas of what is considered beautiful. Mrs. Adams warns readers of certain fashion faux-pas in their appearances, such as: "ladies will persist in having their dresses five or five yards and a-half wide; this is perfectly absurd, and shows bad taste."<sup>265</sup> Other examples of this attention to clothing for both its practical and ornamental functions occur through an advertisement by a Mrs. M. A. Sterritt from Chatham, Canada West (now Ontario) for her services as a dressmaker with the "latest patterns," an article discussing the

<sup>261</sup> Thompson, Race and Beauty in Canada, 59.

<sup>262</sup> Thompson, Race and Beauty in Canada, 59.

<sup>263</sup> Jacqueline Beaudoin-Ross, Form and Fashion, 69-73.

<sup>264</sup> Mrs. Adams, "More Hints on Petticoats," Provincial Freeman, March 22, 1856, 177.

<sup>265</sup> Adams, "More Hints on Petticoats," 177.

psychological effects of certain silhouettes and colours, and a detailed overview on caring for silks.<sup>266</sup>

Freedom necessitated a responsibility to others. Although slavery had been abolished, newly freed blacks were not given any financial or social aid, and faced discrimination and segregation. It is of no small significance that the motto for Amherstburg, Ontario's Frederick Douglass Self-Improvement Club was "Lifting as We Climb."<sup>267</sup> Early literary societies illustrate the presence of black social organizations that provided support and resources for social mobility in Canada. Carole Gerson points out that "the first women's literary society in Ontario and perhaps in all of Canada" was established by black women with the creation of Mary Bibb's Windsor Ladies' Club in 1854.<sup>268</sup> Mary Ann Shadd Cary believed that community was integral to individual prosperity.<sup>269</sup> Liberation of the self, relied on liberation of the collective. The black Canadian press, such as Henry Bibb's The Voice of the Fugitive and Mary Ann Shadd Cary's the Provincial Freeman, was essential to community building, antislavery discourse, and most importantly, countering paternalist views of black people as being in need of salvation. Newspapers by black abolitionists furthered their self-representation through the media itself, but also shared ideologies of racial uplift, which was integral to the resilience of free black communities.<sup>270</sup> Notman's studio, as a photographer of eminent men and women in Canada, produced portraits that outwardly possessed the appearance of regal or even heroic subjects. Like Sojourner Truth, who chose to present herself according to the signs of bourgeois respectability

<sup>266</sup> Mrs. M. A. Sterritt, "Mrs. M. A. Sterritt, Fashionable Dress and Cloak Maker," advertisement, *Provincial Freeman*, September 22, 1855, 87; "Dress," *Provincial Freeman*, May 5, 1855, 33; "How to Keep Silks," *Provincial Freeman*, February 23, 1856, 162.

<sup>267</sup> Constitution and By-Laws of the Frederic [sic] Douglass Self-Improvement Club (1898-1899), Alvin D. McCurdy Fonds, Archives of Ontario Microfilm MS 1178, Reference Code F 2076-9-0-3.

<sup>268</sup> Carole Gerson, *Canadian Women in Print, 1750-1918* (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2011), 12. 269 Jane Rhodes, *Mary Ann Shadd Cary: The Black Press and Protest in the Nineteenth Century* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press), 121.

<sup>270</sup> Rhodes, Mary Ann Shadd Cary, 32-33.

in her *cartes de visite*, "as a model for an emancipated, prosperous African American future," the photographs within the Notman collection are purposeful in their alignment with a decorous style of portraiture in which the subjects are read as gentlemen and ladies rather than "personifications" of the vestiges of slavery.<sup>271</sup>

## **VI.** Conclusion

Notions of daguerreotypes as conveyors of truth stemmed from the belief that the camera could yield precise images devoid of human interference, since it relied upon sunlight and machinery to accurately replicate a person's appearance.<sup>272</sup> Because outward appearances and manners were said to be characteristic of one's moral attributes, photographs, in their "imitation" of the sitter, were considered to reveal the "soul behind that surface."<sup>273</sup> This marked a shift in portraiture away from surface idealization towards the interiority of the subject in the late nineteenth century.<sup>274</sup> The notion that a photograph could represent the essence of a person became a popular theme in literature where writers would create stories of familial estrangement and reunion.<sup>275</sup> However, not only was the technology flawed in its rendering of complexion, but photographers employed techniques to produce a desired outcome, including: the careful construction of a composition, the creation of a relaxing atmosphere for sitters so that their expressions could be more natural, the selection of clothing colours and patterns that would photograph well, and the retouching of negatives. These photographs epitomize Victorian aristocratic values in self-presentation and domesticity.<sup>276</sup> The customers of Notman's studio, active in the selection of backgrounds and accessories, but ultimately guided by the photographer

<sup>271</sup> Grigsby, Enduring Truths, 79.

<sup>272</sup> Williams, Confounding Images, 46.

<sup>273</sup> Williams, Confounding Images, 47.

<sup>274</sup> Williams, Confounding Images, 183.

<sup>275</sup> Williams, Confounding Images, 184-185.

<sup>276</sup> Bara, "Through the Frosty Lens," 27-28.
to create displays of "good taste and judgment" carried these sensibilities to the clothes they chose to wear for their photographs.<sup>277</sup> "Garments," Helen E. Roberts surmises, "signal to the world the role the wearer may be expected to play and remind the wearer of the responsibilities of that role, its constraints and limitations."<sup>278</sup> William Notman, the most prestigious photographer in the country, offered clients the ability to meet these criteria of artistic beauty and photographic quality. For black patrons, doing so was not necessarily a form of assimilation, but instead an act of claiming space and challenging an economy of visual representations that sought to misconstrue their rights to equitable futures.

<sup>277 &</sup>quot;Sensational Photography," The Philadelphia Photographer 21, no. 241 (January 1884): 23.

<sup>278</sup> Helene E. Roberts, "The Exquisite Slave: The Role of Clothes in the Making of the Victorian Woman" Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society 2, no. 3 (1977): 554.

## **Chapter Three**

## **Imagined Geographies: Parallel Visions of Canada**

# I. Introduction

Joan M. Schwartz defines "imagined geographies" as "products of representational practices that transform 'space' on the ground into 'place' in the mind. Sometimes seen only as tools of power, control, and domination over the non-Western 'Other,' they are, more broadly, value-laden visualizations of people(s), place(s), and the relationship(s) between them."<sup>279</sup> Furthermore, imagined geographies are useful constructs in assessing how photography is used as a tool in the formation of ideas about "landscape and identity," particularly in Canada where the emergence of photography coincided with the formation of the Dominion.<sup>280</sup> Photography was essential to assembling collective identities and histories through its production, viewership, and circulation. As will be discussed in this chapter, the production of Canadian identity by British colonists in the nineteenth century structured asymmetries of power where those who fell outside the definition of British patrician values were less central to the newly formed definition of Canada. Whereas Chapter One looked at the photograph as a form of biography and Chapter Two examined the significance of the performance of identity in shifting and reframing one's visibility, Chapter Three will study how mechanisms of visuality facilitate collective identity. This chapter has two connected objectives: First, I will establish how images of Canadian nationhood perpetuated a white nationalist myth of the North through apparatuses such as the policing of behaviour, appropriation of Indigenous clothing and activities, and the idea of the

<sup>279</sup> Joan M. Schwartz, "Felix Man's 'Canada': Imagined Geographies and Pre-Texts of Looking," in *The Cultural Work of Photography in Canada*, eds., Andrea Kunard and Carol Payne (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2011), 4. Schwartz borrows the concept of imagined or imaginative geography from Edward Said and Benedict Anderson.

<sup>280</sup> Schwartz, "Felix Man's 'Canada'," 4.

picturesque. Second, I will contend that studio portraits of black patrons in front of backdrops of the Canadian landscape destabilised fables of Canadian identity, and will read this into the context of immigration policies and community formation in Ontario and Quebec.

## **II. The Production of Canadian Identity**

In what follows, I will discuss the ways in which the idea of the North perpetuated a myth of Canadian nationhood through images of Canadian winter scenes, particularly "*Young Canada*" *William McFarlane Notman* (1867; Fig. 3.1) and *Old and Young Canada* (1884; Fig. 3.2) Light was essential in creating Notman's indoor winter scenes that attracted tourists and received acclaim in photography journals, such as his *Caribou Hunting* series. Notman began creating winter scenes in 1861, and they expanded the limits of studio photography by employing set design, props, retouching, composite photography, and most importantly natural lighting, to create "truthful" imitations of the snowy Canadian outdoors within the studio.<sup>281</sup> *The Philadelphia Photographer*, a journal based in the United States, marvelled at the imaginative nature of these constructions, and dedicated features to studying the windows and proprieties of the rooms in which these images were taken (Figs. 2.1 and 2.2).<sup>282</sup> Notman's Bleury Street studio (Appendix I) held not one but three "operating rooms" in which to take portraits: a main room and two smaller ones, all of which possessed windows and skylights that faced north.<sup>283</sup> Overhead lighting became customary in theatre and photography, eventually being termed

<sup>281</sup> Bara, "Through the Frosty Lens," 25; "Outdoor Photographs Taken Indoors," 131.

<sup>282 &</sup>quot;Outdoor Photographs Taken Indoors," 129-131; "Further Remarks on Lights and Lighting," 229-232; Bara, "Through the Frosty Lens," 24-26. To accomplish these winter scenes, the floor was covered with white sand or cotton. Although the studio initially used plain backdrops for the winter scenes, they developed methods of imitating snowy landscapes or buildings in the following years, starting with the implementation of a hand-painted backdrop showing a winter landscape in 1862. In the mid-1870s, these scenes were constructed using photomontage. To make these composites, sitters would be cut out of the original image, and then re-photographed against backgrounds that were either painted onto cardboard that matched the size of to the portraits or photographs of real winter landscapes. Retouchers would paint over the photomontage to blend the composite parts. Dendritic salt was used to simulate snow on clothes or other objects, and falling snow was mimicked by moving the glass plate negative through the air after white paint was sprayed onto it. Frozen ponds were recreated through a sheet of polished zinc. 283 Triggs, *William Notman's Studio*, 53-55.

"North" or "Northern" light in the early twentieth century, borrowing from conventions used in north European painting of the 1700s.<sup>284</sup> According to Richard Dyer, northern light is:

literally and symbolically, superior light. [...] the North is an epitome of the "high, cold" places that promoted the vigour, cleanliness, piety and enterprise of whiteness. White people come off best from this standardized Northern light, such that they seem to have a special affinity with it, to be enlightened, to be the recipient, reflection and maybe even source of the light of the world.<sup>285</sup>

Stemming from religious iconography, light from above is associated with the heavens, and by extension, moral purity.<sup>286</sup> The tendency for photography studios to use light from north-facing windows or skylights may seem innocuous – a simple matter of controlled visibility – however, it is interesting to then observe the appearance of light emanating from above in the illustration Old and Young Canada, which was based on a photograph taken at the Notman studio in 1876.<sup>287</sup> These soft rays of northern light shine onto Old and Young Canada. The Winter Carnival pamphlet in which this image was printed described the illustration as Young and Old Canada looking at one another – the former "impatient to be as big, as sturdy, and as capital a snowshoer" and the latter hoping that the boy will develop into the nation he promises to become in twenty years.<sup>288</sup> The photo that this illustration originated from is one of several images taken by Notman's studio of adults and children in winter landscapes. Exemplary of these photographs is a portrait of William Notman's son William McFarlane Notman as "Young Canada" in which he is depicted wearing snowshoes, a blanket coat and an arrow sash in a snowy landscape.<sup>289</sup> Children are typically seen as "innocents," and their portrayal in patriotic costumes established direct relationships between their potential and the growth of a nascent country.<sup>290</sup>

<sup>284</sup> Dyer, White, 117-118.

<sup>285</sup> Dyer, White, 118.

<sup>286</sup> Dyer, White, 118-119.

<sup>287</sup> Stack, "Very Picturesque and Very Canadian'," 30.

<sup>288 &</sup>quot;Our Illustrations," The Winter Carnival Illustrated (Montreal: George Bishop and Co., 1884), 12.

<sup>289</sup> Stack, "Very Picturesque and Very Canadian'," 27.

<sup>290</sup> Stack, "Very Picturesque and Very Canadian'," 28.

What these illustrated embodiments of nation also reveal is the adoption of winter attire and activities that originally belonged to the Indigenous, and later, French Canadian people. Both Old and Young Canada are portrayed wearing the blanket coat (*capote*) and arrow belt (*ceinture fléchée*), as well as snowshoes. Winter sports, such as snowshoeing and tobogganing, and attire such as the arrow belt were Europeanized adoptions of activities and clothing originally created by Indigenous people and then appropriated by French settlers.<sup>291</sup> Their implementation into markers of Anglo-Canadian identity served as an erasure of Indigenous and French-Canadian histories, positioning British Canadians as successors to the land. As Gillian Poulter has indicated, "acting out these myths of origin dressed in 'Indigenous' clothing caused the performers to feel themselves part of that history."<sup>292</sup> These performances of northernness on the part of British colonists naturalized them as "native" Canadians.

Studying these images of the Canadian North as a precursor to studio portraits of black subjectivity is important, because as Reni Eddo-Lodge has claimed, "discussing racism is not the same thing as discussing 'black identity'. Discussing racism is about discussing white identity. It's about white anxiety."<sup>293</sup> Images like "*Young Canada*" and *Old and Young Canada*, as well as the Winter Carnival culture that they were enveloped in, concretized beliefs about white superiority through their framing of race. British colonists who sought to claim their right to the land adopted an idea of moral and physical dominance rooted in the northern climate. To nationalists like Robert Grant Haliburton, it was essential that Canada fabricate an identity rooted

<sup>291</sup> The origins of the blanket coat are unclear. What can be ascertained is that it was an important trade item between French settlers and Indigenous people. However, bourgeois Anglo-Canadians such as Lady Aberdeen regarded the blanket coat as "an adaptation of the blanketing worn by the Indians" (quoted in Stack, "Very Picturesque and Very Canadian'," 34). For more on the origins of the coat, see Stack, "Very Picturesque and Very Canadian'," 34n5.

<sup>292</sup> Poulter, "Embodying Nation: Indigenous Sports in Montreal, 1860-1885," in *Contesting Bodies and Nation in Canadian History*, eds. Patrizia Gentile and Jane Nicholas (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2014), 79. 293 Reni Eddo-Lodge, *Why I'm No Longer Talking to White People About Race* (London: Bloomsbury Circus, 2017), 215.

in its climate, since he believed that the harshness of life in northern regions produced a dominant race. In a lecture to the Montreal Literary Club in 1869, Haliburton declared that Canada is "a Northern country inhabited by the descendants of Northern races," and as such, that British Canadians should "adopt a broader basis which will comprise at once the Celtic, the Teutonic, and the Scandinavian elements."<sup>294</sup> Haliburton's lecture reflected historical Darwinist attitudes towards a perceived relationship between latitude and "racial difference." Additionally, it was thought that the northern climate was responsible for civil freedom. Carl Berger writes: "Liberty itself depended upon self-reliance, a rugged independence, instilled by the struggle for existence. Thus to the equation of 'northern' with strength and the strenuous virtues, against 'southern' with degeneration and effeminacy, was added the identification of the former with liberty and the latter with tyranny."<sup>295</sup> Christian literature in Victorian England associated physical hardiness with moral character – traits that were projected onto images of strong British men, and thereby excluded those of differing racial, ethnic, religious, and sexual identities.<sup>296</sup> This idea even extended to include the belief that only those from other northern countries would be familiar with freedom and possess a desire to move to Canada.<sup>297</sup> This myth of the North was reiterated in nineteenth and early twentieth-century Canadian literature and visual art, such as travelogues, Old and Young Canada, and even the landscape paintings of the Group of Seven.<sup>298</sup>

Winter scenes of individuals engaged in outdoor activities while donning Canadian winter attire were popular among tourists to Montreal, such as those attending the Winter

<sup>294</sup> Robert Grant Haliburton, The Men of the North and Their Place in History: A Lecture Delivered Before the Montreal Literary Club, March 31, 1869 (Montreal: John Lovell, 1869), 2.

<sup>295</sup> Carl Berger, "The True North Strong and Free," in Canadian Culture: An Introductory Reader, ed. Elspeth Cameron (Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press, 1997), 93.

<sup>296</sup> Daniel Coleman, White Civility: The Literary Project of English Canada (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006), 130-135.

<sup>297</sup> Berger, "The True North Strong and Free," 95. 298 Berger, "The True North Strong and Free," 95.

Carnival, and soldiers stationed at the city's British garrison.<sup>299</sup> Claire Omhovère remarks that in these scenes of Canadian winter activities, "ice, snow and winter equipment index the nordicity of the national character in compositions which, although they are reminiscent of Cornelius Krieghoff's picturesque style, assert the hardiness of a population invigorated by the cold climate of the North."<sup>300</sup> Established as nation-forming project in the 1880s, the Montreal Winter Carnivals were emblematic of this mentality.<sup>301</sup> Among the Carnivals' events were winter sports such as tobogganing and snowshoeing, and a fancy dress ball at the Windsor Hotel. Poulter contends that the Carnivals denoted British settlers' "culmination of decades of inventing traditions built around interaction with the Canadian climate and landscape though participating in indigenous winter sports," since these "were activities whose Aboriginal and French Canadian associations had been overlaid with the British ideology of order and discipline."<sup>302</sup>

As such, the Carnival was exclusive to an elite class who used it as an opportunity to "display their wealth and taste," omitting most residents of Montreal through admission fees, event times, and regulations on appropriate behaviour.<sup>303</sup> This delineation of who was allowed to participate in these visions of nationhood also occurred through dress:

Anglophone press comments about the "strange attire worn by a young lady from the country" seen on the streets indicate underlying ethnic differences. Although picturesque costumes were encouraged and lauded in the organized events of the carnival, they were acceptable only in the guise of being "historical." When they were worn as everyday clothing, they were an embarrassment because they detracted from middle-class claims to be "civilized" and "modern."<sup>304</sup>

<sup>299</sup> Bara, "Through the Frosty Lens," 25.

<sup>300</sup> Claire Omhovère, "Documenting Disappearance: A Century of Canadian Photography, from William McFarlane Notman to Edward Burtynsky and Douglas Coupland," in *The Memory of Nature in Aboriginal, Canadian and American Contexts*, eds. Françoise Besson, Claire Omhovère, and Héliane Ventura (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2014), 256-257.

<sup>301</sup> Gillian Poulter, *Becoming Native in a Foreign Land: Sport, Visual Culture and Identity in Montreal, 1840-85* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2009), 185-188. The Winter Carnival occurred in 1883, 1884, 1885, 1887, and 1889 (Poulter, *Becoming Native in a Foreign Land*, 166).

<sup>302</sup> Poulter, Becoming Native in a Foreign Land, 104.

<sup>303</sup> Poulter, Becoming Native in a Foreign Land, 188.

<sup>304</sup> Poulter, Becoming Native in a Foreign Land, 191.

Demarcations of acceptable behaviour and attire are also evident in the costumes permitted at the Carnival's Grand Ball. Indigenous and Orientalist costumes were popular at the Winter Carnival Ball, but dressing up as "negro characters" was not permitted, "except by special permission." <sup>305</sup> Gillian Poulter deduces that the regulation on acceptable costumes was intended to maintain British order by avoiding the carnivalesque. As with sports and hunting, this form of winter entertainment deliberately enforced a Canadian cultural identity marked by British self-restraint alongside the simultaneous displacement of black, Indigenous, French, Asian and working class citizens. The exclusion of blackface costumes from a fancy dress ball that encouraged the appropriation of other cultures in an attempt to historicize or exoticize them hints at the explicit violence inherent to the portrayal of black caricatures in popular culture. Although it was permissible to engage in imaginary depictions of Indigenous and Asian people and their cultures, the "characters" created by blackface were deemed too vulgar.

To understand perceptions about the ways in which whites viewed black Canadians, it is useful to turn to Kyna Hamill's investigation of the burlesquing of the sleigh narrative in New England.<sup>306</sup> Sleighing was a favourite winter pastime, and around it was a dense visual and literary culture that derided black people who engaged in modern city life through urban winter activities. In cities such as New York and Boston, horse-drawn sleighs were not only an ideal form of transportation for snowy winter streets, but also a source of social enjoyment and a means to advertise one's affluence.<sup>307</sup> Inherent to many of these depictions is an idea of excess, either through high spirits, intimate moments, or illustrations of an overturned or "upsot"

<sup>305</sup> Poulter, Becoming Native in a Foreign Land, 183.

<sup>306</sup> Kyna Hamill, "'The Story I Must Tell': 'Jingle Bells' in the Minstrel Repertoire," *Theatre Survey* 58, no. 3 (September 2017): 375-403.

<sup>307</sup> Hamill, "'The Story I Must Tell'," 378.

sleigh.<sup>308</sup> As was introduced in the previous chapter, the figure of the dandy was used to illustrate the "otherness" of black civilians. Blackface minstrel performers constructed dandy archetypes in songs about northern winter activities to the extent that "the dandy character was particular to the northern blackface tradition and was used to lampoon black men from the South who supposedly thought only of 'courting, flashy clothes, new dances, and their looks." Extending past the stage, audience members could take renditions of these performances home to the parlour through sheet music that was sold outside the theatre.<sup>309</sup> Additionally, these caricatures of urban dandies engaged in winter scenes were widespread as illustrations in popular culture, as exemplified by Thomas Worth's *Darktown* series (1879-1890) printed by Currier and Ives, such as *A Team Fast on the Snow* (1883; Fig. 3.3).<sup>310</sup> Hamill communicates that Worth's illustrations signify how black people

continue to appear caricatured in the sleigh narrative [...] and [this] becomes fixed across a variety of popular arts by the end of the nineteenth century. It is a genre in which freed slaves turn out still to have no place in the white winter society of the North, even as northern abolitionists claimed credit for having freed them in the first place.<sup>311</sup>

Beyond satirizing the presence of educated and well-dressed black inhabitants of northern cities, burlesqued sleigh narratives specifically sought to make a case for their incongruity with the northern climate and activities that were coded as white. Approximately two centuries after Louis XIV questioned whether enslaved Africans could survive in the northern regions of New France, the same mentality still prevailed among whites who used it to perpetuate the falsehood that black Canadians, who had at this point had either been born or lived in the northern States and Canada for several generations, did not belong in nations with cold climates.<sup>312</sup>

<sup>308</sup> Hamill, "The Story I Must Tell'," 378-379.

<sup>309</sup> Hamill, "'The Story I Must Tell'," 390.

<sup>310</sup> Hamill, "The Story I Must Tell'," 391.

<sup>311</sup> Hamill, "'The Story I Must Tell'," 395.

<sup>312</sup> Winks, The Blacks in Canada, 18.

G. Conway and Friends (1901; Fig. 3.4) stands out as one of the several Canadian winter scenes that Notman was recognized for creating. Here, one sees a group of four individuals, perhaps friends or couples, in a composition that evokes metropolitan elegance. Alongside the bourgeois decorum evident in this photo, there is warmth in the playfulness of the image and the smile of the woman seated in the centre. Dendritic salt mimicking snow has been placed on shoulders and sleeves, and a residential snowy backdrop is also visible. What is unusual about the image is that the sitters' clothing and the florals apparent in the women's hats seem better suited to the warmer months. The picture book indicates that this photo was taken in August. No other winter scenes could be located in the *carte de visite* and cabinet card picture books from July to September, and any outdoor backdrops photographed around this time were typically of gardens. This suggests that the sitters specifically asked the studio to prepare a winter scene for them. It is possible that like many others who had photographs taken of themselves in snowy settings, that G. Conway and his friends were tourists.<sup>313</sup> Notman's studio even advertised this category of images as "affording friends at a distance an excellent idea of our Canadian winters," indicating that it was popular to take such photographs home as travel souvenirs or mail them to loved ones.<sup>314</sup> Upper-class Anglo-Canadians in Montreal considered the donning of blanket coats and arrow sashes, and engagement in recreational winter activities "picturesque" and emblematic of the nation's identity.<sup>315</sup> Eileen Stack notes that tourists would frequently have a set of studio portraits photographed to depict Anglo-Canadian life:

the urban and civilized versus the rural and untamed. The first features the sitter in formal or street clothes posed among ornate furniture and drapery expressive of European portraiture conventions. [...] The second types of photograph features the same sitter dressed in a blanket coat against a scene mimicking a snowy Canadian winter.<sup>316</sup>

<sup>313</sup> Considering the lack of female title or prefix, one can conjecture that G. Conway was a man.

<sup>314 &</sup>quot;Portraits in Winter Costume," advertisement, Montreal Gazette, February 14, 1867, 4.

<sup>315</sup> Stack, "Very Picturesque and Very Canadian'," 22.

<sup>316</sup> Stack, "Very Picturesque and Very Canadian'," 26.

Although the frequency with which blanket coats appear in Notman studio portraits diminishes in the 1890s, it was still conventional to wear fur coats to accompany snowy backdrops.<sup>317</sup> Without making assumptions about the sitters' intentions, it is possible that the decision to wear their own clothing, as opposed to Canadian winter attire from the studio, implied a conscious decision to avoid the picturesque.<sup>318</sup> Alternatively, the decision to wear clothing which was illsuited to the cold climate implied by the snowy setting could have also signalled their physical vigour, which, in the absence of appropriate winter attire, could still tolerate the coldness evoked by the scene. In order to further explore this notion, one can study these images within the broader context of the absence of black subjects in Canadian art history, especially the absence of their depiction in the Canadian landscape and the asymmetries of power inherent in the idea of the picturesque.

# **III. Problematizing the "Picturesque"**

The "picturesque" was a method of viewership and representation through which old or rugged objects were incorporated into the rural landscape as aesthetic elements in order to make it appear uninhabited.<sup>319</sup> This ideology was even applied to impoverished inhabitants who, like the "ruins" around them were viewed as rustic artefacts of a disappearing way of life. The application of this technique to Indigenous and rural French figures in Canadian paintings was a key method through which they were made peripheral to the Canadian narrative.<sup>320</sup> David Marshall defines the "picturesque" as a problem of aesthetics where it "represents a point of view that frames the world and turns nature into a series of living tableaux. It begins as an

<sup>317</sup> Stack, "Very Picturesque and Very Canadian'," 26.

<sup>318</sup> There is a second image of *G. Conway and Friends* in the picture book, in which the sitters are positioned in a slightly different arrangement, but otherwise the backdrop and style of the photo are the same.

<sup>319</sup> Ann Bermingham, *Landscape and Ideology: The English Rustic Tradition 1740-1860* (Berkeley/Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1989), 68-70.

<sup>320</sup> Poulter, Becoming Native in a Foreign Land, 39.

appreciation of natural beauty, but it ends by turning people into figures in a landscape or figures in a painting."<sup>321</sup> Charmaine A. Nelson elaborates on this concept:

the picturesque was as much about the active aestheticization of vision as it was about the ability of a viewer/artist to create a safe space and vantage point from which to see and produce a landscape; a space which, through its distance from the human subjects being viewed, could transform people into "figures in the landscape". [...] The distance achieved by the artists through the deliberate choice of certain vantage points served to render humans as mere objects<sup>322</sup>

Used to aestheticize and depoliticize the vestiges of slavery and the labour conditions of working class black people in the rural South, the notion of the "picturesque" can also be seen in travel photographs of the southern States. Longing to experience the old South, tourists from the northern United States sought out experiences that were "distinctly southern," part of which were the "plantation ruins."<sup>323</sup> Since northern travellers' desire to enjoy a scenic idealization of the old South was at odds with the social realities of black people who lived there, travel writers sought to romanticize their presence as "picturesque" component of the landscape.<sup>324</sup> The frequency with which the word "picturesque" was used in relation to the lives of rural black folks transformed the uncomfortable truth of their economic hardship and racist disenfranchisement into one of scenic pleasure.<sup>325</sup> The term's usage had further insidious purposes. Often applied to images of black field workers, "picturesque" attributes implied that their poverty was natural, reflective of a supposed inability to "advance by the formula of hard work and middle class success."<sup>326</sup> If they were idle or expressed joy, then it was surmised that they were inherently lazy. By 1890, photographers and travel writers had effectively reinforced this notion by reconfiguring the threat of a free labour workforce to American nationhood by transforming the

<sup>321</sup> David Marshall, "The Problem of the Picturesque," *Eighteenth-Century Studies* 35, no. 3 (Spring 2002), 414. 322 Nelson, Slavery, *Geography and Empire*, 201.

<sup>323</sup> Nina Silber, *The Romance of Reunion: Northerners and the South, 1865-1900* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2002), 76-77.

<sup>324</sup> Silber, The Romance of Reunion, 78.

<sup>325</sup> Silber, The Romance of Reunion, 80.

<sup>326</sup> Silber, The Romance of Reunion, 81.

image of southern black field workers into a romanticization of the "ruins" of slavery. One such photographer was Rudolf Eickemeyer Jr. who took pictures of black folks in the fields. In photographing them, he assuaged northern white people's anxieties about southern blacks' abilities to "ascend the ladder of economic progress."<sup>327</sup> Thus the "picturesque" when applied to black people, allowed northerners to neutralize the uncomfortable reality of their presence as liberated people, and instead enjoy them as an "authentic" element of a scenic travel destination.

An example of similar visual rhetoric being used in Canada can be found with illustrations published in the *Canadian Illustrated News* to commemorate a Royal visit paid by the new Governor General of Canada and Princess Louise to Halifax. The image titled "Negroes Bringing in Evergreens for the Arches," (1878; Fig. 3.7) can be read in comparison with the photographs of Eickemeyer, such as The Peanut Field (c. 1900; Fig. 3.5). As with Eickemeyer, the illustration attempts to aestheticize labour and objectify the presence of field workers as elements of a landscape. The simultaneous visibility of the arches' interiority and exteriority also echoes the idea of the ruin, essential to the picturesque genre. A white male overseer, and a cattle driver contribute to the effect of living *tableaux* in which fieldwork is naturalized. Although these images depict a reality that was very much lived, their problem lies with the fact that they were intended to be pleasurable for the white viewer, whether through the aestheticization of poverty, the fetishism of labour, or the humour that often accompanied these images – in this case, the image is described as one of "two little views of sable enthusiasm on a day when all the high world was agog."<sup>328</sup> This description and the placement of this image amid other glimpses of the reception position the subjects' labour as natural, and their ascent or assimilation in white society as improbable. Just as imaginations of the North sought to naturalize white British

<sup>327</sup> Silber, The Romance of Reunion, 81.

<sup>328 &</sup>quot;The Vice-Regal Reception," 370.

settlers as successors to the land, picturesque visions of the landscape attempted to naturalize the poverty and toil of those who worked on it.

A technique that artists used to further this notion of the picturesque was to compare their work to that by European painters.<sup>329</sup> This strategy was even employed by photographers. In discussing a series of photographs about black southerners, critic Carl Sadakichi Hartmann wrote that Rudolf Eickemeyer Jr. privately acknowledged that he sought "to do something similar for the Southern negro as Millet did for the French peasant."<sup>330</sup> This parallel is evident in images such as Eickemeyer's *The Peanut Field* (c. 1900; Fig. 3.5) and Millet's *The Gleaners* (1857; Fig. 3.6). In both images, the subjects are bent over as they harvest, with significant attention paid to the back, and by extension, backbreaking labour. The perverse voyeurism of these pictures recalls slave plantation imagery in which workers were under constant surveillance by their overseers. Not only were workers to anticipate inspection of their bodies and labour by tourists, but also the expectation that they perform for the photographer. Elucidating upon this construction of the picturesque are passages submitted to photography journals that described encounters with subjects. Below is an example of such an account from amateur photographer,

Clarence B. Moore:

The wretched amateur, moreover, is frequently balked in his desire to get a really picturesque composition by the wish of the sitter to pose in his Sunday clothes. Very recently I induced a colored man, with tattered garments, shovel, and lunch pail in hand, to pose under a palmetto, the composition to be a parody on the well-known picture, "The Nooning." All was arranged, and I was on the point of removing the cap, when a colored woman, a friend of the sitter evidently, rushed from a neighboring shanty, crying out: "Why, you ain't agoi'n to let him take you like that, is you, Mr. Mack?" That was enough. Mr. Mack changed his mind, and "The Nooning" will have to wait for another sable sitter.<sup>331</sup>

<sup>329</sup> Nelson, Slavery, Geography and Empire, 207.

<sup>330</sup> Sadakichi Hartmann, "Rudolph Eickemeyer, Jr." *The Photographic Times: An Illustrated Monthly Magazine Devoted to the Interests of Artistic and Scientific Photography* 32, no. 4 (April 1900): 161.

<sup>331</sup> Clarence B. Moore, "Encouragement to Amateurs," *Wilson's Photographic Magazine* 27, no. 368 (April 1890): 231.

Although narratives like this example by Moore were intended to provide humorous annotations for the white readers of these journals, they ultimately reveal disturbing glimpses of the intimate violence involved in the creation of these "picturesque" images. One can even read the effects of minstrelsy into Moore's attempts to emphasize the accent and expressions of the subject's friend. However, these accounts also disclose methods in which subjects denied the objectifying gaze of the tourist, either by refusing to participate in bodily performance for the photographer, or by attempting to direct the outcome of the photograph. Likewise, Indigenous people subjected to the colonial gaze of photographers in Canada sometimes used these situations to their own benefit in the way of obtaining family photographs or remuneration.<sup>332</sup> bell hooks articulates that media such as these photographs embody fetishism and a mechanism to assert one's dominance over the Other:

When race and ethnicity become commodified as resources for pleasure, the culture of specific groups, as well as the bodies of individuals, can be seen as constituting an alternative playground where members of dominating races, genders, sexual practices affirm their power-over in intimate relations with the Other.<sup>333</sup>

As discussed above, one sees this quite literally in the picturesque "playground" composed by white northerners visiting the southern States. Within Canada, a similar visual rhetoric existed in the desires of tourists visiting Niagara Falls. Indigenous and black people in Niagara Falls were viewed as spectacles, adding to the sublime experience of the Falls.<sup>334</sup> Instead of incorporating black people into picturesque visions of a ruinous landscape, white people affirmed their difference and distance by associating them with the trepidation they felt towards the Falls.<sup>335</sup>

<sup>332</sup> Sherry Farrell Racette, "Returning Fire, Pointing the Canon: Aboriginal Photography as Resistance," in *The Cultural Work of Photography in Canada*, 72

<sup>333</sup> bell hooks, Black Looks, 23.

<sup>334</sup> Karen Dubinsky, "Local Colour: The Spectacle of Race at Niagara Falls," in *Racism, Eh?: A Critical Inter-Disciplinary Anthology of Race and Racism in Canada*, eds. Charmaine A. Nelson and Camille A. Nelson (Concord: Captus Press, 2004), 222-236.

<sup>335</sup> Dubinksy, "Local Colour," 230-232.

Many of the employees of the resorts and other tourism related labour were black, and like the field workers, their presence was objectified into an experience of the landscape.<sup>336</sup>

The specific location of A Wayside Scene, Canada (1859; Fig. 3.8) is not stated on the front or back of the stereograph. Produced as part of a series of North American views by British photographer William England for the London Stereoscopic Company, the lack of specificity of A Wayside Scene, Canada allowed the spectator to visualize the sitters within any Canadian destination.<sup>337</sup> Considering the number of itinerant performers and roadside merchants at Niagara, and the frequency with which views of Niagara Falls appeared in box sets of stereoscopes, a Victorian viewer could even imagine these figures as one of the "tourist attractions" at Niagara Falls.<sup>338</sup> In this stereoscopic scene, two white men with monkeys, one of whom is behind a barrel organ, are seated on either side of a black man who stands in the centre. All three men appear to be in front of a wooden wall or fence, and they all gaze at the camera. Immediately, the contemporaneous viewer would have recognized two tropes of the picturesque: the image of the shanty as implied by the wooden wall, and views of labourers at rest. With its haphazard tilt and slightly off centre angle, the spectator would have the impression of walking up to or passing by this scene on the street. Like *cartes de visite*, stereographs were another parlour or drawing room item through which armchair tourists were able to witness the world.<sup>339</sup> Where they differed was the intimacy of the viewing experience. Taken two and a half inches

<sup>336</sup> Dubinksy, "Local Colour," 230-232.

<sup>337 &</sup>quot;America in the Stereoscope," *The Art-Journal*, July 1, 1860, 221. Some of the locations included in the series were: city views of "New York, Boston, Washington, Philadelphia, Quebec, Montreal, and Ottawa"; "scenes on the rivers St. Lawrence, the Delaware, and the Hudson"; and scenes of the "Katskills,' Sleepy Hollow, the Indian Fall, the Falls of the Pontiac, and Trenton Falls – not forgetting Poug[h]keepsie." The article concludes with descriptions of eleven stereographs taken at Niagara Falls, highlighting the significance of stereoscopic images that illustrated one of the "wonders of the world" ("America in the Stereoscope," 221). Because William England also travelled to Montreal, Quebec, and Ottawa, it is difficult to determine where exactly *A Wayside Scene, Canada* was taken. If not in Niagara Falls, then perhaps en route to one of the aforementioned cities.

<sup>338</sup> Dubinksy, "Local Colour," 224; Greenhill and Birrell, Canadian Photography, 45.

<sup>339</sup> Greenhill and Birrell, Canadian Photography, 45.

apart horizontally, stereographs were two slightly different perspectives of the same view, which, when looked at through a stereoscope, rendered a three dimensional experience for the viewer by mimicking binocular depth perception.<sup>340</sup> William England's stereographs of the United States and Canada were said to have brought people "into closer and safer acquaintance with the New World than all books that have been written on the subject," and in the case of *A Wayside Scene*, *Canada*, stereoscopic views could also offer spectators a voyeuristic exploration of poverty.<sup>341</sup> Akin to the firsthand accounts written by tourists to Niagara Falls, England's stereoviews provide contemporary scholars with an idea of how white people regarded black and Indigenous workers within picturesque tourist destinations in Canada. Additionally, like the winter scenes, which were targeted to visitors of Montreal and its Winter Carnival, William England's stereographs also reveal how Canada's identity was constructed for and envisioned by the rest of the world.

#### **IV. Reorienting the Gaze**

By contrast, *Two Women with Niagara Falls Backdrop* (c. 1880-1900; Fig. 3.9) is completely at odds with the ways in which white Canadian society sought to envision the Dominion. As with *G. Conway and Friends*, this is a jovial image that speaks of affection, and could also be a photograph meant to commemorate a trip to Canada as tourists. Thompson notes that public interest in the backdrop can be attributed to their "fascination with new forms of visual entertainment available in the mid- to late nineteenth century," such as the Diorama, panorama, and theatre, since "through painted backdrops, patrons could insert themselves photographically into the painted scapes that formed the ground of many popular visual

<sup>340</sup> Greenhill and Birrell, Canadian Photography, 44.

<sup>341</sup> Greenhill and Birrell, Canadian Photography, 45; "America in the Stereoscope," 221.

technologies."<sup>342</sup> Painted backdrops were not merely decorative, they functioned as a visual technology and form of leisure that directed and configured sighted.<sup>343</sup> By extension, the authors of African American Vernacular Photography claim, "painted backdrops are especially prevalent in African American studio portraits. Many feature idealized landscapes such as [...] [a] waterfall or architectural views that transport the sitters into different class, geographic, or historical realities."<sup>344</sup> A black and white tintype by an unknown photographer, *Two Women with* Niagara Falls Backdrop, presents two black women seated in front of a painted backdrop of the Falls. Although the object in the hand of the sitter at left is unclear, they both seem to be holding closed fans in their laps. Their floral hats and attire, and the parasol resting by the woman at right suggest that this image was taken in the spring or summer. Scholars Charmaine A. Nelson and Kay Dian Kriz have commented on the "transgressive" usage of parasols by black women in the Caribbean who were cognizant of the class mobility afforded by clothing.<sup>345</sup> Carried by white women or held for them by enslaved maidservants, the parasol was a fashion essential across the British Empire, and facilitated upper-class white femininity through its prevention of sun exposure. Therefore, the dark bodies of the enslaved became darker with consistent sun exposure and the light bodies of the slave owning classes were protected.<sup>346</sup> By accessorizing one's outfit with a parasol - or as in the analysis by Kriz whereby black maidservants showed their insubordination by holding parasols over both themselves and the white women for whom they

<sup>342</sup> Thompson, Shine, 79.

<sup>343</sup> Thompson, Shine, 80.

<sup>344</sup> Wallis and Willis, African American Vernacular Photography, 126.

<sup>345</sup> Nelson, Slavery, Geography and Empire, 317; Kay Dian Kriz, Slavery, Sugar and the Culture of Refinement: *Picturing the British West Indies 1700-1840* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008), 57. 346 Nelson, Slavery, Geography and Empire, 316-317.

worked – black women disrupted the codification of femininity and class difference signified through enforced demarcations in dress.<sup>347</sup>

In her scholarship on photography in nineteenth-century Brazil, Margrit Prussat argues that photography was used to strengthen Brazilian nationhood.<sup>348</sup> The legal practice of slavery in Brazil continued until 1888, which resulted in the dominance of white photographers, and a desire for photographs that catered to tourist imaginations.<sup>349</sup> A popular iconographic convention was to present people in accordance with their professions as a means to indicate their position in the social hierarchy.<sup>350</sup> Staged with signifiers of one's occupation within constructed settings in the studio, these images relied on the guise of realism. Despite common knowledge that photography employed the enactment of poses, special effects, and props, the "realistic effect" was what made the medium so persuasive, and helped images such as these to circulate within the image market and travel literature.<sup>351</sup> Additionally, akin to photographers who sought to depict a touristic vision of the southern States through photographs of the black figure in proximity to labour, white photographers in Brazil produced staged studio scenes that represented black labourers in rural and urban environments. As with the pictures of free black people in the southern United States, the indexing of class through studio photography in Brazil created an association between labour, land and the subjugation of black people. This also included depictions of enslaved female street-merchants in metropolitan surroundings, which furthered the social and spatial differentiation between black and white women as it was deemed

<sup>347</sup> Nelson, Slavery, Geography and Empire, 317; Kay Dian Kriz, Slavery, Sugar and the Culture of Refinement, 57.

<sup>348</sup> Margrit Prussat, "Icons of Slavery: Black Brazil in Nineteenth Century Photography and Image Art," in *Living History: Encountering the Memory of the Heirs of Slavery*, ed. Ana Lucia Araujo (Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Pub, 2009), 203.

<sup>349</sup> Prussat, "Icons of Slavery," 203.

<sup>350</sup> Prussat, "Icons of Slavery," 205.

<sup>351</sup> Prussat, "Icons of Slavery," 207.

inappropriate for white women to be on the streets without male companions.<sup>352</sup> More importantly, the photographs in Brazil depicted unfree labour, which cemented an unconscious association within the collective memory between Africans and occupations associated with slavery, even after abolition.<sup>353</sup>

Prussat writes, "Indigenous people are (usually, but not exclusively) photographed in natural settings, Africans mostly by conducting typical professions, whereas Afro-Brazilians are often represented in elegant studio portraits."<sup>354</sup> Free women commissioned *carte de visite* portraits of themselves and articulated their "ascent in social position" through studio props that signified class and education such as "artificial flowers, aristocratic ambience and furniture, a fan or a handkerchief."<sup>355</sup> This hierarchy of representation indexed a shift in perception that was connected to transculturation, since "the portrayed thus demonstrated that they take part in the Brazilian-European culture, its system of social stratification, and aesthetic conventions."<sup>356</sup> However, because enslaved blacks in Canada gained freedom considerably earlier than elsewhere in the Americas, they would have been able to intervene in their misrepresentation earlier as well. The lateness of abolition and the already established nature of photography in the United States, Cuba, and Brazil, would have concretized certain visual rhetoric that appeased white anxieties about emancipation, particularly rhetoric that enforced racial difference and subjugation.

One can see a similar indexing of class within the Notman archives. Although subjects of all races, classes, genders, and occupations were photographed at the Notman studios, photographs like *H. Evans and Lady, G. Conway and Friends* and those of Miss Guilmartin are

<sup>352</sup> Prussat, "Icons of Slavery," 210-211.

<sup>353</sup> Prussat, "Icons of Slavery," 211.

<sup>354</sup> Prussat, "Icons of Slavery," 219.

<sup>355</sup> Prussat, "Icons of Slavery," 213.

<sup>356</sup> Prussat, "Icons of Slavery," 214.

undeniably splendid in comparison with the other photos of black subjects. The appropriate use of studio proprieties was a concern for photographers like Notman who outlined the need for discerning taste rather than excess.<sup>357</sup> Based on a visual reading of the images, one can postulate that the décor and setting of a backdrop would have been arranged according to the visual presentation and attire of the sitter – so that the image would convey an appropriate use of ornamentation, rather than excess or poor judgement. Providing insight on his process to *The Philadelphia Photographer*, Notman remarked that although he was apt to experiment with new ideas when struck by inspiration,

It is not advisable to disturb the studios or rooms in every-day use, which, if well appointed, ought not only to be carpeted, but abound in suitable pieces of furniture and choice ornaments, such as usually seen in drawing or sitting rooms. If possible, let such be real, and so arranged that sitters may have somewhat of a home feeling.<sup>358</sup>

This passage is illuminating because the photographs themselves indicate subtle changes in composition, poses, and accessories even when the setting remains constant between sitters on a given day or series of days. The largest of his three operating rooms possessed not only the best lighting but also was made to appear like a parlour (unlike the other two which tended to be more plain and were frequently used for his outdoor compositions). It was also in the largest studio that the proprietaries, furniture, and backgrounds were stored. Triggs notes that because of the easy access to a variety of props in this studio, changes to the setting could be made easily and deftly between customers.<sup>359</sup> Additionally, greater buying power could have facilitated greater input in the outcome of the image, and would have certainly allowed for the purchase of the more expensive cabinet cards, which due to their larger size would have permitted more objects

<sup>357</sup> Greenhill and Birrell, Canadian Photography, 66.

<sup>358 &</sup>quot;Our Picture," 398-399.

<sup>359</sup> Triggs, William Notman's Studio, 55.

to be clearly legible and thus added to the composition.<sup>360</sup> If not configured through the designation of appropriate "taste," then class would have certainly been inscribed through the additional services that a patron would have been able to afford. Not only did the larger and more detailed cabinet cards cost more, but "for an increased fee, a customer could have several poses taken, with a change of costume for each one if desired, part of the increased fee going to pay for the dressing room attendants."<sup>361</sup> Furthermore, Notman had a robust art department, which, aside from retouching and colouring images, created the painted backdrops: "indoor or outdoor, summer or winter, beach scene, forest stream, patio, parlour, library, living room, and classical columns (either Grecian or Roman)."<sup>362</sup>

Not only was the purchasing of daguerreotypes accessible across classes, unlike other forms of art, but it was also a profession that allowed entry from a range of economic backgrounds.<sup>363</sup> When photography first emerged in the 1840s, there were fifty recorded black daguerreotypists who operated in the United States.<sup>364</sup> As of 1890, there were 190 black American photographers.<sup>365</sup> Some photographers were also able to earn a substantial income: an unnamed black photographer in St. Paul, Minnesota is indicated as generating \$20,000 in revenue per year.<sup>366</sup> Another black photographer, this time from New Bedford, Massachusetts, was documented as a recently established manager and proprietor of a "leading, if not the leading; gallery of the city."<sup>367</sup> Willis conveys that the significance of photography by African

<sup>360</sup> Greenhill and Birrell, Canadian Photography, 66.

<sup>361</sup> Triggs, William Notman, 141.

<sup>362</sup> Triggs, William Notman, 141.

<sup>363</sup> Williams, Confounding Images, 38-39.

<sup>364</sup> Willis, Reflections in Black, 4.

<sup>365</sup> Proceedings of the National Negro Business League: Its First Meeting, Held in Boston, Massachusetts, August 23-24, 1900 (Boston: J.R. Hamm, 1901), 16. The number stems from the United States Census of 1890. 366 Proceedings of the National Negro Business League, 23.

<sup>367</sup> Proceedings of the National Negro Business League, 176.

Americans lies in its breadth of artistic style, patrons, and communities addressed.<sup>368</sup> Whether the portraits were of black and white abolitionists or members of local communities, these images "realized visually the dreams and desires of their individual communities, which included a spirit of transformation contrasting the mass-produced stereotypical images."<sup>369</sup> Furthermore, in a world where black people's mobility and appearance was under constant surveillance and scrutiny from white people, black-run photography studios would have ostensibly been free of what Frantz Fanon terms the "crushing objecthood" of the white gaze.<sup>370</sup> James Smalls, borrowing from Du Bois' notion of "double consciousness", expands on this idea by suggesting that black self-portraitists were "forced to be forever self conscious to her or his public self at the expense of the private."<sup>371</sup> However, it is important to note that even in the context of white spaces, such as Notman's studio, subjects would not have necessarily been concerned with the white gaze. While many black photographers (and black patrons) consciously countered derogatory images through the creation of their own, many photographs eschewed notions of "respectability" and were simply reminders of a life well-lived and well-loved:

Most of the men and women responsible for visually documenting black America were not simply obsessed with race. As modern visual poets, they were equally concerned with locating and reproducing the beauty and fragility of the race, the ironic humor of everyday life, the dream life of a people. [...] Although racism certainly circumscribed their lives, their interior world was far more meaningful.<sup>372</sup>

Research on black photographers in Victorian Canada would undoubtedly provide insight the interior life of black individuals alluded to by Robin D. G. Kelly in the above passage. Within Canada, there is only one known nineteenth-century black photographer, Isaac Henry Lewis, as

<sup>368</sup> Willis, Reflections in Black, 15.

<sup>369</sup> Willis, Reflections in Black, 15.

<sup>370</sup> Frantz Fanon, Black Skin, White Masks, trans. Charles Lam Markmann (London: Pluto, 2008), 83-85.

<sup>371</sup> James Smalls, "African-American Self-Portraiture: Repair, Reclamation, Redemption," *Third Text* 15, no. 54 (2001): 49.

<sup>372</sup> Robin D. G. Kelley, "Foreword," in Reflections in Black, x.

identified by Julie Crooks.<sup>373</sup> Lewis was listed as a photographer in the Toronto directories from 1886 to 1900, with evidence pointing to his practice as a photographer continuing into the twentieth century.<sup>374</sup> Although a residential address is listed as early as 1886, he held a business location at 110 Queen Street West in Toronto from 1887 to 1889, moved to Ontario Street in 1890, then settled at 140 Duke Street and 106 ½ Queen Street West for two years each until moving to Church Street from 1895 through 1898, then finally settling on Anderson Street for the remainder of the century.<sup>375</sup> Several photographers possessed storefronts in Montreal, however, to date, none have been identified as black (Appendix II).

However, other forms of self-representation also existed for blacks in Canada: drawings and paintings.<sup>376</sup> In an 1851 copy of *The Voice of the Fugitive*, a newspaper owned by the fugitive slave Henry Bibb, is an advertisement by a painter known as M. Bordman. In it, he provides notice that he had just opened his studio in Sandwich, Ontario, and highlights his skill in creating "likenesses," indicating that, a customer would not be charged unless they were

<sup>373</sup> Julie Crooks, "I.H. Lewis: Black Photographer from Toronto," *Free Black North*, object label. 374 Glen C. Phillips, *The Ontario Photographers List (1851-1900)* (London, ON: Iron Gate Publishing, 1997), 84; Glen C. Phillips, *The Ontario Photographers List Volume II (1901-1925)* (London, ON: Iron Gate Publishing, 1997), 42, 74. Isaac H. Lewis is listed as a photographer in Toronto from 1901 to 1903 and 1912 to 1920. However, another Isaac H. Lewis (perhaps the location of a branch studio run by him or his son) is listed as a photographer in Oakville from 1901 to 1906.

<sup>375</sup> Isaac H. Lewis (Henry Lewis and Son), bds 104 Duke in *The Toronto City Directory for 1886* (Toronto: R.L. Polk and Co., 1886), 555; 110 Queen West in *The Toronto City Directory for 1887* (Toronto: R.L. Polk and Co., 1887), 1075; 110 Queen West in *The Toronto City Directory for 1888* (Toronto: R.L. Polk and Co., 1888), 1205;
110 Queen West in *The Toronto City Directory for 1888* (Toronto: R.L. Polk and Co., 1888), 1313; 30 Ontario St. in *The Toronto City Directory for 1889* (Toronto: R.L. Polk and Co., 1889), 1313; 30 Ontario St. in *The Toronto City Directory for 1890* (Toronto: R.L. Polk and Co., 1890), 1465; 140 Duke St. in *The Toronto City Directory for 1891* (Toronto: Might's Directory Co., 1891), 969; 140 Duke St. in *The Toronto City Directory for 1892* (Toronto: Might's Directory Co., 1892), 1569; 106 ½ Queen St. W. in *The Toronto City Directory for 1893* (*Toronto: Might's Directory Co., 1893), 1514*; 106 ½ Queen St. W. in *The Toronto City Directory for 1894* (Toronto: Might Directory Co., 1894), 1586; h 307 Church St. in *The Toronto City Directory for 1895* (Toronto: Might Directory Co., 1895), 920; 307 Church St. in *The Toronto City Directory for 1897* (Toronto: Might Directory Co., 1897), 1584; 307 Church St. in *The Toronto City Directory for 1897*, 1584; 307 Church St. in *The Toronto City Directory for 1898*, 1600; 52 Anderson in *The Toronto City Directory for 1899* (Toronto: Might Directory for 1901 (Toronto: Might Directory for 1901), 593.
376 There are sketched portraits in the Alvin D. McCurdy Fonds at the Archives of Ontario, Toronto.

"satisfied with the truthfulness of the Portrait."<sup>377</sup> Although little is known about the painter, including his racial identity, his full name was likely Marcus Boardman, who was originally from the United States and would have been 32 years old at the time of this advertisement.<sup>378</sup> Sandwich was located in Essex County, home to thriving communities of black Canadians and refugees seeking safety from kidnapping under the American Fugitive Slave Act.<sup>379</sup> The passage of the Fugitive Slave Act in 1850 meant that the northern United States became dangerous for blacks fleeing enslavement in the South, and with this, the immigration of black people to Canada greatly increased.<sup>380</sup> Most people settled in central and eastern Canada, especially Ontario where they formed black communities in places such as in Amherstburg, Buxton, Chatham, London, St. Catharines, Toronto, and Windsor. Estimates for the number of black people in Upper Canada (Ontario) after British abolition are in the thousands whereas they are only in the hundreds for Lower Canada (Quebec).<sup>381</sup> This is due to several factors: language, transportation, religion, and the fact that many people moved to Canada with the intention of eventually returning to the States when and if slavery had ended there as well. This also meant that there was a rich network of migrant communities and settlements in Lower Canada, especially along the American border, that did not exist further up north.

Before the development of the railways that would prompt the majority of Montreal's black population to live on the west side of the city, black people owned and rented properties all

<sup>377</sup> M. Bordman, "M. Bordman, Portrait, Ornamental, and Sign Painter," advertisement, *The Voice of the Fugitive*, October 8, 1851, 3.

<sup>378 1851</sup> Census of Canada, Sandwich, Essex County, Canada West (Ontario); p. 89, line 16; 1851; Library and Archives Canada Microfilm RG 31, Roll C-11720. His occupation was listed as "painter".

<sup>379</sup> See Michael Wayne, "The Black Population in Canada West on the Eve of the American Civil War: A Reassessment Based on the Manuscript Census of 1861," *Histoire sociale/Social History* 28, no. 56 (1995): 465-485.

<sup>380</sup> Joseph Mensah, *Black Canadians: History, Experiences, Social Conditions* (Black Point: Fernwood Pub, 2010), 49-53.

<sup>381</sup> Mackey, Done with Slavery, 304.

over the city.<sup>382</sup> However, St. Antoine became the preferred neighbourhood of many black Montrealers by the end of the century (Appendix I). Dorothy Williams attributes this to affordable rents that were accessible to immigrant and working-class residents, and also due to the adjacent rail companies by which many black people were employed.<sup>383</sup> Williams posits that this is reflective of residential tendencies in the nineteenth century – working-class city dwellers often lived near their workplaces in order to reduce travel time and costs. Several black Montrealers lived in the city temporarily as part of their employment, and ninety percent were Americans, largely coming from Chicago, Philadelphia, New York and Washington.<sup>384</sup>

Despite the lack of official records, it is estimated that approximately ten thousand blacks entered Canada before 1850, and twenty thousand from 1850 to 1860. Prejudices against black people in Canada increased with the higher immigration rate, to the extent that some black people felt that they experienced greater racism in Canada than in the United States.<sup>385</sup> Like the United States, "Blacks faced segregated schools, restaurants, theatres, and hotels in Canada."<sup>386</sup> Although many white Canadians had initially supported the abolition of slavery, they were not prepared to accept black immigrants within Canadian culture or society, and their hostility was also manifested within popular culture through dehumanizing satire and grotesque names.<sup>387</sup> Robin W. Winks articulates some of the struggles imposed by white Canadians onto black migrants and citizens who sought lives north of the border. In the decades following the Emancipation Proclamation of 1863, black people had achieved physical freedom, but legally,

<sup>382</sup> Mackey, Done with Slavery, 157.

<sup>383</sup> Dorothy W. Williams, *The Road to Now: A History of Blacks in Montreal* (Montreal: Véhicule Press, 2006), 34-37. A black porter in uniform is visible in the composite produced by the Notman studio for the Canadian Pacific Railway; see plate of "William Notman and Son, *Canadian Pacific Railway, Montreal*. 1888, new 40.6 x 50.8 print from original 20.3 x 25.4 cm glass dry-plate negative, VIEW-1596. McCord Museum, Montreal," in Triggs, *The Composite Photographs of William Notman*, 57.

<sup>384</sup> Williams, The Road to Now, 36, 43.

<sup>385</sup> Mensah, Black Canadians, 50.

<sup>386</sup> Mensah, Black Canadians, 50.

<sup>387</sup> Winks, The Blacks in Canada, 291.

they faced increased racism – a period that has been termed by Robin W. Winks as the "nadir" of black Canadians' endeavours for equity and justice.<sup>388</sup> White Canadians worried that there would be an influx of black immigrants, and as a result, "renewed their efforts to exclude black children from the common schools, refused work to those few new refugees who did arrive, and encouraged those already present to return to the dis-United States."<sup>389</sup> Several people moved back to the United States after the Emancipation Proclamation because of the difficulties they faced in Canada. Adherents to pseudo-scientific notions of racial difference determined that this migration back to the South "underscored the white assumption that blacks were unnatural to the northern landscape."390 By the late nineteenth-century, several black aid organizations were dissolved, and the caricaturing of black people became prevalent in Canadian newspapers, theatre, musical performances, and other forms of culture.<sup>391</sup> For many white people in Canada, these images would have been their first encounter with a person of another race, ethnicity, or culture. By virtue of the ubiquity of this visual culture, many whites would have developed racist imaginations before even meeting someone in person. Winks deduces that the "nadir" for black Canadians "came at the moment when the nation as a whole at last felt itself to be emerging as an identifiable culture on the world scene."<sup>392</sup>

#### V. Aesthetic Networks

Since black people have historically been excluded from the creation of images, photography's accessibility and ubiquity made it an essential tool in the construction of a "counter-hegemonic world of images that would stand as visual resistance, challenging racist

<sup>388</sup> Winks, The Blacks in Canada, 288-336. He specifies this period as 1865 to 1930.

<sup>389</sup> Winks, The Blacks in Canada, 289.

<sup>390</sup> Winks, The Blacks in Canada, 289.

<sup>391</sup> Winks, The Blacks in Canada, 290-291.

<sup>392</sup> Winks, The Blacks in Canada, 313.

images."393 In addition to unequal access to the sphere of visual culture production, bell hooks deduces that the commodification of blackness means that certain images, often racist ones, generate the greatest capital value.<sup>394</sup> Due to this difference in value, it becomes difficult to garner interest in supporting work that is made both by black artists and interrupts or challenges essentialist perceptions of blackness. Since this poses a barrier to media production within the dominant (white) culture, hooks explains that it is necessary to recognize the significance of photography in daily life. She proposes, "When we concentrate on photography, then, we make it possible to see the walls of photographs in black homes as a critical intervention, a disruption of white control of black images."<sup>395</sup> The display of photographs inside black homes unsettled hegemonic visualizations, since these walls functioned as private galleries that were "blackowned and -operated," showing pictures of black people that were made by black people and depicted the complexity of lives, experiences, and appearances.<sup>396</sup> When seen through the context of a history of transatlantic slavery, and the attempts to forcibly erase identity, culture, and familial bonds, self-representation and documentation through photography became an important method of cultivating new futures and preserving one's family history:<sup>397</sup>

When the psychohistory of a people is marked by ongoing loss, when entire histories are denied, hidden, erased documentation may become an obsession. [...] the camera provided a means to document a reality that could, if necessary, be packed, stored, moved from place to place.<sup>398</sup>

- 395 hooks, "In Our Glory," 47.
- 396 hooks, "In Our Glory," 47-48.

<sup>393</sup> bell hooks, "In Our Glory: Photography and Black Life," in Picturing Us, 46.

<sup>394</sup> hooks, "In Our Glory," 47.

<sup>397</sup> hooks, "In Our Glory," 49.

<sup>398</sup> hooks, "In Our Glory," 48.

Image-making was also a way to create a record of the family legacy, one that would get passed down generations, and memorialize ancestors along with their stories as the photographs were discussed among family members.<sup>399</sup>

Photographs occupied a central role in the Victorian home, serving as sentimental décor and entertainment in areas that connected the domestic space and external world: mainly, the drawing room, entrance hall and parlour. <sup>400</sup> Family photos visualized bonds of kinship. In their presentation of the family unit and their centrality to spaces that entertained guests, photographic collections were essential to the making of the Victorian home both through their emotional value and the image of the family that they projected to the outside world. Christian Walker relates that African American photo albums provided family members with a reflection of themselves, a reflection that was often absent from visual culture. However, just as importantly, they possessed the capacity to contextualize one's history, and contribute to a "critical eye" for the ways in which racial identity was constructed and valued in popular culture.<sup>401</sup> He maintains that the fallacies in articulations about race in dominant discourse lie with their lack of nuance in order to serve the white gaze.<sup>402</sup> Brian Wallis argues that the most truthful images are vernacular photographs, "often recorded by the most ordinary photographer, small town studio operators," and relatives with portable cameras.<sup>403</sup> Eschewing artistic aspirations, "they are personal photographs, bound more for the private album than the public exhibition."<sup>404</sup>

This is evident within the photographs in the Alvin D. McCurdy Fonds and Richard Bell Family Fonds in Ontario. Both of these collections stem from family "museums" and albums,

<sup>399</sup> hooks, "In Our Glory," 51.

<sup>400</sup> Wexler, Tender Violence, 64.

<sup>401</sup> Christian Walker, "Gazing Colored: A Family Album," in Picturing Us, 66.

<sup>402</sup> Walker, "Gazing Colored," 69-70.

<sup>403</sup> Wallis, "The Dream Life of a People," 9.

<sup>404</sup> Wallis, "The Dream Life of a People," 10.

and reflect the collection and exchange of photographs among close relations within St. Catharines, Niagara, Chatham, Amherstburg, Windsor, Toronto, Detroit, and Quebec City.<sup>405</sup> In her research on migration between the United States and Canada border along the Great Lakes, Nora Faires affirms there was a

transnational black community in the Great Lakes region, knit together by formal institutions such as religious organizations; by networks of information such as newspapers; by regular participation in celebrations such as the festival of West Indian Emancipation held each August; and by less structured, more intimate ties of kin and friendship, reinforced by visits undertaken within this borderland.<sup>406</sup>

Photographs were shared among family and friends to demonstrate affection, strengthen relations, and celebrate life. Images such as *G. Conway and Friends* and *Two Women with Niagara Falls Backdrop* allowed loved ones to live vicariously through the sitters and imagine themselves as tourists within a snowy Canadian city or the breathtaking scene of the Falls. For the first time, these public and private experiences could be documented and made to travel across spheres, according to the desires of their patrons. Susan S. Williams suggests that the combination of their portability, circulation, and accessibility made these images "an important component of an increasingly commercialized public sphere."<sup>407</sup> While this is true, they operated within an extensive private network in which their comprehension could only be made clear to the relations of whom these images were addressed. Today, public collections such as those held by the McCord Museum, the Archives of Ontario, and Brock University, provide a glimpse of the ways in which black life was constantly affirmed and celebrated through photography.

<sup>405</sup> As evidenced by the Canadian origins of the families represented by these collections, and the photographic mounts that identify studios.

<sup>406</sup> Nora Faires, "Going Across the River: Black Canadians and Detroit Before the Great Migration," *Citizenship Studies* 10, no. 1 (2006): 118.

<sup>407</sup> Williams, Confounding Images, 45.

## **VI.** Conclusion

That the pictorial schematics of landscape would be so closely tied to early photography is not coincidental. This connection between landscape and early photography is evident in the design and visual culture from which the daguerreotype emerged: the daguerreotype was not originally meant for portraiture; thus, the first daguerreotypes could only render landscapes, street views, and still life.<sup>408</sup> By the time photography reached North America, Canadians were already familiar with the precursors to Daguerre and Talbot's inventions, the *camera obscura* and *camera lucida*.<sup>409</sup> The camera obscura in particular was a popular form of entertainment at Niagara Falls.<sup>410</sup> Stephen C. Pinson notes that unlike contemporary assertions that these were used as optical drawing aids, "theorists of the time recommended such instruments more for the study of light, color, and gradation of tone, or what they referred to as 'effects' of nature."<sup>411</sup> Much of the reason why Daguerre's theatrical backdrops, Diorama, and daguerreotype were successful was because of the already existing culture of vision and light that sought to represent nature, including the theatrical mediation of nature in the eighteenth century through the "picturesque."<sup>412</sup>

This chapter concludes with a return to the ideas raised by the notion of an imagined geography. While black patrons of the arts would have faced limited mobility in daily life, their photographs were able to traverse across these geographic and imagined borders. Canada was founded upon an idea of the North as white, male, and in this case, one of British self-denial, which became reified in images and activities that promoted an idea of the North and indexed people according to race and class. Although initially created for the private sphere, photographs

<sup>408</sup> Greenhill and Birrell, Canadian Photography, 24.

<sup>409</sup> Greenhill and Birrell, Canadian Photography, 21.

<sup>410</sup> Greenhill and Birrell, Canadian Photography, 21.

<sup>411</sup> Pinson, Speculating Daguerre, 55.

<sup>412</sup> Pinson, Speculating Daguerre, 55-56.

like *G. Conway and Friends* and *Two Women with Niagara Falls Backdrop* disrupt the dominant visual rhetoric of Canadian nationhood as one of patrician values, and instead assert the pluralities of what it meant to be Canadian. As primary documents, photographs reveal "individual and collective understandings of landscape, [place,] and identity." <sup>413</sup> During a period where migration and citizenship were contested by a public anxious about the effect of the Emancipation Proclamation on Canada, these photographs reveal not only how these anxieties manifested in popular imaginaries of the Dominion, but also how black subjects asserted their sense of belonging and citizenship, and in doing so, contributed to the "writing, as well as to the making, of Canadian history."<sup>414</sup>

<sup>413</sup> Schwartz, "Felix Man's 'Canada'," 19.

<sup>414</sup> Schwartz, "Felix Man's 'Canada'," 19.

## Conclusion

This research explored the representations of black Victorians in portrait photography in nineteenth-century Montreal. In so doing, this thesis examined the significance of early photography to asserting definitions of selfhood and liberty, the role it played in relation to the broader visual culture, and the differences in the use of photography across the Americas. As mentioned in Chapter One, one of the unique characteristics of the Notman collection is its record of patrons. For this reason, it was possible to compile biographical and contextual information on several of the sitters, which ranged from astute businessmen like Osborne Morton, to eminent upper-class women like Miss Guilmartin, to subjects who posed under the conditions of their employment such as in the photographs of nursemaids. In their reflection of a multiplicity of lives and experiences, these photographs build and contest the nation's collective memory, through which dominant narratives of the country often erase the four centuries-long presence of black Canadians and the legacies of their artistic production.

By extension, the images reveal the instability of racial categories. As discussed in Chapters Two and Three, race and identity are constituted in theatrical performance or engagement with other individuals and collectives. Just as photographs waver between real and artificial (as shown through compositions, poses, costuming, and fabricated settings), so too do they function to stabilize or disrupt notions of citizenship and identity. Figures like John Anderson were able to circulate their image across legal restrictions and geographical borders, and as a result, were able to direct their representation so that they could advocate for their personhood and the emancipation of others. A related goal of this thesis was to examine how control over one's image operated in relation to misrepresentations in dominant visual culture and barriers to modes of self-representation. While the studio as theatre allowed for performativity, not everyone could afford to have their image taken, especially at Notman's, where the prices would have been too steep for some members of the working class. There is also some visual evidence to suggest that class identity was read into the attire of a sitter, and that this would have been reflected in the creation of their setting and the selection of props. For the most part, the more eminent the patron, regardless of race, the more sumptuous the environment within which they were pictured. At the same time, the prestige of Notman's studio as a producer of white Anglo-Canadian identity and photographer of prominent individuals would have been legible in any images taken at his studio. Patrons likely used the prominence of Notman's studio, and its attention to systems of visibility, to direct the function of photography through their composition of the self.

At the turn of the twentieth century, activists such as W. E. B. Du Bois organized to produce and exhibit portrait photographs that countered disparaging images in the dominant culture under the term "the New Negro," which was intended to encapsulate the strength and brilliance of black people in America.<sup>415</sup> Tied to notions of "upward mobility and progress," this campaign was not without its drawbacks as it "imposed a white cultural standard for gauging achievement," but it provided inspiration for African Americans and countered whiteconstructed narratives.<sup>416</sup> Brian Wallis cites 1880 as the point at which studios run by black photographers rose in popularity across America.<sup>417</sup> These portraits highlighted one's free status through European fashions, props such as books, which indicated one's education and literacy, and ultimately encapsulated a strong sense of self through poise and "tasteful" surroundings.<sup>418</sup>

<sup>415</sup> Wallis, "The Dream Life of a People," 11.

<sup>416</sup> Wallis, "The Dream Life of a People," 12.

<sup>417</sup> Wallis, "The Dream Life of a People," 13.

<sup>418</sup> Willis and Williams, The Black Female Body, 140-147.

"progress" were met with resistance from a culture entrenched in systemic racism. In photographs of servants, such as those of nursemaids, not only did these images replicate the power structures found within visual representations of slavery from years prior, but they also presented the issue of the "wage slavery" of the working poor, something which was especially true for black female labourers.<sup>419</sup> Frederick Douglass, towards the end of his career, admitted to the many obstacles present in a society that sought to limit social mobility and progress, by declaring, "Experience demonstrates that there may be a slavery of wages only a little less galling and crushing in its effects than chattel slavery, and that this slavery of wages must go down with the other."<sup>420</sup>

What Douglass recognized in the nineteenth century as the moral and social force of images continues today in the work of critical race scholars. Not only is race socially and legally constructed, but these constructions influence legislation and legal processes to reproduce inequities. In short, law and race mutually construct one other.<sup>421</sup> Beth Loffreda and Claudia Rankine termed the formation of racial constructs in the production and reception of literary and visual culture as the "racial imaginary", or as:

the way our culture has imagined over and over again the narrative opportunities, the feelings and attributes and situations, the subjects and metaphors and forms and voices, available both to characters of different races and their authors. The racial imaginary changes over time, in part because artists get into tension with it, challenge it, alter its availabilities.<sup>422</sup>

<sup>419</sup> Frederick Douglass, "Parties Were Made for Men, Not Men for Parties: An Address Delivered in Louisville, Kentucky, on 25 September 1883," in *The Frederick Douglass Papers: Series One: Speeches, Debates, and Interviews Volume 5: 1881-1895*, eds. John W. Blassingame and John R. McKivigan (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992), 97.

<sup>420</sup> Douglass, "Parties Were Made for Men, Not Men for Parties," 97.

<sup>421</sup> Laura E. Gómez, "Understanding Law and Race as Mutually Constitutive: An Invitation to Explore an Emerging Field," *Annual Review of Law and Social Science* 6 (2010): 487-505.

<sup>422</sup> Claudia Rankine and Beth Loffreda, "Introduction," in *The Racial Imaginary: Writers on Race in the Life of the Mind*, eds. Claudia Rankine, Beth Loffreda, and Max King Cap, (Albany: Fence Books, 2016), 22.

Citizenship is conferred in the act of looking, since "the gaze of the powerful is neither neutral nor benign; misrecognition hinders the ability of black people to act as citizens."<sup>423</sup> For many, photographs were a way to document their lives and illustrate their well-being to friends and kin in other regions.<sup>424</sup> As a result, for the most part, these photos remained within private contexts, however, some people publically circulated or displayed their likenesses in order to make their desired social identities a political reality.<sup>425</sup> Photographs allowed one to visually concretize one's affluence, educational and professional accomplishments, relationships, aesthetic tastes, and overall self-presentation. As Deborah Willis writes, "Their photographs realized visually the dreams and desires of their individual communities, which include a spirit of transformation contrasting the mass-produced stereotypical images."<sup>426</sup>

Today, the latent meaning of these photographs render a more accurate narrative of the beginnings of North America, one that de-centres whiteness and maleness. Since photographs can provide information that is absent from the records, such as class identity and ethnicity, they not only facilitate a better comprehension of the sitters, but to also reinscribe otherwise erased people into the history of a country.<sup>427</sup> In their foreword to the exhibition catalogue, *Black Victorians*, the directors assert that the title disrupts the connotation of "Victorian" as white and male by demonstrating the importance of black people to the formation of British society.<sup>428</sup> Despite their significance to the construction of "British economic power and identity," their

<sup>423</sup> Melissa V. Harris-Perry, Sister Citizen: Shame, Stereotypes, and Black Women in America (New Haven/London: Yale University Press, 2011), 40.

<sup>424</sup> Willis, Reflections in Black, 10-11.

<sup>425</sup> Deborah Willis, "Counteracting the Stereotype: Photography in the Nineteenth Century," in *The Image of the Black in Western Art, Volume V: The Twentieth Century, Part 1: The Impact of Africa*, eds. David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates Jr., and Karen C. C. Dalton (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010) 19-21. 426 Willis, *Reflections in Black*, 15.

<sup>427</sup> Caroline Bressey, "Victorian Photography and the Mapping of the Black Presences in Britain," *in Black Victorians*, 68, 75.

<sup>428</sup> Virginia Tandy and Rita McLean, "Director's Foreword and Acknowledgements," in Black Victorians, 8.
representations are largely nonexistent in British art. <sup>429</sup> Even more concerning is that many of these representations are *mis*-representations meant to further the goals of the colonial enterprise – or conversely, the abolitionist movement – through their circulation. Jan Marsh posits that because white artists created many of these works, the subject would have had limited agency over their portrayal.<sup>430</sup> As a result, many of these works re-inscribed the colonial gaze – that of the white artist and viewer.<sup>431</sup>

A limitation with my research is the lack of primary accounts by black photography subjects in Canada. Furthermore, additional research expanded to include photographic collections within archives throughout Quebec is needed to see how photographic representation differed across the province. Of particular interest would be Quebec City as this would have been the second largest municipality in Lower Canada. Perhaps the key issue raised by this work is the need for research exploring the presence of historical black photographers throughout Canada, a study that would be limited by the lack of racial categories on the census. However, the implications of these findings would provide greater insight into how the subject positions of the photographer would have impacted the resulting images, the experiences for the sitters, and the communities they served. This would also facilitate greater knowledge about access to portrait photography across gender, race, and class.

As Susan Sontag has written, "remembering is an ethical act."<sup>432</sup> It is my hope that museums, archives, and universities continue to interrogate the decisions and policies that may reinforce structural inequities in recognition of their role as producers of cultural heritage and imagination, and that they mirror this commitment to equity in their support of the educational

<sup>429</sup> Jan Marsh, "The Black Presence in British Art 1800-1900: Introduction and Overview," in *Black Victorians*, 12. 430 Marsh, "The Black Presence in British Art," 14.

<sup>431</sup> Marsh, "The Black Presence in British Art," 17.

<sup>432</sup> Susan Sontag, Regarding the Pain of Others (New York: Picador, 2004), 115.

and professional development of future scholars and professionals. Photographs have the capacity to connect a society with "a recuperative, redemptive memory" that goes beyond colonial narratives.<sup>433</sup> If we are to take Stuart Hall's definition of cultural identity as "a matter of 'becoming' as well as of 'being'," and how "we are positioned by, and position ourselves within, the narratives of the past," then we can view photographs not only as representations, but also producers of culture and nationhood, and the multiple stories and storytellers that are rooted in this country's history.<sup>434</sup>

<sup>433</sup> bell hooks, "In Our Glory," 53.

<sup>434</sup> Stuart Hall, "Cultural Identity and Cinematic Representation," *Framework: The Journal of Cinema and Media*, no. 36 (1989): 70.

### Appendix



## I. Map of Key Locations in Montreal (1861–1901)

Charles E. Goad, Atlas of the City of Montreal: From Special Survey and Official Plans, Showing All Buildings and Names of Owners. 1881. Image courtesy of Bibliothèque et Archives nationales du Québec, Montreal. Red demarcations and black numerals are my own.

- St. Antoine Ward
- 1. Notman's Bleury Street location (1861-1895). The following page contains further information on the opening dates of the studios.
- 2. Notman's Windsor Hotel branch (1888-1901)
- 3. Notman's Phillip Square location (1894-1901)
- 4. Osborne Morton' Prince of Wales' Livery Stables at 10 Victoria Square (1861-1862)
- 5. Morton's address at 82 Craig Street (1863-1865)
- 6. Morton's addresses at 660 and 658 Craig Street (1865-1867). This can also be the "Craig near Bleury" location at which he listed for 1862-1863.
- 7. The final location for Morton's livery stables at 38 St. Bonaventure Street (1867-1871)

### II. Photographers in Montreal (1861–1901)

This list was compiled using extant Mackay and Lovell business directories for Montreal published from 1860 to 1900. However, in the alphabetical directories of citizens, the occupation of photographer is listed next to several addresses even though some of these photographers are not in the business directories, and thus not included in this list. Their absence from the business directories could mean that they were employees at photography studios, did not own storefronts, operated from their homes, were itinerant photographers, did not subscribe to the directory, or did not wish to be listed. In some instances, additional information was obtained from the alphabetical directories to present more comprehensive, but not conclusive, date ranges.

William Notman opened his first studio at 11 Bleury Street in 1856. As of March 1860, he had expanded his business to include the adjacent house at 9 Bleury.<sup>435</sup> In 1862, he purchased the houses at 7 and 9 Bleury. Although the business remained at these same two buildings for the remainder of his career, the street address was changed from 9 to 17 in 1865. Notman also opened a branch in a room at the Windsor Hotel. However, the dates and purpose of this branch are unclear. He was a member of the Hotel's executive committee upon its opening in 1878, and advertised a branch studio there in the Lovell business directories from 1888 until 1909.<sup>436</sup> However, there is no evidence to suggest that this functioned as an actual photography studio. A descriptive account of the branch from 1886 refers to it as an "office" and suggests that its purpose was to sell and display samples of their work, in addition to scheduling appointments for portraits to be taken at the Bleury Street studio.<sup>437</sup> A timeline in the most recent exhibition catalogue proposes that the Windsor Hotel branch was open from 1878 to 1917, but there is no indication of this in the directories.<sup>438</sup> Hence, 1888 has been used as the opening date for the purpose of this list.

Guide to abbreviations: cor. = corner, opp. = opposite, wid. = widow.

Name	Address	Years
Archambault, Henri E.	2202 Notre Dame	1888-1889
	2204 Notre Dame	1889-1896
	2192 Notre Dame	1896-1901
Archambault, J.E. and Co.	300 ½ Notre Dame	1868-1870
Archambault, L.G.H.	300 ½ Notre Dame	1877-1878
	1694 Notre Dame	1888-1890
	1662 Notre Dame	1890-1895
Arless, G.C. (and Co.)	251 St. James	1883-1885
	261 St. James	1885-1901
Armstrong and Co.	88 St. Martin	1888-1889
Aubin and Co.	3673 Notre Dame, St. Henri	1894-1895

<sup>435</sup> Triggs, William Notman, 23.

<sup>436</sup> Triggs, William Notman, 28-29.

<sup>437</sup> Industries of Canada: City of Montreal, Historical and Descriptive Review, Leading Firms and Moneyed Institutions (Montreal: Historical Publishing Co., 1886), 128.

<sup>438</sup> Samson and Sauvage, Notman, 21.

Baltzly, Benjamin F.	372 Notre Dame	1868-1870
	3 St. Alexander	1870-1871
Barrat, George	2365 St. Catherine	1900-1901
Baum, L. and W.	1840 St. Catherine	1894-1895
Bazinet, Antoine and Co.	cor. Notre Dame and St. Vincent	1863-1865
,	51 St. Vincent	1865-1869
	cor. Notre Dame and St. Vincent	1869-1870
Beaudet, William	15 <sup>1</sup> / <sub>2</sub> Gosford	1888-1889
Bellehumeur, Louis	opp. 279 St. Joseph	1864-1865
Bennett, J.C.S.	100 Metcalfe	1900-1901
Bigaouette, Charles	106 St. Martin	1891-1893
Boisseau, Alfred	372 Notre Dame	1865-1868
	84 Great St. James	1868-1869
Boivin, Z.F.	281 St. Lawrence	1891-1892
	545 Lagauchetière	1894-1895
Bosse, L.C.A.	261 Avenue de l'Hotel de Ville	1900-1901
Bourassa, Samuel	1158 Ontario	1892-1893
,	296 St. Lawrence	1892-1897
	229 St. Lawrence	1897-1901
Bourdua, Aldéric	144 Grand Trunk	1877-1878
Brien, Anatole	2204 Notre Dame	1900-1901
Brodeur, H.A.	81 St. Charles Borromée	1894-1895
Brulé, Henri	7 Dubord	1894-1895
Brulé, J.A.	9 Chaboillez Square	1900-1901
Brulé, Jacques	226 <sup>1</sup> / <sub>2</sub> St. Lawrence	1888-1889
Brymer, James C.	464 Notre Dame	1877-1878
Burns, Edward W.	677 Craig	1877-1878
Bussière, A.	11 Market Square	1888-1889
Buxton, John	126 Notre Dame	1861-1862
	192 Notre Dame	1865-1866
Campeau, Louis	1064 St. Lawrence	1888-1897
-	1411 St. Lawrence, Ville St. Louis	1897-1901
Campeau, Pacific	249 St. Ambroise, St. Henri	1900-1901
Cantin, Louis O.	175 McGill	1875-1876
		1877-1878
Carrier and Co.	159 St. Lawrence	1900-1901
Carrière, M.	141 Drolet	1891-1892
	129 Laval	1892-1893
	538 Sanguinet	1894-1895
Chalifoux, Benjamin	350a Rachel	1900-1901
Charbonneau, A.	169 ½ Notre Dame	1900-1901
Contant, Miss C.	177a Rachel	1900-1901
Coté, Alphonse	1316 St. Catherine	1900-1901
Coté, Arthur	220 Wolfe	1891-1892
	367 Wolfe	1892-1895
Coté, Ludger	220 Wolfe	1888-1893

	1495 St. Catherine	1893-1901
Courtois and Lebrun	249 Centre	1894-1895
Courtois, Louis	247 Centre	1894-1895
Couture, J.A.	159 St. Lawrence	1894-1895
Cowan, John	1124 St. James	1900-1901
Cumming and Brewis	117 and 119 Mansfield, cor. St. Catherine	1889-1892
Cumming, W.A.	242 St. James	1888-1889
Cumming, W.A.	119 Mansfield	1894-1895
Cyr, Cyrille	111 St. Charles Borromée	1868-1870
Dagenais and Renaud	1158 Ontario	1891-1892
6		
Dagenais, Alfred	474 Lagauchetière 86 St. Lawrence	1874-1875
		1877-1878
Dagenais, Henri	51 St. Vincent	1888-1889
	542 Lagauchetière	1891-1895
	150.04	1900-1901
Dagenais, J.A.	159 St. Lawrence	1888-1889
	186 St. Lawrence	1891-1895
	182 St. Lawrence	1900-1901
Dandurand, R.	417 Beaudry	1900-1901
David, C. and Co.	745 Wellington	1900-1901
David, Charles	528 Lagauchetière	1892-1893
Demers, James Louis	121 and 123 Dorchester	1863-1865
	497 Dorchester	1865-1867
		1869-1870
Dennison, James	112 Vitré	1894-1895
	2264 St. Catherine	1897-1901
	141 St. Peter	1899-1901
Desautels, Charles	1662 Notre Dame	1900-1901
Desjardins, O.J.	1162 Ontario	1900-1901
Desmarais and Co.	277 Mignonne, cor. St. Lawrence	1864-1865
	11 St. Chaboillez Square	1868-1869
Desmarais and Pauzé	47 St. Lawrence	1869-1870
Desmarais, Louis Elie (and Co.)	11 Chaboillez Square	1871-1879
	300 ½ Notre Dame	1874-1879
	14 St. Lawrence	1879-1889
	17 St. Lawrence	1889-1895
Desmarais, O.	cor. Craig and St. Lambert Hill	1871-1876
Desmarais, Olivier	St. Helen's Island	1877-1878
Desmarais, Ovila (and Co.)	18 St. Lawrence, St. Henri	1876-1878
Dion, Charles	210 Notre Dame	1861-1862
Dion, Charles (and Brother)	5 St. Bonaventure	1863-1865
Dion, Charles	7 St. Bonaventure	1865-1866
Doane, T.C.	2 Place d'Armes	1860-1865
2000, 110.	126 Great St. James	1865-1866
Dufresne and Lachapelle	160 Notre Dame	1865-1866
Dufresne, Charles	69 St. Mary	1877-1878
,	j	

Dufresne, Mrs. P. and Co.	3542 Notre Dame, St. Henri	1900-1901
Duffesne, P.	3633 and 3635 Notre Dame, St. Henri	1894-1895
Dufresne, Philéas	615 Notre Dame	1888-1895
Duhamel, Alphonse	1447 Notre Dame	1892-1893
Dumas, J.A.	112 Vitré	1900-1901
Dynes and Hawksett	66 Great St. James	1861-1864
Dynes and Scott	66 Great St. James	1864-1865
Ellison Brothers	158 Notre Dame	1860-1861
Field, J. Hampden	1 Bleury	1875-1878
Forestdale, Miss Laurinda	$305 \frac{1}{2}$ Notre Dame	1864-1865
Fortier, Narcisse	51 St. Vincent	1891-1895
Fortier, Nicolas	51 St. Vincent	1900-1901
Fournier, A.	17 St. Lawrence	1900-1901
Gagné, Edouard	170 ½ Notre Dame	1877-1878
Gagné, Mrs. Eugene, wid. Edouard	1823 St. Catherine	1888-1889
Gagne, Mis. Lugene, Wid. Lubuard	211 St. Lawrence	1891-1895
Gagnon, P.M.	1507 St. Catherine	1888-1892
Gauthier, Théophile	173 McGill	1888-1889
Gautiner, Theophile	208 Mount Royal	1892-1893
Giguère, N.A.	68 Jacques Cartier Square	1888-1889
Girard, Alfred	1823 St. Catherine	1894-1895
Gordon, D.	76 Mansfield	1900-1901
Gregory, Charles	McGill	1864-1865
Grenier, H.N.	239 McGill	1866-1867
Hamilton, A.L.	3 Place d'Armes Hill	1890-1891
Henderson, Alexander	10 Phillips Square	1867-1874
Henderson, Mexander	237 St. James	1874-1876
	387 Notre Dame	1876-1884
	28 McTavish	1884-1895
Hogg, David H.	662 Craig	1894-1895
Homier, Albert	1823 St. Catherine	1900-1901
Inglis, James	122 Great St. James	1866-1867
inglis, James	101 Great St. James	1867-1870
	199 St. James	1870-1872
	195 ½ St. James	1872-1874
	51 Bleury	1874-1878
Kellie and Co.	10 ½ Phillips Square	1892-1895
Lacas, Emile and Co.	10 ½ Phillips Square	1891-1892
Laflamme, Eugène	1572 Notre Dame	1888-1901
Lajoie, Miss A.	799 St. Catherine	1900-1901
Lajoie, Mrs. Victorine (and Co.)	11 Chaboillez Square	1888-1889
Lujole, 1115. Vietorine (und Co.)	211 St. Lawrence	1889-1890
	1560 Notre Dame	1890-1892
	1694 Notre Dame	1892-1893
	538 Lagauchetière	1894-1895
Lajoie, P.A.	1560 Notre Dame	1892-1893
Lujoio, 1.71.		10/2 10/3

Lalonde, Noël C.	18 St. Lawrence	1866-1875
,	30 St. Lawrence	1875-1889
	69 St. Lawrence	1889-1890
Lalonde, Noël C. and Son (Charles)		1890-1901
Lamarre, Eugène	3181 <sup>1</sup> / <sub>2</sub> Notre Dame, St. Cunegonde	1900-1901
Lambly J.T.	105 Vitré	1888-1890
Luniory V.I.	112 Vitré	1890-1892
Laporte, François	239 McGill	1868-1869
Laprès and Lavergne	360 St. Denis	1892-1901
Lapres, J.N.	208 St. Denis	1891-1892
Larin and Stidworthy	2202 Notre Dame	1900-1901
Larin, Henri	18 St. Lawrence	1880-1889
	2202 Notre Dame	1889-1895
Lay, John, S.	7 St. Bonaventure	1866-1867
Lebrun, Joseph	247 Centre	1894-1895
Leggo and Co.	10 Place d'Armes	1894-1893
Leggo and Co.	1 Place d'Armes Hill	
Lauring and Ca		1871-1874
Lemire and Co.	1064 St. Lawrence	1892-1893
Lemire, George	7 St. Bonaventure	1867-1869
	68 Jacques Cartier Square	1869-1877
Loiselle, L.A. and Co.	cor. St. Catherine and St. Andre	1888-1889
Loiselle, L.F.P./L.B.F.	330 Notre Dame	1891-1895
Loupret, Mrs./Miss J.	9 Chaboillez Square	1891-1895
Lymburner, Narcisse	144 Grand Trunk	1877-1878
Maillé, L.O.	1694 Notre Dame	1894-1895
Malette and Gordon	83 St. Martin	1891-1893
Malette, N.P.	2442 Notre Dame	1894-1895
Mandeville, Arthur	228 St. Lawrence	1888-1889
Marchand, Emile	728 Berri	1894-1895
Martial, Israel	546 Lagauchetière	1888-1889
Martin, George	cor. Craig and St. Peter	1863-1865
	109 St. Peter	1865-1868
Martin, James	497 Dorchester	1877-1878
Martin, Merritt	141 St. Peter	1888-1889
Martin, W.G.	141 St. Peter	1888-1893
Matton, Ferdinand	320 Notre Dame	1900-1901
McDonald, John	576 St. Antoine, St. Henri	1900-1901
McIntyre, A.C.	122 Great St. James	1867-1868
Métivier, Charles	469 Marianne	1888-1889
Mitchell, N.T.	285 Notre Dame	1866-1867
Montreal Photographic Studio	1630 Notre Dame (E. Desmarais, manager)	1892-1893
Nettleton, Thomas	2 Gain	1888-1889
Notman, William	9 and 11 Bleury	1860-1865
	17 Bleury	1865-1877
	17 and 19 Bleury	1877-1878
Notman and Sandham	17 and 19 Bleury	1878-1881
	2	

	17 Bleury	1881-1883
Notman, William and Son	17 Bleury	1883-1895
	Windsor Hotel, Dominion Square	1888-1901
	14 Phillips Square	1894-1901
O'Reilly, J.	102 St. Lawrence	1867-1869
	474 Lagauchetière	1869-1870
Parks, J.G.	18 St. Lawrence	1865-1866
,	1 Bleury	1866-1869
	84 Great St. James	1869-1870
	188 St. James	1870-1874
	195 ½ St. James	1874-1884
	197 St. James	1884-1889
	187 St. James	1887-1888
	2264 St. Catherine	1889-1895
Perreault, Henri	2075 Notre Dame	1891-1893
Poirier, J.R. (and Co.)	3065 Notre Dame, St. Cunegonde	1894-1901
Potter, Henry	196 ½ Notre Dame, opp. Crystal Block	1863-1865
1 otter, 110mg	288 Notre Dame	1865-1866
	74 Great St. James	1866-1870
	$300 \frac{1}{2}$ Notre Dame	1870-1875
Quéry Frères (P.A. and G.W.)	10 St. Lambert	1888-1901
Racette, Euclide	330 Notre Dame	1888-1889
	1158 Ontario	1889-1892
Reilly, John	102 St. Lawrence	1866-1867
Rice and Bennett	141 St. Peter	1894-1895
Rice, A.I.	2261 St. Catherine	1900-1901
Richard, Henri	68 Jacques Cartier Square	1892-1896
,	1729 St. Catherine	1900-1901
Riendeau, Charles	494 Laval	1888-1889
Rivet, Joseph	8 Sanguinet	1864-1865
	7 Sanguinet	1865-1871
	14 St. Lawrence	1871-1878
Ross, James	105 ½ McGill	1861-1863
	105 McGill	1863-1865
	239 McGill	1865-1866
	175 McGill	1866-1867
Rousseau and Joron	69 St. Lawrence	1894-1901
Roussel, A.G.	619b St. Lawrence	1900-1901
Roy and Harris	4 St. Lawrence	1892-1893
Roy, L.	1823 St. Catherine	1897-1898
Sawyer, William	118 St. Peter	1870-1871
Shorey, John B.	304 Notre Dame	1863-1864
Snider, George A.	159 St. Lawrence	1876-1878
Sourdif, Alcide	17 St. Lawrence	1900-1901
St. George, Mrs. Julie, wid. Théo.	1507 St. Catherine	1892-1893
	20 Arcade	1894-1895
		-

Stockford, William	291 Notre Dame	1863-1865
	449 Notre Dame	1866-1867
Such and Co.	69 St. Lawrence	1891-1893
Such, Mrs. E., wid. James	342 St. Lawrence	1894-1895
Summerhayes and Walford	1 Bleury	1884-1891
Summerhayes, R.	1 Bleury	1891-1895
Taber, A.B.	215 and 304 Notre Dame	1860-1862
	24 Great St. James	1860-1862
	158 Notre Dame	1861-1863
	Excelsior Hall, 62 1/2 Great St. James	1863-1865
Taber, E.H.	210 Notre Dame St.	1863-1865
Thifault, Alfred	300 Sanguinet	1872-1873
Turner, Edwin R.	149 Great St. James	1866-1870
	193 St. Peter	1876-1878
Vaillancourt, Alphonse	1511 St. Catherine	1894-1895
Vaillancourt, A.J.	1509 St. Catherine	1900-1901
Valiquette, Mrs. Caroline/Stanislas	3 Fulford	1886-1889
	1036 St. Lawrence	1890-1894
Valiquette, Stanislas	1036 St. Lawrence	1895-1898
	1064 St. Lawrence	1898-1899
Valiquette, Mrs. Stanislas and Co.	1064 St. Lawrence	1899-1901
Victoria and Co.	3673 Notre Dame, St. Henri	1900-1901
Walford, Alfred G.	2243 St. Catherine, cor. Victoria	1891-1900
	745 Wellington	1896-1901
	3 Victoria	1898-1901
White, A.P.	Royal Hall, 3 Bleury	1863-1864

# Figures



*Fig. 1.1* William Notman, *Picture Book No. 8, I-7320 to I-8363.* 1863, 40 x 27 cm, N-0000.1956.1.8. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.2* William Notman, *Mr. John Anderson.* 1861, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8 x 5 cm, I-0.55.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



Fig. 1.3 Unknown artist, Yours Truly John Anderson. 1863, frontispiece from Harper Twelvetrees, ed., The Story of the Life of John Anderson, the Fugitive Slave (London: W. Tweedie, 1863). Image courtesy of the University Library, The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill.



*Fig. 1.4* William Notman, *Osborne Morton.* 1863, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen paper, 8 x 5 cm, I-9503.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.







*Fig. 1.6* William Notman and Son, *Harry Sinker, Jockey.* 1892, silver salts on glass, gelatin dry plate process, 17 x 12 cm, II-98889. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.7* William Notman, *Robert S. Duncanson, Artist.* 1864, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-11978.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.8* William Notman, *Robert S. Duncanson, Artist.* 1864, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-11979.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.9* William Notman, *Dr. Davis.* 1875, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17 x 12 cm, II-18419.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.10* William Notman and Son, *Dr. Rohlehr.* 1897, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, 17 x 12 cm, II-121342.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



Fig. 1.11 Notman and Sandham, Miss Guilmartin. 1877, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17.8 x 12.7 cm, II-45957.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.12* William Notman and Son, *Miss Guilmartin.* 1885, silver salts on glass, gelatin dry plate process, 17 x 12 cm, II-77923.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.13* William Notman, *Mrs. McWill* and *Mrs. Ringold's Servants.* 1873, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17 x 12 cm, I-89124.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



Fig. 1.14 William Notman, E. J. Samson, St. Alban's Militia. 1873, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17 x 12 cm. I-89035.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.15* William Notman and Son, *Ransom Guards, St. Albans, Vermont, Composite.* 1873, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, composite photograph, N-0000.73.11. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.16* Unknown photographer, *Mrs. Farquharson, Copied in 1867.* 1867, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-28756.0.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.17* Unknown photographer, *Nurse and Baby, Copied for Mrs. Farquharson in 1868.* 1868, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-31290.0.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.18* William Notman and Son, *Baby Paikert and Nurse.* 1901, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, 8.5 x 5.6 cm. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.19* William H. Buckley, *Nanny with the Children in Her Care, Guysborough.* c. 1900, 1985-386/216. Buckley Family Fonds, Nova Scotia Archives, Halifax.



*Fig. 1.20* William Notman, *Mrs. Cowan's Nursemaid.* 1871, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8 x 5 cm, I-66067.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 1.21* William Notman, *Missie D. Cowan.* 1871, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17.8 x 12.7 cm, I-66066.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 2.1* Unknown artist, *Untitled (Primary Operating Room in Notman's Studio).* 1866, from *The Philadelphia Photographer* 3, no. 32, August 1866.



Fig. 2.2 Unknown artist, Untitled (Secondary Operating Room in Notman's Studio). 1866, from The Philadelphia Photographer 3, no. 29, May 1866.



*Fig. 2.3* William Notman, *Thomas Waites*. 1862, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-3312.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 2.4* William Notman, *George E. Jones.* 1863, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8 x 5 cm, I-8338.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 2.5* Unknown photographer, *Mr. Jones, Copied in 1868.* 1868, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-33528.0.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 2.6* Unknown photographer, *Mr. Jones, Copied in 1868.* 1868, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 8.5 x 5.6 cm, I-32559.0.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 2.7* William Notman, *H. Evans and Lady.* 1871, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 9 x 5.6 cm, I-66017.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



Fig. 2.8 Notman and Sandham, B. Harris. 1880, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17.8 x 12.7 cm, II-56583.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 2.9* William Notman and Son, *Lincoln Marlin.* 1886, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17.8 x 12.7 cm, II-81978.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



Fig. 2.10 H.Y.S., Halifax. "Now That the Marquis's Come, Plaids Are All the Fashion." 1878, from The Canadian Illustrated News 18, no. 24, December 14, 1878.



*Fig. 2.11* William Notman and Son, *Mr. Hickey, Blackface Theatre Performer.* 1896, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 17.8 x 12.7 cm, II-115184.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



Fig. 2.12 Edward Jump, "The Apple of My Eye" (The Burnt Cork Fraternity. Hogan and Mudge's Minstrels in Their Comicalities). 1872, from The Canadian Illustrated News 6, no. 17, October 26, 1872.



*Fig. 2.13* Edward Jump, *Washing Up (The Burnt Cork Fraternity. Hogan and Mudge's Minstrels in Their Comicalities).* 1872, from *The Canadian Illustrated News* 6, no. 17, October 26, 1872.



*Fig. 3.1* William Notman, "*Young Canada,*" *William McFarlane Notman.* 1867, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, albumen process, 14 x 10 cm, I-24436.1, McCord Museum, Montreal.



*Fig. 3.2* Unknown artist, *Old and Young Canada*. 1884, from *The Winter Carnival Illustrated* (Montreal: George Bishop and Co., 1884).



*Fig. 3.3* Thomas Worth for Currier and Ives, *A Team Fast on the Snow (Darktown Comics* series). 1883, chromolithograph, 57.300.316. Museum of the City of New York.



*Fig. 3.4* William Notman and Son, *G. Conway and Friends*. 1901, silver salts on paper mounted on paper, 17 x 12 cm, II-138423.1. McCord Museum, Montreal.



Fig. 3.5 Rudolph Eickemeyer Jr., The Peanut Field. c. 1900, from The Photographic Times 32, no. 4, April 1900.



*Fig. 3.6* Jean-François Millet, *The Gleaners*. 1857, oil on canvas, 83.5 x 110 cm, RF 592. Musée d'Orsay, Paris.



*Fig. 3.7* H.Y.S., *Halifax – Negroes Bringing in Evergreens for the Arches.* 1878, from *The Canadian Illustrated News* XVIII, no. 24, December 14, 1878.



*Fig. 3.8* William England, *A Wayside Scene, Canada.* 1859, albumen silver print with applied colour, 7.2 x 14.7 cm, 21655. National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa.



Fig. 3.9 Unknown photographer, Two Women with Niagara Falls Backdrop. c. 1880-1900,
tintype, 6.4 × 5.1 cm, RG 63. Richard Bell Family Fonds, Brock University Archives, Brock
University, St. Catharines. Image courtesy of the Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto.

### **Bibliography**

### **Primary Sources**

- "America in the Stereoscope." The Art-Journal. July 1, 1860.
- "Cabinet Photographs, Best Finish." Advertisement. *Montreal Winter Carnival Souvenir*. Montreal: Canada Railway News Co, 1889.
- Canada Census and Statistics Office. Bulletin I: Wage-Earners by Occupations. Ottawa: S.E. Dawson, 1907.
- Canada Railway Advertising Company, Montreal business sketches with a description of the city of Montreal: its public buildings and places of interest, and the Grand Trunk works at Point St. Charles, Victoria Bridge &c., &c. Montreal: M. Longmore and Co., Gazette Job Office, 1864.
- Constitution and By-Laws of the Frederic [sic] Douglass Self-Improvement Club (1898-1899). Alvin D. McCurdy Fonds. Archives of Ontario Microfilm MS 1178, Reference Code F 2076-9-0-3.
- "Diorama of Uncle Tom's Cabin." Provincial Freeman. May 5, 1855.
- "Dress." Provincial Freeman, May 5, 1855.
- "Further Remarks on Lights and Lighting." *The Philadelphia Photographer* 3, no. 32 (August 1866): 229-232.
- "How to Keep Silks." Provincial Freeman, February 23, 1856.
- Industries of Canada: City of Montreal, Historical and Descriptive Review, Leading Firms and Moneyed Institutions. Montreal: Historical Publishing Company, 1886.
- Loi concernant la succession de dame Francis Jane Mary Lloyd. SC 1914, c 129.
- Lovell's Classified Business Directory for 1877-1878. Montreal: Lovell Printing and Publishing Co., 1877.
- Lovell's Classified Business Directory for 1888-1889. Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1888.
- Lovell's Classified Business Directory for 1891-1892. Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1891.
- Lovell's Montreal Business Directory for 1892-1893. Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1892.
- Lovell's Montreal Business Directory for 1894-1895. Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1894.
- Lovell's Montreal Business Directory for 1900-1901. Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1900.
- *Lovell's Montreal Directory.* Montreal: Lovell Printing and Publishing Co. Published annually. From 1875 to 1879 published by Lovell Printing and Publishing Co.; from 1880 to 1900 published by John Lovell and Son.
- Mackay's Montreal Directory. Montreal: Owler and Stevenson. Published annually. From 1860 to 1862 published by Owler and Stevenson; from 1863 to 1867 published by John Lovell.
- Montreal Directory. Montreal: John Lovell. Published annually from 1868 to 1874.
- Medical Faculty, Bishop's College." *The Canada Medical Record: A Monthly Journal of Medicine and Surgery* 3, no. 9 (April 1875): 521
- Minutes of the Faculty of Medicine. University of Bishop's College. February 28, 1884. Bishop's University Archives.
- Montcalm West Ward, Quebec City, Quebec. 1891 Census of Canada. Library and Archives Canada Microfilm RG 31, Roll T-6414.
- "Obituary. Mr. L. J. Guilmartin." Savannah Morning News, May 18, 1902

- Ordinance No. 9 of 1884 to Ordinance No. 17 of 1891. Vol. 3 of The Laws of British Guiana. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1895.
- "Our Illustrations." *The Winter Carnival Illustrated*. Montreal: George Bishop and Co., 1884.

- "Outdoor Photographs Taken Indoors." *The Philadelphia Photographer* 3, no. 29 (May 1866): 129-131.
- "Personal." *The Canada Medical Record: A Monthly Journal of Medicine and Surgery* 4 no. 3 (December 1875): 71
- "Portraits in Winter Costume." Advertisement. Montreal Gazette, February 14, 1867.
- Proceedings of the National Negro Business League: Its First Meeting, Held in Boston, Massachusetts. August 23-24, 1900. Boston: J.R. Hamm, 1901.
- Prop File. Notman Photographic Archives. McCord Museum of Canadian History, Montreal.
- Quebec City, Quebec. Marriage Record. Onésiphore Ernest Talbot to Marie Anne Law Guilmartin. Register photocopied at the Registry of Quebec, Institut Généalogique

Drouin; Montreal, Quebec, Canada.

- Quebec Official Gazette 50, vol. 50 (December 14, 1918): 2440.
- Sandwich, Essex County, Canada West (Ontario). 1851 Census of Canada. Library and Archives Canada Microfilm RG 31, Roll C-11720.
- Savannah, Chatham County, Georgia. 1860 United States Census (Slave Schedule). National Archives Microfilm M-653, Roll 143.
- Savannah, Chatham County, Georgia. 1880 United States Census. National Archives Microfilm T-9, Roll 138.
- "Sensational Photography." The Philadelphia Photographer 21, no. 241 (January 1884): 22-24.
- Shole's Directory of the City of Savannah, 1882. Savannah, GA: Morning News Steam Printing House, 1882).
- Smith's Brooklyn Directory. Brooklyn: William H. Smith, 1856.
- St. Johns, Florida. Marriage License. Laurence J. Guilmartin to Frances J. Lloyd, January 7, 1854. *Florida, County Marriage Records, 1823-1982 [database on-line]*. Lehi, UT, USA: Ancestry.com Operations, Inc., 2016.
- "The Electric Light in Photographic Studios." *Anthony's Photographic Bulletin* 25, no. 6 (June 1894): 180-184.
- The Canadian Parliament: Biographical Sketches and Photo-Engravures of the Senators and Members of the House of Commons of Canada. Montreal: Perrault Printing Co., 1906.
- The Industries of Savannah. Chief Cotton Port of the South Atlantic Coast and the Principal Shipping Point of the World for Naval Stores: Her Trade, Commerce, Manufactures and Representative Establishments. Savannah, GA: J.M. Elstner and Company, 1886
- The National Cyclopaedia of American Biography: Being the History of the United States as Illustrated in the Lives of the Founders, Builders, and Defenders of the Republic, and of the Men and Women who are Doing the Work and Moulding the Thought of the Present Time. Vol. 3. New York: J. T. White and Co., 1893.
- *The Toronto City Directory.* Toronto: R.L. Polk and Co. Published annually. From 1886 to 1890 published by R.L. Polk and Co.; from 1891 to 1893 published by Might's Directory Co.; from 1894 to 1900 published by Might Directory Co.; in 1901 published by Might Directories.
- "The Vice-Regal Reception." The Canadian Illustrated News. December 14, 1878.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Our Picture." The Philadelphia Photographer 4, no. 48 (December 1867): 398-399.

- Toronto Business Sketches: Being Descriptive Notices of the Principal Business Establishments in this City. Toronto: Daily Telegraph Printing House, 1867.
- "Uncle Tom's Cabin': A Grand Exhibition of the Diorama of Uncle Tom's Cabin." *Newport Mercury*, July 28, 1855.
- University of Bishop's College: Sixth Annual Announcement of the Faculty of Medicine, Montreal. Montreal: Lovell Printing and Publishing Co., 1876.
- Adams, Mrs. "More Hints on Petticoats." Provincial Freeman. March 22, 1856.
- Bordman, M. "M. Bordman, Portrait, Ornamental, and Sign Painter." Advertisement. *The Voice* of the Fugitive. October 8, 1851.
- Douglass, Frederick. "A Tribute to the Negro." The North Star. April 7, 1849.
- . "Call for a National Colored Convention." *Frederick Douglass' Paper*. May 20, 1853.
- Haliburton, Robert Grant. *The Men of the North and Their Place in History: A Lecture Delivered Before the Montreal Literary Club*, March 31, 1869. Montreal: John Lovell, 1869.
- Hartmann, Sadakichi. "Rudolph Eickemeyer, Jr." *The Photographic Times: An Illustrated Monthly Magazine Devoted to the Interests of Artistic and Scientific Photography* 32, no. 4 (April 1900): 161-166.
- Moore, Clarence B. "Encouragement to Amateurs." *Wilson's Photographic Magazine* 27, no. 368 (April 1890): 230-231.
- Notman, William. *Photography: Things You Ought to Know*. Montreal: Louis Perrault and Co., 1866.
- Pickard, Kate E. R. *The Kidnapped and the Ransomed: Being the Personal Recollections of Peter Still and His Wife Vina, After Forty Years of Slavery.* Syracuse: William T. Hamilton, 1856.
- Shadd, Mary A. A Plea for Emigration or Notes on Canada West in Its Moral, Social and Political Aspect: Suggestions Respecting Mexico, West Indies and Vancouver's Island for the Information of Colored Emigrants. Detroit: George W. Pattison, 1852.
- Sterritt, Mrs. M. A. "Mrs. M. A. Sterritt, Fashionable Dress and Cloak Maker." Advertisement. *Provincial Freeman*, September 22, 1855.
- Still, J.N. "Exhibitions and Lectures." *Frederick Douglass' Paper*, May 4, 1855. ———. "Exhibitions and Lectures." *Frederick Douglass' Paper*. May 4, 1855.
- ------. "Exhibitions and Lectures." Provincial Freeman, May 19, 1855
- Still, J. N. and Co. "To Colored Men of Business." Frederick Douglass' Paper. April 14, 1854.
- Still, John N. and Co. "Circular to Clothes Dealers and Barber-Shop Keepers." *Frederick Douglass' Paper*. August 21, 1851.
- Still, William. The Underground Rail Road: A Record of Facts, Authentic Narratives, Letters, &c., Narrating the Hardships, Hair-Breadth Escapes and Death Struggles of the Slaves in Their Efforts for Freedom, As Related by Themselves and Others, or Witnessed by the Author. Philadelphia: Porter and Coates, 1872.
- Terrill, Frederick William, A Chronology of Montreal and of Canada from A.D. 1752 to A.D. 1893. Montreal: John Lovell and Son, 1893.
- Twelvetrees, Harper, ed. *The Story of the Life of John Anderson, the Fugitive Slave*. London: William Tweedie, 1863.

#### Secondary Sources

- Adams, Tracey. "Making a Living: African Canadian Workers in London, Ontario, 1861-1901." *Labour/Le Travail* 67 (Spring 2011): 9-44.
- Bara, Jana. "Cradled in Furs Winter Fashions in Montreal in the 1860s." *Dress* 16, no. 1 (1990): 39-47.

------. "Through the Frosty Lens: William Notman and His Studio Props, 1861-1876." *History* of Photography 12, no. 1 (1988): 23-30.

- Beaudoin-Ross, Jacqueline. Form and Fashion: Nineteenth-Century Montreal Dress. Montreal: McCord Museum of Canadian History, 1992.
- Beckford, Sharon Morgan. "(Up)Rooting Claims to Legitimacy: Blackness and the Canadian National Imaginary in Djanet Sears's Adventures of a Black Girl in Search of God and Afua Cooper's Negro Cemeteries." In Ebony Roots, Northern Soil: Perspectives on Blackness in Canada, edited by Charmaine Nelson, 277-296. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars, 2010.
- Berger, Carl. "The True North Strong and Free." In *Canadian Culture: An Introductory Reader,* edited by Elspeth Cameron, 83-102. Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press, 1997.
- Bermingham, Ann. Landscape and Ideology: The English Rustic Tradition 1740-1860. Berkeley/Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1989.
- Boone, Emilie. "The Likeness of Fugitivity: William Notman's Carte-De-Visite Portrait of John Anderson." *History of Photography* 37, no. 2 (2013): 221-234.
- Bristow, Peggy, ed. We're Rooted Here and They Can't Pull Us Up: Essays in African Canadian Women's History. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1994.
- Browne, Simone. *Dark Matters: On the Surveillance of Blackness*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2015.
- Coleman, Daniel. *White Civility: The Literary Project of English Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006.
- Cooper, Afua. The Hanging of Angélique: The Untold Story of Canadian Slavery and the Burning of Old Montréal. Toronto: Harper Collins Canada, 2011.
- Copp, J. Terry. "The Condition of the Working Class in Montreal, 1897-1929." *Canadian Historical Association, Historical Papers* 7, no. 1 (1972): 157-180.
- Crooks, Julie. "I.H. Lewis: Black Photographer from Toronto." *Free Black North*. Object label. Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario, 2017.
- Crooks, Julie. "The Bell-Sloman Collection at Brock University: A Fugitive Archive." *Photography and Culture* 10, no. 2 (2017): 173-180.
- Daniels, Douglas Henry. *Pioneer Urbanites: A Social and Cultural History of Black San Francisco*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990.
- Douglass, Frederick. "Parties Were Made for Men, Not Men for Parties: An Address Delivered in Louisville, Kentucky, on 25 September 1883." In *The Frederick Douglass Papers: Series One: Speeches, Debates, and Interviews Volume 5: 1881-1895*, edited by John W. Blassingame and John R. McKivigan, 85-100. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992.
- . "Pictures and Progress: An Address Delivered in Boston, Massachusetts, on 3 December 1861." In *The Frederick Douglass Papers: Series One: Speeches, Debates, and Interviews Volume 3: 1855–1863*, edited by John W. Blassingame, 452-473. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1985.

Dunson, Stephanie. "Black Misrepresentation in Nineteenth-Century Sheet Music Illustration." In Beyond Blackface: African Americans and the Creation of American Popular Culture, 1890-1930, edited by W. Fitzhugh Brundage, 45-65. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2011.

------. "The Minstrel in the Parlor: Nineteenth-Century Sheet Music and the Domestication of Blackface Minstrelsy." *ATQ* 16, no. 4 (December 2002): 241-256.

Dyer, Richard. White. London: Routledge, 1997.

- Earle, Rebecca. "'Two Pairs of Pink Satin Shoes!': Race, Clothing and Identity in The Americas (17th-19th Centuries)." *History Workshop Journal*, no. 52 (August 2001): 175-195.
- Eddo-Lodge, Reni. *Why I'm No Longer Talking to White People About Race*. London: Bloomsbury Circus, 2017.
- Edmunds-Flett, Sherry. "'Abundant faith': Nineteenth-Century African-Canadian Women on Vancouver Island." In *Telling Tales: Essays in Western Women's History*, edited by Catherine Anne Cavanaugh and R. R., 274-293. Warne. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2000.
- Elgersman Lee, Maureen. Unyielding Spirits: Black Women and Slavery in Early Canada and Jamaica. New York: Garland Pub, 1999.
- English, Darby. How to See a Work of Art in Total Darkness. Cambridge: MIT Press, 2007.
- Fanon, Frantz. *Black Skin, White Masks*. Translated by Charles Lam Markmann. London: Pluto, 2008.
- Faires, Nora. "Going Across the River: Black Canadians and Detroit Before the Great Migration." *Citizenship Studies* 10, no. 1 (2006): 117-134.
- Gerson, Carole. Canadian Women in Print, 1750-1918. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2011.
- Gómez, Laura E. "Understanding Law and Race as Mutually Constitutive: An Invitation to Explore an Emerging Field." *Annual Review of Law and Social Science* 6 (2010): 487-505.
- Greenhill, Ralph, and A. J. Birrell. *Canadian Photography*, 1839-1920. Toronto: Coach House Press, 1979.
- Grigsby, Darcy Grimaldo. *Enduring Truths: Sojourner's Shadows and Substance*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2015.
- Hall, Roger, Gordon Dodds, and Stanley Triggs, *The World of William Notman: The Nineteenth Century Through a Master Lens*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1993.
- Hall, Stuart. "Cultural Identity and Cinematic Representation." *Framework: The Journal of Cinema and Media*, no. 36 (1989): 68-81.
- Hamill, Kyna. "'The Story I Must Tell': 'Jingle Bells' in the Minstrel Repertoire." *Theatre Survey* 58, no. 3 (September 2017): 375-403.
- Harris-Perry, Melissa V. Sister Citizen: Shame, Stereotypes, and Black Women in America. New Haven/London: Yale University Press, 2011.
- hooks, bell. Black Looks: Race and Representation. Boston: South End Press, 1992.
- Josiah, Barbara P. Migration, Mining, and the African Diaspora: Guyana in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011.
- Ketner, Joseph D. The Emergence of the African-American Artist Robert S. Duncanson, 1821-1872. Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1994.
- Knight, Mélanie, "Black Self-Employed Women in the Twenty-First Century: A Critical Approach." *Canadian Woman Studies* 23 (2004): 104-110.

- Kriz, Kay Dian. Slavery, Sugar and the Culture of Refinement: Picturing the British West Indies 1700-1840. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008.
- Kunard, Andrea. "Canada." In *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, edited by John Hannavy, 261-267. New York: Routledge, 2008.
- Kunard, Andrea, and Carol Payne, eds. *The Cultural Work of Photography in Canada*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2011.
- Lott, Eric. Love and Theft: Blackface Minstrelsy and the American Working Class. 20th anniv. ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- Mackey, Frank. *Black Then: Blacks and Montreal, 1780-1880's*. Montreal/Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2004.
- Mair, Lucille Mathurin. "Women Field Workers in Jamaica During Slavery." In *Caribbean Slavery in the Atlantic World: A Student Reader*, edited by Verene Shepherd and Hilary McD. Beckles, 390-397. Kingston, Jamaica: Ian Randle, 2000.
- Marsh, Jan, ed. *Black Victorians: Black People in British Art, 1800-1900.* Aldershot, Hampshire: Lund Humphries, 2005.
- Marshall, David. "The Problem of the Picturesque." *Eighteenth-Century Studies* 35, no. 3 (Spring 2002): 413-437.
- Mensah, Joseph. *Black Canadians: History, Experiences, Social Conditions*. Black Point: Fernwood Pub, 2010.
- Miller, Monica L. Slaves to Fashion: Black Dandyism and the Styling of Black Diasporic Identity. Durham: Duke University Press, 2009.
- Miller, Richard F. States at War. A Reference Guide for Connecticut, Maine, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, Rhode Island, and Vermont in the Civil War. Vol. 1. Hanover: University Press of New England, 2013.
- Milner, Elizabeth H. Bishop's Medical Faculty, Montreal, 1871-1905: Including the Affiliated Dental College, 1896-1905. Sherbrooke, QC: René Prince, 1985.
- Nelson, Charmaine A. "From African to Creole: Examining Creolization through the Art and Fugitive Slave Advertisements of Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Canada and Jamaica." Paper presented as the McCready Lecture on Canadian Art at The Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto, ON, Canada, January 20, 2016.
- ———. "Innocence Curtailed: Reading Maternity and Sexuality as Labor in Canadian Representations of Black Girls." In *Sex, Power, and Slavery,* edited by Gwyn Campbell and Elizabeth Elbourne, 434-468. Athens: Ohio University Press, 2014.
  - ——. Representing the Black Female Subject in Western Art. New York: Routledge, 2010.
- ———. Slavery, Geography and Empire in Nineteenth-Century Marine Landscapes of Montreal and Jamaica. London: Routledge, 2017.
- Nelson, Charmaine A., and Camille A. Nelson, eds. *Racism, Eh?: A Critical Inter-Disciplinary* Anthology of Race and Racism in Canada. Concord: Captus Press, 2004.
- Nicholl, Christopher. *Bishop's University*, 1843-1970. Montreal/Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1994.
- Nora, Pierre. *Realms of Memory: Rethinking the French Past*, edited by Lawrence D. Kritzman. Translated by Arthur Goldhammer. New York: Columbia University Press, 1996.
- Omhovère, Claire. "Documenting Disappearance: A Century of Canadian Photography, from William McFarlane Notman to Edward Burtynsky and Douglas Coupland." In *The Memory of Nature in Aboriginal, Canadian and American Contexts*, edited by Françoise

Besson, Claire Omhovère, and Héliane Ventura, 254-272. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2014.

- Patterson, Orlando. *Slavery and Social Death: A Comparative Study*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982.
- Peiss, Kathy. *Hope in a Jar: The Making of America's Beauty Culture*. New York: Metropolitan Books, 1998.
- Phillips, Glen C. *The Ontario Photographers List (1851-1900)*. London, ON: Iron Gate Publishing, 1997.
  - -----. The Ontario Photographers List Volume II (1901-1925). London, ON: Iron Gate Publishing, 1997.
- Pinson, Stephen C. Speculating Daguerre: Art and Enterprise in the Work of L.J.M. Daguerre. Chicago: London, 2012.
- Poulter, Gillian. "Embodying Nation: Indigenous Sports in Montreal, 1860-1885." In Contesting Bodies and Nation in Canadian History, edited by Patrizia Gentile and Jane Nicholas, 69-96. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2014.
  - ——. Becoming Native in a Foreign Land: Sport, Visual Culture and Identity in Montreal, 1840-85. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2009.
- Powell, Richard J. *Cutting a Figure: Fashioning Black Portraiture*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008.
- Pringle, Allan. "Robert S. Duncanson in Montreal, 1863-1865." American Art Journal 17, no. 4 (Autumn 1985): 28-50.
- Prussat, Margrit. "Icons of Slavery: Black Brazil in Nineteenth Century Photography and Image Art." In *Living History: Encountering the Memory of the Heirs of Slavery*, edited by Ana Lucia Araujo, 203-230. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Pub, 2009.
- Rankine, Claudia, and Beth Loffreda. "Introduction." In *The Racial Imaginary: Writers on Race in the Life of the Mind*, edited by Claudia Rankine, Beth Loffreda, and Max King Cap, 13-22. Albany: Fence Books, 2016.
- Rhodes, Jane. *Mary Ann Shadd Cary: The Black Press and Protest in the Nineteenth Century*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1998.
- Roberts, Helene E. "The Exquisite Slave: The Role of Clothes in the Making of the Victorian Woman." *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society.* 2, no. 3 (1977): 554-569.
- Rugg, Linda Haverty. *Picturing Ourselves: Photography and Autobiography*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1997.
- Sandwell, R W. *Powering Up Canada: A History of Power, Fuel, and Energy from 1600.* Montreal/Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2016.
- Severa, Joan L. Dressed for the Photographer: Ordinary Americans and Fashion, 1840-1900. Kent, Ohio: Kent State Univ. Press, 1995.
- Sheehan, Tanya. *Doctored: The Medicine of Photography in Nineteenth-Century America*. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2011,
- Silber, Nina. *The Romance of Reunion: Northerners and the South, 1865-1900.* Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2002.
- Skidmore, Colleen. "Notman, Wiliam and Sons (1856-1935)." In *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, edited by John Hannavy, 1011-1013. New York: Routledge, 2008.
- ———. "Women in Photography at the Notman Studio, Montreal, 1856-1881." PhD diss., University of Alberta, 1999.

- Smalls, James. "African-American Self-Portraiture: Repair, Reclamation, Redemption." *Third Text* 15, no. 54 (2001): 47-62.
- Sontag, Susan. Regarding the Pain of Others. New York: Picador, 2004.
- Spires, Derrick R. "Black Theories of Citizenship in the Early United States, 1793-1860." PhD diss., Vanderbilt University, 2012.
- Stack, Eileen. "Very Picturesque and Very Canadian': The Blanket Coat and Anglo-Canadian Identity in the Second Half of the Nineteenth Century." In *Fashion: A Canadian Perspective*, edited by Alexandra Palmer, 17-40. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004.
- Stauffer, John, Zoe Trodd, and Celeste-Marie Bernier. *Picturing Frederick Douglass: An Illustrated Biography of the Nineteenth Century's Most Photographed American*. New York: Liveright Publishing Corporation, 2015.
- Stauffer, John. "Frederick Douglass and the Aesthetics of Freedom." *Raritan.* 25, no. 1 (2005): 114-136.
- ———. *The Works of James McCune Smith: Black Intellectual and Abolitionist*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Thompson, Cheryl. "Race and Beauty in Canada: Print Culture, Retail, and the Transnational Flow of Products, Images and Ideologies, 1700s to Present." PhD diss., McGill University, 2015.
- Thompson, Krista A. Shine: The Visual Economy of Light in African Diasporic Aesthetic Practice. Durham: Duke University Press, 2015.
- Triggs, Stanley G. *The Composite Photographs of William Notman*. Montreal: McCord Museum of Canadian History, 1994.
- ———. *William Notman's Studio: The Canadian Picture*. Montreal: McCord Museum of Canadian History, 1992.
- ——. William Notman: The Stamp of a Studio. Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario, 1985.
- Waldstreicher, David. "Reading the Runaways: Self-Fashioning, Print Culture, and Confidence in Slavery in the Eighteenth-Century Mid-Atlantic." *The William and Mary Quarterly* 56, no. 2 (1999): 243-272.
- Walker, Tamara J. *Exquisite Slaves: Race, Clothing, and Status in Colonial Lima*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017.
- Wallace, Maurice O., and Shawn Michelle Smith, eds. *Pictures and Progress: Early Photography and the Making of African American Identity*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2012.
- Wallis, Brian, and Deborah Willis. *African American Vernacular Photography: Selections from the Daniel Cowin Collection*. New York: International Center of Photography, 2005.
- Wayne, Michael. "The Black Population in Canada West on the Eve of the American Civil War: A Reassessment Based on the Manuscript Census of 1861." *Histoire sociale/Social History*. 28, no. 56 (1995): 465-485.
- Wexler, Laura. *Tender Violence: Domestic Visions in an Age of U.S. Imperialism*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2000.
- White, Graham, and Shane White. "Slave Hair and African American Culture in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries." *The Journal of Southern History* 61, no. 1 (February 1995): 45-76.
- Whitfield, Harvey Amani. Blacks on the Border: The Black Refugees in British North America, 1815-1860. Burlington: University of Vermont Press, 2006.

- Williams, Dorothy W. *Blacks in Montreal, 1628-1986: An Urban Demography*. Cowansville: Éditions Yvon Blais, 1989.
- Williams, Susan S. Confounding Images: Photography and Portraiture in Antebellum American Fiction. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997.
- Willis, Deborah, and Carla Williams. *The Black Female Body: A Photographic History*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2002.
- Willis, Deborah. "Counteracting the Stereotype: Photography in the Nineteenth Century." In The Image of the Black in Western Art, Volume V: The Twentieth Century, Part 1: The Impact of Africa, edited by David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates, and Karen C. C. Dalton, 11-26. Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010.
- ------. *Reflections in Black: A History of Black Photographers, 1840 to the Present.* New York: W.W. Norton, 2000.
- Willis, Deborah, ed. *Picturing Us: African American Identity in Photography*. New York: New Press, 1994.
- Winks, Robin W. *The Blacks in Canada: A History*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1997.
- Wood, Marcus. The Horrible Gift of Freedom: Atlantic Slavery and the Representation of Emancipation. Athens: The University of Georgia Press, 2010.